Q. SEPTIMI FLORENTIS
TERTVLLIANI
APOLOGETICVS

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
C. F. CLAY, MANAGER
London: FETTER LANE, E.C.
Edinburgh: 100 PRINCES STREET

New York: G. P. PUTNAM'S SONS
Bombay, Calcutta and Madras: MACMILLAN AND CO., LTD.
Toronto: J. M. DENT AND SONS, LTD.
Tokyo: THE MARUZEN-KABUSHIKI-KAISHA

Q. SEPTIMI FLORENTIS TERTVLLIANI APOLOGETICVS

The text of Oehler

Annotated, with an Introduction, by

JOHN E. B. MAYOR, M.A.
Professor of Latin in the University of Cambridge
Fellow and President of St John's College

With a translation by

ALEX. SOUTER, B.A.
Regius Professor of Humanity in the University of Aberdeen
Late Scholar of Gonville and Caius College

Cambridge:
at the University Press
1917

PREFACE

THE late Professor John E. B. Mayor, during his tenure of the professorship of Latin at Cambridge, frequently lectured on the *Apology* of Tertullian in the Divinity Schools. About the year 1892 he wrote out his notes in a copy of Oehler's earlier edition (Halle, 1849), that had been interleaved with sheets of paper about twice the size of the pages of the book itself. These notes were added to from time to time down to the year 1907, if not later, and they formed the matter of his lectures. Already in 1893 he began to publish them in *The Journal of Philology*, but the publication never went beyond the end of the fifth chapter.

After his death on December 1, 1910, his executors considered the advisability of publishing the whole of the notes, and honoured me with the request to edit them for publication. I had heard the lectures throughout two or more terms of my undergraduate period at Cambridge, and had been profoundly influenced by them. I therefore felt it binding on me to suspend my own work and perform this act of *pietas*.

The executors first arranged with Mr E. S. Payne of Clifton, Bristol, for a copy of the notes as a basis for the proposed publication. Though the Professor's handwriting is beautifully clear, it is at the same time so microscopic that this was no light task to perform. Mr Payne also verified many of the references, and appended a number of useful remarks on the notes themselves.

It may be at once admitted that only the Professor himself, or some one equally learned, could edit these notes in a satisfactory manner. I am fully conscious of my own unfitness for the task, which has been very heavy. I have felt it necessary to compare Mr Payne's copy with the original MS, in which work I received valued help from the friend of thirty years, Mr James Taylor of the Aberdeen Centre for the Training of Teachers; but this is only part of what was required. I have had to put the notes in correct sequence, to reduce to order the somewhat chaotic state of the references and quotations within the notes themselves, to supply references never filled

in, and to cut out references or quotations given twice in the same note. I have brought the references to the works of Tertullian that have appeared in the Vienna edition, into conformity with that edition, as the Professor himself would have wished. In the few cases where references have in some way baffled me, I have placed a point of interrogation within brackets as a danger signal. It is not often that I have added anything of my own. When this has been done, I felt sure that Prof. Mayor himself would have made the addition prior to publication. Such additions are enclosed within square brackets, and the editor's initials are appended.

The notes were not intended by their author to constitute a complete commentary, but rather to form a useful supplement to those already published, such as Havercamp's and Oehler's. They provide, however, so vast a body of illustration, both of the subject-matter and of the language of the *Apology*, that not only are they to be regarded as a commentary, but as by far the best commentary ever published. Nevertheless, as Tertullian is the most difficult of all Latin prose writers, and the notes are not of a type intended for schoolboys, it has been deemed advisable to add an English translation of the text. This translation has had the inestimable advantage of thorough revision by the veteran brother of the commentator, Emeritus-Professor Joseph B. Mayor, of King's College, London, who has spared no pains to make the whole book as perfect as possible.

The Provost of King's, Dr M. R. James, has given kind help in cases of extreme difficulty. I am also indebted to my assistant, Mr Robert Weir, formerly of Pembroke College, Oxford, for help in the reading of the proofs and the verification of references. Nor must I forget the extreme care of the press readers.

Prof. Mayor's introduction, with the notes on chapters I to V, has been reprinted from *The Journal of Philology* by kind permission of the editors. I have ventured to add a bibliography of the chief works on Tertullian, which have appeared since that article was published. I have also compiled the index.

A. SOUTER.

THE UNIVERSITY,
ABERDEEN.
22nd November, 1916.

CONTENTS

ADDENDA ET CORRIGENDA

page 13,	line 24.	For 'It is' read 'Is it,' and add '?' at end of sentence.
,, 16	,, 7.	Read 'damnandi.'
,, 19	,, 30.	For 'the emperor' read 'a general.'
,, ,,	,, 43.	For 'in' read 'on.'
,, 21	,, 4.	Omit 'could have.'
,, 27	,, 8.	For 'their divine character is preserved' read 'the divine is kept in reserve.'
,, 131	,, 18.	For 'equanimity' read 'endurance.'
,, 135	,, 12.	For 'commentators' read 'garblers.'
,, 237	,, 18.	A full stop should be placed after '2,' and 'Hav.' separated from it.
,, 279	,, 6.	Mr R. Weir has found the reference to be XI 13.
,, 287	,, 12.	The reference to 'John 16, 13' should be added, and cf. C. H. Turner in Journ. Theol. Stud. XIV (1912–13), p. 563. His article 'Tertullianea. I.' pp. 556–564, was accidentally omitted from the Bibliography.
,, 297	,, 5.	The reference is wrong.
,, 311	,, 19.	After '13' add '§ 1.'
,, 313	,, 24.	Add another example of *pascua* (sing.), Gen. 47, 4 (in Lyons Heptateuch).
,, 320	,, 35.	For 'VII' read '7.'
,, 322	,, 21.	Before '163' add '97.'
,, 325	,, 1.	The passage of Prudentius Peristeph. intended is X 919–920. The 'Vincent.' intended is perhaps Vincent of Beauvais.
,, 332	,, 5.	Omit 'n.'
,, ,,	,, 38.	There should be a space between 'Plin.' and 'inscr.'
,, 337	,, 10.	For '7 § 7' read '4 § 8.' For '7 § 3' read '13 § 13.'
,, 373	,, 13.	Delete '?'
,, 405	,, 29.	For 'ORA' read 'ORO.'
,, 429	,, 8.	Add '[add Aug. Serm. 393, Ps.-Aug. Serm. 261, § 3. A. S.].'
,, 450	,, 28 f.	'lexx.' etc. refer to SCRVPVLOSITAS, line 16.
,, 465	,, 27.	For '22' read '23.'

INTRODUCTION

In my Bibliographical Clue to Latin Literature (Cambr. 1875, pp. 163—6) I collected the titles of the principal editions of Tertullian, and of works or essays published in illustration of him and his writings. I now add:

J. P. Condamin, De Q. S. F. Tertulliano, uexatae religionis patrono, et praecipuo apud Latinos Christianae linguae artifice. Bar-le-Duc 1877. 8vo.

Q. S. F. T. libellus de spectaculis. Ad cod. Agobardinum denuo collatum recensuit, adnotationes criticas nouas addidit Ern. Klussmann. Lips. 1877. Large 8vo.

id. Adnotationes crit. ad Tert. de spect. in Gymnasium Ienense ipsis Non. Oct. anni 1876 bonis litteris dedicandum pientissimis notis prosequuntur Director et Collegae Gymnasii Rudolphopolitani. Rudolphopoli, Froebel. (Reviewed by H. Rönsch in Liter. Centralblatt, 31 March 1877.)

Is. Pelet, Essai sur l'apologétique de Tertullien. Strasb. 1868. 8vo. Keim, Die Zeit des T. apol. in his Aus dem Urchristenthum I (Zürich 1878) 174—8. In the Zeitschr. f. oest. Gymn. 1869, pp. 348—368 W. Hartel reviewed Ebert's dissertation on Tertullian's relation to Minucius Felix.

The same Hartel in his Patristische Studien I (Wien, Tempsky, 1890, pp. 58. 8vo) wrote: Zu Tert. de spect. de idol.

Dr Ernst Noeldechen, who in 1890 published: Tert. dargestellt von E. N. Gotha, Perthes. 8vo, pp. viii 496: also wrote in Brieger's Zeitschr. f. Kirchengeschichte XI, on Tert. de cor., and many other essays on this father in other periodicals.

Dr Aug. Oxé, Prolegomena de carmine aduersus Marcionitas. Leipz. Fock. 1888. 8vo, pp. 51. Cf. Ztschr. f. wiss. Theol. 1876, pp. 113—120, 154—158.

R. A. Lipsius, Die Quellen der ältesten Ketzergeschichte. Leipz. 1875, pp. 64—83.

G. R. Hauschild, Die Grundsätze und Mittel der Sprachbildung bei Tertullian. Leipz. 1876. 4to. The same: Tertullians Psychologie und Erkenntnisstheorie. Frankf. 1880. 4to.

P. Schwenk, Über die Zeit des Minucius Felix (Jahrbb. f. prot. Theol. 1883 n. 2).

Fr. Wilhelm, De Minucii Felicis Octauio et Tertulliani apologetico. Bresl. Philol. Abhandl. 1887.

The first part of the Vienna edition of Tertullian, prepared by Reifferscheid, appeared, completed by Wissowa, in 1890, but it does not contain the Apology: however it is so far helpful that it gives an instalment of cognate pieces, spect., idol., ad nat., test. an.

[The third part of the Vienna edition of Tertullian, edited by Emil Kroymann, appeared in 1906. It contains pat., carn. resurr., adu. Hermog., adu. Val., adu. omn. haer., adu. Prax., adu. Marc. (see Eb. Nestle in Philologus, LXVII (1908), 477–479). The second and fourth parts, to be edited by E. Kroymann and H. Hoppe, are as yet (1916) unpublished. A.S.]

See Engelmann, Bibliotheca Scriptorum Classicorum. 8th ed. by E. Preuss. II 1882, pp. 663–666, and Teuffel-Schwabe, Gesch. d. röm. Lit.[5] § 373.

[J. Schmidt, Ein Beitrag zur Chronologie der Schriften Tertullian's und der Proconsuln von Afrika (Rheinisches Museum, XLVI (1891), 77—98).

A. Harnack, Die griechische Uebersetzung des Apologeticus Tertullian's (Texte und Untersuchungen, VIII 4), Leipzig, 1892.

M. Klussmann, Excerpta Tertullianea in Isidori Hispalensis Etymologiis, Hamburg, 1892.

A. Harnack, Geschichte der altchristl. Lit. bis Eusebius, I, Leipzig, 1893, 667—687, II (2), Leipzig, 1904, 256–296.

E. Noeldechen, Tertullians Gegen die Juden, auf Einheit, Echtheit und Entstehung geprüft (Texte und Untersuchungen, XII 2), Leipzig, 1894.

M. Schanz, Die Abfassungszeit des Octavius des Minucius Felix (Rheinisches Museum, L (1895), 114–136).

H. Gomperz, Tertullianea, Vienna, 1895.

E. Norden, De Minucii Felicis aetate et genere dicendi, Greifswald, 1897.

K. Holl, Tertullian als Schriftsteller (Preussische Jahrbücher, LXXXVIII (1897), 262—278).

E. Kroymann, Die Tertullianüberlieferung in Italien (Sitzungsberichte d. kaiserl. Akad. in Wien, CXXXVIII (3), 1898).

P. Monceaux, Chronologie des œuvres de Tertullien (Revue de Philologie, XXII (1898), 77—92).

E. Kroymann, Kritische Vorarbeiten fur den 3. und 4. Band der neuen Tertullian-Ausgabe (Sitzungsberichte d. kais. Akad. in Wien, CXLIII (6), 1901).

A. Ehrhard, Die altchristliche Literatur und ihre Erforschung, v. 1884—1900, Freiburg, 1901.

F. Kotek, Anklänge an Ciceros De Natura Deorum bei Minucius Felix und Tertullian, Vienna, 1901.

P. Monceaux, Histoire littéraire de l'Afrique chrétienne, I, Tertullien et les Origines, Paris, 1901.

H. Waitz, Die pseudotertullianische Gedicht adv. Marcionem, Darmstadt, 1901.

C. Callewaert, Le Codex Fuldensis, le meilleur ms. de l'Apologeticum de Tertullien (Revue d'Histoire et de Littérature Religieuses, VII (1902), 322—353).

H. Hoppe, Syntax und Stil des Tertullian, Leipzig, 1903.

O. Bardenhewer, Geschichte der altkirchlichen Literatur, II, Freiburg i. B. 1903, 332—394.

S. Turmel, Tertullien (La Pensée Chrétienne), Paris, 1904.

M. Schanz, Geschichte der römischen Literatur, 3. Teil, 2 Aufl. Munich, 1905, 280—351.

A. d'Alès, La Théologie de Tertullien, Paris, 1905.

A. Engelbrecht, Neue lexikalische und semasiologische Beiträge aus Tertullian (Wiener Studien, XXVIII (1906), 142 159).

G. Rauschen, Tertulliani Apologetici Recensio Nova, Bonn, 1906 (ed. alt. 1912).

A. Souter, A Tenth-Century Fragment of Tertullian's Apology (Journal of Theological Studies, VIII (1906—1907), 297—300).

H. Goelzer, Le Style de Tertullien (Journal des Savants (1907), 202—211).

R. Heinze, Tertullians Apologeticum, Leipzig, 1910.

P. Henen, Index verborum quae Tertulliani apologetico continentur. Louvain and Paris, 1910 (from Musée Belge, vols. XIII, XIV, XV).

J. P. Waltzing, L'Apologétique de Tertullien...Traduction littérale suivie d'un commentaire historique, Louvain, 1911[1].

A. Bill, Zur Erklärung und Textkritik des 1. Buchs Tertullians Adv. Marc. (Texte und Untersuchungen, XXXVIII, 2), Leipzig, 1911.

J. P. Waltzing, Les trois principaux MSS de l'Apologétique de Tertullien (Musée Belge, XVI (1912), 181—241).

H. Schrörs, Zur Textgeschichte und Erklärung von Tertullians Apologetikum (Texte und Untersuchungen, XL, 4), Leipzig, 1914.

E. Löfstedt, Tertullian's Apologeticum textkritisch untersucht, Lund and Leipzig, 1915.

J. Moffatt, The Theology of Tertullian (intended for publication in 1916).

See R. Klussmann, Bibliotheca Scriptorum Classicorum et Graecorum et Latinorum, II (2), Leipzig, 1913, 280—287, and Teuffel, Gesch. d. röm. Lit.[6], Leipz. 1913, § 373. A. S.]

To scholars whose reading is confined to the handful of writers, barely filling a single shelf, which are counted as Latin classics, I would venture to offer a few reasons for following Scaliger, Casaubon, Gataker, Bentley, Wasse, Haupt, Bernays, in widening their ken to the entire range of Latin authors, of whatever creed or profession, down to the contemporaries of Bede and Alcuin. Even such a self-taught giant as Madvig often shews pitiable weakness from the limits to which he restricted himself[2].

When a Greek or Roman philosopher or rhetorician became a Christian (*fiunt, non nascuntur Christiani*), he did not at once forget all the learning of the past. A very large part of what

[1] Has a large bibliography on pp. 336—356.

[2] At the Leyden tercentenary Madvig told me that he had read no Greek or Latin theological author but Josephus, and that only for information respecting ancient warfare. He was however a diligent student of the New Testament, as may be seen by his copy in the Cambridge Divinity Library.

we know of ancient religion, a very large number of perfectly classical words, have been preserved to us only by the fathers[1]. Look at the fragments of Seneca, collect the fragments of Varro, and you will see that it is not safe to say to Christian authors: *non licet esse uos.* I have found abundant evidence in patristic Greek and Latin for many words known to the lexicons only by citations in glossaries. Rönsch, Paucker, Georges, supply students of Romance languages with hundreds of words hitherto unregistered, the parents of a numerous Italian, Spanish, French progeny.

Again, many of the chief classics, as Pindar and Thucydides, are very difficult[2], or (as tragic choruses) very corrupt. Many of the fathers write very simply, and might serve admirably for the neglected discipline of the ear; even as Cicero and the younger Pliny pursued their studies by the aid of *readers.* It is certain that an entire volume of either Chrysostom (Dio—to name a heathen—or John) could be read carefully in shorter time than is spent on the study of the few hundred lines of the Agamemnon. And the path through the former would be all luminous, through the latter dark with corruptions and conjectures and despairing interpretations. Many of the best scholars, as in England Pearson, John Davies, Wasse (much of whose work remains in manuscript), Routh, Kaye, F. Field, Chr. Wordsworth, Lightfoot, have devoted their best energies to the elucidation of the fathers. As a rule patristic and biblical texts are preserved in earlier manuscripts than those of heathen classics; so that palaeographers must necessarily sit at the feet of divines.

For the order of study, I would say: Leave to the infallible oracles of monthly magazines sweeping hypotheses, no whit less hazardous than those of Father Hardouin. First become thoroughly familiar with the ancients themselves, before you

[1] In the Journal of Classical and Sacred Philology II (Cambr. 1855) 82 I shewed that *hic esto* (also *hic sum*) the correlative of the *istic sum* ('I am with you,' i.e. 'I am attending') of Cicero and Terence, is to be gleaned from Augustine.

[2] This remark was once made to me by Mr Bywater. He said: "one could read a very large part of such a writer as Plutarch, in the time that is occupied on the small volume of Thucydides."

listen to guesses about them It is characteristic of the sobriety of Englishmen, that our scholars, as Lardner, Routh, Kaye, Clinton, Lightfoot, have followed in the modest steps of Tillemont, content to collect evidence for the reader's information, not without a guiding clue.

A once popular book, of solid but unobtrusive learning, now forgotten[1], by an accomplished Cambridge scholar (Biography of the Early Church. By R. W. Evans. 2nd ed. London 1859. 2 vols. sm. 8vo), if read with the authorities cited in the notes, will form an excellent introduction to patristic study. Listen to this character of Tertullian's apology (I 336—8):

Its power is far superior to that of any former defence. Tertullian not only surpassed his predecessors in information and talent, but was peculiarly fitted by temper to treat such a subject. No one could express in such forcible language the indignant sense of injustice, or represent its detail in a more lively manner. None could press his arguments so closely, and few had so learned an acquaintance with heathenism, and could expose its follies with more bitter sarcasm (Apol. 42), or whip its wickedness with a heavier lash (Apol. 35). The subject too, while it gave free scope to the range of his argumentative powers, neither allured him, nor compelled him to sophistical subtilties. The free and elastic vigour of a mind that had still half its strength in reserve pervades the composition; and if we put the mere mechanism of style out of the question, and consider the copiousness, the variety, the interest of the matter, the skilfulness of selection of topics, and the powerful grasp with which they are handled, together with the greatness of the occasion, it will not be too much to say, that it is the noblest oration among all which antiquity has left us....In what a state of mind do we rise up from it! Its brilliant pictures are glowing before our eyes, its deep tone of declamation is sounding in our ears, its imploring, its condemning, its expostulating accents have touched our feelings to the quick.... Heaven and hell have been moved, and have entered into a mortal struggle, of which we are now enjoying the fruits, in a victory which has decided the fate of mankind for all eternity. What literary gew-gaws do the finest orations of Cicero and Demosthenes appear

[1] Dr Thompson once lamented to me the change of taste for the worse: "When you wanted to make a present to a young lady, that was the kind of book to give: but now they take no interest in such things."

after this! How do we put them away as childish things, and feel ashamed that we should set such value on the vituperative filth which is poured forth upon Aeschines and Antony, political rivals on the narrow stage of a corner of this little world.

I believe that of those who have really grappled with Tertullian's difficulties, few will challenge this verdict of a most competent judge.

I can conceive few more valuable aids to classical scholarship than a digest, not on the plan of the Dutch *uariorum* editors, nor yet on the scissors-and-paste plan of Dindorf, of all that is permanently valuable in commentaries and miscellaneous remarks on the Christian apologists, say to 500 A.D. The work should appear by itself, and would have a permanent value, whatever manuscripts might spring to light. Critics and commentators should be read in order of time and each allowed credit for his contributions—I would not ruthlessly clip away even the biographical confidences with which old scholars enlivened their learning—; no quotation should be repeated, but the entire composite note should be fused into unity, references being reduced to one uniform pattern. Each special subject, as the calumny about Thyestean feasts, should be exhausted in some one note, and cross references given. The editor would be in excellent company for some years, and would learn something of the meaning of catholic communion, as he forgathered with the Spanish Jesuit La Cerda, the French jurists Didier Herauld (Heraldus) and Nic. Rigault, with Le Nourry and Tillemont and Ceillier, Mosheim and Semler, Oehler and Ebert, Kaye and Blunt[1] and Pusey[2], Neander and Oehler (*sic*) and Böhringer and Nöldechen[3]. Perhaps no two men ever more thoroughly mastered every detail in the field of the early apolo-

[1] Right Use of the Early Fathers. Here p. 432 Lightfoot might have found, cited from Theoph. ad Autol. I 1 f., a far more apt parallel to Philem. 11. than that which he cites from c. 12 of the same book.

[2] Notes (ascribed by Kaye to Dodgson) on Dodgson's excellent translation in the Library of the Fathers. It is interesting to learn that the citations in these notes were verified by one who left us, J. B. Morris.

[3] On this latest monograph see Lüdemann in Theol. Jahresber. hrsg. v. R. A. Lipsius, X, 1891, pp. 128—9. Lipsius, alas, is no more, but this annual, of unrivalled excellence, is continued by his Jena colleagues.

gists than Le Nourry (whose Apparatus, Par. 1715, is reprinted in Migne and in Oehler) and Christian Kortholt (15 Jan. 163$\frac{2}{3}$—31 March 1694), whose 'Paganus obtrectator' (Kiel 1698 4to. 2nd ed. Lubeck 1703 4to), comment. on Iust. M., Athenag., Theophil., Tatian (ibid. 1675 fol. 'profundae eruditionis,' says Walch); 'de persecutionibus ecclesiae primaeuae' (Kiel 1689 4to) and other works (see the Bodleian catalogue and Joecher) are in my judgement still necessary to the student. If Mr Carstens, in a slight article in the Allg. deutsche Biographie XVI (Leipz. 1882) 726 says that K.'s books "have been long overtaken by the advance of science and have no longer any importance," I comfort myself by the remembrance that this Biography is weakest in the lives and works of scholars. I should like to cross-examine Mr Carstens on Kortholt. Of works on the other apologists that of Semisch on Justin and Keim's Celsus, are, so far as I know, the most helpful.

Beside printed sources, my ideal editor should inquire for manuscripts[1]. My mouth watered when I read Blunt's casual

[1] [May I again call attention to the fact that there is a tenth-century MS of chapters 38, 39 and part of 40 of the *Apologeticus* in the Kantons-Bibliothek at Zürich (Rheinau XCV), which is closely related to the lost Fulda MS (*Journal of Theological Studies*, VIII (1906—1907), pp. 297—300)? This fact has been overlooked by Rauschen and others. Also, why has it been left to me to point out that the MS containing "Tertulliani Quaedam," alluded to by Oehler, vol. I, p. xxi, after Montfaucon Bibl. bibl. tom. I, p. 1134, as in the catalogue of the library of St Germain-des-Prés, and doubtless identical with the MS of the *Apologeticus* at Petrograd, also alluded to by Oehler (p. xii), is still as a matter of fact at Petrograd (Q. v. 1, No. 40), having been brought there by Peter Dubrowsky? It is of the ninth century, is probably the oldest existing MS of the *Apologeticus*, and is mentioned in K. Gillert's catalogue, printed in the *Neues Archiv*, V (1880), 241—265, 597—617, VI (1881), 497—512, and described (with a photograph of one page) in A. Staerk, *Les Manuscrits Latins du V au XIII Siècle conservés à la Bibliothèque Impériale de Saint-Pétersbourg* (2 tomes, St Pétersbourg, 1910), Tome I, p. 130, Tome II, planche 57. Further, Kroymann, the new Vienna editor of Tertullian, is entirely ignorant of the Luxemburg MS of Tertullian, no. 75 (saec. XV ex.), though it appears to have been used by Semler, and a catalogue of the Luxemburg collection was published in 1894. The MS contains carn. Chr., carn. resurr., cor. mil., mart., paenit., uirg. uel., hab. mul., cult. fem., ad ux. I and II, de fug. in pers., Scap., exh. cast., monog., pall., pat. Dei (*sic*), adu. Prax., adu. Val., adu. Marc., adu. Iud., adu. omn. haer., praescr. her., adu. Hermog. The contents thus bear a striking resemblance to those of certain Italian MSS, e.g. Vat. Urb. 64 (saec. XV), described by Kroymann in the first article mentioned on p. xi, pp. 4, 5. A. S.]

remark that Rigault's glossary is convenient for annotation. This book and Blunt's manuscript lectures on the early fathers should certainly be secured for the university which he adorned. The Germans are no doubt the most active workers in the patristic vineyard; but how few of them are scholars like Burton or Blunt, Kaye or Field!

LANGUAGE.

Of existing glossaries to Tertullian, those of Rigault, Semler (also in Migne) and (the best) Oehler, all are necessary. [The language of Tertullian, so far as comprised in the two already published volumes of the Vienna edition, has been completely recorded on slips for the *Thesaurus Linguae Latinae*. A complete index to the *Apologeticus* has been made by Henen: see the additions to the Bibliography. A. S.] General lexicons of independent value are Faber[1] (best ed. by Leichius, Francof. 1749, fol.), a favorite with Dr Westcott; Rob. Stephens (ed. Gesner, 4 vols. 1749; the ed. of Ant. Birr, Basil. 1740, fol. 4 vols., has inedited notes of Henry Stephens); Forcellini, two editions of which are still incomplete, that by De Vit (lexicon and glossary and a large part of the valuable 'Onomasticon' have appeared), and that by Corradini (incorporating Klotz); Scheller (3rd ed. Leipz. 1804—5, 5 vols. 8vo; I have Madvig's copy), translated, without the instructive and pathetic preface, by Riddle for the Oxford Press (fol.); Klotz; (Freund's book, which has supplied the basis of ninety-nine hundredths of the lexicons sold in England for many years, is, after the letter C, a most careless compilation from Forcellini); and, fullest of all in vocabulary, and necessary as a supplement even to Forcellini, Georges. [This honour now belongs to *Nouveau Dictionnaire Latin-Français*...par E. Benoist et H. Goelzer, Paris 1893, for the whole alphabet, to the 8th edition of Georges by his son H. Georges, Hannover and Leipzig, 1912—1916, for three quarters, and to the *Thesaurus Linguae Latinae*, Leipzig, 1900 ff., for A—Dimico, F—Familia. A. S.]

[1] Of Faber, Gesner, Forcellini, Scheller, I said something in the Journal of Classical and Sacred Philology II (Cambr. 1855), 277—290.

Of the adaptations of Freund I have for many years employed two copies of Riddle-White, and (of late) two copies of Lewis-Short, as a basis for annotations; but young scholars, who use a lexicon not so much to add to or correct its statements, as to learn the usage of the language, ought to employ Gesner or Forcellini or Scheller habitually. For a portion of the alphabet (from D—K) by far the completest storehouse is the 'Thesaurus der klassischen Latinität,' begun by Georges, and continued from D onwards by Gustav Mühlmann (Leipz. 1851—68).

Any of the old Latin-English lexicons, from Cooper to the complete editions of Ainsworth, give far more racy, homespun English for the Latin words, than the books which now command the market. Lewis-Short has an improved orthography and some additions from Georges and various commentaries; also a few articles (e.g. *cum* conj. and prep., *sui*, *suus*) are carefully and independently executed; but in some points the changes from Riddle-White are for the worse.

In the 'Bibliographical Clue to Latin Literature' I recorded under each author the then aids (indexes cet.) to the study of his language; it is well to remember that the 'Delphin' classics (Valpy's reprint is very accurate, and adds many useful commentaries to the original quartos) and also Lemaire's supply complete indexes to many authors. Merguet is about half way through the Herculean task of a concordance to Cicero; he and others have brought out three rival lexicons to Caesar: Teubner's press is engaged on lexicons to Livy and Tacitus[1]. In Teubner's 'bibliotheca' some authors, chiefly technical, as Cassius Felix, Iulius Valerius cet., are furnished with indexes. The Berlin 'Monumenta Germaniae historica' and the Vienna library of the fathers have indeed indexes, but in many cases by no means exhaustive; e.g. not Reifferscheid, but Forcellini, informs us that the rare word *bacula* (dim. of *baca*) occurs thrice in Arnobius. Of late years the French have returned to the field in which they reigned supreme in the 16th and 17th

[1] [Fügner's *Lexicon Livianum* advanced no farther than B, but Gerber and Greef's *Lexicon Taciteum* is complete. The *Scriptores Historiae Augustae* have been done by Lessing, and other authors by others. A. S.]

centuries. Thus: Henri Gœlzer, 'Étude lexicographique et grammaticale de la Latinité de Saint Jérome' (Paris, Hachette, 1884), and (a perfect model in its way) Max Bonnet, 'Le Latin de Grégoire de Tours' (ibid. 1890). The Archiv für lat. Lexikographie, published since 1884 by Teubner, has, thanks to the self-sacrifice of the publisher and the editor Ed. Wölfflin, done a great work in surveying the whole field of Latin letters, and training readers to gather in the whole mass of Latin words. There too may be seen reviews of all new books and articles bearing on the subject.

There is yet an opening for two lexicons, of moderate compass, but of great value to critics, lexicographers and grammarians.

(A) We possess two lexicons of terminations in Greek, but, to my knowledge, none in Latin. [The want was supplied in 1904 by O. Gradenwitz, Later uli Vocum Latinarum: Voces Latinas et a fronte et a tergo ordinandas curauit (Leipzig). A. S.] I refer to: (I) 'Henrici Hoogeveen, opus postumum exhibens dictionarium analogicum linguae graecae' (Cambr. typis acad. 1800. 4to), a book recommended by the late Dr Thompson: and (II) 'Etymologisches Wörterbuch der griechischen Sprache zur Uebersicht der Wortbildung nach den Endsylben geordnet von Dr Wilhelm Pape' (Berl. 1836, 8vo).

(B) Faber and Gesner frequently record under one word other words with which it is liable to be confounded by scribes: they also cite lexicographical collections in commentaries and journals. Whoever has traced with attention the course of lexicography knows that almost every word well treated by any lexicon owes its good fortune to some exhaustive note of N. Heins, or J. F. Gronov, or Bentley cet. The indexes to such books as Drakenborch's Livy and Duker's Florus will shew how the thing should be done. To go down the whole course of classical learning, from such treasuries as Gruter's 'Fax Artium,' to the 'aduersaria' of Madvig and the 'lectiones' of Cobet, would be the making of any young scholar.

The most useful commentary, on the whole, is Oehler's. Herauld also and Rigault should be read, and Dr Pusey. La Cerda is copious in parallels. Pamelius takes a polemical

rather than a literary interest in his author, but his index of things is the completest of all; Rigault also and Oehler are good. Kaye, Ebert (literary history) and Böhringer will well repay the labour of perusal.

My notes are not exhaustive, but are intended chiefly as a supplement to earlier commentaries. May they prove that there is much in Tert. of interest to any student, though no more of a technical theologian than was Jakob Bernays.

TERTVLLIANI APOLOGETICVS

TERTVLLIANI APOLOGETICVS

1. Si non licet uobis, Romani imperii antistites, in aperto et edito, in ipso fere uertice ciuitatis praesidentibus ad iudicandum palam dispicere et coram examinare quid sit liquido in causa Christianorum, si ad hanc solam speciem auctoritas uestra de iustitiae diligentia in publico aut timet aut erubescit inquirere, si denique, quod proxime accidit, domesticis iudiciis nimis operata infestatio sectae huius obstruit defensioni, liceat ueritati uel occulta uia tacitarum litterarum ad aures uestras peruenire. Nihil de causa sua deprecatur, quia nec de condicione miratur. Scit se peregrinam in terris agere, inter extraneos facile inimicos inuenire, ceterum genus, sedem, spem, gratiam, dignitatem in caelis habere. Unum gestit interdum, ne ignorata damnetur. Quid hic deperit legibus in suo regno dominantibus, si audiatur? An hoc magis gloriabitur potestas eorum, quo etiam auditam damnabunt ueritatem? Ceterum inauditam si damnent, praeter inuidiam iniquitatis etiam suspicionem merebuntur alicuius conscientiae, nolentes audire quod auditum damnare non possint. Hanc itaque primam causam apud uos collocamus iniquitatis odii erga nomen Christianorum. Quam iniquitatem idem titulus et onerat et reuincit qui uidetur excusare, ignorantia scilicet. Quid enim iniquius, quam ut oderint homines quod ignorant, etiam si res meretur odium? Tunc etenim meretur, cum cognoscitur an mereatur. Vacante autem meriti notitia, unde

TERTULLIAN'S DEFENCE OF THE CHRISTIANS AGAINST THE HEATHEN

Chap. I. If it is not permitted even to you, who are the governors of the Roman Empire, seated on a lofty and conspicuous tribunal, which I might almost call the very summit of ur state: if, I say, even you may not openly investigate and udge in the presence of both parties, what are the real facts in he case of the Christians; if in this instance alone your authority s either afraid or ashamed to make public inquiry with regard o the scrupulous observance of justice; if, finally, as has ecently happened, the persecution of this sect, having been oo much exercised in trials connected with households, has locked up the way to defence—, then let the truth be permitted o reach your ears, if only by the hidden path of silent literature. She asks no mercy in her case, because she does not feel any surprise either as to her circumstances. She knows that her art is that of a foreigner upon earth, that amongst aliens she asily finds enemies, while she has her race, her home, hope, welcome and honour in heaven. One thing only does she eagerly desire in the meantime, namely that she be not condemned without being known. What loss is herein inflicted on the laws, which are absolute masters in their own realm, if she should be heard? Or will this make them boast all the more of their power, in that they condemn the truth even when they have heard it? Further, if they should condemn it unheard, besides the odium attached to unfair dealing, they will also earn the suspicion of a certain complicity, by their refusal to hear what, if heard, they could not condemn. This then is the first proof that we lay before you of the injustice of your hatred towards the name of Christian. This unfairness is at once exaggerated and refuted by the same plea that seems to excuse it, namely ignorance. For what could be more unfair than that men should hate that of which they know nothing, even if the fact deserve this hatred? For then only does the fact deserve hatred, when it is already ascertained whether it deserves it. In default of the knowledge of its deserts, whence can the justice

odii iustitia defenditur, quae non de euentu, sed de conscientia probanda est? Cum ergo propterea oderunt homines, quia ignorant quale sit quod oderunt, cur non liceat eiusmodi illud esse, quod non debeant odisse? Ita utrumque ex alterutro redarguimus, et ignorare illos, dum oderunt, et iniuste odisse, dum ignorant. Testimonium ignorantiae est, quae iniquitatem dum excusat, condemnat, cum omnes qui retro oderant, quia ignorabant quale sit quod oderant, simul desinunt ignorare, cessant et odisse. Ex his fiunt Christiani, utique de conperto, et incipiunt odisse quod fuerant, et profiteri quod oderant, et sunt tanti quanti et denotamur. Obsessam uociferantur ciuitatem; in agris, in castellis, in insulis Christianos; omnem sexum, aetatem, condicionem, etiam dignitatem transgredi ad hoc nomen quasi detrimento maerent, nec tamen hoc modo ad aestimationem alicuius latentis boni promouent animos. Non licet rectius suspicari, non libet propius experiri. Hic tantum curiositas humana torpescit. Amant ignorare, cum alii gaudeant cognouisse. Quanto magis hos Anacharsis denotasset inprudentes de prudentibus iudicantes quam inmusicos de musicis! Malunt nescire, quia iam oderunt. Adeo quod nesciant praeiudicant id esse quod, si sciant, odisse non poterant, quando, si nullum odii debitum deprehendatur, optimum utique sit desinere iniuste odisse, si uero de merito constet, non modo nihil odii detrahatur, sed amplius adquiratur ad perseuerantiam, etiam iustitiae ipsius auctoritate. Sed non ideo, inquit, bonum, quia multos conuertit: quanti enim ad malum performantur? quanti transfugae in peruersum? Quis negat? tamen quod uere malum est, ne ipsi quidem, quos rapit, defendere pro bono audent. Omne malum aut timore aut pudore natura perfudit. Denique malefici gestiunt latere, deuitant apparere, trepidant deprehensi, negant accusati, ne torti quidem facile aut semper confitentur, certe damnati maerent. Dinumerant in semetipsos mentis malae impetus,

of hatred be defended, seeing that it is to be tested not by the verdict passed but by a good conscience? When therefore men hate because they do not know the character of what they hate, what is to hinder the thing hated from being of the sort they ought not to hate? So we refute either position from the other, showing that in hating they do not know, and that in not knowing, their hatred is unjust. It is an evidence of the ignorance, which, while it is made the excuse, is really the condemnation of injustice, when all who hated in the past, because they did not know the character of that which they hated, cease to hate as soon as they cease to be ignorant. It is from this class that Christians are produced, of course from conviction, and begin to hate what they had been, and to profess what they hated, and are indeed as numerous as we who are branded with that name. They cry aloud that the state is besieged: that (even) in the country-districts, in the (walled) villages, in the islands, you will find Christians. They mourn as for a loss that all, without distinction of sex, age, circumstances, or even position, are deserting to this name. And yet even in this very way they do not carry on their minds to the appraisement of some good hidden therein; they do not care[1] to form a truer conjecture upon a closer inquiry, they have no pleasure in trying it at closer quarters. In this sphere alone is human curiosity apathetic; they delight to be ignorant, while others rejoice to have learned. How much more severely would Anacharsis have condemned these men, as specimens of the unwise judging the wise, than as the unmusical judging the musical! They had rather be ignorant, because they already hate; such a strong suspicion have they that what they are ignorant of is that which, if they knew it, they could not hate; since, if no duty to hate were discovered, it would of course be best to cease to hate unjustly, but if there were no doubt as to desert, not only would there be no withdrawal of hatred, but persistence would gain greater force, even through the sanction of justice itself. 'But it is not therefore good,' they say, 'because it makes many converts: for how many are fashioned for evil! how many deserters are there to what is wrong?' Who denies it? Yet what is truly evil, even those who are in its clutches do not dare to defend as good. Nature has stamped on every evil thing the character either of fear or of shame. Accordingly evil-doers are eager to hide, they shrink from showing themselves, they tremble when caught, deny their guilt when charged, and even when tortured do not readily or always confess. To be sure when condemned they mourn, and they either sum up

[1] Reading *libet* (J. B. M.).

uel fato uel astris imputant: nolunt enim suum esse, quia malum agnoscunt. Christianus uero quid simile? Neminem pudet, neminem paenitet, nisi plane retro non fuisse. Si denotatur, gloriatur: si accusatur, non defendit: interrogatus uel ultro confitetur, damnatus gratias agit. Quid hoc mali est, quod naturalia mali non habet, timorem, pudorem, tergiuersationem, paenitentiam, deplorationem? Quid? hoc malum est, cuius reus gaudet? cuius accusatio uotum est et poena felicitas? Non potes dementiam dicere, qui reuinceris ignorare.

2. Si certum est denique nos nocentissimos esse, cur a uobis ipsis aliter tractamur quam pares nostri, id est ceteri nocentes, cum eiusdem noxae eadem tractatio deberet interuenire? Quodcunque dicimur, cum alii dicuntur, et proprio ore et mercenaria aduocatione utuntur ad innocentiae suae commendationem. Respondendi, altercandi facultas patet, quando nec liceat indefensos et inauditos omnino damnari. Sed Christianis solis nihil permittitur loqui quod causam purget, quod ueritatem defendat, quod iudicem non faciat iniustum, sed illud solum expectatur quod odio publico necessarium est, confessio nominis, non examinatio criminis: quando, si de aliquo nocente cognoscatis, non statim confesso eo nomen homicidae uel sacrilegi uel incesti uel publici hostis, ut de nostris elogiis loquar, contenti sitis ad pronuntiandum, nisi et consequentia exigatis, qualitatem facti, numerum, locum, modum, tempus, conscios, socios. De nobis nihil tale, cum aeque extorqueri oporteret quod cum falso iactatur, quot quisque iam infanticidia degustasset, quot incesta contenebrasset, qui coci, qui canes adfuissent. O quanta illius praesidis gloria, si eruisset aliquem, qui centum iam infantes comedisset! Atquin inuenimus inquisitionem quoque in nos prohibitam. Plinius enim Secundus cum prouinciam regeret, damnatis

against themselves, or ascribe to their destiny or their star the outbursts of an evil mind. For they are unwilling to acknowledge as their own what they recognise to be bad. But the Christian does nothing of the kind. No (Christian) feels shame, or regret, except of course that he was so late in becoming one. If he is defamed, he rejoices; if he is prosecuted, he does not defend himself; if he is questioned, he at once confesses, if he is condemned, he returns thanks. What evil can there be in this which has none of the characters of evil, either fear, or shame, prevarication, regret, or despair? What? is there evil in that, which causes pleasure to the person accused of it, whose prosecution is his dearest wish, and who finds his happiness in his punishment? You cannot call it madness, since you are proved to know nothing about it.

Chap. II. Again, supposing it to be true that we are criminals of deepest dye, why are we treated differently by you from our fellows, I mean all other criminals, since the same guilt ought to meet with the same treatment? When others are called by whatever name is applied to us, they employ both their own voices and the services of a paid pleader to set forth their innocence. They have every opportunity of answering and cross-questioning, since it is not even legal that persons should be condemned entirely undefended and unheard. But the Christians alone are not permitted to say anything to clear themselves of the charge, to uphold the truth, to prevent injustice in the judge. The one thing looked for is that which is demanded by the popular hatred, the confession of the name, not the weighing of a charge. Whereas, if you were inquiring into the case of some criminal, you would not be satisfied to give a verdict, immediately on his confession of the crime of homicide or sacrilege or incest or treason, to speak of the charges levelled against us, unless you also demanded an account of the accessory facts, the character of the act, the frequency of its repetition, the place, the manner, the time, who were privy to it, who were accomplices in it. In our case no such procedure is followed, although there was an equal necessity to sift by investigation the false charges that are bandied about, how many slaughtered babes each had already tasted, how many times he had committed incest in the dark, what cooks, what dogs had been present (on the occasion). Oh what fame would that governor have acquired, if he had ferreted out some one, who had already eaten up a hundred infants! But we find that in our case even such inquiry is forbidden. For Plinius Secundus, when he was in command of a province, after con-

quibusdam Christianis, quibusdam gradu pulsis, ipsa tamen multitudine perturbatus, quid de cetero ageret, consuluit tunc Traianum imperatorem, adlegans praeter obstinationem non sacrificandi nihil aliud se de sacramentis eorum conperisse quam coetus antelucanos ad canendum Christo et deo, et ad confoederandam disciplinam, homicidium, adulterium, fraudem, perfidiam et cetera scelera prohibentes. Tunc Traianus rescripsit hoc genus inquirendos quidem non esse, oblatos uero puniri oportere. O sententiam necessitate confusam! Negat inquirendos ut innocentes, et mandat puniendos ut nocentes. Parcit et saeuit, dissimulat et animaduertit. Quid temetipsam, censura, circumuenis? Si damnas, cur non et inquiris? si non inquiris, cur non et absoluis? Latronibus uestigandis per uniuersas prouincias militaris statio sortitur. In reos maiestatis et publicos hostes omnis homo miles est; ad socios, ad conscios usque inquisitio extenditur. Solum Christianum inquiri non licet, offerri licet, quasi aliud esset actura inquisitio quam oblationem. Damnatis itaque oblatum quem nemo uoluit requisitum, qui, puto, iam non ideo meruit poenam, quia nocens est, sed quia non requirendus inuentus est. Itaque nec in illo ex forma malorum iudicandorum agitis erga nos, quod ceteris negantibus tormenta adhibetis ad confitendum, solis Christianis ad negandum, cum, si malum esset, nos quidem negaremus, uos uero confiteri tormentis compelleretis. Neque enim ideo non putaretis requirenda quaestionibus scelera, quia certi essetis admitti ea ex nominis confessione, qui hodie de confesso homicida, scientes homicidium quid sit, nihilominus ordinem extorquetis admissi. Quo peruersius, cum praesumatis de sceleribus nostris ex nominis confessione, cogitis tormentis de confessione decedere, ut negantes nomen pariter

demning some Christians, and having dislodged others from the stand they had taken up[1], was nevertheless greatly troubled by their very numbers, and then consulted the Emperor Trajan as to what he should do in future, stating that, apart from the obstinate refusal to sacrifice, he had found out nothing else about their mysteries, save meetings before dawn to sing to Christ and to[2] God, and to establish one common rule of life, forbidding murder, adultery, fraud, treachery and other crimes. Then Trajan replied that such people were not indeed to be sought out, but that if they were brought before the court they ought to be punished. O self-contradictory verdict which says they are not to be sought out, because they are innocent, and yet orders them to be punished as criminals; which spares while it rages, which shuts the eye to crime and yet chastises it. Why, O judgment, dost thou cheat thyself? If thou condemnest, why dost thou not also denounce? If thou dost not denounce, why not also acquit? For the tracking of brigands the soldiers on outpost duty cast lots throughout all the provinces. Against those charged with treason and the enemies of the state, every man is a soldier. The investigation is made wide enough to take in accomplices and others who are privy to it. The Christian alone may not be sought out, but he may be brought into court, as if searching out had any other object than prosecution! You condemn therefore, when prosecuted, one whom no one desired to be sought out, one, I suppose, who already deserved punishment, not because he was guilty, but because, though not to be inquired after, he was found. Thus not in that matter either do you act towards us according to the rule for trying malefactors: namely that to others you apply torture when they deny, to make them confess, to Christians alone you apply it to make them deny. And yet, if it were a crime (with which we were charged), we indeed should deny our guilt, but you by tortures would compel us to confess it. Nor indeed could you think that crimes were not to be investigated by questionings, on the ground that you were assured by the confession of the name that they had been committed. For even to-day, though you know what murder is, you nevertheless extort from a confessed murderer the whole train of circumstances touching the act. Wherefore it is with the greater perverseness that when you make up your minds beforehand about our crimes from the confession of the name, you seek to compel us by tortures to go back from our confession, with the result that in denying the name we at the same time

[1] See G. A. T. Davies in *Journ. Theol. Stud.* (April) 1913.

[2] So the MSS, but surely *ut* 'as to' should be read (cf. Plin. etc.).

utique negemus et scelera, de quibus ex confessione nominis praesumpseratis. Sed, opinor, non uultis nos perire, quos pessimos creditis. Sic enim soletis dicere homicidae Nega, laniari iubere sacrilegum, si confiteri perseuerauerit. Si non ita agitis circa nos nocentes, ergo nos innocentissimos iudicatis, cum quasi innocentissimos non uultis in ea confessione perseuerare, quam necessitate, non iustitia damnandam a uobis sciatis. Vociferatur homo: Christianus sum. Quod est dicit; tu uis audire quod non est. Veritatis extorquendae praesides de nobis solis mendacium elaboratis audire. Hoc sum, inquit, quod quaeris an sim. Quid me torques in peruersum? Confiteor, et torques: quid faceres, si negarem? Plane aliis negantibus non facile fidem accommodatis: nobis, si negauerimus, statim creditis. Suspecta sit uobis ista peruersitas, ne qua uis lateat in occulto, quae uos aduersus formam, aduersus naturam iudicandi, contra ipsas quoque leges ministret. Nisi fallor enim, leges malos erui iubent, non abscondi, confessos damnari praescribunt, non absolui. Hoc senatusconsulta, hoc principum mandata definiunt. Hoc imperium, cuius ministri estis, ciuilis, non tyrannica dominatio est. Apud tyrannos enim tormenta etiam pro poena adhibebantur: apud uos soli quaestioni temperatur. Vestram illis seruate legem usque ad confessionem necessariam, et iam si confessione praeueniantur, uacabunt: sententia opus est: debito poenae nocens expungendus est, non eximendus. Denique nemo illum gestit absoluere. Non licet hoc uelle, ideo nec cogitur quisquam negare. Christianum hominem omnium scelerum reum, deorum, imperatorum, legum, morum, naturae totius inimicum existimas, et cogis negare, ut absoluas quem non poteris absoluere nisi negauerit. Praeuaricaris in leges. Vis ergo neget se nocentem, ut eum facias innocentem, et quidem inuitum iam, nec de praeterito reum. Unde ista peruersitas, ut etiam illud non recogitetis, sponte confesso magis credendum

of course deny the crimes also, about which you presumed us guilty from the confession of the name. But, methinks, you do not wish us to perish, though you believe us to be the worst of men. For is it your wont to say to a murderer, 'Deny the fact?' or to order a sacrilegious person to be torn with scourges, if he continue to confess? If you do not act so in the case of us criminals, you must judge us to be entirely innocent, when you will not have us as innocent persons to persevere in such a confession, as you know has to be condemned by you of necessity and not from justice. A man cries out: 'I am a Christian.' He tells what he is: you wish to hear what he is not. Though presiding to extract the truth, from us alone you strive to hear falsehood. 'I am,' he says, 'that which you ask whether I am: why do you torture me to make me give a wrong answer? You reward my confession with torture: what would you have done, if I had denied?' It is quite evident that, when others deny, you do not readily credit them: while, if we deny, you immediately believe our assertion. You ought to suspect this perversity, lest some power lurk in secret that makes tools of you against all rule, against the nature of judicial trial, even against the laws themselves. For unless I am mistaken, the laws order that malefactors should be rooted out, not concealed: they lay down that those who confess should be condemned, not acquitted. This is ordained by decrees of the senate, by the edicts of emperors. The government whose servants you are is the rule of a fellow-citizen, not of a tyrant. For with tyrants tortures were employed also as punishment; with you they are kept within bounds for the sole purpose of inquiry. Retain for them your law up to the point of necessary confession. And if (tortures) are anticipated by confession, they will be superfluous. A verdict is needed: the guilty man must be struck off the roll of the accused by the punishment which is his due, and not saved from punishment. No one, in short, cares to acquit him: it is not allowable to wish this: consequently no guilty man is compelled to deny his guilt. But a Christian man you believe to be guilty of all crimes, an enemy of gods, emperors, laws, morals, the whole teaching of nature, and yet you compel him to deny, in order that you may acquit one whom you will not be able to acquit unless from his denial. You are guilty of unfair dealing against the laws. You wish him therefore to deny his guilt, that you may make him out to be innocent, and that too unwilling as he now is, and no longer arraigned for the past. Whence comes this perversity, that you should fail to reflect even on this fact, that more credence should be given to one who voluntarily confesses than to one who denies under com-

esse quam per uim neganti? uel ne compulsus negare non ex fide negarit et absolutus ibidem post tribunal de uestra rideat aemulatione iterum Christianus? Cum igitur in omnibus nos aliter disponitis quam ceteros nocentes, ad unum contendendo, ut de eo nomine excludamur (excludimur enim si faciamus quae faciunt non Christiani), intellegere potestis non scelus aliquod in causa esse, sed nomen, quod quaedam ratio aemulae operationis insequitur, hoc primum agens, ut homines nolint scire pro certo quod se nescire pro certo sciunt. Ideo et credunt de nobis quae non probantur, et nolunt inquiri, ne probentur non esse quae malunt credidisse, ut nomen illius aemulae rationis inimicum praesumptis, non probatis criminibus de sua sola confessione damnetur. Ideo torquemur confitentes et punimur perseuerantes et absoluimur negantes, quia nominis proelium est. Denique quid de tabella recitatis illum Christianum? Cur non et homicidam? Si homicida Christianus, cur non et incestus uel quodcunque aliud esse nos creditis? In nobis solis pudet aut piget ipsis nominibus scelerum pronuntiare? Christianus si nullius criminis nomine reus est, ualde incestum, si solius nominis, crimen est.

3. Quid? quod ita plerique clausis oculis in odium eius inpingunt, ut bonum alicui testimonium ferentes admisceant nominis exprobrationem. Bonus uir Gaius Seius, tantum quod Christianus. Item alius: Ego miror Lucium Titium sapientem uirum repente factum Christianum. Nemo retractat, ne ideo bonus Gaius et prudens Lucius, quia Christianus, aut ideo Christianus, quia prudens et bonus. Laudant quae sciunt, uituperant quae ignorant, et id quod sciunt eo quod ignorant inrumpunt, cum sit iustius occulta de manifestis praeiudicare quam manifesta de occultis praedamnare. Alii, quos retro ante hoc nomen uagos, uiles, improbos nouerant, ex ipso denotant quod laudant. Caecitate odii in suffragium inpingunt: Quae mulier!

pulsion? or whether one who has been forced to deny should not have denied sincerely, and after acquittal on the spot, leaving the court, should once more claim to be a Christian, and laugh at your vain effort to prove him other? Since therefore in every way you treat us differently from all other criminals, by aiming at this one thing, that we may be shut out from that name, for we *are* shut out if we do things which Christians do not do, you can understand that there is no crime in question, but just the name, which is harassed by the scheming of a kind of rival agency, its first aim being that men should be unwilling to know for certain that of which they certainly know themselves to be ignorant. Consequently they not only believe what is not proved with regard to us, but they are unwilling that inquiry should be made, lest those things should be proved not to be, which they had rather should be believed to be, so that the hostile name of that rival agency should be condemned merely by its own confession, on the presumption, not the proof of crime. Accordingly we are tortured when we confess, and punished when we persist, and acquitted if we deny, just because it is a battle about a name. Finally, you also read out from the charge-sheet that a man is a Christian. Why not also style him a murderer? If a Christian is a murderer, why not also one guilty of incest or any other crime you believe us to be guilty of? It is in our case only that you are ashamed or reluctant to give a verdict on the mere names of the crimes[1]. If a Christian is guilty of no specific crime, it is a very guilty sort of crime, if one of the name only!

Chap. III. Again, many people are so blinded with prejudice that even when they are bearing witness to a man's excellence, they mingle with it a taunt against the name of Christian. 'So-and-so is a good fellow, were it not that he is a Christian.' So another says 'I marvel that a philosopher like So-and-so should have so suddenly turned Christian.' No one reflects whether the fact that So-and-so is good or wise is due to his Christianity, or the fact that So-and-so is a Christian results from his being wise and good. They praise what they know, and blame what they do not know, and that which they know they spoil because they are really ignorant of it. Surely it were a juster course to prejudge things hidden from things evident, than to precondemn the evident from the hidden. Others characterize in their very praises those they formerly knew, before they received the name of Christian, as vagabonds, worthless and wicked. Through their blind hatred they become

[1] J. B. M. conjectures *scelera*.

quam lasciua, quam festiua! Quis iuuenis! quam lasciuus, quam amasius! Facti sunt Christiani! Ita nomen emendationi inputatur. Nonnulli etiam de utilitatibus suis cum odio isto paciscuntur, contenti iniuria, dum ne domi habeant quod oderunt. Uxorem iam pudicam maritus iam non zelotypus, filium iam subiectum pater retro patiens abdicauit, seruum iam fidelem dominus olim mitis ab oculis relegauit; ut quisque hoc nomine emendatur, offendit. Tanti non est bonum quanti odium Christianorum. Nunc igitur, si nominis odium est, quis nominum reatus? Quae accusatio uocabulorum, nisi si aut barbarum sonat aliqua uox nominis, aut infaustum aut maledicum aut inpudicum? Christianus uero, quantum interpretatio est, de unctione deducitur. Sed et cum perperam Chrestianus pronuntiatur a uobis (nam nec nominis certa est notitia penes uos), de suauitate uel benignitate conpositum est. Oditur itaque in hominibus innocuis etiam nomen innocuum. At enim secta oditur in nomine utique sui auctoris. Quid noui, si aliqua disciplina de magistro cognomentum sectatoribus suis inducit? Nonne philosophi de auctoribus suis nuncupantur Platonici, Epicurei, Pythagorici? etiam a locis conuenticulorum et stationum suarum Stoici, Academici? aeque medici ab Erasistrato et grammatici ab Aristarcho, coci etiam ab Apicio? nec tamen quemquam offendit professio nominis cum institutione transmissa ab institutore. Plane, si qui probauit malam sectam et ita malum et auctorem, is probabit et nomen malum dignum odio de reatu sectae et auctoris, ideoque ante odium nominis conpetebat prius de auctore sectam recognoscere uel auctorem de secta. At nunc utriusque inquisitione et agnitione neglecta nomen detinetur, nomen expugnatur, et ignotam sectam, ignotum et auctorem uox sola praedamnat, quia nominantur, non quia reuincuntur.

4. Atque adeo quasi praefatus haec ad sugillandam odii erga nos publici iniquitatem, iam de causa innocentiae consistam,

vehement supporters. 'What a fine woman! How merry, how debonair!' 'What a fine fellow, what a sport, what a gallant!' They have become Christians. Thus is the name applied to their reformation. Some even make a bargain with this hatred at the cost of their interests, ready to put up with harm, provided that what they hate is not mixed up with their home-life. A husband now no longer jealous has turned out of doors his now chaste wife: a father, patient in the past, has disinherited his now obedient son: a once forgiving master has banished from his sight a now faithful servant. In each case the reform effected by the name of Christian is the ground of offence. Goodness is not of such account as hatred of the Christians. Now therefore if it is a name that is hated what charge can there be against a name, what prosecution of words, unless it be that a particular utterance of a word has a barbarous or ill-omened or a scurrilous or immodest sound? The name Christian indeed, so far as its meaning is concerned, is derived from 'anointing.' And even when it is wrongly pronounced 'Chreestian' by you—for neither is there any real knowledge of the name among you—it is made up from sweetness or kindness. And thus even an innocent name gets hated in the case of innocent men. But indeed there can be no doubt that the sect is hated in the name of its Founder. What novelty is there in a school of thought bringing on its followers a name taken from its teacher? Are not philosophers named after their founders, e.g. Platonists, Epicureans, Pythagoreans? or even from their places of meeting and their stations, as Stoics or Academics? so too physicians from Erasistratus, and grammarians from Aristarchus, and even cooks from Apicius? And yet the profession of a name, handed down with the institution from the founder himself, causes no offence. To be sure, if any one should prove a sect to be evil, and thus the originator also to be evil, he will prove the name to be likewise evil, worthy of hatred from the guilt attaching to the sect and its founder. Hence, before hating the name, it were fitting first to convict the sect from the character of the founder, or the founder from the character of the sect. But, as matters are, though the investigation and examination of both are neglected, the name is laid hold of, the name is made the object of attack, and a mere word prejudges a sect and its founder (though both are equally unknown) simply because they bear a name, not because they are convicted of guilt.

Chap. IV. Having then made this sort of preface by way of hammering into men's heads the unfairness of the popular hatred

nec tantum refutabo quae nobis obiciuntur, sed etiam in ipsos retorquebo qui obiciunt, ut ex hoc quoque sciant homines in Christianis non esse quae in se nesciunt esse, simul uti erubescant accusantes non dico pessimi optimos, sed iam, ut uolunt, conpares suos. Respondebimus ad singula quae in occulto admittere dicimur, quae illos palam admittentes inuenimus, in quibus scelesti, in quibus uani, in quibus damnandis, in quibus inridendi deputamur. Sed quoniam, cum ad omnia occurrit ueritas nostra, postremo legum obstruitur auctoritas aduersus eam, ut aut nihil dicatur retractandum esse post leges aut ingratis necessitas obsequii praeferatur ueritati, de legibus prius concurram uobiscum ut cum tutoribus legum. Iam primum cum dure definitis dicendo: Non licet esse uos! et hoc sine ullo retractatu humaniore praescribitis, uim profitemini et iniquam ex arce dominationem, si ideo negatis licere, quia uultis, non quia debuit non licere. Quodsi, quia non debet, ideo non uultis licere, sine dubio id non debet licere quod male fit, et utique hoc ipso praeiudicatur licere quod bene fit. Si bonum inuenero esse quod lex tua prohibuit, nonne ex illo praeiudicio prohibere me non potest quod, si malum esset, iure prohiberet? Si lex tua errauit, puto, ab homine concepta est; neque enim de caelo ruit. Miramini hominem aut errare potuisse in lege condenda aut resipuisse in reprobanda? Non enim et ipsius Lycurgi leges a Lacedaemoniis emendatae tantum auctori suo doloris incusserunt, ut in secessu inedia de semetipso iudicarit? Nonne et uos cotidie experimentis inluminantibus tenebras antiquitatis totam illam ueterem et squalentem siluam legum nouis principalium rescriptorum et edictorum securibus truncatis et caeditis? Nonne uanissimas Papias leges, quae ante liberos suscipi cogunt quam Iuliae matrimonium contrahi, post tantae auctoritatis senectutem heri Seuerus, constantissimus principum, exclusit? Sed et iudicatos in partes secari a creditoribus leges

towards us, I will now join issue as to the question of innocence, and will not only rebut the charges against us, but will even cause them to recoil on the very men who make them; that from this also men may know that Christians are free from those failings, of the existence of which in themselves their critics are unconscious; and that they may at the same time blush, while they accuse us I do not say the worst accusing the best, but rather (as they themselves would have it) ordinary persons accusing their fellows. We will meet each of the secret scandals laid to our charge by appealing to the same acts committed openly, acts in which we are held to show ourselves wicked, empty-headed, worthy of condemnation and of ridicule. But since when the truth of our cause meets you at every turn, the authority of the laws is at last set up against it, so that either it is said that nothing is to be reconsidered after the laws have decided, or the necessity of obedience is unwillingly preferred to truth, it is upon the laws that I will first join issue with you, as their guardians. In the first place then, when you harshly lay down the law by your phrase 'Your existence is forbidden,' and enjoin this without any gentler reservation, you make no secret of violence and tyranny as belonging to your stronghold, if you deny us the right to exist because such is your will, not because it was fitting that we should be outlawed. If however you wish this not to be allowed because it is not right, no doubt an evil action ought not to be allowed; and of course this very fact involves a previous judgment that a good action is legal. If I shall find something to be good, which your law has forbidden, is it not, by this previous determination, disabled from forbidding me that which, if it were evil, it would justly forbid? If your law has made a mistake, I suppose it is because it was framed by a man, for it certainly did not fall from heaven. Do you wonder either that a man should have made a mistake in framing a law, or should have come to his senses again when he finds in it matter for emendation? Did not even the improvements made by the Spartans in the laws of Lycurgus himself cause him such pain that he determined to resign office and starve himself to death? Do not even you too, as daily experience throws light upon the darkness of antiquity, lop and cut down all the wild growth of that ancient forest of statutes with the new axes of imperial rescripts and edicts? Did not Severus, that most determined of emperors, as it were but yesterday, abrogate the ridiculous Papian laws, which enforced the bringing up of children before the Julian laws enforced the contracting of marriage,—laws whose antiquity gave them such high authority? Nay there were even laws authorizing that those

erant. consensu tamen publico crudelitas postea erasa est, in pudoris notam capitis poena conuersa est. Bonorum adhibita proscriptio suffundere maluit hominis sanguinem quam effundere. Quot adhuc uobis repurgandae latent leges, quas neque annorum numerus neque conditorum dignitas commendat, sed aequitas sola? et ideo cum iniquae recognoscuntur, merito damnantur. licet damnent. Quomodo iniquas dicimus? Immo, si nomen puniunt, etiam stultas: si uero facta, cur de solo nomine puniunt facta, quae in aliis de admisso, non de nomine probata defendunt? Incestus sum, cur non requirunt? Infanticidia cur non extorquent? In deos, in Caesares aliquid committo, cur non audior qui habeo quo purger? Nulla lex uetat discuti quod prohibet admitti, quia neque iudex iuste ulciscitur, nisi cognoscat admissum esse quod non licet, neque ciuis fideliter legi obsequitur ignorans quale sit quod ulciscitur lex. Nulla lex sibi soli conscientiam iustitiae suae debet, sed eis a quibus obsequium expectat. Ceterum suspecta lex est quae probari se non uult, inproba autem, si non probata dominetur.

5. Ut de origine aliquid retractemus eiusmodi legum, uetus erat decretum, ne qui deus ab imperatore consecraretur nisi a senatu probatus. Scit M. Aemilius de deo suo Alburno. Facit et hoc ad causam nostram, quod apud uos de humano arbitratu diuinitas pensitatur. Nisi homini deus placuerit, deus non erit; homo iam deo propitius esse debebit. Tiberius ergo, cuius tempore nomen Christianum in saeculum introiuit, adnuntiata sibi ex Syria Palaestina, quae illic ueritatem ipsius diuinitatis reuelauerant, detulit ad senatum cum praerogatiua suffragii sui. Senatus, quia non ipse probauerat, respuit, Caesar in sententia mansit, comminatus periculum accusatoribus Christianorum. Consulite commentarios uestros, illic reperietis primum Neronem in hanc sectam cum maxime Romae orientem

sentenced under them should be cut in pieces by their creditors, yet was this cruelty afterwards blotted out by public consent, the punishment of death being converted into a mark of disgrace. By the resort to a public sale of property they preferred to raise the blush of shame rather than to shed blood. How many laws still lie hidden for you to purify, laws which neither antiquity nor the dignity of their framers, but only their fairness (if such there be) commends? and therefore when they are recognised to be unfair, though condemning, they are deservedly condemned. But how do we call them unfair? Nay, if they punish the mere name, we call them foolish also. If however it is deeds that they punish, why, in our case, do they punish deeds on the ground merely of the name, which in other cases they maintain must be proved by the act and not from the name given to the accused? I am guilty of incest: why do they not inquire into it? of infanticide, why do they not extort a confession? I commit some offence against the gods or the Caesars; why am I not heard, when I am able to clear myself? No law forbids the investigation of that which is prohibited, because neither can any judge rightly exact punishment unless he knows that an illegal offence has been committed; nor can any citizen loyally obey the law, if ignorant of the nature of that which is punished by the law. The law is not only bound to satisfy itself as to its own intrinsic justice; it must also satisfy those from whom it looks for obedience. A law excites suspicion if it is not willing to be tested, and it is wicked if, after being disapproved, it claims despotic power.

Chap. V. And now to treat somewhat more fully of the origin of laws of this kind, there was an old decree that no god should be consecrated by the emperor without the approval of the senate. M. Aemilius learnt this in the case of his god Alburnus. This, too, makes in our favour, because among you divinity is weighed out by human caprice. Unless a god shall have been acceptable to man, he shall not be a god: man must now be propitious to a god. Accordingly Tiberius, in whose time the Christian name first made its appearance in the world, laid before the senate tidings from Syria Palaestina which had revealed to him the truth of the divinity there manifested, and supported the motion by his own vote to begin with. The senate rejected it because it had not itself given its approval. Caesar held to his own opinion and threatened danger to the accusers of the Christians. Consult your records: you will there find that Nero was the first emperor who wreaked his fury in the blood of Christians, when our religion was just springing

Caesariano gladio ferocisse. Sed tali dedicatore damnationis nostrae etiam gloriamur. Qui enim scit illum, intellegere potest non nisi grande aliquod bonum a Nerone damnatum. Temptauerat et Domitianus, portio Neronis de crudelitate, sed qua et homo, facile coeptum repressit, restitutis etiam quos relegauerat. Tales semper nobis insecutores, iniusti, impii, turpes, quos et ipsi damnare consuestis, a quibus damnatos restituere soliti estis. Ceterum de tot exinde principibus ad hodiernum diuinum humanumque sapientibus edite aliquem debellatorem Christianorum! At nos e contrario edimus protectorem, si litterae M. Aurelii grauissimi imperatoris requirantur, quibus illam Germanicam sitim Christianorum forte militum precationibus impetrato imbri discussam contestatur. Sicut non palam ab eiusmodi hominibus poenam dimouit, ita alio modo palam dispersit, adiecta etiam accusatoribus damnatione, et quidem tetriore. Quales ergo leges istae quas aduersus nos soli exercent impii, iniusti, turpes, truces, uani, dementes? quas Traianus ex parte frustratus est uetando inquiri Christianos. quas nullus Hadrianus, quamquam omnium curiositatum explorator, nullus Vespasianus, quamquam Iudaeorum debellator, nullus Pius, nullus Verus impressit. Facilius utique pessimi ab optimis quibusque, ut ab aemulis, quam a suis sociis eradicandi iudicarentur.

6. Nunc religiosissimi legum et paternorum institutorum protectores et ultores respondeant uelim de sua fide et honore et obsequio erga maiorum consulta, si a nullo desciuerunt, si in nullo exorbitauerunt, si non necessaria et aptissima quaeque disciplinae oblitterauerunt. Quonam illae leges abierunt sumptum et ambitionem comprimentes? quae centum aera non amplius in coenam subscribi iubebant nec amplius quam unam inferri gallinam, et eam non saginatam, quae patricium, quod decem pondo argenti habuisset, pro magno ambitionis titulo

up in Rome. But we even glory in being first dedicated to destruction by such a monster. For whoever knows him can understand that it could only have been something of supreme excellence that could have called forth the condemnation of Nero. Domitian too had tried the same experiment as Nero, with a large share of Nero's cruelty, but inasmuch as he retained something of humanity also, he was easily able to change his course, even restoring those whom he had banished. Such have always been our persecutors, unjust, impious and treacherous, whom even ye yourselves have been wont to condemn and to reinstate those who were condemned by them. But out of so many emperors who reigned from that time to the present, men versed in knowledge, human and divine, show us one who set himself to destroy the Christians. We on the other hand can show you a protector, if the letters of the honoured emperor M. Aurelius be searched, in which he testifies that the famous drought in Germany was put a stop to by the rain which fell in answer to the prayers of the Christians who happened to be in his army. Thus, although he did not openly abolish punishment incurred by such men, yet in another way he openly neutralized it, adding also a condemnation, and indeed a more shocking one, for their prosecutors. Of what sort then are these laws, which are put into force against us by the impious, the unjust, the base, the cruel, the foolish, the mad, and by them alone? Laws which Trajan made less effective by forbidding Christians to be sought out; to which no Hadrian, although an investigator of all curiosities, no Vespasian, although conqueror of the Jews, no Pius, no Verus ever set his mark. Certainly the worst of men would be more readily sentenced to death by all the best, as their enemies, than by their own accomplices.

Chap. VI. Now I should like these scrupulous champions and avengers of laws and ancestral institutions to answer with regard to their own loyalty, respect and obedience towards the decrees of their ancestors, whether they have abandoned none, whether they have transgressed in none, whether they have not abolished what were the necessary and most appropriate elements of their rule of life. What has become of those laws which checked extravagance and ostentation? those which ordered that not more than a hundred pence should be allowed for a dinner, that not more than one fowl and that not specially fattened should be served, which removed a patrician from the senate, because he had ten pounds weight of wrought silver, on the ground that this was a notable proof of ostentation,

senatu submouebant, quae theatra stuprandis moribus orientia statim destruebant, quae dignitatum et honestorum natalium insignia non temere nec inpune usurpari sinebant? Video enim et centenarias coenas a centenis iam sestertiis dicendas, et in lances (parum est si senatorum et non libertinorum uel adhuc flagra rumpentium) argentaria metalla producta. Video et theatra nec singula satis esse nec nuda; nam ne uel hieme uoluptas inpudica frigeret, primi Lacedaemonii penulam ludis excogitauerunt. Video et inter matronas atque prostibulas nullum de habitu discrimen relictum. Circa feminas quidem etiam illa maiorum instituta ceciderunt quae modestiae, quae sobrietati patrocinabantur, cum aurum nulla norat praeter unico digito quem sponsus obpignorasset pronubo anulo, cum mulieres usque adeo uino abstinerentur, ut matronam ob resignatos cellae uinariae loculos sui inedia necarint, sub Romulo uero quae uinum attigerat, inpune a Metennio marito trucidata sit. Idcirco et oscula propinquis offerre etiam necessitas erat, ut spiritu iudicarentur. Ubi est illa felicitas matrimoniorum de moribus utique prosperata, qua per annos ferme sexcentos ab urbe condita nulla repudium domus scripsit? At nunc in feminis prae auro nullum leue est membrum, prae uino nullum liberum est osculum, repudium uero iam et uotum est, quasi matrimonii fructus. Etiam circa ipsos deos uestros quae prospecte decreuerant patres uestri, idem uos obsequentissimi rescidistis. Liberum Patrem cum mysteriis suis consules senatus auctoritate non modo urbe, sed uniuersa Italia eliminauerunt. Serapidem et Isidem et Arpocratem cum suo cynocephalo Capitolio prohibitos inferri, id est curia deorum pulsos, Piso et Gabinius consules non utique Christiani euersis etiam aris eorum abdicauerunt, turpium et otiosarum superstitionum uitia cohibentes. His uos restitutis summam maiestatem contulistis. Ubi religio, ubi ueneratio maioribus debita a uobis? Habitu, uictu, instructu, sensu, ipso denique sermone

which proceeded at once to destroy theatres as they rose for the corruption of morals, which did not allow the badges of office or noble birth to be employed lightly or with impunity? (I ask these questions) for I see dinners, which can only be called centuries from the 100,000 sesterces they cost, and whole mines of silver worked out into plates, a small thing if they were the property of senators only and not of freedmen or of those who are still liable to be flogged. I see too that one theatre, or a theatre open to the sky, is not enough for each town: for doubtless it was to prevent their immodest pleasure from being too cold in winter, that the Spartans first invented their cloak for the sports. I see too that there is no difference left between the dress of matrons and that of prostitutes. Indeed with regard to women even those customs of our ancestors have fallen into disuse, which protected modesty and sobriety, in an age when no woman knew aught of gold save on the one finger which the bridegroom had claimed for himself with the wedding ring, and when women abstained from wine to such a degree, that her relatives put a matron to death by starvation for breaking open the bins of the wine-cellar. Under Romulus indeed one who had touched wine was put to death with impunity by her husband Metennius. For the same reason they were also even obliged to offer kisses to their kinsfolk, that they might be judged by their breath. Where is now that happiness of married life so successful in point of morals at any rate, the result of which was that for about six hundred years after the foundation of Rome a writing of divorce was unknown? But now in the case of women every part of the body is weighted with gold, no kiss is free owing to wine, and divorce is now the object of prayer, as the natural fruit of marriage. Even with regard to your gods themselves the wise decrees of your ancestors with their application to the future have been rescinded by you, the very people who plume yourselves on your obedience to them. The consuls on the authority of the senate banished Father Bacchus with his mysteries not only from the capital but from the whole of Italy. Serapis and Isis and Harpocrates with their dog-headed attendant were forbidden the Capitol, in other words were expelled from the parliament of the gods, their altars overturned and themselves banished by the consuls Piso and Gabinius, who were assuredly no Christians, with a view to check the vices arising from their base and idle superstitions. But these you have restored, and conferred on them the highest dignity. Where is your religion, where the respect you owe to your ancestors? In dress, in food, in household arrangements, in feeling, even in

proauis renuntiastis. Laudatis semper antiquitatem, et noue de die uiuitis. Per quod ostenditur, dum a bonis maiorum institutis deceditis, ea uos retinere et custodire quae non debuistis, cum quae debuistis non custodistis. Ipsum adhuc quod uidemini fidelissime tueri a patribus traditum, in quo principaliter reos transgressionis Christianos destinastis, studium dico deorum colendorum, de quo maxime errauit antiquitas, licet Serapidi iam Romano aras restruxeritis, licet Baccho iam Italico furias uestras immoletis, suo loco ostendam proinde despici et neglegi et destrui a uobis aduersus maiorum auctoritatem. Nunc enim ad illam occultorum facinorum infamiam respondebo, ut uiam mihi ad manifestiora purgem.

7. Dicimur sceleratissimi de sacramento infanticidii et pabulo inde, et post conuiuium incesto, quod euersores luminum canes, lenones scilicet tenebrarum, libidinum impiarum in uerecundiam procurent. Dicimur tamen semper, nec uos quod tam diu dicimur eruere curatis. Ergo aut eruite, si creditis, aut nolite credere, qui non eruistis. De uestra uobis dissimulatione praescribitur non esse quod nec ipsi audetis eruere. Longe aliud munus carnifici in Christianos imperatis, non ut dicant quae faciunt, sed ut negent quod sunt. Census istius disciplinae, ut iam edidimus, a Tiberio est. Cum odio sui coepit ueritas. Simul atque apparuit, inimica est. Tot hostes eius quot extranei, et quidem proprie ex aemulatione Iudaei, ex concussione milites, ex natura ipsi etiam domestici nostri. Cotidie obsidemur, cotidie prodimur, in ipsis plurimum coetibus et congregationibus nostris opprimimur. Quis umquam taliter uagienti infanti superuenit? Quis cruenta, ut inuenerat, Cyclopum et Sirenum ora iudici reseruauit? Quis uel in uxoribus aliqua inmunda uestigia deprehendit? Quis talia facinora cum inuenisset, celauit aut uendidit ipsos trahens

language itself you have abandoned your ancestors. You are always praising old times, but you change your position from day to day. By this it is shown that, in departing from the good customs of your ancestors, you retain and preserve those which you ought not, while you have not preserved those which you ought. Even the very thing that you still seem most faithfully to guard, as handed down by your ancestors, that in which most of all you have marked the Christians as guilty of transgression, I mean zeal in the worship of the gods, (concerning which early ages made the greatest mistakes,) although you have built up again the altars to Serapis, now become a Roman, although you present the frantic orgies of your worship to Bacchus, now an Italian, I will show in the proper place that these are alike looked down upon and slighted and undermined by you against the authority of your ancestors. But now I will reply to that evil reputation for secret crimes, to clear my way for the more open ones.

Chap. VII. We are called abominable from the sacrament of infanticide and the feeding thereon, as well as the incestuous intercourse, following the banquet, because the dogs, that overturn the lamps, (our pimps forsooth of the darkness) bring about the shamelessness engendered by our impious lusts. Yet we are but called so on each occasion, and you take no pains to bring to light what we have been so long charged with. Therefore either prove the fact, if you believe it, or refuse to believe it, you who have not proved it. For your want of straightforwardness a preliminary objection is raised against you, that that cannot be true which not even you yourselves dare to search out. It is quite a different duty that you lay upon the executioner against the Christians, namely, not that they should say of what they are guilty, but that they should deny what they are. The beginning of this teaching, as I have already stated, dates from Tiberius. Truth from the first was accompanied by hatred of herself: from her first appearance she is an enemy. She has as many enemies as there are strangers to her, the Jews indeed quite specially so from jealousy, the soldiers from their violence, and even the very members of our households from natural ill-feeling. We are daily besieged, we are daily betrayed, even in our very meetings and assemblies we are frequently surprised. Who ever came upon an infant wailing under such circumstances? Who ever kept for the judge the bloodstained faces of Cyclopes and Sirens just as he had found them? Who detected even on our wives any trace of impurity? Who when he had discovered such crimes, concealed them or sold his concealment of them,

homines? Si semper latemus, quando proditum est quod admittimus? immo a quibus prodi potuit? Ab ipsis enim reis non utique, cum uel ex forma omnibus mysteriis silentii fides debeatur. Samothracia et Eleusinia reticentur, quanto magis talia quae prodita interim etiam humanam animaduersionem prouocabunt, dum diuina seruatur? Si ergo non ipsi proditores sui, sequitur ut extranei. Et unde extraneis notitia, cum semper etiam piae initiationes arceant profanos et arbitris caueant? Nisi si impii minus metuunt. Natura famae omnibus nota est. Vestrum est: Fama malum qua non aliud uelocius ullum. Cur malum fama? quia uelox? quia index? an quia plurimum mendax? quae ne tunc quidem, cum aliquid ueri adfert, sine mendacii uitio est, detrahens, adiciens, demutans de ueritate. Quid? quod ea illi condicio est, ut non nisi cum mentitur perseueret et tamdiu uiuit quamdiu non probat, siquidem, ubi probauit, cessat esse et quasi officio nuntiandi functa rem tradit, et exinde res tenetur, res nominatur. Nec quisquam dicit uerbi gratia, Hoc Romae aiunt factum, aut, Fama est illum prouinciam sortitum, sed, Sortitus est ille prouinciam, et, Hoc factum est Romae. Fama, nomen incerti, locum non habet ubi certum est. An uero famae credat nisi inconsideratus? Quia sapiens non credit incerto. Omnium est aestimare, quantacunque illa ambitione diffusa sit, quantacunque asseueratione constructa, quod ab uno aliquando principe exorta sit necesse est. Exinde in traduces linguarum et aurium serpit, et ita modici seminis uitium cetera rumoris obscurat, ut nemo recogitet, ne primum illud os mendacium seminauerit, quod saepe fit aut ingenio aemulationis aut arbitrio suspicionis aut non noua sed ingenita quibusdam mentiendi uoluptate. Bene autem quod omnia tempus reuelat, testibus etiam uestris prouerbiis atque sententiis, ex dispositione naturae, quae ita ordinauit, ut nihil diu lateat, etiam quod fama non

with the very offenders in his grasp? If we are always in hiding, when was the crime we commit betrayed? nay rather, by whom could it be betrayed? Assuredly not by the accused themselves, since even according to rule all mysteries are bound to be loyally concealed. Silence is preserved with regard to the mysteries of Samothrace and Eleusis; how much more with regard to such as if betrayed will sometimes even call forth human punishment, while their divine character is preserved! unless therefore they are themselves their own betrayers, it follows that the betrayers must be outsiders. And, if so, whence do the outsiders obtain the knowledge, since even religious initiations always exclude the profane and take precautions against the presence of eye-witnesses, unless it be that the impious are bolder than others? The nature of rumour is known to all. One of your (own) writers says: 'Rumour, than which no other evil is swifter.' Why is rumour an evil? because it is swift? because it gives information? or is it because it is very often lying? Even when it brings some truth with it, it is not exempt from the flaw of falsehood, as it takes away from, adds to, and alters the truth. What are we to say of the fact that its character is such that it does not persist without lying and it lives only as long as it cannot prove its truth; since when it has proved it, it ceases to exist and as though it had done its work of reporting hands down the matter, and thereafter it is held to be fact, and is so called. Nor does anyone for example remark: 'They say this has happened at Rome,' or 'The rumour is that he has obtained the province (by lot),' but 'He has obtained the province,' and:—'This has happened at Rome.' Rumour, a name belonging to uncertainty, has no place where certainty exists. Would anyone indeed, unless he were devoid of sense, believe rumour? A wise man does not trust what is uncertain. Anyone can judge that, however great may be the extent to which the story is spread, however great the confidence with which it has been built up, still it must have sprung at some time or other from a single root. From that it creeps into the branches of tongues and ears. And a fault in the little seed is so concealed by the shield[1] of rumour, that no one reflects whether that first mouth may not have sown the lie, a thing that often happens either through the inventiveness of jealousy or the humour of suspicion or the pleasure in lying, which is not new but inborn in some people. It is a good thing that time reveals everything, as even your proverbs and maxims testify, by the arrangement of nature, which has so ordered it that nothing is concealed for long, even that which rumour has

[1] Reading *caetra* with Schrörs.

distulit. Merito igitur fama tamdiu conscia sola est scelerum Christianorum. Hanc indicem aduersus nos profertis, quae quod aliquando iactauit tantoque spatio in opinionem corroborauit usque adhuc probare non ualuit, ut fidem naturae ipsius appellem aduersus eos qui talia credenda esse praesumunt.

8. Ecce proponimus horum facinorum mercedem. Vitam aeternam repromittunt. Credite interim. De hoc enim quaero, an et qui credideris tanti habeas ad eam tali conscientia peruenire. Veni, demerge ferrum in infantem nullius inimicum, nullius reum, omnium filium, uel, si alterius officium est, tu modo adsiste morienti homini antequam uixit, fugientem animam nouam expecta, excipe rudem sanguinem, eo panem tuum satia, uescere libenter. Interea discumbens dinumera loca, ubi mater, ubi soror; nota diligenter, ut, cum tenebrae ceciderint caninae, non erres. Piaculum enim admiseris nisi incestum feceris. Talia initiatus et consignatus uiuis in aeuum. Cupio respondeas, si tanti aeternitas. Aut si non, ideo nec credenda. Etiamsi credideris, nego te uelle; etiamsi uolueris, nego te posse. Cur ergo alii possint, si uos non potestis? cur non possitis, si alii possunt? Alia nos, opinor, natura; Cynopaene aut Sciapodes? Alii ordines dentium, alii ad incestam libidinem nerui? Qui ista credis de homine, potes et facere. Homo es et ipse, quod et Christianus. Qui non potes facere, non debes credere. Homo est enim et Christianus et quod et tu. Sed ignorantibus subicitur et inponitur. Nihil enim tale de Christianis asseuerari sciebant obseruandum utique sibi et omni uigilantia inuestigandum. Atquin uolentibus initiari moris est, opinor, prius patrem illum sacrorum adire, quae praeparanda sint describere. Tum ille: Infans tibi necessarius adhuc tener, qui nesciat mortem, qui sub cultro tuo rideat; item panis, quo sanguinis uirulentiam colligas; praeterea

not spread abroad. Justly therefore, has rumour and rumour alone had for so long any knowledge of the crimes of the Christians. This is the informer you produce against us, one which as yet has not been able to prove what it has so long thrown out and what in so long a period of time it has strengthened into a settled opinion. But now to appeal to the credit of nature herself against those who dare to assume that such stories are to be believed.

Chap. VIII. Lo, I set before you the reward of such crimes; they promise everlasting life. Believe it for the moment. About this I ask whether even you who have believed think it worth while to attain it at the price of such a (guilty) conscience. Come, plunge the sword into an infant who is no one's enemy, guilty of no crime, the child of all: or if such bloodshed is another's duty, do you merely stand by a human being dying before he has really lived; wait for the flight of the new life; catch the scarce-formed blood; with it soak your bread, and enjoy your meal. Meantime, as you recline, count the places and mark where your mother, where your sister is; make a careful note, so that when the dogs have put out the lights, you may not make a mistake. For you will be guilty of sin if you fail to commit incest. Thus initiated and sealed, you live for ever. Please tell me, whether eternity is worth such a price; if it is not so, it ought not to be believed to be so. Even if you believed it, I deny that you wished it; even if you wished it, I deny that you could do it. Why then should others be capable of doing what you cannot do? why could not you do it if others can? We, I suppose, are of another nature—monstrosities with heads of dogs or with feet so large as to shade us; with teeth differently arranged, and with organs different from other men, for the gratification of incestuous lust! You who believe such things about a fellow man can also do them yourself. You too are a human being, as the Christian is too. You who are incapable of the deeds, ought not to believe them possible. For the Christian also is a human being as you are. But perhaps the ignorant alone are tricked and decoyed into our religion: for they knew that no such statement was made about the Christians: but they must assuredly look to the matter and study it with all care. And yet, it is the custom, I fancy, for those who wish to be initiated, first to approach the father of the rites, and to write down what has to be prepared. Then he says: 'You have need of a little child, still soft, with no knowledge of death, who will smile under your knife: also bread, in which to gather the blood sauce; further, candlesticks

candelabra et lucernae et canes aliqui et offulae, quae illos ad euersionem luminum extendant: ante omnia cum matre et sorore tua uenire debebis. Quid, si noluerint uel nullae fuerint? quid denique singulares Christiani? Non erit, opinor, legitimus Christianus nisi frater aut filius. Quid nunc, et si ista omnia ignaris praeparantur? Certe postea cognoscunt et sustinent et ignoscunt. Timent plecti, si proclament, qui defendi merebuntur, qui etiam ultro perire malint quam sub tali conscientia uiuere. Age nunc timeant, cur etiam perseuerant? Sequitur enim, ne ultra uelis id te esse quod, si prius scisses, non fuisses.

9. Haec quo magis refutauerim, a uobis fieri ostendam partim in aperto, partim in occulto, per quod forsitan et de nobis credidistis. Infantes penes Africam Saturno immolabantur palam usque ad proconsulatum Tiberii, qui eosdem sacerdotes in eisdem arboribus templi sui obumbratricibus scelerum uotiuis crucibus exposuit, teste militia patriae nostrae, quae id ipsum munus illi proconsuli functa est. Sed et nunc in occulto perseueratur hoc sacrum facinus. Non soli uos contemnunt Christiani, nec ullum scelus in perpetuum eradicatur aut mores suos aliqui deus mutat. Cum propriis filiis Saturnus non pepercit, extraneis utique non parcendo perseuerabat, quos quidem ipsi parentes sui offerebant et libentes respondebant et infantibus blandiebantur, ne lacrimantes immolarentur. Et tamen multum homicidio parricidium differt. Maior aetas apud Gallos Mercurio prosecatur. Remitto fabulas Tauricas theatris suis. Ecce in illa religiosissima urbe Aeneadarum piorum est Iupiter quidam quem ludis suis humano sanguine proluunt. Sed bestiarii, inquitis. Hoc, opinor, minus quam hominis? An hoc turpius, quod mali hominis? certe tamen de homicidio funditur. O Iouem Christianum et solum patris filium de crudelitate! Sed quoniam de infanticidio nihil interest sacro an arbitrio perpetretur, licet parricidium homicidio intersit,

and lamps and some dogs and little morsels of meat, to make them strain and overturn the lamps; above all you will have to come with your mother and sister. What if they refuse or if you have none? What in a word are solitary Christians to do? Every lawful Christian will be, I suppose, either a brother or a son. What now, even if all these things are prepared for those who know nothing about them? At any rate they learn it later, and endure it and pardon it! You will say they fear punishment, though, if they declared the facts, they would deserve every protection, and though they would rather suffer death than live with such a consciousness of guilt! Suppose, however, that they are still afraid, why do they still continue to be Christians? For it follows that you no longer wish to be that which you would never have become if you had known beforehand.

CHAP. IX. To refute these charges more effectively, I will show that these crimes are perpetrated by you both in public and in secret, which is perhaps the reason that you have come to believe them about us also. Babes were sacrificed publicly to Saturn in Africa till the proconsulate of Tiberius, who exposed the same priests on the same trees that overshadow the crimes of their temple, on dedicated crosses, as is attested by the soldiery of my father[1], which performed that very service for that proconsul. But even now this accursed crime is in secret kept up. It is not the Christians only who despise you; nor is any crime rooted out once for all, nor does any god change his character. Since Saturn did not spare his own children, of course he stuck to his habit of not sparing those of other people, whom indeed their own parents offered of themselves, being pleased to answer the call, and fondled the infants, lest they should weep when being sacrificed. And yet a parent's murder of his child is far worse than simple homicide. Among the Gauls adults are sacrificed to Mercury. I leave the fables about the Taurians to the theatres to which they belong. Lo, in that deeply religious city of the pious descendants of Aeneas there is a certain Jupiter whom at his own games they drench with human blood. 'But,' say you, 'only that of a criminal condemned to the beasts.' This, I suppose, is of less value than that of a human being. Or is this the viler, because it is that of an evil man? At any rate it is the blood of homicide that is shed. What a Christian is Jupiter, the only son of his father in point of cruelty! But since, in a case of infanticide, it matters not whether it is carried out as a sacred rite or out of mere caprice

[1] Reading *patris nostri.*

conuertar ad populum. Quot uultis ex his circumstantibus et in Christianorum sanguinem hiantibus, ex ipsis etiam uobis iustissimis et seuerissimis in nos praesidibus apud conscientias pulsem, qui natos sibi liberos enecent? Siquidem et de genere necis differt, utique crudelius in aqua spiritum extorquetis aut frigori et fami et canibus exponitis. Ferro enim mori aetas quoque maior optauerit. Nobis uero semel homicidio interdicto etiam conceptum utero, dum adhuc sanguis in hominem delibatur, dissoluere non licet. Homicidii festinatio est prohibere nasci, nec refert natam quis eripiat animam an nascentem disturbet. Homo est et qui est futurus; etiam fructus omnis iam in semine est. De sanguinis pabulo et eiusmodi tragicis ferculis legite, necubi relatum sit (est apud Herodotum, opinor), defusum brachiis sanguinem ex alterutro degustatum nationes quasdam foederi conparasse. Nescio quid et sub Catilina degustatum est. Aiunt et apud quosdam gentiles Scytharum defunctum quemque a suis comedi. Longe excurro. Hodie istic Bellonae sacratus sanguis de femore proscisso in palmulam exceptus et esui datus signat. Item illi qui munere in arena noxiorum iugulatorum sanguinem recentem de iugulo decurrentem exceptum auida siti comitiali morbo medentes auferunt, ubi sunt? item illi qui de arena ferinis obsoniis coenant, qui de apro, qui de ceruo petunt? Aper ille quem cruentauit, conluctando detersit. Ceruus ille in gladiatoris sanguine iacuit. Ipsorum ursorum aluei appetuntur cruditantes adhuc de uisceribus humanis. Ructatur proinde ab homine caro pasta de homine. Haec qui editis, quantum abestis a conuiuiis Christianorum? Minus autem et illi faciunt qui libidine fera humanis membris inhiant, quia uiuos uorant? minus humano sanguine ad spurcitiam consecrantur, quia futurum sanguinem lambunt? Non edunt infantes plane, sed magis puberes. Erubescat error

(although it does matter whether it is child-murder or homicide) I will appeal to the people. How many of those standing around and panting for the blood of the Christians, aye even of yourselves, magistrates most just and severe against us, should I prick in their consciences, for putting to death the children born to them? Since there is a difference also in the manner of the death, it is assuredly more cruel to suffocate them by drowning or to expose them to cold and starvation and the dogs; for even an older person would prefer to die by the sword. But to us, to whom homicide has been once for all forbidden, it is not permitted to break up even what has been conceived in the womb, while as yet the blood is being drawn (from the parent body) for a human life. Prevention of birth is premature murder, and it makes no difference whether it is a life already born that one snatches away, or a life in the act of being born that one destroys: that which is to be a human-being is also human; the whole fruit is already actually present in the seed. With regard to banquets of blood and such like tragic dishes, you may read whether it is not somewhere stated (it is in Herodotus, I think) that certain tribes had arranged the tasting of blood drawn from the arms of both sides to signify ratification of a treaty. Something of the same kind was tasted also under Catiline. They say that among certain tribesmen of the Scythians also each dead person becomes food for his own relations. But I am wandering too far. On this very day, in this very country, blood from a wounded thigh, caught in a palm of the hand and given to her worshippers to drink, marks the votaries[1] of Bellona. Again, what of those who, by way of healing epilepsy, at the gladiatorial show, drain with eager thirst the blood of slaughtered criminals, while it is still fresh and flowing down from the throat? Or what of those, who dine on bits of wild-beast from the arena, who seek a slice of boar or stag? That boar in the struggle wiped off the blood from him whom he had first stained with gore; that stag wallowed in a gladiator's blood. The paunches of the very bears are eagerly sought, while they are yet gorged with undigested human flesh; thus flesh that has been fed on man is forthwith vomited by man. You that eat such things, how far removed you are from the feasts of the Christians! But are those others less guilty, who with savage lust gloat over human bodies, because they devour them alive? are they any the less dedicated to filth by human blood, because they lick up what is about to become blood? they do not absolutely eat infants, but rather those that are grown up. Your crimes ought to

[1] Reading *sacratos*.

uester Christianis, qui ne animalium quidem sanguinem in epulis esculentis habemus, qui propterea suffocatis quoque et morticinis abstinemus, ne quo modo sanguine contaminemur uel intra uiscera sepulto. Denique inter temptamenta Christianorum botulos etiam cruore distensos admouetis, certissimi scilicet inlicitum esse penes illos per quod exorbitare eos uultis. Porro quale est, ut quos sanguinem pecoris horrere confiditis, humano inhiare credatis, nisi forte suauiorem eum experti? Quem quidem et ipsum proinde examinatorem Christianorum adhiberi oportebat ut foculum, ut acerram. Proinde enim probarentur sanguinem humanum adpetendo quemadmodum sacrificium respuendo, alioquin negandi si non gustassent, quemadmodum si immolassent, et utique non deesset uobis in auditione custodiarum et damnatione sanguis humanus. Proinde incesti qui magis quam quos ipse Iupiter docuit? Persas cum suis matribus misceri Ctesias refert. Sed et Macedones suspecti, quia, cum primum Oedipum tragoediam audissent, ridentes incesti dolorem, Ἤλαυνε, dicebant, εἰς τὴν μητέρα. Iam nunc recogitate quantum liceat erroribus ad incesta miscenda, suppeditante materias passiuitate luxuriae. Imprimis filios exponitis suscipiendos ab aliqua praetereunte misericordia extranea, uel adoptandos melioribus parentibus emancipatis. Alienati generis necesse est quandoque memoriam dissipari, et simul error inpegerit, exinde iam tradux proficiet incesti serpente genere cum scelere. Tunc deinde quocunque in loco, domi, peregre, trans freta comes est libido, cuius ubique saltus facile possunt alicubi ignaris filios pangere uel ex aliqua seminis portione, ut ita sparsum genus per commercia humana concurrat in memorias suas, neque eas caecus incesti sanguinis agnoscat. Nos ab isto euentu diligentissima et fidelissima castitas sepsit, quantumque ab stupris et ab omni post matrimonium excessu, tantum et ab incesti casu tuti sumus. Quidam multo securiores totam uim huius erroris uirgine continentia depellunt, senes

blush before us Christians, who do not reckon the blood even of animals among articles of food, who abstain even from things strangled and from such as die of themselves, lest we should in any way be polluted even by blood which is buried within the body. Again, among the trials of the Christians you offer them sausages actually filled with blood, being of course perfectly aware that the means you wish to employ to get them to abandon their principles is in their eyes impermissible. Further, how absurd it is for you to believe that they, who you are assured, abhor the blood of beasts, are panting for the blood of man, unless perchance you have found the former more palatable! Indeed this thirst for blood, like the little altar and the incense-box, should have been itself applied as a means of testing the Christians. For they would then be distinguished by their desire for human blood, in the same way as by their refusal to sacrifice; being otherwise deserving of rejection, if they had refused to taste, just as if they had sacrificed. And you would at any rate have had no lack of human blood at the hearing and condemnation of prisoners. Again, who are more incestuous than those whom Jupiter himself has taught? Ctesias records that the Persians have sexual intercourse with their own mothers. The Macedonians, too, are suspect, because on first hearing the tragedy of Oedipus, they ridiculed his grief at the incest of which he had been guilty, saying: *Il montait sa mère.* And now reflect what an opening is left to mistakes to bring about incestuous unions, for which the wide range of profligacy supplies opportunity. In the first place there is your exposure of your children, to be brought up by some passing stranger out of pity, and your surrender of them to be adopted by parents better than yourselves. The memory of a progeny thus cast off must some time or other be lost, and when once the error has rooted itself, the transmission of the incest will proceed farther and farther, as the family grows gradually with the crime. In the second place, everywhere, at home, abroad, across the seas, lust is in attendance, whose promiscuous impulses can easily beget children to you unawares in some place or other, even from however small a portion of the seed, so that a family, which has thus become scattered, may through the varied intercourse of men meet its own past, and may yet fail to recognise in it the mixtures of incestuous blood. We on the contrary are guarded from this result by a scrupulously faithful chastity, and we are as safe from the chance of incest as we are from debauchery and every excess in wedded life. Some are even much safer, as they withstand all possibility of this mistake by virgin continence, old men in

pueri. Haec in uobis esse si consideraretis, proinde in Christianis non esse perspiceretis. Idem oculi renuntiassent utrumque. Sed caecitatis duae species facile concurrunt, ut qui non uident quae sunt, uidere uideantur quae non sunt. Sic per omnia ostendam. Nunc de manifestioribus dicam.

10. Deos, inquitis, non colitis, et pro imperatoribus sacrificia non penditis. Sequitur ut eadem ratione pro aliis non sacrificemus, quia nec pro nobis ipsis, semel deos non colendo. Itaque sacrilegii et maiestatis rei conuenimur. Summa haec causa, immo tota est, et utique digna cognosci, si non praesumptio aut iniquitas iudicet, altera quae desperat, altera quae recusat ueritatem. Deos uestros colere desinimus ex quo illos non esse cognoscimus. Hoc igitur exigere debetis, uti probemus non esse illos deos, et idcirco non colendos, quia tunc demum coli debuissent, si dei fuissent. Tunc et Christiani puniendi, si quos non colerent, quia putarent non esse, constaret illos deos esse. Sed nobis, inquitis, dei sunt. Appellamus et prouocamus a uobis ad conscientiam uestram: illa nos iudicet, illa nos damnet, si poterit negare omnes istos deos uestros homines fuisse. Si et ipsa inficias ierit, de suis antiquitatum instrumentis reuincetur, de quibus eos didicit, testimonium perhibentibus ad hodiernum et ciuitatibus in quibus nati sunt, et regionibus in quibus aliquid operati uestigia reliquerunt, in quibus etiam sepulti demonstrantur. Nunc ergo per singulos decurram, tot ac tantos, nouos, ueteres, barbaros, Graecos, Romanos, peregrinos, captiuos, adoptiuos, proprios, communes, masculos, feminas, rusticos, urbanos, nauticos, militares? Otiosum est etiam titulos persequi, ut colligam in conpendium, et hoc non quo cognoscatis, sed recognoscatis. Certe enim oblitos agitis. Ante Saturnum deus penes uos nemo est, ab illo census totius uel potioris et notioris diuinitatis. Itaque quod de origine constiterit, id et de posteritate conueniet. Saturnum itaque, si quantum litterae docent, neque Diodorus

years, children in innocence. If you considered such to be the case among yourselves, you would in consequence see clearly that it was not the case among the Christians. The same eyes would have reported both alike. But the two kinds of blindness easily combine: those who do not see what really is, naturally think they see what is not. I will show this to be the case throughout. Now I will speak about more open sins.

Chap. X. You accuse us of refusing to worship the gods, and to spend money on sacrificing for the emperors. It follows that we refuse to sacrifice for others on the same principle that we refuse even to sacrifice for ourselves, viz. by refusing once for all to worship the gods. Consequently we are charged with sacrilege and treason. This is the main point in the case, nay it is the whole case, and certainly worthy of investigation, if neither prejudice nor unfairness is to be the judge, the one despairing of the truth, the other objecting to it. We cease to worship your gods, from the moment we learn that they are no gods. This therefore is what you ought to demand, that we should prove that they are no gods, and therefore not to be worshipped, because then only would it have been our duty to worship them, if they had been gods. Then too the Christians would have deserved punishment, if it were certain that those whom they did not worship, because they thought they had no existence, were gods after all. 'But to us,' you say, 'they are gods.' We make application and appeal from you to your conscience; let that judge us, let that condemn us, if it is able to deny that all these gods of yours were human beings. If conscience shall itself contest this, it will be refuted from its own documents of ancient times, from which it has learned of them, for they give evidence preserved to our day both of the communities in which they were born and of the districts in which they did some work of which they have left traces, and in which they are shown actually to have been buried. Now shall I run over them one by one, so many and so great as they are, new, old, barbarian, Greek, Roman, strangers, captives, adopted, individual, common, male, female, country, city, naval, military? It needs leisure even to follow out their titles, even to sum up all in brief, not that you may learn but that you may be reminded of them: for certainly you play the part of those that have forgotten. Previous to Saturn there is no god among you, from him dates the origin of all deity or at least of the more powerful and better known divinity. Therefore what is established with regard to the origin, will be valid also with regard to the later time. With regard to Saturn therefore, if we make appeal to what we can

Graecus aut Thallus neque Cassius Seuerus aut Cornelius Nepos neque ullus commentator eiusmodi antiquitatum aliud quam hominem promulgauerunt. si quantum rerum argumenta, nusquam inuenio fideliora quam apud ipsam Italiam, in qua Saturnus post multas expeditiones postque Attica hospitia consedit, exceptus a Iano, uel Iane, ut Salii uolunt. Mons quem incoluerat, Saturnius dictus, ciuitas quam depalauerat, Saturnia usque nunc est, tota denique Italia post Oenotriam Saturnia cognominabatur. Ab ipso primum tabulae et imagine signatus nummus, et inde aerario praesidet. Tamen si homo Saturnus, utique ex homine, et quia ab homine, non utique de caelo et terra. Sed cuius parentes ignoti erant, facile fuit eorum filium dici quorum et omnes possumus uideri. Quis enim non caelum ac terram matrem ac patrem uenerationis et honoris gratia appellet? uel ex consuetudine humana, qua ignoti uel ex inopinato adparentes de caelo superuenisse dicuntur. Proinde Saturno repentino ubique caelitem contigit dici; nam et terrae filios uulgus uocat quorum genus incertum est. Taceo quod ita rudes adhuc homines agebant, ut cuiuslibet noui uiri adspectu quasi diuino commouerentur, cum hodie iam politi quos ante paucos dies luctu publico mortuos sint confessi, in deos consecrent. Satis iam de Saturno, licet paucis. Etiam Iouem ostendemus tam hominem quam ex homine, et deinceps totum generis examen tam mortale quam seminis sui par.

11. Et quoniam sicut illos homines fuisse non audetis negare, ita post mortem deos factos instituistis adseuerare, causas quae hoc exegerint retractemus. Inprimis quidem necesse est concedatis esse aliquem sublimiorem deum et mancipem quendam diuinitatis, qui ex hominibus deos fecerit. Nam neque sibi illi sumere potuissent diuinitatem, quam non habebant, nec alius praestare eam non habentibus nisi qui proprie possidebat. Ceterum si nemo esset qui deos faceret, frustra praesumitis deos factos auferendo factorem. Certe

learn from literature, neither the Greek Diodorus nor Thallus nor Cassius Severus nor Cornelius Nepos, nor any other recorder of such ancient beliefs, has proclaimed him anything but a man; if to proofs from facts, I find nowhere more reliable proofs than in Italy itself, in which Saturn after many expeditions and after a residence in Attica took up his abode, having been welcomed by Janus, or Janes, as the Salii prefer to call him. The mountain which he had inhabited was called Saturnian, the city, the bounds of which he had marked out with stakes, is even to this day Saturnia, finally the whole of Italy was named Saturnian, in succession to the name Oenotria. With him it was that accounts began and the impress of a human figure upon a coin, and thus it is that he presides over the treasury. But if Saturn was a man, he was of course sprung from a man, and because he was sprung from a man, it follows that he did not come from heaven or earth. But when a man's parents were unknown, it was easy to call him a son of those whose sons we also can all of us be considered: for who would not call heaven and earth father and mother respectively out of reverence and respect? even in accordance with human custom, by which unknown persons or those who appear unexpectedly are said to have come upon us from heaven. Thus it is that Saturn who appeared suddenly happened everywhere to be called divine; indeed the common people call those also 'sons of earth' whose origin is uncertain. I say nothing of the fact that till then men were so unsophisticated, that they were stirred by the appearance of any new man, as if it were divine, since to-day men who are already cultivated deify those who a few days before they confessed by a public funeral were dead. Enough now about Saturn, though in few words. We will show that even Jupiter was himself as much man as he was sprung from man, and that in succession the whole swarm of his descendants were as mortal as they were like the seed from which they sprang.

Chap. XI. And since you have established the custom of maintaining that they were deified after death, in spite of the fact that you dare not deny them to have been men, let us review the causes that have led to this result. In the first place of course, you must admit that there is some superior god, a sort of proprietor of deity, who has made gods out of men. For neither could they have taken to themselves a deity which they did not possess, nor could anyone else have offered it to those who did not possess it unless he possessed it in his own right. If there was no one to make them gods, it is in vain that you assume their deification to have taken place,

quidem si ipsi se facere potuissent, nunquam homines fuissent, possidentes scilicet condicionis melioris potestatem. Igitur si est qui faciat deos, reuertor ad causas examinandas faciendorum ex hominibus deorum, nec ullas inuenio, nisi si ministeria et auxilia officiis diuinis desiderauit ille magnus deus. Primo indignum est, ut alicuius opera indigeret, et quidem mortui, cum dignius ab initio deum aliquem fecisset qui mortui erat operam desideraturus. Sed nec operae locum uideo. Totum enim hoc mundi corpus siue innatum et infectum secundum Pythagoram, siue natum factumue secundum Platonem, semel utique in ista constructione dispositum et instructum et ordinatum cum omni rationis gubernaculo inuentum est. Imperfectum non potuit esse quod perfecit omnia. Nihil Saturnum et Saturniam gentem expectabat. Vani erunt homines, nisi certi sint a primordio et pluuias de caelo ruisse et sidera radiasse et lumina floruisse et tonitrua mugisse et ipsum Iouem quae in manu eius inponitis fulmina timuisse, item omnem frugem ante Liberum et Cererem et Mineruam, immo ante illum aliquem principem hominem de terra exuberasse, quia nihil continendo et sustinendo homini prospectum post hominem potuit inferri. Denique inuenisse dicuntur necessaria ista uitae, non instituisse. Quod autem inuenitur, fuit, et quod fuit, non eius deputabitur qui inuenit, sed eius qui instituit: erat enim antequam inueniretur. Ceterum si propterea Liber deus quod uitem demonstrauit, male cum Lucullo actum est, qui primus cerasia ex Ponto Italiae promulgauit, quod non est propterea consecratus ut frugis nouae auctor, qui ostensor. Quamobrem si ab initio et instructa et certis exercendorum officiorum suorum rationibus dispensata uniuersitas constitit, uacat ex hac parte causa adlegendae humanitatis in diuinitatem, quia quas illis stationes et potestates distribuistis, tam fuerunt ab initio quam et fuissent etiamsi deos istos non creassetis. Sed conuertimini ad causam aliam, respondentes conlationem diuinitatis meritorum remunerandorum fuisse rationem. Et hinc conceditis, opinor, illum deum deificum iustitia praecellere, qui non temere nec

while you deny the maker. Of course if they had been able to make themselves gods, they would never have been men, possessing as they did the command of a higher state. Therefore, if there is anyone who makes gods, I return to my examination of the causes for making gods out of men, and I can find none, unless it be that that great god desired servants and helpers in discharge of his divine duties. But to begin with it is unworthy of him that he should need the service of anyone, especially of a dead man, since, if he were likely to need the service of a dead person, it would have been a worthier course to have made some god from the first. But I see no room for such aid either. For the whole body of the world, whether unborn or unmade, as Pythagoras believed, or born and made, as Plato believed, was surely found to have been once for all arranged and equipped and ordered in its present structure entirely under the guidance of reason. That could not be imperfect which has perfected all things. Nothing was waiting for Saturn and Saturn's race. Men will show themselves fools if they are not convinced that, from the beginning, rains fell from heaven, stars twinkled, the greater lights have shown their power, thunders have roared, and Jove himself has feared the thunderbolts which you place in his hand; moreover every sort of crop sprang forth in abundance from the soil before the days of Bacchus and Ceres and Minerva, nay even before that first man, if there were such, because nothing devised for the preservation and support of man could be introduced later than his own appearance. Lastly, the gods are said to have discovered, not to have originated, these necessaries of life. That however which is discovered, existed, and that which existed will not be counted as his who discovered it, but as his who originated it; for it existed before it was found. But if Bacchus is a god because he pointed out the vine, Lucullus, who first made cherries from Pontus known to Italy, has been unfairly treated, in that he was not for that reason deified, as the originator of a new kind of fruit, because he pointed it out. Wherefore, if the universe has existed from the beginning, both equipped and furnished with definite plans for carrying out its functions, this reason for promoting humanity to divinity falls to the ground, because the positions and powers that you have divided amongst them existed as much from the beginning, as they would also have existed, even if you had not appointed these gods of yours. But you turn to another reason, and reply that divinity was conferred upon them by way of rewarding their deserts. And hence you grant, I suppose, that that god-making deity excels in justice, since he apportioned so great

indigne nec prodige tantum praemium dispensarit. Volo igitur merita recensere, an eiusmodi sint, ut illos in caelum extulerint et non potius in imum tartarum merserint, quem carcerem poenarum infernarum cum uultis adfirmatis. Illuc enim abstrudi solent impii quique in parentes et incesti in sorores et maritarum adulteri et uirginum raptores et puerorum contaminatores et qui saeuiunt et qui occidunt et qui furantur et qui decipiunt et quicunque similes sunt alicuius dei uestri, quem neminem integrum a crimine aut uitio probare poteritis, nisi hominem negaueritis. Atquin ut illos homines fuisse non possitis negare, etiam istae notae accedunt quae nec deos postea factos credi permittunt. Si enim uos talibus puniendis praesidetis, si commercium, colloquium, conuictum malorum et turpium probi quique respuitis, horum autem pares deus ille maiestatis suae consortio adsciuit, quid ergo damnatis quorum collegas adoratis? Suggillatio est in caelo uestra iustitia. Deos facite criminosissimos quosque, ut placeatis deis uestris. Illorum est honor consecratio coaequalium. Sed ut omittam huius indignitatis retractatum, probi et integri et boni fuerint. Quot tamen potiores uiros apud inferos reliquistis! aliquem de sapientia Socratem, de iustitia Aristiden, de militia Themistoclem, de sublimitate Alexandrum, de felicitate Polycraten, de copia Croesum, de eloquentia Demosthenen. Quis ex illis deis uestris grauior et sapientior Catone, iustior et militarior Scipione? quis sublimior Pompeio, felicior Sylla, copiosior Crasso, eloquentior Tullio? Quanto dignius istos deos ille adsumendos expectasset, praescius utique potiorum? Properauit, opinor, et caelum semel clusit, et nunc utique melioribus apud inferos musitantibus erubescit.

12. Cesso iam de isto, ut qui sciam me ex ipsa ueritate demonstraturum quid non sint, cum ostendero quid sint. Quantum igitur de deis uestris, nomina solummodo uideo quorundam ueterum mortuorum et fabulas audio et sacra de fabulis recognosco: quantum autem de simulacris ipsis, nihil aliud reprehendo quam materias sorores esse uasculorum

a reward neither rashly nor unworthily nor wastefully. I wish therefore to review their merits, to see whether they are of such a kind as to warrant their elevation to heaven, and not rather their abasement to the lowest hell, which, when you please, you affirm to be a prison of infernal punishment. For it is there that are wont to be thrust away all that were undutiful to parents, guilty of incest towards sisters, adulterers of wives, abductors of maidens, polluters of boys, and those who rage, kill, steal, deceive, and whoever are like some god of your own, not one of whom you will be able to prove free from taint of crime or fault, unless you deny his humanity. But, to make it impossible for you to deny that they were men, there are also these characteristics which do not allow the belief that they became gods afterwards either. For if you sit in judgment for the punishment of such, if all the good among you reject the intercourse, the conversation, the company, of the evil and the base, and yet that great god has admitted their fellows into a partnership in his own majesty—why then do you condemn those whose fellows you worship? Your justice implies chastisement in heaven. To please your gods you must convert your worst criminals into gods! The deification of their equals is a compliment to them. But to omit further consideration of this disgrace, suppose they were honest and pure and good: yet how many better men have you left in the lower world! a Socrates distinguished for wisdom, an Aristides for justice, a Themistocles for generalship, an Alexander for glory, a Polycrates for good fortune, a Croesus for wealth, a Demosthenes for eloquence. Which of those gods of yours is worthier and wiser than Cato, a juster man or a better soldier than Scipio, who more eminent than Pompey, more fortunate than Sulla, wealthier than Crassus, more eloquent than Cicero? How much more worthily would he have waited to adopt these as gods, especially as he had foreknowledge of these better ones to come! He was in a hurry, I suppose, and closed the doors of heaven once for all, and is doubtless blushing now when he hears the complaints of better men grumbling in the lower world.

Chap. XII. I say no more now about this point, knowing that the truth itself will enable me to prove to you what they are *not*, when I have shown you what they *are*. With regard then to your gods, I see only the names of certain dead men of old time, about whom I hear tales, and I recognise sacred rites derived from the tales. With regard, however, to the images themselves, I have no fault to find except that the materials

instrumentorumque communium uel ex isdem uasculis et instrumentis quasi fatum consecratione mutantes licentia artis transfigurante, et quidem contumeliosissime et in ipso opere sacrilege, ut reuera nobis maxime, qui propter ipsos deos plectimur, solatium poenarum esse possit quod eadem et ipsi patiuntur ut fiant. Crucibus et stipitibus inponitis Christianos. Quod simulacrum non prius argilla deformat cruci et stipiti superstructa? in patibulo primum corpus dei uestri dedicatur. Ungulis deraditis latera Christianorum. At in deos uestros per omnia membra ualidius incumbunt asciae et runcinae et scobinae. Ceruices ponimus. Ante plumbum et glutinum et gomphos sine capite sunt dei uestri. Ad bestias impellimur. Certe quas Libero et Cybele et Caelesti applicatis. Ignibus urimur. Hoc et illi a prima quidem massa. In metalla damnamur. Inde censentur dei uestri. In insulis relegamur. Solet et in insula aliqui deus uester aut nasci aut mori. Si per haec constat diuinitas aliqua, ergo qui puniuntur, consecrantur, et numina erunt dicenda supplicia. Sed plane non sentiunt has iniurias et contumelias fabricationis suae dei uestri, sicut nec obsequia. O impiae uoces, o sacrilega conuicia! Infrendite, inspumate! Idem estis qui Senecam aliquem pluribus et amarioribus de uestra superstitione perorantem reprehendistis. Igitur si statuas et imagines frigidas mortuorum suorum simillimas non adoramus, quas milui et mures et araneae intellegunt, nonne laudem magis quam poenam merebatur repudium agniti erroris? Possumus enim uideri laedere eos quos certi sumus omnino non esse? Quod non est, nihil ab ullo patitur, quia non est.

13. Sed nobis dei sunt, inquis. Et quomodo uos e contrario impii et sacrilegi et inreligiosi erga deos uestros deprehendimini, qui, quos praesumitis esse, neglegitis, quos timetis, destruitis, quos etiam uindicatis, inluditis? Recognoscite si mentior. Primo quidem, cum alii alios colitis, utique quos

are sisters to ordinary vessels and tools, or are made from the same vessels and tools, changing their destiny as it were by dedication, the wantonness of art transforming them, and that too in the most insulting way involving a sacrilege in the work itself. Thus it may be in truth a solace especially to us who are punished on account of the gods themselves, a solace, I say, in our punishment, that they themselves also go through the same experience for their making. You place the Christians on crosses and stakes: what image is not first moulded in soft clay laid on a cross and a stake? it is on a gibbet that the body of your god is consecrated first of all. You tear the sides of the Christians with claws, but upon your gods axes and planes and files are more vigorously applied all over their bodies. We lay down our necks: your gods are without a head until lead and glue and nails have been applied. We are cast out to wild-beasts, to the very beasts which form the train of Bacchus and Cybele and the Carthaginian goddess of Heaven. We are cast into the fire: so also are they, while the ore from which they are taken is refined. We are condemned to the mines and quarries: it is from thence your gods get their origin. We are banished to islands: in an island also it is usual for some god of yours either to be born or to die. If any divinity is thus confirmed, then those who are punished are deified, and punishments will have to be spoken of as tokens of divinity. But clearly your gods do not feel these injuries and insults involved in their formation, as neither do they feel the homage they receive. Oh the impious words, the sacrilegious abuse! gnash your teeth at them, and foam with rage! You are the same people who blamed Seneca when with more bitterness and at greater length he argued against your superstition. Consequently, if we do not worship cold statues and figures, which have a strong likeness to the dead they represent, images of which kites and mice and spiders have a correct idea, did not the renouncing of a discovered error deserve praise rather than punishment? For can we be thought to inflict injury on those who, we feel sure, do not exist at all? That which does not exist, can suffer nothing from any one, because it has no existence.

Chap. XIII. 'But to us they are gods,' you say. If that be so, how is it that you on the contrary are found impious, sacrilegious, and irreligious towards your gods? you who neglect those whose existence you take for granted, who destroy those whom you fear, who mock even those whom you avenge? Consider if my statement is false. In the first place, when

non colitis, offenditis. Praelatio alterius sine alterius contumelia non potest procedere, quia nec electio sine reprobatione. Iam ergo contemnitis quos reprobatis, quos reprobando offendere non timetis. Nam, ut supra praestrinximus, status dei cuiusque in senatus aestimatione pendebat. Deus non erat quem homo consultus noluisset et nolendo damnasset. Domesticos deos, quos Lares dicitis, domestica potestate tractatis pignerando, uenditando, demutando aliquando in caccabulum de Saturno, aliquando in trullam de Minerua, ut quisque contritus atque contusus est, dum diu colitur, ut quisque dominus sanctiorem expertus est domesticam necessitatem. Publicos aeque publico iure foedatis, quos in hastario uectigales habetis. Sic Capitolium, sic olitorium forum petitur; sub eadem uoce praeconis, sub eadem hasta, sub eadem adnotatione quaestoris diuinitas addicta conducitur. Sed enim agri tributo onusti uiliores, hominum capita stipendio censa ignobiliora (nam hae sunt notae captiuitatis), dei uero qui magis tributarii, magis sancti, immo qui magis sancti, magis tributarii. Maiestas quaestuaria efficitur. Circuit cauponas religio mendicans. Exigitis mercedem pro solo templi, pro aditu sacri. Non licet deos gratis nosse; uenales sunt. Quid omnino ad honorandos eos facitis quod non etiam mortuis uestris conferatis? Aedes proinde, aras proinde. Idem habitus et insignia in statuis. Ut aetas, ut ars, ut negotium mortui fuit, ita deus est. Quo differt ab epulo Iouis silicernium? a simpulo obba? ab haruspice pollinctor? Nam et haruspex mortuis apparet. Sed digne imperatoribus defunctis honorem diuinitatis dicatis, quibus et uiuentibus eum addicitis. Accepto ferent dei uestri, immo gratulabuntur, quod pares eis fiant domini sui. Sed cum Larentinam publicum scortum, uelim saltim Laidem aut Phrynen, inter Iunones et Cereres et Dianas adoretis, cum Simonem Magum statua et inscriptione Sancti Dei inauguratis, cum de paedagogiis aulicis nescio quem synodi deum

some of you are worshipping one god, some another, of course you slight the feelings of those whom you do not worship: preference of one is impossible without insult to another, since one cannot even choose without implied blame. It follows therefore that you lightly esteem those of whom you disapprove, and whom you do not fear to offend by your disapproval. For, as I hinted above, the position of each god depended on the opinion of the senate. He was no god, whom a man, when consulted, had declined to deify, and by his refusal had condemned. Your household gods, whom you call Lares, you deal with according to your household rights, pledging, advertising, changing them, sometimes from a Saturn into a cooking-pot, sometimes from a Minerva into a ladle, as each god happens to be worn and damaged with long adoration, as each master has found a more sacred deity in his domestic need. Your public gods you profane equally by public authority, while you keep them as sources of revenue in the auction-catalogue. Thus the Capitol, thus the vegetable market is attended by the bidders; under the same voice of the crier, under the same spear, under the same entry made by the quaestor, divinity is knocked down to the highest bidder. But indeed lands charged with tribute are cheaper, and persons rated at a tax are less noble (for these are the marks of serfdom): but the gods who bring in more tribute are more holy, or rather those who are more holy, bring in more tribute. Their majesty is made a matter of profit. Religion goes begging about the taverns. You demand payment for the ground on which a temple stands, for permission to approach the sacred place; you cannot be acquainted with the gods for nothing, they have their price. What do you do at all to honour them, which you do not also bestow on your dead? Both alike have their temples and altars. The dress is the same, the ornaments on their dress the same. The god corresponds in age, skill, and business to the dead man. What difference is there between a funeral feast and a banquet to Jupiter? between a sacrificial and a funeral chalice? an undertaker and a soothsayer? for a soothsayer also attends upon the dead. But you worthily confer the honour of divinity on emperors when dead, since even in their lifetime you assign it to them. Your gods will give you credit for it, nay rather they will thank you for making their masters equal to them. But when you worship Larentina, a common whore—would it were at least a Lais or a Phryne—, among the Junos and the Cereses and the Dianas, when you hallow the name of Simon Magus with the statue and inscription of a holy god, when you make some court page a member of the college of gods; although the

facitis, licet non nobiliores dei ueteres, tamen contumeliam a uobis deputabunt hoc et aliis licuisse quod solis antiquitas contulit.

14. Volo et ritus uestros recensere: non dico quales sitis in sacrificando, cum enecta et tabidosa et scabiosa quaeque mactatis, cum de opimis et integris superuacua quaeque truncatis, capitula et ungulas, quae domi quoque pueris uel canibus destinassetis, cum de decima Herculis nec tertiam partem in aram eius inponitis (laudabo magis sapientiam, quod de perdito aliquid eripitis), sed conuersus ad litteras uestras, quibus informamini ad prudentiam et liberalia officia, quanta inuenio ludibria! deos inter se propter Troianos et Achiuos ut gladiatorum paria congressos depugnasse, Venerem humana sagitta sauciatam, quod filium suum Aenean paene interfectum ab eodem Diomede rapere uellet, Martem tredecim mensibus in uinculis paene consumptum, Iouem, ne eandem uim a ceteris caelitibus experiretur, opera cuiusdam monstri liberatum, et nunc flentem Sarpedonis casum, nunc foede subantem in sororem sub commemoratione non ita dilectarum iampridem amicarum. Exinde quis non poeta ex auctoritate principis sui dedecorator inuenitur deorum? Hic Apollinem Admeto regi pascendis pecoribus addicit, ille Neptuni structorias operas Laomedonti locat. Est et ille de lyricis (Pindarum dico) qui Aescolapium canit auaritiae merito, quia medicinam nocenter exercebat, fulmine iudicatum. Malus Iuppiter, si fulmen illius est, impius in nepotem, inuidus in artificem. Haec neque uera prodi neque falsa confingi apud religiosissimos oportebat. Nec tragici quidem aut comici parcunt, ut non aerumnas uel errores domus alicuius dei praefentur. Taceo de philosophis, Socrate contentus, qui in contumeliam deorum quercum et hircum et canem deierabat. Sed propterea damnatus est Socrates, quia

old gods are no nobler, yet they will consider it an insult paid to them from you, that this privilege, which antiquity conferred on them alone, has been allowed to others also.

Chap. XIV. I am unwilling[1] to go further and review your sacred rites. I do not say what is your method in sacrificing, which leads you to slaughter every worn-out, putrefying and mangy creature, to cut off all the useless parts from the prime and sound beasts, the little heads and the hoofs, which even at home you would have set apart for slaves or dogs, your placing on Hercules' altar of not even a third part of the tithe that is due to him. I will rather praise your wisdom in rescuing something of what is in danger of being lost. But when I turn to your literature, whence you derive instruction in practical wisdom, and the duties of gentlemen, what ridiculous situations do I find! gods engaged like pairs of gladiators and fighting desperately together on account of the Trojans and the Achaeans, Venus wounded by an arrow from a human hand, because she wished to snatch her son Aeneas, when almost killed, from the same Diomede (who had wounded herself); Mars reduced almost to a shadow by thirteen months in chains, Jupiter rescued by the agency of some monster from meeting the same violence at the hands of the other divinities, and at one time weeping the misfortune of Sarpedon, at another burning with shameful lust for his sister, and telling her the while of the mistresses in the long past, none of them so much loved as she. Since that time what poet may not be found calumniating the gods, on the authority of the chief of his craft? One makes over Apollo to king Admetus to feed his flocks, another lets out Neptune's services in building to Laomedon. There is also the great lyric poet (I mean Pindar), who sings that Aesculapius was deservedly punished with a thunderbolt by reason of his greed, which made him practise the healing art injuriously. Jupiter is evil, if the thunderbolt is his, devoid of natural feeling for his grandson, and jealous of the skilled practitioner. Such stories ought never to have been revealed if true; if false, ought never to have been invented, among really religious people. Nor do the writers of tragedies or comedies refrain from publishing in their prologues the sorrows or wanderings of the family of some god. I say nothing of the philosophers, being quite content with Socrates, who, in mockery of the gods, swore by the oak and the goat and the dog. But (say you) Socrates was condemned for that very reason, because he tried to do away with the gods.

[1] Reading *Nolo*.

deos destruebat. Plane olim, id est semper, ueritas odio est. Tamen cum paenitentia sententiae Athenienses et criminatores Socratis postea afflixerint et imaginem eius auream in templo collocarint, rescissa damnatio testimonium Socrati reddidit. Sed et Diogenes nescio quid in Herculem ludit, et Romanus Cynicus Varro trecentos Ioues, siue Iupitros dicendos, sine capitibus introducit.

15. Cetera lasciuiae ingenia etiam uoluptatibus uestris per deorum dedecus operantur. Dispicite Lentulorum et Hostiliorum uenustates, utrum mimos an deos uestros in iocis et strophis rideatis: moechum Anubin, et masculum Lunam, et Dianam flagellatam, et Iouis mortui testamentum recitatum, et tres Hercules famelicos inrisos. Sed et histrionum litterae omnem foeditatem eorum designant. Luget Sol filium de caelo iactatum laetantibus uobis, et Cybele pastorum suspirat fastidiosum non erubescentibus uobis, et sustinetis Iouis elogia cantari, et Iunonem, Venerem, Mineruam a pastore iudicari. Ipsum quod imago dei uestri ignominiosum caput et famosum uestit, quod corpus inpurum et ad istam artem effeminatione productum Mineruam aliquam uel Herculem repraesentat, nonne uiolatur maiestas et diuinitas constupratur laudantibus uobis? Plane religiosiores estis in cauea, ubi super sanguinem humanum, super inquinamenta poenarum proinde saltant dei uestri argumenta et historias noxiis ministrantes, nisi quod et ipsos deos uestros saepe noxii induunt. Vidimus aliquando castratum Attin, illum deum ex Pessinunte, et qui uiuus ardebat, Herculem induerat. Risimus et inter ludicras meridianorum crudelitates Mercurium mortuos cauterio examinantem, uidimus et Iouis fratrem gladiatorum cadauera cum malleo deducentem. Singula ista quaeque adhuc inuestigare quis posset? Si honorem inquietant diuinitatis, si maiestatis uestigia obsoletant, de contemptu utique censentur tam eorum qui eiusmodi factitant quam eorum quibus factitant. Sed

Plainly! because the truth has long, or rather always, been an object of hatred. Nevertheless, when the Athenians, from remorse for the sentence they had passed, not only afterwards punished the prosecutors of Socrates but also placed a golden statue of him in a temple, the reversal of the condemnation gave a new testimony to Socrates. But Diogenes too made some witticism at Hercules' expense, and the Roman Cynic, Varro, introduces a whole host of headless Joves (or Jupiters as they ought perhaps to be called).

Chap. XV. The rest of your licentious wits also work for your pleasures through the dishonour of the gods. Examine the farces of the Lentuli and Hostilii, and consider whether it is the buffoons or your gods whose jokes and tricks you are laughing at; such subjects as an adulterous Anubis, a masculine Moon, Diana scourged, the will of the deceased Jupiter read aloud, and three starving Herculeses held up to ridicule. Moreover the writings of the playwrights also give form to all their filthiness. The Sun-god mourns his son cast from heaven, while you rejoice, and Cybele sighs for her disdainful shepherd, while you are no whit ashamed, and you can endure to listen to the song which tells the sins of Jupiter, and the trial of Juno, Venus and Minerva by the shepherd. What of the fact that a mask representing a god of yours covers the head of a branded and notorious person, that an unclean body prolonged for this accomplishment by emasculation represents a Minerva or a Hercules—is not their majesty outraged and their divinity prostituted, while you applaud? You are clearly more religious in the amphitheatre, where your gods in like manner dance on human blood, on the marks of punishments undergone, providing plots and narratives for criminals, save and except that criminals often put on the character of your gods themselves also. We have sometimes witnessed the mutilation of Attis, the famous god of Pessinus, and a man who was burning alive had personated Hercules. We have laughed too amidst the sportive atrocities of the midday combatants, at Mercury testing apparent deaths with a branding-iron; we have likewise seen Jupiter's brother dragging down the corpses of gladiators with a hammer in his hand (to finish those who were not quite dead). But who could even inquire into these absurdities one by one? If they disquiet the honour of the gods, if they obliterate all traces of divinity, surely they take their rise in the contempt both of those who practise such things and of those for whom they practise them. But those you will say are mere shows.

ludicra ista sint. Ceterum si adiciam, quae non minus conscientiae omnium recognoscent, in templis adulteria conponi, inter aras lenocinia tractari, in ipsis plerumque aedituorum et sacerdotum tabernaculis sub isdem uittis et apicibus et purpuris thure flagrante libidinem expungi, nescio, ne plus de uobis dei uestri quam de Christianis querantur. Certe sacrilegi de uestris semper adprehenduntur. Christiani enim templa nec interdiu norunt; spoliarent forsitan ea et ipsi, si et ipsi ea adorarent. Quid ergo colunt qui talia non colunt? Iam quidem intellegi subiacet ueritatis esse cultores qui mendacii non sint, nec errare amplius in eo in quo errasse se recognoscendo cessauerunt. Hoc prius capite et omnem hinc sacramenti nostri ordinem haurite, repercussis ante tamen opinionibus falsis.

16. Nam et, ut quidam, somniastis caput asininum esse deum nostrum. Hanc Cornelius Tacitus suspicionem eiusmodi *dei* inseruit. Is enim in quinta historiarum suarum bellum Iudaicum exorsus ab origine gentis etiam de ipsa tam origine quam de nomine et religione gentis quae uoluit argumentatus Iudaeos refert Aegypto expeditos siue, ut putauit, extorres uastis Arabiae in locis aquarum egentissimis, cum siti macerarentur, onagris, qui forte de pastu potum petituri aestimabantur, indicibus fontis usos ob eam gratiam consimilis bestiae superficiem consecrasse. Atque ita inde praesumptum opinor nos quoque ut Iudaicae religionis propinquos eidem simulacro initiari. At enim idem Cornelius Tacitus, sane ille mendaciorum loquacissimus, in eadem historia refert Gneum Pompeium, cum Hierusalem cepisset proptereaque templum adisset speculandis Iudaicae religionis arcanis, nullum illic reperisse simulacrum. Et utique, si id colebatur quod aliqua effigie repraesentabatur, nusquam magis quam in sacrario suo exhiberetur, eo magis, quia nec uerebatur extraneos arbitros, quamquam uana cultura. Solis enim sacerdotibus adire licitum; etiam conspectus ceterorum uelo oppanso interdicebatur. Vos tamen non

If however I were to add—what will be equally admitted by the consciences of all—that adulteries are arranged in the temples, that panders ply their trade among the altars, that often in the very rooms of sacristans and priests, under the same fillets and sacred caps and purple vestments, lust is satisfied while the incense is burning, I know not whether your gods may not find more reason to complain about you than about the Christians. Certainly those guilty of sacrilege are always of your number. For the Christians do not know the temples even by day. Perhaps they might also rob them themselves, if they themselves also did reverence to them. What then do they worship who do not worship such things? Already indeed it is easy to be understood that those are worshippers of the truth who are not worshippers of a lie, and that they no longer err in a matter in which the recognition of previous error taught them to give it up. Grasp this fact first, and thence gather the whole order of our mystery, first however rejecting certain false notions.

Chap. XVI. For you, too, like some others, have dreamed that an ass's head is the object of our worship. The fancy of such a deity was put into their minds by Cornelius Tacitus, who in the fifth of his Histories, having begun his account of the Jewish War with an account of the origin of the race, and having also discussed at his pleasure alike the origin itself and the name and religion of the race, records that the Jews, having been freed or, as he thought, exiled from Egypt, when they were weakened through thirst in the deserts of Arabia, where water was very scarce, employed some wild asses to guide them to a spring, thinking that they would probably be seeking water after food, and on that account consecrated the form of a similar animal. And hence I think it was presumed that we, too, being thus allied to the Jewish religion were taught to do reverence to the same image. But indeed it is the same Cornelius Tacitus, truly the most inventive of romancers, who in the same history records that Gnaeus Pompeius, after capturing Jerusalem and thus going to the temple to investigate the secrets of the Jewish religion, found no image therein. And to be sure, if the object of worship was represented by some figure, this would have been most appropriately shown in its own shrine, the rather that the worship, however vain, had no fear of strangers to witness it; only the priests were allowed to approach, while the gaze of the rest was forbidden by a curtain spread out over it. And yet you will not deny that you pay divine honours to

negabitis et iumenta omnia et totos cantherios cum sua Epona coli a uobis. Hoc forsitan inprobamur, quod inter cultores omnium pecudum bestiarumque asinarii tantum sumus. Sed et qui crucis nos religiosos putat, consecraneus erit noster. Cum lignum aliquod propitiatur, uiderit habitus, cum materiae qualitas eadem sit, uiderit forma, dum id ipsum dei corpus sit. Et tamen quanto distinguitur a crucis stipite Pallas Attica, et Ceres Pharia, quae sine effigie rudi palo et informi ligno prostant? Pars crucis est omne robur quod erecta statione defigitur. Nos, si forte, integrum et totum deum colimus. Diximus originem deorum uestrorum a plastis de cruce induci. Sed et Victorias adoratis, cum in tropaeis cruces intestina sint tropaeorum. Religio Romanorum tota castrensis signa ueneratur, signa iurat, signa omnibus deis praeponit. Omnes illi imaginum suggestus in signis monilia crucum sunt: siphara illa uexillorum et cantabrorum stolae crucum sunt. Laudo diligentiam. Noluistis incultas et nudas cruces consecrare. Alii plane humanius et uerisimilius solem credunt deum nostrum. Ad Persas, si forte, deputabimur, licet solem non in linteo depictum adoremus, habentes ipsum ubique in suo clypeo. Denique inde suspicio quod innotuerit nos ad orientis regionem precari. Sed et plerique uestrum adfectatione aliquando et caelestia adorandi ad solis ortum labia uibratis. Aeque si diem solis laetitiae indulgemus, alia longe ratione quam religione solis secundo loco ab eis sumus qui diem Saturni otio et uictui decernunt exorbitantes et ipsi a Iudaico more, quem ignorant. Sed noua iam dei nostri in ista proxime ciuitate editio publicata est, ex quo quidam frustrandis bestiis mercenarius noxius picturam proposuit cum eiusmodi inscriptione: DEUS CHRISTIANORUM ΟΝΟΚΟΙΗΤΗΣ. Is erat auribus asininis, altero pede ungulatus, librum gestans et togatus. Risimus et nomen et formam. Sed illi debebant adorare statim biforme numen, quia et canino et leonino capite commixtos, et de capro et de ariete cornutos, et a lumbis hircos, et a cruribus

all beasts of burden, as well as to asses, heads and bodies both, along with their own goddess Epona. Perhaps our fault consists in the fact that amongst the worshippers of cattle and beasts of all kinds we worship the ass alone.

But he too who thinks that we adore the cross will be our fellow-worshipper. When some piece of wood is propitiated, no matter for the fashion as long as the quality of the material is the same, no matter for the form as long as the god is bodily in the image. And yet what a great difference there is between the upright of a cross and the Athenian Pallas or the Egyptian Ceres, who stand forth formless, a rough stake, a shapeless bit of wood! Every piece of wood that is fixed in the ground in an erect position is part of a cross; we, perhaps, worship an unmutilated and complete god. I have said that the sculptors of your gods make a beginning with a cross: but you also worship Victories, although, in trophies, crosses form the inside part. The whole religion of the Roman camp consists in worshipping the standards, in swearing by the standards, and in setting the standards above all the gods. All those rows of images on the standards are but as necklaces of crosses; those pennons on the ensigns and banners are the robes of crosses. I commend your scrupulous attitude: you would not dedicate crosses that were bare and undraped. Others, certainly with greater semblance of nature and of truth, believe the sun to be our god. If so, we shall perhaps be classed with the Persians, although we do not worship a representation of the sun on a linen cloth, since everywhere we have the sun himself within his own hemisphere. Lastly the suspicion arises from the knowledge that we turn to the east in prayer. But many of you too with an affectation of sometimes worshipping heavenly bodies move your lips towards the rising sun. Likewise if we give rein to joy on Sundays, in a far different way from sun worship, we are only second to those who devote Saturday (Sabbath) to idleness and feasting, and who also deviate from the Jewish custom of which they are ignorant. But recently in this city, what is really a new representation of our god has been made public, since a certain criminal, hired to trick the wild beasts, exhibited a picture with an inscription to the following effect: 'The Christian God, the Offspring of an Ass.' He had asses' ears, one foot hoofed, was dressed in the toga and carried a book. We laughed both at the name and the figure. But they were bound to worship at once a two-formed divinity, because they have welcomed, as gods, creatures with heads both of dog and of lion, with the horns of a goat and a ram, others with goats' bodies from the loins downwards, and like serpents

serpentes, et planta uel tergo alites deos receperunt. Haec ex abundanti, ne quid rumoris inrepercussum quasi de conscientia praeterissemus. Quae omnia conuersi iam ad demonstrationem religionis nostrae repurgauimus.

17. Quod colimus, deus unus est, qui totam molem istam cum omni instrumento elementorum, corporum, spirituum uerbo quo iussit, ratione qua disposuit, uirtute qua potuit, de nihilo expressit, in ornamentum maiestatis suae, unde et Graeci nomen mundo *κόσμον* accommodauerunt. Inuisibilis est, etsi uideatur; incomprehensibilis, etsi per gratiam repraesentetur; inaestimabilis, etsi humanis sensibus aestimetur. Ideo uerus et tantus est. Ceterum quod uideri communiter, quod comprehendi, quod aestimari potest, minus est et oculis quibus occupatur, et manibus quibus contaminatur, et sensibus quibus inuenitur: quod uero inmensum est, soli sibi notum est. Hoc quod est, deum aestimari facit, dum aestimari non capit. Ita eum uis magnitudinis et notum hominibus obicit et ignotum. Et haec est summa delicti nolentium recognoscere quem ignorare non possunt. Vultis ex operibus ipsius tot ac talibus, quibus continemur, quibus sustinemur, quibus oblectamur, etiam quibus exterremur, uultis ex animae ipsius testimonio conprobemus? Quae licet carcere corporis pressa, licet institutionibus prauis circumscripta, licet libidinibus et concupiscentiis euigorata, licet falsis deis exancillata, cum tamen resipiscit, ut ex crapula, ut ex somno, ut ex aliqua ualitudine, et sanitatem suam patitur, deum nominat, hoc solo, quia proprie uerus hic unus. Deus bonus et magnus, et Quod deus dederit omnium uox est. Iudicem quoque contestatur illum Deus uidet, et Deo commendo, et Deus mihi reddet. O testimonium animae naturaliter Christianae! Denique pronuntians haec non ad Capitolium, sed ad caelum respicit. Nouit enim sedem dei uiui ab illo, et inde descendit.

from the legs, and with wings on the foot or the back. I have stated these methods more fully, to avoid passing over, as it were purposely, any rumour without rebutting it. All these false opinions we have now cleared away and proceed to turn[1] to the proof of our religion.

Chap. XVII. The object of our worship is one God, who through the word by which he commanded (that they should exist), the reason by which he arranged them, the power by which he could (carry out his will), fashioned out of nothing all this mass with all its apparatus of elements, bodies and spirits, for an ornament to his own greatness, whence it is that the Greeks also have applied the name *κόσμος* (ornament) to the universe. He is invisible, though he may be seen; incomprehensible, though he is represented to men through his grace; inestimable, though he can be estimated through the human senses; therefore is he the true and the mighty God. What is capable, however, of being generally seen, of being grasped, of being valued, is less both than the eyes by which it is caught, than the hands by which it is touched, and the thoughts by which it is discovered: but that which is immeasurable is known only to itself. This is what makes God valued, while yet he is incapable of valuation. Thus it is that the power of his greatness presents him as both known and unknown to men. And this is the substance of their offence, that they refuse to recognise him of whom they cannot be ignorant. Do you wish that we should prove this from his own works, so many and of such a character, by which we are restrained, upheld, delighted; nay even by which we are terrified, or should we prove it even from the evidence of the soul itself? Although weighed down by the prison of the body, though confined by evil customs, though emasculated by lusts and passions, though enslaved to false gods, yet, when it recovers its senses, as after surfeit, as after sleep, as after some illness, when it becomes conscious of its own health, it names God, for the sole reason that he alone is by nature the true God. 'Good God,' 'Great God' and 'Which may God grant' are expressions used by all. That he is also a judge is attested by the words: 'God sees,' 'I commend to God,' and 'God will recompense me.' O evidence of the natural Christianity of the soul! For when uttering these words it looks not to the Capitol, but to the sky. It knows indeed the place of abode of the living God: from him and from there[2] it descended.

[1] *Conuersuri*, the certain emendation of J. B. M. for *conuersi* of MSS.
[2] A stop at *uiui*.

18. Sed quo plenius et inpressius tam ipsum quam dispositiones eius et uoluntates adiremus, adiecit instrumentum litteraturae, si qui uelit de deo inquirere, et inquisito inuenire, et inuento credere, et credito deseruire. Viros enim iustitiae innocentia dignos deum nosse et ostendere a primordio in saeculum emisit spiritu diuino inundatos, quo praedicarent deum unicum esse, qui uniuersa condiderit, qui hominem de humo struxerit (his enim est uerus Prometheus, qui saeculum certis temporum dispositionibus et exitibus ordinauit), exinde quae signa maiestatis suae iudicantis ediderit per imbres, per ignes, quas demerendo sibi disciplinas determinauerit, quae ignoratis et desertis et obseruatis his praemia destinarit, ut qui producto aeuo isto iudicaturus sit suos cultores in uitae aeternae retributionem, profanos in ignem aeque perpetem et iugem, suscitatis omnibus ab initio defunctis et reformatis et recensitis ad utriusque meriti dispunctionem. Haec et nos risimus aliquando. De uestris sumus. Fiunt, non nascuntur Christiani. Quos diximus praedicatores, prophetae de officio praefandi uocantur. Voces eorum itemque uirtutes, quas ad fidem diuinitatis edebant, in thesauris litterarum manent, nec istae latent. Ptolemaeorum eruditissimus, quem Philadelphum supernominant, et omnis litteraturae sagacissimus, cum studio bibliothecarum Pisistratum, opinor, aemularetur, inter cetera memoriarum, quibus aut uetustas aut curiositas aliqua ad famam patrocinabatur, ex suggestu Demetri Phalerei grammaticorum tunc probatissimi, cui praefecturam mandauerat, libros a Iudaeis quoque postulauit, proprias atque uernaculas litteras, quas soli habebant. Ex ipsis enim et ad ipsos semper prophetae perorauerant, scilicet ad domesticam dei gentem ex patrum gratia. Hebraei retro qui nunc Iudaei. Igitur et litterae Hebraeae et eloquium. Sed ne notitia uacaret, hoc quoque a Iudaeis Ptolemaeo subscriptum est septuaginta et duobus interpretibus indultis, quos Menedemus quoque philoso-

CHAP. XVIII. But that we might more fully and more seriously approach to himself as well as to his arrangements and purposes, he added a literary document, in case any one should wish to inquire about God, and having inquired to find him, and having found him to believe on him, and having believed to serve him. For from the beginning he hath sent into the world men overflowing with the divine spirit, and worthy by their justice and innocence to know God and to make him known, in order that they might preach him as the only god who founded the universe, and formed man from the soil, for this is the true Prometheus, who ordered the world by fixed arrangements and endings of seasons,—who afterwards proclaimed signs of his majesty in judgment by water and fire, who laid down statutes for the gaining of his favour: who has appointed rewards for those that know not, those that neglect, and those that keep his laws; in order that when this world shall have come to an end[1] he may adjudge his worshippers to the reward of eternal life, and the irreligious to a fire no less continuous and lasting, having raised all those that have died from the beginning and given them a new form and called to an account for the recompense of each man's deserts. We too once laughed at this: we sprang from your ranks: Christians are made Christians, and not born such. Those whom we have called preachers are named prophets from their office of foretelling. Their words and likewise their wonderful deeds, which they performed to produce belief in the Godhead, remain in the storehouses of literature, nor are these now hidden. Ptolemy, surnamed Philadelphus, a most learned king with a keen appreciation of all literature, in his zeal for libraries, in which, I suppose, he rivalled Pisistratus, amongst other historical monuments, which were rendered famous either by antiquity or curiosity of some kind, at the instance of Demetrius of Phalerum, the most approved grammarian of the time, to whom he had entrusted the chief care of the matter, asked books from the Jews also, writings peculiar to themselves and in their own language. For the prophets were always taken from among themselves and had always addressed themselves as being a people belonging to God in accordance with the favour shown to their fathers. Hebrews was the name formerly given to those now called Jews. Consequently both their literature and language are Hebrew. But that there might be no deficiency of knowledge, this also was granted by the Jews to Ptolemy, seventy-two translators being allowed, whom Menedemus also, the philosopher, a champion of (divine)

[1] Read *prodacto* with J. E. B. M.

phus, prouidentiae uindex, de sententiae communione suspexit. Adfirmauit haec uobis etiam Aristaeus. Ita in Graecum stilum exaperta monumenta reliquit. Hodie apud Serapeum Ptolemaei bibliothecae cum ipsis Hebraicis litteris exhibentur. Sed et Iudaei palam lectitant. Vectigalis libertas; uulgo aditur sabbatis omnibus. Qui audierit, inueniet deum; qui etiam studuerit intellegere, cogetur et credere.

19. Primam instrumentis istis auctoritatem summa antiquitas uindicat. Apud uos quoque religionis est instar, fidem de temporibus adserere. [Auctoritatem litteris praestat antiquitas summa. Primus enim prophetes Moyses, qui mundi conditionem et generis humani pullulationem et mox ultricem iniquitatis illius aeui uim cataclysmi de praeterito exorsus est, per uaticinationem usque ad suam aetatem et deinceps per res suas futurorum imagines edidit, penes quem et temporum ordo digestus ab initio supputationem saeculi praestitit. Superior inuenitur annis circiter trecentis quam ille antiquissimus penes uos Danaus in Argos transuenisset, Troiano denique proelio ad mille annos ante est, unde et ipso Saturno. Secundum enim historiam Thalli, qua relatum est bellum Assyriorum et Saturnum Titanorum regem cum Ioue dimicasse, ostenditur bellum cccxx et duobus annis Iliacum exitum antecessisse. Per hunc Moysen etiam illa lex propria Iudaeis a deo missa est. Deinceps multa et alii prophetae uetustiores litteris uestris. Nam et qui ultimo cecinit, aut aliquantulo praecucurrit aut certe concurrit aetate sapientiae auctoribus, etiam latoribus legis. Cyri enim et Darii regno fuit Zacharias, quo in tempore Thales, physicorum princeps, sciscitanti Croeso nihil certum de diuinitate respondit, turbatus scilicet uocibus prophetarum. Solon eidem regi finem longae uitae intuendum praedicauit non aliter quam prophetae. Adeo respici potest tam iura uestra quam studia de lege deque diuina doctrina concepisse. Quod prius est, hoc sit semen

providence, admired, in consequence of their community of view (on this subject). Aristaeus also has declared this to you. So he (Ptolemy) left these records behind, made accessible in the Greek idiom. To this very day the libraries of Ptolemy are shown in the Serapeum with the Hebrew literature itself. But the Jews too read it publicly: this liberty they have on payment of a tax, and there is common access to them every Sabbath. He who listens will find God: he also who is at pains to understand will be compelled to believe also.

Chap. XIX. The first authority is claimed for these sacred books by their extreme antiquity. Among you also the claiming of belief on the score of time amounts to a religion. Authority is given to literature by extreme age. For the prophet Moses, who began from the past his account of the creation of the world and the growth of the human race and afterwards the power of the flood which avenged the unrighteousness of that age, was the first to proclaim by prophecy down to his own time, and then through his own exploits, representations of the things to be, (was the first) also in whom a chronological order arranged from the beginning has given us a calculation of time. He is found to be about three hundred years earlier than the date at which Danaus, the most ancient (hero) known to you, crossed to Argos, he is found to be about a thousand years earlier than the Trojan war, which means that he is as much earlier than Saturn himself. For according to Thallus' history, in which it is recorded that Bel[1], king of the Assyrians, and Saturn, king of the Titans, fought with Jupiter, it can be shown that Bel antedated the destruction of Troy by three hundred and twenty-two years. It was through this Moses also that the Jews received from God that law peculiar to themselves. After his time in succession much was recorded by other prophets also who are older than your records; for even he who prophesied last either preceded somewhat or was at least contemporaneous with your philosophers, and even with your lawgivers. For in the reigns of Cyrus and Darius lived Zechariah, at which time Thales, the earliest of the natural philosophers, stirred no doubt by the words of the prophets, could give no definite answer about the Godhead to the questions of Croesus. To the same king Solon declared, in much the same words as the prophets, that he must look to the end of a long life. So clearly can it be seen from a backward glance that he (Solon) derived both your laws and your philosophy from the Jewish law and the divine teaching. What comes first must of necessity be the

[1] Reading *Belum.*

necesse est. Inde quaedam nobiscum uel prope nos habetis. De sophia amor eius philosophia uocitatus est, de prophetia affectatio eius poeticam uaticinationem deputauit. Gloriae homines si quid inuenerant, ut proprium facerent, adulterauerunt. Etiam fructibus a semine degenerare contigit. Multis adhuc de uetustate modis consisterem diuinarum litterarum, si non maior auctoritas illis ad fidem de ueritatis suae uiribus quam de aetatis annalibus suppetisset. Quid enim potentius patrocinabitur testimonio earum, nisi dispunctio cotidiana saeculi totius, cum dispositiones regnorum, cum casus urbium, cum exitus gentium, cum status temporum ita omnibus respondent, quemadmodum ante milia annorum praenuntiabantur? Unde et spes nostra, quam ridetis, animatur, et fiducia, quam praesumptionem uocatis, corroboratur. Idonea est enim recognitio praeteritorum ad disponendam fiduciam futurorum. Eadem uoces praedicauerunt utramque partem, eadem litterae notauerunt. Unum est tempus apud illas quod apud nos separari uidetur. Ita omnia quae supersunt improbata, *probata* sunt nobis, quia cum illis quae probata sunt tunc futuris praedicabantur. Habetis, quod sciam, et uos Sibyllam, quatinus appellatio ista uerae uatis dei ueri passim super ceteros qui uaticinari uidebantur usurpata est. Sunt uestrae Sibyllae nomen de ueritate mentitae, quemadmodum et dei uestri.] Omnes itaque substantias omnesque materias, origines, ordines, uenas ueterani cuiusque stili uestri, gentes etiam plerasque et urbes insignes historiarum et canas memoriarum, ipsas denique effigies litterarum, indices custodesque rerum et (puto adhuc minus dicimus) ipsos inquam deos uestros, ipsa templa et oracula et sacra unius interim prophetae scrinium saeculis uincit, in quo uidetur thesaurus collocatus totius Iudaici sacramenti et inde iam nostri. Si quem audistis interim Moysen, Argiuo Inacho pariter aetate est. Quadringentis paene annis (nam et septem minus) Danaum, et ipsum apud uos uetustissimum, praeuenit, mille circiter cladem Priami

seed. Hence it is that you have certain tenets either in common with us or like ours. It is from *sophia* (wisdom) that the love of it has got the name 'philosophy,' and from prophecy that the imitation of it has borrowed the divination of the poets. If men found anything that was glorious, they corrupted it to make it their own. Even fruits have degenerated from the quality of the seed. In many further ways I might join issue on the antiquity of the sacred writings, were it not that they derive a greater weight of credibility from the strength of their truth than from the records of their age. For what will support its evidence more powerfully than the daily testing of a whole age, when the arrangements of kingdoms, the fall of cities, the destruction of nations, the situations at particular times, correspond exactly to the prophecies about them made thousands of years before? Hence our hope, at which you laugh, receives fresh life, and our confidence, which you call assurance, is strengthened. For it is natural that an examination of the past should lead us to put confidence in the future. The same[1] words prophesied both past and future, the same writings have signified them. Time, which among us seems to be divided into parts, is but one in those writings. Consequently all that remains unverified is already for us verified, because it was prophesied along with those events which were then in the future and have (since) been verified. You also have, if I am not mistaken, a Sibyl. I mention her because this name of the true prophetess of the true God has been everywhere used beyond all others, who seemed to have the gift of prophecy, as[2] your Sibyls have falsely employed the name instead of the true one, even as your gods also have done.] All beings therefore and all materials, beginnings, arrangements, channels of each ancient writing of yours, likewise very many races and cities distinguished in history and hoary in records, further the very forms of the letters, the indicators and guardians of facts, and—I believe that as yet I have been putting it too feebly—your very gods I say, the very temples and oracles and sacred rites, are sometimes centuries antedated by one prophet's book, in which the treasure of the whole Jewish religion, and hence of ours also, seems to have been placed. If meantime you have heard of some Moses, he is as old as the Argive Inachus: by almost four hundred years—actually seven less—he precedes Danaus who is himself too the oldest among you, and he is about a thousand

[1] Reading *eaedem.*

[2] Reading *sicut.* [Others read *habemus nos* and *sciunt*, which seem to make better sense, especially if we read *sciant* <*autem*> or *sed* before *sicut.* "But let your Sibyls know that they have taken a false name from the true one." J. B. M.]

antecedit, possem etiam dicere quingentis amplius et Homerum, habens quos sequar. Ceteri quoque prophetae etsi Moysi postumant, extremissimi tamen eorum non retrosiores reprehenduntur primoribus uestris sapientibus et legiferis et historicis? Haec quibus ordinibus probari possint non tam difficile est nobis exponere quam enorme, nec arduum, sed interim longum. Multis instrumentis cum digitorum supputariis gesticulis adsidendum est, reseranda antiquissimarum etiam gentium archiua, Aegyptiorum, Chaldaeorum, Phoenicum, aduocandi municipes eorum per quos notitia subministrata est, aliqui Manethon Aegyptius et Berosus Chaldaeus, sed et Hieromus Phoenix, Tyri rex, sectatores quoque ipsorum Mendesius Ptolemaeus et Menander Ephesius et Demetrius Phalereus et rex Iuba et Apion et Thallus et si quis istos aut probat aut reuincit, Iudaeus Iosephus, antiquitatum Iudaicarum uernaculus uindex. Graecorum etiam censuales conferendi, ut quae quando sint gesta aut concatenationes temporum aperiantur, per quae luceant annalium numeri: peregrinandum est in historias et litteras orbis. Et tamen quasi partem iam probationis intulimus, cum per quae probari possint aspersimus. Verum differre praestat, uel ne minus persequamur festinando uel diutius euagemur persequendo.

20. Plus iam offerimus pro ista dilatione maiestatem scripturarum, si non uetustate diuinas probamus, si dubitatur antiquitas. Nec hoc tardius aut aliunde discendum. Coram sunt quae docebunt, mundus et saeculum et exitus. Quicquid agitur, praenuntiabatur; quicquid uidetur, audiebatur. Quod terrae uorant urbes, quod insulas maria fraudant, quod externa atque interna bella dilaniant, quod regnis regna conpulsant, quod fames et lues et locales quaeque clades et frequentiae plerumque mortium uastant, quod humiles sublimitate, sublimes humilitate mutantur, quod iustitia rarescit, iniquitas increbrescit, bonarum omnium disciplinarum cura torpescit, quod etiam officia temporum et elementorum munia exorbitant,

years earlier than the overthrow of Priam; I might also add 'and Homer too' by more than 500 years, seeing I have authorities for this statement. With regard to the other prophets also, although they are later than Moses, are not the very latest of them nevertheless found to be earlier than your earliest philosophers, legislators and historians? By what successions these statements can be proved it is not so much a difficult as it is an immense task for us to set forth, nor is it really difficult, but at this stage it would take too long. We should have to settle ourselves down to many documents with calculating movements of the fingers, we should have to unlock the archives even of the most ancient peoples, the Egyptians, the Chaldaeans, the Phoenicians. We should have to call in fellow-citizens of those by whom this knowledge has been supplied, some Egyptian Manetho and some Chaldean Berosus, but also Hiram the Phoenician, king of Tyre: their successors also, Ptolemy of Mendes and Menander of Ephesus and Demetrius of Phalerum and King Juba and Apion and Thallus, and either to confirm or refute these, the Jew Josephus, the native champion of Jewish antiquities. The census-books of the Greeks must also be compared, that what things were done at what time or the sequence of events may be made known, so as to throw light on the chronology of historical events; we must make excursions into the histories and literature of the world. And yet we have already brought forward about half of our proof, when we have given a sprinkling of the means by which they can be proved. But it is better to postpone (our proof), lest we should either accomplish less in our haste or digress too far in our treatment.

Chap. XX. In place of this deferred proof I now offer you something more, the majesty of the Scriptures, if we cannot prove them to be divine because of their age, if their age is questionable. Nor is this to be learnt slowly or from some other source; your instructors are before your eyes; the world and the age and the course of history. Whatsoever is taking place, was prophesied; whatsoever is now seen, was heard of: the swallowing up of cities by the earth, the encroachment on islands by the sea, the slaughters caused by foreign and domestic wars, the clash of kingdoms upon kingdoms, the devastation produced by famine and pestilence, and all local disasters and the great frequency of deaths; the humble are exalted and the lofty abased; the growing infrequency of justice, the growing frequency of injustice, the decay of the care for all noble lessons, the deviations in the functions of the seasons and the duties of the elements, the disturbance in the shape of natural objects

quod et monstris et portentis naturalium forma turbatur, prouidenter scripta sunt. Dum patimur, leguntur; dum recognoscimus, probantur. Idoneum, opinor, testimonium diuinitatis ueritas diuinationis. Hinc igitur apud nos futurorum quoque fides tuta est, iam scilicet probatorum, quia cum illis, quae cotidie probantur, praedicebantur. Eaedem uoces sonant, eaedem litterae notant, idem spiritus pulsat, unum tempus est diuinationi futura praefanti. Apud homines, si forte, distinguitur, dum expungitur, dum ex futuro praesens, dehinc ex praesenti praeteritum deputatur. Quid delinquimus, oro uos, futura quoque credentes, qui iam didicimus illi per duos gradus credere?

21. Sed quoniam edidimus antiquissimis Iudaeorum instrumentis sectam istam esse suffultam quam aliquanto nouellam, ut Tiberiani temporis, plerique sciunt, profitentibus nobis quoque, fortassean hoc nomine de statu eius retractetur, quasi sub umbraculo insignissimae religionis, certe licitae, aliquid propriae praesumptionis abscondat, uel quia praeter aetatem neque de uictus exceptionibus neque de solemnitatibus dierum neque de ipso signaculo corporis neque de consortio nominis cum Iudaeis agimus, quod utique oporteret si eidem deo manciparemur? Sed et uulgus iam scit Christum ut hominum aliquem, qualem Iudaei iudicauerunt, quo facilius quis nos hominis cultores existimauerit. Verum neque de Christo erubescimus, cum sub nomine eius deputari et damnari iuuat, neque de deo aliter praesumimus. Necesse est igitur pauca de Christo ut deo. Dudum Iudaeis erat apud deum gratia ubi et insignis iustitia et fides originalium auctorum: unde illis et generis magnitudo et regni sublimitas floruit et tanta felicitas, ut de dei uocibus, quibus edocebantur, de promerendo deo et non offendendo praemonerentur. Sed quanta deliquerint, fiducia patrum inflati ad declinandum, deriuantes a disciplina in profanum modum, etsi ipsi non confiterentur, probaret exitus hodiernus ipsorum. Dispersi, palabundi, et soli et caeli sui

both by prodigies and by portents, (all) are written (down) with foresight. While we experience them, they are being read; while we examine them, they are being proved true. The truth of prophecy is, I think, a reliable evidence of divinity. Therefore it is thus that amongst us the belief also in future events is safe, being already of course proved true, because they were prophesied along with those things that are daily verified; the same words sound, the same letters mark them, the same spirit impels them, time is an unity to prophecy when foretelling the future. Among men perhaps it is marked off into periods, while it is being completed, while the present is calculated from the future, then the past from the present. What is our sin, I pray you, in believing the future also, as we have already learned through two stages to believe it?

Chap. XXI. But since we have stated that this sect is supported by most ancient Jewish documents, though very many know on our own declaration also that it is comparatively new, belonging as it does to the time of Tiberius, perchance on this ground a further inquiry may be made into its nature, viz. that it conceals some of its own arrogance under the shadow of a most famous religion, or one that is at any rate permitted by law, or because in addition to the question of its age we have no relation with the Jews either with regard to distinctions of meats, or the sanctity of special days or the distinctive bodily mark itself or the sharing of the name with them, which would of course be our duty if we were the property of the same god. Even the common people now know Christ as a human being, such as the Jews judged him (to be), so that it is easier for any one to believe that we are worshippers of a man. But we are neither ashamed of Christ, seeing that we rejoice to be reckoned as his servants and condemned with him, nor is our idea of God different from that of the Jews. We must therefore say something about Christ as God. The Jews had long enjoyed favour with God, for among them the justice and loyalty of their ancestors at the beginning were remarkable; whence the greatness of their race and the glory of their kingdom flourished and so great happiness, that from the words of God, by which they were taught, they were warned beforehand as to the gaining of his favour and the avoidance of his displeasure. But how greatly they transgressed, being puffed up by confidence in their fathers to leave the true path, and profanely turning aside from their training! Even if they themselves did not admit the fact, their ruinous situation to-day would prove it. Scattered in all directions, straggling, exiles from their own

extorres uagantur per orbem sine homine, sine deo rege, quibus nec aduenarum iure terram patriam saltim uestigio salutare conceditur. Cum haec illis sanctae uoces praeminarentur, eadem semper omnes ingerebant fore uti sub extimis curriculis saeculi ex omni iam gente et populo et loco cultores sibi adlegeret deus multo fideliores in quos gratiam transferret, pleniorem quidem ob disciplinae auctioris capacitatem. Venit igitur qui ad reformandam et inluminandam eam uenturus a deo praenuntiabatur, Christus ille filius dei. Huius igitur gratiae disciplinaeque arbiter et magister, inluminator atque deductor generis humani filius dei adnuntiabatur: non quidem ita genitus, ut erubescat in filii nomine aut de patris semine. Non de sororis incesto nec de stupro filiae aut coniugis alienae deum patrem passus est squamatum aut cornutum aut plumatum, amatorem in auro conuersum Danaidis. Iouis ista sunt numina uestra. Ceterum dei filius nullam de impudicitia habet matrem; etiam quam uidetur habere, non nupserat. Sed prius substantiam edisseram, et ita natiuitatis qualitas intellegetur. Iam ediximus deum uniuersitatem hanc mundi uerbo et ratione et uirtute molitum. Apud uestros quoque sapientes ΛΟΓΟΝ, id est sermonem atque rationem, constat artificem uideri uniuersitatis. Hunc enim Zeno determinat factitatorem, qui cuncta in dispositione formauerit; eundem et fatum uocari et deum et animum Iouis et necessitatem omnium rerum. Haec Cleanthes in spiritum congerit, quem permeatorem uniuersitatis adfirmat. Et nos autem sermoni atque rationi itemque uirtuti, per quae omnia molitum deum ediximus, propriam substantiam spiritum inscribimus, cui et sermo insit pronuntianti et ratio adsit disponenti et uirtus praesit perficienti. Hunc ex deo prolatum didicimus et prolatione generatum et idcirco filium dei et deum dictum ex unitate substantiae. Nam et deus spiritus. Et cum radius ex sole porrigitur, portio ex summa; sed sol erit in radio, quia solis est radius nec separatur substantia sed extenditur. Ita de spiritu spiritus et de deo deus ut lumen de lumine accensum. Manet integra et indefecta materiae matrix, etsi plures inde traduces qualitatis mutueris:

soil and sky, they wander over the world without either man or God for their king; they are not allowed even as strangers to greet the land of their fathers even to the extent of stepping on it. While holy voices threatened them with this beforehand, at the same time all were continually urging, that in the last stages of time God would then choose for himself from every race, community and region worshippers much more faithful to whom to transfer his favour, which would be actually fuller by reason of the capacity of a more developed teaching. He came therefore, that being, Christ, the Son of God, who it was foretold would come from God to reform and illuminate the world. The Son of God therefore was announced as ruler and master of this grace and dispensation, the enlightener and the leader of the human race, not indeed born under such circumstances, that he should blush at the name of son or at his father's seed; it was not through incestuous connexion with a sister nor through the debauching of a daughter or of another's wife that he got a god for father, a lover scaly or horned or feathered or changed into a shower of gold, like Danae's. These shameful deeds of Jupiter are the gods you worship. But the Son of God has his mother as the result of no unchastity; even she, whom he seems to have (for mother), had not married. But I will first explain his nature, and thus the character of his birth will be understood. We have already proclaimed that God constructed this totality of the universe by word and reason and power. Among your philosophers also it is a settled belief that Logos, which means word and reason, is the fashioner of the universe. For Zeno lays it down that this maker, who fashioned everything in order, is the same that is called also fate and god and the mind of Jupiter and the inevitableness of all things. These Cleanthes combines in the Spirit, which he maintains pervades the universe. And we also ascribe Spirit as its true essence to word and reason and likewise to power, by which we have proclaimed that God has constructed everything, in which are present both word when declaring and reason when arranging and power when accomplishing. We have learnt that this Spirit came forth from God and by this forth-coming is begotten and has therefore been called Son of God, and God from unity of nature. For Spirit is also God. Also, when a ray is projected from the sun, it is a part of the whole; but the sun will be in the ray, because the ray belongs to the sun and is not separated from it by nature but stretches out from it. Spirit comes from Spirit and God from God as light is kindled from light. The parent-stem remains whole and unlessened in substance, even if you borrow a number of offshoots of its character from it:

ita et quod de deo profectum est, deus est et dei filius et unus ambo. Ita et de spiritu spiritus et de deo deus modulo alternum numerum, gradu non statu fecit, et a matrice non recessit sed excessit. Iste igitur dei radius, ut retro semper praedicabatur, delapsus in uirginem quandam et in utero eius caro figuratus nascitur homo deo mixtus. Caro spiritu instructa nutritur, adolescit, adfatur, docet, operatur et Christus est. Recipite interim hanc fabulam, similis est uestris, dum ostendimus quomodo Christus probetur et qui penes uos eiusmodi fabulas aemulas ad destructionem ueritatis istiusmodi praeministrauerint. Sciebant et Iudaei uenturum esse Christum, scilicet quibus prophetae loquebantur. Nam et nunc aduentum eius expectant, nec alia magis inter nos et illos conpulsatio est quam quod iam uenisse non credunt. Duobus enim aduentibus eius significatis, primo, qui iam expunctus est in humilitate conditionis humanae, secundo, qui concludendo saeculo imminet in sublimitate diuinitatis exertae, primum non intellegendo secundum, quem manifestius praedicatum sperant, unum existimauerunt. Ne enim intellegerent pristinum, credituri, si intellexissent, et consecuturi salutem, si credidissent, meritum fuit delictum eorum. Ipsi legunt ita scriptum mulctatos se sapientia et intellegentia et oculorum et aurium fruge. Quem igitur hominem solummodo praesumpserant de humilitate, sequebatur uti magum aestimarent de potestate, cum ille uerbo daemonia de hominibus excuteret, caecos reluminaret, leprosos purgaret, paralyticos restringeret, mortuos denique uerbo redderet uitae, elementa ipsa famularet compescens procellas et freta ingrediens, ostendens se esse uerbum dei, id est ΛΟΓΟΝ, illud primordiale, primogenitum, uirtute et ratione comitatum et spiritu fultum, eundem qui uerbo omnia et faceret et fecisset. Ad doctrinam uero eius, qua reuincebantur magistri primoresque Iudaeorum, ita exasperabantur, maxime quod ingens ad eum multitudo deflecteret, ut postremo oblatum

so also that which has come forth from God, is God and the Son of God, and both are one. So the Spirit that comes from Spirit and the God that comes from God brought about the number two, as regards the measure (of the possession of being), in grade not in unchangeable condition, and it did not separate from the source, but came out from it. This ray, therefore, of God, as was always foretold[1] in the past, coming down into a certain virgin and being formed into flesh in her womb, is born man mixed with God. The flesh having been informed with breath is nourished, grows up, speaks, teaches, works, and is Christ. Meantime accept this story, which is like your own, while I show how he is proved to be Christ and who they are among you who have previously supplied hostile tales of that kind to destroy a truth of this kind. The Jews too knew that Christ was to come, seeing that it was to them that the prophets used to speak. For even now they are looking out for his arrival, nor is there any greater cause of disagreement between us and them than the fact that they do not believe that he has already come. For as two advents of his have been indicated, the first, which has already been fulfilled (in every predicted detail), in the humility of his human creation, the second, which precedes the end of the world, in the loftiness of the manifested Godhead, they by misunderstanding the first, have thought the second, which (having been more clearly prophesied[2]) they expect, to be the only one. It was the desert of their transgression that they should not understand the original advent, for if they had understood, they would have believed, and if they had believed they would have attained safety. They themselves read it thus written, that they have lost their wisdom and understanding and the use of their eyes and ears. It followed therefore that he whom they had assumed to be merely man because of his humility, they regarded as a magician from his power, when by a word he cast out demons from men, restored light to the blind, cleansed the lepers, braced up the paralytic again, and even by a word restored the dead to life, ruled the elements themselves, quelling storms and walking upon seas, showing that he was the word of God (that is the Logos), that original, first-born word, attended by power and reason and supported by spirit, the selfsame who was both making and had made everything by a word. At his teaching, however, by which the teachers and leading men among the Jews were refuted, they were so angered, especially because a vast crowd was turning aside to him, that in the end they prosecuted him, and by the violence of

[1] Read *praedicebatur*. [2] Read *praedictum*.

Pontio Pilato, Syriam tunc ex parte Romana procuranti, uiolentia suffragiorum in crucem Iesum dedi sibi extorserint. Praedixerat et ipse ita facturos; parum si non et prophetae retro. Et tamen suffixus multa mortis illius propria ostendit insignia. Nam spiritum cum uerbo sponte dimisit, praeuento carnificis officio. Eodem momento dies medium orbem signante sole subducta est. Deliquium utique putauerunt qui id quoque super Christo praedicatum non scierunt. Et tamen eum mundi casum relatum in arcanis uestris habetis. Tunc Iudaei detractum et sepulchro conditum magna etiam militari manu custodiae diligentia circumsederunt, ne, quia praedixerat tertia die resurrecturum se a morte, discipuli furto amoliti cadauer fallerent suspectos. Sed ecce tertia die concussa repente terra, et mole reuoluta quae obstruxerat sepulchrum, et custodia pauore disiecta, nullis apparentibus discipulis nihil in sepulchro repertum est praeterquam exuuiae sepulti. Nihilominus tamen primores, quorum intererat et scelus diuulgare et populum uectigalem et famularem sibi a fide reuocare, subreptum a discipulis iactitauerunt. Nam nec ille se in uulgus eduxit, ne impii errore liberarentur, ut et fides, non mediocri praemio destinata, difficultate constaret. Cum discipulis autem quibusdam apud Galilaeam, Iudaeae regionem, ad quadraginta dies egit docens eos quae docerent. Dehinc ordinatis eis ad officium praedicandi per orbem circumfusa nube in caelum est receptus, multo uerius quam apud uos adseuerare de Romulo Proculi solent. Ea omnia super Christo Pilatus, et ipse iam pro sua conscientia Christianus, Caesari tunc Tiberio nuntiauit. Sed et Caesares credidissent super Christo, si aut Caesares non essent necessarii saeculo, aut si et Christiani potuissent esse Caesares. Discipuli quoque diffusi per orbem ex praecepto magistri dei paruerunt, qui et ipsi a Iudaeis insequentibus multa perpessi utique pro fiducia ueritatis libenter Romae postremo per Neronis saeuitiam

their partisanship forcibly obtained from Pontius Pilate, who at that time was governing Syria on behalf of the Romans, Jesus' surrender for crucifixion. He himself also had foretold that they would do so; a small thing, if the prophets had not also foretold it earlier. And further, on being crucified he displayed many signs peculiar to that death. For he released his spirit of his own accord with a word, anticipating the duty of the executioner. At the same moment daylight was withdrawn, though the sun was then marking the middle of his course. Those who did not know that this also had been prophesied[1] with regard to Christ, thought that it was an eclipse; and yet you have that overshadowing of the sky recorded in your secret records. Then the Jews took him down, laid him in a tomb, and further surrounded it with a large band of soldiers, to guard it carefully, lest his disciples might remove the corpse by stealth, because he had foretold that on the third day he would rise again from death, and thus escape those who suspected them. But lo, on the third day there was a sudden earthquake and the massive stone which had blocked the entrance to the tomb was rolled back; the guard dispersed in panic, though no disciples appeared, and nothing was found in the tomb except the grave clothes. Nevertheless, the rulers, whose interest it was both to spread a wicked tale and to recall from the faith their tributaries and dependents, spread abroad the report that he had been stolen by his disciples. For neither did he show himself to the crowd, lest the irreligious might be freed from their mistake, and also in order that belief, which is destined to receive no little reward, should be strengthened by difficulty. However with certain disciples he lived in Galilee, a district of Judea, for forty days, teaching them what they were to teach. Then, having ordained them to the duty of preaching throughout the world, he was taken up to heaven in a cloud, much more truly than people like Proculus are wont to assert among you about Romulus. All these things with reference to Christ, Pilate, who himself also in his own conscience was now a Christian, reported to the then emperor Tiberius. But even the emperors would have believed on Christ, if either emperors had not been necessary to the world or if it had been possible for Christians too to be emperors. His disciples also scattered throughout the world in accordance with the order of their teacher God. They themselves too having gladly suffered much at the hands of persecuting Jews, of course for their confidence in the truth, at last through the cruelty of Nero sowed the seed of Christian martyrdom at Rome.

[1] Read *praedictum.*

sanguinem Christianum seminauerunt. Sed monstrabimus uobis idoneos testes Christi ipsos illos quos adoratis. Multum est si eos adhibeam ut credatis Christianis propter quos non creditis Christianis. Interim hic est ordo nostrae institutionis, hunc edidimus et sectae et nominis censum cum suo auctore. Nemo iam infamiam incutiat, nemo aliud existimet, quia nec fas est ulli de sua religione mentiri. Ex eo enim quod aliud a se coli dicit quam colit, negat quod colit, et culturam et honorem in alterum transfert, et transferendo iam non colit quod negauit. Dicimus, et palam dicimus, et uobis torquentibus lacerati et cruenti uociferamur: Deum colimus per Christum. Illum hominem putate, per eum et in eo se cognosci et coli deus uult. Ut Iudaeis respondeamus, et ipsi dominum per hominem Moysen colere didicerunt: ut Graecis occurram, Orpheus Pieriae, Musaeus Athenis, Melampus Argis, Trophonius Boeotiae initiationibus homines obligauerunt: ut ad uos quoque dominatores gentium adspiciam, homo fuit Pompilius Numa, qui Romanos operosissimis superstitionibus onerauit. Licuerit et Christo commentari diuinitatem, rem propriam, non qua rupices et adhuc feros homines multitudini tot numinum demerendorum attonitos efficiendo ad humanitatem temperaret, quod Numa, sed qui iam expolitos et ipsa urbanitate deceptos in agnitionem ueritatis ocularet. Quaerite igitur si uera est ista diuinitas Christi. Si ea est qua cognita ad bonum quis reformatur, sequitur ut falsae renuntietur, conperta inprimis illa omni ratione quae delitiscens sub nominibus et imaginibus mortuorum quibusdam signis et miraculis et oraculis fidem diuinitatis operatur.

22. Atque adeo dicimus esse substantias quasdam spiritales. Nec nouum nomen est. Sciunt daemones philosophi, Socrate ipso ad daemonii arbitrium exspectante. Quidni? cum et ipsi daemonium a pueritia adhaesisse dicatur, dehortatorium plane a bono. Omnes sciunt poëtae; etiam uulgus indoctum in usum maledicti frequentat. Nam et Satanan, principem huius mali generis, proinde de propria conscientia animae eadem

But we will show you that the very persons whom you worship are reliable witnesses of Christ. It is a great point, if, to make you believe the Christians, I can employ those on whose account you now disbelieve them. Meantime this is the order of our teaching, this the beginning both of our sect and name together with that of its founder. Let no one now charge us with dishonour, let no one believe any other thing than this, because it is not permitted to any one to tell lies about his own religion. For from the moment that a man says anything is worshipped by him other than what he worships, he denies what he worships, and transfers both worship and honour to another, and by transferring he now no longer worships that which he denied. We affirm and affirm openly and, torn and bleeding, as we are, under your torture, we cry aloud, 'We worship God through Christ.' Suppose him to be a man: it is through him and in him that God desires himself to be known and worshipped. But to reply to the Jews, they themselves too were taught to worship the Lord through the man Moses: and to meet the objections of the Greeks, Orpheus at Pieria, Musaeus at Athens, Melampus at Argos, Trophonius in Boeotia bound men by initiations: to turn my attention to you also, the rulers of the nations, Numa Pompilius, who loaded the Romans with most irksome superstitions, was a man. Let it be allowed to Christ to imagine divinity to be his own possession, not as a mere name by which he was to tone down to a true humanity a barbarous herd, by making them awe-struck at the crowd of so many divine powers that had to be appeased, as Numa did, but so as to open to the recognition of the truth the eyes of men already refined and deceived by their very refinement. Seek then and see whether this divinity of Christ be true. If it is that on the learning of which any one is reformed and becomes good, it follows that the unreal (divinity) must be given up, as all that method in particular has been found out, which hiding itself under names and representations of dead persons does by certain signs and wonders and oracles work belief in its own divinity.

Chap. XXII. And further we say that there are certain spiritual substances; nor is the name unusual. The philosophers are familiar with daemons, since Socrates himself waited on the will of a daemon. Why not? A daemon is said to have actually attached itself to him since boyhood, evidently to dissuade him from good. All the poets know them, even the untaught rabble makes constant use of them for cursing; for they utter even the name of Satan, the chief of this evil class, as it were from the soul's innate knowledge, with the same

execramenti uoce pronuntiat. Angelos quoque etiam Plato non negauit. Utriusque nominis testes esse uel magi adsunt. Sed quomodo de angelis quibusdam sua sponte corruptis corruptior gens daemonum euaserit, damnata a deo cum generis auctoribus et cum eo quem diximus principe, apud litteras sanctas ordo cognoscitur. Nunc de operatione eorum satis erit exponere. Operatio eorum est hominis euersio. Sic malitia spiritalis a primordio auspicata est in hominis exitium. Itaque corporibus quidem et ualitudines infligunt et aliquos casus acerbos, animae uero repentinos et extraordinarios per uim excessus. Suppetit illis ad utramque substantiam hominis adeundam subtilitas et tenuitas sua. Multum spiritalibus uiribus licet, ut inuisibiles et insensibiles in effectu potius quam in actu suo appareant, si poma, si fruges nescio quod aurae latens uitium in flore praecipitat, in germine exanimat, in pubertate conuulnerat, ac si caeca ratione temptatus aër pestilentes haustus suos offundit. Eadem igitur obscuritate contagionis adspiratio daemonum et angelorum mentis quoque corruptelas agit furoribus et amentiis foedis aut saeuis libidinibus cum erroribus uariis, quorum iste potissimus quo deos istos captis et circumscriptis hominum mentibus commendat, ut et sibi pabula propria nidoris et sanguinis procuret simulacris imaginibus oblata. Et quae illi accuratior pascua est, quam ut hominem e cogitatu uerae diuinitatis auertat praestigiis falsis? Quas et ipsas quomodo operetur expediam. Omnis spiritus ales est. Hoc angeli et daemones. Igitur momento ubique sunt; totus orbis illis locus unus est; quid ubi geratur tam facile sciunt quam adnuntiant. Velocitas diuinitas creditur, quia substantia ignoratur. Sic et auctores interdum uideri uolunt eorum quae adnuntiant. Et sunt plane malorum nonnunquam, bonorum tamen nunquam. Dispositiones etiam dei et tunc prophetis contionantibus excerpunt et nunc lectionibus resonantibus carpunt. Ita et hinc sumentes quasdam temporum sortes aemulantur diuinitatem, dum furantur diuinationem. In oraculis autem quo ingenio ambiguitates temperent in euentus sciunt Croesi, sciunt Pyrrhi.

word of cursing. Plato also did not deny the existence of angels: even the magi are ready to bear witness to both names (i.e. spirits and angels). Nay we learn in sacred literature the story how, from certain angels polluted of their own free-will, a yet more polluted race of spirits arose, condemned by God along with the founders of their stock and along with him whom we have called the chief. Now it will be enough to explain the course of their work. Their business is the destruction of man: thus did the wickedness of spirits begin at the beginning of things with a view to the ruin of man. Therefore while it is true that they inflict on bodies both diseases and some severe accidents, they also inflict on the soul sudden and strange aberrations of violent madness. Their wonderful subtilty and fineness of texture give them access to both parts of man. Spiritual agencies have great power, so that being invisible and intangible[1] they show themselves rather in their effect than in their action; if fruit, if ground-crops are through some secret fault in the atmosphere nipt in the bud, killed in the seed, seriously damaged when ripe, and if the air attacked in some hidden way exhales its pestilential draughts. Then by the same obscure contagion the breathing of daemons and of angels (upon us) works corruptions of the mind also, in attacks of raving madness and disgraceful paroxysms of folly or cruel lusts attended by various errors, of which the most signal is this by which it recommends these gods to the enthralled and deluded minds of men, that it may obtain for itself also proper diets of fumes and blood, offered to statues and images. And what more exquisite pasture could it have than by its deceptive legerdemain to turn away man from thinking on true divinity? How it works these very tricks I will explain. Every spirit is winged. So are angels and daemons. Consequently in a moment they are everywhere, to them the whole world is one place; what is being done in any place it is as easy for them to know as to report. Their swiftness is believed to betoken divinity, because their substance is unknown. Thus they sometimes wish to be regarded as the authors also of what they report; and they certainly are so at times in the case of evil, but never of good things. Even the counsels of God they in the old days picked up from the words of the prophets, and in these days they gather them from the lessons of Scripture they hear. So it is that gleaning from them certain responses with regard to dates they enviously ape the divinity, while they steal the oracles of God. In the sphere of oracles, moreover, people like Croesus and Pyrrhus know with what ingenuity they adapt ambiguities to

[1] The reference is to all the senses other than *sight*.

Ceterum testudinem decoqui cum carnibus pecudis Pythius eo modo renuntiauit quo supra diximus; momento apud Lydiam fuerat. Habent de incolatu aëris et de uicinia siderum et de commercio nubium caelestes sapere paraturas, ut et pluuias, quas iam sentiunt, repromittant. Benefici plane et circa curas ualitudinum. Laedunt enim primo, dehinc remedia praecipiunt ad miraculum noua siue contraria, post quae desinunt laedere, et curasse creduntur. Quid ergo de ceteris ingeniis uel etiam uiribus fallaciae spiritalis edisseram? phantasmata Castorum, et aquam cribro gestatam, et nauem cingulo promotam, et barbam tactu inrufatam, ut numina lapides crederentur, ut deus uerus non quaereretur?

23. Porro, si et magi phantasmata edunt et iam defunctorum infamant animas, si pueros in eloquium oraculi elidunt, si multa miracula circulatoriis praestigiis ludunt, si et somnia immittunt habentes semel inuitatorum angelorum et daemonum adsistentem sibi potestatem, per quos et caprae et mensae diuinare consuerunt, quanto magis ea potestas de suo arbitrio et pro suo negotio studeat totis uiribus operari quod alienae praestat negotiationi! Aut si eadem et angeli et daemones operantur quae et dei uestri, ubi est ergo praecellentia diuinitatis, quam utique superiorem omni potestate credendum est? Non ergo dignius praesumetur ipsos esse qui se deos faciant, cum eadem edant quae faciant deos credi, quam pares angelis et daemonibus deos esse? Locorum differentia distinguitur, opinor, ut a templis deos existimetis quos alibi deos non dicitis; ut aliter dementire uideatur qui sacras turres peruolat, aliter qui tecta uiciniae transilit, et alia uis pronuntietur in eo qui genitalia uel lacertos, alia qui sibi gulam prosecat. Compar exitus furoris et una ratio est instigationis. Sed hactenus

events. But it was in the way we have mentioned above that the Pythian Apollo reported the boiling of a tortoise with the flesh of a sheep; a moment had taken him to Lydia. From the fact that they inhabit the air and from the neighbourhood of the stars and from their dealings with the clouds they are able to have knowledge of the preparations in heaven, so that they can even promise rains which they already feel. They are also clearly sorcerers[1] in their treatments of disease. For they first injure, and then prescribe remedies to excite wonder, whether simply new or absolutely opposed to the usual practices, after which they cease to injure, and are (thus) believed to have effected a cure. Why then should I speak of other subtilties or even powers of spiritual deception? the appearances of the Castors, and the water borne in a sieve, and the ship propelled by a girdle, and the beard made red at a touch,—so that stones might be believed to be divinities, and the true God should not be sought after?

Chap. XXIII. Moreover, if magicians also call forth apparitions and dishonour the souls of those already dead, if they put children to death to get an oracular utterance, if they perform many wonders with mountebank trickery, if they also let loose dreams, having to stand by them the power of angels and spirits once for all invited, through whom both goats and tables have been wont to give oracles, how much more would that power of its own initiative and on behalf of its own business exert itself with all its strength to carry out the same work, which it performs to serve the business of another! Or if both angels and daemons work the same things as your gods also work, where then lies the preeminence of divinity, which must of course be believed to be superior to every (other) power? Will it not then be more fitting to assume that it is the persons themselves who make themselves gods, since they display the same actions which produce belief in divinity, than to imagine that the gods are merely on a level with angels and daemons? A distinction is made, I suppose, according to the difference of localities, so that from their temples you judge those to be gods, whom in other places you do not call gods: so that one who flies through sacred towers is considered to suffer from one kind of madness, while one who leaps over the houses in the neighbourhood is considered to suffer from another, and one power is declared to exist in him who cuts off his organs of generation or his arms, and another in him who cuts off his tongue. The result of the madness is alike in both cases and there is one

[1] Reading *Venefici*. (For the confusion, cf. Aug. *serm.* 163 § 2.)

uerba; iam hinc demonstratio rei ipsius, qua ostendemus unam esse utriusque nominis qualitatem. Edatur hic aliqui ibidem sub tribunalibus uestris quem daemone agi constet. Iussus a quolibet Christiano loqui spiritus ille tam se daemonem confitebitur de uero quam alibi dominum de falso. Aeque producatur aliquis ex his qui de deo pati existimantur, qui aris inhalantes numen de nidore concipiunt, qui ructando curantur, qui anhelando praefantur. Ista ipsa Virgo Caelestis pluuiarum pollicitatrix, ipse iste Aesculapius medicinarum demonstrator, aliam diem morituris Socordio et Tenatio et Asclepiodoto sumministraturi, nisi se daemones confessi fuerint Christiano mentiri non audentes, ibidem illius Christiani procacissimi sanguinem fundite! Quid isto opere manifestius? Quid hac probatione fidelius? Simplicitas ueritatis in medio est. Virtus illi sua adsistit; nihil suspicari licebit. Magia aut aliqua eiusmodi fallacia fieri dicitis? Non dicetis, si oculi uestri et aures permiserint uobis. Quid autem inici potest aduersus id quod ostenditur nuda sinceritate? Si altera parte uere dei sunt, cur sese daemonia mentiuntur? An ut nobis obsequantur? Iam ergo subiecta est Christianis diuinitas uestra, nec diuinitas deputanda est quae subdita est homini et, si quid ad dedecus facit, aemulis suis. Si altera parte daemones sunt uel angeli, cur se alibi pro deis agere respondent? Nam sicut illi qui dei habentur daemones se dicere noluissent, si uere dei essent, scilicet ne se de maiestate deponerent, ita et isti, quos directo daemonas nostis, non auderent alibi pro deis agere, si aliqui omnino dei essent, quorum nominibus utuntur. Vererentur enim abuti maiestate superiore sine dubio et timendorum. Adeo nulla est diuinitas ista quam tenetis, quia, si esset, neque a daemoniis adfectaretur in confessione neque a deis negaretur. Cum ergo utraque pars concurrit in confessionem deos esse negans, agnoscite unum genus esse, id est daemonas, uerum utrobique. Iam deos quaerite. Quos enim praesumpseratis, daemonas esse cognoscitis. Eadem uero opera nostra ab

method only of incitement. But enough of words; from this point onward there must be a presentation of the thing itself, by which we shall show that the nature of gods and daemons is one. Let any one be produced in this very place under your tribunals, who it is well known is under the influence of a daemon; that spirit, if ordered by any Christian to speak, will as readily confess itself a daemon, because it is true, as elsewhere a god because it is untrue. Let someone likewise be brought forward from among those who are thought to be under the influence of a god, men who by breathing on altars acquire a divine power from the odour of the sacrifice, who are cured by exhaling, and force an utterance as they pant. This very Maiden of the Heavens, the promiser of rains, this very Aesculapius, the discoverer of cures, the ministers of another day to Socordius, Tenatius and Asclepiodotus, men doomed to die - unless they confess themselves daemons, not daring to lie to a Christian, forthwith shed the blood of that most insolent Christian! What could be more evident than a fact like this? what more trustworthy than this demonstration? The simplicity of truth is for all eyes to see, its own excellence supports it, suspicion is impossible. Do you say this result comes from magic or some deception of that kind? You will not say it, (even) if your eyes and ears allow you. But what can be insinuated against that which is set forth in its naked simplicity? If, on the one hand, they are truly gods, why do they say falsely that they are daemons? is it that they may please us? If so, then your divinity is already subject to Christians, and that is not to be considered divinity which is subject to a man, and (if aught can add to the disgrace) to its actual foes. If on the other hand they are daemons or angels, why do they answer that they play the part of gods elsewhere? For, just as those who are considered gods would have refused to call themselves daemons, if they had been truly gods, of course lest they should depose themselves from their high dignity, so also these whom you know at once to be daemons, would not dare elsewhere to pose as gods, if those gods whose names they usurp were gods of any sort at all, since they would be afraid to misuse those higher dignities which, without doubt, they would also have to dread. Therefore this divinity which you hold fast is non-existent: for, if it existed, it would neither be claimed by spirits in confession, nor denied by gods. Since then both sides agree to our admission, denying that the gods exist, you must recognise that there is one class only, viz. daemons, but that it is on both sides. You must now seek for fresh gods, since those you had assumed to exist, you learn are daemons. But by this same aid from us,

eisdem deis uestris non tantum hoc detegentibus quod neque ipsi dei sint neque ulli alii, etiam illud in continenti cognoscitis, qui sit uere deus, et an ille et an unicus quem Christiani profitemur, et an ita credendus colendusque, ut fides, ut disciplina disposita est Christianorum. Dicent ibidem: Et quis ille Christus cum sua fabula? si homo communis conditionis? si magus? si post mortem de sepulchro a discipulis subreptus? si nunc denique penes inferos? si non in caelis potius, et inde uenturus cum totius mundi motu, cum orbis horrore, cum planctu omnium, sed non Christianorum, ut dei uirtus et dei spiritus et sermo et sapientia et ratio et dei filius? Quodcunque ridetis, rideant et illi uobiscum; negent Christum omnem ab aeuo animam restituto corpore iudicaturum, dicant hoc pro tribunali, si forte, Minoëm et Rhadamanthum secundum consensum Platonis et poëtarum hoc esse sortitos; suae saltim ignominiae et damnationis notam refutent. Renuntiant se immundos spiritus esse, quod uel ex pabulis eorum, sanguine et fumo et putidis rogis pecorum, et impuratissimis linguis ipsorum uatum intellegi debuit: renuant ob malitiam praedamnatos se in eundem iudicii diem cum omnibus cultoribus et operationibus suis. Atquin omnis haec nostra in illos dominatio et potestas de nominatione Christi ualet et de commemoratione eorum quae sibi a deo per arbitrum Christum imminentia exspectant. Christum timentes in deo et deum in Christo subiciuntur seruis dei et Christi. Ita de contactu deque afflatu nostro, contemplatione et repraesentatione ignis illius correpti etiam de corporibus nostro imperio excedunt inuiti et dolentes et uobis praesentibus erubescentes. Credite illis, cum uerum de se loquuntur, qui mentientibus creditis. Nemo ad suum dedecus mentitur, quin potius ad honorem. Magis fides proxima est aduersus semetipsos confitentes quam pro semetipsis negantes. Haec denique testimonia deorum uestrorum Christianos facere consuerunt; quam plurimum illis credendo in Christo domino credimus. Ipsi litterarum nostrarum fidem accendunt, ipsi spei nostrae fidentiam aedificant. Colitis illos, quod sciam, etiam de sanguine Christianorum.

from these same gods of yours, who reveal not only this, that neither they themselves nor any others are gods, you immediately learn this also, namely who is truly God, and whether it is he and he alone whom we Christians profess to believe, and whether he ought to be believed and worshipped as the belief and teaching of the Christians is laid down. They will say at the same time: 'And who is that Christ with his story? was he a man of ordinary condition? was he a magician? was he after death stolen from the tomb by his disciples? Is he now at last among the shades below?' Is he not rather in the heavens, and to come thence with a movement of the whole universe, with trembling of the world, with mourning of all (but not of the Christians), as the power of God and the breath and word and wisdom and reason of God, and the Son of God? Whatsoever you laugh at, let them also (i.e. the daemons) laugh at it with you; let them deny that Christ will judge every soul that has been since the beginning of time, each having its body restored to it. Let them say that instead of this tribunal a Minos perhaps and a Rhadamanthus, according to the agreement of Plato and the poets, were allotted to this duty; let them at least repudiate the stigma of their own disgrace and condemnation. They report that they are unclean spirits, a fact which ought to have been understood even from their diet, blood and smoke and the putrid sacrifices of cattle, and the polluted tongues of the soothsayers themselves. Let them deny that on account of their wickedness they were fore-ordained to the same day of judgment with all their worshippers and agencies. Yet all this rule and power of ours over them derives its strength from the naming of Christ, and from the mention of those things which they look for as impending over them from God, through Christ the Judge. Fearing Christ in God and God in Christ, they are subject to the servants of God and Christ. Thus from our touch and from our breath being carried away by the thought and vision of that fire, they even leave the bodies of men at our order, unwilling and discomfited and ashamed at your presence. Believe them when they speak the truth about themselves, ye who believe them when they lie. No one lies to bring disgrace, but rather to bring honour upon himself. Credence is more readily given to those who confess against themselves than to those who deny in defence of themselves. Further these testimonies from your own gods have been wont to make Christians: because, the more we believe them, the more we believe in Christ as Lord. They themselves excite belief in our scriptures, they themselves build up trust in our hope. To the best of my belief, you even propitiate them with the blood of Christians. They would therefore

Nollent itaque uos tam fructuosos, tam officiosos sibi amittere, uel ne a uobis quandoque a Christianis fugentur, si illis sub Christiano, uolente uobis ueritatem probare, mentiri liceret.

24. Omnis ista confessio illorum qua se deos negant esse quaque non alium deum respondent praeter unum, cui nos mancipamur, satis idonea est ad depellendum crimen laesae maxime Romanae religionis. Si enim non sunt dei pro certo, nec religio pro certo est: si religio non est, quia nec dei pro certo, nec nos pro certo rei sumus laesae religionis. At e contrario in uos exprobratio resultauit, qui mendacium colentes ueram religionem ueri dei non modo neglegendo, quin insuper expugnando, in uerum committitis crimen uerae inreligiositatis. Nunc ut constaret illos deos esse, nonne conceditis de aestimatione communi aliquem esse sublimiorem et potentiorem, uelut principem mundi perfectae potentiae et maiestatis? Nam et sic plerique disponunt diuinitatem, ut imperium summae dominationis esse penes unum, officia eius penes multos uelint, ut Plato Iouem magnum in caelo comitatum exercitu describit deorum pariter et daemonum. Itaque oportere et procurantes et praefectos et praesides pariter suspici. Et tamen quod facinus admittit qui magis ad Caesarem promerendum et operam et spem suam transfert nec appellationem dei ita ut imperatoris in aliquo principe confitetur, cum capitale esse iudicetur alium praeter Caesarem et dicere et audire? Colat alius deum, alius Iouem, alius ad caelum manus supplices tendat, alius ad aram Fidei, alius, si hoc putatis, nubes numeret orans, alius lacunaria, alius suam animam deo suo uoueat, alius hirci. Videte enim ne et hoc ad inreligiositatis elogium concurrat, adimere libertatem religionis et interdicere optionem diuinitatis, ut non liceat mihi colere quem uelim, sed cogar colere quem nolim. Nemo se ab inuito coli uolet, ne homo quidem. Atque adeo et Aegyptiis permissa est tam uanae superstitionis potestas

be unwilling to lose those who are so profitable and so dutiful to them as you are, if only that they might not be driven away from you one day by the Christians, if it were in their power to speak falsely in the presence of a Christian who wished to prove the truth to you.

CHAP. XXIV. All this confession of theirs, by which they deny that they are gods and by which they answer that there is no other God but one, whose servants we are, is sufficient to refute the charge of signal violation of the Roman religion. For if there are assuredly no gods, then assuredly there is no religion either; and if there is no religion, because assuredly there are no gods either, assuredly neither can we be charged with violation of religion. On the contrary the reproach has recoiled on yourselves, who, worshipping a lie, commit the crime of real irreligion against the truth, not only by neglecting the true worship of the true God, but by attacking it also. Now, even though it were allowed that those gods exist, do you not coincide with the general opinion that there is one higher and more powerful, a sort of head of the universe of absolute power and sovereignty? For very many also distribute the divine power in such a way as to wish the rule of the highest lordship to be in the hands of one, while his functions are in the hands of many, as Plato describes the great Jupiter in heaven, attended by a host alike of gods and of daemons, and held it thus to be right that the procurators and prefects and governors (in general) should be alike respected[1]. And yet what crime is committed by him who applies both his exertions and his hope rather to the winning of favour with Caesar, and does not allow the name God, just as he would not allow the name Emperor in the case of any leading man, since it is judged a capital offence both to use and to listen to the use of the name for any one but Caesar? Let one worship God, another Jupiter; let one hold out suppliant hands to the sky, another to the altar of Fides; let one, if such is your opinion, count the clouds while he prays, another the panels of the ceiling; let one dedicate to his God his own life, another the life of a goat. Beware, too, lest this also should be combined with the charge of irreligion, the taking away of the liberty of worship and the forbidding of the choice of a god, so that I should be prevented from worshipping him whom I will, but should be compelled to worship (another) against my will. No being, not even a man, will desire to be worshipped by an unwilling person; and yet even the Egyptians were allowed the power of such a foolish superstition, for the deification of

[1] Joining to previous sentence, as grammar requires.

auibus et bestiis consecrandis et capite damnandis qui aliquem huiusmodi deum occiderit. Unicuique etiam prouinciae et ciuitati suus deus est, ut Syriae Astartes, ut Arabiae Dusares, ut Noricis Belenus, ut Africae Caelestis, ut Mauritaniae reguli sui. Romanas, ut opinor, prouincias edidi, nec tamen Romanos deos earum, quia Romae non magis coluntur quam qui per ipsam quoque Italiam municipali consecratione censentur: Casiniensium Deluentinus, Narniensium Visidianus, Asculanorum Ancharia, Volsiniensium Nortia, Ocriculanorum Valentia, Sutrinorum Hostia; Faliscorum in honorem Patris Curis et accepit cognomen Iuno. Sed nos soli arcemur a religionis proprietate. Laedimus Romanos nec Romani habemur qui non Romanorum deum colimus. Bene quod omnium deus est, cuius uelimus aut nolimus omnes sumus. Sed apud nos quoduis colere ius est praeter deum uerum, quasi non hic magis omnium sit deus cuius omnes sumus.

25. Satis quidem mihi uideor probasse de falsa et uera diuinitate, cum demonstraui quemadmodum probatio consistat, non modo disputationibus, nec argumentationibus, sed ipsorum etiam testimoniis quos deos creditis, ut nihil iam ad hanc causam sit retractandum. Quoniam tamen Romani nominis proprie mentio occurrit, non omittam congressionem, quam prouocat illa praesumptio dicentium Romanos pro merito religiositatis diligentissimae in tantum sublimitatis elatos, ut orbem occuparint, et adeo deos esse, ut praeter ceteros floreant qui illis officium praeter ceteros faciant. Scilicet ista merces a Romanis deis pro gratia expensa est. Sterculus et Mutunus et Larentina prouexit imperium. Peregrinos enim deos non putem extraneae genti magis fautum uoluisse quam suae, et patrium solum, in quo nati, adulti, nobilitati sepultique sunt, transfretanis dedisse. Viderit Cybele, si urbem Romanam ut memoriam Troiani generis adamauit, uernaculi sui scilicet aduersus Achiuorum arma protecti, si ad ultores transire prospexit, quos sciebat Graeciam Phrygiae debellatricem subacturos. Itaque maiestatis suae in urbem conlatae grande documentum nostra etiam aetate proposuit, cum Marco Aurelio

birds and beasts, and the condemnation to death of any one who had killed a god of this sort. Each province also and city-state has its own god, as Syria has Astartes, as Arabia Dusares, as the Norici have Belenus, as Africa has Caelestis, Mauretania its own chieftains. It is a list of Roman provinces that I have given, I think, and yet their gods are not Roman, because they are not more worshipped at Rome than those who throughout Italy itself also are ranked as gods from municipal consecration: Deluentinus of Casinum, Visidianus of Narnia, Ancharia of Asculum, Nortia of Volsinii, Valentia of Ocriculum, Hostia of Sutrium, Juno of the Falisci, who also received the surname (Curritis) in honour of Father Curis. But we alone are debarred from a religion of our own. We offend the Romans and are not considered Romans because we do not worship the god of the Romans. It is well that there is a God of all, to whom willy nilly we all belong. But among you it is lawful to worship anything except the true God, as if He to whom we all belong were not rather the God of all.

Chap. XXV. I think I have now given sufficient proof about true and false divinity, since I have shown how the proof holds together, not only by discussions or reasonings, but also by the evidence of those very beings whom you believe to be gods, so that nothing now needs to be revised for the present purpose. Since, however, a special reference has been made to the Roman name, I will not pass over the controversy, provoked by the prejudiced assertion that the Romans owing to their scrupulous piety have been raised to such a height of glory, as to have gained dominion over the world, and to have proved the existence of their gods by the fact that those flourish beyond all others who beyond all others are mindful of their duty to them. This reward was paid, forsooth, by the Roman gods in gratitude. The extension of the empire was due to Sterculus and Mutunus and Larentina! For I could not suppose that foreign gods wished more favour shown to a foreign race than to their own, and gave the land of their fathers, in which they were born, grew up, were ennobled and were buried, to those from across the sea. Let Cybele see to it, if she learned to love the city of Rome as the memorial of the Trojan race, her own native race forsooth, which she had guarded against the arms of the Greeks, if she had the forethought to desert to the avengers, who, she knew, would subdue Greece, the vanquisher of Phrygia. Therefore even in our time she has exhibited a signal proof of honour conferred on Rome, when on the removal of Marcus Aurelius from the conduct of

apud Sirmium reipublicae exempto die sexto decimo Kalendarum Aprilium archigallus ille sanctissimus die nono Kalendarum earundem, quo sanguinem inpurum lacertos quoque castrando libabat, pro salute imperatoris Marci iam intercepti solita aeque imperia mandauit. O nuntios tardos! o somniculosa diplomata! quorum uitio excessum imperatoris non ante Cybele cognouit, ne deam talem riderent Christiani. Sed non statim et Iupiter Cretam suam Romanis fascibus concuti sineret, oblitus antrum illud Idaeum et aera Corybantia et iocundissimum illic nutricis suae odorem. Nonne omni Capitolio tumulum illum suum praeposuisset, ut ea potius orbi terrae praecelleret quae cineres Iouis texit? Vellet Iuno Punicam urbem posthabita Samo dilectam ab Aeneadarum gente deleri? Quod sciam

hic illius arma,
Hic currus fuit, hoc regnum dea gentibus esse,
Si qua fata sinant, iam tum tenditque fouetque.

Misera illa coniunx Iouis et soror aduersus fata non ualuit! Plane

Fato stat Iupiter ipse.

Nec tantum tamen honoris fatis Romani dicauerunt dedentibus sibi Carthaginem aduersus destinatum uotumque Iunonis quantum prostitutissimae lupae Larentinae. Plures deos uestros regnasse certum est. Igitur si conferendi imperii tenent potestatem, cum ipsi regnarent, a quibus acceperant eam gratiam? Quem coluerat Saturnus et Iupiter? Aliquem, opinor, Sterculum. Sed postea Romani cum indigenis suis, etiam si qui non regnauerunt? Tamen regnabantur ab aliis nondum cultoribus suis, ut qui nondum dei habebantur. Ergo aliorum est regnum dare, quia regnabatur multo ante quam isti dei inciderentur. Sed quam uanum est fastigium Romani nominis religiositatis meritis deputare, cum post imperium siue adhuc regnum religio profecerit. Age iam, rebus religio profecerit? Nam etsi a Numa concepta est curiositas superstitiosa, nondum tamen aut simulacris aut templis res diuina apud Romanos constabat. Frugi religio et pauperes ritus et nulla Capitolia

public affairs, by death, at Sirmium on the seventeenth of March, that most holy high-priest (of Cybele) on the twenty-fourth of that same March, on which he made a libation of impure blood, mutilating his arms also, none the less issued the usual orders for the safety of the emperor Marcus, though his life was already ended. Oh slothful messengers! Oh sleepy despatches! whose fault it was that Cybele had no earlier news of the emperor's demise, so as to prevent the ridicule of such a goddess by the Christians. But even Jupiter would not immediately have allowed his own Crete to be upset by the Roman fasces, forgetting the Idaean cave and the Corybantic cymbals and the pleasing odour of his nurse there. Would he not have preferred his own grave there to any Capitol, so that the land which covered the ashes of Jupiter should rather rule over the world? Would Juno have wished that the Carthaginian city, 'which she loved next to Samos,' should be destroyed by the race of the sons of Aeneas (above all others)? To the best of my knowledge:

> 'Here stood her chariot: here, if Heav'n were kind,
> The seat of awful empire she design'd.'

The unhappy wife and sister of Jupiter could not prevail against the fates! It is evident 'Jupiter himself depends on destiny.' Yet the Romans have not offered so much honour to the fates which gave up Carthage to them against the will and prayer of Juno, as they have to the common whore Larentina. It is certain that a number of your gods were kings. Therefore, if they have the power of conferring rule, from whom had they received it, when they themselves reigned? Whom had Saturn and Jupiter worshipped? Some Sterculus, I suppose. But what did the Romans do later with their native gods, even if some did not reign? Yet the country was ruled by others, not yet their worshippers, seeing they were not yet regarded as gods. Consequently it is the prerogative of others to confer a kingdom, because kingly rule existed much earlier than these gods had their names engraved. But how foolish it is to attribute the glory of the Roman name to the deserts of piety, when your religion has developed since the time of the Empire or even since the time of the kingdom! Come now, has the growth of the state led to the advance of piety? No: for although Numa first formulated superstitious curiosity, nevertheless it was not till later that the divine element among the Romans consisted either of images or of temples: piety was frugal and the ceremonies were inexpensive, and there was no Capitol striving to reach the sky, but only improvised altars made of turf, and vessels which were still of common

certantia ad caelum, sed temeraria de cespite altaria, et uasa adhuc Samia, et nidor ex illis, et deus ipse nusquam. Nondum enim tunc ingenia Graecorum atque Tuscorum fingendis simulacris urbem inundauerant. Ergo non ante religiosi Romani quam magni, ideoque non ob hoc magni, quia religiosi. Atquin quomodo ob religionem magni, quibus magnitudo de inreligiositate prouenit? Ni fallor enim, omne regnum uel imperium bellis quaeritur et uictoriis propagatur. Porro bella et uictoriae captis et euersis plurimum urbibus constant. Id negotium sine deorum iniuria non est. Eaedem strages moenium et templorum, pares caedes ciuium et sacerdotum, nec dissimiles rapinae sacrarum diuitiarum et profanarum. Tot igitur sacrilegia Romanorum quot tropaea, tot de deis quot de gentibus triumphi, tot manubiae quot manent adhuc simulacra captiuorum deorum. Et ab hostibus ergo suis sustinent adorari et illis imperium sine fine decernunt quorum magis iniurias quam adolationes remunerasse debuerant. Sed qui nihil sentiunt tam impune laeduntur quam frustra coluntur. Certe non potest fidei conuenire, ut religionis meritis excreuisse uideantur qui, ut suggessimus, religionem aut laedendo creuerunt aut crescendo laeserunt. Etiam illi quorum regna conflata sunt in imperii Romani summam, cum ea amitterent, sine religionibus non fuerunt.

26. Videte igitur, ne ille regna dispenset cuius est et orbis qui regnatur et homo ipse qui regnat, ne ille uices dominationum ipsis temporibus in saeculo ordinarit qui ante omne tempus fuit et saeculum corpus temporum fecit, ne ille ciuitates extollat aut deprimat sub quo fuit sine ciuitatibus aliquando gens hominum. Quid erratis? prior est quibusdam deis suis siluestris Roma, ante regnauit quam tantum ambitum Capitolii extrueret. Regnauerant et Babylonii ante Pontifices, et Medi ante Quindecimuiros, et Aegyptii ante Salios, et Assyrii ante Lupercos, et Amazones ante Virgines Vestales. Postremo si Romanae

pottery, and the sacrificial odour from them, and the god himself nowhere to be seen. For at that time the talents of the Greeks and Etruscans had not yet flooded the capital to execute commissions for statues. Consequently the Romans were not religious before they were great, and therefore their religion was not the cause of their greatness. Further, how can it be on account of religion that they are great, seeing it was the want of religion which made them great? For unless I am mistaken, every kingdom or empire is gained by wars and extended by victories. Again, wars and victories are generally at the cost of the capture and destruction of cities. That business cannot be carried out without harm to gods. Walls and temples are involved in common ruin, citizens and priests are alike slaughtered, and there is no difference in the plundering of sacred and profane wealth. Therefore the sacrilegious acts of the Romans are as many in number as their trophies; they have triumphed as often over gods as over nations, their spoils in war are no more numerous than the images of captive gods that still remain. They therefore endure to be worshipped even by their enemies, and they decree an empire without end to those whose injuries, rather than their acts of worship[1], they should have repaid. But those who are without feeling, it is as harmless to injure, as it is idle to worship. Certainly it is beyond belief, that those should have progressed on account of their religious merits, who, as we have hinted, have either grown by injury done to religion or have inflicted injury on religion by their growth. Even those whose kingdoms have been combined to make up the sum of the Roman Empire, were not without religions at the time when they lost their kingdoms.

Chap. XXVI. See therefore, whether it is not he who regulates kingdoms, whose is both the world that is ruled, and the man himself that rules; whether it is not he that fixed the alternations of power at their actual dates in the world's history, who was before all time and made the history of the world the embodiment of time and seasons; whether it is not he who raises or crushes states, under whom the race of men existed at one time without states. Why are you led astray? Rome in her rude state is older than certain of its gods, it ruled before it raised such a wide circuit as the Capitol. The Babylonians too had reigned before the pontiffs, and the Medes before the Quindecimviri, and the Egyptians before the Salii, the Assyrians before the Luperci, the Amazons before the Vestal Virgins. Finally, if it is the religious rites of Rome that confer kingdoms,

[1] Spell correctly *adulationes.*

religiones regna praestant, nunquam retro Iudaea regnasset despectrix communium istarum diuinitatum, cuius et deum uictimis et templum donis et gentem foederibus aliquamdiu Romani honorastis, numquam dominaturi eius, si deo non deliquisset ultimo in Christum.

27. Satis haec aduersus intentationem laesae diuinitatis, quo non uideamur laedere eam quam ostendimus non esse. Igitur prouocati ad sacrificandum obstruimus gradum pro fide conscientiae nostrae, qua certi sumus ad quos ista perueniant officia sub imaginum prostitutione et humanorum nominum consecratione. Sed quidam dementiam existimant, quod, cum possimus et sacrificare in praesenti et inlaesi abire manente apud animum proposito, obstinationem saluti praeferamus. Datis scilicet consilium, quo uobis abutamur; sed agnoscimus, unde talia suggerantur, quis totum hoc agitet, et quomodo nunc astutia suadendi nunc duritia saeuiendi ad constantiam nostram deiciendam operetur. Ille scilicet spiritus daemoniacae et angelicae paraturae, qui noster ob diuortium aemulus et ob dei gratiam inuidus de mentibus uestris aduersus nos proeliatur occulta inspiratione modulatis et subornatis ad omnem quam in primordio exorsi sumus et iudicandi peruersitatem et saeuiendi iniquitatem. Nam licet subiecta sit nobis tota uis daemonum et eiusmodi spirituum, ut nequam tamen et serui metu nonnunquam contumaciam miscent, et laedere gestiunt quos alias uerentur. Odium enim etiam timor spirat. Praeterquam et desperata condicio eorum ex praedamnatione solatium reputat fruendae interim malignitatis de poenae mora. Et tamen adprehensi subiguntur et condicioni suae succidunt, et quos de longinquo oppugnant, de proximo obsecrant. Itaque cum uice rebellantium ergastulorum siue carcerum uel metallorum uel hoc genus poenalis seruitutis erumpunt aduersus nos, in quorum potestate sunt, certi et inpares se esse et hoc magis perditos, ingratis resistimus ut aequales et repugnamus perseuerantes in eo quod oppugnant et illos nunquam magis detriumphamus quam cum pro fidei obstinatione damnamur.

Judea would never have reigned in the past, since she disdained all these ordinary divinities; and yet ye Romans for some time honoured her God with victims, her temple with gifts and her people with treaties, nor would you ever have ruled over her, if she had not sinned against God and finally against Christ also.

Chap. XXVII. This meets the charge of injury to your gods, since we cannot be supposed to injure that which we have shown to be non-existent. Therefore when we are challenged to sacrifice, we make a stand against it on the strength of our conscience, whereby we are assured who those are to whom these services extend under the profanation of images and the deification of human names. But some think it madness that, when we might both sacrifice at the time and depart uninjured, while retaining our own private opinions, we should prefer stubbornness to safety. Forsooth you are giving us advice how to take advantage of you; but we recognise the source of such hints, who it is that prompts all this, and how at one time by cunning advice, at another by harsh cruelty, he is working towards the overthrow of our firmness. Assuredly that spirit of daemonic[1] and angelic nature, which, being our enemy on account of its separation (from God) and being jealous on account of the favour of God (shown to us), wars against us from the fortress of your minds, which by a secret influence are regulated and equipped for all that perversity of judgment and unfairness of cruelty which we began to describe at the outset. For although all the power of daemons and spirits of that kind is subject to us, yet like worthless people and slaves they sometimes mingle obstinacy with fear, and are eager to injure those, of whom at another time they are afraid: for even fear breathes hatred. Furthermore their hopeless state, arising from the fact of their being foredoomed, gleans from the delay of punishment the solace of enjoying their evil disposition during the meantime. And yet when they are seized they are subdued and yield to their fate, and those whom they attack afar off, they supplicate when they are nigh. Therefore when, like rebellious slaves, confined in barracoons or prisons or mines or quarries or suffering any other penal servitude of this kind, they break out against us in whose power they are, knowing full well both that they are ill-matched and that they are thus all the more undone, we resist them against our will as equals and attack them in return, continuing in that which they attack, and we never triumph over them more than when we are condemned for the persistence of our belief.

[1] Read *daemonicae*, probably the only form known to Tertullian.

28. Quoniam autem facile iniquum uideretur liberos homines inuitos urgeri ad sacrificandum (nam et alias diuinae rei faciundae libens animus indicitur), certe ineptum existimaretur, si quis ab alio cogeretur ad honorem deorum, quos ultro sui causa placare deberet, ne prae manu esset iure libertatis dicere: Nolo mihi Iouem propitium; tu quis es? Me conueniat Ianus iratus ex qua uelit fronte; quid tibi mecum est? Formati estis ab isdem utique spiritibus, uti nos pro salute imperatoris sacrificare cogatis, et inposita est tam uobis necessitas cogendi quam nobis obligatio periclitandi. Ventum est igitur ad secundum titulum laesae augustioris maiestatis, siquidem maiore formidine et callidiore timiditate Caesarem obseruatis quam ipsum de Olympo Iouem. Et merito, si sciatis. Quis enim ex uiuentibus quilibet non mortuo potior? Sed nec hoc uos ratione facitis potius quam respectu praesentaneae potestatis: adeo et in isto inreligiosi erga deos uestros deprehendemini, cum plus timoris humano dominio dicatis. Citius denique apud uos per omnes deos quam per unum genium Caesaris peieratur.

29. Constet igitur prius, si isti, quibus sacrificatur, salutem imperatoribus uel cuilibet homini inpertire possunt, et ita nos crimini maiestatis addicite, si angeli aut daemones substantia pessimi spiritus beneficium aliquod operantur, si perditi conseruant, si damnati liberant, si denique, quod in conscientia uestra est, mortui uiuos tuentur. Nam utique suas primo statuas et imagines et aedes tuerentur, quae, ut opinor, Caesarum milites excubiis salua praestant. Puto autem, eae ipsae materiae de metallis Caesarum ueniunt, et tota templa de nutu Caesaris constant. Multi denique dei habuerunt Caesarem iratum. Facit ad causam, si et propitium, cum illis aliquid liberalitatis aut priuilegii confert. Ita qui sunt in Caesaris potestate, cuius et toti sunt, quomodo habebunt salutem Caesaris in potestate, ut eam praestare posse uideantur, quam facilius ipsi a Caesare consequantur? Ideo ergo committimus in maiestatem impera-

Chap. XXVIII. Since however it might easily seem unjust that free men should be forced against their will to perform sacrifice (for at other times also a willing mind is enjoined for the performance of religious duty), it would assuredly be thought absurd, if any one were compelled by another to pay respect to gods, whom he was bound to appease for his own sake without any urging, lest it might at once be open to him to say by the right of freedom: 'I do not want Jupiter to be propitious to me: who are you?' 'Let Janus meet me with angry looks from any face he likes: what business have you with me?' You were framed of course by the same spirits to compel us to sacrifice for the safety of the emperor, and the necessity for coercion was as much imposed on you as the obligation of incurring danger by refusal was imposed on us. We have come then to the second charge, that of injury done to a more sacred majesty, since you worship the Caesar with greater dread and more calculating fear than you do Olympian Jove himself. And deservedly, if you only knew. For who among the living is not better than any dead man you like? But even this is not done by you from reason, so much as from regard to authority which acts on the spur of the moment; to such a degree in this matter also will you be found irreligious towards your gods, in showing more dread of human power. Finally among you a man will sooner commit perjury by all the gods than by the one genius of Caesar.

Chap. XXIX. First then let it be agreed, whether these to whom sacrifice is offered can confer safety on the emperors or on any other man, and then charge us with treason, if angels or daemons, in essence most depraved, work any benefit, if the lost save, if those that are condemned acquit, if finally, the dead (such as ye know your gods to be) are guardians of the living. If so, they would first at all events guard their own statues and images and temples, which I believe the soldiers of the Caesars keep safe by night pickets. I think moreover that the very materials of these come from the mines of the Caesars, and that the erection of whole temples depends on the will of the Caesar. Further, many gods have experienced the wrath of Caesar. It supports my case, if they have also found him propitious, when he confers upon them some free gift or privilege. How then can they, who are in the power of the Caesar, and who entirely belong to him, have the safety of the Caesar in their power, so as to appear able to grant that (safety), which they themselves would more easily gain from the Caesar? Therefore it is that we offend against the majesty

toris, quia illos non subicimus rebus suis, quia non ludimus de officio salutis ipsorum qui eam non putamus in manibus esse plumbatis. Sed uos inreligiosi, qui eam quaeritis ubi non est, petitis a quibus dari non potest, praeterito eo in cuius est potestate. Insuper eos debellatis qui eam sciunt petere, qui etiam possunt impetrare, dum sciunt petere.

30. Nos enim pro salute imperatorum deum inuocamus aeternum, deum uerum, deum uiuum, quem et ipsi imperatores propitium sibi praeter ceteros malunt. Sciunt quis illis dederit imperium, sciunt, qua homines, quis et animam, sentiunt eum esse deum solum in cuius solius potestate sunt, a quo sint secundi, post quem primi, ante omnes et super omnes deos. Quidni? cum super omnes homines, qui utique uiuunt et mortuis antistant. Recogitant quousque uires imperii sui ualeant, et ita deum intellegunt; aduersus quem ualere non possunt, per eum ualere se cognoscunt. Caelum denique debellet imperator, caelum captiuum triumpho suo inuehat, caelo mittat excubias, caelo uectigalia imponat. Non potest. Ideo magnus est quia caelo minor est. Illius enim est ipse cuius et caelum est et omnis creatura. Inde est imperator unde et homo antequam imperator, inde potestas illi unde et spiritus. Illuc suspicientes Christiani manibus expansis, quia innocuis, capite nudo, quia non erubescimus, denique sine monitore, quia de pectore oramus, precantes sumus semper pro omnibus imperatoribus. Vitam illis prolixam, imperium securum, domum tutam, exercitus fortes, senatum fidelem, populum probum, orbem quietum, quaecunque hominis et Caesaris uota sunt, haec ab alio orare non possum quam a quo me scio consecuturum, quoniam et ipse est qui solus praestat et ego sum cui impetrare debetur, famulus eius, qui eum solus obseruo, qui propter disciplinam eius occidor, qui ei offero opimam et maiorem hostiam quam ipse mandauit, orationem de carne pudica, de anima innocenti, de spiritu sancto profectam, non grana thuris unius assis, Arabicae arboris lacrimas, nec duas meri guttas, nec sanguinem reprobi bouis mori optantis, et post omnia inquinamenta etiam

of the emperors, because we do not subject them to their own creatures, because we do not make sport of the duty of (praying for) their safety, since we do not think that it lies in hands soldered with lead. But you are the irreligious people, who seek it where it is not, ask it of those who cannot give it, passing over him in whose power it is. Furthermore you persecute those who know how to ask it, who can also obtain it, since they know how to ask.

Chap. XXX. For we invoke on behalf of the safety of the emperors a God who is everlasting, a God who is real, a God who is living, whom even the emperors themselves prefer should be propitious to them beyond all others. They know who gave them empire, they know, as human beings, who gave them life also, they feel that he is the only God, in whose power alone they are, to whom they are second, after whom they are first, before all and above all gods. Why not? since they are above all men, who of course are alive and take precedence of the dead. They reflect how far the strength of their empire extends, and thus they understand God; they recognise that they are strong through him, against whom they have no strength. Let the emperor then subdue heaven, let him lead heaven captive in his triumph, let him set his watch, let him impose his tribute on heaven. He cannot; he is great for the reason that he is only less than heaven. For he himself belongs to Him whose are both heaven and all created things. He derives his position of emperor from the same source from which he derived his humanity before he became emperor. He gets his power from the source from which he gets his breath. Thither the Christians look up, with hands spread out because innocent, with head uncovered, because we are not ashamed, finally without a prompter, because we pray from the heart. We pray always for all the emperors, that they may have a long life, a safe rule, a family free from danger, courageous armies, a faithful senate, loyal subjects, a peaceful world, all that a man and a Caesar pray for. These things I cannot pray for from any one else than from him from whom I know I shall get them, since he himself alone can give them, and I am he to whom the obtaining is due, his slave, who alone worship him, who on account of his teaching am put to death, who offer him a rich and greater victim than he himself commanded, prayer arising from a pure body, from an innocent soul, from the Holy Spirit, not grains of incense costing a penny, the tears of an Arabian tree, nor two drops of unmixed wine, nor the blood of an unsound ox, anxious for death, and after all these stains a conscience

conscientiam spurcam: ut mirer, cum hostiae probantur penes uos a uitiosissimis sacerdotibus, cum cuiuis praecordia potius uictimarum quam ipsorum sacrificantium examinantur. Sic itaque nos ad deum expansos ungulae fodiant, cruces suspendant, ignes lambant, gladii guttura detruncent, bestiae insiliant: paratus est ad omne supplicium ipse habitus orantis Christiani. Hoc agite, boni praesides, extorquete animam deo supplicantem pro imperatore. Hoc erit crimen, ubi ueritas dei et deuotio est.

31. Adolati nunc sumus imperatori et mentiti uota quae diximus, ad euadendam scilicet uim. Plane proficit ista fallacia. Admittitis nos enim probare quodcunque defendimus. Qui ergo putaueris nihil nos de salute Caesarum curare, inspice dei uoces, litteras nostras, quas neque ipsi supprimimus et plerique casus ad extraneos transferunt. Scitote ex illis praeceptum esse nobis ad redundantiam benignitatis etiam pro inimicis deum orare et persecutoribus nostris bona precari. Qui magis inimici et persecutores Christianorum quam de quorum maiestate conuenimur in crimen? Sed etiam nominatim atque manifeste, Orate, inquit, pro regibus et pro principibus et potestatibus, ut omnia tranquilla sint uobis. Cum enim concutitur imperium, concussis etiam ceteris membris eius utique et nos, licet extranei a turbis aestimemur, in aliquo loco casus inuenimur.

32. Est et alia maior necessitas nobis orandi pro imperatoribus, etiam pro omni statu imperii rebusque Romanis, qui uim maximam uniuerso orbi imminentem ipsamque clausulam saeculi acerbitates horrendas comminantem Romani imperii commeatu scimus retardari. Itaque nolumus experiri, et dum precamur differri, Romanae diuturnitati fauemus. Sed et iuramus, sicut non per genios Caesarum, ita per salutem eorum, quae est augustior omnibus geniis. Nescitis genios daemonas dici et inde diminutiua uoce daemonia? Nos iudicium dei suspicimus in imperatoribus, qui gentibus illos praefecit. Id in eis scimus esse quod deus uoluit, ideoque et saluum uolumus esse quod deus uoluit et pro magno id iuramento habemus.

also that is foul; so that I wonder, when the victims are tested among you by vicious priests, when any one judges the hearts rather of the victims than of the sacrificers themselves. Therefore let hooks thus dig into us while our hands are spread out to God, let crosses suspend us, let fires play about us, let swords behead us, let wild-beasts leap upon us; the very attitude of the praying Christian is ready for every kind of capital punishment. This is your duty, ye excellent governors, wrench out a soul that is praying to God for the emperor. The crime will be found there, where is the truth of a God and piety to him.

CHAP. XXXI. Now they tell us that we have fawned upon the emperor and uttered lying prayers, of course with the view of escaping violence. Clearly this deception is to our benefit; for you allow that we make good whatever point we defend. You therefore who have thought that we care nothing for the safety of the Caesars, look into our Scripture, the oracles of God, which we ourselves do not conceal and many accidents bring into the hands of strangers. Know from these that we are taught to the point of superfluity of kindness even to pray God for our enemies and to entreat benefits for our persecutors. Who are to a greater extent enemies and persecutors of the Christians than those about whose majesty we are arraigned? But even by name and clearly: 'Pray,' says (the scripture), 'for kings and for chiefs and for powers, that all things may be at peace for you.' For when the empire is shattered, and when the other parts of it also are shattered, we too of course, although the crowd considers us foreigners, are involved in some quarter of the disaster.

CHAP. XXXII. There is also another greater necessity for us to pray for emperors, even for the whole state of the Empire and the fortunes of Rome, since we know that the great force which is threatening the whole world and the end itself of world-history which threatens terrible afflictions is being kept back by the respite granted to the Roman empire. Therefore we are unwilling to experience this, and while we pray for its postponement we are favouring the long continuance of Rome. But we also swear, though not by the genii of the Caesars, yet by their safety, which is more divine than any genii. Do you not know that genii is a name for *daemones* and for *daemonia*, a diminutive word derived from it? We look up to the judgment of God in the emperors, for He set them over the races of the world. We know that that is in them which God willed, and so we wish that also to be safe which God willed, and we consider

Ceterum daemonas, id est genios, adiurare consueuimus, ut illos de hominibus exigamus, non deierare, ut eis honorem diuinitatis conferamus.

33. Sed quid ego amplius de religione atque pietate Christiana in imperatore? quem necesse est suspiciamus ut eum quem dominus noster elegit, ut merito dixerim: Noster est magis Caesar, a nostro deo constitutus. Itaque ut meo plus ego illi operor in salutem, siquidem non solum ab eo postulo eam qui potest praestare, aut quod talis postulo qui merear impetrare, sed etiam quod temperans maiestatem Caesaris infra deum magis illum commendo deo, cui soli subicio. Subicio autem cui non adaequo. Non enim deum imperatorem dicam, uel quia mentiri nescio, uel quia illum deridere non audeo, uel quia nec ipse se deum uolet dici. Si homo sit, interest homini deo cedere. Satis habeat appellari imperator. Grande et hoc nomen est, quod a deo traditur. Negat illum imperatorem qui deum dicit; nisi homo sit non est imperator. Hominem se esse etiam triumphans in illo sublimissimo curru admonetur. Suggeritur enim ei a tergo: Respice post te! Hominem te memento! Et utique hoc magis gaudet tanta se gloria coruscare, ut illi admonitio condicionis suae sit necessaria. Minor erat, si tunc deus diceretur, quia non uere diceretur. Maior est qui reuocatur, ne se deum existimet.

34. Augustus, imperii formator, ne dominum quidem dici se uolebat; et hoc enim dei est cognomen. Dicam plane imperatorem dominum, sed more communi, sed quando non cogor, ut dominum dei uice dicam. Ceterum liber sum illi. Dominus enim meus unus est, deus omnipotens aeternus, idem qui et ipsius. Qui pater patriae est, quomodo dominus est? Sed et gratius est nomen pietatis quam potestatis. Etiam familiae magis patres quam domini uocantur. Tanto abest ut imperator deus debeat dici, quod non potest credi non modo

that to be a great oath. But demons, that is genii, we have been accustomed to adjure, in order to drive them out of men, not to swear by them, in order to confer the honour of divinity upon them.

Chap. XXXIII. But why should I say more about the religious attitude and the loyalty of the Christians towards the emperor? We are bound to look up to him as the one whom our Lord has chosen. I should be justified in saying: the Caesar is more ours (than yours), as having been appointed by our God. Accordingly, as he is mine, I work more for his safety, since I not only ask it from Him who is able to grant it, or because I who ask it am such an one as deserves to obtain it, but also because by lowering the greatness of the Caesar as compared with that of God, I commend him the more to God, to whom alone I subject him. But I subject him to Him, to whom I do not make him equal. For I will not call the emperor God, whether it is because I am unable to lie, or whether I do not dare to mock him, or because he himself will not even wish to be called God. If he be a man, it is man's interest to yield to God; let him be content to be styled emperor. This also is a great name, bestowed upon him by God. He who calls the Caesar God, denies him to be what he is, an emperor; unless he be a man, he is not emperor. That he is a man he is reminded even when he is riding in his triumphal chariot. For a hint comes to him from the rear: 'Look behind you! Remember that you are a man!' And surely he is all the more carried away by the thought of his resplendent glory, that a reminder of his lot is necessary to him. He were smaller (than he is), if he were then called God, because he would not be truly so called. He who is recalled to himself lest he should think himself God, is the greater.

Chap. XXXIV. Augustus, the creator of the empire, refused even to be called Lord: for this too is a surname of God. Of course I shall call the emperor lord, but with the usual spelling, and only when I am not forced to call him Lord with a capital, in place of God. But I am free so far as he is concerned: for I have but one Master, the almighty and eternal God, the same who is also his God. How can he who is father of his native city be its lord? Moreover, the name which suggests affectionate care is more pleasing than that which suggests authority. Even of a household men are called fathers rather than lords. So far is it from being a right of the emperor to be called God, which is incredible [except] by a flattery that

turpissima sed et perniciosa adolatione. Tamquam si habens imperatorem alterum appelles, nonne maximam et inexorabilem offensam contrahes eius quem habuisti, etiam ipsi timendam quem appellasti? Esto religiosus in deum, qui uis illum propitium imperatori. Desine alium deum credere atque ita et hunc deum dicere cui deo opus est. Si non de mendacio erubescit adulatio eiusmodi hominem deum appellans, timeat saltim de infausto. Maledictum est ante apotheosin deum Caesarem nuncupari.

35. Propterea igitur publici hostes Christiani, quia imperatoribus neque uanos neque mentientes neque temerarios honores dicant, quia uerae religionis homines etiam sollemnia eorum conscientia potius quam lasciuia celebrant. Grande uidelicet officium focos et toros in publicum educere, uicatim epulari, ciuitatem tabernae habitu abolefacere, uino lutum cogere, cateruatim cursitare ad iniurias, ad inpudentias, ad libidinis inlecebras. Sicine exprimitur publicum gaudium per dedecus publicum? Haecine solemnes dies principum decent, quae alios dies non decent? Qui obseruant disciplinam de Caesaris respectu, hi eam propter Caesarem deserunt, et malorum morum licentia pietas erit, occasio luxuriae religio deputabitur? O nos merito damnandos! Cur enim uota et gaudia Caesarum casti et sobrii et probi expungimus? cur die laeto non laureis postes obumbramus nec lucernis diem infringimus? Honesta res est solemnitate publica exigente induere domui tuae habitum alicuius noui lupanaris. Velim tamen in hac quoque religione secundae maiestatis, de qua in secundum sacrilegium conuenimur Christiani non celebrando uobiscum solemnia Caesarum quo more celebrari nec modestia nec uerecundia nec pudicitia permittunt, sed occasio uoluptatis magis quam digna ratio persuasit, fidem et ueritatem uestram demonstrare, ne forte et isthic deteriores Christianis deprehendantur qui nos nolunt Romanos haberi, sed ut hostes principum Romanorum. Ipsos

is not merely base but baneful. It is just as if having an emperor, you were to call another [by the same title]: will you not bring upon you the great and implacable hatred of the existing emperor, a hatred to be dreaded even by him to whom you have given the title? Be loyal towards God, you who wish Him to be propitious to the emperor. Cease to believe in another god, and so to describe him as a god, who has need of God. If such a flattery, calling a man a god, is not ashamed of the falsehood, let it at least be afraid of the ill-luck of so doing. It is the opposite of a blessing to call the Caesar god before his deification.

Chap. XXXV. On these grounds then the Christians are regarded as public enemies, because they do not offer to the emperors either useless or lying or ill-advised honours, because men of true religion celebrate even their regular festivals conscientiously rather than wantonly. It is forsooth an important duty, to bring out hearths and couches into the public street, to feast parish by parish, to efface the city under the guise of a tavern, to produce mud by wine[1], to run about in crowds for the committal of outrages, insults and incitements to lust. Is it thus that public joy is expressed by public disgrace? Does such behaviour become the festal days of emperors, which befits not other days? Shall those who observe order out of regard to Caesar, abandon it on account of Caesar, and shall loyalty grant a licence for immorality, and religion give occasion to indulgence? Verily we deserve to be condemned! For why do we, chaste, sober and honest people, fulfil the vows and joys of the Caesars? Why on the festal day do we not cover over our door-posts with bay garlands or violate the day with lamps? Is it an honourable practice, when a public festival demands, to clothe your house with the garb of some new brothel? I should like however to show your faithfulness and truth in the matter of this cult also of a second majesty, with reference to which we Christians are arraigned on a second charge of sacrilege, because we do not celebrate in your company the annual festivals of the Caesars in a manner in which neither sense of fitness nor modesty nor chastity allows them to be celebrated, but which the opportunity of pleasure rather than any worthy reason has prompted, lest perchance here too those who are unwilling that we should be considered Romans, but only as enemies of the Roman emperors, should be found worse than the Christians. I appeal to the citizens of Rome themselves, to the native

[1] J. B. M. reading *uinum luto*, 'thicken your mud with wine.'

Quirites, ipsam uernaculam septem collium plebem conuenio, an alicui Caesari suo parcat illa lingua Romana? Testis est Tiberis, et scholae bestiarum. Iam si pectoribus ad translucendum quandam specularem materiam natura obduxisset, cuius non praecordia insculpta apparent noui ac noui Caesaris scenam congiario diuidundo praesidentis? Etiam illa hora qua adclamant:

De nostris annis augeat tibi Iupiter annos!

Haec Christianus tam enuntiare non nouit quam de nouo Caesare optare. Sed uulgus, inquis. Ut uulgus, tamen Romani, nec ulli magis depostulatores Christianorum quam uulgus. Plane ceteri ordines pro auctoritate religiosi ex fide. Nihil hosticum de ipso senatu, de equite, de castris, de palatiis ipsis spirat. Unde Cassii et Nigri et Albini? unde qui inter duas laurus obsident Caesarem? unde qui faucibus eius exprimendis palaestricam exercent? unde qui armati palatium inrumpunt, omnibus tot Sigeriis atque Partheniis audaciores? De Romanis, nisi fallor, id est de non Christianis. Atque adeo omnes illi sub ipsa usque impietatis eruptione et sacra faciebant pro salute imperatoris et genium eius deierabant, alii foris alii intus, et utique publicorum hostium nomen Christianis dabant. Sed et qui nunc scelestarum partium socii aut plausores cotidie reuelantur, post uindemiam parricidarum racematio superstes, quam recentissimis et ramosissimis laureis postes praestruebant, quam elatissimis et clarissimis lucernis uestibula nebulabant, quam cultissimis et superbissimis toris forum sibi diuidebant, non ut gaudia publica celebrarent, sed ut uota propria iam ediscerent in aliena sollemnitate et exemplum atque imaginem spei suae inaugurarent, nomen principis in corde mutantes. Eadem officia dependunt et qui astrologos et aruspices et augures et magos de Caesarum capite consultant, quas artes ut ab angelis desertoribus proditas et a deo interdictas ne suis quidem causis adhibent Christiani. Cui autem opus est per-

populace of the seven hills. I charge you to say whether that Roman tongue spares any Caesar belonging to it[1]. Witness not the Tiber only but the training-schools of wild beasts as well. Again, if nature had drawn over our breasts some transparent substance through which the light could pass, who is there whose heart would not appear to be engraved with the likeness of one new Caesar after another, presiding over the distribution of a dole? Even at that hour at which they shout:

'May Jupiter add years to thine from ours!'

These words the Christian is just as unable to utter as he is to pray for this in the case of a new Caesar. But it is the mob, you say. Though it is the mob, yet they are Romans, and none demand the Christians for punishment more eagerly than the mob. No doubt the other classes of society, in proportion to their authority, are religious from conviction: nothing hostile breathes from the senate itself, from the knights, from the army, from the palace itself. Whence come the Cassii and the Nigri and the Albini? Whence those who besiege Caesar between the two bay-trees? Whence those who practise gymnastic exercises in order to strangle him? Whence those who rush armed into the palace, more reckless than all the number of the Sigerii and Parthenii? All come from among the Romans, if I am not mistaken, that is, from among the pagans. And yet all these traitors up to the actual outbreak of disloyalty were both sacrificing for the safety of the emperor and swearing by his genius, some out of doors, others within, and of course they were giving the name of public enemies to the Christians. But even those who are now daily revealed as the accomplices or abettors of criminal factions, the gleanings that still remain after the vintage of parricides, how they decked out their doors with the freshest and most luxuriant bay-trees, how they darkened their porches with the tallest and brightest lamps, with what elegant and splendid couches did they divide up the market-place among themselves, not that they might celebrate the joy of the people, but that they might now learn private prayers in a ceremony connected with another and might install both a copy and a picture of their hope, while changing mentally the name of the emperor! These same dutiful services are paid also by those who consult astrologers and soothsayers and augurs and magicians about the lives of the Caesars, which arts, as having been introduced by the apostate angels and forbidden by God, the Christians never employ even for their own concerns. Moreover, who needs to

[1] not?.

scrutari super Caesaris salute, nisi a quo aliquid aduersus illam cogitatur uel optatur, aut post illam speratur et sustinetur? Non enim ea mente de caris consulitur qua de dominis. Aliter curiosa est sollicitudo sanguinis, aliter seruitutis.

36. Si haec ita sunt, ut hostes deprehendantur qui Romani uocabantur, cur nos, qui hostes existimamur, Romani negamur? Non possumus et Romani non esse et hostes esse, cum hostes reperiantur qui Romani habebantur. Adeo pietas et religio et fides imperatoribus debita non in huiusmodi officiis consistit quibus et hostilitas magis ad uelamentum sui potest fungi, sed in his moribus quibus diuinitas imperat tam uere quam circa omnes necesse habent exhiberi. Neque enim haec opera bonae mentis solis imperatoribus debentur a nobis. Nullum bonum sub exceptione personarum administramus, quia nobis praestamus, qui non ab homine aut laudis aut praemii expensum captamus, sed a deo exactore et remuneratore indifferentis benignitatis. Idem sumus imperatoribus qui et uicinis nostris. Male enim uelle, male facere, male dicere, male cogitare de quoquam ex aequo uetamur. Quodcunque non licet in imperatorem, id nec in quemquam: quod in neminem, eo forsitan magis nec in ipsum qui per deum tantus est.

37. Si inimicos, ut supra diximus, iubemur diligere, quem habemus odisse? Item si laesi uicem referre prohibemur, ne de facto pares simus, quem possumus laedere? Nam de isto ipsi recognoscite. Quotiens enim in Christianos desaeuitis, partim animis propriis, partim legibus obsequentes? Quotiens etiam praeteritis uobis suo iure nos inimicum uulgus inuadit lapidibus et incendiis? Ipsis Bacchanalium furiis nec mortuis parcunt Christianis, quin illos de requie sepulturae, de asylo quodam mortis, iam alios, iam nec totos auellant, dissecent, distrahant. Quid tamen de tam conspiratis umquam denotatis,

inquire into the safety of Caesar, except he who meditates or desires something against it, or who hopes and waits for something to follow after? For one does not consult about friends with the same feeling as about masters. The solicitude of kinship is of a different nature from that of servitude.

Chap. XXXVI. If this is so, that those are found out to be enemies who were called Romans, why are we, who are but thought to be enemies, denied to be Romans? We cannot be at the same time non-Romans and enemies, since those who were considered Romans are found to be enemies. The fact is that the loyalty and worship and faith that are due to the emperors do not consist in services such as even enmity can perform rather as a cloak to itself, but in those habits, which are as truly demanded by the godhead as they must be shown towards mankind in general. For indeed it is not to the emperors alone that such services of good will are due from us. No benefit that we accomplish pays any regard to special individuals, because it is to ourselves that we perform it, and we do not snatch at payment from a man either of praise or of reward, but from God, who exacts and rewards impartial kindness. We are the same to the emperors as we are to our neighbours. For we are forbidden to wish evil, to do evil, to say evil, to think evil, about any one without distinction. Whatsoever is not permitted against the emperor, neither is it permitted against any one; and what is permitted against no one, is perhaps all the more forbidden against him whom God has made so great.

Chap. XXXVII. If we are ordered, as we said above, to love our enemies, whom have we left to hate? Likewise, if when injured we are forbidden to retaliate, lest by our action we should put ourselves on the level of our enemy, whom can we injure? For consider this matter yourselves. How often do you rage fiercely against the Christians in obedience partly to your own feelings, partly to the laws? How often also, passing you over, does the hostile rabble of its own right attack us with stones and fires? With the very rage of Bacchanals, they do not spare Christians even when they are dead, nay from the rest of the tomb, from the sort of refuge that death affords, they would drag them away, cut them up, tear them to pieces, when they are already decomposed, when already not even entire. Yet what instance did you ever note[1] of our retaliation

[1] Reading *denotastis*.

de tam animatis ad mortem usque pro iniuria repensatum, quando uel una nox pauculis faculis largiter ultionis posset operari, si malum malo dispungi penes nos liceret? Sed absit ut aut igni humano uindicetur diuina secta aut doleat pati in quo probatur. Si enim et hostes exertos, non tantum uindices occultos agere uellemus, deesset nobis uis numerorum et copiarum? Plures nimirum Mauri et Marcomanni ipsique Parthi, uel quantaecunque unius tamen loci et suorum finium gentes quam totius orbis. Hesterni sumus, et uestra omnia impleuimus, urbes, insulas, castella, municipia, conciliabula, castra ipsa, tribus, decurias, palatium, senatum, forum: sola uobis reliquimus templa. Cui bello non idonei, non prompti fuissemus, etiam inpares copiis, qui tam libenter trucidamur, si non apud istam disciplinam magis occidi liceret quam occidere? Potuimus et inermes nec rebelles, sed tantummodo discordes solius diuortii inuidia aduersus uos dimicasse. Si enim tanta uis hominum in aliquem orbis remoti sinum abrupissemus a uobis, suffudisset utique dominationem uestram tot qualiumcumque ciuium amissio, immo etiam et ipsa destitutione punisset. Procul dubio expauissetis ad solitudinem uestram, ad silentium rerum et stuporem quendam quasi mortui orbis. Quaesissetis quibus imperaretis. Plures hostes quam ciues uobis remansissent. Nunc enim pauciores hostes habetis prae multitudine Christianorum, paene omnium ciuitatium paene omnes ciues Christianos habendo. Sed hostes maluistis uocare generis humani potius quam erroris humani. Quis autem uos ab illis occultis et usquequaque uastantibus mentes et ualitudines uestras hostibus raperet, a daemoniorum incursibus dico, quae de uobis sine praemio, sine mercede depellimus? Suffecisset hoc solum nostrae ultioni, quod uacua exinde possessio inmundis spiritibus pateret. Porro nec tanti praesidii conpensationem cogitantes non modo non molestum uobis genus, uerum etiam

upon you for injuries inflicted on us who are so united and so stout-hearted even to death, when even a single night with a few little torches could effect abundant vengeance, if it were allowable amongst us to wipe out wrong with wrong? But a truce to the thought that a sect actuated by the spirit of God should either be avenged by the torch of man or should shrink from suffering that by which it is tested. For if we wished to play the part also of declared enemies, and not merely that of secret avengers, should we lack the force of numbers and of troops? The Moors and the Marcomani and the Parthians themselves, or any races of whatsoever size, which are limited nevertheless to one place and to their own territory, are I suppose more numerous than we are whose region is coextensive with the whole world! We are but of yesterday, yet we have filled all that is yours, cities, islands, fortified towns, country towns, centres of meeting, even camps, tribes, classes of public attendants, the palace, the senate, the forum; we have left you only your temples. For what war should we not have been fitted and ready, even if we had been unequal in forces, we, who are so willing to be butchered, if it had not been more permissible according to this teaching of ours to be slain than to slay? We could also, unarmed, and not rebellious but merely disagreeing, have fought against you, using only the weapon of the ill-will which our separation creates. For if such a mass of men as we are had broken off from you and gone to some distant corner of the world, the loss of so many citizens, of whatever sort, would assuredly have shamed your rule, nay rather would have punished it even by the very fact of its desertion. Without doubt you would have been panic-stricken at your solitude, at the silence of business and the death-like stupefaction of the world; you would have had to seek subjects to rule over. More enemies would have remained to you than subjects. Now as a matter of fact you have fewer enemies, in consequence of the multitude of the Christians, owing to the fact that nearly all the citizens you have in nearly all the cities are Christian. But you have chosen to call them enemies of the human race rather than of human error. Moreover, who would have snatched you from those secret enemies that everywhere play havoc with your minds and health? I mean from the incursions of spirits, which we drive from you, without reward and without price. This alone would have been sufficient for our vengeance, that an empty tenement was then left open to unclean spirits. Further, without even a thought of the compensation required for so great a protection, you have preferred to consider as enemies a class which is not only harmless to you, but even

necessarium hostes iudicare maluistis, quia sumus plane, non generis humani tamen, sed potius erroris.

38. Proinde nec paulo lenius inter licitas factiones sectam istam deputari oportebat, a qua nihil tale committitur quale de inlicitis factionibus timeri solet? Nisi fallor enim, prohibendarum factionum causa de prouidentia constat modestiae publicae, ne ciuitas in partes scinderetur, quae res facile comitia, concilia, curias, contiones, spectacula etiam aemulis studiorum conpulsationibus inquietaret, cum iam et in quaestu habere coepissent uenalem et mercenariam homines uiolentiae suae operam. At enim nobis ab omni gloriae et dignitatis ardore frigentibus nulla est necessitas coetus, nec ulla magis res aliena quam publica. Unam omnium rempublicam agnoscimus, mundum. Aeque spectaculis uestris in tantum renuntiamus in quantum originibus eorum, quas scimus de superstitione conceptas, cum et ipsis rebus, de quibus transiguntur, praetersumus. Nihil est nobis dictu, uisu, auditu cum insania circi, cum inpudicitia theatri, cum atrocitate arenae, cum xysti uanitate. Quo uos offendimus, si alias praesumimus uoluptates? Si oblectari nouisse nolumus, nostra iniuria est, si forte, non uestra. Sed reprobamus quae placent uobis. Nec uos nostra delectant. Sed licuit Epicureis aliquam decernere uoluptatis ueritatem, id est animi aequitatem, et ampla negotia Christianae.

39. Edam iam nunc ego ipse negotia Christianae factionis, ut qui mala refutauerim, bona ostendam. Corpus sumus de conscientia religionis et disciplinae unitate et spei foedere. Coimus in coetum et congregationem, ut ad deum quasi manu facta precationibus ambiamus orantes. Haec uis deo grata est. Oramus etiam pro imperatoribus, pro ministris eorum et potestatibus, pro statu saeculi, pro rerum quiete, pro mora finis. Coimus ad litterarum diuinarum commemorationem, si quid praesentium temporum qualitas aut praemonere cogit aut recognoscere. Certe fidem sanctis uocibus pascimus, spem

necessary, people that palpably are enemies, yet not indeed of the human race, but rather of error.

Chap. XXXVIII. Furthermore was not a somewhat gentler attitude also more fitting, namely the enrolment of this sect among the legal associations, seeing it commits no such crime as is wont to be feared from illegal associations? For unless I am mistaken, the reason for preventing associations derives its force from forethought as to public order, lest the state should be split up into factions. This result would easily disturb the elections, the assemblies, the senates, public meetings, even the shows, by the rival clash of partisanship, since even already men had begun to regard their deeds of violence as for sale and hire, and a means of earning a livelihood. But to us who are dead to all the zeal for fame and position, there is no need for meeting together, nor is there anything more foreign to us than affairs of state. We recognise the world as one commonwealth belonging to all. Your shows likewise we shun just as much as their beginnings, which we know arise from superstition, since we pass by even the events themselves which are their occasion. We have nothing to say, or see or hear, in connexion with the madness of the circus, the immodesty of the theatre, the ferocity of the arena, the vain-glory of the gymnasium. In what do we offend you, if we prefer different pleasures? If we refuse to be taught how to enjoy pleasure, it is our loss, perhaps, not yours. But we reject what pleases you, nor do our pleasures delight you. But the Epicureans were permitted to maintain some reality of pleasure, that is calm of mind, and for the Christian's pleasure there are great tasks.

Chap. XXXIX. I will now at once proclaim the actual[1] occupations of the Christian association, in order that I who rejected the idea that they were evil may show that they are good. We are a corporation with a common knowledge of religion, a common rule of life, and an union of hope. We come together for meeting and assembly, in order that having formed a band as it were to come before God we may encompass him with prayers. This violence is pleasing to God. We pray also for the emperors, for their ministers and those in authority, for the state of the world, for general quiet, for the postponement of the end. We meet to call one another to remembrance of the Scripture, if the aspect of affairs requires us either to be forewarned or to be reminded of anything. In any case we feed

[1] *ipsa*, J. B. M. *ipse* cett.

erigimus, fiduciam figimus, disciplinam praeceptorum nihilominus inculcationibus densamus: ibidem etiam exhortationes, castigationes et censura diuina. Nam et iudicatur magno cum pondere, ut apud certos de dei conspectu, summumque futuri iudicii praeiudicium est, si quis ita deliquerit, ut a communicatione orationis et conuentus et omnis sancti commercii relegetur. Praesident probati quique seniores, honorem istum non pretio, sed testimonio adepti. Neque enim pretio ulla res dei constat. Etiam si quod arcae genus est, non de honoraria summa quasi redemptae religionis congregatur. Modicam unusquisque stipem menstrua die, uel cum uelit, et si modo uelit, et si modo possit, apponit: nam nemo compellitur, sed sponte confert. Haec quasi deposita pietatis sunt. Nam inde non epulis nec potaculis nec ingratiis uoratrinis dispensatur, sed egenis alendis humandisque et pueris ac puellis re ac parentibus destitutis, iamque domesticis senibus, item naufragis, et si qui in metallis, et si qui in insulis uel in custodiis, dumtaxat ex causa dei sectae, alumni confessionis suae fiunt. Sed eiusmodi uel maxime dilectionis operatio notam nobis inurit penes quosdam. Vide, inquiunt, ut inuicem se diligant; ipsi enim inuicem oderunt: et ut pro alterutro mori sint parati: ipsi enim ad occidendum alterutrum paratiores erunt. Sed et quod fratres nos uocamus, non alias, opinor, insaniunt quam quod apud ipsos omne sanguinis nomen de affectione simulatum est. Fratres autem etiam uestri sumus, iure naturae matris unius, etsi uos parum homines, quia mali fratres. At quanto dignius fratres et dicuntur et habentur qui unum patrem deum agnouerunt, qui unum spiritum biberint sanctitatis, qui de uno utero ignorantiae eiusdem ad unam lucem expauerint ueritatis. Sed eo fortasse minus legitimi existimamur, quia nulla de nostra fraternitate tragoedia exclamat, uel quia ex substantia familiari fratres sumus, quae penes uos fere dirimit fraternitatem. Itaque qui animo animaque miscemur, nihil de rei communicatione dubitamus. Omnia indiscreta sunt apud nos praeter uxores. In isto loco consortium soluimus in quo solo ceteri homines consortium exercent, qui non amicorum solummodo matrimonia

our belief on holy words, we raise our hope, we strengthen our confidence, we clinch the teaching none the less by driving home precepts. There too are pronounced exhortations, corrections and godly judgments. For our judgment too is delivered with great weight, as among those who are sure that they are acting under the eye of God, and there is the greatest anticipation of the future judgment, if any one has so sinned, as to be banished from the communion of prayer and assembly and all holy fellowship. We are governed by the most approved elders, who have obtained this office not by purchase, but on testimony; for indeed nothing of God is obtainable by money. Even if we have a kind of treasury, this is not filled up from a sense of obligation, as of a hired religion. Each member adds a small sum once a month, or when he pleases, and only if he is willing and able; for no one is forced, but each contributes of his own free will. These are the deposits as it were made by devotion. For that sum is disbursed not on banquets nor drinking bouts nor unwillingly on eating-houses, but on the supporting and burying of the poor, and on boys and girls deprived of property and parents, and on aged servants of the house, also on shipwrecked persons, and any, who are in the mines or on islands or in prisons, provided it be for the cause of God's religion, who thus become pensioners of their confession. But the working of that kind of love most of all brands us with a mark of blame in the eyes of some. 'See,' they say, 'how they love one another'; for they themselves hate one another; 'and how they are ready to die for one another'; for they will be more ready to kill one another. But also they rage at us for calling one another brethren, for no other reason, I suppose, than because among themselves every name indicating blood relationship is assumed from affection. But we are also your brothers, by right of nature, the one mother, although you are little deserving of the name men, because you are evil brothers. But how much more worthily are those both called and considered brethren who have recognised one Father, namely God, who have imbibed one spirit of holiness, who from one womb of the same ignorance have quaked before one light of truth! But we are perhaps regarded as less legitimate for the reason that no tragedy proclaims aloud our brotherliness, or because we are brothers as the result of household possessions, which among you generally break up the relationship of brothers. And so we, who are united in heart and soul, have no hesitation about sharing a thing. Among us all things are common except wives. In this matter alone we dissolve partnership, in which alone all other men practise partnership, who not only use the wives

usurpant, sed et sua amicis patientissime subministrant: ex illa, credo, maiorum et sapientissimorum disciplina, Graeci Socratis et Romani Catonis, qui uxores suas amicis communicauerunt, quas in matrimonium duxerant liberorum causa et alibi creandorum, nescio quidem an inuitas. Quid enim de castitate curarent, quam mariti tam facile donauerant? O sapientiae Atticae, o Romanae grauitatis exemplum: lenones philosophus et censor! Quid ergo mirum, si tanta caritas conuiuatur? Nam et coenulas nostras praeterquam sceleris infames ut prodigas quoque suggillatis. De nobis scilicet Diogenis dictum est: Megarenses obsonant quasi crastina die morituri, aedificant uero quasi numquam morituri. Sed stipulam quis in alieno oculo facilius perspicit quam in suo trabem. Tot tribubus et curiis et decuriis ructantibus acescit aër: Saliis coenaturis creditor erit necessarius: Herculanarum decimarum et pollunctorum sumptus tabularii supputabunt: Apaturiis, Dionysiis, mysteriis Atticis cocorum dilectus indicitur: ad fumum coenae Sarapiacae sparteoli excitabuntur. De solo triclinio Christianorum retractatur. Coena nostra de nomine rationem sui ostendit. Id uocatur quod dilectio penes Graecos. Quantiscumque sumptibus constet, lucrum est pietatis nomine facere sumptum, siquidem inopes quosque refrigerio isto iuuamus, non qua penes uos parasiti adfectant ad gloriam famulandae libertatis sub auctoramento uentris inter contumelias saginandi, sed qua penes deum maior est contemplatio mediocrium. Si honesta causa est conuiuii, reliquum ordinem disciplinae de causa aestimate. Quod sit de religionis officio, nihil uilitatis, nihil inmodestiae admittit. Non prius discumbitur quam oratio ad deum praegustetur. Editur quantum esurientes capiunt, bibitur quantum pudicis utile est. Ita saturantur, ut qui meminerint etiam per noctem adorandum deum sibi esse: ita fabulantur, ut qui sciant dominum audire. Post aquam manualem et lumina, ut quisque de scripturis sanctis uel de proprio ingenio potest, prouocatur in medium deo canere: hinc probatur quomodo biberit. Aeque oratio conuiuium dirimit. Inde disceditur non in cateruas caesionum nec in classes discursationum nec in eruptiones lasciuiarum,

of friends, but also most patiently supply their own to their friends, in accordance, I believe, with the well-known teaching of ancient sages and philosophers, the Greek Socrates and the Roman Cato, who shared their wives with friends, those wives whom they had married, perhaps with their consent, to bear children in other households also. For what care could they have for chastity, which their husbands had given away so lightly! What an example of Athenian philosophy, of Roman seriousness! A philosopher and a censor both acting the part of procurers! What wonder is it then that so great affection is outraged! For you also revile our little dinners as extravagant also in addition to being disgraced by crime. It was about us of course that Diogenes uttered his saying: 'The Megarians buy food as if they were to die to-morrow, but they build as if they were never to die!' But one sees a mote more easily in another's eye than a beam in one's own. The air becomes sour with so many tribes, parishes and guilds belching. The Salii will need a money-lender when they are to dine: the public accountants will sum up the expenditure of the tithes and offerings to Hercules: at the Apaturia, the Dionysia, and the Attic mysteries a levy of cooks is proclaimed, at the smoke of a Sarapis banquet the firemen will be aroused. It is only the dining-room of the Christians that is objected to. Our dinner shows its significance by its name: it is called by the name which amongst the Greeks means affection. Whatsoever be its cost, it is a gain to incur expense in the name of religion, since by this refreshment we help those who are in need, not in the way that among you parasites eagerly strive for the glory of enslaving their freedom at the price of a belly that has to be filled amid insults: but in the way that with God greater regard is paid to them of low degree. If the purpose of our entertainment is honourable, form your estimate of the remainder of our rule from its motive. As it is concerned with our religious duty, it allows nothing base, nothing disorderly. We do not recline until we have first partaken of prayer to God: only so much is eaten as to satisfy hunger: only as much is drunk as becomes the chaste. Appetite is satisfied so far as is consistent with the remembrance that they have to worship God even in the night: they talk as those who know that the Master is listening. After the bringing in of water for washing the hands, and lights, each is invited to sing publicly to God as he is able from his knowledge of holy scripture or from his own mind: thus it can be tested how he has drunk. In like manner prayer closes the feast. The meeting then breaks up, not into riotous bands for assaulting the innocent, nor into disturbances in the streets, nor for outbursts of

sed ad eandem curam modestiae et pudicitiae, ut qui non tam coenam coenauerint quam disciplinam. Haec coitio Christianorum merito sane inlicita, si inlicitis par, merito damnanda, si quis de ea queritur eo titulo quo de factionibus querela est. In cuius perniciem aliquando conuenimus? Hoc sumus congregati quod et dispersi, hoc uniuersi quod et singuli, neminem laedentes, neminem contristantes. Cum probi, cum boni coeunt, cum pii, cum casti congregantur, non est factio dicenda, sed curia.

40. At e contrario illis nomen factionis accommodandum est qui in odium bonorum et proborum conspirant, qui aduersum sanguinem innocentium conclamant, praetexentes sane ad odii defensionem illam quoque uanitatem, quod existiment omnis publicae cladis, omnis popularis incommodi Christianos esse in causam. Si Tiberis ascendit in moenia, si Nilus non ascendit in arua, si caelum stetit, si terra mouit, si fames, si lues, statim Christianos ad leonem! adclamatur. Tantos ad unum? Oro uos, ante Tiberium, id est ante Christi aduentum, quantae clades orbem et urbes ceciderunt? Legimus Hieran, Anaphen et Delon et Rhodon et Co insulas multis cum milibus hominum pessum abisse. Memorat et Plato maiorem Asiae uel Africae terram Atlantico mari ereptam. Sed et mare Corinthium terrae motus ebibit, et uis undarum Lucaniam abscisam in Siciliae nomen relegauit. Haec utique non sine iniuria incolentium accidere potuerunt. Ubi uero tunc, non dicam deorum uestrorum contemptores Christiani, sed ipsi dei uestri, cum totum orbem cataclysmus aboleuit, uel, ut Plato putauit, campestre solummodo? Posteriores enim illos clade diluuii contestantur ipsae urbes in quibus nati mortuique sunt, etiam quas condiderunt: neque enim alias hodiernum manerent nisi et ipsae posthumae cladis illius. Nondum Iudaeum ab Aegypto examen Palaestina susceperat nec iam illic Christianae sectae origo consederat, cum regiones adfines eius Sodoma et Gomorra igneus imber exussit. Olet adhuc incendio terra, et si qua

lasciviousness, but to the same care for orderliness and modesty, as those who have fed, not so much on meats as on instruction in righteousness. This meeting together of Christians would have been deservedly illegal, I admit, if it were the same as the illegal, deservedly to be condemned, if any one complains of it with the same accusation as is made about clubs. For whose ruin have we ever met? We are the same when gathered together as we are when scattered, we are as a body what we are also as individuals, injuring no one, paining no one. When worthy, when good men come together, when the pious and pure are gathered together, it is to be called not a club, but a council chamber.

CHAP. XL. But on the contrary the name of faction is to be applied to those who conspire to foment hatred against good and worthy persons, who cry aloud against the blood of the innocent, pretending forsooth in defence of their hatred that foolish excuse besides, that the Christians are to blame for every public disaster, every misfortune that happens to the people. If the Tiber rises to the walls, if the Nile does not rise to the fields, if the sky is rainless, if there is an earthquake, a famine, a plague, immediately the cry arises, 'The Christians to the lion!' What! so many to one (lion)? I pray you tell me: before the time of Tiberius, that is, before the coming of Christ, how many disasters smote the world or particular cities? We read that Hiera, Anaphe and Delos and Rhodes and Ophiusa[1] were ruined with many thousands of persons. Plato also mentions that a land greater than Asia or Africa was snatched away by the Atlantic Ocean. But an earthquake also drained the Corinthian sea, and the force of the waves cut off Lucania and banished it to bear the name of Sicily. These things of course could not happen without harm to the inhabitants. But where were at that time, I will not say, the Christians who think nothing of your gods, but your gods themselves, when a flood overwhelmed the whole world, or, as Plato supposed, only the plains? For, that your gods are later than the catastrophe of the flood, is attested by the very cities in which they were born and died, or even which they founded; for otherwise they would not have remained to-day, if they had not been later than that disaster. Palestine had not yet received its Jewish swarm from Egypt, nor yet had the beginning of the Christian sect settled there, when a shower of fire burnt up the neighbouring regions of Sodom and Gomorrha.

[1] Reading *Ophiusam* for *Co insulas.*

illic arborum poma, conantur oculis tenus, ceterum contacta cinerescunt. Sed nec Tuscia iam tunc atque Campania de Christianis querebantur, cum Vulsinios de caelo, Pompeios de suo monte perfudit ignis. Nemo adhuc Romae deum uerum adorabat cum Hannibal apud Cannas per Romanos anulos caedes suas modio metiebatur. Omnes dei uestri ab omnibus colebantur, cum ipsum Capitolium Senones occupauerant. Et bene quod, si quid aduersi urbibus accidit, eaedem clades templorum quae et moenium fuerunt, ut iam hoc reuincam non ab eis euenire, quia et ipsis euenit. Semper humana gens male de deo meruit. Primo quidem ut inofficiosa eius, quem cum intellegeret ex parte, non requisiuit, sed et alios insuper sibi commentata quos coleret: dehinc quod non inquirendo innocentiae magistrum et nocentiae iudicem et exactorem omnibus uitiis et criminibus inoleuit. Ceterum si requisisset, sequebatur, ut cognosceret requisitum et recognitum obseruaret et obseruatum propitium magis experiretur quam iratum. Eundem igitur nunc quoque scire debet iratum quem et retro semper, priusquam Christiani nominarentur. Cuius bonis utebatur ante editis quam sibi deos fingeret, cur non ab eo etiam mala intellegat euenire cuius bona esse non sensit? Illius rea est cuius et ingrata. Et tamen si pristinas clades comparemus, leuiora nunc accidunt, ex quo Christianos a deo orbis accepit. Ex eo enim et innocentia saeculi iniquitates temperauit et deprecatores dei esse coeperunt. Denique cum ab imbribus aestiua hiberna suspendunt et annus in cura est, uos quidem cotidie pasti statimque pransuri, balneis et cauponiis et lupanaribus operantibus, aquilicia Ioui immolatis, nudipedalia populo denuntiatis, caelum apud Capitolium quaeritis, nubila de laquearibus exspectatis, auersi ab ipso et deo et caelo: nos uero ieiuniis aridi et omni continentia expressi, ab omni uitae fruge dilati, in sacco et cinere uolutantes inuidia caelum tun-

The land still smells of fire, and if any tree bears fruit there, it can only be looked at, but when touched it turns to ashes. But neither did Tuscany nor Campania even in those days complain about the Christians when fire from heaven flooded Vulsinii, and fire from its own mountain Pompeii. No one as yet worshipped the true God at Rome, when Hannibal by means of the Roman rings measured by bushel the extent of the slaughter he had inflicted at Cannae. All your gods were worshipped by all, when the Senones had seized the Capitol itself. And fortunately any misfortune that happened to cities involved temples in the same disasters as the city walls, which enables me now to prove that such disasters do not come from the gods, because they come upon themselves also. The human race has always deserved ill of God: in the first place indeed as neglecting its duty towards him, whom though it understood partly, it did not search out, but also devised for itself other deities besides to worship: in the second place because, by not seeking out the teacher of uprightness and judge and avenger of guilt, it has grown in all vices and crimes. But if it had sought him out, it would have followed that, when it had sought him, it might learn to know him, and when it recognised him it might worship him, and when it had worshipped him it might find him by experience to be propitious rather than wrathful. Therefore we ought now also to know that the same god is angry, as always in the past also, before Christians received their name. Seeing that it enjoyed his blessings, which were displayed before it fashioned gods for itself, why should it not understand that evils also come from him, to whom it was not conscious that the blessings belonged? It is guilty of that towards which it is also ungrateful. And yet if we were to compare the disasters of old, those of the present day are slighter, since God gave the Christians as his gift to the world. For from that time uprightness has moderated the injustices of the world and likewise men have begun to be intercessors with God. For example, when summer weather keeps the winter from rains, and the crops are a subject of anxiety, you to be sure, feeding daily and yet immediately ready to resume your meals, while the baths, the taverns and the brothels are busy, sacrifice offerings to Jupiter for rain, order the people to go for a season with bare feet, seek the heaven at the Capitol, and watch for clouds from its panelled roofs, turning away both from God himself and from heaven itself. But we, parched with fastings and pinched with every sort of self-restraint, separated from all bread necessary to life, wallowing in sackcloth and ashes, importune heaven with reproach, we

dimus, deum tangimus, et cum misericordiam extorserimus, Iupiter honoratur.

41. Vos igitur inportuni rebus humanis, uos rei publicorum incommodorum inlices semper, apud quos deus spernitur, statuae adorantur. Etenim credibilius haberi debet eum irasci qui neglegatur quam qui coluntur, aut nae illi iniquissimi, si propter Christianos etiam cultores suos laedunt, quos separare deberent a meritis Christianorum. Hoc, inquitis, et in deum uestrum repercutere est, si quod et ipse patiatur, propter profanos etiam suos cultores laedi. Admittite prius dispositiones eius, et non retorquebitis. Qui enim semel aeternum iudicium destinauit post saeculi finem, non praecipitat discretionem, quae est condicio iudicii, ante saeculi finem. Aequalis est interim super omne hominum genus et indulgens et increpans. Communia uoluit esse et commoda profanis et incommoda suis, ut pari consortio omnes et lenitatem eius et seueritatem experiremur. Quia haec ita didicimus apud ipsum, diligimus lenitatem, metuimus seueritatem, uos contra utramque despicitis: et sequitur ut omnes saeculi plagae nobis, si forte, in admonitionem, uobis in castigationem a deo obueniant. Atquin nos nullo modo laedimur: inprimis quia nihil nostra refert in hoc aeuo nisi de eo quam celeriter excedere, dehinc, quia si quid aduersi infligitur, uestris meritis deputatur. Sed etsi aliqua nos quoque praestringunt ut uobis cohaerentes, laetamur magis recognitione diuinarum praedicationum, confirmantium scilicet fiduciam et fidem spei nostrae. Sin uero ab eis quos colitis omnia uobis mala eueniunt nostri causa, quid colere perseueratis tam ingratos, tam iniustos, qui magis uos in dolore Christianorum iuuare et adserere debuerant, quos separare deberent a meritis Christianorum?

42. Sed alio quoque iniuriarum titulo postulamur, et infructuosi in negotiis dicimur. Quo pacto homines uobiscum degentes, eiusdem uictus, habitus, instructus, eiusdem ad uitam necessitatis? Neque enim Brachmanae aut Indorum

touch the heart of God, and when we have wrested mercy (from Him), Jupiter gets the honour.

Chap. XLI. You therefore are dangerous to human affairs, you are to blame for public misfortunes, drawing them always upon us, since you despise God and worship statues. For surely it is more likely that one who is neglected should get angry rather than those who are worshipped. Otherwise they are indeed most unfair, if on account of the Christians they injure their own worshippers also, whom they ought to keep unaffected by the deserts of the Christians. 'This,' you say, 'is to retort on your own god also, if he himself allows his own worshippers also to be injured on account of the profane.' Learn first his plans, and you will not then retort. For He who has once for all ordained an everlasting judgment after the end of the world, does not hasten the separation, which is a circumstance of the judgment, before the end of the world. Meanwhile he deals impartially with the whole human race, both as indulging and reproving; he wished that good and evil should be shared alike by his own servants and by the wicked, so that, by an equal partnership, all might have experience both of his gentleness and of his sternness. Because we have thus learnt these things in his own company, we love his gentleness and we fear his sternness, while you on the contrary despise both: and it follows that all the plagues of the world come from God on us, it may be, for warning, but on you for punishment. And yet we are not really injured at all, in the first place because we have no concern in this life except to depart from it as speedily as possible, in the second place because, if any misfortune is brought upon us, it is attributed to your deserts. But even if some troubles touch us also as being connected with you, we rejoice more in the recognition of the divine prophecies, which of course strengthen the assurance and confidence of our hope. But if it be the case that all these evils come upon you on our account from those whom you worship, why do you continue to worship beings so ungrateful and so unjust, whose duty it was rather to help and defend you in the suffering coming from the Christians, since it was their duty to keep you apart from the deserts of the Christians?

Chap. XLII. But we are arraigned also on a different charge of injuries inflicted, and we are said to be unprofitable in business matters. How can this be true of men who live with you, who enjoy the same food, have the same manner of life, and dress, the same requirements for life? For we are

gymnosophistae sumus, siluicolae et exules uitae. Meminimus gratiam debere nos deo, domino, creatori: nullum fructum operum eius repudiamus: plane temperamus, ne ultra modum aut perperam utamur. Itaque non sine foro, non sine macello, non sine balneis, tabernis, officinis, stabulis, nundinis uestris ceterisque commerciis cohabitamus in hoc saeculo. Nauigamus et nos uobiscum et militamus et rusticamur et mercatus proinde miscemus, artes, opera nostra publicamus usui uestro. Quomodo infructuosi uidemur negotiis uestris, cum quibus et de quibus uiuimus, non scio. Sed si caerimonias tuas non frequento, attamen et illa die homo sum. Non lauor diluculo Saturnalibus, ne et noctem et diem perdam, attamen lauor honesta hora et salubri, quae mihi et calorem et sanguinem seruet: rigere et pallere post lauacrum mortuus possum. Non in publico Liberalibus discumbo, quod bestiariis supremam coenantibus mos est, attamen ubi de copiis tuis coeno. Non emo capiti coronam. Quid tua interest, emptis nihilominus floribus quomodo utar? Puto gratius esse liberis et solutis et undique uagis. Sed etsi in coronam coactis, nos coronam naribus nouimus: uiderint qui per capillum odorantur. Spectaculis non conuenimus; quae tamen apud illos coetus uenditantur si desiderauero, liberius de propriis locis sumam. Thura plane non emimus. Si Arabiae queruntur, sciant Sabaei pluris et carioris suas merces Christianis sepeliendis profligari quam deis fumigandis. Certe, inquitis, templorum uectigalia cotidie decoquunt: stipes quotusquisque iam iactat? Non enim sufficimus et hominibus et deis uestris mendicantibus opem ferre, nec putamus aliis quam petentibus inpertiendum. Denique porrigat manum Iupiter et accipiat, cum interim plus nostra misericordia insumit uicatim quam uestra religio templatim. Sed cetera uectigalia gratias Christianis agent ex fide dependentibus debitum, qua alieno fraudando abstinemus, ut, si ineatur quantum uectigalibus pereat fraude et mendacio

neither Brahmins nor Indian gymnosophists, dwellers in the forests, and exiles from ordinary life. We remember the gratitude we owe to God our Lord and Creator: we reject no fruit of his works: though it is true we refrain from the excessive or wrong use of them. Consequently we cannot dwell together in the world, without the market-place, without the shambles, without your baths, shops, factories, taverns, fairs and other places of resort. We also sail with you and serve in the army and we till the ground and engage in trade as you do, we join our crafts, we lend our services to the public for your profit. How we can seem unprofitable to your business affairs, when we live with you and by you, I do not know. But if I do not frequent your rites, nevertheless even on your holiday I am a human being. I do not bathe at dawn on the days of the Saturnalia, lest I should lose both night and day: nevertheless I bathe at a proper and healthful hour, which will keep me warm and ruddy: I can be stiff and sallow enough after my last bath when dead. I do not recline at table in public at the Liberalia, as is the custom of those who contend with the beasts when partaking of the last meal of their lives: yet I dine anywhere[1] on your supplies. I do not buy a garland for my head. What difference does it make to you, how I employ flowers which are none the less purchased? I think they are more pleasing when free and unbound and trailing everywhere. But even if we have them combined into a garland, we know a garland by the nose: let those who have perfumed locks see to it. We do not meet together at the public shows: if nevertheless I want what is advertised at those meetings, I will take them more freely from their own places. We absolutely refrain from buying incense: if the Arabias complain, let the Sabaeans know that their wares are used in greater quantity and at greater cost for the burial of Christians than for the fumigating of gods. 'Exactly,' you say, 'the revenues of the temples are daily failing: how few people now cast in pieces of money!' Yes, for we are not able to bring help both to men and to your gods when they beg, nor do we think that we ought to share with others than those who ask. So, let Jupiter himself hold out his hand and receive his share, while meantime our pity spends more street by street than your religion does temple by temple. But your other revenues will give thanks to the Christians, who pay down what they owe, in accordance with the belief by which we abstain from appropriating what is another's, so that, if the question is raised how much is lost to the revenues through the dishonesty and lying of your returns, a calculation can easily

[1] *ubiubi.*

uestrarum professionum, facile ratio haberi possit, unius speciei querela conpensata pro commodo ceterarum rationum.

43. Plane confitebor, quinam, si forte, uere de sterilitate Christianorum conqueri possint. Primi erunt lenones, perductores, aquarioli, tum sicarii, uenenarii, magi, item aruspices, arioli, mathematici. His infructuosos esse magnus est fructus. Et tamen quodcunque dispendium est rei uestrae per hanc sectam, cum aliquo praesidio conpensari potest. Quanti habetis, non dico qui iam de uobis daemonia excutiant, non dico iam qui pro uobis quoque uero deo preces sternant, quia forte non creditis, sed a quibus nihil timere possitis?

44. At enim illud detrimentum reipublicae tam grande quam uerum nemo circumspicit, illam iniuriam ciuitatis nullus expendit, cum tot iusti impendimur, cum tot innocentes erogamur. Vestros enim iam contestamur actus, qui cotidie iudicandis custodiis praesidetis, qui sententiis elogia dispungitis. Tot a uobis nocentes uariis criminum elogiis recensentur: quis illic sicarius, quis manticularius, quis sacrilegus aut corruptor aut lauantium praedo, quis ex illis etiam Christianus adscribitur? aut cum Christiani suo titulo offeruntur, quis ex illis etiam talis quales tot nocentes? De uestris semper aestuat carcer, de uestris semper metalla suspirant, de uestris semper bestiae saginantur, de uestris semper munerarii noxiorum greges pascunt. Nemo illic Christianus, nisi plane tantum Christianus, aut si et aliud, iam non Christianus.

45. Nos ergo soli innocentes. Quid mirum, si necesse est? Enimuero necesse est. Innocentiam a deo edocti et perfecte eam nouimus, ut a perfecto magistro reuelatam, et fideliter custodimus, ut ab incontemptibili dispectore mandatam. Vobis autem humana aestimatio innocentiam tradidit, humana item dominatio imperauit; inde nec plenae nec adeo timendae estis

be made, as a complaint of one sort is balanced by the gain coming from all other calculations.

Chap. XLIII. I will readily confess what sort of people can perhaps truly complain of the unprofitableness of the Christians. First will come the procurers, the pimps, the bullies, then the assassins, the poisoners, the magicians: likewise the diviners, the soothsayers, the astrologers. To be unprofitable to these is great profit. And yet whatsoever loss there is to your property through this sect, can be balanced by some protection afforded by them. At what price do you value, I do not say, those who have the power to drive out evil spirits from you now—I do not now say those who offer their prayers for you also before the true God, because perhaps you do not believe in Him, but those from whom you have nothing to fear?

Chap. XLIV. But indeed there is a loss to the state, as great as it is real, to which no one pays any regard, an injury to the state of which no one takes account, when in our persons so many just men are wasted, so many innocent men are squandered away. For we now appeal to your records of proceedings, ye who daily preside over the trials of prisoners, who by passing sentences erase the charges out of the calendar. So many guilty persons are examined by you on various charges: what assassin there, what cutpurse, what sacrilegious person or debaucher or thief of the baths, is there among them who is also described as a Christian? Or, when Christians are prosecuted on their specific charge (i.e. the charge of Christianity), who among them is also such as so many criminals are? It is with your own people that the prisons are always steaming, your own people who make the mines re-echo to their sighs, the wild beasts are always stuffed with the same, and from among them too the givers of shows always find herds of criminals to feed. No one there is a Christian, unless he is nothing but a Christian: or, if he be also anything else, he is already no longer a Christian.

Chap. XLV. We alone therefore are free from guilt. What wonder, if it is inevitable? For indeed it is inevitable. Taught innocence by God, we both know it perfectly, seeing it has been revealed by a perfect teacher, and guard it faithfully, as committed to us by an observer who cannot be slighted. But to you man's judgment has handed down uprightness, man's tyranny, too, has commanded it: thence it is that you belong to a discipline which is neither complete nor really to be feared

disciplinae ad innocentiae ueritatem. Tanta est prudentia hominis ad demonstrandum bonum quanta auctoritas ad exigendum: tam illa falli facilis quam ista contemni. Atque adeo quid plenius, dicere: Non occides, an docere: Ne irascaris quidem? Quid perfectius, prohibere adulterium, an etiam ab oculorum solitaria concupiscentia arcere? Quid eruditius, de maleficio, an et de maliloquio interdicere? Quid instructius, iniuriam non permittere, an nec uicem iniuriae sinere? Dum tamen sciatis ipsas leges quoque uestras quae uidentur ad innocentiam pergere de diuina lege, ut antiquiore forma, mutuatas. Diximus iam de Moysi aetate. Sed quanta auctoritas legum humanarum, cum illas et euadere homini contingat et plerumque in admissis delitiscenti, et aliquando contemnere ex uoluntate uel necessitate delinquenti? Recogitate ea etiam pro breuitate supplicii cuiuslibet, non tamen ultra mortem remansuri. Sic et Epicurus omnem cruciatum doloremque depretiat, modicum quidem contemptibilem pronuntiando, magnum uero non diuturnum. Enimuero nos qui sub deo omnium speculatore dispungimur, quique aeternam ab eo poenam prouidemus merito, soli innocentiae occurrimus, et pro scientiae plenitudine et pro latebrarum difficultate et pro magnitudine cruciatus non diuturni, uerum sempiterni, eum timentes quem timere debebit et ipse qui timentes iudicat, deum, non proconsulem timentes.

46. Constitimus, ut opinor, aduersus omnium criminum intentationem, quae Christianorum sanguinem flagitat. Ostendimus totum statum nostrum, et quibus modis probare possimus ita esse sicut ostendimus, ex fide scilicet et antiquitate diuinarum litterarum, item ex confessione spiritualium potestatum. Qui nos reuincere audebit, non arte uerborum, sed eadem forma qua probationem constituimus, de ueritate? Sed dum unicuique manifestatur ueritas nostra, interim incredulitas, dum de bono sectae huius obducitur, quod usui iam et de commercio innotuit, non utique diuinum negotium existimat, sed magis philosophiae genus. Eadem, inquit, et philosophi monent atque profitentur,

in view of the reality of innocence. A man's knowledge for the pointing out of what is really good, is just as great as his authority for exacting it: the former is just as easily deceived as the latter is slighted. And further which is the more comprehensive, to say: 'Thou shalt do no murder,' or to teach: 'Do not even become angry'? What is more absolute, to forbid adultery, or even to bar man from the solitary desire of the eyes? Which shows a deeper experience, the prohibition from evil-doing, or the further prohibition from evil-speaking? Which shows better instruction, not to permit injury, or not even to allow retaliation for injury? Provided, however, you know that your very laws also, which seem to tend in the direction of uprightness, have borrowed their form from the divine law as the older pattern. We have spoken already about the age of Moses. But how little is the authority of human laws, since a man has a chance both to escape them, and very often to lie hid in his crimes, and sometimes to set them at nought, sinning involuntarily[1] or of necessity? Reflect also on them in view of the shortness of any punishment, which will not in any case last beyond death. So also Epicurus makes light of all torture and pain, by declaring indeed that if slight it is contemptible, while if great it will not last long. In very truth we who are examined before God who searches all, we who look forward to everlasting punishment from Him as our due, are the only ones who attain uprightness, both in view of the fullness of knowledge and in view of the difficulty of concealment and in view of the greatness of the torture, which is not lasting only but everlasting, fearing Him, whom even he himself who judges the fearful will have to fear, that is, fearing God, not the pro-consul.

Chap. XLVI. We have maintained our ground, I think, against the denunciation of all charges, which clamours for the blood of the Christians. We have shown our whole position, and in what ways we can prove it to be such as we have shown, by the trustworthiness, of course, and the antiquity of our sacred writings, and also from the confession of spiritual powers. Who will dare to refute us, not by skill in words, but by the same method, by which we established our proof, namely on the ground of truth? But while our truth is displayed to every man, meantime unbelief, confounded as it is by the goodness of this sect, which has now become known to experience, as well as from intercourse with it, does not of course regard it as a divine question, but rather as a kind of philosophy. Philosophers also,

[1] *inuoluntate.*

innocentiam, iustitiam, patientiam, sobrietatem, pudicitiam. Cur ergo quibus comparamur de disciplina, non proinde illis adaequamur ad licentiam impunitatemque disciplinae? uel cur et illi, ut pares nostri, non urgentur ad officia quae nos non obeuntes periclitamur? Quis enim philosophum sacrificare aut deierare aut lucernas meridie uanas proferre conpellit? Quinimmo et deos uestros palam destruunt et superstitiones uestras commentariis quoque accusant laudantibus uobis. Plerique etiam in principes latrant sustinentibus uobis, et facilius statuis et salariis remunerantur quam ad bestias pronuntiantur. Sed merito. Philosophi enim non Christiani cognominantur. Nomen hoc philosophorum daemonia non fugat. Quidni? cum secundum deos philosophi daemonas deputent. Socratis uox est: Si daemonium permittat. Idem et cum aliquid de ueritate sapiebat deos negans, Aesculapio tamen gallinaceum prosecari iam in fine iubebat, credo ob honorem patris eius, quia Socratem Apollo sapientissimum omnium cecinit. O Apollinem inconsideratum! Sapientiae testimonium reddidit ei uiro qui negabat deos esse. In quantum odium flagrat ueritas, in tantum qui eam ex fide praestat offendit: qui autem adulterat et adfectat, hoc maxime nomine gratiam pangit apud insectatores ueritatis. Quam inlusores et corruptores inimice philosophi adfectant ueritatem et adfectando corrumpunt, ut qui gloriam captant. Christiani et necessario appetunt et integre praestant, ut qui saluti suae curant. Adeo neque de scientia neque de disciplina, ut putatis, aequamur. Quid enim Thales ille princeps physicorum sciscitanti Croeso de diuinitate certum renuntiauit, commeatus deliberandi saepe frustratus? Deum quilibet opifex Christianus et inuenit et ostendit et exinde totum quod in deum quaeritur re quoque adsignat: licet Plato adfirmet factitatorem uniuersitatis neque inueniri facilem et inuentum enarrari in omnes difficilem. Ceterum si de pudicitia prouocemus, lego partem sententiae Atticae, in Socratem corruptorem adolescentium pronuntiatum.

they say, give the same advice and make the same professions, uprightness, justice, endurance, sobriety, chastity. Why then are we not similarly made equal to them in the freedom and impunity accorded to our teaching, if we are compared with them in teaching? Or why are they also as our equals not forced to perform duties, the non-performance of which by us results in our trial? For who forces a philosopher to sacrifice, or to swear, or to expose useless lamps at midday? Nay rather, they both openly demolish your gods and they even blame your superstitions in their writings, and you praise them for it. Very many of them even bark at the emperors, while you submit to it, and they are more readily rewarded with statues and salaries than sentenced to the wild-beasts. And deservedly; for they are surnamed philosophers not Christians. This name philosophers does not put daemons to flight. Why should it be otherwise, since philosophers consider that daemons come next after the gods? It is a saying of Socrates: 'If the daemon permit.' He also, when he showed something of true wisdom in denying the gods, yet just at the close of his life ordered a cock to be sacrificed to Aesculapius, I believe out of respect to his father, because Apollo declared Socrates the wisest of men. Oh ill-advised Apollo! He gave a testimonial for wisdom to that man who denied the existence of the gods. With whatsoever vehemence truth is hated[1], in that degree does he offend who sets it forth as the result of his belief; he however who adulterates, while pretending love for it, gains favour most of all on this account among the persecutors of the truth. Philosophers affect the truth by mockery and corruption with hostile intent, and by imitation corrupt it like those who snatch at praise, Christians both seek after the truth of necessity and display it in its purity, like those who care for their own salvation. So neither in knowledge nor in morality are we on a level, as you suppose. For what certainty was there in the reply which Thales, the first of natural philosophers, made to Croesus when he questioned him with regard to divinity, although he had often employed to no purpose the extension of time allowed him for deliberation? But any Christian labourer both finds and sets forth God and then ascribes to him in deed all that is sought for in God, although Plato asserts that the maker of the universe is not easily found and when found is with difficulty explained to the multitude. Moreover if we make our appeal on the point of chastity, I read that a part of the Athenian sentence was pronounced[2] against Socrates as a corrupter of youth.

[1] Read *odio*. [2] *pronuntiatam*.

Sexum nec femineum mutat Christianus. Noui et Phrynen meretricem Diogenis supra recumbentis ardori subantem, audio et quendam Speusippum de Platonis schola in adulterio perisse. Christianus uxori suae soli masculus nascitur. Democritus excaecando semetipsum, quod mulieres sine concupiscentia aspicere non posset et doleret si non esset potitus, incontinentiam emendatione profitetur. At Christianus saluis oculis feminas non uidet; animo aduersus libidinem caecus est. Si de probitate defendam, ecce lutulentis pedibus Diogenes superbos Platonis toros alia superbia deculcat: Christianus nec in pauperem superbit. Si de modestia certem, ecce Pythagoras apud Thurios, Zenon apud Prienenses tyrannidem adfectant: Christianus uero nec aedilitatem. Si de aequanimitate congrediar, Lycurgus apocarteresin optauit, quod leges eius Lacones emendassent: Christianus etiam damnatus gratias agit. Si de fide conparem, Anaxagoras depositum hostibus denegauit: Christianus et extra fidelis uocatur. Si de simplicitate consistam, Aristoteles familiarem suum Hermian turpiter loco excedere fecit: Christianus nec inimicum suum laedit. Idem Aristoteles tam turpiter Alexandro regendo potius adolatur, quam Plato a Dionysio uentris gratia uenditatur. Aristippus in purpura sub magna grauitatis superficie nepotatur, et Hippias dum ciuitati insidias disponit, occiditur. Hoc pro suis omni atrocitate dissipatis nemo unquam temptauit Christianus. Sed dicet aliquis etiam de nostris excedere quosdam a regula disciplinae. Desinunt tamen Christiani haberi penes nos, philosophi uero illi cum talibus factis in nomine et honore sapientiae perseuerant. Adeo quid simile philosophus et Christianus? Graeciae discipulus et caeli? famae negotiator et uitae? uerborum et factorum operator, et rerum aedificator et destructor? amicus et inimicus erroris? ueritatis interpolator et integrator et expressor, et furator eius et custos?

47. Antiquior omnibus ueritas, nisi fallor, et hoc mihi

Nor does the Christian change the female sex [i.e. the natural use of the woman]. I know the harlot Phryne ministered to the lustful embraces of Diogenes. I am informed too that a certain Speusippus of Plato's school died in the act of adultery. A Christian remembers his sex when thinking of his wife alone. Democritus, by blinding himself because he could not look on women without lust and was pained if he did not possess them, declares his incontinency by his attempted cure. But the Christian, though he preserve his sight, sees no women, because he is blinded against lust in his heart. If I were to defend him on the score of humility, behold Diogenes with muddy feet tramples down the proud couches of Plato with a pride of his own; a Christian shows no arrogance even towards the poor. If I were to contend on the score of moderation, behold Pythagoras at Thurii, and Zeno at Priene, both aim at a tyranny, but the Christian does not even aspire to a magistracy in a country-town. If I were to meet you on the ground of equanimity, Lycurgus chose death by starvation, because the Spartans altered his laws; a Christian even when condemned gives thanks. If I draw a comparison in loyalty, Anaxagoras denied a deposit made by the enemy; a Christian even among strangers is called faithful. If I were to take my stand on sincerity, Aristotle disgracefully ousted his intimate friend Hermias: a Christian does not injure even his enemy. The same Aristotle by ruling Alexander so disgracefully, rather fawns upon him, as Plato is praised by Dionysius for gluttony. Aristippus lives the life of a profligate in purple under a great appearance of gravity, and Hippias is killed while planning treachery against the state. No Christian ever attempted this revenge for his own friends though scattered abroad with all possible cruelty. But it will be said that some even from amongst our own people deviate from the rule of discipline; they then cease to be regarded as Christians among us, whereas those philosophers in spite of such deeds continue in the name and respect accorded to wisdom. Further, what likeness is there between the philosopher and the Christian, the disciple of Greece and the disciple of heaven, the trader in reputation and the trader in salvation, the doer of words and the worker of deeds, the builder up and the destroyer of things, the friend and the enemy of error, the corrupter and the restorer and exponent of truth, its thief and its guardian?

Chap. XLVII. Truth is older than everything else, if I mis-

proficit antiquitas praestructa diuinae litteraturae, quo facile credatur thesaurum eam fuisse posteriori cuique sapientiae. Et si non onus iam uoluminis temperarem, excurrerem in hanc quoque probationem. Quis poëtarum, quis sophistarum, qui non omnino de prophetarum fonte potauerit? Inde igitur philosophi sitim ingenii sui rigauerunt, ut quae de nostris habent, ea nos conparent illis. Inde, opinor, et a quibusdam philosophia quoque eiecta est, a Thebaeis dico, et a Spartiatis et Argiuis, dum ad nostra conantur, et homines gloriae, ut diximus, et eloquentiae solius libidinosi, si quid in sanctis scripturis offenderunt digestis, ex proprio instituto curiositatis ad propria opera uerterunt, neque satis credentes diuina esse, quo minus interpolarent, neque satis intellegentes, ut adhuc tunc subnubila, etiam ipsis Iudaeis obumbrata, quorum propria uidebantur. Nam et si qua simplicitas erat ueritatis, eo magis scrupulositas humana fidem aspernata mutabat, per quod in incertum miscuerunt etiam quod inuenerant certum. Inuentum enim solummodo deum non ut inuenerant disputauerunt, ut et de qualitate et de natura eius et de sede disceptent. Alii incorporalem adseuerant, alii corporalem, ut tam Platonici quam Stoici; alii ex atomis, alii ex numeris, qua Epicurus et Pythagoras, alius ex igni, qua Heraclito uisum est: et Platonici quidem curantem rerum, contra Epicurei otiosum et inexercitum, et ut ita dixerim, neminem humanis rebus; positum uero extra mundum Stoici, qui figuli modo extrinsecus torqueat molem hanc; intra mundum Platonici, qui gubernatoris exemplo intra id maneat quod regat. Sic et de ipso mundo natus innatusue sit, decessurus mansurusue sit, uariant. Sic et de animae statu, quam alii diuinam et aeternam, alii dissolubilem contendunt, ut quis sensit, ita et intulit aut reformauit. Nec mirum, si uetus instrumentum ingenia philosophorum interuer-

take not, and the antiquity of the divine literature already established is so far helpful to my argument in that it makes it credible that this was the storehouse for all later wisdom. And if I were not now reducing the size of this book, I might run on to prove this also. What poet, what philosopher is there, who has not drunk at all from the fountain of the prophets? It is from thence therefore that the philosophers have watered the thirst of their genius, that what they have taken from our writings may put us on a level with them. Thence, too, I fancy, philosophy was even banished by certain peoples, as by the Thebans, the Spartans and the Argives. While they are striving to imitate our doctrines, being both greedy as men with a lust, as we have said, of fame and of eloquence only, anything they took offence at in the holy scriptures, such is their inquisitiveness, they have at once rewritten it to suit their own fancy, neither sufficiently believing their divine character, which would prevent them from garbling them, nor yet sufficiently understanding them, as being even then somewhat obscure, and darkened even to the Jews themselves, whose property they were believed to be. For even when the truth was in simple form, all the more did that cavilling spirit of man, disdaining belief, begin to falter, and thus they confounded in uncertainty even that which they had found certain. For having found only that there was a God, they disputed about him not as they found him revealed, but as to his character, his nature and abode. Some aver that he is incorporeal, others corporeal, as the Platonists and Stoics respectively; some think him to consist of atoms, others of numbers, as was thought by Epicurus and Pythagoras (respectively), others of fire, as Heraclitus thought: and the Platonists indeed (believe him) to take care of the world, but the Epicureans on the contrary hold him to be inactive and unemployed, and, if I may say so, non-existent as far as human affairs are concerned, while the Stoics believe him to be situated outside the world, where, like a potter, he makes this mass to revolve from without, but the Platonists that he was inside the universe, and that he remains inside that which he directs like a steersman. In the same way they differ also about the universe itself, as to whether it was created or uncreated, whether it will die or last for ever; so also about the condition of the soul, which some maintain is divine and eternal, and others perishable, as each thought, so he either introduced a new opinion or modified an old one. Nor can any wonder that the ingenuity of philosophers

terunt. Ex horum semine etiam nostram hanc nouitiolam paraturam uiri quidam suis opinionibus ad philosophicas sententias adulterauerunt et de una uia obliquos multos et inexplicabiles tramites sciderunt. Quod ideo suggesserim, ne cui nota uarietas sectae huius in hoc quoque nos philosophis adaequare uideatur et ex uarietate defensionum iudicet ueritatem. Expedite autem praescribimus adulteris nostris illam esse regulam ueritatis quae ueniat a Christo transmissa per comites ipsius, quibus aliquanto posteriores diuersi isti commentatores probabuntur. Omnia aduersus ueritatem de ipsa ueritate constructa sunt, operantibus aemulationem istam spiritibus erroris. Ab his adulteria huiusmodi salutaris disciplinae subornata, ab his quaedam etiam fabulae immissae quae de similitudine fidem infirmarent ueritatis uel eam sibi potius euincerent, ut quis ideo non putet Christianis credendum quia nec poëtis nec philosophis, uel ideo magis poëtis et philosophis existimet credendum quia non Christianis. Itaque ridemur praedicantes deum iudicaturum. Sic enim et poëtae et philosophi tribunal apud inferos ponunt. Et gehennam si comminemur, quae est ignis arcani subterraneam ad poenam thesaurus, proinde decachinnamur. Sic enim et Pyriphlegethon apud mortuos amnis est. Et si paradisum nominemus, locum diuinae amoenitatis recipiendis sanctorum spiritibus destinatum, maceria quadam igneae illius zonae a notitia orbis communis segregatum, Elysii campi fidem occupauerunt. Unde haec, oro uos, philosophis aut poëtis tam consimilia? Nonnisi de nostris sacramentis. Si de nostris sacramentis, ut de prioribus, ergo fideliora sunt nostra magisque credenda, quorum imagines quoque fidem inueniunt. Si de suis sensibus, iam ergo sacramenta nostra imagines posteriorum habebuntur, quod rerum forma non sustinet. Nunquam enim corpus umbra aut ueritatem imago praecedit.

48. Age iam, si qui philosophus adfirmet, ut ait Laberius de sententia Pythagorae, hominem fieri ex mulo, colubram ex

has perverted the Old Testament. Certain men from their stock have by their opinions falsified even this more modern Testament of ours after the views of philosophers, and from the one way have caused many oblique and intricate paths to diverge. I should like to make this remark, lest any one should think that the notorious variety in our sect should seem to put us on an equality with the philosophers in this respect also, and condemn truth out of the variety of defences[1]. We, however, at once lay down to the corrupters of our faith that the rule of the truth is that which comes from Christ, passed on through his followers, somewhat later than whom these different commentators will be proved to have existed. Everything against the truth is built up from the truth itself, this rivalry being due to the spirits of error. By them the corruptions of this sort of wholesome teaching are instigated, by these even certain fables have been let loose, such as by their likeness should weaken belief in the truth or win it rather for themselves, leading a man to suppose that he must not believe the Christians for the reason that he must not believe either poets or philosophers, or should think that he must put more belief in poets and philosophers because he can put none in Christians. Thus we are laughed at when we preach that God will judge. For so do both poets and philosophers place a tribunal in the world below. And if we were to threaten a hell, which is a storehouse of secret fire for subterranean punishment, we are similarly laughed to scorn. For so also is Pyriphlegethon a river among the dead. And if we were to name paradise, a place of celestial delight appointed to receive the spirits of the saints, separated from the knowledge of the common world by a sort of wall consisting of that fiery zone, if so, the Elysian fields have already anticipated the belief. Whence comes it, I pray you, that these things are so like the poets or philosophers? Only from our mysteries; if from our mysteries, then, as being taken from the earlier, ours are more reliable and more to be believed, whose copies even find credence; if from their own inventions, our mysteries will then be regarded as copies of the later, which is not borne out by the plan of things; for never does the shadow precede (in time) the body or the copy the reality.

Chap. XLVIII. Come now, if any philosopher were to assert, as Laberius does with regard to the doctrine of Pythagoras,

[1] But with *defectionem uindicet ueritatis* 'should claim that the truth has failed.'

muliere, et in eam opinionem omnia argumenta eloquii uirtute distorserit, nonne consensum mouebit et fidem infiget etiam ab animalibus abstinendi propterea? Persuasum quis habeat, ne forte bubulam de aliquo proauo suo obsonet? At enim Christianus si de homine hominem ipsumque de Gaio Gaium reducem repromittat, lapidibus magis, nec saltim coetibus a populo exigetur. Si quaecunque ratio praeest animarum humanarum reciprocandarum in corpora, cur non in eandem substantiam redeant, cum hoc sit restitui, id esse quod fuerat? Iam non ipsae sunt quae fuerant, quia non potuerunt esse quod non erant, nisi desinant esse quod fuerant. Multis etiam locis ex otio opus erit, si uelimus ad hanc partem lasciuire, quis in quam bestiam reformari uideretur. Sed de nostra magis defensione, qui proponimus multo utique dignius credi hominem ex homine rediturum, quemlibet pro quolibet, dum hominem, ut eadem qualitas animae in eandem restauraretur conditionem, etsi non effigiem. Certe quia ratio restitutionis destinatio iudicii est, necessario idem ipse qui fuerat exhibebitur, ut boni seu contrarii meriti iudicium a deo referat. Ideoque repraesentabuntur et corpora, quia neque pati quicquam potest anima sola sine materia stabili, id est carne, et quod omnino de iudicio dei pati debent animae, non sine carne meruerunt intra quam omnia egerunt. Sed quomodo, inquis, dissoluta materia exhiberi potest? Considera temetipsum, o homo, et fidem rei inuenies. Recogita quid fueris antequam esses. Utique nihil. Meminisses enim, si quid fuisses. Qui ergo nihil fueras priusquam esses, idem nihil factus cum esse desieris, cur non possis rursus esse de nihilo eiusdem ipsius auctoris uoluntate qui te uoluit esse de nihilo? Quid noui tibi eueniet? Qui non eras, factus es; cum iterum non eris, fies. Redde si potes rationem qua factus es,

that a man is made out of what was once a mule, and the snake out of what was once a woman, and should by force of eloquence have twisted all arguments to support that opinion, will he not gain assent and establish belief in abstaining even from animal food for that reason? Would any one be fully persuaded to abstain, lest perchance in buying beef he should be purchasing a bit of some ancestor of his? But indeed, if a Christian were to promise that man would be made again from man and that very Gaius would be reproduced from Gaius, the people will rather insist on stoning him, and will not even come to hear him. If there rules any method for the reincarnation of souls, why should they not return into the same nature, since restoration means this, to be that which it had been? Now they are not the very souls that they had been, because they have not been able to be that which they were not, unless they were to cease to be that which they had been. There will be need also for many topics treated in a leisurely way, if we would be playful in this direction, for instance, what kind of beast any particular person might appear likely to be changed into. But we are more concerned with our defence; we lay it down that it is of course a much more worthy belief that man should be refashioned from man, given person for any given person, as long as it be a human being, so that the same kind of soul may be reinstated into the same rank, even if it be not into the same outward form. Assuredly, because the reason of restoration is what is appointed by judgment, of necessity the very same man, who had existed before, will be brought before the judgment seat, that he may receive from God the verdict on his good or evil deserts. Hence the bodies also will be again presented, both because the soul alone apart from material substance, that is the flesh, cannot suffer anything, and because whatsoever souls are doomed to suffer from the judgment of God, they have not deserved it apart from that flesh, within which they did everything. 'But how,' you say, 'can matter that has suffered dissolution be made to appear?' Consider thyself, O man, and thou wilt find it not incredible. Reflect what thou wert, before thou hadst a being: assuredly naught: for if thou hadst been aught thou wouldst remember it. Thou therefore who wast nothing before thou wert, and who also becamest nothing, when thou didst cease to be, why couldst thou not be brought again to life from nothingness by the will of the very same Author, who willed that thou shouldest be from naught? What novelty will happen to thee? Thou who wert not, camest into being: when a second time thou shalt not be,

et tunc require qua fies. Et tamen facilius utique fies quod fuisti aliquando, quia aeque non difficile factus es quod nunquam fuisti aliquando. Dubitabitur, credo, de dei uiribus, qui tantum corpus hoc mundi de eo quod non fuerat non minus quam de morte uacationis et inanitatis inposuit, animatum spiritu omnium animarum animatore, signatum et ipsum humanae resurrectionis exemplum in testimonium uobis. Lux cotidie interfecta resplendet et tenebrae pari uice decedendo succedunt, sidera defuncta uiuescunt, tempora ubi finiuntur incipiunt, fructus consummantur et redeunt, certe semina non nisi corrupta et dissoluta fecundius surgunt, omnia pereundo seruantur, omnia de interitu reformantur. Tu homo, tantum nomen, si intellegas te uel de titulo Pythiae discens, dominus omnium morientium et resurgentium, ad hoc morieris, ut pereas? Ubicumque resolutus fueris, quaecunque te materia destruxerit, hauserit, aboleuerit, in nihilum prodegerit, reddet te. Eius est nihilum ipsum cuius et totum. Ergo, inquitis, semper moriendum erit et semper resurgendum? Si ita rerum dominus destinasset, ingratis experireris conditionis tuae legem. At nunc non aliter destinauit quam praedicauit. Quae ratio uniuersitatem ex diuersitate conposuit, ut omnia aemulis substantiis sub unitate constarent ex uacuo et solido, ex animali et inanimali, ex conprehensibili et inconprehensibili, ex luce et tenebris, ex ipsa uita et morte: eadem aeuum quoque ita destinata et distincta condicione conseruit, ut prima haec pars, ab exordio rerum quam incolimus, temporali aetate ad finem defluat, sequens uero, quam expectamus, in infinitam aeternitatem propagetur. Cum ergo finis et limes, medius qui interhiat, adfuerit, ut etiam ipsius mundi species transferatur aeque temporalis, quae illi dispositioni aeternitatis aulaei uice oppansa est, tunc restituetur omne humanum genus ad expungendum quod in isto aeuo boni seu mali meruit, et exinde pendendum

thou shalt come into being. Give, if thou canst, a reason why thou wast created, and then ask how thou wilt come to be. And yet thou wilt of course more easily become what thou at one time wast, because with equal ease thou becamest what thou wast never at any time. There will be doubt felt, I believe, about the strength of God, who planted (in the void) this so great body of the universe from that which had never been, as well as from the death of emptiness and void, animated by the spirit which gives life to all souls, itself also stamped by the example of human resurrection for evidence to you. Light, though daily destroyed, shines again, and the shades of night in like manner departing come up in its place, stars die and come to life again, the seasons when they are ending are beginning, fruits are brought to perfection and again return; assuredly seeds, unless they decay and fall to pieces, do not spring up in rich fruitfulness, all things are preserved by perishing, all things are formed again from death. Thou, O man, a name of such might, if thou wouldst understand thyself, learning even from the inscription of the Pythian priestess, thou who art lord of all that die and rise again, wilt thou die to this end, so as to perish for ever? Into whatever substance thou shalt have been resolved, whatsoever material has destroyed thee, swallowed thee up, effaced thee, wasted thee to nothing, it will give thee back (to life). Nothingness itself belongs to him to whom the whole also belongs. 'Therefore,' you say, 'one must always be dying and always rising again.' If the Lord of the world had so appointed, it would have been against your will that you would experience that law of your creation. But as matters are, he has appointed it exactly as he declared. That same Reason which constructed the universe out of diversity, so that all things should consist of rival substances under the bond of unity, as of empty and solid, of animate and inanimate, of things tangible and intangible, of light and darkness, of life itself and death, the same Reason has also so disposed the whole course of existence as to make time consist of two parts so determined and distinct, that this first part in which we dwell should flow down in an age of time from the beginning of things to the end, but that the second part which we await should be extended to an endless eternity. When therefore the end and mid boundary, which yawns between, has come, so that even the fashion of the universe itself has passed away, which is equally a matter of time, spread like a curtain in front of that system of eternity, then will the whole human race be restored to settle what of good or evil it has earned in this life, and there-

in immensam aeternitatis perpetuitatem. Ideoque nec mors iam, nec rursus ac rursus resurrectio, sed erimus idem qui nunc, nec alii post, dei quidem cultores apud deum semper, superinduti substantia propria aeternitatis: profani uero, et qui non integre ad deum, in poena aeque iugis ignis, habentes ex ipsa natura eius diuinam scilicet subministrationem incorruptibilitatis. Nouerunt et philosophi diuersitatem arcani et publici ignis. Ita longe alius est qui usui humano, alius qui iudicio dei apparet, siue de caelo fulmina stringens, siue de terra per uertices montium eructans; non enim absumit quod exurit, sed dum erogat, reparat. Adeo manent montes semper ardentes, et qui de caelo tangitur, saluus est, ut nullo iam igni decinerescat. Et hoc erit testimonium ignis aeterni, hoc exemplum iugis iudicii poenam nutrientis. Montes uruntur et durant. Quid nocentes et dei hostes?

49. Hae sunt quae in nobis solis praesumptiones uocantur, in philosophis et poëtis summae scientiae et insignia ingenia. Illi prudentes, nos inepti; illi honorandi, nos inridendi, immo eo amplius et puniendi. Falsa nunc sint quae tuentur et merito praesumptio, attamen necessaria; inepta, attamen utilia; siquidem meliores fieri coguntur qui eis credunt, metu aeterni supplicii et spe aeterni refrigerii. Itaque non expedit falsa dici nec inepta haberi quae expedit uera praesumi. Nullo titulo damnari licet omnino quae prosunt. In uobis itaque praesumptio est haec ipsa quae damnat utilia. Proinde nec inepta esse possunt; certe etsi falsa et inepta, nulli tamen noxia. Nam et multis aliis similia quibus nullas poenas inrogatis, uanis et fabulosis, inaccusatis et inpunitis, ut innoxiis. Sed in eiusmodi enim, si utique, inrisui iudicandum est, non gladiis et ignibus et crucibus et bestiis, de qua iniquitate saeuitiae non modo caecum hoc uulgus exsultat et insultat, sed et quidam

after to pay it down through an endless eternity. And therefore it is neither death at once, nor a recurring resurrection, but we shall be the same as now, nor different afterwards; worshippers of God indeed and ever with God, clothed upon with the special nature of eternity: but the profane and those who are not perfect before God, in the punishment of an equally lasting fire, having from its very nature a supply, divine of course, of imperishable quality. The philosophers also know the difference between a secret and a common fire. Thus that which is for human use is far different from that which ministers to the judgment of God, whether it draws down thunderbolts from heaven, or belches fire from the earth through the mountain craters; for it consumes not what it burns, but renews even while it destroys. Thus the mountains endure though always burning, and he who is stricken with fire from heaven is safe from being reduced to ashes by any other fire. And this will be a witness of eternal fire, this an example of everlasting judgment, continually feeding its own punishment: the mountains are burned and yet endure. What shall we say of the guilty and of the enemies of God?

Chap. XLIX. These are the things which in us alone are called vain assumptions, but in the philosophers and poets are instances of the highest knowledge and of extraordinary ability. They are wise, we are foolish; they are worthy of honour, we of ridicule, nay more than that, of punishment too. Let the opinions we hold be false and deserving of the name of prejudice, but yet they are necessary; let them be foolish, but yet they are advantageous, since those who believe them are constrained to become better men, from fear of everlasting punishment and hope of everlasting refreshment. Therefore it is inexpedient that those things should be called false, or regarded as foolish, which it is expedient should be presumed to be true; on no ground whatever ought that to be condemned which is beneficial. It is in you therefore that we find this very prejudice which condemns the useful. Hence our belief cannot be foolish, and, assuredly, even if it were false and foolish, it is nevertheless injurious to no one; for it is like many other things on which you inflict no penalties, unreal and fictitious things, which are not prosecuted nor punished, as being harmless: but indeed against such errors judgment ought to be pronounced, if at all, by ridicule, not by swords and fires and crosses and wild-beasts; in which unjust cruelty not only this blind rabble exults and insults, but certain of your own selves also, who aim at popularity with the

uestrum, quibus fauor uulgi de iniquitate captatur, gloriantur. Quasi non totum quod in nos potestis nostrum sit arbitrium. Certe, si uelim, Christianus sum. Tunc ergo me damnabis, si damnari uelim; cum uero quod in me potes, nisi uelim, non potes, iam meae uoluntatis est quod potes, non tuae potestatis. Proinde et uulgus uane de nostra uexatione gaudet. Proinde enim nostrum est gaudium, quod sibi uindicat, qui malumus damnari quam a deo excidere: contra illi, qui nos oderunt, dolere, non gaudere debebant, consecutis nobis quod elegimus.

50. Ergo, inquitis, cur querimini quod uos insequamur, si pati uultis, cum diligere debeatis per quos patimini quod uultis? Plane uolumus pati, uerum eo more, quo et bellum miles. Nemo quidem libens patitur, cum et trepidare et periclitari sit necesse. Tamen et proeliatur omnibus uiribus, et uincens in proelio gaudet qui de proelio querebatur, quia et gloriam consequitur et praedam. Proelium est nobis quod prouocamur ad tribunalia, ut illic sub discrimine capitis pro ueritate certemus. Victoria est autem pro quo certaueris obtinere. Ea uictoria habet et gloriam placendi deo et praedam uiuendi in aeternum. Sed obducimur. Certe cum obtinuimus. Ergo uicimus, cum occidimur, denique euadimus, cum obducimur. Licet nunc sarmenticios et semaxios appelletis, quia ad stipitem dimidii axis reuincti sarmentorum ambitu exurimur. Hic est habitus uictoriae nostrae, haec palmata uestis, tali curru triumphamus. Merito itaque uictis non placemus; propterea enim desperati et perditi existimamur. Sed haec desperatio et perditio penes uos in causa gloriae et famae uexillum uirtutis extollunt. Mucius dexteram suam libens in ara reliquit: o sublimitas animi! Empedocles totum sese Catanensium Aetnaeis incendiis donauit: o uigor mentis! Aliqua Carthaginis conditrix rogo se secundum matrimonium dedit: o praeconium castitatis! Regulus, ne unus pro multis hostibus uiueret, toto corpore cruces patitur: o uirum fortem

mob through injustice, make a boast of it. As if all the power you have over us were not of our own free choice! Surely it is only if I will it to be so, that I am a Christian; you will therefore condemn me, only if I will to be condemned; since the power you have over me, you do not possess unless I will it, your power therefore belongs to my will, not to your own authority. So also the mob vainly rejoices at the way in which we are tormented; for in the same way the joy is ours, which they claim for themselves, as we prefer to be condemned rather than to fall away from God: while, on the contrary, those that hate us ought to mourn, not to rejoice, because we have attained that which we have chosen.

Chap. L. 'So,' you say, 'why do you complain that we persecute you, if you wish to suffer, since you ought to love those by whose means you suffer what you wish?' Certainly we wish to suffer, but in the way in which a soldier also suffers war. Nobody indeed willingly suffers, since both panic and danger are inevitably to be faced; and yet the man who complained about battle fights with all his strength and rejoices when he conquers in battle, because he attains both glory and booty. Our battle is that we are summoned before tribunals, to fight there for the truth at the risk of our lives. But to obtain that for which one has struggled is a victory, a victory that carries with it both the glory, of pleasing God, and the spoil, which is eternal life. But, you will say, we are convicted; yes, but it is after we have won the day; therefore we have conquered, when we are killed. Thus we escape, when we are convicted. You may call us now 'faggoted' and 'axle-men,' because bound to a stake the length of half an axle we are burned by the faggots surrounding us. This is the garb of our victory, this our garment decked with palm-leaves, such is the chariot in which we triumph. Naturally therefore we do not please those whom we conquered; for that is the reason why we are regarded as desperate and reckless men. But this desperation and recklessness in your midst exalts the standard of virtue in the cause of glory and renown. Mucius gladly left his right hand on the altar: 'Oh loftiness of spirit!' Empedocles freely gave his whole body to Etna's fires at the instance of the people of Catana: 'Oh what strength of mind!' We read of some foundress or other of Carthage who sacrificed her second marriage to the funeral-pyre: 'Oh noble encomium of chastity!' Regulus, lest his own single life should be spared in exchange for so many enemies, suffers tortures all over his body: 'What

et in captiuitate uictorem! Anaxarchus, cum in exitum tisanae pilo contunderetur: Tunde, tunde, aiebat, Anaxarchi follem, Anaxarchum enim non tundis: o philosophi magnanimitatem, qui de tali exitu suo etiam iocabatur! Omitto eos qui cum gladio proprio uel alio genere mortis mitiore de laude pepigerunt. Ecce enim et tormentorum certamina coronantur a uobis. Attica meretrix carnifice iam fatigato postremo linguam suam comesam in faciem tyranni saeuientis exspuit, ut exspueret et uocem, ne coniuratos confiteri posset, si etiam uicta uoluisset. Zeno Eleates consultus a Dionysio, quidnam philosophia praestaret, cum respondisset contemptum mortis, inpassibilis flagellis tyranni obiectus sententiam suam ad mortem usque signabat. Certe Laconum flagella sub oculis etiam hortantium propinquorum acerbata tantum honorem tolerantiae domui conferunt quantum sanguinis fuderint. O gloriam licitam, quia humanam, cui nec praesumptio perdita nec persuasio desperata reputatur in contemptu mortis et atrocitatis omnimodae, cui tantum pro patria, pro imperio, pro amicitia pati permissum est quantum pro deo non licet! Et tamen illis omnibus et statuas defunditis, et imagines inscribitis, et titulos inciditis in aeternitatem. Quantum de monumentis potestis scilicet, praestatis et ipsi quodammodo mortuis resurrectionem. Hanc qui ueram a deo sperat, si pro deo patiatur, insanus est. Sed hoc agite, boni praesides, meliores multo apud populum si illis Christianos immolaueritis, cruciate, torquete, damnate, atterite nos: probatio est enim innocentiae nostrae iniquitas uestra. Ideo nos haec pati deus patitur. Nam et proxime ad lenonem damnando Christianam potius quam ad leonem confessi estis labem pudicitiae apud nos atrociorem omni poena et omni morte reputari. Nec quicquam tamen proficit exquisitior quaeque crudelitas uestra: inlecebra est magis sectae. Plures efficimur quotiens metimur a uobis: semen est sanguis Christianorum. Multi apud uos ad toleran-

a brave man, what a conqueror even in captivity!' Anaxarchus, when he was being pommelled to death with a barley pestle, kept saying: 'Pound, pound away: for it is the bodily coating of Anaxarchus, not Anaxarchus himself, that you are pounding!' 'Oh the great-souled philosopher, who could actually joke about such a death as his!' I leave out those who bargained for fame with their own swords or some other milder form of death. For, lo, even rivalries of tortures are crowned by you. An Athenian harlot who had already wearied out the executioner, at last bit through her tongue and spat it out into the face of the cruel tyrant, that she might spit out her own voice also, to prevent her from being able to confess the names of the conspirators, even in case she might give in and desire to do so. Zeno of Elea, being consulted by Dionysius as to what was the benefit of philosophy, when he had replied: 'Contempt of death,' without showing feeling he was thereupon exposed to the scourges of the tyrant and continued to seal his opinion even up to the point of death. Assuredly the scourges of the Spartans, embittered, as they were, under the eyes even of cheering relatives, confer upon the family a reputation for endurance, in proportion to the blood they have shed. Here is a glory licensed because human, to which neither reckless prejudice nor desperate persuasion is ascribed in despising death and every sort of cruelty, to which it is allowed to endure more for one's city, for the empire, and for friendship, than it is allowed to endure for God! And yet for all these you cast statues and write inscriptions and engrave titles to last for ever; certainly you yourselves also, in so far as you can, in a certain sense confer resurrection on the dead by means of your monuments: while he who hopes for a real resurrection from God, if he suffer for God, is thought insane. But go on thus, ye excellent governors, and you will be all the more popular with the mob if you sacrifice Christians to their wishes: crucify, torture, condemn, annihilate us: your injustice is a proof of our innocence. It is for that reason that God allows us to suffer these things. For quite recently by condemning a Christian woman to the lust of man rather than to a lion, you confessed that the stain upon chastity is reckoned more heinous among us than any punishment and any death. Nor yet doth your cruelty, though each act be more exquisite than the last, profit you: it is rather an attraction to our sect. We spring up in greater numbers the more we are mown down by you: the blood of the Christians is the seed of a new life. Many among yourselves exhort men to the

tiam doloris et mortis hortantur, ut Cicero in Tusculanis, ut Seneca in Fortuitis, ut Diogenes, ut Pyrrhon, ut Callinicus. Nec tamen tantos inueniunt uerba discipulos quantos Christiani factis docendo. Illa ipsa obstinatio, quam exprobratis, magistra est. Quis enim non contemplatione eius concutitur ad requirendum quid intus in re sit? quis non, ubi requisiuit, accedit? ubi accessit, pati exoptat, ut totam dei gratiam redimat, ut omnem ueniam ab eo compensatione sanguinis sui expediat? Omnia enim huic operi delicta donantur. Inde est, quod ibidem sententiis uestris gratias agimus. Ut est aemulatio diuinae rei et humanae, cum damnamur a uobis, a deo absoluimur.

endurance of pain and death, as Cicero in the Tusculans, Seneca in his book on Chances, Diogenes, Pyrrho and Callinicus. But yet words do not find so many disciples as the Christians do by their teaching by deeds. That very obstinacy, with which you upbraid us, is a lesson. For who is there that is not stirred up by the consideration of it to ask what there is within it? Who does not join us when he has asked? who when he has joined us, does not eagerly desire to suffer, that he may buy back the whole favour of God, that he may procure all indulgence from him by the payment of his own blood? For all sins are forgiven to this action. Hence it is that in the same place we give thanks to your judgments. As there is an enmity between what is of God and what is of man, when we are condemned by you, we are acquitted by God.

In the following places Prof. Mayor appears to have preferred to read differently from Oehler:—

p. 2	l. 7	obstruit] *add.* uiam
p. 8	l. 5	et *pr.*] ut
p. 12	l. 7	esse in causa (?)
	l. 19	*om.* nomine
	l. 20	ualde] nomen ualde *om.* , *after* nominis
p. 16	l. 11	concurram] consistam
p. 24	l. 15	inuerecundiam *as one word*
p. 28	l. 32	iurulentiam (?)
p. 36	l. 7	impenditis
	l. 8	qua (?)
p. 44	l. 15	insulas (?)
	l. 22	repreh.] *either* non repreh. *or* depreh. (?)
p. 46	l. 4	perstrinximus
p. 48	l. 3	Nolo
p. 50	l. 14	pastorem (?)
p. 56	l. 4	repurgabimus (?)
p. 58	l. 13	prodacto
p. 60	l. 2	Aristeas (?)
	l 3	ex aperto
p. 68	l. 26	autem] etiam
p. 70	l. 2	alterum
	l. 3	numero
p. 74	l. 24	reformetur (?)
	l. 25	falsa (?)
		post renunt. *hab.* quaeuis alia contraria comperta (?)
p. 76	l. 23	e] a (?)
		recogitatu
p. 86	l. 3	Astarte
p. 86	l. 12	quia (?)
p. 92	l. 6	intentionem
	l. 23	metui (?)
	l. 28	conditioni (?)
p. 94	l. 14	quolibet
		tuo *add. after* mortuo (?)
p. 106	l. 7	non esse et hostes esse] esse et hostes non esse
	l. 31	denotastis (?)
p. 108	l. 3	penes nos dispungi (?)
p. 114	l. 37	nec *bis*] neque *bis*
p. 116	l. 15	causa
	l. 23	abscissam
	l. 30	hod.] in hod.
p. 118	l. 1	cenantur
p. 120	l. 24	perstringunt (?)
p. 122	l. 16	ubiubi
p. 124	l. 14	expendimur (??)
	l. 27	perfecto (?)
p. 126	l. 14	inuoluntate
	l. 26	intentionem
p. 128	l. 9	oblatrant (?)
	l. 20	odio
	l. 23	mimice
p. 132	l. 11	*om.* scripturis
p. 134	l. 18	ridemur] et ridemur
p. 136	l. 16	condicionem (?)
p. 138	l. 19	condicionis (?)
p. 140	l. 19	tuemur
	l. 20	praesumptiones

NOTES

ABBREVIATIONS[1]

The following are the more difficult abbreviations employed :—

aex. = ante exitum
a. f. = ante finem
a. m. = ante medium
DH. = Dionysius of Halicarnassus
DL. = Diogenes Laertius
DS. = Diodorus Siculus
f., fin. = in fine
h. c. = in hoc capitulo
h. l. = in hoc loco
Lasaulx = E. v. Lasaulx, Studien des classischen Alterthums (Regensburg, 1854)
m. = in medio
omn. = omnia (the whole context)
p. m. = post medium
ppr. = post prohoemium
pr. = in prohoemio
Tzschirner = Tzschirner, Geschichte der Apologetik (Leipzig, 1805)
< > sometimes enclose an explanatory word

[1] Consult also the Introduction.

Cap. I

p. 2 l. 1 ROMANI IMPERII ANTISTITES called *praesides* c. 9. 30 f. 50.

p. 2 l. 7 SECTAE HVIVS c. 21 pr. n.

p. 2 l. 10 SCIT SE PEREGRINAM IN TERRIS AGERE ep. ad Diognet. 5 § 5 *πατρίδας οἰκοῦσιν ἰδίας, ἀλλ᾽ ὡς πάροικοι· μετέχουσι πάντων ὡς πολῖται καὶ πάνθ᾽ ὑπομένουσιν ὡς ξένοι· πᾶσα ξένη πατρίς ἐστιν αὐτῶν καὶ πᾶσα πατρὶς ξένη. . . .* § 9 *ἐπὶ γῆς διατρίβουσιν, ἀλλ᾽ ἐν οὐρανῷ πολιτεύονται.* Cf. Lightfoot on Clem. Rom. ep. pr.

p. 2 l. 10 AGERE c. 10 m. p. 36 l. 30 *certe enim oblitos agitis.*

p. 2 l. 16 INAVDITAM SI DAMNENT ad nat. I 20 p. 93 2 Wiss. *emendate uosmetipsos prius, ut Christianos puniatis, nisi quod emendaueritis, non punietis, immo eritis Christiani; immo si fueritis Christiani, eritis emendati. discite quid in nobis accusetis, et non accusabitis...* l. 8 *damnate ueritatem, sed inspectam si potestis, et probate errorem, sed repertum si putatis. quodsi praescribitur uobis errorem amare et odisse ueritatem, cur quod amatis et odistis non noueritis?* Minuc. 27 § 8 *sic* <daemones> *occupant animos et obstruunt pectora, ut ante nos incipiant homines odisse quam nosse, ne cognitos aut imitari possint aut damnare non possint.* Lact. V 1 § 5 *quia student damnare tamquam nocentes quos utique sciunt innocentes, constare de ipsa innocentia nolunt: quasi uero maior iniquitas sit probatam innocentiam* damnasse *quam* inauditam. § 6 *sed, ut dixi, uerentur, ne, si audierint, damnare non possint.* Acts 25 16.

p. 2 l. 18 HANC ITAQVE PRIMAM CAVSAM APVD VOS COLLOCAMVS INIQVITATIS ODII ERGA NOMEN CHRISTIANORVM Matt. 10 22. 24 9. Mark 13 13. Luke 6 22. 21 12, 17. Io. 15 21. Acts 5 41. 9 14—16, 21. 1 Pet. 4 14—16. (Cf. Lightfoot on Ign. Eph. 3 pr. ('the Name,' absolute). Renan L'Église

Chrétienne 369 n. 2 and 3. Kortholt Paganus obtrectator pp. 711—720 'de inuiso ipsomet Christianorum nomine.' Iustin. apol. 2 2 p. 42[c] seq. "Ptolemaeus accused and condemned solely as a Christian. Lucius, another Christian, asked: *τίς ἡ αἰτία; τοῦ μήτε μοιχὸν μήτε πόρνον μήτε ἀνδροφόνον μήτε λωποδύτην μήτε ἅρπαγα μήτε ἁπλῶς ἀδίκημά τι πράξαντα ἐλεγχόμενον, ὀνόματος δὲ Χριστιανοῦ προσωνυμίαν ὁμολογοῦντα τὸν ἄνθρωπον τοῦτον ἐκολάσω;* Your judgement, Urbicus, ill befits the emperor Pius, or the emperor's son the Philosopher, or the sacred senate." Urbicus replied: "You too seem to me to be one of them." "Certainly." He was sentenced and returned thanks. Tert. scorp. 10 p. 523 l. 15 Oehler *ipsum* nominis odium. ibid. p. 524 l. 10 *et* odium nominis *hic erit, et persecutio hic erumpit.* 11 p. 526 l. 4 from foot *odio habemur ab omnibus hominibus* nominis causa, *quomodo scriptum est.*

p. 2 l. 22 QVID ENIM INIQVIVS, QVAM VT ODERINT HOMINES QVOD IGNORANT, ETIAM SI RES MERETVR ODIVM? ep. ad Diognet. 5 fin. *τὴν αἰτίαν τῆς ἔχθρας εἰπεῖν οἱ μισοῦντες οὐκ ἔχουσιν.*

p. 2 l. 24 VACANTE...MERITI NOTITIA c. 11 p. 40 l. 29 uacat *ex hac parte causa.* c. 18 p. 58 l. 30 *sed ne* notitia uacaret.

p. 4 l. 6 TESTIMONIVM IGNORANTIAE EST, QVAE INIQVITATEM DVM EXCVSAT, CONDEMNAT cet. ad nat. I 1 pr. p. 59 Wiss. testimonium ignorantiae uestrae quae iniquitatem dum defendit, reuincit, in promptu est, quod omnes qui uobiscum retro ignorabant et uobiscum oderant, simul eis contigit scire, desinunt odisse quia desinunt ignorare, immo fiunt et ipsi quod oderant et incipiunt odisse quod fuerant.

p. 4 l. 11 OBSESSAM VOCIFERANTVR CIVITATEM cet. c. 37 p. 108. ad nat. I 1 p. 98 l. 8 seq. Blunt Right Use 275, 277, 279. Kaye 85 seq. Vales. on Eus. h. e. IV 17. Lucian. Antioch. in Rufin. interpr. Eus. h. e. IX 6 (=Routh Reliq. sacr. IV[2] p. 6 l. 26) *pars paene mundi iam maior huic ueritati adstipulatur; urbes integrae, aut si in his aliquid suspectum uidetur, contestatur de his etiam agrestis manus, ignara figmenti.* Eus. p. e. I 1 § 6 p. 3[a] universality of the call, 3 § 10 p. 8[b], § 15 p. 9[d] universality of the preaching, through all lands.

p. 4 l. 13 DIGNITATEM not only the lowborn and ignorant became Christians Blunt Right Use ser. 2 lect. 2 pp. 294—317. Renan, l'Antéchrist 3 (Pomponia Graecina). Orig. c. Cels. III 9 p. 117 pr. *νῦν μὲν οὖν τάχα, ὅτε διὰ τὸ πλῆθος τῶν προσερχομένων τῷ λόγῳ καὶ πλούσιοι καί τινες τῶν ἐν ἀξιώμασι καὶ γυναῖα τὰ ἁβρὰ καὶ εὐγενῆ ἀποδέχονται τοὺς ἀπὸ τοῦ λόγου, τολμήσει τις λέγειν διὰ τὸ δοξάριον προΐστασθαί τινας τῆς κατὰ Χριστιανοὺς διδασκαλίας.* III 12 p. m. *οὕτω τοίνυν, ἐπεὶ σεμνόν τι ἐφάνη τοῖς ἀνθρώποις Χριστιανισμός, οὐ μόνον, ὡς ὁ Κέλσος οἴεται, τοῖς ἀνδραποδωδεστέροις, ἀλλὰ καὶ πολλοῖς τῶν παρ' Ἕλλησι φιλολόγων, ἀναγκαίως ὑπέστησαν, οὐ πάντως διὰ στάσεις καὶ τὸ φιλόνεικον, αἱρέσεις, ἀλλὰ διὰ τὸ σπουδάζειν συνιέναι τὰ Χριστιανισμοῦ καὶ τῶν φιλολόγων πλείονας.* cf. c. 44—71. VII 54 f. (of the words of Jesus) *δυνάμει λελέχθαι θείᾳ, μέχρι δεῦρο ἐπιστρέφοντας οὐ τῶν ἁπλουστέρων τινὰς μόνον, ἀλλὰ καὶ πολλοὺς τῶν συνετωτέρων.* Rufin. h. e. V 21.

p. 4 l. 17 AMANT IGNORARE ignorance of Crescens Iustin. apol. II 3. Demand for enquiry id. apol. I 3.

p. 4 l. 19 IMPRVDENTES DE PRVDENTIBVS IVDICANTES ad mart. 1 p. 3 *nec tantus ego sum, ut uos alloquar. uerumtamen et gladiatores perfectissimos non tantum magistri et praepositi sui, sed etiam idiotae et superuacui quique adhortantur de longinquo, ut saepe de ipso populo dictata suggesta profuerint.*

p. 4 l. 20 MALVNT NESCIRE cet. ad nat. I 1 p. 59 l. 15 Wiss. Minuc. 27 § 8 (of demons) *sic occupant animos et obstruunt pectora, ut ante nos incipiant homines odisse quam nosse, ne cognitos aut imitari possint aut damnare non possint.*

p. 4 l. 25 SED NON IDEO, INQVIT, BONVM, QVIA MVLTOS CONVERTIT cet. to the end of c. 1. cf. ad nat. I 1 p. 59 l. 20—60 l. 16.

INQVIT 'they say.' c. 31 p. 98 l. 19. Iuu. III 153 n. (pp. 198, 373). XIV 153 n. Arnob. I 3, 34. III 6. Bünemann on Lact. de ira Dei 19 § 7.

p. 4 l. 33 DINVMERANT IN SEMETIPSOS MENTIS MALAE IMPETVS, VEL FATO VEL ASTRIS IMPVTANT "either they tell up against themselves the outbursts of an evil mind, or (if they excuse themselves) they make their destiny or their star responsible."

p. 6 l. 1 IMPVTANT de paenit. 6 a. m. p. 654 l. 6 *quis enim seruus, postquam libertate mutatus est, furta sua et fugas sibi* imputat? cf. on the stars as a scapegoat Iul. Firm. math. I 1 in Heraldus.

p. 6 l. 2 CHRISTIANVS VERO QVID SIMILE? c. 2 pr. *quodcumque dicimur.* ibid. p. 6 l. 25 *de nobis nihil tale.* c. 8 p. 28 l. 24 *homo es et ipse, quod et Christianus...homo est enim et Christianus et quod et tu.*

NEMINEM PVDET, NEMINEM PAENITET, NISI PLANE RETRO NON FVISSE Minuc. 28 § 2 *malum autem adeo non esse, ut Christianus reus nec erubesceret nec timeret, et* unum solummodo, quod non ante fuerit, paeniteret.

p. 6 l. 4 SI ACCVSATVR, NON DEFENDIT Lact. V 20 § 10 *ideo cum tam nefanda perpetimur, ne uerbo quidem reluctamur, sed Deo remittimus ultionem.*

p. 6 l. 5 DAMNATVS GRATIAS AGIT c. 46 p. m. p. 130 l. 15 Christianus etiam damnatus gratias agit. 50 f. (note) p. 146 l. 9 *inde est quod ibidem* sententiis uestris gratias agimus. *ut est aemulatio diuinae rei et humanae, cum damnamur a uobis, a Deo absoluimur.* 1 Cor. 4 12. Iustin. apol. II 2 f. p. 43[c] Lucius, defending Ptolemaeus, and confessing himself a Christian, is ordered for execution: ὁ δὲ καὶ χάριν εἰδέναι ὡμολόγει, πονηρῶν δεσποτῶν τῶν τοιούτων ἀπηλλάχθαι γινώσκων καὶ πρὸς τὸν πατέρα καὶ βασιλέα τῶν οὐρανῶν πορεύεσθαι, καὶ ἄλλος δὲ τρίτος ἐπελθὼν κολασθῆναι προσετιμήθη. Aug. serm. 309 4 (reply of Cyprian to the sentence of death) Deo gratias! Le Blant les actes des martyrs 237—8.

Cap. II

Cf. c. 46 'why have we not the same impunity as philosophers?'

p. 6 l. 17 CHRISTIANIS SOLIS NIHIL PERMITTITVR LOQVI QVOD CAVSAM PVRGET Iulitta, winning her case against one who had embezzled the greater part of her estate, was by him denounced as a Christian. Refusing to sacrifice, she was condemned to the stake (Basil. hom. de diuersis v in mart. Iulittam, II 33[a]—43[c]).

p. 6 l. 19 ILLVD SOLVM EXSPECTATVR QVOD ODIO PVBLICO

NECESSARIVM EST, CONFESSIO NOMINIS, NON EXAMINATIO CRIMINIS cet. Iustin apol. I 4 pr. p. 54^{d}—55^{b} *ὀνόματος μὲν οὖν προσωνυμία οὔτε ἀγαθὸν οὔτε κακὸν κρίνεται ἄνευ τῶν ὑποπιπτουσῶν τῷ ὀνόματι πράξεων· ἐπεί, ὅσον γε ἐκ τοῦ κατηγορουμένου ἡμῶν ὀνόματος, χρηστότατοι ὑπάρχομεν. ἀλλ᾽ ἐπεὶ οὐ τοῦτο δίκαιον ἡγούμεθα, διὰ τὸ ὄνομα, ἐὰν κακοὶ ἐλεγχώμεθα, αἰτεῖν ἀφίεσθαι, πάλιν, εἰ μηδὲν διά τε τὴν προσηγορίαν τοῦ ὀνόματος καὶ διὰ τὴν πολιτείαν εὑρισκόμεθα ἀδικοῦντες, ὑμέτερον ἀγωνιᾶσαί ἐστι μὴ ἀδικῶς κολάζοντες τοὺς μὴ ἐλεγχομένους τῇ δίκῃ κόλασιν ὀφλήσητε. ἐξ ὀνόματος γὰρ ἢ ἔπαινος ἢ κόλασις οὐκ ἂν εὐλόγως γένοιτο, ἢν μή τι ἐνάρετον ἢ φαῦλον δι᾽ ἔργων ἀποδείκνυσθαι δύνηται. καὶ γὰρ τοὺς κατηγορουμένους ἐφ᾽ ὑμῶν πάντας πρὶν ἐλεγχθῆναι οὐ τιμωρεῖτε, ἐφ᾽ ἡμῶν δὲ τὸ ὄνομα ὡς ἔλεγχον λαμβάνετε, καίπερ, ὅσον γε ἐκ τοῦ ὀνόματος, τοὺς κατηγοροῦντας μᾶλλον κολάζειν ὀφείλετε. Χριστιανοὶ γὰρ εἶναι κατηγορούμεθα· τὸ δὲ χρηστὸν μισεῖσθαι οὐ δίκαιον. καὶ πάλιν ἐὰν μέν τις τῶν κατηγορουμένων ἔξαρνος γένηται τῇ φωνῇ μὴ εἶναι φήσας, ἀφίετε αὐτὸν ὡς μηδὲν ἐλέγχειν ἔχοντες ἁμαρτάνοντα, ἐὰν δέ τις ὁμολογήσῃ εἶναι, διὰ τὴν ὁμολογίαν κολάζετε· δέον καὶ τὸν τοῦ ὁμολογοῦντος βίον εὐθύνειν καὶ τὸν τοῦ ἀρνουμένου, ὅπως διὰ τῶν πράξεων ὁποῖός ἐστιν ἕκαστος φαίνηται.* Athenag. 2 p. 3^{bc} *καὶ γὰρ οὐ πρὸς τῆς ὑμετέρας δικαιοσύνης τοὺς μὲν ἄλλους, αἰτίαν λαβόντας ἀδικημάτων, μὴ πρότερον ἢ ἐλεγχθῆναι κολάζεσθαι, ἐφ᾽ ἡμῶν δὲ μεῖζον ἰσχύειν τὸ ὄνομα τῶν ἐπὶ τῇ δίκῃ ἐλέγχων, οὐκ εἰ ἠδίκησέ τι ὁ κρινόμενος τῶν δικαζόντων ἐπιζητούντων, ἀλλ᾽ εἰς τὸ ὄνομα ὡς εἰς ἀδίκημα ἐνυβριζόντων. οὐδὲν δὲ ὄνομα ἐφ᾽ ἑαυτοῦ καὶ δι᾽ αὑτοῦ οὔτε πονηρὸν οὔτε χρηστὸν νομίζεται, διὰ δὲ τὰς ὑποκειμένας αὐτοῖς ἢ πονηρὰς ἢ ἀγαθὰς πράξεις ἢ φλαῦρα ἢ ἀγαθὰ δοκεῖ.*

p. 6 l. 21 NON STATIM CONFESSO EO NOMEN HOMICIDAE VEL SACRILEGI...CONTENTI SITIS AD PRONVNTIANDVM cet. Tatian 27 pr. p. 164^{a} *πῶς γὰρ οὐκ ἄτοπον τὸν μὲν λῃστὴν διὰ τὸ ἐπικατηγορούμενον ὄνομα μὴ κολάζειν, πρὶν ἂν τἀληθὲς ἐπ᾽ ἀκριβείᾳ καταμανθάνειν, ἡμᾶς δὲ προλήμματι λοιδορίας ἀνεξετάστῳ μεμισηκέναι;* Lact. V 1 § 2 *ab hoc* <the pagan reader> *tamen si fieri potest humanitatis iure postulamus, ut non prius damnet quam uniuersa cognouerit. nam si* sacrilegis *et proditoribus et ueneficis potestas defendendi sui datur nec praedamnari*

quemquam incognita causa licet, non iniuste petere uidemur, ut si quis erit ille qui inciderit in haec, si leget, perlegat, si audiet, sententiam differat in extremum.

p. 6 l. 22 PVBLICI HOSTIS cf. below in this chapter p. 8 l. 14 *in reos maiestatis et* publicos hostes *omnis homo miles est.* c. 35 pr. p. 102 l. 10 *propterea igitur* publici hostes *Christiani, quia imperatoribus neque uanos neque mentientes neque temerarios honores dicant.*

p. 6 l. 23 ELOGIIS 24 m. p. 84 l. 28. de cor. 5 f. Oehler. Neumann der röm. Staat u. d. allg. Kirche I (Leipz. 1890) 33 n. 1.

p. 6 l. 27 INFANTICIDIA...INCESTA Minuc. 28 § 2 *et nos enim idem fecimus et eadem uobiscum quondam adhuc caeci et hebetes sentiebamus, quasi Christiani monstra colerent,* infantes uorarent, conuiuia incesta miscerent; *nec intellegebamus fabulas istas semper uentilari et numquam uel inuestigari uel probari, nec tanto tempore aliquem exsistere qui proderet, non tantum facti ueniam, uerum etiam indicii gratiam consecuturum.* Iustin. apol. I 26 p. 70[bc] (cf. Otto n. 14 on c. 10 f. p. 58[d]), speaking of Gnostics (cf. Otto n. 30) *εἰ δὲ καὶ τὰ δύσφημα ἐκεῖνα μυθολογούμενα ἔργα πράττουσι, λυχνίας μὲν ἀνατροπὴν καὶ τὰς ἀνέδην μίξεις καὶ ἀνθρωπείων σαρκῶν βοράς, οὐ γινώσκομεν.* cf. c. 29 pr. p. 71[c] *ἡ ἀνέδην μίξις.* Tat. 25 fin. p. 163[d] *παρ' ἡμῖν οὐκ ἔστιν ἀνθρωποφαγία.* 32 p. 167[b] *τὰ δὲ τῆς ἀσελγείας πόρρω κεχώρισται.* Athenag. 3 pr. p. 4[c] *τρία ἐπιφημίζουσιν ἡμῖν ἐγκλήματα, ἀθεότητα, Θυεστεῖα δεῖπνα, Οἰδιποδείους μίξεις* (cf. Otto n. 1). 31 pr. p. 34[d] (Otto n. 1). Theophil. ad Autol. speaks of cannibalism III 3 p. 118[d]. 4 p. 119[b] (Otto n. 4). 5 p. 119[c]—120[d]. 8 p. 122[c]. 15 p. 126[d]; of incest 3 p. 118[d]. 4 p. 119[b]. 6 p. 120[a—d]. 8 p. 122[c]. 15 p. 126[d]; retorting the charges on gods and philosophers. In the persecution at Lugudunum some heathen slaves, from fear of torture (Eus. h. e. V 1 § 14), *κατεψεύσαντο ἡμῶν Θυέστεια δεῖπνα καὶ Οἰδιποδείους μίξεις.* Byblias, who had denied the faith, recovered her constancy on the rack, asking (ibid. §§ 25 26) *πῶς ἂν παιδία φάγοιεν οἱ τοιοῦτοι, οἷς μηδὲ ἀλόγων ζῴων αἷμα φαγεῖν ἐξόν;* A.D. 311, under Maximin (Eus. h. e. IX 5 § 2), the commandant of the garrison at Damascus compelled prostitutes to confess that they had once

been Christians, *συνειδεῖεν τε αὐτοῖς ἀθεμιτουργίας, ἐν αὐτοῖς τε τοῖς κυριακοῖς πράττειν αὐτοὺς τὰ ἀκόλαστα.* Origen c. Cels. VI 27 f. 40 pr. traces these calumnies to the Jews: in his day most even of the heathen refused to credit them. cf. Lightfoot Ignatius I pp. 52 53. On the chastity of Christians cf. Tert. c. 38 f. p. 110 l. 18. 39 p. 112 l. 34.

p. 6 l. 31 PLINIVS cf. Eus. h. e. III 33. My Bibliographical Clue to Latin Literature pp. 146—7 gives the literature on Plin. ep. 96—97 up to 1875. Add Renan les évangiles 469—484 and in Journ. des Sav. 1876 p. 725 seq. Keim Rom und das Christenthum Berlin 1881 512—8 and ind. s. v. Plinius. Boissier Les Chrétiens devant la législation rom. (Rev. d. Deux Mondes 13 Apr. 1876), and on the authenticity of Pliny's letter and the earliest persecutions id. in Rev. Archéol. 1876 Febr. and June. J. Variot, Les Lettres de Pline le jeune, correspondance avec Trajan relativement aux Chrétiens de Pont et de Bithynie (Rev. des Questions Historiques, July 1878, pp. 80—153) and id. De Plinio iuniore et imperatore Traiano apud Christianos et de Christianis apud Plinium iuniorem et imperatorem Traianum. Par. 1878. 8vo. Arnold Studien zur Geschichte der Plinianischen Christenverfolgung. 1877. My notes in Classical Review IV (1890) 121—3. Lightfoot Ignatius I pp. 50—56: pp. 57—62 comment on Tert. h. l. and Eus. For other works of Overbeck, Aubé, Allard, see Holzmann and Zöpffel, Lex. f. Theologie[2], Braunschweig, 1888, s.v. Christenverfolgungen. See esp. K. J. Neumann der röm. Staat u. die allg. Kirche bis auf Diocletian I (Leipzig 1890) 17—33. [W. M. Ramsay Church in the Roman Empire (London 1893) chap. X; E. G. Hardy Studies in Roman History (London 1906) chap. VI. A.S.]

p. 8 l. 3 OBSTINATIONEM c. 50 f. p. 146 l. 4 *illa ipsa* obstinatio, *quam exprobratis, magistra est.*

p. 8 l. 9 NEGAT INQVIRENDOS VT INNOCENTES Blunt Right Use 348. Mommsen, Strafr. 313 3. Harnack Gesch. d. altchr. Lit. (1893) I 866. Hadrian ep. ad Minucium Fundanum A.D. 125 according to Clinton, or A.D. 126 (Haenel corpus legum, Lips. 1857, pp. 86 87), the substance of which is given by Oros. VII 13 § 2 *praecepit per epistulam ad Minucium Fundanum*

proconsule Asiae datum, ut nemini liceret Christianos sine obiectu criminis aut probatione damnare. On the question of authenticity see Otto on Iustin. apol. I 69 p. 99[d] n. 1. Lightfoot Ignatius I[1] 442, 460—4. 522 where he (after Rigault) finds an allusion to Hadrian's rescript to Fundanus in the *mandatum* of Tertull. ad Scap. 4 (p. 547 l. 1) *Pudens etiam missum ad se Christianum in elogio concussione eius intellecta dimisit, scisso eodem elogio, sine accusatore negans se auditurum hominem secundum mandatum.* Melito apol. to Marcus Aurelius (Eus. h. e. IV 26 § 10) says of Antoninus Pius *ὁ δὲ πατήρ σου...ταῖς πόλεσι περὶ τοῦ μηδὲν νεωτερίζειν περὶ ἡμῶν ἔγραψεν* (cf. Lightfoot l. c. p. 443). Athenag. 3 p. 4[d] (to Marcus Aurelius and Commodus) *καὶ τοῦ μηδὲν τούτων ἀδικεῖν ὑμεῖς μάρτυρες, κελεύοντες μὴ μηνύειν· πρὸς ὑμῶν λοιπὸν ἐξέτασιν ποιήσασθαι βίου, δογμάτων, τῆς πρὸς ὑμᾶς καὶ τὸν ὑμέτερον οἶκον καὶ τὴν βασιλείαν σπουδῆς καὶ ὑπακοῆς.* Under Commodus (Eus. h. e. V 21 § 3) the accuser of Apollonius had his legs broken by sentence of Perennius.

p. 8 l. 13 LATRONIBVS cet. Dio LXXVI 10. Mommsen Strafrecht 312 1, 307 2.

p. 8 l. 15 SOCIOS cet. Mommsen röm. Strafrecht 91 2, 98 3—4.

p. 8 l. 22 CETERIS NEGANTIBVS TORMENTA ADHIBETIS AD CONFITENDVM, SOLIS CHRISTIANIS AD NEGANDVM ad Scap. 4 pr. p. 546 l. 4 *quid enim amplius tibi mandatur, quam* nocentes confessos damnare, negantes autem ad tormenta reuocare? *uidetis ergo, quomodo ipsi uos contra mandata faciatis,* ut confessos negare cogatis. *adeo confitemini innocentes esse nos, quos damnare statim ex confessione non uultis.* Cypr. ad Demetrian. 13 pr. (p. 360 16) *quin potius elege tibi alterum de duobus: Christianum esse aut est crimen aut non est.* si crimen est, quid non interficis confitentem? si crimen non est, quid persequeris innocentem? torqueri enim debui, si negarem. *si poenam tuam metuens id quod prius fueram et quod deos tuos non colueram mendacio fallente celarem, tunc torquendus fuissem, tunc* ad confessionem criminis cum ui doloris adigendus, sicut in quaestionibus ceteris torquentur rei qui se negant crimine quo accusantur

teneri, *ut facinoris ueritas quae indice uoce non promitur dolore corporis exprimatur. nunc uero* cum sponte confitear et clamem et crebris et repetitis identidem uocibus Christianum me esse contester, quid tormenta admoues confitenti, *et deos tuos non in abditis et secretis locis sed palam, sed publice, sed in foro ipso magistratibus et praesidibus audientibus destruenti?* Ambr. de Cain et Abel II 9 § 27 *in iudiciis saecularibus impositi eculeo torquentur negantes, et quaedam tangit iudicem miseratio confitentis...mitigat iudicem pudor reorum, excitat autem pertinacia denegantium.*

p. 10 l. 4 SI NON ITA AGITIS CIRCA NOS NOCENTES c. 6 p. 22 l. 10 circa *feminas quidem etiam illa maiorum instituta ceciderunt.* ibid. p. 22 l. 23 *etiam* circa *ipsos deos uestros quae prospecte decreuerant patres uestri.* Often in Quintil., the two Plinys, Tac., Suet. Burman on Quintil. decl. I § 7 *quid* circa *te pecunia potest?* 4 § 7 *affectus* circa *liberos.* Dräger hist. Synt. I 576.

p. 10 l. 8 VOCIFERATVR HOMO: CHRISTIANVS SVM c. 21 p. m. p. 74 l. 10 *dicimus, et palam dicimus, et uobis torquentibus lacerati et cruenti* uociferamur. *Deum colimus per Christum.* de corona mil. 1 p. 416 l. 2 *statim tribunus 'cur' inquit 'tam diuersus habitus?' negauit ille sibi cum ceteris licere. causas expostulatus* 'Christianus sum' *respondit.* Scorpiace c. 9 the latter half (e.g. p. 164 l. 17 Wiss. *qui se Christianum confitetur, Christi se esse testatur*). passio Perpetuae 6 (p. 70 l. 16 Robinson) *Hilarianus* <procurator> 'Christiana es?' *inquit. et ego respondi* 'Christiana sum.' acta mart. Scillit. p. 114 l. 11—23 ed. Robinson. Iustin. apol. II 2 p. 42^{cde}. 43^{a}. acta Iustini c. 3 f. 4 (the whole). 5 f. *ὡσαύτως δὲ καὶ οἱ λοιποὶ μάρτυρες εἶπον· 'ποίει ὃ θέλεις. ἡμεῖς γὰρ Χριστιανοί ἐσμεν καὶ εἰδώλοις οὐ θύομεν.'* Theophil. ad Autol. I 1 p. 69^{b} *ἔτι δὲ φὴς με Χριστιανὸν ὡς κακὸν τοὔνομα φοροῦντα, ἐγὼ μὲν οὖν ὁμολογῶ εἶναι Χριστιανός, καὶ φορῶ τὸ θεοφιλὲς ὄνομα τοῦτο ἐλπίζων εὔχρηστος εἶναι τῷ θεῷ.* So the Gallic martyrs Eus. h. e. V 1 § 19 (Blandina). § 20 (Sanctus) *πρὸς πάντα τὰ ἐπερωτώμενα ἀπεκρίνατο τῇ Ῥωμαϊκῇ φωνῇ 'Χριστιανός εἰμι.'* § 26 (Byblias). VIII 3 § 3 (under Diocletian) *ἄλλος Χριστιανὸς εἶναι ἐκεκράγει, τῇ τοῦ σωτηρίου προσ-*

ῥήματος ὁμολογίᾳ λαμπρυνόμενος. Eus. mart. Pal. 3 § 3. acta Felicis (ad calc. Optati, ed. Du Pin, Par. 1702) p. 147 col. 1 med. *cui Anulinus proconsul dixit 'quod tibi nomen est?' Felix episcopus dixit* 'Christianus sum.' *Anulinus proconsul dixit 'non te de uocabulo quaesiui professionis, sed percunctatus sum quo nomine nuncuperis.' Felix episcopus dixit 'sicut tibi iam dixi, hoc nunc et iterum dico, quia* Christianus sum *et episcopus.'* Cf. acta Saturnini cet. c. 4 seq. (ibid. p. 151 col. 2 f. seq.) often. acta Eupli (p. 438 Ruinart). Lucifer Calar. moriendum esse pro Dei filio 2 (p. 287 12 Hartel) *cernimus una hac uoce religiosa* 'Christianus sum, *nolo esse ut tu es, Constantius, apostata' omne crimen excludi...et tu inquis* 'negate uos Christianos.' Victor Vitens. III § 50 (= V 14) *infantulo* clamante *ut poterat:* 'Christianus sum, Christianus sum, *per sanctum Stephanum* Christianus sum.' Rufin. h. e. VII 12 p. 415. VIII 3 p. 467.

p. 10 l. 9 VERITATIS EXTORQVENDAE PRAESIDES (Kaye p. 48) DE NOBIS SOLIS MENDACIVM ELABORATIS AVDIRE Minuc. 28 § 3 *nos* <i.e. while yet heathens> *tamen cum sacrilegos aliquos et incestos, parricidas etiam defendendos et tuendos suscipiebamus, hos nec audiendos in totum putabamus, nonnumquam etiam miserantes eorum crudelius saeuiebamus,* ut torqueremus confitentes ad negandum, *uidelicet ne perirent, exercentes in his peruersam quaestionem* non quae uerum erueret, sed quae mendacium cogeret. Justin cited on p. 6 l. 19.

p. 10 l. 14 NE QVA VIS LATEAT IN OCCVLTO the Evil Spirit infr. p. 12 l. 7 *quaedam ratio aemulae operationis.* cf. c. 22. 27 p. 92 l. 17 *ille scilicet spiritus daemoniacae et angelicae paraturae, qui noster ob diuortium aemulus et ob Dei gratiam inuidus de mentibus uestris aduersus nos proeliatur* occulta inspiratione *modulatis.* c. 32. Iustin. apol. I 5.

p. 10 l. 15 QVAE VOS ADVERSVS FORMAM...IVDICANDI CONTRA IPSAS QVOQVE LEGES MINISTRET cf. c. 21 p. 70 l. 27 *elementa ipsa* famularet. de carne Christi 12 (II p. 447 l. ult.) *sine qua notitia sui nulla anima* se ministrare *potuisset.* The usual sense of *ministro* (*uiros, uires animumque* cet.) may hold here: 'without self-knowledge no soul could have rendered its

services'; and in the text: 'this mysterious power makes tools of you, lends your services.'

p. 10 l. 24 DEBITO POENAE NOCENS EXPVNGENDVS EST, NON EXIMENDVS *eximere* (cf. exemption) is the office of mercy, *expungere* of justice (the full satisfaction of all claims). c. 15 f. *libidinem.* c. 20 f. (of time). c. 21 p. 70 l. 15 of the first advent 'iam expunctus est' (fulfilled in every predicted detail). c. 35 p. 102 l. 22 (with Oehler's note) *cur enim uota et gaudia Caesarum casti et sobrii et probi* expungimus? cf. c. 44 pr. *qui sententiis elogia* dispungitis (clear off the police sheet by sentencing the accused to their several punishments). de orat. 9 pr. (p. 187 l. 1 Wiss.) *quot simul* expunguntur *officia*! de corona mil. 1 pr. (I p. 416, with Oehler's note) *liberalitas praestantissimorum imperatorum* expungebatur *in castris.* de an. 35 pr. (p. 360 l. 9 Wiss.). 55 pr. (p. 387 l. 25) *Christo in corde terrae triduum mortis legimus* expunctum. adu. Marc. II 20 f. p. 363 l. 24 Kr. *suum populum in tempore expeditionis* < of the Exodus > *aliquo solacio tacitae compensationis* expunxit. III. 5 (p. 382 l. 6 Kr.) *et diuinationi propheticae magis familiare est id quod prospiciat, dum prospicit, iam uisum atque ita iam* expunctum, *id est omni modo futurum, demonstrare.* 12 (p. 395 l. 24 Kr.). 17 (p. 405 six lines from end of ch.). 20 pr. (p. 410 l. 12 Kr.). 23 pr. (p. 417 l. 3 Kr.). 24 a.m. (p. 419 l. 28 Kr.). IV 16 (p. 471 l. 22 Kr.) *coepit* expungi *quod dictum est per Osee.* 20 a.m. (p. 484 l. 16 Kr.) *nam cum transfretat, psalmus* expungitur (cf. c. 40 p. 559 l. 11 Kr.)...*cum undas freti discutit, Abacuc* adimpletur. 22 p.m. (p. 495 l. 20 Kr.). 29 a.m. (p. 520 l. 23 Kr.) *ut quod supra distuli* expunxerim. 34 p.m. (p. 537 l. 12 Kr.) *donec consummatio rerum resurrectionem omnium plenitudine mercedis* expungat. 39 prope f. (p. 558 l. 3) *si quae a Creatore sunt, merito sustinebunt elementa domini sui ordinem* expungi, *si quae a Deo optimo, nescio an sustineat caelum et terra* perfici *quae aemulus statuit.* V 7 f. (p. 596 l. 22).

p. 10 l. 27 CHRISTIANVM HOMINEM OMNIVM SCELERVM REVM...EXISTIMAS, ET COGIS NEGARE, VT ABSOLVAS *et* 'and yet' c. 37 (p. 108 l. 9) *hesterni sumus* et *uestra omnia impleuimus.* Iuu. VII 124 n. XIII 91 n. Holden on Minuc. 12 § 2. 24 § 2.

p. 12 l. 7 NOMEN, QVOD QVAEDAM RATIO AEMVLAE OPERATIONIS INSEQVITVR, HOC PRIMVM AGENS, VT HOMINES NOLINT SCIRE PRO CERTO QVOD SE NESCIRE PRO CERTO SCIVNT Iustin. apol. I 5 pr. (p. 55[d]) τί δὴ τοῦτ᾽ ἂν εἴη; ἐφ᾽ ἡμῶν, ὑπισχνουμένων μηδὲν ἀδικεῖν μηδὲ τὰ ἄθεα ταῦτα δοξάζειν, οὐ κρίσεις ἐξετάζετε, ἀλλ᾽ ἀλόγῳ πάθει καὶ μάστιγι δαιμόνων φαύλων ἐξελαυνόμενοι, ἀκρίτως κολάζετε μὴ φροντίζοντες. Tert. apol. c. 5 (p. 20 l. 6) *tales semper nobis* insecutores. 21 (p. 72 l. 32) *a Iudaeis* insequentibus *multa perpessi*. c. 50 pr. (p. 142) '*ergo*' *inquitis* '*cur querimini quod uos* insequamur?' In Tert. de an. 20 *Deus dominus* is opposed to *diabolus aemulus*.

p. 12 l. 13 IDEO TORQVEMVR CONFITENTES....ET ABSOLVIMVR NEGANTES, QVIA NOMINIS PROELIVM EST Orig. c. Cels. II 13 (p. 68) Christians alone punished for opinions. Epicureans overthrow providence, Peripatetics deny the efficacy of prayer, and are unmolested. It may be said that Samaritans are persecuted for religion. No, the Sicarii are put to death for practising circumcision, a rite allowed to Jews alone. καὶ οὐκ ἔστιν ἀκοῦσαι δικαστοῦ πυνθανομένου, εἰ κατὰ τήνδε τὴν νομιζομένην θεοσέβειαν ὁ Σικάριος ἀγωνιζόμενος βιοῦν, μεταθέμενος μὲν ἀπολυθήσεται, ἐμμένων δὲ τὴν ἐπὶ θανάτῳ ἀπαχθήσεται. ἀλλὰ γὰρ ἀρκεῖ δειχθεῖσα ἡ περιτομὴ πρὸς ἀναίρεσιν τοῦ πεπονθότος αὐτήν. Tert. Scorpiace 11 pr. *ipsi denique praesides cum cohortantur* negationi: '*serua animam tuam*,' *dicunt, et* '*noli animam tuam perdere*.'

p. 12 l. 16 SI HOMICIDA CHRISTIANVS, CVR NON ET INCESTVS VEL QVODCVNQVE ALIVD ESSE NOS CREDITIS? 1 Pet. 2 12. 3 16. 4 14.

p. 12 l. 19 CHRISTIANVS SI NVLLIVS CRIMINIS REVS EST, NOMEN VALDE INCESTVM, SI SOLIVS NOMINIS CRIMEN EST pat. 2 *ingratissimas nationes, ludibria artium et opera manuum suarum adorantes, nomen cum familia ipsius* <Dei> *persequentes*. Athenag. 1 p. 2[b] ὑμῖν δὲ (καὶ μὴ παρακρουσθῆτε ὡς οἱ πολλοὶ ἐξ ἀκοῆς) τὸ ὄνομα τί ἀπεχθάνεται; οὐ γὰρ τὰ ὀνόματα μίσους ἄξια, ἀλλὰ τὸ ἀδίκημα δίκης καὶ τιμωρίας. ibid.[c] ἐπὶ μόνῳ ὀνόματι προσπολεμούντων ἡμῖν τῶν πολλῶν. cf. c. 2. Arnob. II 1 pr. *quid causae est quod tam grauibus*

insectamini Christum bellis, uel quas eius continetis offensas, ut ad eius nominis *mentionem rabidorum pectorum efferuescatis ardoribus?* With Tert. c. 2—4 cf. Iustin. apol. I 4.

Cap. III

p. 12 l. 22 VT BONVM ALICVI TESTIMONIVM FERENTES ADMISCEANT NOMINIS EXPROBRATIONEM innocence of Christians c. 45 pr. Iustin. apol. I 14 15. Lact. III 26. ep. ad Diognet. c. 5 6. Semisch Justin. II 191 seq. Neander I (1)[2] 428 seq.

p. 12 l. 23 GAÏVS SEIVS...LVCIVM TITIVM Iuu. IV 13 n.

p. 12 l. 25 NEMO RETRACTAT, NE IDEO BONVS GAÏVS..., QVIA CHRISTIANVS on *ne* (= $\mu\acute{\eta}$) see Oehler on c. 2 p. 121 n. x. adu. Marc. V 16 (p. 631 l. 6 Kr.) *secundum uero Marcionem nescio* ne *sit Christus creatoris.* Rönsch Itala u. Vulgata 400. Gesta apud Zenophilum (Routh reliq. sacr. IV[2] 325 l. 4 and 7) *quaere* ne *plus habeatis...quaere,* ne *plus habeat.* Aug. de peccato originali 17 § 18 *quis enim scit,* ne *forte det illis Deus paenitentiam!* Aug. c. D. I 28 pr. (I 44 14 Dombart) *interrogate fideliter animas uestras,* ne *forte de isto integritatis...bono uos inflatius extulistis.* Irenaeus V 30 3 *ut ex multis colligamus* ne *forte Titan uocetur.* Hermes XXV 124 l. 2 *interrogari* ne. Greg. dial. III 37 (p. 361[ab] Ben.) *asperit* ne. Victor Vitens. III § 50 (= V 14) *cogitauit impietas Ariana a parentibus paruulos filios separare,* ne *posset per pietatis affectum etiam uirtutem prosternere genitorum.*

p. 12 l. 31 EX IPSO DENOTANT QVOD LAVDANT *quam lasciua! quam festiua! quam amasius!* meant as praise by the heathen, sound in Christian ears as a reproach.

p. 14 l. 2 FACTI SVNT CHRISTIANI de cult. fem. II 11 f. (I 731) *grandis blasphemia est, ex qua dicatur: 'ex quo* facta est Christiana *pauperius incedit.'*

p. 14 l. 2 ITA NOMEN EMENDATIONI IMPVTATVR 'thus reform is taxed with the name.' Those who are no longer giddy, are charged with the name of Christian as a crime.

p. 14 l. 3 NONNVLLI ETIAM DE VTILITATIBVS SVIS CVM ODIO ISTO PACISCVNTVR they sacrifice their interests to this hatred, make a bargain with this hatred at the cost of their interests.

c. 50 p. 144 l. 4 *omitto eos qui* cum *gladio proprio uel alio genere mortis mitiore* de *laude* pepigerunt.

p. 14 l. 5 VXOREM IAM PVDICAM MARITVS IAM NON ZELOTYPVS...ABDICAVIT ad nat. I 4 p. 64 l. 24 Wiss. *scio maritum unum atque alium, anxium retro de uxoris suae moribus, qui ne mures quidem in cubiculum inrepentes sine gemitu suspicionis sustinebat, comperta causa nouae sedulitatis et inusitatae captiuitatis omnem uxori patientiam obtulisse*[1], *negasse* <se> zelotypum, *maluisse* <se> *lupae quam Christianae maritum: ipsi suam licuit in peruersum demutare naturam, mulieri non permisit in melius reformari.* cf. ad uxor. II 7. See the story of a reformed wife denounced as a Christian by her husband (Iustin. apol. II 2 p. 41^{e} seq.). cf. what follows here and ad nat. about the son abdicated (the rhetoricians *passim.* Quintil. VII 4 §§ 26 27) and the slave sent on the land. Blunt Right Use 376—7. Kaye 130—1.

p. 14 l. 7 SERVVM IAM FIDELEM DOMINVS OLIM MITIS AB OCVLIS RELEGAVIT de idolol. 17 pr. (p. 50 l. 10 Wiss.) *ceterum quid facient* serui *uel* liberti *fideles, item officiales sacrificantibus dominis uel patronis uel praesidibus suis adhaerentes? sed si merum quis sacrificanti tradiderit, immo si uerbo quoque aliquo sacrificio necessario adiuuerit, minister habebitur idololatriae.* cf. Blunt Right Use 378. Slaves sent into the country as a punishment Iuu. VIII 180 n. Journal of Philology XX 279 280. Petron. 69 *sic me saluum habeatis, ut ego sic solebam ipsumam meam debattuere, ut etiam dominus suspicaretur; et ideo me* in uilicationem relegauit.

p. 14 l. 9 NVNC IGITVR, SI NOMINIS ODIVM EST, QVIS NOMINVM REATVS? cet. cf. n. on p. 6 l. 19 and 21. Iustin. apol. I 7 f. (p. 56^{e}) *ὅθεν πάντων τῶν καταγγελλομένων ὑμῖν τὰς πράξεις κρίνεσθαι ἀξιοῦμεν, ἵνα ὁ ἐλεγχθεὶς ὡς ἄδικος κολάζηται, ἀλλὰ μὴ ὡς Χριστιανός· ἐὰν δέ τις ἀνέλεγκτος φαίνηται, ἀπολύηται ὡς Χριστιανὸς οὐδὲν ἀδικῶν.* Athenag. 2 (p. 3^{d}) *τὸ τοίνυν πρὸς ἅπαντας ἴσον καὶ ἡμεῖς ἀξιοῦμεν, μὴ ὅτι Χριστιανοὶ λεγόμεθα μισεῖσθαι καὶ κολάζεσθαι (τί γὰρ ἡμῖν τὸ ὄνομα πρὸς κακίαν τελεῖ;) ἀλλὰ κρίνεσθαι ἐφ᾽ ὅτων ἂν καὶ εὐθύνῃ*

[1] Oehler strangely: 'omnem u. p. o.] h. e. repudium scripsisse.' Rather, 'offered to wink at every infidelity.'

τις, καὶ ἢ ἀφίεσθαι ἀπολυομένους τῆς κατηγορίας ἢ κολάζεσθαι τοὺς ἁλισκομένους πονηρούς, μὴ ἐπὶ τῷ ὀνόματι (οὐδεὶς γὰρ Χριστιανὸς πονηρός, εἰ μὴ ὑποκρίνεται τὸν λόγον), ἐπὶ δὲ τῷ ἀδικήματι. Iren. I 24 § 6 *ne pati quidem propter nomen possunt.* Tert. de idol. 14 *totus circus scelestis suffragiis nullo merito* nomen *lacessit.*

p. 14 l. 10 QVAE ACCVSATIO VOCABVLORVM, NISI SI AVT BARBARVM SONAT ALIQVA VOX NOMINIS AVT INFAVSTVM AVT MALEDICVM AVT IMPVDICVM? Quintil. X 1 § 9 n. *omnibus fere uerbis praeter pauca, quae sunt parum uerecunda, in oratione locus est.* XI 1 § 60 *esse in uerbis quod deceat aut turpe sit nemini dubium est.* Liu. XXVIII 28 § 4 Atrium *Vmbrum semilixam,* nominis *etiam* abominandi *ducem.* cf. Lips. on Tac. h. IV 53. Lobeck on Soph. Ai. 430. Valckenaer on Eur. Phoen. 639. Elmsley on Eur. Ba. 508. Stanley on Aesch. Ag. 690. Victorius uar. lect. XXXVI 24. Columna on Enn. Androm. p. 240 ed. ult. Spalding on Quintil. V 10 § 31. Aristot. rhet. II 23 § 20 p. 1440 b 18 seq. with Cope's n. *nomen omen.*

p. 14 l. 12 CHRISTIANVS VERO, QVANTVM INTERPRETATIO EST, DE VNCTIONE DEDVCITVR adu. Marc. IV 14 f. (p. 463 l. 2 Kr.) *nomen Christianorum, utique a Christo deductum.* Theophil. ad Autol. I 12 pr. (p. 77^b with Otto n. 1) *περὶ δὲ τοῦ καταγελᾶν μου, καλοῦντά με Χριστιανόν, οὐκ οἶδας ὃ λέγεις. πρῶτον μὲν ὅτι τὸ χριστὸν ἡδὺ καὶ εὔχρηστον καὶ ἀκαταγέλαστόν ἐστιν.* ibid. fin. *τοιγαροῦν ἡμεῖς τούτου εἵνεκεν καλούμεθα Χριστιανοὶ ὅτι χριόμεθα ἔλαιον θεοῦ.* Iustin. apol. I 12 p. 60^a. II 6 p. 44^e. dial. 63 p. 287^b. 64 pr. p. 287^c. 117 p. 345^b. Lact. IV 7 §§ 6 7. Pearson on the Creed (Cambr. 1882) 175 seq.

p. 14 l. 13 PERPERAM CHRESTIANVS PRONVNTIATVR A VOBIS the evidence is collected by Pearson on the Creed art. 2 (Cambr. 1882 pp. 151—2). See Iustin. apol. I 4 p. 54^d. 55^a. 46 p. 83^d. Theophil. ad Autol. I 1 p. 69^b. Clem. Al. str. II § 18 p. 438 P. Lact. IV 7 § 4 *nam Christus non proprium nomen est, sed nuncupatio potestatis et regni: sic enim Iudaei reges suos appellabant.* § 5 *sed exponenda huius nominis ratio est propter ignorantium errorem, qui eum immutata littera Chrestum solent dicere.* See Bünemann there. [Add inscriptions edited by J. G. C. Anderson in Studies in the History and Art of the Eastern Provinces of

the Roman Empire (Aberdeen 1906) pp. 215 ff. Selections from the Greek Papyri by G. Milligan (Cambr. 1910) p. 113. A.S.] It is very doubtful whether the *impulsor Chrestus* (Suet. Claud. 25) can denote Christ. See Herm. Schiller Gesch. d. röm. Kaiserzeit I 447 n. 6.

p. 14 l. 16 and 17 ODITVR Neue Formenlehre III^{3} 643. Georges Lexikon der lat. Wortformen. Hartel's ind. to Lucifer Calar. *coniugatio* p. 356 col. 2. Rönsch Itala u. Vulgata 283.

p. 14 l. 17 QVID NOVI, SI ALIQVA DISCIPLINA DE MAGISTRO COGNOMENTVM SECTATORIBVS SVIS INDVCIT? NONNE PHILOSOPHI DE AVCTORIBVS SVIS NVNCVPANTVR PLATONICI, EPICVREI, PYTHAGORICI? Iustin. dial. 2 p. 218^{c}—219^{c}. 35 p. 253^{d}—254^{a}. Clem. Al. str. VII § 108 p. 900 P. Epiphan. haer. XLVIII 14.

p. 14 l. 22 COCI ETIAM AB APICIO Iuu. IV 23 n. pp. 221, 396. Tert. de pall. 5 f. (I p. 954) *taceo Nerones et* Apicios *et Rufos.* Friedländer Sittengeschichte II^{5} 622—629 shows that artists, dancers, athletes cet. assumed the names of famous predecessors.

p. 14 l. 23 NEC TAMEN QVEMQVAM OFFENDIT PROFESSIO NOMINIS CVM INSTITVTIONE TRANSMISSA AB INSTITVTORE on the impunity of philosophers see c. 48 49. Iustin. apol. I 4 fin. p. 55^{c}. 26 f. p. 70^{b} *πάντες οἱ ἀπὸ τούτων* <gnostics> *ὁρμώμενοι, ὡς ἔφημεν, Χριστιανοὶ καλοῦνται, ὃν τρόπον καὶ οἱ οὐ κοινωνοῦντες τῶν αὐτῶν δογμάτων ἐν τοῖς φιλοσόφοις τὸ ἐπικαλούμενον ὄνομα τῆς φιλοσοφίας κοινὸν ἔχουσιν. εἰ δὲ καὶ τὰ δύσφημα ἐκεῖνα μυθολογούμενα ἔργα πράττουσι, λυχνίας μὲν ἀνατροπὴν καὶ τὰς ἀνέδην μίξεις καὶ ἀνθρωπείων σαρκῶν βοράς, οὐ γινώσκομεν· ἀλλ' ὅτι μὴ διώκονται μηδὲ φονεύονται ὑφ' ὑμῶν, κἂν διὰ τὰ δόγματα, ἐπιστάμεθα.* Orig. c. Cels. II 13 p. 68 *διὰ ποῖον γὰρ δόγμα τῶν ἐν ἀνθρώποις γεγενημένων κολάζονται καὶ ἄλλοι, ὅτι ὁρῶν τὰ ἀσεβῆ ἢ τὰ ψευδῆ τῶν δογμάτων κατηγορούμενα, ἔδοξε καὶ τοῦτο σεμνύνειν διὰ τοῦ προλέγειν δῆθεν περὶ αὐτοῦ; κ.τ.λ.* Philosophy does not in fact lack martyrs and confessors, an Anaxagoras, a Socrates, a Musonius, and had much to fear from the Roman government and from the mob Luc. Alex. 45 *ὁ δὲ Ἀλέξανδρος ἀγανακτήσας ἐπὶ τῷ ἐλέγχῳ καὶ μὴ φέρων τοῦ ὀνείδους τὴν ἀλήθειαν ἐκέλευε τοὺς παρόντας λίθοις βάλλειν αὐτὸν ἢ καὶ αὐτοὺς ἐναγεῖς ἔσεσθαι καὶ Ἐπικουρείους κληθήσεσθαι.* 46 f. *ἔδει γῆν πρὸ γῆς ἐλαύνεσθαι ὡς ἀσεβῆ καὶ ἄθεον καὶ*

'Επικούρειον, ἥπερ ἦν ἡ μεγίστη λοιδορία. 47 Alexander burnt publicly the *κύριαι δόξαι* of Epicurus, and flung the ashes into the sea. cf. 25. 43. 44. His proclamation (c. 38) '*εἴ τις ἄθεος ἢ Χριστιανὸς ἢ Ἐπικούρειος ἥκει κατάσκοπος τῶν ὀργίων, φευγέτω. οἱ δὲ πιστεύοντες τῷ θεῷ τελείσθωσαν τύχῃ τῇ ἀγαθῇ.*' *καὶ ὁ μὲν ἡγεῖτο λέγων* '*ἔξω Χριστιανούς,*' *τὸ δὲ πλῆθος ἅπαν ἐπεφθέγγετο* '*ἔξω Ἐπικουρείους.*'

p. 14 l. 29 IGNOTAM SECTAM, IGNOTVM ET AVCTOREM VOX SOLA PRAEDAMNAT, QVIA NOMINANTVR, NON QVIA REVINCVNTVR cf. Iustin. apol. I 4. II 2 p. 42[c] seq.

Cap. IV

p. 14 l. 33 IAM DE CAVSA INNOCENTIAE CONSISTAM 'to join issue.' exx. in Dirksen manuale under *consistere* n. 2 'iudicio congredi, actione experiri,' and in Brisson de uerborum significationibus. Read below (p. 16 l. 11) with Rigault and cod. Fuld. *de legibus prius* consistam <*concurram* Oehler> *nobiscum ut cum tutoribus legum.* fragm. Fuld. c. 19 p. 62 l. 5. c. 46 pr. p. 126 l. 25 constitimus, *ut opinor, aduersus omnium criminum intentationem.* ibid. p. 130 l. 17. Oehler on de idol. 13 pr. p. 87 l. ult. Quintil. decl. 252 p. 30 l. 1 *ut diceret, qua alia lege cum illo* consistere *potuerim.* 5 other exx. in Ritter's ind.

p. 16 l. 4 NON DICO PESSIMI OPTIMOS de idol. 14 f. (p. 47 l. 6 Wiss.) *si quid et carni indulgendum est, habes,* non dicam *tuos dies tantum, sed et plures.* de fuga in pers. 10 (p. 479 l. 6 up) *illum,* non dico *in mari et in terra, uerum in utero etiam bestiae inuenio.*

p. 16 l. 8 INRIDENDI 18 p. 58 l. 15 *haec et nos* risimus *aliquando.*

p. 16 l. 9 LEGVM OBSTRVITVR AVCTORITAS 37 pr. p. 106 l. 25 *quotiens enim in Christianos desaeuitis, partim animis propriis, partim* legibus *obsequentes!* Blunt Right Use p. 341.

p. 16 l. 13 NON LICET ESSE VOS Minuc. 8 § 3 *homines... deploratae* illicitae *ac desperatae factionis grassari in deos non ingemescendum est!* uit. Alex. Seu. 22 *Iudaeis priuilegia reseruauit,* Christianos esse *passus est.* Judaism was tole-

rated infr. c. 21 pr. p. 66 l. 17 *insignissimae religionis, certe licitae.* Blunt Right Use 345. Sulpic. Seu. chron. II 29 3 *post etiam datis legibus religio uetabatur, palamque edictis propositis* Christianum esse non licebat.

p. 16 l. 14 INIQVAM EX ARCE DOMINATIONEM Iuu. X 307 n. Luc. VIII 490. Plut. Timol. 22 1. DS. XVI 70. The new ed. of Dict. Ant. does not notice the political importance of the *arx*, though *arx* and esp. ἀκρόπολις very frequently denote the stronghold of tyranny, or, metaphorically, of tyrannical passions. Iustin. XXI 5 2. Flor. I 1 5.

p. 16 l. 20 SI LEX TVA ERRAVIT Orig. c. Cels. I 1 p. 5 *παρ' ἀληθείᾳ δικαζούσῃ οἱ νόμοι τῶν ἐθνῶν, οἱ περὶ ἀγαλμάτων καὶ τῆς ἀθέου πολυθεότητος, νόμοι εἰσὶ Σκυθῶν καὶ εἴ τι Σκυθῶν ἀσεβέστερον. οὐκ ἄλογον οὖν συνθήκας παρὰ τὰ νενομισμένα ποιεῖν, τὰς ὑπὲρ ἀληθείας.* Many passages to the same effect in K. J. Neumann, der röm. Staat und die allg. Kirche bis auf Diocletian, I (Leipz. 1890) 234.

p. 16 l. 21 NEQVE ENIM DE CAELO RVIT Iuu. XI 27 n. Muret. uar. lect. XIII 7. Dorville on Chariton p. 133. Vulpi and Wunderlich on Tibull. I 3 90. Wetstein on Io. 3 13 and Acts 19 35. esp. Otto die Sprichwörter...der Römer (Leipz. 1890) 62. Add Liu. XXII 29 3 *se acies repente, uelut* caelo demissa, *ad auxilium ostendit.* Plin. XXVI § 13 f. (of the physician Asclepiades) *uniuersum prope humanum genus circumegit in se non alio modo quam si* caelo demissus *aduenisset.* Ammian. XXII 2 4 *effundebatur aetas omnis et sexus tamquam* demissum *aliquem uisura* de caelo. Lact. I 11 55 (citing Minuc. 21 § 7). Io. Sarisb. policrat. VII 12 (col. 662c Migne). Heraclides said of Empedocles that he fell from the moon (DL. VIII § 72). Lexx. under διοπετής. Lydus de ostentis 7.

p. 16 l. 27 SQVALENTEM SILVAM LEGVM praescr. haer. 37 m. pudic. 17 (I 254 3 Wiss.). exhort. cast. 6.

p. 16 l. 29 PAPIAS LEGES see Rigault. Evidence in Haenel corpus legum (Leipzig 1857) pp. 24—29. Lact. I 16 10 *non inlepide Seneca in libris moralis philosophiae 'quid ergo est' inquit 'quare apud poetas salacissimus Iuppiter desierit liberos tollere? utrum sexagenarius factus est et illi* lex Papia *fibulam imposuit?'*

p. 16 l. 30 IVLIAE Rein das Privatrecht der Römer (1858) 461—468. Tert. de monogam. 16 (I 786 l. 18) *aliud est, si et apud Christum* legibus Iuliis *agi credunt, et existimant caelibes et orbos ex testamento Dei solidum non posse capere.* Prud. perist. X 201—5 *sed, credo, magni limen amplectar Iouis: qui si citetur legibus uestris reus,* | *laqueis minacis implicatus* Iuliae, | *luat seueram uinctus et Scantiniam* | *te cognitore dignus ire in carcerem.* cf. Rein in Pauly Real-Encyclopädie IV 979—981.

p. 16 l. 31 SEVERVS on the persecutions under S. see Blunt church of the first three centuries 298—305. Tert. ad Scap. 4 (p. 547 l. 3 up) *ipse etiam* Seuerus, *pater Antonini, Christianorum memor fuit. nam et Proculum Christianum,...qui eum per oleum aliquando curauerat, requisiuit et in palatio suo habuit usque ad mortem eius; quem et clarissimas feminas et clarissimos uiros* Seuerus, *sciens huius sectae esse, non modo non laesit, uerum et testimonio exornauit et populo furenti in nos palam restitit.* Spartian. Seuer. 17 § 1 *Iudaeos fieri sub graui poena uetuit. idem etiam de Christianis sanxit.* Clinton Fasti Romani A.D. 202. Haenel corpus legum A.D. 202 and 204. Eus. h. e. VI 2 §§ 2 3. Aubé Les Chrétiens dans l'empire romain de la fin des Antonins 1881, Görres in the Jahrbücher für prot. Theologie (1878), and Réville, La religion à Rome sous les Sévères (1886) are critical; Wieseler, Die Christenverfolgungen der Caesaren bis zum 3. Jahrh. (1878) and Allard Histoire des persécutions pendant les deux premiers siècles (1885) and Hist. d. p. pendant la première moitié du III[e] siècle (1886) are conservative.

p. 16 l. 32 IVDICATOS IN PARTES SECARI A CREDITORIBVS LEGES ERANT, CONSENSV TAMEN PVBLICO CRVDELITAS POSTEA ERASA EST Blunt Right Use 645: "Matt. 24 51 'The lord of that servant shall come in a day when he looketh not for him, and in an hour that he is not aware of, and shall cut him asunder,' *διχοτομήσει αὐτὸν.* The term *διχοτομήσει*, as applied to the servant who had forfeited his trust, and abused his master's property in his absence, finds an illustration in Tertullian, who speaks of an obsolete Roman law, by which the bankrupt debtor was condemned to be cut asunder by his creditors." See leg. XII tabul. n. 3 (Bruns-Mommsen Fontes

iuris Romani antiqui, Freib. in Br. 1887, p. 20 n. 6, who quotes Gell. XX 1 §§ 48—52. Quintil. III 6 § 84 *in XII tab. debitoris corpus inter creditores diuidi licuit,* and commends Niebuhr for interpreting the law literally, not, as John Taylor, of *bonorum sectio*).

p. 18 l. 4 Blunt Right Use p. 341.

p. 18 l. 8 CVR DE SOLO NOMINE PVNIVNT FACTA, QVAE IN ALIIS DE ADMISSO, NON DE NOMINE PROBATA DEFENDVNT Heraldus, La Cerda, Oehler, take *defendunt* as = *ulciscuntur.* Havercamp, reading *probanda*, takes it thus 'maintain that they ought to be established by evidence of their commission, not by the name borne by the accused.' That *defendo* can = *ulciscor,* is certain. See adu. Marc. I 26 (5 exx.). Brisson and Dirksen. Rönsch in Zeitschr. f. wiss. Theol. XVI 267—270 and in das Buch der Jubiläen (Leipz. 1874) 144. Hildebrand gl. Par. p. 293 153 DEFENSVS *uindicatus, ultus.* vulg. Iudith 1 12 *quod defenderet* = *ἐκδικήσειν* LXX. Rom. 12 19 *defendentes* = *ἐκδικοῦντες.* Wopkens on Iustin. XXVIII 2 4. *defensa* Deut. 32 35 in Tert. adu. Marc. II 18 = *ἐκδίκησις* (wrongly translated 'defence' in Riddle-White and Lewis-Short). cf. corp. gloss. II (Leipz. 1888) 289 l. 28 *ἐκδίκησις defensio...ultio* cet. IV 479 l. 69 *defensio ἐκδικία.*

Here, however, the opposition *puniunt...defendunt* pleads for the usual sense of the word. Else one verb *puniunt* would have sufficed: 'in our case they punish on the ground of the bare name acts, which in others they punish' cet. More forcible by far is the antithesis; 'in us they punish on the score of our mere name, what in others they uphold, even when proved by evidence of the fact, not by the name given to the accused.' He speaks below e g. of tolerated abortion and lechery (cf. c. 9).

p. 18 l. 10 CVR NON REQVIRVNT? Iustin. apol. I 3 pr. p. 54[a] *ἀλλ' ἵνα μὴ ἄλογον φωνὴν καὶ τολμηρὰν δόξῃ τις ταῦτα εἶναι, ἀξιοῦμεν τὰ κατηγορούμενα αὐτῶν ἐξετάζεσθαι, καί, ἐὰν οὕτως ἔχοντα ἀποδεικνύωνται, κολάζεσθαι ὡς πρέπον ἐστὶν ἁλόντας κολάζειν· εἰ δὲ μηδὲν ἔχοι τις ἐλέγχειν, οὐχ ὑπαγορεύει ὁ ἀληθὴς λόγος διὰ φήμην πονηρὰν ἀναιτίους ἀνθρώπους ἀδικεῖν, μᾶλλον δὲ ἑαυτούς, οἳ οὐ κρίσει ἀλλὰ πάθει τὰ πράγματα ἐξάγειν ἀξιοῦτε.* Athenag. 2 pr. (p. 3[a]) *καὶ εἰ μέν τις ἡμᾶς*

ἐλέγχειν ἔχει ἢ μικρὸν ἢ μεῖζον ἀδικοῦντας, κολάζεσθαι οὐ παραιτούμεθα, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἥτις πικροτάτη καὶ ἀνηλεὴς τιμωρία ὑπέχειν ἀξιοῦμεν.

p. 18 l. 11 IN DEOS...ALIQVID COMMITTO c. 22—28.

p. 18 l. 11 IN CAESARES c. 29—39.

CAP. V

p. 18 l. 20 VETVS ERAT DECRETVM, NE QVI DEVS AB IMPERATORE CONSECRARETVR NISI A SENATV PROBATVS c. 13 pr. p. 46 l. 4 *nam, ut supra praestrinximus,* status dei cuiusque in senatus aestimatione pendebat. *deus non erat quem homo consultus noluisset et nolendo damnasset.* Marquardt röm. Staatsverw. III² 275 "The *consecratio imperatoris* is to be understood like *consecratio dei* or *natalis dei*, as the day of the establishment of the worship. Cic. n. d. II § 62 *hunc dico Liberum Semela natum, non eum, quem nostri maiores...cum Cerere et Libera* consecrauerunt. de leg. II § 28." ibid. 466 "only those emperors were consecrated, for whom their successors procured a special decree of the senate. Oros. VII 4 6. Prud. c. Symm. I 223—5. 245—250. CIL IX 2628 *genio deiuei Iulii, quem* senatus *populusque Romanorum* deorum in numerum rettulit. Athan. c. gent. 9 f. (I 20ᵈ seq. Migne) οὐ πολλῷ πρότερον, ἢ τάχα καὶ μέχρι νῦν ἡ Ῥωμαίων σύγκλητος τοὺς πώποτε αὐτῶν ἐξ ἀρχῆς ἄρξαντας βασιλέας, ἢ πάντας, ἢ οὓς ἂν αὐτοὶ βούλωνται καὶ κρίνωσι, δογματίζουσιν ἐν θεοῖς εἶναι καὶ θρησκεύεσθαι θεοὺς γράφουσι· οἷς μὲν γὰρ ἀπεχθάνονται, τούτους ὡς πολεμίους τὴν φύσιν ὁμολογοῦσι καὶ ἀνθρώπους ὀνομάζουσιν· οὓς δὲ καταθυμίους ἔχουσι, τούτους δι' ἀνδραγαθίαν θρησκεύεσθαι προστάττουσιν, ὥσπερ ἐπ' ἐξουσίας ἔχοντες τὸ θεοποιεῖν, αὐτοὶ ἄνθρωποι τυγχάνοντες καὶ εἶναι θνητοὶ μὴ ἀρνούμενοι, κ.τ.λ. More in Eckhel D.N. VIII 249." Mommsen Staatsr. II² 732—7. See the exhaustive treatise of the Abbé E. Beurlier Le culte impérial, son histoire et son organisation depuis Auguste jusqu'à Justinien. Par. 1891. 8vo.

p. 18 l. 23 NISI HOMINI DEVS PLACVERIT, DEVS NON ERIT Minuc. 23 § 13 *ecce plumbatur construitur erigitur: nec adhuc*

deus est: ecce ornatur consecratur oratur: tunc postremo deus est, cum homo illum uoluit et dedicauit.

p. 18 l. 24 HOMO IAM DEO PROPITIVS ESSE DEBEBIT c. 29 p. 94 l. 27 *tota templa de nutu Caesaris constant. multi denique dei habuerunt Caesarem iratum. facit ad causam, si et* propitium *cum illis aliquid liberalitatis aut priuilegii confert.*

p. 18 l. 24 TIBERIVS...CVIVS TEMPORE NOMEN CHRISTIANVM IN SAECVLVM INTROIVIT 7 p. 24 l. 21 *census istius disciplinae, ut iam edidimus, a Tiberio est.* 21 pr. p. 66 l. 14 *sectam istam... aliquanto nouellam, ut* Tiberiani *temporis, plerique sciunt.* 40 pr. p. 116 l. 18 *ante* Tiberium, *id est ante Christi aduentum.* Pearson Exposition of the Creed art. II Cambr. 1882, p. 195 "Tertullian seems to make it <the Christian name> as ancient as the reign of Tiberius...But I conceive indeed he speaks not of the name, but of the religion...However the name of Christian is not so ancient as Tiberius, nor, as I think, of Gaïus. Some ancient author in Suidas (in Ναζαραῖος and in Χριστιανοί) assures us, that it was first named in the reign of Claudius, when St Peter had ordained Euodius bishop of Antioch...And Iohannes Antiochenus (i.e. Malalas, chronogr. p. 247 Bonn)... tells us that Euodius...was the author of the name." cf. Lipsius, Ueber den Ursprung und den ältesten Gebrauch des Christennamens, Jena 1873.

ibid. NOMEN CHRISTIANVM Arn. I 19 f. Christianum nomen *odisse.* ibid c. 2 p. 4 3 *postquam esse nomen in terris Christianae religionis occepit.* Aug. c. D. I 15 *multo minus* nomen *criminandum est* Christianum.

p. 18 l. 26 ADNVNTIATA SIBI EX SYRIA PALAESTINA, QVAE ILLIC VERITATEM IPSIVS DIVINITATIS REVELAVERANT, DETVLIT AD SENATVM CVM PRAEROGATIVA SVFFRAGII SVI. SENATVS, QVIA NON IPSE PROBAVERAT, RESPVIT, CAESAR IN SENTENTIA MANSIT, COMMINATVS PERICVLVM ACCVSATORIBVS CHRISTIANORVM c. 21 p. 72 l. 26 *ea omnia super Christo Pilatus, et ipse iam pro sua conscientia Christianus, Caesari tunc Tiberio nuntiauit. sed et Caesares credidissent super Christo, si aut Caesares non essent necessarii saeculo, aut si et Christiani potuissent esse Caesares.* Eus. h. e. II 2 cites Tertull. and Chrys. hom. 26 in 2 Cor. (X 624^{d}) repeats the tale. Tillemont (mem. eccl. I, Par. 1693,

151—3) collects other patristic witnesses to the legend. Add anon. post Dionem (V 232 Dind.) ὅτι Τιβέριος ἀνήγγελλεν ἐπὶ τὴν σύγκλητον, ὥστε τὸν Χριστὸν τρισκαιδέκατον θεὸν εἶναι· ἡ δὲ σύγκλητος οὐκ ἀπεδέξατο, ὥστε καί τινα ἀστειευόμενον εἰπεῖν· ὅτι τρισκαιδέκατον οὐκ δέχεσθε, καὶ πρῶτος ἔρχεται. This writer wrote after Sozomen (i.e. after 439 A.D. Görres in Jahrbb. 1875 212—9). The Clementines (hom. I 6 seq. recogn. I 6 seq.) represent the fame of Christ as having reached Rome in autumn, He having come before the world in the spring of the same year[1]. Melito, in a famous passage (Eus. h. e. IV 26 § 7 = Otto apol. IX 412. 434—5) says that 'our philosophy' took its rise under Augustus, αἴσιον ἀγαθὸν for the empire. ἔκτοτε γὰρ εἰς μέγα καὶ λαμπρὸν τὸ τῶν Ῥωμαίων ηὐξήθη κράτος, οὗ σὺ διάδοχος εὐκταῖος γέγονάς τε καὶ ἔσῃ μετὰ τοῦ παιδός, φυλάσσων τῆς βασιλείας τὴν σύντροφον καὶ συναρξαμένην Αὐγούστῳ φιλοσοφίαν, ἣν καὶ οἱ πρόγονοί σου πρὸς ταῖς ἄλλαις θρησκείαις ἐτίμησαν. See Winer Realwörterb. Pilatus ad fin. Keim in Schenkel Bibel-Lexikon under Tiberius (V 535) and in Rom und das Christenthum (Berlin 1881, pp. 167—171). No Grotius (on Matt. 24 11), no Pearson lect. IV 14 15 in acta apost. (minor Theol. works, 1844, I 352—8) also concio II ad clerum (ibid. II 15—28), Fabricius (salutaris lux evangelii, Hamburg 1731, pp. 221—2), Mosheim (De rebus Christianorum ante Constantinum, Helmst. 1753, pp. 92 93), Lardner, Testimonies of ancient Heathen c. 2 § 1 (Works, 1829, VI 604—620), but upholders of tradition, as Dr Pusey (n. ad loc.) and Canon Churton (on Pearson l.c. II 23—24, where he rebukes Kaye's scepticism), or uncritical readers, like Lasaulx, now support Tertullian. Tanaquil Faber, Basnage, Dupin, Gibbon, were wiser in their day: so too Bishop Kaye (102—5). See Lipsius 'Gospels, apocryphal' in DCB II 708—9 (Tert. and Iustin. apol. I 35 p. 76[c], 48 p. 84[c] imply the existence of a document drawn up in the form of official *acta praesidialia*). Rather they *assume* that the Roman archives contained an official report sent by Pilatus to Tiberius. The extant forgery was founded on these notices of the early fathers and not con-

[1] Orig. c. Cels. II 30 speaks of the *pax Romana* under Augustus as favorable to the diffusion of the Gospel over the world.

versely (Lightfoot Ignatius I^1 55). cf. Kaye 103. 110. The character of Tiberius disproves the statement in the text (Suet. Tib. 69 *circa deos ac religiones neglegentior, quippe addictus mathematicae plenusque persuasionis cuncta fato agi*). Far from encouraging foreign rites (ibid. 36), *externas caeremonias, Aegyptios Iudaicosque ritus compescuit.* Seneca's father seized the pretence of this persecution to wean the young Pythagorean from a bloodless diet (Sen. ep. 108 § 22) *in Tiberii Caesaris principatum iuuentae tempus inciderat. alienigena tum sacra mouebantur, sed inter argumenta superstitionis ponebatur quorumdam animalium abstinentia. patre itaque meo rogante, qui non calumniam timebat, sed philosophiam oderat, ad pristinam consuetudinem redii.* Suppose that Pilate would have endorsed the biblical account of the trial and the Passion; is it not certain that he would not have reported facts so injurious to his character for justice? Lardner says (p. 611) "when he wrote to Tiberius, he <Pilate> would be very naturally led to say something of our Lord's wonderful resurrection and ascension, with which he could not possibly be unacquainted." We rather infer from the Bible (Matt. 28 14) that the governor was kept in ignorance of the resurrection. The Gospel of Peter supports indeed Lardner's surmise. For writers of legends had no feeling for the tragic irony of history. The greatest event of human story passed unnoticed by the rulers of earth, 'not with observation' or pomp. If we would know how provincial governors reported executions of Christians to head quarters, we need but turn to Plin. ep. X 96 § 3 *perseuerantes duci iussi.*

p. 18 l. 30 CONSVLITE COMMENTARIOS VESTROS c. 44 pr. p. 124 l. 15 *uestros enim iam contestamur actus.* c. 19 p. 64 l. 8 *reseranda antiquissimarum etiam gentium archiua.* Scorpiace 15 p. 178 l. 11 *uitas Caesarum legimus:* orientem fidem Romae primus Nero cruentauit. See the evidence in Clinton Fasti Romani A.D. 64 and 65. Eus. h. e. II 25 § 4 quotes our text.

p. 18 l. 30 ILLIC REPERIETIS PRIMVM NERONEM IN HANC SECTAM CVM MAXIME ROMAE ORIENTEM CAESARIANO GLADIO FEROCISSE on the Neronian persecution see ind. général to Renan's seven volumes, 'persécutions' p. 213. Lightfoot 'St

Paul in Rome' (Philippians, 1—28). ind. 'Nero' to Clem. (both volumes) and (on this passage) Ignatius I 23. Herm. Schiller Nero 424—439. comment. Mommsen 41—47 and Gesch. der röm. Kaiserzeit I 359. 445—450. Keim, Aus dem Urchristenthum (1878), Arnold, Die neronische Christenverfolgung (1888). Lact. m. p. 2 § 6 (of Nero) primus omnium persecutus Dei seruos *Petrum cruci adfixit et Paulum interfecit.*

Mommsen, röm. Geschichte V 520 seq., denies that the apocalypse pictures the Neronian persecution. The martyrs in the apocalypse suffer, not for burning Rome, but for refusing to worship the Caesars. He accordingly dates the prophecy, with Irenaeus, under Domitian.

p. 18 l. 31 CVM MAXIME this expression was perfectly well explained by scholars until Hand, Tursellinus III 599—603, following Priscian, took it as a particle of degree, rather than of time. As here, with a participle, spect. 10 (I p. 12 l. 7 Wiss.) *Nam saepe censores* nascentia cum maxime *theatra destruebant moribus consulentes.* Sen. ep. 95 § 14 *fuit sine dubio, ut dicitis, uetus illa sapientia* cum maxime nascens (at the very moment of its birth) *rudis.* Tac. ann. IV 27 coeptantem cum maxime *seditionem disiecit.* cf. Tert. bapt. 1. spect. 1. paen. 6.

p. 20 l. 1 TALI DEDICATORE DAMNATIONIS NOSTRAE paenit. 2 pr. *Deus...in semet ipso* paenitentiam dedicauit.

p. 20 l. 2 QVI ENIM SCIT ILLVM *scio* (savoir) for *noui* (connaître), and conversely, in late Latin. Rönsch Itala u. Vulgata 380. Sil. VI 168 scire nemus *pacemque loci explorare libebat.* Commodian. apol. 46. 172. 576. Lamprid. Alex. 45 § 3 *omnes ambulabant, ne* dispositionem *Romanorum barbari* scirent. Hier. ep. 130 12 pr. *imitare sponsum tuum, esto auiae matrique subiecta. nullum uirorum, et maxime iuuenum, nisi cum illis, uideas.* nullum scias, quem *illae* nesciant. id. uit. Hilarion. 42 f. *plerisque asserentibus* scire *se quidem* Hilarionem *et uere illum esse famulum Dei, sed ubi esset ignorare.* Apul. herb. 6 l. 75. Paulin. uita Ambros. 30 *sed cum in conuiuio a regibus gentis suae interrogaretur, utrum* sciret Ambrosium, *et respondisset* nosse se uirum. (In Sil. and Lamprid. *scire=cognoscere*, a use found by Madvig in Cic. and Livy.)

p. 20 l. 3 TEMPTAVERAT ET DOMITIANVS, PORTIO NERONIS

DE CRVDELITATE cited by Eus. h. e. III 20 § 7. Cf. Iuu. IV 38 n. caluo *seruiret Roma* Neroni. Eus. h. e. III 17 *πολλήν γε μὴν εἰς πολλοὺς ἐπιδειξάμενος ὁ Δομετιανὸς ὠμότητα...τελευτῶν τῆς Νέρωνος θεοεχθρίας τε καὶ θεομαχίας διάδοχον ἑαυτὸν κατεστήσατο. δεύτερος δῆτα τὸν καθ' ἡμῶν ἀνεκίνει διωγμόν, καίπερ τοῦ πατρὸς αὐτοῦ Οὐεσπασιανοῦ μηδὲν καθ' ἡμῶν ἄτοπον ἐπινοήσαντος.* Melito ibid. IV 26 § 9 *μόνοι πάντων ἀναπεισθέντες ὑπό τινων βασκάνων ἀνθρώπων τὸν καθ' ἡμᾶς ἐν διαβολῇ καταστῆσαι λόγον ἠθέλησαν Νέρων καὶ Δομετιανός, ἀφ' ὧν καὶ τὸ τῆς συκοφαντίας ἀλόγῳ συνηθείᾳ περὶ τοὺς τοιούτους ῥυῆναι συμβέβηκε ψεῦδος.* On the persecution under Domitian see Lightfoot, Clement I[2] and II[2] indd. 'Domitian.' Herm. Schiller, Geschichte der röm. Kaiserzeit I 576—9. Keim, Rom. u. d. Christenthum, ind. 'Domitian.' Renan, index général, 'Domitien.'

p. 20 l. 4 DE CRVDELITATE c. 9 p. 30 l. 31 *o Iouem Christianum et solum patris filium* de crudelitate!

p. 20 ibid. QVA ET HOMO c. 30 pr. p. 96 l. 9 *sciunt quis illis dederit imperium, sciunt,* qua homines, *quis et animam.*

p. 20 l. 5 FACILE COEPTVM REPRESSIT, RESTITVTIS ETIAM QVOS RELEGAVERAT Lightfoot, Clement, I[2] 41 n. 3 "Tert. speaks as if Domitian himself had recalled the exiles. This father must, I imagine, have had in his mind the story which Hegesippus tells (Eus. h. e. III 19), how Domitian was so impressed with the poverty and simplicity of the grandsons of Jude that he not only set them free, but also 'by an injunction stopped the persecution of the Church.' But this is inconsistent with the representations of all other writers, both heathen and Christian, who ascribe the restitution of Domitian's victims to his successor Nerva."

p. 20 l. 6 TALES SEMPER NOBIS INSECVTORES, INIVSTI IMPII TVRPES, QVOS ET IPSI DAMNARE CONSVESTIS, A QVIBVS DAMNATOS RESTITVERE SOLITI ESTIS see Lact. mort. pers. Eus. uit. Const. II 24 §§ 1 2. 26 § 2. 54. orat. Constantini ad sanctorum coetum (ad calc. Eus. uit. Const.) c. 24 (of the miserable ends of Decius, Valerian and Aurelian). INSECVTORES add to lexx. Iul. Val. II c. 15 fin. Ennod. p. 3 l. 1 (Lewis-Short omits the reference to Prud., given by Riddle-White).

p. 20 l. 11 M. AVRELII Blunt Church in the first three centuries 284—294. Under him Justin, Melito, Athenagoras, Theophilus, Tatian, Miltiades, all wrote apologies. Keim, Rom u. d. Christenthum, ind. under 'Markus Aurelius.' Lightfoot Ignatius I[1] 460 seq. 'The Church and the Empire under Hadrian, Pius and Marcus' (cf. ind. 'Marcus Aurelius'). Renan, index général 'Marc-Aurèle' p. 169. Herm. Schiller Kaiserzeit I 682 6. Melito in Eus. h. e. IV 26 § 5 gives a gloomy picture of the Church under Aurelius: *τὸ γὰρ οὐδεπώποτε γενόμενον, νῦν διώκεται τὸ τῶν θεοσεβῶν γένος, καινοῖς ἐλαυνόμενον δόγμασι κατὰ τὴν Ἀσίαν. οἱ γὰρ ἀναιδεῖς συκοφάνται καὶ τῶν ἀλλοτρίων ἐρασταί, τὴν ἐκ τῶν διαταγμάτων ἔχοντες ἀφορμήν, φανερῶς λῃστεύουσι νύκτωρ καὶ μεθ᾽ ἡμέραν διαρπάζοντες τοὺς μηδεν ἀδικοῦντας.* See the martyrdoms of the faithful in Lugudunum (Eus. h. e. V 1). cf. Iustin. Apol II 2. Clinton, Fasti Romani A.D. 177 col. 4. Neumann Der röm. Staat u. d. allg. Kirche I (1890) 28—39.

p. 20 l. 11 LITTERAE M. AVRELII GRAVISSIMI IMPERATORIS a spurious letter is printed by Otto at the end of Iustin. apol. II (I[3] 246—252), and (with the evidence for the miracle of the thundering legion) in Lightfoot (Ignatius I[1] 469—476). Haenel, Corpus legum 120—1 and add. 271. Clinton, Fasti Rom. append. pp. 22—26. Otto, Corpus Apolog. IX (1872) 486—491 (on a fragment of Apollinaris in Eus. h. e. V 5 § 4). Lightfoot (pp. 473—4) "The simple fact that M. Aurelius wrote to the Senate is mentioned, as we have seen (LXXI 10 § 5 *καὶ τῇ γερουσίᾳ ἐπέστειλεν*) by Dion. The emperor could hardly have done otherwise. Tertullian hazards the assertion that in this letter mention was made of the prayers of the Christians. Accordingly he claims M. Aurelius as a protector of the Christians. But the very language in which he asserts his claim shows that he had no direct and personal knowledge of any such letter; '*si* litterae M. Aurelii...*requirantur*.' Here he assumes that if sought among the archives the letter would be found. Just in the same way he elsewhere (apol. 21) refers his heathen readers to the official reports which Pilate sent to Tiberius after the trial of Christ. He did not doubt that both documents would be found in the archives. Yet this hazard of Tertullian

is apparently the sole foundation on which later statements are built." Eus. h. e. v 5 § 5 *μάρτυς δὲ τούτων γένοιτ' ἂν ἀξιόχρεως ὁ* Τερτυλλιανός...§ 6 *γράφει δ' οὖν καὶ αὐτὸς λέγων Μάρκου τοῦ συνετωτάτου βασιλέως ἐπιστολὰς εἰσέτι νῦν φέρεσθαι κ.τ.λ.* Keim Rom u. d. Christenthum, 632—4.

p. 20 l. 12 ILLAM GERMANICAM SITIM CHRISTIANORVM FORTE MILITVM PRECATIONIBVS IMPETRATO IMBRI DISCVSSAM CONTESTATVR c. 40 f. p. 118 l. 25 *denique cum ab imbribus aestiua hiberna suspendunt,...uos quidem...aqualicia Ioui immolatis......: nos uero ieiuniis aridi et omni continentia expressi, ab omni uitae fruge dilati, in sacco et cinere uolutantes inuidia caelum tundimus, Deum tangimus, et cum misericordiam extorserimus, Iuppiter honoratur.* ad Scap. 4 (p. 548 l. penult.) Marcus *quoque* Aurelius in Germanica expeditione Christianorum militum orationibus ad Deum factis imbres *in siti illa impetrauit. quando non geniculationibus et ieiunationibus nostris etiam siccitates sunt depulsae: tunc et populus acclamans Deo deorum, qui solus potens, in Iouis nomine Deo nostro testimonium reddidit.* de orat. 29 pr. (p. 199 l. 9 Wiss.) *ceterum quanto amplius operatur oratio Christiana!* (l. 17) *nunc uero oratio iustitiae omnem iram Dei auertit, pro inimicis excubat, pro persequentibus supplicat. mirum si aquas caelestes extorquere nouit, quae potuit et ignes impetrare?* See Clinton, F. R., A.D. 174. Kaye X, XI, 99 seq. Blunt, First three centuries, 294—6. Mosheim, Comment. rerum christianarum ante Const. 247—252. Martigny, Dict. des ant. chrét. (1877) p. 418. Keim, Rom u. d. Christenthum, 628—634. Kraus, Real-Encycl. d. christl. Alterthümer, under Legio fulminatrix. Lardner, Credibility pt II ch. 15 (Works, 1829, VII 176—198). He shows that the King who defended the miracle against Moyle was not (as Mosheim thought) Peter King, lord-chancellor. Classical Review 1895, p. 141 b. E. Petersen Blitz- und Regenwunder an der Marcus-Säule, Rhein. Mus. L (1895) pp. 453 ff. [Mommsen, Gesammelte Schriften, Bd IV pp. 498 ff. A. S.]

p. 20 l. 13 SICVT NON PALAM AB EIVSMODI HOMINIBVS POENAM DIMOVIT, ITA ALIO MODO PALAM DISPERSIT, ADIECTA ETIAM ACCVSATORIBVS DAMNATIONE, ET QVIDEM TAETRIORE Blunt Right Use 346. Eus. h. e. v 5 § 6 *τοῦτον* <M. Aurelius>

δέ φησι <Tert.> *καὶ θάνατον ἀπειλῆσαι τοῖς κατηγορεῖν ἡμῶν ἐπιχειροῦσιν.* To this refers V 21 § 3 *ἀλλ' ὁ μὲν δείλαιος* <the accuser of Apollonius> *παρὰ καιρὸν τὴν δίκην εἰσελθών, ὅτι μὴ ζῆν ἐξὸν ἦν κατὰ βασιλικὸν ὅρον τοὺς τῶν τοιῶνδε μηνυτάς, αὐτίκα κατάγνυται τὰ σκέλη, Περεννίου δικαστοῦ τοιαύτην κατ' αὐτοῦ ψῆφον ἀπενέγκαντος.* cf. K. J. Neumann, der röm. Staat u. d. allg. Kirche I (1890) 81. Celsus (in Orig. VIII 69, p. 213 Lomm.) implies that under Aurelius *inquisitio* was made: *ὑμῶν δὲ κἂν πλανᾶταί τις ἔτι λανθάνων, ἀλλὰ ζητεῖται πρὸς θανάτου δίκην.* Athenag. I p. 1^{bc} you (Aurelius and Commodus) by your prudence secure profound peace to the empire. We Christians alone are shut out from your providence, *συγχωρεῖτε δὲ μηδὲν ἀδικοῦντας...ἐλαύνεσθαι καὶ φέρεσθαι καὶ διώκεσθαι.*

p. 20 l. 18 TRAIANVS c. 2 p. 6 l. 31 n. Keim Rom u. d. Christenthum, 512—541. Lightfoot, Ignatius, indd. to both volumes, Blunt Right Use 340—5.

p. 20 l. 19 HADRIANVS Melito in Eus. h. e. IV 26 § 10 persecutions, instigated (§ 9) by Nero and Domitian, repressed by Hadrian and Antoninus. Lightfoot Ignatius I^{1} 442 (cf. ind. 'Hadrian') "only one recorded martyrdom under Hadrian is absolutely certain...the death of the Roman bishop Telesphorus" (Iren. III 3 4). Renan VI 5 6. 31 seq. The apologies of Quadratus and Aristides (this last newly discovered), of Apelles and Aristo appeared in this reign.

p. 20 ibid. OMNIVM CVRIOSITATVM EXPLORATOR Iulian. Caes. 311^{cd} after Trajan enters *ἀνὴρ σοβαρὸς τά τε ἄλλα καὶ δὴ καὶ μουσικὴν ἐργαζόμενος, εἴς τε τὸν οὐρανὸν ἀφορῶν πολλάκις καὶ πολυπραγμονῶν τὰ ἀπόρρητα.* DCass. LXIX 5 § 1 (cf. Suid. Ἀδριανός) *ᾐτιῶντο μὲν δὴ .. αὐτοῦ καὶ τὸ πάνυ ἀκριβὲς καὶ τὸ περίεργον καὶ τὸ πολύπραγμον.* 11 § 3 *τά τε γὰρ ἄλλα περιεργότατος* Ἀδριανός, *ὥσπερ εἶπον, ἐγένετο, καὶ μαντείαις μαγγανείαις τε παντοδαπαῖς ἐχρῆτο.* Spartian. Hadr. 11 § 4 *et erat* curiosus *non solum domus suae sed etiam amicorum, ita ut per frumentarios occulta omnia exploraret.* Remember his restless travels, e.g. to the statue of Memnon, and his proficiency in many arts. Renan VI 4, 9 seq., 23, 37 n. 3, 40. His relation to Christianity id. ind. général p. 4 col. 1.

p. 20 l. 20 VESPASIANVS Eus. h. e. III 17 f. see in Light-

foot, Ignatius, I[1] 15 16 the evidence of Hilary and Sulpicius Seuerus for persecutions under Vespasian and Titus.

p. 20 l. 20 DEBELLATOR above p. 20 l. 9: also cited from Verg. and Stat. and vulg. (one ex. each). Add Claud. IV cons. Hon. 28. Hier. in cant. tr. 2 col. 528.

p. 20 l. 21 PIVS Keim, Rom u. d. Christenthum, 570—6. Lightfoot, Ignatius, I ind. p. 493 "The reign of Antoninus Pius, which has been regarded as a period of unbroken peace for the Church, is found to be stained with the blood of not a few martyrs." ibid. 629—695 he dates the martyrdom of Polycarp A.D. 155. Renan, ind. général 14 col. 1.

p. 20 l. 21 VERVS no special persecutions are attributed to him.

CAP. VI

p. 20 l. 24 RELIGIOSISSIMI c. 9 p. 30 l. 27 *in illa religiosissima urbe Aeneadarum.*

p. 20 l. 25 PROTECTORES c. 4 p. 16 l. 11 *de legibus prius concurram uobiscum ut cum tutoribus legum.*

p. 20 ll. 25—27 RESPONDEANT...SI...EXORBITAVERVNT on *si* = *num* and indic. in or. obl. see c. 21 p. 74 l. 23 n., Oehler on ad Mart. 2 (I p. 7 8).

p. 20 l. 27 IN NVLLO = *nulla in re* cor. 10. idol. 11 m. *in nullo necessarius esse debeo alii.* Rufin. h. e. I 1 p. 14. VI 31 p. 383. IX 8 p. 522 f. X 11. Ios. ant. II 9 p. 50 a.m. 49 m. II 12 p. 55. II 13 p. 56 m. & p.m. bis.

EXORBITAVERVNT infr. 9 p. 34 l. 6. 16 p. m. n. ad nat. I 13. II 2. exhort. cast. 5 f. scorp. 3 f. Isid. off. III 39 (lexx. cite Lact. Aug. Sid.).

p. 20 l. 28 OBLITTERAVERVNT monog. 3 p. m. ad ux. II 3. I 6 pr. Att. Cic. Catull. Liu. Tac. Suet.

p. 20 l. 28 SVMPTVM Arn. II 67 *nam si mutare sententiam culpa est ulla uel crimen et a ueteribus institutis in alias res nouas uoluntatesque migrare, criminatio ista et uos spectat, qui totiens uitam consuetudinemque mutastis, qui in mores alios atque alios ritus priorum condemnatione transistis...leges conseruatis...in cohibendis censorias sumptibus? in penetralibus et culinis perpetuos fouetis focos.*

p. 20 l. 29 CENTVM AERA Saluian. gub. 1 § 10 fin.

p. 20 l. 30 SVBSCRIBI 18 *sed ne notitia uacaret, hoc quoque a Iudaeis Ptolemaeo subscriptum est.* uirg. uel. 10 *certi sumus Spiritum sanctum magis masculis tale aliquid subscribere potuisse, si feminis subscripsisset.* idol. 13 *festis diebus et aliis extraordinariis sollemnitatibus, quas interdum lasciuiae interdum timiditati nostrae subscribimus.*

p. 20 l. 31 SAGINATAM pall. 5 f. *praecidam gulam...qua Aufidius Lurco primus sagina corpora uitiauit et coactis alimentis in adulterinum prouexit saporem.* Mart. XIII 62 *pascitur et dulci* cet. inscr. *auium fartor. auiarius altiliarius* (Orelli 2866). *fartores* Colum. VIII 7 1. *curator gallinarius* Varro III 9 7. lex Fannia B.C. 161. Plin. ad Trai. 50 (71) § 139 *gallinas saginare Deliaci coepere, unde pestis exorta opimas aues et suopte corpore unctas deuorandi. hoc primum antiquis cenarum interdictis exceptum inuenio iam lege C. Fanni cos. XI annis ante tertium Punicum bellum, ne quid uolucre poneretur praeter unam gallinam quae non esset altilis, quod deinde caput translatum per omnes leges ambulauit.* i.e. C. Fannius Strabo [Pauly-Wissowa Bd VI 1994 A. S.]. cf. Rein in Pauly s.u. 'sumptus.'

p. 20 l. 32 DECEM PONDO Plut. Sull. 1 pr.

p. 22 l. 1 THEATRA...DESTRVEBANT spect. 10 *theatrum proprie sacrarium Veneris est. hoc denique modo id genus operis in saeculo euasit. nam saepe censores nascentia cum maxime theatra destruebant, moribus consulentes, quorum scilicet periculum ingens de lasciuia prouidebant, ut iam hic ethnicis in testimonium cedat sententia ipsorum nobiscum faciens et nobis in exaggerationem disciplinae etiam humanae praerogatiua.* Oros. IV 21 4. V. M. II 4 2. Plin. h. n. XVII 25 § 244. Dio LVII 11. Tiberius banished actors. Marquardt III[2] 530 n. 6.

p. 22 l. 2 DIGNITATVM Herald digress. I 6 p. 203—4.

p. 22 l. 3 Gell. II 24 § 2—15. Macrob. III 17. 'sumptuariae leges' dict. ant.

p. 22 l. 5 PARVM EST SI idol. 7 m. *p. sit si ab aliis manibus accipiant quod contaminent.* patient. 3 m. *parum hoc, si non etiam proditorem suum secum habuit.*

p. 22 l. 6 FLAGRA RVMPENTIVM Iuu. 6 479 Friedl. *hic frangit ferulas*; 8 247 *nodosam posthac frangebat uertice uitem* n. (and

in Journ. Phil. XX 289 f.) of a parasite. Sid. ep. III 13 § 5 *uesicarum ruptor fractorque ferularum.*

p. 22 l. 9 PROSTIBVLAS Hier. ep. 84 § 7 (I 529[a]) gl. Par. p. 251 n. 492. Ambr. in ps. 118 s. 1 § 12. fr. Plaut.

p. 22 l. 10 CIRCA c. 2 p. 10 l. 5.

p. 22 l. 13 OBPIGNORASSET 1 ex. each (not this) from Ter. Cic. Sen. Mart. in lexx.

ANVLO de idolol. 16 *circa officia uero priuatarum et communium sollemnitatum, ut togae purae, ut sponsalium,...nullum putem periculum obseruari de flatu idololatriae, quae interuenit....eas mundas esse opinor per semetipsas, quia neque uestitus uirilis neque anulus...de alicuius idoli honore descendit.* Bingham XXII 3 5. Selden uxor hebr. 2 14 & 25. Bailey Rituale Anglo-Cath. p. 316 (citing Clem. Al. paed. III c. 11 § 57 p. 287 l. 26).

p. 22 l. 15 CELLAE VINARIAE Vitr. Plin. Apul. (add Met. IX 34) Plin. XIV § 89 *non licebat id feminis Romae bibere. inuenimus inter exempla Egnati Metenni uxorem, quod uinum bibisset e dolio, interfectam fusti a marito, eumque caedis a Romulo absolutum. Fabius Pictor in annalibus suis scripsit matronam, quod loculos in quibus erant claues cellae uinariae resignauisset, a suis inedia mori coactam.* Arn. II 67 f. (Ehnenh. p. 102. Hildebr. p. 234) *matres familias uestrae in atriis operantur domorum industrias testificantes suas? potionibus abstinent uini? adfinibus et propinquis osculari eas ius est, ut sobrias comprobent atque abstemias se esse?* Migne XVII 437[a]. [Study of Ambrosiaster p. 30; Ps.-Aug. Quaest. Vet. et Nou. Test. 115 § 26. A. S.]

p. 22 l. 16 METENNIO Mommsen Strafrecht 19 1 (no example of the exercise of this right except aetiological legends) "Den Egnatius Mecennius, welcher seine Frau wegen unerlaubten Weintrinkens mit einem Knittel erschlagen hat, spricht König Romulus frei (V. M. VI 3 9. Plin. l.c. Tert. Seru. Aen. I 737. verallgemeinert Dion. Hal. II 25. Polyb. VI 11[a] 4 (540, 4 Hultsch; 496, 33 Bekker; ed. Büttner-Wobst vol. II p. 253)). Diese Erzählung soll wohl die ursprünglich dem Ehemann zustehende Gewalt über Leben und Tod der Ehefrau erläutern. Wegen eines ähnlichen Vergehens wird eine Frau

von den Ihrigen (*sui*) zum Hungertod verurtheilt. Fabius in Plin. l.c." So Fatua in Lact. I 22.

p. 22 l. 17 OSCVLA Arn. II 67 fin. (among obsolete fashions) cited above. Gell. X 23. Athen. X 13. Plut. qu. Rom. 6. Plin. XIV § 90 *Cato ideo propinquos feminis osculum dare ut scirent an temetum olerent. hoc tum nomen uino erat, unde et temulentia appellata. Cn. Domitius iudex pronuntiauit mulierem uideri plus uini bibisse quam ualetudinis causa uiro insciente, et dote multauit.*

p. 22 l. 19 SEXCENTOS Hier. Mag. misc. 2 15. Marquardt Privatleb. I 69 n. 2.

p. 22 l. 20 SCRIPSIT properly *misit.* Marquardt Privatleb. I 76 n. 1.

p. 22 l. 21 PRAE AVRO cet. cult. fem. I 9 f. Plin. XXXIII §§ 39—40 *idem enim tu, Brute, mulierum pedibus aurum gestatum tacuisti et nos sceleris arguimus illum qui primus auro dignitatem per anulos fecit! habeant in lacertis iam quidem et uiri, quod ex Dardanis uenit—itaque et Dardanium uocabatur..., habeant feminae in armillis digitisque totis, collo, auribus, spiris; discurrant catenae circa latera et in secreto margaritarum sacculi e collo dominarum aureo pendeant, ut in somno quoque unionum conscientia adsit; etiamne pedibus induetur atque inter stolam plebemque hunc medium feminarum equestrem ordinem faciet?* Arn. II 67 f. cited above.

p. 22 l. 22 VOTVM i.e. *nuptiae.* ad nat. II 11 fin. Apul. flor. I 4 p. 18 *togam parari uoto et funeri.* met. IV 26 p. 293 *uotis nuptialibus pacto iugali destinatus.* dig. Testament. ludicr. M. Grunnii Corocottae *sorori meae Quirinae, cuius in uotum interesse non potui.* Sen. ben. III 16 *exeunt matrimonii causa, nubunt repudii.*

p. 22 l. 23 CIRCA 2 p. 10 l. 5.

p. 22 l. 25 LIBERVM B.C. 186. ad nat. I 10 p. 75 28 seq. Wiss. where also Serapis, Isis, cet. Aug. C. D. VIII 9. XVIII 13 p.m. Firmicus de errore prof. rel. 6 § 6 cet. Preller röm. Myth. 716. Marquardt III^2 42 n. 2. Bayle œuvres III 368.

p. 22 l. 26 ELIMINAVERVNT ad nat. II 7 (p. 107 13 Wiss.) *criminatores deorum poetas eliminari Plato censuit.* I 10 (p. 75 28 Wiss.) *certe Liberum patrem cum socru sua consules senatus*

auctoritate non urbe solum modo, uerum tota Italia eliminauerunt. Sid. ep. 1 2. Liu. XXXIX 16 8.

p. 22 l. 27 SERAPIDEM cet. ad nat. I 10 (cited next page). Cic. n. d. III § 47. Minuc. 21 § 5 *despice sis Isidis ad hirundinem, sistrum et adsparsis membris inanem tui Serapidis siue Osiridis tumulum.* § 7 *Isis perditum filium cum Cynocephalo suo et caluis sacerdotibus luget, plangit, inquirit....* § 8 *haec tamen Aegyptia quondam, nunc et sacra Romana sunt.* Preller röm. Mythol. 727 seq. (= II 378 seq.). Marquardt III² 78 n. 1 and 6. 79 n. 9. 77 n. 6. cf. n. 5 and n. 4. Renan les apôtres 342 n. 1. Isis worshipped by Caracalla (Spart. who says that Commodus carried an Anubis) cf. Lampr. Al. Seu. 26 § 8 (Isis and Serapis).

p. 22 l. 27 CYNOCEPHALO scorp. 1 p. 146 11 Wiss. Cypr. ad Demetrian. 12 *crocodili et cynocephali et lapides et serpentes coluntur, et Deus solus in terris aut non colitur aut non impune colitur.* Aug. C. D. II 14. III 12. [Ps.-Aug. Quaest. Vet. et Nou. Test. 114 § 11 A.S.] Drexler in Roscher 'Hermanubis' col. 2314.

p. 22 l. 28 CAPITOLIO Marquardt III² 41 n. 7 called de spect. 12 (p. 15 11 Wiss.) *omnium daemonum templum.* Arnob. II. 73 *quid? uos Aegyptiaca numina, quibus Serapis atque Isis est nomen, non post Pisonem et Gabinium consules in numerum uestrorum rettulistis deorum?*

p. 22 l. 29 GABINIVS B.C. 58. ad nat. I 10 p. 76 5 Wiss. *sed tamen et Gabinius consul Kalendis Ianuariis, cum uix hostias probaret prae popularium coetu, quia nihil de Serape et Iside constituisset, potiorem habuit senatus censuram quam impetum uulgi, et aras institui prohibuit.*

p. 22 l. 32 ad nat. I 10 p. 74 22 Wiss. *de reliqua uero conuersationis humanae dispositione palam subiacet, quanta a maioribus mutaueritis, cultu habitu apparatu ipsoque uictu ipsoque sermone.*

p. 22 l. 33 INSTRVCTV one ex. marked ἅπ. εἰρ. in LS (from Cic.) add 41 pr. de an. 19 pr. Apul. met. XI 30. Seru. Aen. V 402. Paulin Nol. ep. 3 3. Dirksen manuale. Symm. ep. 5 11. 20 § 2. Gen. 12 37 ap. Aug. quaest. in Exod. 47 [= ἀποσκευή. A. S.].

p. 24 l. 1 RENVNTIASTIS 38 n.

p. 24 l. 1 ad nat. I 10 p. 74 20 Wiss. *de legibus quidem iam supra dictum est, quod eas nouis de die consultis constitutisque obruistis.*

NOVE Plaut. Cornific. (once). Sen. rhet. Gell. [add Iren. lat. *quater*, Nouat. Vincent. A. S.].

p. 24 l. 6 PRINCIPALITER in this sense scorp. 2 f. Sol. dig. Marc. Emp. p. 349 17. Paulin. Nol. ep. 24 8.

TRANSGRESSIONIS cult. fem. II 5 p. m. cor. 11 bis. ad nat. I 10 a. m. p. 75 3 Wiss. Aug. Ambr. [also Cypr. Ambst. Hier. Rufin. etc. A. S.].

p. 24 l. 8 IAM ROMANO Luc. IX 158 *euoluam busto numen iam gentibus Isim.* Of Serapis, Horus in Macr. I 7 § 15 *nullum itaque Aegypti oppidum intra muros suos aut Saturni aut Serapis fanum recepit.* § 16 *horum alterum uix aegreque a uobis admissum audio.*

p. 24 l. 8 RESTRVXERITIS ad nat. I 10 p. 76 2 Wiss. *ceterum Serapem et Isidem et Arpocraten et Anubem prohibitos Capitolio Varro commemorat, eorumque aras a senatu deiectas non nisi per uim popularium restructas.* Seru. Aen. VIII 698 *Varro dedignatur Alexandrinos deos Romae coli.* Suid. ἐγκατέσκηψαν· τὰ τῶν Αἰγυπτίων κατὰ τὰ ἐν Ἀλεξανδρείᾳ πόλει ἐγκατέσκηψε καὶ τῇ Ῥώμῃ· Οὐάρρων. *restruere* only cited from Tert. (one other reference). [I have found it once in Iren. lat. A.S.]

p. 24 l. 12 MANIFESTIORA 9 fin.

CAP. VII

p. 24 l. 13 DICIMVR cet. 1 Pet. 2 11—12. 3 16. 4 4. Robert Turner M.A. fell. S. Joh. Cambr. vic. S. Pet. Colchester. The calumnies upon the primitive Christians accounted for. Or, an enquiry into the grounds, and causes of the charge of incest, infanticide, atheism, ono-latria, or ass-worship, sedition, cet. laid against the Christians, in the three first centuries. Lond. Bonwicke 1727. 8. Kaye 403. Iustin. apol. II 2 courage of Christians disproves the charge of lust. Some heathen slaves of Christians, fearing torture, and instigated by the soldiers (Eus. h. e. V 1 § 14) κατεψεύσαντο ἡμῶν Θυέστεια δεῖπνα καὶ Οἰδιποδείους μίξεις. cf. Iustin. apol. II 12 13. I 10 23 27.

Hier. ep. 41. 4 pr. Bonwetsch Montan. 40. Epiph. and Philastr. probably do not follow Tert., as this reproach is nowhere else found in contemporary literature. Tert. ieiun. 13 seems not to know of it (but see Praedest. haer. 26). These reproaches long obsolete. Tert. cult. fem. II 4. Iustin. c. Tryph. 10 pr. p. 227[b]. Carpocrates Clem. Al. strom. III 2 §§ 5—8 p. 511 P. Eus. h. e. IV 7 §§ 9—11 [Tat. 25 fin.]. Aug. haer. 7. Praedestinat. haer. 48 14. Philastr. haer. 21 49. Thdt [IX 33 p. 128, 40 (?) A. S.].

p. 24 l. 13 SACRAMENTO Kaye 336—7. On these charges see Semisch Iustin. d. Märt. II 100 seq. Athenag. suppl. 31 3 *τρία ἐπιφημίζουσιν ἡμῖν ἐγκλήματα*, (I) *ἀθεότητα*, (II) *Θυέστεια δεῖπνα*, (III) *Οἰδιποδείους μίξεις*. He handles I c. 4—30. III c. 32—34. II c. 35—6. Iustin. dial. 10. apol. I 26 fin. (of philosophers) *εἰ δὲ καὶ τὰ δύσφημα ἐκεῖνα μυθολογούμενα ἔργα πράττουσι, λυχνίας μὲν ἀνατροπὴν καὶ τὰς ἀνέδην μίξεις, καὶ ἀνθρωπείων σαρκῶν βοράς, οὐ γινώσκομεν.* Tatian 25 f. *ἀνθρωποφαγίαν*. 32 *ἀσέλγειαν*. Theophil. III 15 *ἀδιαφόρως ζῆν καὶ συμφύρεσθαι ταῖς ἀθεμίτοις μίξεσιν.* ib. *σαρκῶν ἀνθρωπείων ἐφάπτεσθαι.* Minuc. 9 and 31. Eus. h. e. IV 7 § 11 says that the real enormities of the Carpocratians were ascribed to all Christians. See impr. Christiani Kortholti de uita et moribus, Christianis primaeuis per gentilium malitiam afflictis liber Kilonii 1683. 4to. c. 9 pp. 94—151. Clem. Al. str. III p. 430 says of the disciples of Prodicus *τὸ καταισχῦνον αὐτῶν τὴν πορνικὴν ταύτην δικαιοσύνην ἐκποδὼν ποιησαμένους φῶς τῇ τοῦ λύχνου περιτροπῇ μίγνυσθαι* (Gnostics Epiphan. 26). These charges, originated by Jews (ad nat. I 14), nearly obsolete. Orig. Cels. VI 27 f. 40. Baur Gesch. der drei ersten Jahrh.[2] 374 n. 2. 375 n. 1 (same reports in cent. 4 against the Euchites (Psellus de operat. daemonum ed. Boissonade Norimbergae. 1838 p. 8)). Philastr. haer. 57. Kortholt Pag. Obtr. 99. 546 sq. Io. Bona rer. liturg. I c. 4. Lardner II 337—8. Incest and infanticide Salu. gub. IV § 85 ap. La Cerda. Bingham XV 7 10. Philastr. haer. 29 (59) de Carpocratianis. cf. Bingham XXII 1 § 3.

INFANTICIDII ad nat. I 7 p. 68 11 Wiss. Cynics allowed cannibalism. DL. VI 73. Epiphanius cet. make same charge against Montanists. Isid. Pelus. ep. I 242 *ἡ Μοντανοῦ βλασφημία*

παιδοκτονίαις, μοιχείαις τε καὶ εἰδωλολατρείαις συντίθεται. Cyrill. Hier. cat. 16 8 ὁ Μοντανὸς ὁ ἀθλιώτατος καὶ πάσης ἀκαθαρσίας καὶ ἀσελγείας πεπληρωμένος cet. Rufin. h. e. V 16. 18. VII p. 188.

p. 24 l. 15 CANES 8 *discumbens dinumera loca, ubi mater, ubi soror; nota diligenter, ut, cum tenebrae ceciderint caninae, non erres. piaculum enim admiseris, nisi incestum feceris.* (Cf. the appeal of Marie Antoinette to all mothers) 8 lower down *candelabra et lucernae, et canes aliqui et offulae, quae illos ad euersionem luminum extendant: ante omnia cum matre et sorore tua uenire debebis.* omn. ad nat. I 2 p. 61 20 Wiss. Minuc. 9 § 6 *illic post multas epulas, ubi conuiuium caluit et incestae libidinis, ebrietatis feruor exarsit, canis qui candelabro nexus est, iactu offulae extra spatium lineae, qua uinctus est, ad impetum et saltum prouocatur: sic euerso et extincto conscio lumine, impudentibus tenebris nexus infandae cupiditatis inuoluuntur per incertum sortis: et si non omnes opera, conscientia tamen pariter incesti; quoniam uoto uniuersorum appetitur, quicquid accidere potest in actu singulorum.* cf. Rufin. h. e. IX 5, and on the darkness h. e. XI 25. Iustin c. Tryph. 10 p. 227[b].

TENEBRARVM pudic. 22 p. 271 17 Wiss. *uiolantur uiri ac feminae in tenebris plane ex usu libidinum notis*, ad nat. I 16 pr. *uentum est ad horam lucernarum et caninum ministerium et ingenia tenebrarum. quo in loco metuo ne cedam. quid enim tale in uobis detinebo? uerum iam laudate consilium incesti uerecundi, quod adulteram noctem commenti sumus, ne aut lucem aut ueram noctem contaminaremus, quod etiam luminibus terrenis parcendum existimauimus.*

p. 24 l. 15 INVERECVNDIAM paen. 6 f. *praesumptio inuerecundiae portio est.*

p. 24 l. 17 ERVERE ad nat. I 16 fin. cf. apol. 2 n. Oehler.

p. 24 l. 19 PRAESCRIBITVR ad nat. I 3 p. 62 21 Wiss. *praescribitur enim uobis non posse crimina obicere, quae neque institutum dirigit neque probatio adsignat neque sententia enumerat.* II 1 p. 93 20 Wiss. *si tantam peruersitatem una praescriptione discuti liceret, in expedito esset nuntiatio, cum omnes istos deos ab hominibus institutos.* adu. Herm. 1 pr. *solemus haereticis compendii gratia de posteritate praescribere.*

Dirksen's manuale 'praescribere,' 'praescriptio.' Rudorff röm. Rechtsgesch. II 117—120. Cod. VIII 36 de exceptionibus seu praescriptionibus. Gesner on Quintil. VII 5 § 2.

p. 24 l. 21 NEGENT Cypr. ad Demetr. c. 13.

CENSVS Oehler on de cor. 13 f. (p. 452 n. u.). adu. Hermog. 4 pr. *quis enim alius Dei census, quam aeternitas?* Blunt Right Use 377—8.

p. 24 l. 22 DISCIPLINAE 2 39 etc.

TIBERIO c. 21 pr. p. 66 l. 15. c. 5 p. 18 l. 24 n.

ODIO 14 p. 50 l. 1 *plane olim, id est semper, ueritas odio est.* infr. 46 *in quantum odio flagrat ueritas, in tantum qui eam ex fide praestat offendit.* Ter. Andr. I 1 41 (=68) *obsequium amicos, ueritas odium parit,* where Lindenbr. cites Lact. V 9 6. Sulp. Seu. Aug. etc. Otto Sprichwörter 368 (omits Tertullian). Orig. c. Cels. VI 27 f. some would not even speak to the Christians.

p. 24 l. 24 IVDAEI Iustin. c. Tryphon. 17 (p. 234e cf. c. 108 p. 335c) after the resurrection the Jews, far from repenting, *ἄνδρας ἐκλεκτοὺς ἀπὸ Ἱερουσαλὴμ ἐκλεξάμενοι τότε ἐξεπέμψατε εἰς πᾶσαν τὴν γῆν λέγοντες αἵρεσιν ἄθεον Χριστιανῶν πεφηνέναι, καταλέγοντές τε ταῦτα ἅπερ καθ' ἡμῶν οἱ ἀγνοοῦντες ἡμᾶς πάντες λέγουσιν.* The Jews (Bingham XIII 5 4) cursed Christians in their synagogues. Iust. c. Tr. 16 f. p. 234c with Otto's n.

p. 24 l. 25 CONCVSSIONE blackmail Cod. Theod. VIII 10. XI 7 § 1. concussura militum mart. Perpet. III p. 64 13. fuga in pers. 12 prope f., *miles me uel delator uel inimicus concutit, nihil Caesari exigens, immo contra faciens, cum Christianum legibus humanis reum, mercede dimittit.* ib. 13 pr. (wrongly assigned to ad Scap. by LS) *sed et omni petenti me dabo in causa eleemosynae, non in concussurae...traditorem aut persecutorem aut concussorem.* ib. 12 a. m. *tu autem pro eo pacisceris cum delatore uel milite uel furunculo aliquo praeside, sub tunica et sinu, quod aiunt, ut furtiuo, quem coram toto mundo Christus emit, immo et manumisit...Quid enim dicit ille concussor? da mihi pecuniam, certe ne eum tradat.* ad Scap. 5 p. m. Scorp. 10 m. Verb, Rufin. h. e. VII 26 p. 441 f. Blunt Right Use p. 645 cl. Luke 3 14 *μηδένα διασείσητε.* Grot. (de

concussione of dig. = *περὶ διασεισμῶν* of Basilica and Egyptian papyri).

DOMESTICI ad nat. I 7 p. 68 28 sq. Wiss. *domesticorum curiositas furata est per rimulas et cauernas. quid? cum domestici eros uobis proderent?* Athenag. suppl. 35 cited below. Oehler 319 'seruus.' Blunt Right Use 377—8.

p. 24 l. 27 OPPRIMIMVR cet. Bingham XX 2 8 fin. Eus. V 1 § 14 (martyrs of Lyons and Vienne) *συνελαμβάνοντο δὲ καὶ ἐθνικοί τινες οἰκέται τῶν ἡμετέρων, ἐπεὶ δημοσίᾳ ἐκέλευσεν ὁ ἡγεμὼν ἀναζητεῖσθαι πάντας ἡμᾶς· οἳ καὶ κατ' ἐνέδραν τοῦ Σατανᾶ, φοβηθέντες τὰς βασάνους ἃς τοὺς ἁγίους ἔβλεπον πάσχοντας, τῶν στρατιωτῶν ἐπὶ τοῦτο παρορμώντων αὐτοὺς κατεψεύσαντο ἡμῶν Θυέστεια δεῖπνα καὶ Οἰδιποδείους μίξεις καὶ ὅσα μήτε λαλεῖν μήτε νοεῖν θέμις ἡμῖν, ἀλλὰ μηδὲ πιστεύειν, εἴ τι τοιοῦτο πώποτε παρὰ ἀνθρώποις ἐγένετο.* § 15 *τούτων δὲ φημισθέντων πάντες ἀπεθηριώθησαν εἰς ἡμᾶς, ὥστε καὶ εἴ τινες τὸ πρότερον δι' οἰκειότητα ἐμετρίαζον, τότε μεγάλως ἐχαλέπαινον καὶ διεπρίοντο καθ' ἡμῶν.* Athenag. 35 *τίς οὖν εὖ φρονῶν εἴποι τοιούτους ὄντας ἡμᾶς ἀνδροφόνους εἶναι; οὐ γὰρ ἔστι πάσασθαι κρεῶν ἀνθρωπικῶν μὴ πρότερον ἀποκτείνασί τινα. τὸ πρότερον οὖν ψευδόμενοι, τὸ δεύτερον κἂν μέν τις αὐτοὺς ἔρηται εἰ ἑωράκασιν ἃ λέγουσιν, οὐδεὶς οὕτως ἀπηρυθριασμένος ὡς εἰπεῖν ἰδεῖν. καίτοι καὶ δοῦλοί εἰσιν ἡμῖν, τοῖς μὲν καὶ πλείους τοῖς δὲ ἐλάττους, οὓς οὐκ ἔστι λαθεῖν. ἀλλὰ καὶ τούτων οὐδεὶς καθ' ἡμῶν τὰ τηλικαῦτα οὐδὲ κατεψεύσατο. οὓς γὰρ ἴσασιν οὐδ' ἰδεῖν κἂν δικαίως φονευόμενον ὑπομένοντας, τούτων τίς ἂν κατείποι ἢ ἀνδροφονίαν ἢ ἀνθρωποβορίαν;* Iustin. apol. II 12 says that slaves and children and women, under torture, confessed these crimes. ad nat. I 7 p. 69 18 Wiss. *quis umquam tamen semeso cadaueri superuenit? quis in cruentato pane uestigia dentium deprehendit? quis tenebris repentino lumine inruptis inmunda aliqua, ne dixerim incesta, indicia recognouit?* l. 16 seq. *quod sciam, et conuersatio notior facta est; scitis et dies conuentuum nostrorum; itaque et obsidemur et opprimimur, et in ipsis arcanis congregationibus detinemur....* 22 23 cited below. Minuc. 9 § 5 with the reply 28 §§ 2 5. c. 30.

p. 24 l. 27 ff. Minuc. 28 § 2 Christians, while yet heathen,

accepted these calumnies, "*quasi Christiani monstra colerent, infantes uorarent, conuiuia incesta miscerent, nec intellegebamus ab his fabulas istas semper uentilari et numquam uel inuestigari uel probari.*"

p. 24 l. 29 CYCLOPVM Plin. VII § 9.

p. 24 l. 31 CELAVIT cet. ad nat. I 7 p. 69 22 Wiss. *si praemio impetramus, ne tales in publicum extrahamur, quare et opprimimur? possumus et omnino non extrahi; quis enim proditionem criminis alicuius sine crimine ipso aut uendit aut redimit?* La Cerda cites Salu. I [Timoth.] ad eccl. § 42 *peccata uendere* and Luc. Hermot. 81 *ὠνήσασθαι τὸ πλημμέλημα.*

p. 26 l. 3 SILENTII ad nat. I 7 (p. 68 22 sq. Wiss.). adu. Val. 3. Apul. met. III 15 *sacris pluribus initiatus profecto nosti sanctam silentii fidem.* 20 *rei tantae fidem silentiumque tribue.* XI 21 *quis...tuto possint magna religionis committi silentia.* Basil de spir. sancto 27 *οἱ τὰ περὶ τὰς ἐκκλησίας ἐξ ἀρχῆς διαθεσμοθετήσαντες ἀπόστολοι καὶ πατέρες ἐν τῷ κεκρυμμένῳ καὶ ἀφθέγκτῳ τὸ σεμνὸν τοῖς μυστηρίοις ἐφύλασσον. οὐδὲ γὰρ ὅλως μυστήριον τὸ εἰς τὴν δημώδη καὶ εἰκαίαν ἀκοὴν ἔκφορον.* Lact. VII 26 §§ 8—10. V 19 § 19 *nam fere uulgus, cui simplex incorruptumque iudicium est, si mysteria illa cognoscat in memoriam mortuorum constituta, damnabit, aliudque uerius quod colat quaeret. hinc* (Aen. III 112) fida silentia sacris *instituta sunt ab hominibus callidis ut nesciat populus quid colat.* Celsus (Orig. I 7) complained '*κρύφιον τὸ δόγμα.*' Denied by Origen; Incarnation, Crucifixion, Resurrection, Judgement, are everywhere known. Esoteric doctrine e.g. of Pythagoras *καὶ πάντα δὲ τὰ πανταχοῦ μυστήρια κατὰ τὴν Ἑλλάδα καὶ τὴν βάρβαρον κρύφια ὄντα οὐ διαβέβληται.* cf. Iul. Firm. math. VII praef. apud Hau. Bingham X 5 3.

p. 26 l. 4 ELEVSINIA omn. adu. Val. 1 (ap. Hau.). Hor. c. III 2 25 seq. Apul. apol. 13 f. p. 418 Oud. Aesch. S. c. Th. 593 seq. Antiphon de caede Herod. 82 seq. (Jebb Att. Or. I 42—3). [Lys.] 6 § 19. Ou. a. a. II 601—2 *quis Cereris ritus audet uulgare profanis? magnaque Threicia sacra reperta Samo?* cf. Sozom. VI 25. Lucian Alex. 38. DG IV 14 § 3. Paus. V 17 § 3. Apollod. II 5. Philostr. Apoll. IV 18. Orig. Cels. III 59.

p. 26 l. 7 EXTRANEIS 46 *Anaxagoras depositum hospitibus*

denegauit, Christianus etiam extra (in the outer, heathen world) *fidelis uocatur.*

p. 26 l. 8 PIAE ad nat. I 7 p. 68 25 Wiss. proves this (not *impiae*) to be the true reading: *oro uos, extraneis unde notitia, cum etiam iusta et licita mysteria omnem arbitrum extraneum caueant?*

INITIATIONES LS only one ex. (Suet.).

ARCEANT PROFANOS Hor. c. III 1 1 *odi profanum uulgus et arceo.*

p. 26 l. 9 NISI SI 3 med. 11 ppr.

p. 26 l. 10 ad nat. I 7 p. 67 6 Wiss. Symm. ep. III 45 1 *uera res est famam esse uelocem.* [Pelag. in 1 Thess. 1, 8. A. S.]

p. 26 l. 12 Ou. fasti IV 311 *conscia mens recti famae mendacia risit.*

p. 26 l. 13 Ou. m. XII 56—8 *e quibus hi uacuas implent sermonibus aures, hi narrata ferunt alio, mensuraque ficti crescit et auditis aliquid nouus adicit auctor.*

p. 26 l. 14 EA ILLI CONDICIO cet. cf. ad nat. I 7 p. 67 10 Wiss.

NON NISI cet. Minuc. 28 § 7 *nec tamen mirum, cum hominum fama, quae semper insparsis mendaciis alitur, ostensa ueritate consumitur: sic est negotium daemonum: ab ipsis enim rumor falsus et seritur et fouetur.* On rumours against Christians Athenag. 2, cited on p. 28 l. 1.

p. 26 l. 17 ET EXINDE cet. cf. ad nat. I 7 p. 67 13 Wiss.

p. 26 l. 18 VERBI GRATIA bapt. 11 p. 211 11 Wiss. ad nat. I 2 p. 61 1 Wiss. 7 pr. Paulin. Nol. ep. 39 7. Cic. fin. V § 30 (exempli gr. off. III § 50).

p. 26 l. 21 AN VERO cet. cf. ad nat. I 7 p. 67 17 Wiss.

p. 26 l. 23 AMBITIO circuit = ad nat. I 7 p. 67 19 Wiss. Oehler on idol. 1 pr. p. 67.

p. 26 l. 24 ASSEVERATIONE paen. 4 f. ad nat. II 4 p. m.

p. 26 l. 25 NECESSE EST with subj. Cic. Lucr. Lact.

EXINDE cet. cf. ad nat. I 7 p. 67 20 Wiss.

TRADVCES praescr. haer. 32 *proinde utique et ceterae (ecclesiae) exhibent, quos ab apostolis in episcopatum constitutos apostolici seminis traduces habeant.* ad nat. I 4 pr. *mali nominis.* 12 p. 83 l. 2 Wiss. 16 p. 87 l. 21 Wiss. *tot compagines generis, tot inde traduces ad incestum.*

p. 26 l. 27 RECOGITET NE. 2 *non recogitetis...ne negarit.* 15 p. 52 l. 3. 26 pr. ad nat. I 4 p. 64 l. 17 Wiss. *nemini subuenit, ne ideo bonus quis et prudens, quia Christianus.* ib. 10 pr. *considerate ne.* ib. f. *nescio ne.* Arnob. I 10 f. Hild. *unde tibi est scire, ne.* 58 pr. *uide ne.* Aug. in ps. 21 enarr. 2 24 m. ps. 33 enarr. 2 9. ps. 64 4 f. ps. 70 serm. 2 9 a. m. (direct ib. 3 pr. 10 pr.) ps. 80 2 pr. ep. 96 2 pr. 147 17. 199 16 pr. 222 2 f. Eucher. p. 170 23. (Not in ind. Arn.)

p. 26 l. 28 INGENIO inventiveness, inspiration, device. Oehler on de corona 8 p. 436 n. g.

p. 26 l. 29 Lucian Philopseudes 2 *ἤ που κατανενόηκας ἤδη τινὰς τοιούτους, οἷς ἔμφυτος ἔρως οὗτός ἐστι πρὸς τὸ ψεῦδος ;*

p. 26 l. 30 BENE cet. cf. ad nat. I 7 p. 67 25 Wiss.

BENE...QVOD c. 40 p. 118 l. 8. c. 24 f. p. 86 l. 13. de ieiun. 13 p. 291 27 Wiss. idol. 5 f. Oehler. 15. 23. Aug. ep. 36 8. Ouid. a. a. II 605—6 *o bene quod frustra captatis arbore pomis, garrulus in media Tantalus aret aqua.* Hieron. adu. Rufin. II 24. Quintil. decl. 335 p. 690 Burm. melius q. Iuu. 2 139. Paulin. Nol. c. 24 15. ep. 32 2. Apul. met. III 25. VI 8 f. X 14 f.

OMNIA TEMPVS REVELAT Gell. XII 11 § 7 (in Oehler) and Erasm. Otto Sprichwörter 343. Matt. 10 26. Mark 4 22.

p. 26 l. 32 FAMA Athenag. suppl. 2 pr. Otto ad l. *εἰ δὲ μέχρι ὀνόματος ἡ κατηγορία (εἰς γοῦν τὴν σήμερον ἡμέραν ἃ περὶ ἡμῶν λογοποιοῦσιν ἡ κοινὴ καὶ ἄκριτος τῶν ἀνθρώπων φήμη καὶ οὐδεὶς ἀδικῶν Χριστιανὸς ἐλήλεγκται).* Iustin. apol. I 23 fin. (where Otto compares ib. 10 26 54) of demons *ὃν τρόπον καὶ τὰ καθ' ἡμῶν λεγόμενα δύσφημα καὶ ἀσεβῆ ἔργα ἐνήργησαν, ὧν οὐδεὶς μάρτυς οὐδὲ ἀπόδειξίς ἐστι.*

p. 28 l. 1 DISTVLIT Apul. met. V 10 *populis tam beatum eius differamus praeconium.*

SOLA innocence of Christians c. 44. Cannibalism of Scythians Strabo XI 8 6 p. 513, and Indians (Megasthenes ib. XV 1 56 p. 710), and Irish IV 5 4 p. 201 (also incest). Ioseph. c. Apion. II 7 the Jews fattened a Greek yearly for sacrifice; one such victim found by Antiochus in the temple.

p. 28 l. 2 HANC INDICEM cet. cf. ad nat. I 7 p. 67 27 Wiss.

p. 28 l. 3 CORROBORAVIT (Cic.) bapt. 18 f. de cor. 3 pr. ad nat. II 1. uirg. uel. 1 *consuetudo, initium ab aliqua ignorantia uel*

simplicitate sortitur, in usum per successionem corroboratur et ita aduersus ueritatem uindicatur.

p. 28 l. 4 VSQVE ADHVC Plaut. Ter. Bünem. on Lact. III 8 30.

PROBARE NON VALVIT ad Scap. 4 f. (p. 549. 8) *quod aliud negotium patitur Christianus, nisi suae sectae, quam incestam, quam crudelem tanto tempore nemo probauit.*

FIDEM NATVRAE IPSIVS infr. p. 28 l. 20. Iustin. c. Tryph. 10 p. 227^{b} *μὴ καὶ ὑμεῖς πεπιστεύκατε περὶ ἡμῶν, ὅτι δὴ ἐσθίομεν ἀνθρώπους καὶ μετὰ τὴν εἰλαπίνην ἀποσβεννύντες τοὺς λύχνους ἀθέσμοις μίξεσιν ἐγκυλιόμεθα, ἢ αὐτὸ τοῦτο καταγιγνώσκετε ἡμῶν μόνον, ὅτι τοιούτοις προσέχομεν λόγοις καὶ οὐκ ἀληθεῖ, ὡς οἴεσθε, πιστεύομεν δόξῃ; τοῦτό ἐστιν ὃ θαυμάζομεν, ἔφη ὁ Τρύφων, περὶ δὲ ὧν οἱ πολλοὶ λέγουσιν, οὐ πιστεῦσαι ἄξιον· πόρρω γὰρ κεχώρηκε τῆς ἀνθρωπίνης φύσεως.* cf. on these charges Justin apol. I 26 n. 29 Otto. Minuc. 30 § 1 *nemo hoc potest credere, nisi qui potest audere.* Quintil. IV 2 52 *credibilis autem erit narratio ante omnia, si prius consuluerimus nostrum animum, ne quid naturae dicamus aduersum.*

CAP. VIII

p. 28 l. 7 ECCE cet. cf. ad nat. I 7 p. 70 19 Wiss. Charges unknown to Cypr. ad Demetrianum, Arn. Lact. In the reign of Maximin a Roman commander at Damascus (Eus. h. e. IX 5 § 2) seized certain abandoned women and by threat of torture forced them to confess, as he dictated, *ὡς δὴ εἴησάν ποτε Χριστιαναὶ συνειδεῖέν τε αὐτοῖς ἀθεμιτουργίας* (cf. n. on c. 2 p. 156 l. 36).

p. 28 l. 8 INTERIM 21 p. 70 7 *recipite interim hanc fabulam, dum ostendimus.* Orig. c. Cels. VI 27 f.

p. 28 l. 10 VENI cet. cf. ad nat. I 7 p. 70 25 Wiss. Saluian. IV § 85 *denique quam praue ac nefarie pagani semper de sacris dominicis opinati sint, docent persecutorum immanium cruentissimae quaestiones, qui in sacrificiis christianis nihil aliud quam impura quaedam fieri atque abominanda credebant. siquidem etiam initia ipsa nostrae religionis non nisi a duobus maxime facinoribus oriri arbitrabantur, primum scilicet homicidio, deinde, quod homicidio est grauius, incestu, nec homicidio*

solum et incestu, sed et quod sceleratius quiddam est incestu ipso et homicidio, incestu matrum sacrosanctarum et homicidio innocentium paruulorum, quos non occidi tantum a Christianis, sed, quod magis abominandum est, etiam uorari existimabant: et haec omnia...ad promerendam uitam aeternam, quasi uero, etiamsi posset his rebus accipi, tanti esset ad eam per scelera tam immania peruenire.

p. 28 l. 13 RVDEM Minuc. 30 § 1 *illum iam uelim conuenire, qui initiari nos dicit aut credit de caede infantis et sanguine. putas posse fieri, ut tam molle, tam paruulum corpus fata uulnerum capiat? ut quisquam illum rudem sanguinem nouelli et uixdum hominis fundat caedat exhauriat?*

p. 28 l. 14 INTEREA cet. cf. ad nat. I 7 p. 71 3 Wiss.

p. 28 l. 17 TALIA INITIATVS adu. Marc. IV 11 p. 450 l. 14 Kr. *aliam scilicet et contrariam initiatos diuinitatem.* 21 p. 491 l. 7 Kr. *nec pannis iam sepulturae inuolucrum initiatus.*

CONSIGNATVS Scorp. 4 f. *militem sacramento*: later 'to confirm.' Bingham XII 2 § 4 n. 86. 3 § 4 n. 17.

p. 28 l. 18 CVPIO RESPONDEAS cet. cf. ad nat. I 7 p. 71 7 Wiss.

SI c. 6 pr. note.

p. 28 l. 21 ALIA cet. cf. ad nat. I 7 f.

Philostr. Apoll. III 45 ff. a beast with man's head, of the size of a lion, shooting from its tail thorn-like hairs, a cubit in length. Iarchas, who described these, denied the existence of σκιάποδες. σκιάποδας δὲ ἀνθρώπους, ἢ μακροκεφάλους ἢ ὁπόσα Σκύλακος ξυγγραφαὶ περὶ τούτων ᾄδουσιν, οὔτε ἄλλοσέ ποι βιοτεύειν τῆς γῆς οὔτε μὴν ἐν Ἰνδοῖς. Plin. VII § 23 (from Megasthenes) *in multis...montibus genus hominum capitibus caninis ferarum pellibus uelari, pro uoce latratum edere, unguibus armatum uenatu et aucupio uesci...Ctesias scribit...hominum genus qui Monocoli uocarentur singulis cruribus, mirae pernicitatis ad saltum, eosdem Sciapodas uocari, quod in maiori aestu humi iacentes resupini umbra se pedum protegant.*

p. 28 l. 23 NERVI ad nat. I 7 f. Iuu. 10 206 n. Burm. anth. II pp. 533—541. priap. 68 23. Acron in Hor. s. 1 2 118. Suid. s.v. Ὠριγένης p. 1281 14 Bernh. Epiphan. haer. LXIV 111 (I 527 *a*).

QVI ISTA cet. Minuc. 30 § 1 cited on p. 193 l. 16.

p. 28 l. 24 QVOD 2 p. 10 l. 8 *quod est dicit, tu uis audire quod non est.* ib. p. 6 l. 13 *quodcumque dicimur.* 35 *de Romanis id est.* Arn. II 26 *quid esset Deus uerus iam addiscerent suspicari.*

p. 28 l. 26 SVBICITVR of the cuckoo foisting its eggs on other birds Plin. X § 26 the fledgling afterwards called *subditus.* (cf. Iuu. 4 103.)

p. 28 l. 28 ATQVIN Oehler on fug. in pers. 6 p. 473 n. k. Hand Tursell. I 213 seq.

p. 28 l. 31 NESCIAT Saluian. IV § 69 *legem et deum.* § 70 *praeceptum domini.*

p. 28 l. 32 IVRVLENTIAM same v. l. in Jerome [ep. 108 31 § 2. A. S.] adu. Iouin. I 18.

p. 30 l. 1 CANDELABRA cet. cf. ad nat. I 16.

p. 30 l. 2 EXTENDANT ad uxor. I 3 *quod si apostolo auscultamus, obliti posteriorum, extendamur in priora.* adu. Val. 9 p. 187 l. 17 Kr. *et uincitur difficultate et extenditur adfectione.* Aug. contra Faustum XIII 18 fin. *libros propheticos et apostolicos legimus alterutris uocibus sibi concinentes; et ea concinentia, tamquam caelesti tuba, et a torpore mortalis uitae nos excitantes, et ad palmam supernae uocationis extendentes.*

p. 30 l. 7 SVSTINENT c. 25 p. 90 l. 15 n. ad uxor. II 5 quater.

p. 30 l. 10 SEQVITVR NE = *ut non* Saluian ind. p. 346 after *ita, sic, hoc, in hoc.*

CAP. IX

Jupiter and Apollo, when the Pelasgians in dearth vowed a tenth of their fruits, afflicted them with plagues because they omitted to sacrifice $\frac{1}{10}$ of their offspring D. H. I 23 seq. Porphyr. in Eus. p. e. IV 16 many exx. of human sacrifice: see also Eus. de laud. Constantini 13 §§ 6 Hein., and 7.

p. 30 l. 14 INFANTES Iuu. 6 fin. n. [unpubl. A. S.]. Friedländer III 767 n. 5. Marquardt III^2 74 n. 2.

PENES local, Africian. Sittl die lokale Verschiedenheiten d. lat. Sprache 136. de pall. 3 *p. Latium.* Claud. Mam. ep. 2 ad Sap. p. 205 2 E. *penes Galliam nostram professionis tuae par unus et solus es.* A.L.L. XIII 364—5.

SATVRNO Iuu. 15 116 n. Macr. I 7 31. Winer Realwört. 'Molech.' Schenkel Bibellex. 'Saturn.'

p. 30 l. 14 ff. Friedländer III[5] 509. Oros. IV 6 §§ 3—6. Plato Minos 315[bc] ἡμῖν μὲν οὐ νόμος ἐστὶν ἀνθρώπους θύειν ἀλλ' ἀνόσιον, Καρχηδόνιοι δὲ θύουσιν, ὡς ὅσιον ὂν καὶ νόμιμον αὐτοῖς, καὶ ταῦτα ἔνιοι αὐτῶν καὶ τοὺς αὐτῶν υἱεῖς τῷ Κρόνῳ, ὡς ἴσως καὶ σὺ ἀκήκοας. Arnob. II 68. D. H. I 38. D. S. XX 14. Voss. theol. gent. 2 5. Porphyrius in Eus. p. e. IV 16 p. 155[b]. Varro in Aug. C. D. VII 19 (cf. ib. c. 26) *deinde ideo dicit a quibusdam pueros ei [Saturno] solitos immolari, sicut a Poenis, et a quibusdam etiam maiores, sicut a Gallis, quia omnium seminum optimum est genus humanum.* Hier. in Esai. l. 13 c. 46 (IV 544[bc]) *Bel, quem Graeci Belum, Latini Saturnum uocant, cuius tanta fuit apud ueteres religio ut ei non solum humanas hostias captiuorum ignobiliumque mortalium, sed et suos liberos immolarent.* Grotius on Deut. 18 10. Lact. I 21 13 from Pescennius Festus. Sil. IV 767 *flagrantibus aris...paruos imponere natos.* Bayle œuvres III 46. Plut. de superstit. 13. pr. p. 171. D. S. XIII 86 § 3. XX 14 § 4. Orig. c. Cels. V 27 p. m. καὶ πῶς οὐχ ὅσιον παραλύειν νόμους τοὺς φέρ' εἰπεῖν παρὰ Ταύροις περὶ τοῦ ἱερεῖα τοὺς ξένους προσάγεσθαι τῇ Ἀρτέμιδι, ἢ παρὰ Λιβύων τισὶ περὶ τοῦ καταθύειν τὰ τέκνα τῷ Κρόνῳ. Iustin. XIX 1 aex. Porph. de abst. II 54—57.

TIBERII proconsul shortly before (?).

p. 30 l. 17 MILITIA. cf. *leuis armatura, peregrinitas, ciuitas, custodiae.*

PATRIAE NOSTRAE Carthage: de pall. 1 Scorpiace 6 7 f. res. carn. 42. Kaye 6 n. 3. 9 10.

p. 30 l. 18 FVNCTA EST c. dat. ad nat. II 10 m. Dirksen manuale.

p. 30 l. 21 PROPRIIS FILIIS ad nat. II 7 p. m. *cur Saturno alieni liberi immolantur, si ille suis pepercit?* Lact. I 13 § 2 from 'Ennius' in historia sacra. V 10 § 15 *quomodo aut parentibus parcent, qui expulsorem patris sui Iouem [colunt]? aut natis ex se infantibus, qui Saturnum?* 5 §§ 9 10. Among the immoral legends of the *poeticum deorum genus* Scaevola (see n. on c. 16 p. 54 l. 31 below) named *Saturnum liberos deuorare,* Aug. Ciu. D. IV 27 (I 180 17). Greg. Naz. or. 4 115 (I 141[d])

Macr. S. I 8 10. Stallbaum on Plat. Euthyphr. 5 e seq. omn. D. H. II 19 (cited by Thdt gr. aff. cur. III § 47 p. 45 22) *οὔτε γὰρ Οὐρανὸς ἐκτεμνόμενος ὑπὸ τῶν ἑαυτοῦ παίδων παρὰ Ῥωμαίοις λέγεται, οὔτε Κρόνος ἀφανίζων τὰς ἑαυτοῦ γονάς, φόβῳ τῆς ἐξ αὐτῶν ἐπιθέσεως, οὔτε Ζεὺς καταλύων τὴν Κρόνου δυναστείαν.* On Saturn, Thdt. gr. aff. cur. III § 36 and 38 who quotes Plato rep. 377 e seq. Athan. uit. Ant. 75 *Κρόνου φυγὴν καὶ τέκνων καταπόσεις καὶ πατροκτονίας.*

p. 30 l. 23 PARENTES Iustin. apol. II 12 (p. 234 n. 12 Otto). Aristid. c. 9 pr. Human sacrifices G. J. Voss idol. I 35 and b. II. Orig. de princ. II 9 § 5 (XXI 222 L.). Lact. I 21 1 at Salamis in Cyprus, abolished by Hadrian. Victims willing infr. 28 pr. *diuinae rei faciendae libens animus indicitur.* Chrys. in s. Romanum mart. 3 (II 621[d]) *ἔχεις αὐτοκέλευστον ἱερεῖον, τί τὸν δεσμώτην ταῦρον ἀνανεύοντα συμποδίζεις;* Sen. Oed. 334—7 *haec propere admoue, | et sparge salsa colla taurorum mola. | placidone uultu sacra et admotas manus | patiuntur?* Lasaulx 271 n. 258—9.

PARENTES...GALLOS...TAVRICAS Scorpiac. 7 fin. *sed enim Scytharum Dianam aut Gallorum Mercurium aut Afrorum Saturnum hominum uictima placari apud saeculum licuit, et Latio ad hodiernum Ioui media in urbe humanus sanguis ingustatur; nec quisquam retractat aut non rationem praesumit aliquam aut inaestimabilem dei sui uoluntatem. si noster quoque deus propriae hostiae nomine martyria sibi depostulasset, quis illi exprobrasset funestam religionem et lugubres ritus et aram rogum et pollinctorem sacerdotem, et non beatum amplius reputasset, quem deus comedisset?* Lact. I 21 § 3. Iustin. apol. II 12 *τίς γὰρ φιλήδονος ἢ ἀκρατὴς καὶ ἀνθρωπίνων σαρκῶν βορὰν ἀγαθὸν ἡγούμενος δύναιτο ἂν θάνατον ἀσπάζεσθαι;... τίνος γὰρ χάριν οὐχὶ καὶ ταῦτα δημοσίᾳ ὡμολογοῦμεν ἀγαθὰ καὶ φιλοσοφίαν θείαν αὐτὰ ἀπεδείκνυμεν, φάσκοντες Κρόνου μὲν μυστήρια τελεῖν ἐν τῷ ἀνδροφονεῖν, καὶ ἐν τῷ αἵματος ἐμπίπλασθαι, ὡς λέγεται, τὰ ἴσα τῷ παρ' ὑμῖν τιμωμένῳ εἰδώλῳ* [Iupp. Lat.], *ᾧ οὐ μόνον ἀλόγων ζῴων αἵματα προσραίνεται, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἀνθρώπεια, διὰ τοῦ παρ' ὑμῖν ἐπισημοτάτου καὶ εὐγενεστάτου ἀνδρὸς τὴν πρόσχυσιν τοῦ τῶν φονευθέντων αἵματος ποιούμενοι;* Minuc. 30 § 3 ubi Holden, *et haec utique de deorum nestrorum disciplina descendunt. nam Saturnus*

filios suos non exposuit, sed uorauit. merito ei in nonnullis Africae partibus a parentibus infantes immolabantur, blanditiis et osculo comprimente uagitum, ne flebilis hostia immoletur. § 4 *Tauris etiam Ponticis et Aegyptio Busiridi ritus fuit hospites immolare: et Mercurio Gallos humanas uel inhumanas uictimas caedere. Romani Graecum et Graecam, Gallum et Gallam, sacrificia uiuentes obruere: hodieque ab ipsis Latiaris Iuppiter homicidio colitur et, quod Saturni filio dignum est, mali et noxii hominis sanguine saginatur.* On offerings of children to Saturn Lact. I 21 §§ 9—15. Lasaulx Studien p. 250 n. 109 cf. 107—8. 251 n. 113. 253 n. 130. Allard les dernières persécutions 218.

LIBENTES ad Scap. 2 *cum et hostiae ab animo libenti expostulentur respondebant* appeared when called, so *resp. ad tempus, ad diem* etc. Gronov. obs. II 4 p. 122—4 Fr. On the propitiatory use of blood Lasaulx Stud. 237. Plin. XXX § 12 DCLVII (= B.C. 97) *demum anno urbis Cn. Cornelio Lentulo P. Licinio Crasso coss. senatus consultum factum est, ne homo immolaretur, palamque fit, in tempus illud sacra prodigiosa celebrata.* § 13 Druids suppressed in Gaul by Tiberius, still rampant in Britain. *nec satis aestimari potest quantum Romanis debeatur qui sustulere monstra in quibus hominem occidere religiosissimum erat, mandi uero etiam saluberrimum.* Suet. Claud. 25.

p. 30 l. 25 MAIOR AETAS cf. p. 30 ll. 6—7.

p. 30 l. 26 MERCVRIO Scorp. 7 fin. Lact. I 21 § 3 *Galli Esum atque Teutatem humano cruore placabant.* Caes. b. G. IV 16. Cic. p. Font. § 31. D. H. I 38. Solin. 21. Plut. de supers. 13 pr. p. 171. Tac. Germ. 10. Luc. Bell. Ciu. I 444 *et quibus immitis placatur sanguine diro | Teutates, horrensque feris altaribus Esus.* ib. III 399. So the Germans sacrificed the army of Varus. Tac. an. I 61 *lucis propinquis barbarae arae, apud quas tribunos ac primorum ordinum centuriones mactauerant.* ib. XIII 57 *uictores [Hermunduri] diuersam aciem [Chattos] Marti ac Mercurio sacrauere, quo uoto equi, uiri, cuncta uicta occidioni dantur.* Details D. S. V 30. Dio LXXIII 6. Tac. XIV 30. Abolished by the Romans Mela III 2 3. Plin. (cited above).

PROSECATVR 23 46.

TAVRICAS Iuu. 15 116 n. Greg. Naz. or. 39 4 f. (I 679^c) Ταύρων ξενοκτονίαι. Athenag. 26 ἡ μὲν ἐν Ταύροις ["Αρτεμις] φονεύει τοὺς ξένους. Lact. I 21 § 2 *erat lex apud Tauros inhumanam et feram gentem, ut Dianae hospites immolarentur, et id sacrificium multis temporibus celebratum est.* [Sen.] Oct. 978 seq. *urbe est nostra mitior Aulis | et Taurorum barbara tellus. | hospitis illic caede litatur | numen superum: ciuis gaudet | Roma cruore.* Lucian deor. dial. 16 1 (Hera to Leto) *οἱ δέ σοι παῖδες ἡ μὲν αὐτῶν ἀρρενικὴ πέρα τοῦ μετρίου καὶ ὄρειος, καὶ τὸ τελευταῖον ἐς τὴν Σκυθίαν ἀπελθοῦσα πάντες ἴσασιν οἷα ἐσθίει ξενοκτονοῦσα καὶ μιμουμένη τοὺς Σκύθας αὐτοὺς ἀνθρωποφάγους ὄντας.* ibid. 23 1. Iup. trag. 44. Toxaris 2 Amm. XXII 8 §§ 34—36. Lasaulx 252 n. 124.

THEATRIS SVIS cf. c. 15 p. 50 l. 33.

p. 30 l. 27 RELIGIOSISSIMA c. 6 pr. ad nat. II 17 p. 132 l. 6 Wiss. *seruant urbem Romanam, qui suas perdiderunt, si hoc religiositas Romana meruit* [cf. Ps.-Aug. Quaest. 115 § 16 *urbe Roma...sacratissima.* A. S.]. Kaye 48.

AENEADARVM ad nat. II 17 p. 131 4 Wiss....*posthabita Samo dilectam et utique Aeneadarum ignibus adoleri.*

p. 30 l. 28 IVPPITER cet. Scorp. 7 fin. Lasaulx Studien p. 249 n. 100. 248 n. 86. 251 n. 113. Fullest account in [Cypr.] de spect. 5 Minuc. 22 § 6 *ipse Iuppiter uester...cum Latiaris [dicitur] cruore perfunditur.* ib. 30 § 4. Tatian 29 *ταῦτα οὖν ἰδὼν ἔτι δὲ καὶ μυστηρίων μεταλαβὼν καὶ τὰς παρὰ πᾶσι θρησκείας δοκιμάσας διὰ θηλυδριῶν καὶ ἀνδρογύνων συνισταμένας, εὑρὼν δὲ παρὰ μὲν Ῥωμαίοις τὸν κατ' αὐτοὺς Λατιάριον Δία λύθροις ἀνθρώπων καὶ τοῖς ἀπὸ τῶν ἀνδροκτασιῶν αἵμασι τερπόμενον,...κατ' ἐμαυτὸν γενόμενος ἐζήτουν ὅτῳ τρόπῳ τἀληθὲς ἐξευρεῖν δύνωμαι.* The only heathen witness is Porphyr. de abst. II 56 *ἀλλ' ἔτι καὶ νῦν τίς ἀγνοεῖ κατὰ τὴν μεγάλην πόλιν τῇ τοῦ Λατιαρίου Διὸς ἑορτῇ σφαζόμενον ἄνθρωπον;* See the corresp. of Sir R. Peel and T. B. Macaulay with Ld Stanhope. S. Miscellanies Lond. 1863 pp. 128—144. Prud. c. Symm. I 379. Preller röm. Mythol. 191 (= I^2 215) assumes that a criminal condemned to death (*bestiarius*) was executed at the Latian festival in Rome. Marquardt III^2 297 n. 4. Iustin. apol. II 12 p. 234 n. 14 Otto. Theophil. III 8, and

Saturn Lact. v 6 6 and 7. I 21 3. Iuu. 15 116 n. Eus. laud. Const. 13 16. Human Offerings Zahn Forschungen V 188. J. Reville, die Religion in Rom unter den Severen (Leipz. 1888) p. 99 n. 1 127 n. 4. J. Geffcken Zwei Apologeten (1907) p. 66.

p. 30 l. 31 DE CRVDELITATE 5 m. *Domitianus, portio Neronis de crudelitate, sed qua et homo.* Saturn against Uranus, Iuppiter against Saturn Orig. c. Cels. I 17.

p. 30 l. 32 Philostr. Apoll. IV 8 ascribes cannibalism to witches. Socr. III 2 §§ 2, 5 men sacrificed to Mithras.

p. 32 l. 3 PRAESIDIBVS infra 30 f. spect. 30 p. 28 l. 23 Wiss. *praesides persecutores dominici nominis saeuioribus quam ipsi flammis saeuierunt insultantes contra Christianos liquescentes.* de idol. 23 p. 56 l. 12 Wiss. Kaye 48. Blunt Right Use 335. [O. Hirschfeld, Die Kaiserlichen Verwaltungsbeamten bis auf Diocletian (2 Aufl.) pp. 385 ff. A. S.]

p. 32 l. 5 EXTORQVETIS 30 f. *extorquete animam deo supplicantem pro imperatore.*

p. 32 l. 6 CANIBVS Ou. her. 11 83—4 *iamque dari paruum canibusque auibusque nepotem iusserat in solis destituique locis.* Ter. Hecyra.

EXPONITIS cet. ad nat. I 15 Herald pp. 206—8 and 64—65. Orig. c. Cels. VIII § 55 f. Minuc. 30 § 2 *uos enim uideo procreatos filios nunc feris et auibus exponere, nunc adstrangulatos misero mortis genere elidere: sunt quae in ipsis uisceribus medicaminibus epotis originem futuri hominis exstinguant et parricidium faciant ante quam pariant. et haec utique de deorum uestrorum disciplina descendunt. nam Saturnus filios suos non exposuit, sed uorauit.* cf. 31 § 3. conc. Ancyr. c. 21. Athenag. suppl. 35 fin. *καὶ οἱ τὰς τοῖς ἀμβλωθριδίοις χρωμένας ἀνδροφονεῖν τε καὶ λόγον ὑφέξειν τῆς ἐξαμβλώσεως τῷ θεῷ φαμεν, κατὰ ποῖον ἀνδροφονοῦμεν λόγον; οὐ γὰρ τοῦ αὐτοῦ νομίζειν μὲν καὶ τὸ κατὰ γαστρὸς ζῷον εἶναι καὶ διὰ τοῦτο μέλειν τῷ θεῷ, καὶ παρεληλυθότα εἰς τὸν βίον φονεύειν, καὶ μὴ ἐκτιθέναι μὲν τὸ γεννηθέν, ὡς τῶν ἐκτιθέντων τεκνοκτονούντων, πάλιν δὲ τὸ τραφὲν ἀναιρεῖν· ἀλλ' ἐσμὲν πάντα πανταχοῦ ὅμοιοι καὶ ἴσοι, δουλεύοντες τῷ λόγῳ καὶ οὐκ ἄρχοντες αὐτοῦ.* ep. ad Diogn. 5 p. 497b (of Christians) *οὐ ῥίπτουσι τὰ γεννώμενα.* Iustin. apol. I 27 pr. *ἡμεῖς δέ, ἵνα μηδένα διώκωμεν μηδὲ ἀσεβῶμεν,*

ἐκτιθέναι καὶ τὰ γεννώμενα πονηρῶν εἶναι δεδιδάγμεθα 29 pr. Lact. VI 20 § 21 *quid illi, quos falsa pietas cogit exponere? num possunt innocentes existimari, qui uiscera sua in praedam canibus obiciunt, et quantum in ipsis est, crudelius necant, quam si strangulassent?* V 9 § 15 (Bünemann). Ambros. hexaem. V § 58 *feminae nostri generis,...si ditiores sunt, lactare fastidiunt. pauperiores uero abiciunt paruulos et exponunt et deprehensos abnegant. ipsae quoque diuites, ne per plures suum patrimonium diuidatur, in utero proprios necant fetus et parricidalibus sucis in ipso genitali aluo pignora sui uentris exstinguunt, priusque aufertur uita, quam tradatur.* Ael. u. h. II 7. Plin. ep. Trai. 65 66. Visio Pauli c. 40 (pp. 32 33 James apocrypha anecd. 1893). Lact. VI 20 18—25. Ambr. (ed. Vindob.) I 184 18 187 6 seq. Barn. ep. 19 § 5 n. Constit. apost. VII 3 [add Ambst. in Rom. 12 8. A.S.]. Lips. ep. ad Belg. cent. 1 ep. 85. Lasaulx Studien pp. 454 455. Gerhardt Noodt, Iulius Paulus siue de partus expositione et nece apud ueteres. Sagittarius, disp. de expositione infantum, and on Iustin. I 4 § 7. Bernays gesamm. Abhandl. I 243. Lindenbr. on Ter. Andr. 4 4 30. Becker Gallus II³ 61. Kraus in R. Wörterb. s.v. 'Findekinder.' Marquardt-Mau Privatalterthümer p. 3 n. 1 (cf. *tollit*) 82 n. 4 83. Rein Criminalr. 441 seq. Döllinger Heidenthum 716—7. Bingham XI 4 § 18.

p. 32 l. 8 CONCEPTVM VTERO exhort. cast. 12 *quid ergo facies, si nouam uxorem de tua conscientia impleueris? dissoluas medicaminibus conceptum? puto nobis non magis licere nascentem necare, quam natum.* Harnack Medicinisches aus der ältesten Kirchengeschichte (Texte und Untersuchungen VIII 4) 146 n. 3 cites Didache 2 2. Barn. 19 5. h. l. Minuc. l. c. Athenag. l. c. Clem. Al. paed. II 10 § 96. cf. Soran. de mulierum affectibus 1. Sen. Helu. 16 § 3 f. Scribon. epist. 3 pr. Iuu. 6 592—609. Basil. ep. 188 c. 4 n. 2. Philo in Eus. p. e. VIII. 7 § 7 *μὴ γονὴν ἀνδρῶν ἐκτέμνοντες, μὴ γυναικῶν ἀτοκίοις καὶ ἄλλαις μηχαναῖς ἀμβλοῦν.* Ios. c. Ap. II 16 in Eus. p. e. VIII 8 § 35 *τέκνα τρέφειν ἅπαντα προσέταξε, καὶ γυναιξὶν ἀπεῖπε μήτ' ἀμβλοῦν τὸ σπαρεν μήτε διαφθείρειν. ἀλλ' ἢν φανείη, τεκνοκτόνος ἂν εἴη ψυχὴν ἀφανίζουσα καὶ τὸ γένος ἐλαττοῦσα.* Bingham XVI 10 4.

p. 32 l. 11 HOMO EST cet. Iuu. 6 596—7 *quae steriles facit adque homines in uentre necandos conducit.* dig. XXX 2 9 § 1 *partus nondum editus homo non recte fuisse dicitur.* ib. XLVIII 19 39. Hefele Beiträge zur Kirchengesch. II 380—1. Routh reliq. IV 125 (can. 1) 225–6. Mart. IX 41 10 *istud quod digitis, Pontice, perdis, homo est.* Hier. ep. 22 13 *aliae uero sterilitatem praebibunt et necdum sati hominis homicidium faciunt. nonnullae, cum se senserint concepisse de scelere, aborti uenena meditantur, et frequenter etiam ipsae commortuae trium criminum reae ad inferos perducuntur, homicidae sui, Christi adulterae, necdum nati filii parricidae.*

p. 32 l. 13 NECVBI Riddle-White, p. 1261 c. Lewis-Short '*nĕc-ne alicubi.*' adu. Prax. 1. cf. c. 3 p. 12 l. 25.

HERODOTVM III 8 Arabs. IV 70 Scythians. I 74 Medes and Lydians. Armenians Tac. an. XII 47. Luc. Toxaris 37.

p. 32 l. 15 CATILINA (cf. Winer Real-Wörterb. 'Bund') so the Vitellii and Bruti Plut. Publicola 4 § 1. Sall. Catil. 22 1. Flor. II 12 4. Mela II 1 § 12 (Asiacae). Athen. 45 f. (Carmani). Minuc. 30 § 5 *ipsum credo [Iouem] docuisse sanguinis foedere coniurare Catilinam, et Bellonam sacrum suum haustu humani cruoris imbuere et comitialem morbum hominis sanguine, id est morbo grauiore, sanare.* So Diogenes taught (D. L. VI 73. Theophil. III 5) and the Stoics (Theophil. l. c. D. L. VII 121. Men. 188. Sext. Emp. Pyrrh. hyp. III 24). Lamprid. Comm. 9 *Bellonae seruientes uere exsecare bracchium praecepit studio crudelitatis.*

p. 32 l. 16 AIVNT cet. allowed by Diogenes. Theophil. III 4. Petron. 141 (quoted below). Tert. Adu. Marc. I 10 f. Hdt. I 216 of the Massagetae. III 99 of the Padaei. Theophil. III 5. Thyestes, Harpagus, barbarians. Athenag. Resurr. Carn. 4 fin. p. 44^{bc}. Euseb. Praep. Eu. I 4 § 6 p. 11^{bc} *μηδ' ἀνθρωποβορεῖν Σκύθας διὰ τὸν καὶ μέχρις αὐτῶν ἐλθόντα τοῦ Χριστοῦ λόγον ...μηδὲ σάρκας νεκρῶν τῶν φιλτάτων κατὰ τὸ παλαιὸν ἔθος θοινᾶσθαι.* The natives of Pontus. cf. § 7 p. 11^{d}. Orig. contra Cels. V 27 pr. 34 p. 254. 36 p. 256. Tert. de Pall. 4. Iuu. 4 124 n. Lact. I 21 §§ 16, 17. V 10 § 15 *quomodo enim sanguine abstinebunt qui colunt cruentos deos, Martem atque*

Bellonam? Indian cannibals. .Orig. contra Cels. VI 80. Hier. adu. Iouin. II 7 (II 335[bc]) Massagetae and Derbices. Euseb. Praep. Eu. I 4 p. 11[d]. Plin. IV § 88. VI § 53. VII §§ 9, 11, 12. Strabo 231, 198. Solin. 15. Preller-Jordan röm. Myth. II 386 n. 3. Marquardt III[2] 76 n. 9. Lasaulx 254 138.

SCYTHARVM Lucian Deor. Dial. 16 1. De Luctu 21 τὸ δὲ ἀπὸ τούτου διελόμενοι κατὰ ἔθνη τὰς ταφὰς ὁ μὲν Ἕλλην ἔκαυσεν,...ὁ δὲ Σκύθης κατεσθίει. Petron. 141 *apud quasdam gentes scimus adhuc legem seruari, ut a propinquis suis consumantur defuncti, adeo quidem, ut obiurgentur aegri frequenter, quod carnem suam faciant peiorem. his admoneo amicos meos, ne recusent quae iubeo, sed quibus animis deuouerint spiritum meum, eisdem etiam corpus consumant.* Just before: *omnes qui in testamento meo legata habent, praeter libertos meos hac condicione percipient, quae dedi, si corpus meum in partes conciderint et astante populo comederint.* Lucian Toxaris 8 f. (of Sc.) κατεσθίουσι τοὺς πατέρας ἀποθανόντας. Orig. Princ. II 9 5 *apud Scythas, apud quos parricidium quasi ex lege geritur.* Strabo 513 of the Massagetae (Burnes Travels I 189 Turcomans sacrifice aged prisoners). Thdt. IX c. 35 p. 129, 10 seq. Prudent. contra Symm. II 294. Wesseling on Herodot. I 216. III 38.

p. 32 l. 18 cf. c. 23 p. 78 l. 29.

p. 32 l. 21 Plin. h. n. XXVIII § 4 *sanguinem quoque gladiatorum bibunt, ut uiuentibus poculis comitiales [morbi], quod spectare facientes in eadem harena feras quoque horror est. at, hercule, illi ex homine ipso sorbere efficacissimum putant calidum spirantemque et uiuam ipsam animam ex osculo uulnerum, cum plagis omnino ne ferarum quidem admoueri ora mos sit humanus.* § 43 *sanguine ipsius hominis ex quacumque parte emisso efficacissime anginam inlini tradunt Orpheus et Archelaus, item ora comitiali morbo conlapsorum, exsurgere enim protinus.* cf. XXVI § 8 cure of elephantiasis in Egypt. Blunt Right Use 359. Lasaulx 237 n. 27.

p. 32 l. 22 QVI DE HARENA Minuc. 30 § 6 *non dissimiles et qui de harena feras deuorant illitas et infectas cruore uel membris hominis et uiscere saginatas.* Athenag. 4 questions raised about fish birds, and beasts which have preyed on men and been

eaten by men, and so the same particles have formed part of two human bodies.

p. 32 l. 23 APER Ael. N.A. x 16 pr. *ἡ ὗς καὶ τῶν ἰδίων τέκνων ὑπὸ τῆς λαιμαργίας ἀφειδῶς ἔχει, καὶ μέντοι καὶ ἀνθρώπου σώματι ἐντυχοῦσα οὐκ ἀπέχεται, ἀλλ' ἐσθίει.*

p. 32 l. 25 CRVDITANTES De Ieiun. 16 pr. *ubi sepultus est populus carnis auidissimus usque ad choleram ortygometras cruditando.* Add to lexx. Scorp. 5 p. m. (of Adam) *edit inlicitum et transgressione saturatus in mortem -auit.* [See Thes. A.S.]

p. 32 l. 26 RVCTATVR Manil. v. 463 *ructantemque patrem natos* (of Thyestes). Iuu. 4 31.

p. 32 l. 29 INHIANT Cic. Catil. III § 19 *Romulus lactens uberibus lupinis inhians.* cf. Iuu. 10 238. Epiphan. Haer. 26.

HVMANO. So Athenag. Leg. 34 speaking of unnatural lust: "like fish, which devour one another, the stronger chasing the weaker. *καὶ τοῦτό ἐστι σαρκῶν ἅπτεσθαι ἀνθρωπικῶν.*"

p. 32 l. 31 ERVBESCAT...CHRISTIANIS 11 f. Testim. Anim. I p. 136 l. 1 Wiss. *uel tibi erubescant.* Aug. c. Iulian. IV 14 *unusquisque sibi uel alteri erubuerunt.*

p. 34 l. 1 NE ANIMALIVM cet. Euseb. Hist. Eccl. v 1 § 26 Byblias, who had recanted, when tortured (at Lyon or Vienne) to confess infanticides, recovered her rank as martyr, crying on the rack: '*πῶς ἂν παιδία φάγοιεν οἱ τοιοῦτοι, οἷς μηδὲ ἀλόγων ζῴων αἷμα φαγεῖν ἐξόν;*' so the martyr Attalus, when roasted alive, ib. § 52, cried '*ἰδοὺ τοῦτό ἐστιν ἀνθρώπους ἐσθίειν, ὃ ποιεῖτε ὑμεῖς· ἡμεῖς δὲ οὔτε ἀνθρώπους ἐσθίομεν, οὔθ' ἕτερόν τι πονηρὸν πράττομεν.*' Minuc. 30 § 7 *nobis homicidium nec uidere fas nec audire, tantumque ab humano sanguine cauemus, ut nec edulium pecorum in cibis sanguinem nouerimus.* Routh Rel. I 304. 343. Beveridge on Canon. Apost. 63 p. 470[b] Cotel.-Clericus. Jer. Taylor IX 356.

p. 34 l. 2 De Ieiunio adu. Psych. 1 p. 275 l. 2 Wiss. *arguunt nos quod...xerophagias obseruemus, siccantes cibum ab omni carne et omni iurulentia* (s. above). Kaye 146 (De Monogam. 5 De Pudic. 12). Irenaeus Fr. 15 p. 343 Ben. I p. 832 St. (from Oecumen. on 1 Pet. c. 3 p. 498) transl. by Blunt Right Use of the Early Fathers 40. Slaves of catechumens on the rack confessed that the holy communion was the body and blood of

Christ. The martyr Blandina answered: "how could we endure to do such an act; we who, in the practice of our Christian discipline, abstain even from permitted food?" Orig. contra Cels. VIII 30 (cf. n. in Lomm. XX 147—8) c. 31. Clem. Al. Paedag. III § 25 (p. 276 P.) *οὐδὲ γὰρ θιγεῖν αἷμα τοῖς ἀνθρώποις θέμις, οἷς τὸ σῶμα οὐδὲν ἀλλ' ἢ σάρξ ἐστιν αἵματι γεωργουμένη.* Calmet on Acts 15 20. Councils. Aug. contr. Faust. XXXII 13 f. obsolete in his day, the few who observed the restriction mocked by the rest. Clem. Recogn. I 30. Cotelier on Const. Apost. VI 12 n. 27.

p. 34 l. 3 MORTICINIS Varr.

p. 34 l. 5 BOTVLOS Arnob. II 42. Aristoph. Equit. 208 *εἶθ' αἱματοπώτης ἔσθ' ὅτ' ἀλλᾶς χὠ δράκων.*

CERTISSIMI c. inf. 12 f. 11 p. 40 l. 15.

p. 34 l. 6 EXORBITARE c. 6 pr. n. [16 (p. 54 l. 24) n. A.S.]

p. 34 l. 8 De Spectac. 19 p. 20 l. 14 Wiss. *si tales sumus, quales dicimur, delectemur sanguine humano.* Human blood a cure for epilepsy, Cels. III 23.

p. 34 l. 10 FOCVLVM (Plaut. in lexx. ō) Iuu. 3 262 n. Sen. Ep. 66 § 51.

ACERRAM adu. Marcion. I 27 p. m. Arnob. II 76 *perquiramus et nos contra, cur et uos, cum tantos et tam innumeros colatis deos, cumque...acerras omnes turis plenas conficiatis altaribus, cur non inmunes agitis tot discriminibus et procellis, quibus cotidie uos agunt exitiabiles multiplicesque fortunae?*

p. 34 l. 14 CVSTODIARVM prisoners in custody. 44 n. p. 124 l. 16. Orat. 24. Sen. Ep. 70 § 23. Sueton. Calig. 27 Ner. 31 (sing.). Seru. Aen. XI 184. dig. XLVIII 3 10.

p. 34 l. 15 INCESTI cf. c. 21 p. 68 l. 31.

INCESTI...PERSAS Minuc. 31 § 2 *haec enim potius de uestris gentibus nata sunt. ius est apud Persas misceri cum matribus ...memoriae et* tragoediae *uestrae incestis gloriantur, quas uos libenter et legitis et auditis. sic et deos colitis incestos, cum matre, cum filia, cum sorore coniunctos.* Holden ib. Incest of Iuppiter with Rhea and Proserpine. Athenag. Suppl. 20 p. 20ª cf. 32 p. 36ª. 34. Plin. Hist. Nat. II c. 7 § 17 *matrimonia quidem inter deos credi tantoque aeuo ex his neminem nasci et alios esse grandaeuos semperque canos alios iuuenes atque pueros,*

atricolores, aligeros, claudos, ouo editos et alternis diebus uiuentes morientesque puerilium prope deliramentorum est; sed super omnem impudentiam adulteria inter ipsos fingi, mox iurgia et odia, atque etiam furtorum esse et scelerum numina. Xenophanes. [See on p. 38 l. 21 A. S.] Iuppiter and Proserpina Orig. contr. Cels. I 25. 48. Arnob. V 21. Tatian 8 p. 148[a]. 10, and Iuno. Theophil. III 3. 8. Clem. Alex. Strom. III § 11, Protr. II §§ 15 and 16 p. 13 P. Euseb. Praep. Eu. I 4. 6 p. 11[b] ὡς μηκέτι Πέρσας μητρογαμεῖν τοὺς αὐτῷ (τῷ σωτῆρι) μαθητευθέντας. Lasaulx Studien 424 n. 219, 220. Chrys. Hom. 7 in 2 Cor. (X 489[c]). De Virgin. 8 (I 274[a]). Clem. Hom. IV 12. 15. 18. 24, VI 18. Bardesanes in Euseb. Praep. Eu. VI 10 § 16 p. 275 (cf. Basil. Ep. 258 4, III 395[a]. Athenag. 12. Aristid. 9 8. 85).

IVPPITER c. 11 p. 42 l. 8 n. ad nat. II 13 (after Saturn and Ops). Lucian De Sacrif. 5 ἔγημε δὲ πολλὰς μὲν καὶ ἄλλας, ὑστάτην δὲ...τὴν ἀδελφὴν κατὰ τοὺς Περσῶν τοῦτο καὶ Ἀσσυρίων νόμους. Xen. Mem. IV 4 § 20 sq. Luc. VIII 409. Euseb. Laud. Const. 16 p. 251, 33 Heikel. Theocr. Id. XVII 131—134 defends the incest of Ptolemy II by the example of Zeus, see Bouché-Leclercq Hist. des Lagides I (Par. 1903) 163 n. 2. Ruinart Acta Mart. p. 357 *quod Apollo sororem suam Dianam ante aram in Delo uiolauerit.* Lactant. Diu. Inst. I 17 § 8. Ambr. De Virginibus III 2. Theoph. I 9 p. 13[c]. Stallbaum on Plat. Euthyphr. p. 5[c]. Clem. Alex. Paedag. I 7 § 55 p. 131. Stromat. III § 11 p. 515. Tatian c. 28 p. 164. Jeremy Taylor IX 374—5 Eden. Clem. Recogn. IX 25, 27, 29. Hom. 19, 19. Orig. contr. Cels. V 27, VI 80. Bingham XVI 11, 3.

PERSAS ad nat. I 16 p. 86 l. 15 Wiss. *plane Persae, Ctesias edit, tam scientes quam non horrentes cum matribus libere faciunt. sed et Macedones id quod probauerunt palam sese factitare, siquidem, cum primum scaenam eorum Oedipus intrauit trucidatus oculos, risu ac derisu exceperunt. tragoedus consternatus retracta persona, Numquid, ait, domini, displicui uobis? responderunt Macedones: Immo tu quidem pulchre, at scriptor uanissimus si finxit, aut Oedipus dementissimus si ita fecit: atque exinde alter ad alterum,* ἤλαυνε, *dicebat,* εἰς τὴν ματέρα. Lasaulx 424—5. Sen. Lud. 8 § 2. Philo De Spec. Leg. 3 pr. et

med. (I 301—2 M.). Iulian. p. 9[c] (with sisters). [Ps.-Aug. Quaest. Vet. et Nou. Test. no. 115 § 19. A. S.] Thdt. Gr. aff. cur. III §§ 37, 96, 97. ἀδελφομιξία, Basil. Ep. 217 can. 65 75. Euseb. Praep. Eu. VI 10 46. Bingham XXII 1 4. Greg. Nyss. c. fat. (Migne P. G. XLV col. 170 A). Agath. II 24 pr.

p. 34 l. 17 TRAGOEDIAM Lactant. Diu. Inst. VI 20 §§ 23, 28.

p. 34 l. 19 ad nat. I 16 p. 87 l. 7 Wiss. *respicite igitur luxuria inter errores et uentos fluctuante, si desunt populi, quos ad hoc sceleris incursent lata uada et aspera erroris. in primis cum infantes uestros alienae misericordiae exponitis aut in adoptionem melioribus parentibus, obliuiscimini quanta materia incesti sumministratur, quanta occasio casibus aperitur?* Aug. Ep. 23 (98) ad Bonifat. (II 266[d]) *aliquando etiam quos crudeliter parentes exposuerunt nutriendos a quibuslibet, nonnumquam a sacris uirginibus colliguntur et ab eis offeruntur ad baptismum.*

p. 34 l. 20 PASSIVITATE promiscuousness, roving nature. De Cor. Milit. 8 p. m. *huiusmodi quaestioni sic ubique respondeo, admittens quidem utensilium communionem, sed prouocans eam ad rationalium et irrationalium distinctionem, quia passiuitas fallit obumbrans corruptelam conditionis.* Adu. Hermog. 41 p. 170 l. 22 Kr. *haec inquies non est, haec turbulentia et passiuitas non est, sed moderatio et modestia et iustitia motationis neutram in partem inclinantis.* Salu. VII § 16 *immo, quantum ad passiuitatem libidinis pertinet, quis non coniugem in numerum ancillarum redegit?* § 18 *atque illi, de quibus haec scripta legimus, et minore fortasse crimine et minore, ut reor, numero criminum ac passiuitate peccabant.* Oehler's ind. PASSIVVS (PANDO) ad nat. II 1 f. De Monogam. 6 pr. ad Vxor. I 2 f. Conc. Carth. 1 c. 7.

Apul. Metam. IX p. 202, VI 10. cf. n. from Tert. ad nat. I 16 f. (Journ. Phil. XX 279) a kidnapped boy sold in Asia and finally brought to the Roman market and bought by his own father. Socr. H. E. I 18 § 7 wives common property. Exposing children cause of incest, infr. 39 p. 112 l. 24 n. Iustin. Apol. I c. 27 p. 70[e], c. 29 pr. p. 71[d]. Minuc. 30 § 2. 31 § 3. Rein Criminalr. 441 sq. Döllinger Heidenthum u. Judenth. 716—7.

p. 34 l. 21 MISERICORDIA Paullus in dig. XXV 3 4 *necare uidetur non tantum is qui partum praefocat, sed et is qui abicit*

et qui alimonia denegat et qui publicis locis misericordiae causa exponit, quam ipse non habet. Cod. VIII 52 2. Exposition Aug. De Nuptiis et Concupiscentia I c. 15 § 17 (X 619 Gaume). D.S. (II 231) approves Spartan infanticide, which was a capital crime at Thebes. Ael. Var. Hist. II 7. Gibbon's guess that the church was largely recruited from foundlings has no support in antiquity (Blunt Right Use 332—7). Lact. Diu. Inst. VI 20 §§ 21—3 *quid illi quos falsa pietas cogit exponere? num possunt innocentes existimari qui uiscera sua in praedam canibus obiciunt et quantum in ipsis est crudelius necant quam si strangulassent?* § 22 *quis dubitet quin impius sit qui alienae misericordiae locum tribuit? qui, etiamsi contingat ei quod uoluit, ut alatur, addixit certe sanguinem suum uel ad seruitutem uel ad lupanar?* § 23 *quae autem possint uel soleant accidere in utroque sexu per errorem, quis non intellegit, quis ignorat? quod uel unius Oedipodis declarat exemplum duplici scelere confusum. tam igitur nefarium est exponere quam necare.* Clem. Alex. Paedag. III c. 3 § 21 f. (p. 265 P.) ἀλλ' οὐδὲ συνιᾶσιν οἱ ταλαίπωροι, ὡς τὸ ἄδηλον τῆς συνουσίας πολλὰς ἐργάζεται τραγῳδίας. παιδὶ πορνεύσαντι καὶ μαχλώσαις θυγατράσιν ἀγνοήσαντες πολλάκις μίγνυνται πατέρες, οὐ μεμνημένοι τῶν ἐκτεθέντων παιδίων, καὶ ἄνδρας δείκνυσι τοὺς γεγεννηκότας ἀκρασίας ἐξουσία. Aug. c. duas epist. Pelagianorum II § 11 *plangit baptizata mater non baptizatum proprium; et ab impudica expositum, baptizandum casta fetum colligit alienum.* cf. §§ 14 pr.—16. Basil Ep. 217 can. 52. Epist. ad Diognet. 5 p. 497[b]. Athenag. Suppl. 35 fin.

p. 34 l. 24 ERROR Lact. Diu. Inst. VI 20 § 23.

p. 34 l. 26 LIBIDO Saluian. VII c. 16—22 (§§ 65—100) contrasts the lewdness of the Africans with the chastity of their Vandal conquerors.

SALTVS ad nat. I 16 p. 87 l. 15 Wiss.

p. 34 l. 27 IGNARIS, cet. Minuc. 31 § 3 *merito igitur incestum penes uos saepe deprehenditur, semper admittitur: etiam nescientes miseri potestis in illicita ruere, dum Venerem promisce spargitis, dum passim liberos seritis, dum etiam domi natos alienae misericordiae frequenter exponitis, necesse est in uestros recurrere, in filios inerrare.* § 4 *sic incesti fabulam nectitis, etiam cum conscientiam non habetis.* Iustin. Apol. I 27 καὶ τῶν

τούτοις χρωμένων τις πρὸς τῇ ἀθέῳ καὶ ἀσεβεῖ καὶ ἀκρατεῖ μίξει, εἰ τύχοι, τέκνῳ ἢ συγγενεῖ ἢ ἀδελφῷ μίγνυται. cf. Clem. Alex. Paedag. III 3 § 21 p. 265. Bingham XVI 10 11.

FILIOS = liberos. ad nat. I 16 p. 87 l. 16 Wiss. II 12 p. 117 l. 22 Wiss. De Exhort. Castit. 13 *masculorum filiorum.* James on 4 Ezra p. L. Aug. Ep. 127 9 f. Hier. Migne P.L. XXIII 968[a] *cum hodieque Romae omnes filii uocentur infantes.* Ios. Antiq. II 13 p. 57 p. m. bis (ed. 1524). Archiv f. lat. Lex. VII 77—80. 84. 90. 92—94. *τέκνα ὑμῶν* 1 Cor. vii 14 is *filii uestri* in Tert. ad Vxor. II 2.

p. 34 l. 30 NOS cet. c. 39. 46. ad Vxor. I 6. De Cultu Fem. II 9. Athenag. Suppl. 33 *γυναῖκα μὲν ἕκαστος ἡμῶν ἣν ἠγάγετο κατὰ τοὺς ὑφ' ἡμῶν τεθειμένους νόμους νομίζων, καὶ ταύτην μέχρι τοῦ παιδοποιήσασθαι...ἡμῖν μέτρον ἐπιθυμίας ἡ παιδοποιΐα.* Iustin. Apol. I 29 *ἀλλ' ἢ τὴν ἀρχὴν οὐκ ἐγαμοῦμεν εἰ μὴ ἐπὶ παίδων ἀνατροφῇ ἢ παραιτούμενοι τὸ γήμασθαι τέλεον ἐνεγκρατευόμεθα.* A Christian youth, in order to refute the charges of promiscuous intercourse, applied to Felix, governor of Alexandria, for a medical licence for his mutilation. It was refused, but he remained unmarried. Minuc. 31 § 5 *at nos pudorem non facie sed mente praestamus, unius matrimonii uinculo libenter inhaeremus, cupiditatem procreandi aut unam scimus aut nullam.* Socrates I 13 § 3 married priests' cohabitation forbidden. § 4 allowed by Paphnutius. §§ 5, 6 priests' marriage forbidden. IV 23 (Ammon). V 22 § 50. Athenag. 33 p. 37[a] *εὕροις δ' ἂν πολλοὺς τῶν παρ' ἡμῖν καὶ ἄνδρας καὶ γυναῖκας, καταγηράσκοντας ἀγάμους ἐλπίδι τοῦ μᾶλλον συνέσεσθαι τῷ θεῷ.* Euseb. Laud. const. 17. Orig. contra Cels. I 26. VII 48 pr. Spencer on Orig. contra Cels. p. 21 l. 55 (annot. p. 21 ab). Theophil. III 15. Eus. D.E. I 9 §§ 14, 15, 21.

p. 34 l. 32 QVIDAM cet. ad Vx. I 6 *quot enim sunt qui statim a lauacro carnem suam obsignant?* De Cultu Fem. II 9 *non enim et multi ita faciunt et se spadonatui* [cf. Socr. H. E. II 26 § 9] *obsignant propter regnum Dei?* Iustin. Apol. I 15 p. 62[b] after citing Matt. 19 12: *καὶ πολλοί τινες καὶ πολλαὶ ἑξηκοντοῦται καὶ ἑβδομηκοντοῦται οἳ ἐκ παίδων ἐμαθητεύθησαν τῷ Χριστῷ, ἄφθοροι διαμένουσι· καὶ εὔχομαι κατὰ πᾶν γένος ἀνθρώπων τοιούτους δεῖξαι.* Pitra Spicil. Solesm. I 323. Athenag. Suppl.

33 (quoted above). Minuc. 31 § 6 *casto sermone, corpore castiore, plerique inuiolati corporis uirginitate perpetua fruuntur potius quam gloriantur. tantum denique abest incesti cupido, ut nonnullis rubori sit etiam pudica coniunctio.* Harnack Texte VIII 4 (Medicinisches u.s.w.) p. 63 n. 3. A heresy in Eustathius bp of Sebastīa in Armenia to forbid marriage, Socr. Hist. Eccl. II 43 § 3. Herzog-Hauck Real Encykl. XIII 215.

p. 34 l. 33 SENES Adu. Val. 5 p. 182 l. 13 Kr. *Proculus noster uirginis senectae...dignitas.* Schwegler Montanismus I 28 quotes Orig. l.c.

p. 36 l. 4 VIDERE VIDEANTVR Bentl. on Hor. Carm. II 1. 21. cf. *dixisse dicitur* Cic. Verr. IV § 73.

p. 36 l. 5 MANIFESTIORIBVS cf. c. 6 f.

CAP. X

p. 36 l. 6 DEOS NON COLITIS. Of the fathers Athenag. 4—30 treats most fully the charge of atheism. cf. Arnob. I 28 sq. Clem. Al. Strom. VII 1 § 4 Hort-Mayor's n. Plin. Ep. ad Trai. 96 § 5 *qui negabant esse se Christianos aut fuisse, cum praeeunte me deos appellarent et imagini tuae, quam propter hoc iusseram cum simulacris numinum afferri, ture ac uino supplicarent, praeterea male dicerent Christo, quorum nihil posse cogi dicuntur qui sunt re uera Christiani, dimittendos esse putaui.* § 6 some informed against said that they had been Christians and were so no more. *omnes et imaginem tuam deorumque simulacra uenerati sunt et Christo male dixerunt.* Socr. Hist. Eccl. III 22 § 1 pr. Julian gave soldiers the option, *ἢ θύειν ἢ ἀποστρατεύεσθαι.* II 27 § 4. I 36 § 3 (of Asterius) *ἱερωσύνης μὲν ἠστόχησε διὰ τὸ ἐπιτεθυκέναι κατὰ τὸν διωγμόν.* III 13 § 2. 15 § 5. 20 §§ 1—3. IV 1 § 9. 28 §§ 2 3. VII 25 §§ 18 19. I 6 § 37. Arnob. I 29 pr. *ergone impiae religionis sumus apud uos rei, et quod caput rerum et columen uenerabilibus adimus obsequiis, ut conuicio utamur uestro, infausti et athei nuncupamur?* III 28 *quantumlibet nos impios, irreligiosos uocetis et atheos, numquam fidem facietis esse amorum deos, esse bellorum, esse qui discordias conserant.* V 30 *iam dudum me fateor reputantem mecum in animo rerum huiuscemodi monstra solitum esse mirari, audere*

uos dicere quemquam ex is atheum irreligiosum sacrilegum qui deos esse omnino aut negent aut dubitent, aut qui eos homines fuisse contendant et potestatis alicuius et meriti causa deorum in numerum relatos, cum si uerum fiat atque habeatur examen, nullos quam uos magis huiusmodi par sit appellationibus nuncupari, qui sub specie cultionis plus in eos ingeratis maledictionum et criminum, quam si aperte hoc facere confessis maledictionibus coimbibissetis. VI 27 Minuc. c. 8. Iust. Apol. I 6 pr. 56[b] *ἔνθεν δὲ καὶ ἄθεοι κεκλήμεθα. καὶ ὁμολογοῦμεν τῶν τοιούτων καλουμένων θεῶν ἄθεοι εἶναι.* Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IV 15 (martyrdom of Polycarp) § 19 (the proconsul) "*Ὄμοσον τὴν Καίσαρος τύχην, μετανόησον, εἶπον· Αἶρε τοὺς ἀθέους.*" *ὁ δὲ Πολύκαρπος ἐμβριθεῖ τῷ προσώπῳ εἰς πάντα τὸν ὄχλον τὸν ἐν τῷ σταδίῳ ἐμβλέψας, ἐπισείσας αὐτοῖς τὴν χεῖρα, στενάξας τε καὶ ἀναβλέψας εἰς τὸν οὐρανόν, εἶπεν, Αἶρε τοὺς ἀθέους.* The crowd had cried, § 6, *Αἶρε τοὺς ἀθέους· ζητείσθω Πολύκαρπος.* cf. IV 13 § 3.

SACRIFICIA Acta Mart. Iustini c. 1 *ὥστε αὐτοὺς ἀναγκάζεσθαι σπένδειν τοῖς ματαίοις εἰδώλοις.* c. 5 *Ῥουστικὸς ἔπαρχος εἶπε· Τὸ λοιπὸν ἔλθωμεν εἰς τὸ προκείμενον καὶ κατεπεῖγον πρᾶγμα. συνελθόντες οὖν ὁμοθυμαδὸν θύσατε τοῖς θεοῖς*....Justin refused and so the other martyrs said *ποίει ὃ θέλεις. ἡμεῖς γὰρ Χριστιανοί ἐσμεν, καὶ εἰδώλοις οὐ θύομεν. Ῥουστικὸς ἔπαρχος ἀπεφήνατο λέγων· Οἱ μὴ βουληθέντες θῦσαι τοῖς θεοῖς καὶ εἶξαι τῷ τοῦ αὐτοκράτορος προστάγματι μαστιγωθέντες ἀπαχθήτωσαν.*

p. 36 l. 7 IMPENDITIS Idol. 6 p. 36 l. 5 Wiss. *nec anima pecudis impensa, sed anima tua.*

p. 36 l. 8 QVIA : *qua* Ashton.

p. 36 l. 9 SACRILEGII 2 pr. *nomen homicidae uel sacrilegi uel publici hostis* (*ut de nostris elogiis loquar*). ib. med. *sic enim soletis...laniari iubere sacrilegum, si confiteri perseuerauerit.* ad Scap. 2 *tamen nos, quos sacrilegos existimatis, nec in furto umquam deprehendistis, nedum in sacrilegio. omnes autem qui templa despoliant et per deos iurant et eosdem colunt, et Christiani non sunt et sacrilegi tamen deprehenduntur.* Rufin. Hist. Eccl. IV 15 § 18. de Polycarpo (Hav.).

CONVENIMVR 31 f. n. ad nat. I 17 p. 89 l. 12 Wiss. *uani-*

tatis sacrilegia conueniam. Liebenam röm. Vereinswesen 270. Friedländer III[5] 631 n. 10 cites Renan Les Évangiles 401—3.

p. 36 l. 10 TOTA de Idol. 1 pr. *principale crimen generis humani, summus saeculi reatus, tota causa iudicii idololatria.*

p. 36 l. 11 DESPERAT the Academic scepticism e.g. in the speech of Caecilius in Minuc.

p. 36 l. 12 Tzschirner 325. Iustin. Apol. I 6 *ὁμολογοῦμεν τῶν τοιούτων ὀνομαζομένων θεῶν ἄθεοι εἶναι.*

p. 36 l. 13 NON ESSE cf. c. 12 f.

p. 36 l. 17 SED NOBIS c. 13 pr. *sed nobis dei sunt, inquitis.*

p. 36 ll. 19—20 Infr. cap. 11 pr. 40. Idol. 15 p. 47 l. 15 Wiss. *si hominis causa est, recogitemus omnem idololatrian in hominis causam esse. recogitemus omnem idololatrian in homines esse culturam, cum ipsos deos nationum homines retro fuisse etiam apud suos constet.* Cic. Nat. Deor. III c. 19 *nostri quidem publicani, cum essent agri in Boeotia deorum immortalium excepti lege censoria, negabant immortales esse ullos, qui aliquando homines fuissent.* Lact. Diu. Inst. I 15 cites Cic. Cons. '*non dubitauit dicere deos, qui publice colerentur, homines fuisse...cum uero (inquit) et mares et feminas complures ex hominibus in deorum numero esse uideamus.*' Socr. Hist. Eccl. III 23 f. p. 204 205. Aug. Serm. 273 c. 3 4 (V 1106 b sq.). Bingham XIII 3 3 n. 56 sq. Kaye 206. Euhemeri Reliquiae coll. Geyza Némethy (cir. 1891) good ed. Aug. Ciu. Dei IV 27. Athenag. Suppl. I p. 1[b] names Hektor, Agamemnon, Erechtheus, Agraulos etc. cf. Minuc. 22 § 8 sq. of Saturn. Athenag. 28 cites Herodot. II 144 and Alexander the great in a letter to his mother as witnesses to the Egyptian priest's confession that the gods had been men. Minuc. 21 § 4 *Alexander ille magnus Macedo insigni uolumine ad matrem suam scripsit, metu suae potestatis proditum sibi de dis hominibus a sacerdote secretum.* cf. Aug. and Plut. in Holden. Athenag. 30 cites the Sibyl. Aug. in Ps. 93 3 a. m. Theod. Gr. Aff. Cur. III 42 sq. VIII 113 sq.

p. 36 l. 21 TESTIMONIVM PERHIBENTIBVS Varr. Plin. Apul. Metam. II 36 *uos in hanc rem boni Quirites testimonium perhibetote* [and often later, A. S.].

p. 36 l. 22 NATI cet. Arnob. I 37 *discetis, quibus singuli*

patribus, quibus matribus fuerint procreati, qua innati regione, qua gente, quae fecerint egerint pertulerint actitarint. cf. 36. Tatian 21 *γένεσιν ἂν λέγητε θεῶν, καὶ θνητοὺς αὐτοὺς ἀποφαίνεσθε.* Athenag. 18 p. 18[a] *οὐκ ἐξ ἀρχῆς, ὥς φασιν, ἦσαν οἱ θεοί, ἀλλ' οὕτως γέγονεν αὐτῶν ἕκαστος ὡς γινόμεθα ἡμεῖς* cet. Iustin. Cohort. ad Gent. 2. Lact. Diu. Inst. v 19 § 15. Infra c. 25 Iuppiter in Crete.

p. 36 l. 24 SEPVLTI c. 12 *in insulas relegamur? solet et in insulis aliqui deus uester aut nasci aut mori.* ad nat. II 7 p. 106 l. 14 Wiss. *sepulcris regum uestrorum caelum infamatis.* II 12 pr. *nam quot deos et quos utique producam?...ueteres an et nouicios? mares an et feminas?...rusticos an et urbanos? ciues an et peregrinos?* cet. Lact. Ira Dei 11 § 8 (Euhemerus and Ennius). Diu. Inst. I 11 §§ 33 34 (Ennius). 45 46 (Jove's tomb in Crete). 13 § 14. Epit. 13. Arnob. IV 29. V 31. Minuc. 21 § 1 Holden. Plut. II 680[a]. Euhemerus in DS. (Mullach Fragm. Philos. II 431—8). Aug. Ciu. Dei VII 26. Constantine Or. ad Sanct. Coet. 4 § 3 *τῶν δ' ἀφθάρτων ἐκείνων τάφους τε καὶ θήκας ἐπιδεικνύουσιν αὐτοί, κατοιχομένους τε τιμαῖς ἀθανάτοις γεραίρουσιν.* Luc. Iuppiter Trag. 45.

p. 36 l. 25 TOT AC TANTOS De Spect. 30 p. 28 l. 20 Wiss. *quid admirer? quid rideam? ubi gaudeam, ubi exsultem, tot spectans reges, qui in caelum recepti nuntiabantur, cum Ioue ipso et ipsis suis testibus in imis tenebris congemescentes?* ad nat. I 10 p. 75 l. 16 Wiss. *tot ac tanti.* Ou. Trist. III 1 77—8 *di, precor, atque adeo (neque enim mihi turba roganda est) Caesar, ades uoto, maxime diue, meo.* Aetna 62. Aug. Ciu. Dei III 12 (Haverc.). Iuu. 13 46—8 n. Bayle œuvres III 282—3. Lobeck Aglaoph. 507—9. 626. Keim Rom u. das Christenthum 226. Preller-Jordan röm. Myth. I[3] 137. Marquardt III[2] 18 n. 10 and 11.

p. 36 l. 26 CAPTIVOS infr. c. 25 p. 90 l. 15. Marquardt III[2] 34 n. 1—3. Kortholt Pag. Obtr. 88—9. Prud. c. Symm. II 18 sq. 347—361 (349—351) *inter fumantes templorum armata ruinas dextera uictoris simulacra hostilia cepit et captiua domum, uenerans ceu numina uexit.* Arnob. III 38 f. Macr. S. III 9 § 2.

PROPRIOS ad nat. II 9 p. 111, 10 Wiss. *nos uero bifariam Romanorum deos recognoscimus, communes et proprios, id est,*

quos cum omnibus habent et quos ipsi sunt commenti. Arnob. IV 4 *quid enim Romani deos possident peculiares, qui aliarum gentium non sint, et quemadmodum poterunt di esse, si non omnibus quae ubique sunt gentes aequabilitatem sui numinis exhibebunt?* cf. Marquardt III[2] 380 n. 2.

p. 36 l. 27 MASCVLOS FEMINAS Arnob. III 6 (p. 115 27). Augustus (Dio LVI 3 § 1 pr.) commends married knights for imitating the divine example.

p. 36 l. 28 OTIOSVM EST cet. Minuc. 23 § 1 *otiosum est ire per singulos et totam seriem generis istius explicare, cum in primis parentibus probata mortalitas in ceteros ipso ordine successionis influxerit. otiosum est* also in Tac. Ann. XIII 3. Lact. Diu. Inst. II 4 § 28.

p. 36 l. 28 infra c. 24. ad nat. II 12 p. 116 l. 15 Wiss. *quanto diffusa res est, tanto substringenda nobis erit, et ideo, qui in ista specie unum tuemur propositum demonstrandi illos omnes homines fuisse (non quidem ut cognoscatis, nam quasi obliti* (MS *-a*) *agitis*). Local gods comm. on Aen. II 351. V 95. Meurs. on Lycophr. 1473.

p. 36 l. 29 COGNOSCATIS Sen. Med. 194 *si iudicas, cognosce; si regnas, iube.*

p. 36 l. 30 OBLITOS AGITIS c. 1 p. 2 l. 10 c. 37 p. 108 l. 5 *hostes exsertos agere.* Praescr. Haer. 13 *uerbum...ex ea natum egisse Iesum Christum.* ad nat. II 7 p. 107 l. 7 Wiss. *quam incerti agitis circa conscientiae pudorem!*

ANTE SATVRNVM cet. same as Minuc. Oct. 21 Halm = 22 Oehler. Cf. Ebert 369 seq. Tert. ad nat. II 12 p. 116 l. 19 Wiss....*originem generis illorum retractando. origo enim una totius posteritatis. ea origo deorum uestrorum Saturno, ut opinor, signatur.* Arnob. II 70. 71.

p. 36 ll. 33 ff. ad nat. II 12 p. 119 l. 8 Wiss. *exstat apud litteras uestras usquequaque Saturni census. legimus apud Cassium Seuerum, apud Cornelios Nepotem et Tacitum* (Hist. V 2 § 4), *apud Graecos quoque Diodorum quiue alii antiquitatum canos collegerunt.*

p. 36 l. 33 DIODORVS [Iust. M.] Coh. ad Gent. 9 p. 10 c. sq. 25 f. p. 24 c.

p. 38 l. 1 THALLVS infra c. 19. Lact. Diu. Inst. I 13 § 8, 23 § 2.

Theophil. III 29. According to Africanus in Euseb. Praep. Eu. X 10 §§ 3 5 and Euseb. Chron. I p. 14 dealt with Syrian history from Troy to Olymp. 167. [Iust. Mart.] Cohort. ad Gent. c. 9 p. 10[b]. Lardner Heathen Pr. II c. 13 f. p. 122—3 vol. 7 ed. 1829. Müller Fr. Hist. Gr. III 517—9.

CASSIVS SEVERVS C. Müller Fr. Hist. III 517: may be C. Hemina or C. Longinus, Pauly-Wissowa III 1744—9. Minuc. l. c. *scit hoc Nepos et Cassius in historia et Thallus ac Diodorus hoc loquuntur.* In cap. 46 we have Hippias the sophist identified with the son of Pisistratus. Lact. Diu. Inst. I 13 § 8 *omnes ergo non tantum poetae sed historiarum quoque et rerum antiquarum scriptores hominem fuisse consentiunt, qui res eius in Italia gestas memoriae prodiderunt, Graeci Diodorus et Thallus, Latini Nepos et Cassius et Varro.* Thallus again ib. 23 § 2. Cf. infra c. 19 p. 64 l. 14. About Saturn, ad nat II 12 (Tacitus for Thallus). Lact. Diu. Inst. I 11 § 50—15 § 2.

p. 38 l. 2 COMMENTATOR Carn. Christi 22, euangelii (author) Carn. Res. 33, Adu. Marc. IV 2. c. Val. 34 f. De Cor. Mil. 7. Anim. 46. [Rufin.] c. in Joel I 1.

p. 38 l. 4 ad nat. II 12 p. 119 l. 11 Wiss. *nec fideliora uestigia eius quam in ipsa Italia signata sunt. nam post plurimas terras et Attica hospitia Italiae uel, ut tunc uocabatur, Oenotriae consedit, exceptus ab Iano siue Iane, ut Salii uocant. mons, quem coluerat, Saturnius dictus, urbs, quam depalauerat, Saturnia usque nunc est.* Arnob. IV 24.

p. 38 l. 5 POST infr. p. 38 l. 8. Scorpiace 11 (p. 170 l. 22 Wiss.).

p. 38 l. 7 DEPALAVERAT ad nat. II 12 (above). Hermog. 29 pr. Archiv f. Lat. Lex. VIII 189. Hermas Simil. V 2 § 5 *uerum cum post aliquantum temporis dominus eiusdem rediens in uineam intrasset et uidisset decenter eam depalatam*, κεχαρακωμένον (cf. § 3 *cum uineae palos iunxisset*, [τελέσας τὴν χαράκωσιν τοῦ ἀμπελῶνος]). CIL VIII 2728.

p. 38 l. 8 POST p. 38 l. 5.

p. 38 l. 9 SATVRNIA Arnob. I 36 *ciuitatis Saturniae Saturnus auctor.* Verg. Aen. VII 180, VIII 357. Seru. on VIII 318. Muncker on Fulg. I 2 p. 626 Stav.

TABVLAE Minuc. 22 § 9 *Saturnus Creta profugus...rudes*

illos homines et agrestes multa docuit, ut Graeculus et politus, litteras imprimere, nummos signare, instrumenta conficere.

p. 38 l. 10 SIGNATVS NVMMVS Macr. Sat. I 7 § 22 Jan.

HOMO cf. Cic. in Lact. Diu. Inst. I 15 § 19 seq. Arnob. IV 29. Athenag. 28 p. 150. 29 p. 154 (examples 28—30). Sibyl in Otto IX 463—4.

p. 38 l. 11 EX HOMINE cf. p. 38 l. 23.

ad nat. II 12 p. 116 l. 21 Wiss. *neque enim...nobis excidisse debet omnem patrem filiis antiquiorem, tam Saturnum Ioue quam Caelum Saturno: de Caelo enim et Terra Saturnus.*

DE CAELO (cf. l. 16, c. 4, p. 16, l. 21)...TERRAE FILIOS Minuc. 22 § 11 = 21 § 8 Halm (quoted by Lact. I 11 § 55) *homo igitur utique qui fugit, homo utique qui latuit, et pater hominis et natus ex homine, terrae enim et caeli filius, quod apud Italos esset ignotis parentibus proditus, ut in hodiernum inopinato uisos caelo missos, ignobiles et ignotos terrae filios nominamus.* Petr. 43 Fr. Cic. Ad Fam. VII 9 § 3. Otto Sprichw. 344. Iuu. 8 257 *terrae parenti.* 4 98 n. *malim fraterculus esse gigantis.* Ammian. XXII 2 4 *tamquam demissum aliquem uisura de caelo.* Paneg. 5 19 (146 11 B.) *quem ut caelo delapsum intuebantur* (Archiv f. lat. Lex. VII 610—1, VIII 25). Lact. Diu. Inst. III 20 § 7. cf. I 11 § 55 Bü. V 8 § 2 *quid uobis inanem iustitiam depingitis et optatis cadere de caelo, tamquam in aliquo simulacro figuratam.*

p. 38 l. 18 TACEO QVOD Val. Max. IV 4 9 *taceo enim quod princeps ciuitatis filiam ei nuptum dedit.*

p. 38 l. 21. Heraldus quotes Aristot. Rhet. II 23 § 26 p. 1400b 4 *ἄλλος <τόπος>, ὅταν τι ἐναντίον μέλλῃ πράττεσθαι τοῖς πεπραγμένοις, ἅμα σκοπεῖν, οἷον Ξενοφάνης Ἐλεάταις ἐρωτῶσιν εἰ θύωσι τῇ Λευκοθέᾳ καὶ θρηνῶσιν ἢ μή, συνεβούλευεν, εἰ μὲν θεὸν ὑπολαμβάνουσιν, μὴ θρηνεῖν, εἰ δ' ἄνθρωπον, μὴ θύειν.* Capitol. Aurel. 18 § 2 *tantusque illius amor eo die...claruit, ut nemo illum plangendum censuerit, certis omnibus, quod ab dis commodatus ad deos redisset.* On Drusilla's death A.D. 38, D. Cass. LIX 11 *αἰτίαν τε πάντες ὁμοίως εἶχον, εἴθ' ἥσθησαν ἐπί τινι ὡς λυπούμενοι, εἴτε καὶ ὡς χαίροντες ἔπραξαν· ἢ γὰρ μὴ πενθεῖν αὐτὴν ὡς ἄνθρωπον ἢ θρηνεῖν ὡς θεὸν ἐνεκαλοῦντο.* Luc. VIII 833 *et quem tu plangens hominem testaris*

Osirim. L'Abbé E. Beurlier Le Culte impérial, son histoire et son organisation depuis Auguste jusqu'à Justinien. Par. 1861. My notes on Iuu. 4 71 (with add. and ind. *deus*) *dis aequa potestas.* Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. III § 33, p. 43 l. 15 wrongly Nero, Domitian, Commodus.

p. 38 l. 22 PAVCIS Enn. Plaut. Ter. Afr. Cic. Sall. Verg. Hor. Liu. XLII 34 § 1.

p. 38 l. 23 IOVEM Arnob. I 34 f. II 70.

HOMINEM EX HOMINE (cf. p. 38 l. 11) Athenag. 29 p. 33c of Hercules and Aesculapius: either they were gods and without needs ἢ ἄνθρωποι γεγονότες καὶ πονηροὶ δι᾽ ἀμαθίαν ἦσαν καὶ χρημάτων ἐλάττους. τί δεῖ με πολλὰ λέγειν ἢ Κάστορος ἢ Πολυδεύκους μνημονεύοντα ἢ Ἀμφιάρεω οἵ, ὡς εἰπεῖν λόγῳ, χθὲς καὶ πρώην ἄνθρωποι ἐξ ἀνθρώπων γεγονότες, θεοὶ νομίζονται; Lact. Diu. Inst. I 8 §§ 3 4. Euseb. Pr. Eu. III 10 §§ 20 21.

p. 38 l. 24 EXAMEN cf. 40 p. 116 l. 32.

PAR with genit. De Patient. 16 *magnitudinis.* Adu. Marcion. IV 15 p. 465 l. 7 Kr. *creatoris.*

CAP. XI

p. 38 l. 25 HOMINES ad nat. II 13 pr. *affirmando illos post mortem deos factos, ut Varro et qui cum eo somniauerunt.* Aug. de Ciu. Dei VIII 26. VI 7 (I 258 19) *nonne adtestati sunt Euhemero, qui omnes tales deos non fabulosa garrulitate, sed historica diligentia homines fuisse mortalesque conscripsit?* Zahn Forschungen V 287 347. Arnob. IV 29 pr. Hild. Lact. Diu. Inst. I 11 § 17. Müller Fr. Hist. cited on p. 40 l. 33.

p. 38 l. 28 SVBLIMIOREM c. 24 a. m. *nam ut constaret illos deos esse, nonne conceditis de aestimatione communi aliquem esse sublimiorem et potentiorem, uelut principem mundi perfectae potentiae et maiestatis?*

p. 38 l. 29 MANCIPEM ad nat. I 9 pr. *sub eodem mancipe erroris.* ib. II 13 p. 121 l. 17 Wiss. *ita nullus datur nobis renuendi locus esse mancipem quendam diuinitatis.* De Idol. 1 f. *idolorum mancipes.* Arnob. I 28 *per quem, si sunt, esse et habere substantiam sui numinis maiestatisque coeperunt: a quo ipsam deitatem (ut ita dicam) sortiti se esse sentiunt.* Maximus Tyr. Orat. 1. (11 or 17) p. 138 l. 3 ed. Hobein.

p. 38 l. 30 DIVINITATEM. cap. 22 f. p. 76 l. 33.

p. 40 l. 4 NISI SI c. 7 p. 26 l. 9.

p. 40 l. 6 VT ALICVIVS OPERA INDIGERET cf. ἀνενδεής.

p. 40 l. 8 TOTVM cet. Arnob. I 30 *Apollo uobis pluit, Mercurius uobis pluit, Aesculapius, Hercules aut Diana rationem imbrium tempestatumque finxerunt? et hoc fieri qui potest, cum in mundo profiteamini eos natos certoque tempore sensum arripuisse uitalem! si enim temporis antiquitate mundus eos anteuenit, et priusquam nati sunt, iam nouerat pluuias tempestatesque natura, nullum serius nati pluendi ius habent, neque eis inserere rationibus se possunt, quas inuenerunt hic agi et maiore ab auctore tractari.* Theophil. II 4 p. 82[c]. Iustin. c. Tryph. 5. Iren. Fr. 34 (I 845 St.).

p. 40 l. 9 INNATVM: INNATVS and INFECTVS six exx. of each in Adu. Marc. I 15. For *innatus* especially cf. c. 47, p. 132, l. 28 n.

INFECTVM ἀτέλεστον gl. Paulin. Nol. Ep. 24 § 4 pr.

p. 40 l. 10 PYTHAGORAM Theophil. III 7 p. 121[a] (cf. ib.[c]) Πυθαγόρας δέ, τοσαῦτα μοχθήσας περὶ θεῶν καὶ τὴν ἄνω κάτω πορείαν ποιησάμενος, ἔσχατον ὁρίζει φύσιν καὶ αὐτοματισμὸν εἶναί φησιν τῶν πάντων· θεοὺς ἀνθρώπων μηδὲν φροντίζειν. So Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. VI § 13 p. 87 l. 18. P. taught necessity Lasaulx Studien p. 24 n. Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. IV p. 57 4—7 τὸ πᾶν...οὐ γεννητόν, ἀλλ' ἀΐδιον (Xenophanes). Parmenides ib. l. 24 οὖλον μουνογενές τε καὶ ἀτρεμὲς ἠδ' ἀγένητον. Arnob. II 56 *mundum quidam ex sapientibus aestimant neque esse natum neque ullo esse in tempore periturum; immortalem nonnulli, quamuis eum conscribant esse natum et genitum; tertiis uero collibitum dicere est, et esse natum et genitum et ordinaria necessitate periturum.* Cic. Tusc. Disp. I § 70 *haec igitur et alia innumerabilia cum cernimus, possumusne dubitare quin eis praesit aliquis uel effector, si haec nata sunt, ut Platoni uidetur, uel si semper fuerunt, ut Aristoteli placet, moderator tanti operis et muneris?*

p. 40 ll. 13—21 omn. Arnob. I 30.

p. 40 l. 15 CERTI RVISSE c. 9 p. 34 l. 5. c. 12 f.

p. 40 l. 16 FLORVISSE De Patient. 2 *qui florem lucis huius super iustos et iniustos aequaliter spargit.* Adu. Marc.

l. c. Heraldus p. 68 and Digress. I 7 pp. 204—5 πορφύρας ἄνθος.

p. 40 l. 17 Ad Scap. 2 *nos unum deum colimus, quem omnes naturaliter nostis, ad cuius fulgura et tonitrua contremiscitis.* Theophil. ad Autol. I 6 f.

p. 40 l. 18 [Philo] Vita Contempl. 1 (II 472 M.) *οἷς τίνας συγκρίνειν ἄξιον τῶν ἐπαγγελλομένων εὐσέβειαν; ἆρά γε τοὺς τὰ στοιχεῖα τιμῶντας, γῆν ὕδωρ ἀέρα πῦρ; οἷς καὶ ἐπωνυμίας ἔθεντο ἑτέρας ἕτεροι, τὸ μὲν πῦρ Ἥφαιστον παρὰ τὴν ἔξαψιν οἶμαι καλοῦντες, Ἥραν δὲ τὸν ἀέρα, παρὰ τὸ αἴρεσθαι καὶ μετεωρίζεσθαι πρὸς ὕψος, τὸ δὲ ὕδωρ Ποσειδῶνα, τάχα που διὰ τὸ ποτόν, τὴν δὲ γῆν Δημήτραν, παρ' ὅσον μήτηρ εἶναι δοκεῖ πάντων φυτῶν τε καὶ ζῴων.* *Palladis arbor, rami, Palladia silua, corona, -i latices.* Pallas = the olive. Ou. Ars Am. II 16 8 = oil. Haupt Opusc. II 168. Arnob. I 38 (Ehnenh. p. 35) *si enim uos Liberum, quod usum repperit uini, si quod panis, Cererem,...si Mineruam, quod oleae...diuorum rettulistis in censum.* ib. II 65. Lact. Diu. Inst. I 18 § 1 *hoc loco refellendi sunt etiam ii qui deos ex hominibus esse factos non tantum fatentur, sed ut eos laudent, etiam gloriantur, aut uirtutis gratia ut Herculem aut munerum ut Cererem et Liberum aut artium repertarum ut Aesculapium ac Mineruam.* § 18. Clem. Alex. Protr. 2 § 26 p. 22 P.

p. 40 l. 21 ad nat. II 16 pr. *sed enim quidam fructus et necessaria uictui demonstrauerunt. quaeso uos, cum dicitis inuenisse illos, nonne confitemini prius fuisse quae inuenirentur?* Adu. Marc. I 11 p. 304 l. 13 Kr. *quando etiam error orbis propterea deos praesumpserit, quos homines interdum confitetur, quoniam aliquid ab unoquoque prospectum uidetur utilitatibus et commodis uitae.* De Idol. 15 pr. Lact. Diu. Inst. VII 14 §§ 1 2. Kaye 207.

p. 40 l. 25 MALE cet. ad nat. II 16 *cerasium Cn. Pompeius de Ponto <primus> Italiae prouolgauit.* Hier. Ep. 31 3. Plin. Hist. Nat. XV § 102 *cerasi ante uictoriam Mithridaticam L. Luculli non fuere in Italia, ad urbis annum* DCLXXX. *is primus uexit e Ponto, annisque* CXX *trans oceanum in Britanniam usque peruenere.*

p. 40 l. 29 VACAT c. 1 p. 2 l. 24 n. De Patient. 9 *cum constet de resurrectione mortuorum, uacat dolor mortis, uacat et impatientia doloris.*

p. 40 l. 33 Hor. Carm. III 3 9—18. Epist. II 1 5 6. Marquardt III² 58 n. 5. Heraldus Digress. I 11 (pp. 210—2) e.g. Marius Senec. De Ira III 18 § 1 (statues, frankincense and wine). Euseb. Praep. Eu. II 2 53 p. 59[c] (from DS.) *ἑτέρους δὲ λέγουσιν ἐπιγείους γενέσθαι θεούς, διὰ δὲ τὰς εἰς ἀνθρώπους εὐεργεσίας ἀθανάτου τετυχηκότας τιμῆς τε καὶ δόξης, οἷον Ἡρακλέα, Διόνυσον, Ἀρισταῖον, καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους τοὺς τούτοις ὁμοίους.* Cic. De Nat. Deor. I § 38 M., II § 62 M. Philo Byblius (Müller Fr. Hist. III 564 n. 1 7 from Euseb. Praep. Eu. I 9 p. 32[d]) *οἱ παλαίτατοι τῶν βαρβάρων, ἐξαιρέτως δὲ Φοίνικές τε καὶ Αἰγύπτιοι παρ' ὧν καὶ οἱ λοιποὶ παρέλαβον ἄνθρωποι, θεοὺς ἐνόμιζον μεγίστους τοὺς τὰ πρὸς τὴν βιωτικὴν χρείαν εὑρόντας, ἢ καὶ κατά τι εὖ ποιήσαντας τὰ ἔθνη· εὐεργέτας τε τούτους καὶ πολλῶν αἰτίους ἀγαθῶν ἡγούμενοι ὡς θεοὺς προσεκύνουν, καὶ εἰς τὸ χρεὼν καταστάντας ναοὺς κατασκευασάμενοι, στήλας τε καὶ ῥάβδους ἀφιέρουν ἐξ ὀνόματος αὐτῶν.* Plut. Dio 46 § 1, Dio called God and Saviour. [Numerous similar exx. in Egyptian papyri, cf. ZNTW V [1904] 353 ff. A. S.] Lact. Diu. Inst. I 8 § 8. Theodoret Graec. Affec. Cur. II § 97 p. 35 28, III 24 p. 42 8.

p. 42 l. 3 (of the heathen emperors) Prudent. Contra Symm. I 25—27 *heus male de populo meriti, male patribus ipsis | blanditi, quos praecipites in tartara mergi | cum Ioue siuerunt multa et cum plebe deorum.* Lact. Diu. Inst. VII 14 § 3.

p. 42 l. 4 cf. infr. c. 14. Verg. Aen. VI 608 seq. Philosophers owed to prophets their knowledge of hell. Theophil. I 14. Bayle reply to questions, œuvres t. IV p. 322 seq. Ja. Windet De Vita functorum Statu ex Hebr. et Gr. comparatis Sententiis Lond. 1677 s. 1.

CVM VVLTIS Friedländer III⁵ 754 seq.

p. 42 l. 5 INCESTI IN SORORES cf. c. 9 p. 34 l. 15 n. 21 p. 68 l. 13 like Iuppiter. Origen c. Cels. I 17 p. 14 fin. Hennecke Aristid. ind. *συνουσία.* Lucian Necyom. 11. In Egypt Paus. I 7 § 1 Frazer.

p. 42 l. 6 VIRGINVM Iustin XXI 3 maidens devoted to prostitution to win favour from Venus.

p. 42 l. 7 QVI FVRANTVR Sext. Emp. Hypot. III 24 p. 181 Fabr. *ἀλλὰ καὶ κλέπτειν μὲν παρ' ἡμῖν μὲν ἄδικον καὶ παράνομόν ἐστιν· οἱ δὲ καὶ κλεπτίστατον εἶναι θεὸν λέγοντες τὸν Ἑρμῆν οὐκ ἄδικον τοῦτο νομίζεσθαι ποιοῦσι. πῶς γὰρ ἂν θεὸς εἴη κακός;* Lucian Prometh. 16 *ἀλλὰ κακοῦργοί τινες, φής, εἶναι ἐν αὐτοῖς καὶ μοιχεύουσι καὶ πολεμοῦσι και ἀδελφὰς γαμοῦσι καὶ πατράσιν ἐπιβουλεύουσι· παρ' ἡμῖν γὰρ οὐχὶ πολλὴ τούτων ἀφθονία;*

p. 42 l. 8 DEI cf. Friedländer S. G. III⁵ 610. 661—3. Cic. De Nat. Deor. I § 42 M. Tatian 21. Aug. De Ciu. Dei II 7. III 3. esp. Sen. Vita Beata 26 § 6. Aristides Apol. 19 cf. Hennecke ind. *παράνομος*. Theophil. III 3. Arnob. V 28 29. Bayle œuvres III 367.

p. 42 l. 10 HOMINES Athenag. 26 *οἱ δὲ τοῖς πολλοῖς ἀρέσκοντες θεοὶ καὶ ταῖς εἰκόσιν ἐπονομαζόμενοι, ὥς ἔστιν ἐκ τῆς κατ' αὐτοὺς ἱστορίας εἰδέναι, ἄνθρωποι γεγόνασιν.* Arnob. V 30.

p. 42 l. 11 Euripid. Bellerophontes in Plut. Stoic. Repugn. p. 1049 *εἰ θεοί τι δρῶσιν αἰσχρόν, οὐκ εἰσὶν θεοί* [= Nauck frag.² 292 A. S.] Lact. I 19 §§ 6, 7.

p. 42 l. 14 HORVM PARES c. 10 f. Oehler.

p. 42 l. 15 Iustin. Apol. II 14 f. Theophil. III 3 (Thyestean feasts and incest among gods). Prudent. Perist. X 201—5 *sed, credo, magni limen amplectar Iouis: | qui si citetur legibus uestris reus, | laqueis minacis implicatus Iuliae, | luat seueram uinctus et Scantiniam, | te cognitore dignus ire in carcerem.* Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. III § 50 p. 45 41 seq.

p. 42 l. 17 Cf. Clem. Hom. IV 12 seq. 23—25. V 10—19. Arnob. V 8 (Havercamp). Iulian. Caes. 334ᵇ seq. reproaches M. Aurelius for deifying Faustina. Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. III 96. Aug. De Ciu. Dei IV 27 (I 180 11 D.) 26 f.

p. 42 l. 20 Diog. Laert. VI 39 (in Havercamp).

ALIQVEM cf. c. 19 p. 64 l. 10.

DE p. 20 l. 4. omn. Aug. Ep. 91 4 *et reuera Terentianus* (Eun. III 5) *ille adulescens, qui spectans tabulam pictam in pariete, ubi pictura inerat de adulterio regis deorum, libidinem*

qua rapiebatur, stimulis etiam tantae auctoritatis accendit, nullo modo in illud flagitium uel concupiscendo laberetur, uel perpetrando immergeretur, si Catonem maluisset imitari quam Iouem: sed quo pacto id faceret, cum in templis adorare cogeretur Iouem potius quam Catonem? Verum haec ex comoedia, quibus impiorum luxus et sacrilega superstitio conuinceretur, proferre forsitan non debemus.

p. 42 l. 21 ARISTIDEN Themist. p. 114 *b*. Tert. ad nat. I 19 a. m. *id* <judgement after death> *uos Minoi et Rhadamantho adscribitis, iustiore interim Aristide recusato.* Nep. Aristid. I §§ 2—4. V. M. VI 5 e. 2. Macrob. Sat. VI (VII) 3 § 17. Pauly-Wissowa II 880—885. Hermogenes *περὶ τῶν στάσεων* c. 1 (III 7 l. 2, 3 Walz Rhett. cf. ind.) among *ἀπίθανα—οἷον εἰ Σωκράτην τις πλάττοι πορνοβοσκοῦντα ἢ Ἀριστείδην ἀδικοῦντα.* Aug. Ep. 138 18 pr. *quis autem uel risu dignum non putet, quod Apollonium et Apuleium ceterosque magicarum artium peritissimos conferre Christo, uel etiam praeferre conantur? quamquam tolerabilius ferendum sit, quando istos ei comparant potius quam deos suos: multo enim melior, quod fatendum est, Apollonius fuit, quam tot stuprorum auctor et perpetrator, quem Iouem nominant. ista, inquiunt, fabulosa sunt. adhuc ergo laudent rei publicae luxuriosam licentiosam planeque sacrilegam felicitatem, quae ista deorum probra confinxit, quae non solum in fabulis audienda posuit, uerum etiam in theatris spectanda proposuit; ubi crimina plura essent quam numina, quae ipsi di sibi exhiberi habebant libenter, qui in suos cultores uindicare debuerunt, quod ea saltem uiderent patienter.* Aristides *ὁ δίκαιος* Aeschin. I 25. II 23. III 181 cet. Chalcid. in Tim. Plat. c. 172. Andoc. IV 12. Isocr. VIII 7. Plut. Aristid. 3 § 6. 4 § 1. 6 §§ 1 2. 7 §§ 1 10. Diod. Sic. XI 47 2. Luc. Ver. Hist. II § 10. Calumn. 27. Apul. de mag. 18 *eadem est enim paupertas in Aristide iusta...in Socrate sapiens.* v. l. in Cic. de offic. III § 16. Amm. XXX 4 21. Ampel. 15 § 10 *A. Dicaeos.* Sen. de benef. IV 27 § 2 *Aristides, cui iustitia nomen dedit, iniustus est?* cf. Cons. ad Helu. 13 § 7. Cic. pro Sest. § 141. Greg. Naz. c. 10 346 (vol. II p. 430). Liban. Ep. 506. Doxopater in Rhett. Gr. Walz II 269 16 seq. *χαρακτηρίζεται ἕτερος ἀπὸ δικαιοσύνης, ὥσπερ Ἀριστείδης.*

p. 42 l. 25 SVBLIMIOR cf. *de sublimitate Alexandrum* supr. Sall. Hist. Fr. III 88 (p. 145 Maurenb.) *Pompeius a prima adulescentia sermone fautorum similem fore se credens Alexandro regi, facta consultaque eius quidem aemulus erat.*

FELICIOR Plin. VII § 137 *unus hominum ad hoc aeui Felicis sibi cognomen asseruit L. Sulla* cet. cf. II § 144. XVIII § 32. XXII § 12. Sid. Ep. II 13 § 2. Plut. Sull. 34 § 3. He named his children Faustus and Fausta. Luc. II 221—2 *hisne salus rerum Felix his Sulla uocari, his meruit tumulum medio sibi tollere Campo?* Hier. c. Iouin. I 48 (II 316c) *Lucii Sullae Felicis (si non habuisset uxorem) Metella coniux palam erat impudica.*

p. 42 l. 28 CLVSIT Arn. II 66 p. 229 Hild.

MELIORIBVS Aug. Ep. 138 § 18 (cited above).

p. 42 l. 29 MVSSITANTIBVS Plaut. Liu. Cypr. uulg.

ERVBESCIT cf. c. 9 p. 32 l. 31.

Cap. XII

On idols see Lact. II 2. Orig. c. Celsum I 5.

p. 42 l. 33 MORTVORVM c. 40 p. 116 l. 29. Minuc. 23 § 6 *manifestum est homines illos fuisse, quos et natos legimus et mortuos scimus.*

p. 42 l. 34 SIMVLACRIS images only emblems. Athenag Suppl. 18 in. Arnob. VI 17 ( )(14). Lact. II 2. Celsus says that Christian wisdom is but a sorry thing, if it only teaches that wood, stone, bronze, polished by an artist is no true god. Theophil. II 1 the artists will worship, when sold, their own handiwork.

p. 42 l. 34—p. 44 l. 6. Ep. ad Diogn. 2 *οὐ πρὶν ἢ ταῖς τέχναις τούτων εἰς τὴν μορφὴν τούτων ἐκτυπωθῆναι ἦν ἕκαστον αὐτῶν ἑκάστῳ εἰκάζειν μεταμορφούμενον; οὐ τὰ νῦν ἐκ τῆς αὐτῆς ὕλης ὄντα σκεύη γένοιτ' ἄν, εἰ τύχοι τῶν αὐτῶν τεχνιτῶν, ὅμοια τοιούτοις; οὐ ταῦτα πάλιν τὰ νῦν ὑφ' ὑμῶν προσκυνούμενα δύναιτ' ἂν ὑπὸ ἀνθρώπων σκεύη ὅμοια γενέσθαι τοῖς λοιποῖς;* Prudent. Perist. X 296—300 *non erubescis, stulte pago dedite, | te tanta semper perdidisse obsonia, | quae dis ineptus obtulisti talibus, quos trulla, peluis, cantharus, sartagines | fracta et liquata contulerunt uascula!* Iuu. 10 64 n. Arnob. VI 14. [Philo] Vita

Contempl. 1 (II 472 M.) ὧν τὰ ἀδελφὰ μέρη καὶ συγγενῆ λουτροφόροι γεγόνασι καὶ ποδόνιπτρα. Gregorius Palamas Migne P. G. CL (cent. 14) ἀδελφά, φασί, καὶ ὁμόχροα καὶ τῆς αὐτῆς κεραμείας. Iustin. Apol. I 9 p. 57^d τί γὰρ δεῖ εἰδόσιν ὑμῖν λέγειν, ἃ τὴν ὕλην οἱ τεχνῖται διατιθέασι ξέοντες καὶ τέμνοντες καὶ χωνεύοντες καὶ τύπτοντες; καὶ ἐξ ἀτίμων πολλάκις σκευῶν διὰ τέχνης τὸ σχῆμα μόνον ἀλλάξαντες καὶ μορφοποιήσαντες θεοὺς ἐπονομάζουσιν. Clem. Recogn. V 15. Commodian Instr. I 20 7—8 *et deos audetis aeramine dicere fusos? Solueretis eos magis in uascula uobis.*

p. 44 l. 1 EX ISDEM VASCVLIS infr. c. 13 *in caccabulum de Saturno, aliquando in trullam de Minerua.* Minuc. 23 § 9 *deus aureus uel argenteus de immundo uasculo saepius, ut factum Aegyptio regi, conflatur, tunditur, malleis et incudibus figuratur.* Athenag. 26 p. 30^b ἀλλ' ἡ μὲν ὕλη χαλκός ἐστιν. τί δαὶ χαλκὸς δύναται καθ' ἑαυτόν, ὃν μεταποιῆσαι πάλιν εἰς ἕτερον σχῆμα ἔξεστιν, ὡς τὸν ποδονιπτῆρα ὁ παρὰ τῷ Ἡροδότῳ Ἄμασις [II 163], ridiculed for his low birth, he recast his golden footpan into an idol. cf. J. Geffcken zwei Apologeten XXI.

p. 44 l. 2 LICENTIA ARTIS Prudent. Peristeph. X 266—270 *sed pulcra res est forma in aere sculptilis: | quid inprecabor officinis Graeciae, | quae condiderunt gentibus stultis deos? forceps Myronis, malleus Polycliti | natura uestrum est atque origo caelitum.* 291—295 *miror, quod ipsum non sacrastis Mentorem, | nec templa et aras ipse Phidias habet, | fabri deorum uel parentes numinum: | qui si caminis institissent segnius, | non esset ullus Iuppiter conflatilis.*

p. 44 l. 3 ad Scap. 2 *longum est, si retexamus, quibus aliis modis et derideantur et contemnantur omnes di ab ipsis cultoribus suis.* Ep. ad Diognet. 2 ὑμεῖς γὰρ οἱ νῦν νομίζοντες καὶ σεβόμενοι <τούτους θεούς>, οὐ πολὺ πλέον αὐτῶν καταφρονεῖτε; οὐ πολὺ μᾶλλον αὐτοὺς χλευάζετε καὶ ὑβρίζετε; Hennecke ind. Aristid. s.v. δημιουργός.

p. 44 l. 6 ad Mart. 4 (*gladius, crux, rabies bestiarum, ignis, tormenta*). Sen. ad Marc. 20 § 3 *uideo istic cruces non unius quidem generis, sed aliter ab aliis fabricatas: capite quidem conuersos in terram suspendere, alii per obscena stipitem egerunt, alii bracchia patibulo explicuerunt.* Vit. Beat. 19 § 3 *ad*

supplicium tamen acti stipitibus singulis pendent. Ep. 14 § 5 *adactum per medium hominem, qui per os emergeret, stipitem.*

p. 44 l. 9 VNGVLIS c. 30 f. *sic itaque nos ad Deum expansos ungulae fodiant, cruces suspendant.* [cf. Ps.-Aug. quaest. V. et N.T. CXXVII 102 § 14 (p. 210 22 Souter) *tortus huius modi et exungulatus hoc uerum esse dicit quod sequitur.* A. S.]

p. 44 l. 10 RVNCINAE Minuc. 23 § 9 *deus enim ligneus, rogi fortasse uel infelicis stipitis portio, suspenditur, caeditur, dolatur, runcinatur.* Aristid. apol. 13. Orig. c. Cels. VI 14 *κἂν τινες δὲ μὴ ταῦτά φασιν εἶναι τοὺς θεούς, ἀλλὰ μιμήματα θεῶν ἀληθινῶν κἀκείνων σύμβολα· οὐδὲν ἧττον καὶ οὗτοι, ἐν βαναύσων χερσὶ τὰ μιμήματα τῆς θειοτητος φανταζόμενοι εἶναι, ἀπαίδευτοί εἰσι καὶ ἀνδράποδα καὶ ἀμαθεῖς· ὡς τοὺς ἐσχάτους τῶν ἐν ἡμῖν ἀπηλλάχθαι ταύτης τῆς ἀπαιδευσίας.* Hier. in Esai. l. XII c. 44 12 (IV 527[e] 528[d]).

p. 44 l. 11 ANTE ad nat. I 4 p. 64 l. 20 Wiss. *quos retro ante hoc nomen uagos uiles improbos norant* (cf. *post* Oehler on Scorp. 11 p. 526). cf. Arnob. I 39 pr. Minuc. 33.

PLVMBVM c. 29 f. *non ludimus de officio salutis eorum [Caesarum], qui eam non putamus in manibus esse plumbatis.* Arnob. VI 16. Cic. Rep. VI § 8 *illa diuina uirtus non statuas plumbo inhaerentes nec triumphos arescentibus laureis...desiderat.* Basil. de legendis Libris Gentilium 5 (II 180[b]) *οἱ ἀνδριάντες οἱ τῷ μολύβδῳ συνδεδεμένοι.*

GLVTINVM Lucian Iupp. Trag. 33 *πίττης γοῦν ἀναπέπλησται ὁσημέραι ἐκματτόμενος, ὑπὸ τῶν ἀνδριαντοποιῶν...ἐτύγχανον γὰρ ἄρτι χαλκουργῶν ὕπο | πιττούμενος στέρνον τε καὶ μετάφρενον.* Prudent. c. Symm. I 436—7 *mollis si bractea gypsum texerat, infido rarescit glutine sensim.* Lions of Rhea Lucian Deor. Dial. XII 1 2.

p. 44 l. 12 GOMPHOS omn. Luc. Gallus 24 *κἀκείνων γὰρ ἕκαστος ἔκτοθεν μὲν Ποσειδῶν ἢ Ζεύς ἐστι πάγκαλος, ἐκ χρυσίου καὶ ἐλέφαντος συνειργασμένος, κεραυνὸν ἢ ἀστραπὴν ἢ τρίαιναν ἔχων ἐν τῇ δεξιᾷ· ἢν δὲ ὑποκύψας ἴδῃς τά γ᾽ ἔνδον, ὄψει μοχλούς τινας καὶ γόμφους καὶ ἥλους διαμπὰξ διαπεπερονημένους καὶ κορμοὺς καὶ σφῆνας καὶ πίτταν καὶ πηλὸν καὶ πολλήν τινα ἀμορφίαν ὑποικουροῦσαν· ἐῶ λέγειν μυῶν πλῆθος*

ἢ μυγαλῶν ἐμπολιτευόμενον αὐτοῖς ἐνίοτε. Isaiah 41 7. Jerem. 10 4.

SINE CAPITE Hier. on Abacuc l. II c. 3 (VI 659de Vall.) *si quando tyrannus obtruncatur, imagines quoque eius deponuntur et statuae, et uultu tantummodo commutato ablatoque capite, eius qui uicerit facies superponitur, ut manente corpore capitibusque praecisis caput aliud commutetur.* Suet. Tib. 58 Casaub. *statuae quidam Augusti caput dempserat, ut alterius imponeret.*

p. 44 l. 13 CAELESTI cap. 23 p. 80 l. 8 Iuno Caelestis evoked and removed to Rome in the Third Punic War. Seru. Aen. XII 841. Astarte Preller-Jordan II 406—7 riding on a lion in the coins of Septimius Seuerus and Caracalla, frequent in inscriptions (Roscher). P. Faber Semestrium (Lugd. 1595) l. III c. 2. Münter Relig. der Carth.[2] 62. Saluian. de Gubernat. Dei VIII §§ 9 seq. Ambr. Ep. 18 30. Vict. Viten. III 49.

p. 44 l. 14 IN METALLA DAMNAMVR infra c. 39 med. collections for *si qui in metallis, et si qui in insulis uel in custodiis.* cf. 1. 27 f. p. 92 30. cult. fem. I 5 pr. Euseb. Hist. Eccl. VIII 13 § 5 copper mines of Phaeno in Palestine. IX 1 § 7. Vit. Const. II 32. 20 § 3. Rufin. h.e. X 4. cf. de martyr. Palest. 5 § 2. 7 §§ 2 3. 8 §§ 1 13. 9 § 1. 11 § 6. 13 §§ 1 2. W. Wattenbach Passio Sanctorum IV coronatorum in Max. Büdinger Untersuchng. zur röm. Kaisergesch. III Leipz. 1870 pp. 321—379. Andrewes, who used largely the old liturgies (Greek Devotions ed. Medd, p. 41) Μνήσθητι, κύριε,...τῶν ἐν μετάλλοις. Constit. Apost. VIII 10 ὑπὲρ τῶν ἐν μετάλλοις καὶ ἐξορίαις καὶ φυλακαῖς καὶ δεσμοῖς ὄντων διὰ τὸ ὄνομα τοῦ κυρίου δεηθῶμεν. Litany n. 29 and to shew thy pity upon all prisoners and captives. Liturgia Marci (Renaudot I 146) τοὺς ἐν φυλακαῖς, ἐν μετάλλοις ἢ δίκαις ἢ καταδίκαις ἢ ἐν ἐξορίαις ἢ πικρᾷ δουλείᾳ ἢ φόροις κατεχομένους πάντας ἐλέησον, πάντας ἐλευθέρωσον. Cypr. Ep. 77 (to Cypr.) c. 3 pr. (p. 835 l. 16) *tenebras carceris inluminasti, montes metalli in plana deduxisti.* Ep. 76 c. 1 (p. 828 l. 4 seq.) *an ego possim tacere et uocem meam silentio premere, cum de carissimis meis tam multa et gloriosa cognoscam, quibus uos diuina dignatio honorauit, ut ex uobis pars iam martyrii sui consummatione praecesserit meritorum suorum coronam de Domino receptura,*

pars adhuc in carcerum claustris siue in metallis et uinculis demoretur? c. 2 (p. 829 l. 8) *quid uero mirum si uasa aurea et argentea in metallum id est auri et argenti domicilium dati estis? nisi quod nunc metallorum natura conuersa est locaque quae aurum et argentum dare ante consueuerant accipere coeperunt.* c. 6 (p. 832 l. 15) *denique exemplum uestrum secuta multiplex plebis portio confessa est uobiscum pariter et pariter coronata est, conexa uobis uinculo fortissimae caritatis et praepositis suis nec carcere nec metallis separata.* Plin. XXXIII praef. et c. 1. Lucifer de S. Athanas. I 42 f. (142 15 seq.) *et quomodo dimisisti fractos in requiem quando uideas carceres metalla exsilia uix iam capere posse Christianorum numerum per te damnatorum?* Athanas. Vit. Antonii 46. Ant. ministered to confessors in mines and prisons. Brisson de Verb. Sign. "metalla." Athan. Hist. Arian. ad monach. 60 (I 300 Ben. = 766 A Migne). Plut. I 565[b] compar. Niciae cum Crasso 1 § 1 *ἄλλως γὰρ οὐκ ἄν τις δοκιμάσειε τὴν ἀπὸ μετάλλων ἐργασίαν, ἧς τὰ πλεῖστα περαίνεται διὰ κακούργων ἢ βαρβάρων ἐνίων δεδεμένων καὶ φθειρομένων ἐν τόποις ὑπούλοις καὶ νοσεροῖς.*

p. 44 l. 15 INDE CENSENTVR, cet. c. 15 p. 50 l. 31. c. 29 *puto autem, hae ipsae materiae de metallis Caesarum ueniunt.*

p. 44 l. 16 INSVLA Crete infr. c. 25 p. 88 l. 8. Epiphan. Ancorat. 106 pr. p. 108[d]. Martyr. Ign. 7 f. (also Venus at Paphos). Cic. de nat. deor. III § 53. Ennius in historia sacra ap. Lact. diu. Inst. I 11 § 46. Sibylla (8 47—8) ib. § 47. Du Soul on Luc. Timon 6 fin. cf. Philops. 3. Lucan VIII 872. Callim. Hymn. Iou. 8—9. Anthol. Graec. III 22.

NASCI cf. c. 10 p. 36 l. 22.

p. 44 l. 18 NON SENTIVNT Minuc. 23 § 9 *lapideus* [*deus*] *caeditur scalpitur et ab impurato homine leuigatur. nec sentit suae natiuitatis iniuriam, ita ut nec postea de uestra ueneratione culturam.* Clem. Hom. X 7 8. Recogn. V 15.

p. 44 l. 19 FABRICATIONIS Idol. 8 pr. *idolorum.* Iren. II 4 § 1. 10 § 4.

p. 44 l. 20 INFRENDITE de Coron. Milit. 1 pr. *denique singuli designare, et eludere eminus, infrendere cominus.* Paulin. Petricord. Vit. Mart. II 552. (Verg. and Stat. in lexx. partic. Neue II 429 *-ĕre* more common.)

p. 44 l. 21 c. 46 p. 128 l. 7 of philosophers, *quin immo et deos uestros palam destruunt et superstitiones uestras commentariis quoque accusant, laudantibus uobis.* Seneca Fr. 30—44 (III 424—7 Haase) e.g. ap. Aug. de ciu. Dei VI 10 (I 267 13—18) *sacros, inquit, inmortales, inuiolabiles in materia uilissima atque inmobili dedicant, habitus illis hominum ferarumque et piscium, quidam uero mixto sexu, diuersis corporibus induunt; numina uocant, quae si spiritu accepto occurrerent, monstra haberentur.* ap. Lact. I 16 § 10.

ALIQVEM c. 50 a.m. *aliqua Carthaginis conditrix.*

p. 44 l. 23 Melito (in Otto Apolog. IX 413 fr. 2 = Chron. Pasch. p. 483 Dind.) *οὐκ ἐσμὲν λίθων οὐδεμίαν αἴσθησιν ἐχόντων θεραπευταί· ἀλλὰ μόνου θεοῦ τοῦ πρὸ πάντων καὶ ἐπὶ πάντων, καὶ τοῦ Χριστοῦ αὐτοῦ ὄντος θεοῦ λόγου πρὸ αἰώνων, ἐσμὲν θρησκευταί.* Tatian 4 § 2 *πῶς δὲ ξύλα καὶ λίθους θεοὺς ἀποφανοῦμαι;* Melito (ex Syr. Apol. 3 in Otto IX 424) *homines, cum deum quaererent, offenderunt in lapides et lignum.* cf. Athenag. 17 (cf. 15) *γῆ ταῦτα καὶ λίθοι καὶ ὕλη.* Clem. Alex. Protrep. 4 § 56 *χρυσός ἐστι τὸ ἄγαλμά σου, ξύλον ἐστί, λίθος ἐστί, γῆ ἐστίν.* Theophil. I 1. Iustin. Apol. I 9. Dial. cum Tryph. 35. Ep. ad Diognet. 2. cf. Melito c. 4 p. 425 and Otto's n. 114 (p. 463 5). Arnob. VI 14 16 17. Lact. II 2 § 1. V 12 § 12 *cum dis suis araneosis.* Keim on Origen c. Cels. I § 5. VII § 62. III §§ 76 f.

p. 44 l. 24 MILVI cet. Clem. Hom. X 22. Minuc. 24 § 1 *quanto uerius de dis uestris animalia muta naturaliter iudicant? mures hirundines milui, non sentire eos sciunt, norunt inculcant insident ac, nisi abigatis, in ipso dei uestri ore nidificant. araneae uero faciem eius intexunt et de ipso capite sua fila suspendunt, uos tergitis mundatis eraditis.* Arnob. VI 16 *non uidetis sub istorum simulacrorum caueis stelliones sorices blattasque lucifugas nidamenta ponere atque habitare, spurcitias huc omnes atque alia usibus accommodata conducere...nidulorum in mollitiem sollicite miserorum fomenta pullorum? non in ore aliquando simulacri ab araneis ordiri retia atque insidiosos casses quibus uolatus innectere stridularum possint impudentiumque muscarum? non hirundines denique intra ipsos aedium circumuolantes tholos iacularier stercoris ‡splenas,‡ et modo

ipsos uultus, modo numina ora depingere, barbam oculos nasos aliasque omnes partes, in quascumque se detulerit deonerati proluuies podicis? Lact. II 4 §§ 1—3. V 12 §§ 12 13. Clem. Alex. Protrep. § 51 p. 45. § 52 p. 46 (about Olympian Zeus, Serapis, cet.). Hor. S. I 8 37—8 *mentior at si quid, merdis caput inquiner albis coruorum.* Theodoret H. E. V 22 when Theophilus bp Alexandria A.D. 390 laid the axe to Serapis and struck off his head: μύες ἀγεληδὸν ἐξέδραμον ἔνδοθεν· μυῶν γὰρ οἰκητήριον ἦν ὁ Αἰγυπτίων θεός. Baruch 6 20—22. Lucian Gallus 24 f. Aug. in Ps. 113 Serm. 2 c. 2 p.m. (IV 1798[d] Gaume). Lucian Iupp. Trag. 8.

p. 44 l. 25 INTELLEGVNT Idol. 21 pr. *timiditatis est autem, cum te alius per deos suos obligat iuratione uel aliqua testificatione, et tu, ne intellegaris, quiescis.*

p. 44 l. 27 CERTI c. infin. 9 p. 34 5 n.

QVOD NON EST c. 10 p. 36 l. 13. ad nat. I 10 p. 75 l. 6 Wiss. *nisi quod perinde: nos enim contemptores deorum haberi nulla ratio est, quia nemo contemnit quod sciat omnino non esse. quod omnino est, id contemni potest, quod nihil est nihil patitur.* St Paul 1 Cor. 8 4 an idol is nothing in the world. Athan. Contr. Gentes 47 (I 96[a] Migne) ὅμως ἄνθρωποι παράφρονες, παραγκωνισάμενοι τὴν πρὸς τοῦτον γνῶσιν καὶ εὐσέβειαν, τὰ οὐκ ὄντα πρὸ τῶν ὄντων ἐτίμησαν· καὶ ἀντὶ τοῦ ὄντως ὄντος Θεοῦ τὰ μὴ ὄντα ἐθεοποίησαν.

Cap. XIII

p. 44 l. 29 NOBIS DEI SVNT cf. c. 10 pr. p. 36 l. 17.

E CONTRARIO Cic. Caes. Nep. Quintil. (also *in -um, per -um*). Clem. recogn. II 16 pr. 23 29. III 3 19. V 32 pr. VII 4 f. VIII 53. [And often in late authors (see Thes.) A. S.]

p. 44 l. 30 IRRELIGIOSI c. 28 p. 94 l. 16 *adeo et in isto irreligiosi erga deos uestros deprehendemini.* Exhort. Cast. 3. de orat. 12 fin. *-itas* Apol. 24 a. m. and med. [and 25 p. 90 l. 6 A. S.].

p. 44 l. 32 DESTRVITIS c. 46 p. 128 l. 7 *quin immo et deos uestros palam destruunt.*

SI c. 6 pr. n. c. 8 p. 28 l. 18.

p. 44 l. 33 seq. ad nat. I 10 p. 75 l. 12 Wiss. *cum alii alios deos colitis, eos quos non colitis utique contemnitis; praelatio alterius sine alterius contumelia non potest nec ulla electio non reprobatione componitur. qui de pluribus suscipit aliquem, eum quem non suscipit desperit.* ib. II 9 (cf. below) *tum si certos habebant, contenti esse debuerunt nec electos desiderare. in quo etiam inreligiosi deprehenduntur. si enim dei ut bulbi seliguntur, qui non seliguntur, reprobi pronuntiantur.* ad ux. I 3 f. *non propterea appetenda sunt quaedam, quia non uetantur, etsi quodam modo uetantur, cum alia illis praeferuntur: praelatio enim superiorum dissuasio est infimorum.* See Aug. Ciu. Dei VII 1 *qua in re non dico quod facetius ait Tertullianus* (ad nat. II 9 cited above) *fortasse quam uerius, si di seliguntur ut bulbi, utique ceteri reprobi iudicantur. non hoc dico: uideo enim etiam ex selectis seligi aliquos ad aliquid maius atque praestantius. sicut in militia, cum tirones electi fuerint, ex his quoque eliguntur ad opus aliquod maius armorum.* Athenag. Suppl. 14 fin. p. 14^{b} *ἂν τοίνυν ἡμεῖς, ὅτι μὴ κοινῶς ἐκείνοις θεοσεβοῦμεν, ἀσεβῶμεν, πᾶσαι μὲν πόλεις πάντα δὲ ἔθνη ἀσεβοῦσιν· οὐ γὰρ τοὺς αὐτοὺς πάντες ἄγουσι θεούς.* Orig. contr. Cels. V 27. Iustin. apol. I 24 *πρῶτον μὲν ὅτι τὰ ὅμοια τοῖς Ἕλλησι λέγοντες μόνοι μισούμεθα δι' ὄνομα τοῦ Χριστοῦ, καὶ μηδὲν ἀδικοῦντες ὡς ἁμαρτωλοὶ ἀναιρούμεθα, ἄλλων ἀλλαχοῦ καὶ δένδρα σεβομένων καὶ ποταμοὺς καὶ μῦς καὶ αἰλούρους καὶ κροκοδείλους καὶ τῶν ἀλόγων ζῴων τὰ πολλὰ καὶ οὐ τῶν αὐτῶν ὑπὸ πάντων τιμωμένων ἀλλ' ἄλλων ἀλλαχόσε, ὥστ' εἶναι ἀσεβεῖς ἀλλήλοις πάντας διὰ τὸ μὴ τὰ αὐτὰ σέβειν. ὅπερ μόνον ἐγκαλεῖν ἡμῖν ἔχετε, ὅτι μὴ τοὺς αὐτοὺς ὑμῖν σέβομεν θεούς.* cf. Havercamp esp. Lact. II 16 §§ 16 17.

p. 46 l. 2 Kaye 324.

p. 46 l. 4 SVPRA 5 pr. ad nat. I 10 p. 75 l. 24 Wiss. *utique enim impiissimum, immo contumeliosissimum admissum est, in arbitrio et libidine sententiae humanae locare honorem diuinitatis, ut deus non sit, nisi cui esse permiserit senatus.*

p. 46 l. 6 NOLVISSET ad nat. I 10 p. 76 l. 14 Wiss. *priuatos enim deos, quos Lares et Penates domestica consecratione perhibetis, domestica et licentia inculcatis, uenditando,*

pignerando pro necessitate ac uoluntate. Minuc. 23 § 10 *tunc postremo deus est, cum homo illum uoluit et dedicauit.* Woodh. cites Apul. Metam. VII c. 7 f. *uoluit esse Caesar Haemi latronis collegium, et confestim interiuit; tantum potest nutus etiam magni principis.*

p. 46 l. 8 VENDITANDO Melito Apol. 10 (from Syr. p. 430 n. 191 Otto) *stulte, num id est deus quod emitur?* omn. Theophil. II 2 pr. p. 80ᶜ.

CACCABVLVM cet. Arnob. VI 14. cf. 13 *simulacra ista quae uos terrent quaeque templis in omnibus prostrati atque humiles adoratis, ossa lapides aera sunt argentum aurum testa lignum sumptum ex arbore aut commixtum glutinum gypso, ex ornatibus fortasse meretriciis aut ex muliebri mundo camelinis ex ossibus, aut ex Indici animalis dente, ex caccabulis ollulis ex candelabris et lucernis aut ex aliis obscenioribus uasculis congesta conflata in has species ducta sunt, atque in formas quas cernitis exierunt, fornacibus incocta figulinis, ex incudibus et malleis nata, grosis rasa, discobinata de limis serris †furfuraculis† asceis, secta dolata effossa terebrarum excauata uertigine, runcinarum leuigata de planis.* lexx. κακκάβη. κάκκαβος. inscr. in Wochenschr. f. kl. Phil. Oct. 24 1894 p. 1188. Varro de ling. Lat. VI § 127 *uas ubi coquebant cibum ab eo caccabum appellarunt.* The primitive often in Marcel. Empir., Theod. Prisc., Pelagon.

p. 46 l. 9 TRVLLAM Arnob. II 23. Corp. Gl. III 92 28.

Arnob. VI 15 *si aliquis ponat in medio collisos deorum uultus, confracta atque imminuta simulacra iubeatque uos idem frustis hostias et fragminibus caedere, informibus massis sacra et munia impertire diuina: audire a uobis exposcimus, facturine istud sitis an contra quam imperabitur recusaturi? fortasse dicetis: qua causa? quia nemo est in rebus humanis tam stolide caecus, qui argentum aes aurum gypsum ebur argillam deorum in numerum referat ipsaque per se dicat uim habere atque obtinere diuinam.*

p. 46 l. 12 HASTARIO lexx. cite only Tert. h. l. and ad nat. I 10 p. 76 l. 18 Wiss. *sed aliquo solacio priuatorum et domesticorum deorum querellae iuuantur, quod publicos turpius contumeliosiusque tractetis. iam primum, quos in hastarium*

regessistis, publicanis subdi<dis>tis omni quinquennio inter uectigalia uestra proscriptos addicitis. sic Serapeum, sic Capitolium petitur, addicitur diuinitas, conducitur,...sub eadem uoce praeconis, eadem exactione quaestoris. Aug. Ep. 96 § 2 p. 515 l. 18 Goldb. *de hastario emerat.*

p. 46 l. 12—18 cf. ad nat. I 10 p. 76 l. 23—p. 77 l. 2 Wiss.

p. 46 l. 13 HOLITORIVM F. Becker Gallus III^3 57. Dig. VII 1 13 § 4.

p. 46 l. 17 TRIBVTARII Theophilus I 10 *τέλη καὶ εἰσφορὰς παρέχει τῷ βασιλεῖ αὐτή τε* (the Mother of the Gods) *καὶ οἱ υἱοὶ αὐτῆς.* Melito apol. 4 (ex Syr. IX 425 Otto) *etenim ab his prioribus eorum dis et uectigalia et tributa penduntur Caesari, quippe qui maior est eis.* Clem. Hom. X 22. Blunt Right Use p. 254.

p. 46 l. 18 MAIESTAS ad nat. I 10 p. 77 l. 2 Wiss. *maiestas prostituitur in quaestum, negotiatio religione proscribitur, sanctitas locationem mendicat. exigitis...—sacri, pro stipibus, pro hostiis, uenditis totam diuinitatem. non licet eam gratis coli.*

p. 46 l. 19 RELIGIO MENDICANS cf. c. 42, p. 122 l. 27. [Passages] "which animadvert upon the practices of religious mendicants among the heathen in a manner which would be most unsatisfactory to the friars of the Church of Rome." Blunt's Right Use 105–6. Marquardt III^2 211 n. 4. 143 n. 4. Minuc. 24 § 3 *mendicantes uicatim deos ducunt.* Dion. Hal. II 19. Cic. de legib. II §§ 22 40. Ou. Fast. IV 350.

p. 46 l. 21 VENALES Theophil. II 2. Melito Apol. 10 (from Syr. Otto Apol. IX 431) *stulte, num id est deus quod emitur? num id est deus quod egenum est?...quomodo emis eum sicut seruum, et colis eum sicut dominum? quomodo rogas eum ut det tibi ceu diues, et das ei ut pauperi?*

p. 46 l. 22 MORTVIS cf. De Cor. Milit. 10 *quid tam dignum idolo, quam quod et mortuo? nam et mortuorum est ita coronari.* ad nat. I 10 p. 77 l. 10 Wiss. *quid enim omnino...uestris ex aequo praebeatis? exstruitis deis templa, aeque mortuis templa; exstruitis aras deis, aeque mortuis aras; easdem titulis superscribitis litteras, easdem statuis inducitis formas, ut cuique ars aut negotium aut aetas fuit: senex de Saturno, imberbis de Apolline, uirgo de Diana figuratur, et miles in Marte et in*

Vulcano faber ferri consecratur. Lact. II 4 § 9 *quis usus est pretiosorum munerum nihil sentientibus? an ille, qui mortuis? pari enim ratione defunctorum corpora odoribus ac pretiosis uestibus illita et conuoluta humi condunt, qua deos honorant.* Preller-Jordan II 95 n. 1.

p. 46 l. 23 ARAS Suet. Nero 50 *in eo* [*gentili Domitiorum*] *monumento solium porphyretici marmoris superstante Lunensi ara circumsaeptum est lapide Thasio.* omn. Clem. Alex. Protrep. c. 3 4 p. 39 νεὼς...τάφους. Theodoret. Graec. Affect. Cur. VIII 34 Aristotle offered divine honours to his wife (cf. Cic. to Tullia).

p. 46 l. 25 EPVLO IOVIS Marquardt III² 348 n. 4 (cf. 348–9). Arnob. VII 32. Liu. XXV 2 § 10. Valer. Max. II 1 § 2. IV 2 § 3. Guther De Vet. Iure Pontif. IV 23.

SIMPVLO: *simpuuium* Apul. Mag. 18 (II 488 Hild.) Salm. ad Solin. p. 583. Muncker ad Fulgent. p. 781. Fest. p. 707 Lind.

HARVSPICE De Spect. 10 p. 12 l. 2 Wiss. *duobus inquinatissimis arbitris funerum et sacrorum, dissignatore et haruspice.* Bouché-Leclercq Divination IV 65 2.

p. 46 l. 26 POLLINCTOR Scorpiac. 7 fin. *si noster quoque deus propriae hostiae nomine martyria sibi depostulasset, quis illi exprobrasset funestam religionem et lugubres ritus et aram rogum et pollinctorem sacerdotem?* Spect. 10 has not the word. add to lexx. Seru. Aen. VI 218 f. IX 487 and h. l., and s. v. *pollingo* Sen. De Vita Beata 7 § 2 f.

p. 46 l. 27 Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. III §§ 32 33 p. 43 8 seq. wrongly says that Nero, Domitian, and Commodus were deified.

p. 46 l. 28 ACCEPTO FERRE (*-um ferre* or *referre* Cic. Caes. Hor.)(*expensum*). ad nat. I 7 p. 70 l. 12 Wiss. *ceterum quam uanum est profanos scire quod nesciat sacerdos! tacent igitur et accepto ferunt.* Paulin. Nol. Ep. 11 9 pr. [Study of Ambrosiaster p. 79, and Thes. I 321 82 ff. A. S.]

p. 46 l. 30 LARENTINAM c. 25 bis p. 86 l. 28 p. 88 l. 23. Minuc. 25 § 9 *sane et Acca Larentia et Flora meretrices* [cf. Ps.-Aug. Quaest. 114 § 9. A. S.] *propudiosae inter morbos Romanorum et deos computandae.* Arnob. I 28 m. *in ciuitatibus maximis atque in potentioribus populis sacra publice fiunt scortis meritoriis quondam atque in uolgarem libidinem*

prostitutis: nullus tumor indignationis in dis est. Lact. I 20 §§ 1—5. Gell. VII (VI) 7 §§ 5—8. Macrob. Sat. I 10 § 11 sq. Plut. Qu. Rom. 35 p. 272—3. Romul. 4. 5. 7. Aug. De Ciu. Dei VI 7. Preller-Jordan II 26—27 cet. Roscher 'Acca Larentia' 5 seq. 'Hercules' 2294—5.

p. 46 l. 32 SIMONEM Kaye 542—3. Iustin. Martyr Apol. I 26 with Otto. 56. Iren. I 23 § 1.

p. 46 l. 33 PAEDAGOGIIS Oehler h. l. ad nat. II 7 p. 107 l. 2 Wiss. p. 363 Oehler. n. h. 10 f. De Cor. Milit. 13 p. m. Adu. Marcion. I 18 f. Iustin. Apol. I 27 pr. p. 70^{cd} *πρῶτον μὲν, ὅτι τοὺς πάντας σχεδὸν ὁρῶμεν ἐπὶ πορνείᾳ προάγοντας, οὐ μόνον τὰς κόρας ἀλλὰ καὶ τοὺς ἄρσενας, καὶ ὃν τρόπον λέγονται οἱ παλαιοὶ ἀγέλας βοῶν ἢ αἰγῶν ἢ προβάτων τρέφειν ἢ ἵππων φορβάδων, οὕτως νῦν καὶ παῖδας εἰς τὸ αἰσχρῶς χρῆσθαι μόνον.* cet. 29 f. p. 72^{a}. Athenag. (with Otto's note) (cf. p. 90 n. 7) 30 (vii 158 n. 16 Otto), 34. Tatian 28. Clem. Alex. Paedag. III 4 § 26 and Protrept. 4 p. 43. (Clem. Alex. (in Euseb. Praep. Eu. p. 70.)) Theophil. III 8. Antinous called *θεός* on some coins. Orig. contra Cels. III 36. 37. 38. V 63. VIII 9. Hegesippus in Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IV 8 § 2. Athan. contra Gentes 9 (I 20^{c} Migne). Pausan. VIII 9. 7. Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. VIII 28 p. 115. 31. HE IV 18 § 8. Epiphan. Ancorat. 106 f. (II 109^{c}). Klebs Prosopographia imp. Rom. Berl. 1897 I 81—2. Pauly-Wissowa I 2439—41, where the many works of art depicting him are catalogued. Preller-Jordan II 450—1.

NESCIO QVEM Prudent. contr. Symm. I 271.

CAP. XIV

On this chapter cf. J. Geffcken Zwei Christliche Apologeten (1907) xviii, xix.

p. 48 l. 4 NOLO. So Havercamp, and Hartel Ztschr. f. oest. Gymn. 1869 366. Minuc. 24 § 3 *quorum ritus si percenseas, ridenda quam multa, multa etiam miseranda sunt.*

p. 48 l. 5 ENECTA cet. c. 30 f. n. *non grana turis unius assis,...nec duas meri guttas, nec sanguinem reprobi bouis mori optantis.* Iuu. 10 270. 12 95—6 n. ind. s. u. sacrifice. Form

enectus Cic. De Diuinat. II § 73. Tert. ad nat. I 10 p. 78 l. 14 Wiss. *non dico...enecta et tabida quaeque mactatis, de opimis autem et integris superuacua esui capitula, et ungulas et plumarum saetarumque praeuulsa, et si quid domi quoque abiecturi fuissetis.* Lasaulx 275 n. 387. Arnob. I 39 *ueternosis arboribus.* Hermippos in Athen. 551 a (to Dionysos) *οἱ γὰρ πενόμενοι ἀναπηρά σοι θύουσιν ἤδη βοίδια, | Λεωτρεφίδου λεπτότερα καὶ Θουμάντιδος.* Aesop in Havercamp, a traveller vowed to Hermes the half of his windfalls: finding a bag full of dates and almonds, he gives to the god date-stones and almond shells. Lucian bis acc. 10 in Hav. n. 47. Levit. 22. 20 sq. Nevelet Malach. 1 8. 14. Clem. Alex. Strom. VII c. 6 § 30 Pherecrates and Eubulus. § 31 Menander and Hesiod. Herod. II 38. Plut. Orac. Def. 49 (II 437[a]) *δεῖ τὸ θύσιμον τῷ τε σώματι καὶ τῇ ψυχῇ καθαρὸν εἶναι καὶ ἀσινὲς καὶ ἀδιάφθορον.* Verg. Aen. IV 57 *lectas de more bidentes.* Ou. Metam. XV 130 *uictima labe carens et praestantissima forma.* Pollux I 1 § 26. Aristot in Athen. 674 f. Com. Fr. Anon. Meineke IV 613 n. 41 from Clem. Alex. Strom. VII 34. Porphyr. Abst. Anim. II 58.

TABIDOSA De Pudic. 14 m.

p. 48 l. 8 DECIMA HERCVLIS c. 39 p. 114 l. 15. Marquardt III 146—7. Macrob. III 6 § 11. 12 § 2. Plut. Sull. 35 § 1. Crass. 2 (vol. III p. 40 l. 4 ed. Sint.). Cic. de nat. Deor. III 88.

p. 48 l. 10 DE PERDITO Aristoph. Plut. 1107—1145 Hav. The gods starving since Plutus recovered his sight; Cario ate up even before Mercury's share 'because, on discovery, you did not share the flogging.' Lact. II 4 § 15 *his aurum et argentum consecrant, quae tam non habent qui accipiant quam qui illa donarunt.* cf. the thefts of Dionysius §§ 16—19. Publil. Syr. 604 *mortuo munus qui mittit, nil dat illi, adimit sibi.*

LITTERAS cet. supra c. 10 and 11. ad nat. I 10 p. 79 l. 2 Wiss. *adhuc meminimus Homeri. ille opinor est, qui diuinam maiestatem humana condicione tractauit, casibus et passionibus humanis deos imbuens, qui de illis fauore diuersis gladiatoria quodammodo paria composuit: Venerem sauciat sagitta humana, Martem tredecim mensibus in uinculis detinet fortasse periturum, eadem Iouem paene perpessum a caelitum plebe traducit aut lacrimas eius super Sarpedonem excutit aut luxuriantem cum Iunone*

foedissime inducit, commendato libidinis desiderio per commemorationem et enumerationem amicarum. Homer and Hesiod Thdrt. Gr. Aff. Cur. III § 4. Minuc. 22 § 1 *has fabulas et errores et ab imperitis parentibus discimus et, quod est grauius, ipsis studiis et disciplinis elaboramus, carminibus praecipue poetarum, qui plurimum quantum ueritati ipsi sua auctoritate nocuere. § 2 et Plato ideo praeclare Homerum illum inclitum laudatum et coronatum de ciuitate, quam in sermone instituebat, eiecit. § 3 hic enim praecipuus bello Troico deos uestros, etsi ludos facit, tamen in hominum rebus et actibus miscuit: hic eorum paria composuit, sauciauit Venerem, Martem uinxit, uulnerauit, fugauit. § 4 Iouem narrat a Briareo liberatum, ne a dis ceteris ligaretur, et Sarpedonem filium, quoniam morti non poterat eripere, cruentis imbribus fleuisse et loro Veneris illectum flagrantius, quam in adulteras soleat, cum Iunone uxore concumbere.* Leland Christian Revelation Pt I c. 4. Cyrill. adu. Iul. I (VI 41 Aubert). Theophil. I 9. III 8. Clem. Alex. Protr. II § 32 seq. p. 27 P. seq. Cic. de nat. Deor. III § 77 *di poetici.* I § 61 n. 42. 43 n. Marquardt III² 60 n. 2. 61 n. 3 and 4. Athenag. 21 n. 1 Otto. 22 pr. Aug. De Ciu. Dei I 3 pr. *et nobis suscensent, cum de dis eorum talia dicimus, nec suscensent auctoribus suis, quos ut ediscerent, mercedem dederunt; doctoresque ipsos insuper et salario publico et honoribus dignissimos habuerunt.* omn. Lucian Necyomantia 3 (what Menippus learnt from Homer and Hesiod).

p. 48 l. 12 [Iustin.] Cohort. ad Gr. 2 p. 3ᵉ 4ᵃ (Il. XX 66—72). Lact. Diu. Inst. I 3 § 17. Cic. de nat. Deor. II § 70. Arnob. adu. Gent. IV 33 f. *uulnerari, uexari, bella inter se gerere furialium memorantur ardore discriminum.* Prudent. Peristeph. X 211—3 *quid inter aras dissidentum numinum | putas agendum? Martis indignabitur | offensa uirtus, si colatur Lemnius.* Plato Rep. 378d θεομαχίας. Clem. Al. protr. II 36—37 pp. 31 32 (see next note).

p. 48 l. 13 VENEREM Athenag. 21 p. 21ᵃ. Luc. Iupp. Trag. 40. Firm. Mat. 12 § 7 *fuit enim et apud ueteres, licet nondum terram illuminasset domini nostri Christi ueneranda dignatio, in spernendis superstitionibus religiosa constantia. § 8 Diomedes pudicus et sobrius Venerem uulnerat.* Clem. Alex.

Protrep. 36 p. 31 P. Antisthenes would shoot Venus, if he met her, as the corrupter of her sex (in Clem. Alex. Strom. II 20 § 107 p. 485 P. and Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. III § 53 p. 46 18).

p. 48 l. 14 SAVCIATAM Plut. Qu. Symp. IX 8 a question which hand was wounded. Verg. Aen. XI 277 makes Diomed say *Veneris uiolaui uolnere dextram.* [Iustin.] Cohort. ad Gr. 2 p. 3[b] (Il. V 335—340).

p. 48 l. 15 MARTEM Il. V 382—7. Firm. Matern. 12 § 8 *Oti et Ephialtae decreto Mars belli potens temporali exsilio damnatus ferrea catenarum uincla sustinuit.* Arnob. IV 25 pr. *quis* [*prodidit Martem*] *mensibus in Arcadia tribus et decem uinctum? non Melae fluminis filius.* Clem. Alex. Protr. 29 p. 25 P.

p. 48 l. 17 MONSTRI Iustin. Apol. I c. 27 fin. p. 69[b] οὐδὲ λυθῆναι βοηθείας τυχόντα διὰ Θέτιδος ὑπὸ τοῦ ἑκατόγχειρος ἐκείνου. [id.] Cohort. ad Graec. 2 p. 2[c]. Il. I 399—406. Lucian Iupp. Trag. 40. Deor. Dial. 21 2 Hav. Minuc. 23 § 4 cited on p. 48 l. 9.

p. 48 l. 18 SARPEDONIS cf. ad nat. I 10 p. 79 l. 9 Wiss. Constantine Or. ad Sanct. Coet. 10 § 2 (of poets) εἰσάγουσι δὲ <δαίμονας> καὶ ὀδυρομένους τὰς τῶν οἰκείων παίδων σφαγάς. Jortin Misc. Obs. (Lond. 1732) II 7—10 with Lamb and Dav. Vict. v. l. 34 24. Minuc. 22. Plato Rep. 433[b]. Auson. Epitaph. Sarped. Markland on Max. Tyr. 19 6. Cic. De Diuinat. II § 25 *si enim nihil fit extra fatum, nihil leuari re diuina potest. hoc sentit Homerus, cum querentem Iouem inducit, quod Sarpedonem filium a morte contra fatum eripere non posset.* [Iustin.] Cohort. ad Gentiles c. 2. p. 2[d] τοῦτον ἐρῶντα καὶ σχετλιάζοντα καὶ ὀλοφυρόμενον καὶ ὑπὸ τῶν ἄλλων θεῶν ἐπιβουλευόμενον Ὅμηρος εἰσάγει, και ποτὲ μὲν (Il. XVI 433—4) ἐπὶ τοῦ ἑαυτοῦ παιδὸς λέγοντα ὤ μοι ἐγών, ὅτε μοι Σαρπηδόνα, φίλτατον ἀνδρῶν, | μοῖρ᾽ ὑπὸ Πατρόκλοιο Μενοιτιάδαο δαμῆναι. Athenag. 21 p. 21[a]. Athan. Contr. Gentes 11 (I 26[a] Migne). Firm. Matern. 12 8 *Sarpedonem filium mortuum in Troia Iuppiter plangit et mercedem fabricatorum murorum Neptunus a superbo rege non recipit: alterius regis Apollo greges pascit.* Clem. Alex. Protr. § 55 p. 49 P.

Sarpedon and *subantem* and Apollo and Neptune in Ios. Contr. Apion. II 34.

SVBANTEM c. 46 (p. 130 l. 2). De Monogam. 15 p. m. (conj. in adu. Valent. 17). Lucr. Hor. Plin. Anthol. 712 15 R. Hier. Ep. [54 15, p. 481 l. 19 Hilberg. A. S.] 147 10 fin. [Iustin.] Cohort. ad Gr. c. 2 p. 3^{ab} citing Il. XIV 315—7. '9. '21. '23. '26—7. Athenag. 21 p. 21^{d} seq. Firm. err. 4 1 *Iunonem sane, ne et huic deesset incestum, Iouis uolunt ex sorore coniugem factam.* Hild. on Arnob. IV 24 p. 376.

p. 48 l. 19 SOROREM c. 11 p. 42 l. 6. Frazer Paus. I 7 1.

COMMEMORATIONE Ter. Cic. Sen. Ep. 79 § 15. 81 § 23. De Benef. II 11 § 1. Quintil. Tac. [many more in Thes. A. S.].

p. 48 l. 20 PRINCIPIS (see below p. 48 l. 27). ad nat. I 10 p. 79 l. 11 Wiss. *exinde quis non poetarum ex auctoritate principis sui in deos insolens aut* uera prodendo aut falsa fingendo? ibid. p. 79 l. 19 Wiss. (of Socrates) *nam etsi idcirco damnatus est, cum paenituerit Athenienses damnationis, ut criminatores quoque impenderint.* II 7 p. 107 l. 13 Wiss. *criminatores deorum poetas eliminari Plato censuit, ipsum Homerum sane coronatum ciuitate pellendum.* Homer expelled by Plato, Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. II §§ 6 7. p. 22 l. 21. Orig. contr. Cels. IV 36 n. of Spencer.

p. 48 l. 21 DEDECORATOR ἅπ. λεγ.

APOLLINEM cet. Minuc. 22 § 5 *Apollo Admeto* (cf. Tatian 21 p. 159^{d}) *pecus pascit, Laomedonti uero muros Neptunus instituit nec mercedem operis infelix structor accipit.* Arnob. IV 25 n. Varro in Aug. De Ciu. Dei VI 5 (mythical theology teaches *ut di...seruierint homini*). Aug. De Ciu. Dei XVIII 13 p. m. Apollo condemned to servitude for slaying the Cyclopes. Diodor. Sic. IV 71 § 3.

ADMETO. Clem. Alex. Protr. § 35 p. 30 P. Lucian De Sacrif. 4 f. Iupp. Conf. 8. Arnob. IV 25 p. 379 Hild. Aug. De Ciu. Dei III 2.

p. 48 l. 22 STRVCTORIAS (ἅπ. λεγ.) found in glosses. Loewe Prodrom. 399. cf. Minuc. 23 § 5 *structor* (cited above).

p. 48 l. 23 LAOMEDONTI Hor. Carm. III 3 21 22. Clem. Alex. Protr. l. c. Lucian ll. cc.

p. 48 l. 24 AESCVLAPIVM ad nat. II 14 fin. Arnob. I 41 *nonne*

Aesculapium, medicaminum repertorem, post poenas et supplicia fulminis, custodem nuncupauistis et praesidem sanitatis ualetudinis et salutis? IV 24 (161 3) *numquid [a nobis dicitur] cupidinis atque auaritiae causa, sicut canit Boeotius Pindarus, Aesculapium fulminis transfixum esse telo?* VII 44 p. 278 23. Diodor. Sicul. IV 71 p. 315. Muncker ad Hygin. f. 49 p. 113 recalled Androgeos to life. Prop. II 1 62. Lucian Dial. Deor. 13 1. Iustin. Apol. c. 21 p. 67[a]. c. 22 p. 68[b]. c. 54 f. p. 90[b]. Dial. cum Tryph. c. 69. Theophil. III 2. Apolog. Aristid. 10. Athenag. 29 p. 33. (Pind. Pyth. 3 54—58. Cary. 'But lucre wisdom's self can captive hold. | E'en he was turn'd by sight of tempting gain, | (When in the hands appear'd the glist'ning gold) | From death to rescue one already ta'en. | And Jove in sooth, hurling with eager hand, | In either bosom did the breathing stay. Fate follow'd quick his flaming levin-brand,' and Hesiod p. 263 Göttling.) Tatian 8 p. 147[d] 21 p. 159[d]. Orig. Contr. Cels. III 22 23 25. omn. Plat. Rep. III c. 16 p. 408 b. Apollodor. III 10. Hygin. Astr. II 14. Roscher Lex. Myth. I 619 30 seq. Minuc. 21 § 16 Holden, *Aesculapius, ut in deum surgat, fulminatur.* Firm. Mat. 12 8 *Aesculapius alibi fulminatur.* Clem. Alex. Protr. § 30 p. 25 P. citing Pindar. Lact. Diu. Inst. I 19 § 3 (cited below). Verg. Aen. VII 772—3 (cited below). Ambr. De Virginibus III 2 § 7. Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. III § 27 p. 42 l. 26. VIII §§ 19—23 p. 114. Pauly-Wissowa Asklepios col. 1654.

NOCENTER Colum. Cels. Nothing good from heathen gods, Bayle œuvres III 259.

p. 48 l. 25 SI FVLMEN ILLIVS EST. cf. Bouché-Leclercq Divination IV 35 cet.

p. 48 l. 26 NEQVE VERA PRODI NEQVE FALSA CONFINGI cf. ad nat. I 10 p. 79 13 Wiss.

p. 48 l. 27 RELIGIOSISSIMOS c. 6 pr. infra c. 25 p. 86 l. 24 n. Sall. Cat. 12 § 3 n. *nostri maiores religiosissimi mortales.* Marquardt III[2] 6 n. 4. Gieseler Church History (Engl.) I p. 25 n. 1 (§ 11).

Ad nat. I 10 p. 79 l. 13 Wiss. *et tragici quidem aut comici pepercerunt, ut non aerumnas ac poenas dei praefarentur? taceo de philosophis...denique et Socrates in contumeliam eorum*

quercum et canem et hircum iurat. Aug. contr. Faust. XII 40 f. *ea rident in theatris quae uenerantur in templis, in turpitudine nimium liberi, in superstitione nimium serui.* Lact. Diu. Inst. I 19 § 3 *clamat summus poeta...ipsum...illum repertorem medicinae talis et artis ad Stygias undas fulmine detrusum, ut intellegamus quantum ualeat pater omnipotens, qui etiam deos fulminibus exstinguat.* § 4 *sed homines ingeniosi hanc secum habebant fortasse rationem: quia deus fulminari non potest, apparet non esse factum: immo uero quia factum est, apparet hominem fuisse, non deum.* cf. Verg. Aen. VII 772—3 *ipse repertorem medicinae talis et artis | fulmine Phoebigenam Stygias detrusit in undas* (cf. 765—771).

p. 48 l. 28 ERRORES e.g. of Ceres, Clem. Alex. Protr. § 12. p. 12 P. [Iustin.] Or. ad Gentil. 2 p. 38[c]. Minuc. 21 § 9.

p. 48 l. 29 PRAEFENTVR c. 18 p. 58 l. 17 *prophetae de officio praefandi.*

p. 48 l. 30 IN CONTVMELIAM DEORVM)(*in honorem.* Liv. in lexx. Tac. Hist. V 4 *in c. Hammonis.* Plin. Pan. 11 *in c. numinum.*

p. 48 l. 31 CANEM. *νὴ τὸν κύνα.* Theophil. III 2 p. 117[d] 118[a] *τί ὠφέλησεν...Σωκράτην τὸ ὀμνύειν τὸν κύνα καὶ τὸν χῆνα καὶ τὴν πλάτανον;* Spanh. on Aristoph. Nub. 627. Lact. III 20 § 15 *uerum idem per canem et anserem deierabat. o hominem scurram* (*ut ait Zeno Epicureus*) *ineptum, perditum, desperatum, si cauillari uoluit religionem; dementem, si hoc serio fecit, ut animal turpissimum pro deo haberet.* § 16 *quis iam superstitiones Aegyptiorum audeat reprehendere, quas Socrates Athenis auctoritate confirmauit sua?* Lasaulx Studien p. 201 n. 119. Diog. Laert. VII § 32. platanus. Procop. Ep. 63 f. (p. 555 1 Hercher). Lucian Vit. Auct. 16 (dog and plane). Icaromenipp. 9 pr. (dogs and geese and planes): same three in Philostr. Apoll. VI 19 6: goat an Egyptian god Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. III § 85 p. 51 36. Porphyr. De Abst. III 16 f. Menage on Diog. Laert. II 40.

DEIERABAT Plaut. Ter. Varr. Prop. Amm. Tert. Apol. 32 f. 35 p. m. De Idolol. 20 f. Paulin. Nol. c. 24 331 [more exx. in Thes. A. S.]. cf. peiero.

DAMNATVS ad nat. I 10 p. 79 l. 19 Wiss. (cited on p. 48 l. 20). Aug. De Ciu. Dei VIII 3.

p. 50 l. 1 DEOS DESTRVEBAT (the word, c. 46 p. 128 l. 7) infr. c. 46 a. m. *o Apollinem inconsideratum! sapientiae testimonium reddidit ei uiro, qui negabat deos esse. in quantum odio flagrat ueritas, in tantum qui eam ex fide praestat offendit.* ad nat. II 7 (cited above on p. 48 l. 20). De Anima 1, p. 299 28 Wiss. Iustin. Apol. II 10. I 5 *ὅτε δὲ Σωκράτης λόγῳ ἀληθεῖ καὶ ἐξεταστικῶς ταῦτα εἰς φανερὸν ἐπειρᾶτο φέρειν καὶ ἀπάγειν τῶν δαιμόνων τοὺς ἀνθρώπους καὶ αὐτοὶ* [Thirlby *αὐτὸν*] *οἱ δαίμονες διὰ τῶν χαιρόντων τῇ κακίᾳ ἀνθρώπων ἐνήργησαν ὡς ἄθεον καὶ ἀσεβῆ ἀποκτεῖναι λέγοντες καινὰ εἰσφέρειν αὐτὸν δαιμόνια. καὶ ὁμοίως ἐφ' ἡμῶν τὸ αὐτὸ ἐνεργοῦσιν.* Cf. Xen. Mem. I 1 § 1. Theodoret Gr. Aff. Cur. VII § 47 p. 109 l. 50. Plat. Apol. 24[b]. Arnob. I 40 condemnation of Socrates. Sen. Ep. 104 § 28. Diog. Laert. II § 43. VI § 9. Wetstein on Acts 17 18. Orig. contr. Cels. IV 67 p. 554. Hermann Götter d. Alterthum 10 9.

ODIO EST Ter. Andr. 67—8 (cited by Cic. Lael. § 89, Quintil. VIII 5 § 4) *namque hoc tempore | obsequium amicos, ueritas odium parit.* Lact. I 1 § 7. V 9 § 6 Bü. 21 § 1. Epit. 64 17. Tert. Apol. c. 7 p. 24 l. 22 n. c. 46 p. 128 l. 20 n. (see last note). Magirus ueritas n. 34. Otto Sprichw. 368 n. 3. Lindenbrog on Ter. Andr. l. c. (I 1 41). Socr. Hist. Eccl. VI praef. § 6 *τὸ ἀληθὲς πικρόν.* Bias in Auson. XX 191. [Prosper] De Promiss. II 35. Commodian Instr. II 29 5 *Respicite dictum, quod ueritas odia tollat.*

p. 50 l. 2 CRIMINATORES see ad nat. (2 exx. cited above). *διάβολος* gl. 'very rare' (LS.) (Plaut. 1, Tac. 1) cf. Lact. Diu. Inst. II 12 § 17. Epit. 27 § 6 10. Iul. ap. Aug. c. Sec. Resp. Iuliani III 168. Hier. VI 629. 721. Migne CVI 1300[b] [more in Thes., to which add Aug. serm. (tom. V 94 f. ed. Bened.-Antv.) spec. 2, epist. 43, 19, uirg. 20 a.m. A. S.].

p. 50 l. 3 SOCRATIS cet. ad nat. I 10 p. 79 l. 20 Wiss. Diog. Laert. II § 43 Menage, immediately after the death of S. the Athenians banished the other accusers and sentenced Meletus to death, closed gymnasia and palaestrae, set up a brazen statue, the work of Lysippus, to S. in the Pompeium. Aug. Ciu.

Dei VIII 3 p. m. Plut. II 537[f] 538[a]. (De Inuidia et Odio 6) vol. VIII p. 128 R. Orig. contr. Cels. I § 3 (p. 323) p. 5 l. 56 with Spencer (pp. 8 f.). § 65 Aristotle withdrew to Chalcis, lest the Athenians should a second time sin against philosophy. Themist. Or. 20 p. 239[c]. Wesseling on Diodor. Sicul. XIV p. 672 31.

p. 50 l. 5 SED ET cet. ad nat. I 10 p. 79 l. 22 Wiss. *sed et Diogenes nescio quid in Herculem lusit.*

p. 50 l. 6 TRECENTOS IOVES ad nat. I 10 p. 79 l. 23 Wiss. *et Romani stili Diogenes Varro trecentos Ioues, seu Iuppiteres dicendum est, sine capitibus inducit.* Theophil. I 10 *πεύσομαι δέ σου κἀγώ, ὦ ἄνθρωπε, πόσοι Ζῆνες εὑρίσκονται;* Minuc. 22 § 6. Arnob. IV 17 f. *nam esse Apollines quattuor aut tris Ioues numquam nobis facietis fidem, nec si testem ipsum citetis Iouem aut Pythium constituatis auctorem.* Sen. lud. 8 § 1. Marquardt III² 63 n. 4.

Cap. XV

p. 50 l. 8 INGENIA ad nat. I 10 p. 79 l. 25 Wiss. *cetera... etiam uoluptates uestras per dedecus deorum administrant. dispicite apud uos Lentulorum et Hostiorum sacrilegas uenustates, utrum mimos an deos uestros in strophis et iocis rideatis; sed et histrionicas litteras magna cum uoluptate suscipitis, quae omnem foeditatem designant deorum.* Cult. Fem. I 2 m. *utrumne mulieres sine materiis splendoris et sine ingeniis decoris placere non possent hominibus?* pall. 1. Plin. Tac. Arnob. IV 2 *ingeniorum lasciuire luxu.* VI 12 *ut in deorum corporibus lasciuiae artificum luderent.* Teaching of Homer and Hesiod, Lucian Menippus 3.

p. 50 l. 9 DEORVM gods on the stage, Arnob. IV 35 seq.

LENTVLORVM ET HOSTILIORVM Teuffel-Schwabe⁶ § 363 5.

p. 50 l. 10 VENVSTATES Cic. Quintil. Symm. Ep. III 39 *memoriam malorum ioci uenustate frangamus.* Macrob. sat. II 1 § 10 *et iam primum animaduerto duos quos eloquentissimos antiqua aetas tulit, comicum Plautum et oratorem Tullium, eos ambos etiam ad iocorum uenustatem ceteris praestitisse.* Sen. Contr. II § 22 *homo uenustissimus, qui nullius umquam impu-*

nitam stultitiam transire passus est. ibid. x praef. § 2. suas. 2 § 12. Sen. Const. Sap. 17 § 3 *Vatinium, hominem natum et ad risum et ad odium, scurram fuisse et uenustum et dicacem memoriae proditum est.*

MIMOS cet. Aug. De Ciu. Dei IV 26. Minuc. 37 § 12. Cypr. ad Donat. 8 fin. p. 10. Arnob. IV 36 *etiam mimis et scurrilibus ludicris sanctissimorum personae interponuntur deorum, et ut spectatoribus uacuis risus possit atque hilaritas excitari, iocularibus feriuntur cauillationibus numina...quod si haberet uos aliqua uestris pro religionibus indignatio, has potius litteras uos exurere debuistis olim, libros istos demoliri, dissoluere theatra haec potius, in quibus infamiae numinum propudiosis cotidie publicantur in fabulis.* 35 (partly cited below). Prudent. Peristeph. x 220—230 *cur in theatris te uidente id plauditur? cygnus stuprator peccat inter pulpita, | saltat tonantem tauricornem ludius, | spectator horum pontifex summus sedes, | ridesque et ipse, nec negando diluis, | cum fama tanti polluatur numinis. cur tu, sacrate, per cachinnos solueris, | cum se maritum fingit Alcmenae deus, | meretrix Adonem uulneratum scaenica | libidinoso plangit adfectu palam, | nec te lupanar Cypridis sanctae mouet?* Cf. Lact. v 10 §§ 15 16, 20 § 12 *at enim puniendi sunt, qui destruunt religiones. num peius nos destruimus, quam... idem ipsi, qui cum deos colere se dicant, tamen eos publice turpiterque derident, de quibus etiam mimos agi cum risu et uoluptate patiuntur.* Epit. 55 § 3. 63 § 6. Aug. Ciu. Dei IV 26 e. g. (I 179 7 sq.) *in illis certe ludis poetica numinum crimina frequentantur, qui ludi cogentibus numinibus iussu senatus instaurabantur. in illis ludis corruptorem pudicitiae Iouem turpissimi histriones cantabant agebant placebant.*

p. 50 l. 11 STROPHIS De Spect. 29 Oehler. Adu. Marcion. III 10 med. De Anim. 28 p. 347 l. 32 Wiss. Petron. 60. Hier. Ep. 88 (p. 537[b]) *haereticorum -as.* 133 2 (1027[a]). Contr. Rufin. II 20 f. *quasi mimum Philistionis uel Lentuli ac Marulli stropham eleganti sermone confictam.*

MASCVLVM LVNAM *deus Lunus* Μήν in Spartian Carac. 6 § 7. Preller-Jordan II 411 4: 'Auch der deus Lunus auf dem zu Boden gestreckten Stiere auf einem Votivrelief aus Koula in Phrygien bei Texier Asie Mineure I 51 52 ist eine dem

Mithras verwandte Gestalt.' Worshipped in Phrygia and Mesopotamia. Amm. XXIII 3 § 2. Hdn. IV 13. On coins; a man on foot or horseback, with a Phrygian cap and crescent.

p. 50 l 13 HERCVLES Lact. I 21 § 33 *βουθοίνης* and *βουφάγος*. Greg. Naz. Or. 4 122 f. (I 146[ab]) *ἐπικοπτέτω γαστριμαργίαν ὁ Βουθοίνας*. Cl. Al. Protr. § 76 p. 65, Potter. Eur. Alc. 771, 789—818. Spanh. on Callim. H. Dian. 160. Call. ib. 146. Philost. Apoll. V 23 a youth boasting that he could eat more, and drink more wine, than any one else, and being asked what he was the better for his gluttony, replied *τὸ θαυμάζεσθαί με καὶ ἀποβλέπεσθαι· καὶ γὰρ τὸν Ἡρακλέα ἴσως ἀκούεις, ὡς καὶ τὰ σιτία αὐτοῦ παραπλησίως τοῖς ἄθλοις ᾔδετο*. Aristoph. Ranae 550—1, 504—512, 621—3. Lucian Amor. 4. Icaromenip. 27.

FAMELICOS (the word, Plaut. Ter. Plin. Iuu. Apul. Bonif. p. 429 G.) Aristoph. Pax 741 and Schol. Vesp. 60. Athenaeus 411[a]—412[b], 656b. Aristippus to Antisthenes § 4 (Socraticorum Epist. 9 in Hercher Epistolographi p. 617 f.) *πέμψω δέ σοι τῶν θέρμων τῶς μεγάλως τε καὶ λευκώς, ἵν' ἔχῃς μετὰ τὸ ἐπιδείξασθαι τὸν Ἡρακλέα τοῖς νέοις ὑποτραγεῖν*.

HISTRIONVM Lact. Diu. Inst. V 10 20. Prudent. Peristeph. X 221—5 cited above (Roman). Arnob. IV 35 Hild. *sed poetis tantummodo licere uoluistis indignas de dis fabulas et flagitiosa ludibria comminisci? quid pantomimi uestri, quid histriones, quid illa mimorum atque exoleti generis multitudo? nonne ad usum quaestus sui abutuntur dis uestris et lenocinia uoluptatum ex iniuriis adtrahunt contumeliisque diuinis?...et quod nefarium esset auditu, gentis illa genetrix Martiae, regnatoris et populi procreatrix amans saltatur Venus et per adfectus omnes meretriciae uilitatis impudica exprimitur imitatione bacchari.* 36. Aug. De Ciu. Dei VII 26 *quid sunt ad hoc malum Mercurii furta, Veneris lasciuia, stupra ac turpitudines ceterorum, quae proferremus de libris, nisi cotidie cantarentur et saltarentur in theatris?* Theophil. III 15. Greg. Naz. Or. 4 120—2 (cf. above).

p. 50 l. 14 LVGET SOL cet. ad nat. I 10 p. 80 l. 3 Wiss. *luget Sol filium exstinctum laetantibus uobis.*

p. 50 l. 15 LAETANTIBVS VOBIS...NON ERVBESCENTIBVS VOBIS

Woodham compares c. 46 *deos uestros palam destruunt... laudantibus uobis, plerique etiam in principes latrant sustinentibus uobis.*

CYBELE cf. p. 50 l. 26 n. ad nat. I 10 p. 80 l. 4 Wiss. *Cybela pastorem suspirat fastidiosum, non erubescentibus uobis et sustinetis Iouis elogia modulari.* Arnob. IV 35 *saltatur et Magna sacris compta cum infulis Mater et contra decus aetatis illa Pessinuntia Dindymene in bubulci unius amplexum flagitiosa fingitur adpetitione gestire.* V 42. omn. VII 33 p. 266 25. Obscene festival of Cybele at Carthage. Aug. De Ciu. Dei II 4. 5. VII 9. Zahn Forschungen V 176. Lucian Deor. Dial. 12 1. Sidon. C. 23 281—8. Lact. Diu. Inst. I 17 § 7.

SVSPIRAT: Hor. Tibull.

p. 50 l. 16 SVSTINETIS c. 25 p. 90 l. 15.

IOVIS Arnob. IV 35 f. *quin et ille in fabulis maximus ipse regnator poli sine ulla nominis maiestatisque formidine adulterorum agere introducitur partes, atque ut fallere castitatem alienarum possit familias matrum, ora immutare pellacia et in species coniugum subditiui corporis simulatione succedere.* id. VII 33 p. 266. 22.

p. 50 l. 18 ad nat. I 10 p. 80 l. 1 Wiss. *constuprantur coram uobis maiestates in corpore impuro. famosum et diminutum caput imago cuiuslibet dei uestit.*

p. 50 l. 18 seq. Spectac. 10 p. 12 l. 25 Wiss. (with Oehler's note) *quae priuata et propria sunt scaenae de gestu et corporis flexu mollitiae Veneris et Liberi immolant.* Hor. Carm. I 15 1, 2 *pastor cum traheret per freta nauibus | Idaeis Helenen, perfidus hospitam.*

IGNOMINIOSVM Iuu. 8. 188 n.

p. 50 l. 19 EFFEMINATIONE Firmic. math. [VII 25 § 14, ref. in LS. wrong. A. S.] Hier. Seru. ad Aen. IV 216. On actors playing female parts Iuu. 3 93—99 ind. s. v. actors.

p. 50 l. 20 ALIQVAM c. 50 a. m. *aliqua Carthaginis conditrix.*

HERCVLEM cf. Arnob. IV 35 *nec non et illa proles Iouis Sophoclis in Trachiniis Hercules pestiferi tegminis circumretitus indagine miserabiles edere inducitur heiulatus, uiolentia doloris frangi atque in ultimam tabem diffluentium uiscerum maceratione consumi.*

REPRAESENTAT c. 16 p. 52 l. 27. Plin. h. n. XXIII § 82 *si uetusti non sit occasio, decoquitur ut uetustatem simulet.*

p. 50 l. 21 CONSTVPRATVR Idolol. 1. Cic. Liu. Suet. Hier. *ore -atus* Lamprid. Comm. I § 7. [See also Thes. A. S.]

p. 50 l. 22 PLANE cet. ad nat. I 10 p. 80 l. 5 Wiss. *plane religiosiores estis in gladiatorum cauea, ubi super sanguinem humanum, super inquinamenta poenarum perinde saltant dei uestri argumenta et historias nocentibus erogandis, ut in ipsis deis nocentes puniantur.*

CAVEA Plaut. Cic. Verg. Suet. Sen. e.g. Ep. 84 § 10. Sil. XVI 535 *cauea damnante furorem.* 472. Stat. Theb. I 423. V 340. VI 654. Valer. Flac. IV 228. Bährens PLM. V 110 10. Aug. De Ciu. Dei I 31. Prudent. Peristeph. VI 62. Coripp. De Laudibus Iustin. III 253. Lact. V 20 § 13 *qualis haec religio aut quanta maiestas putanda est, quae adoratur in templis, illuditur in theatris? et qui haec fecerint, non poenas uiolati numinis pendunt, sed honorati etiam laudatique discedunt.*

p. 50 l. 23 INQVINAMENTA Vitr. (1). Gell. (1). Tert. De Carne Christi 20 f. De Spectac. 8. 10 f. 15 pr. Ambr. Off. II § 65. De Cain II § 2. Chromat. in Matt. tr. 3 § 6. [Add Aug. spec. 4. Ps.-Aug. serm. ter. A. S.] Picture of Leda Clem. Hom. VI 23.

p. 50 l. 25 NOXII cf. Mart. X 25. VIII 30 (both Scaevola). Spect. 7 (Laureolus). 8 (Daedalus). 21 (Orpheus). Friedländer II[5] 408—10.

p. 50 l. 26 ATTIN ad nat. I 10 p. 80 l. 9 Wiss. *uidimus saepe castratum Attin deum a Pessinunte, et qui uiuus cremabatur, Herculem induerat. risimus et meridiani ludi de deis lusum, quod Ditis pater, Iouis frater, gladiatorum exsequias cum malleo deducit, quo Mercurius, in caluitio pennatulus, in caduceo ignitulus, corpora exanimata iam mortemue simulantia e cauterio probat.* Theophil. I 9. III 8. Minuc. 21 § 11 Holden, Keim 7 n. 2. Aug. De Ciu. Dei VI 7 (I 260 3 D.). Arnob. V 6 7. Tatian 8 p. 147c. Rationalised Porphyr. in Euseb. Praep. Eu. III 11 §§ 12 15 and in Aug. Ciu. Dei VII 25. Mommsen Strafrecht 927 n. 6.

p. 50 l. 27 HERCVLEM Arnob. I 36 p. 54, Hild. VII 33

indignatio relanguescit Alcidae, si tragoedia Sophoclis, cui Trachiniae nomen est, Euripidis aut Hercules actitatur?

MERIDIANORVM Sen. Ep. 7 § 5 *mane leonibus et ursis homines, meridie spectatoribus suis obiciuntur.* § 3 *casu in meridianum spectaculum incidi, lusus exspectans et sales et aliquid laxamenti, quo hominum oculi ab humano cruore acquiescant. contra est, quicquid ante pugnatum est, misericordia fuit. nunc omissis nugis mera homicidia sunt: nihil habent, quo tegantur: ad ictum totis corporibus expositi, numquam frustra manum mittunt* cet.

p. 50 l. 28 Blunt Right Use, 359. Marquardt III^2 564 n. 2. 562 n. pr.

p. 50 l. 31 INQVIETANT Sen. Ep. 2 § 1. 14 § 2. 27 § 6. De Tranquil. 2 § 1 cet.: see printed n. Tert. De Carn. Chr. 1 pr. *qui fidem resurrectionis student inquietare.*

p. 50 l. 32 OBSOLETANT. One other passage of Tert. cited. Cf. [Nicet. de uigiliis § 3 p. 58, 19 ed. Burn. A. S.] *paginam* Greg. Turon. Mart. II 3 p. 610 16. Gloss. Isidor. *obsoletatus, pollutus, inquinatus*, Gloss. Arabico-Lat. p. 708 Vulc. *obsolito, obtero uel inquino.* With the reading of Cod. Fuld. *adsolant* cf. ad nat. I 10 p. 80 l. 14 Wiss. *singula ista* (as here)...*diuinitatis*, si maiestatis fastigium adsolant. ibid. p. 75 l. 27 Wiss. with Oehler's note, *saepe censores inconsulto populo adsolauerunt.* Gloss. in Mai Class. Auctor. VI 504 *adsolitum* (*-at-*) *adlitum* (*-is-*).

CENSENTVR c. 12 p. 44 l. 15. infra c. 24 p.m. p. 86 l. 7. ad nat. I 10 p. 80 l. 16 Wiss. *de contemptu utique censentur quam* [surely *tam* A. S.] *eorum qui* eiusmodi *factitant quam eorum qui ista suscipiunt.* Adu. Hermog. 39 p. 169 l. 9 Kr. *si et materia eadem aeternitate censetur.* Ad Vxor. I 6. De Cult. Fem. I 4 f. Iustin. XI 11 § 9 *hoc se patre censeri iubet.* Greg. Naz. Or. 4 118 (I 143^{cd}). [5 § 15, 2, p. 185, l. 10 Eng. A. S.]

p. 50 l. 33 EIVSMODI c. 49. ad nat. l. c. and I 5 p. 66 l. 4 Wiss. *et tamen eiusmodi neque congregantur neque participant nobiscum.* Oehler p. 631 on Bapt. 12. De Idolol. 21 p. 55 l. 17 Wiss. *in eiusmodi ridere.* De Praescr. Haeret. 5 f. Hermas Simil. 1 (p. 70 17 Hilg.) *diuitias uestras in eiusmodi consumite.* Cypr. Ep. 2 § 1 (p. 468 4 H.). Studia Biblica IV 306.

p. 52 l. 1 LUDICRA cf. c. 9 p. 30 l. 26.

p. 52 l. 2 IN TEMPLIS ADVLTERIA De pudic. 5 p. 227 l. 8 Wiss. *ego quidem idololatria saepissime moechiae occasionem subministro. sciunt luci mei et mei montes et uiuae aquae ipsaque in urbibus templa, quantum euertendae pudicitiae procurem.* Bayle œuvres III 368. Minuc. 25 § 12 *ubi autem magis a sacerdotibus, quam inter aras et delubra conducuntur stupra, tractantur lenocinia, adulteria meditantur? frequentius denique in aedituorum cellulis, quam in ipsis lupanaribus, flagrans libido defungitur.* Iuu. 9 24 *quo non prostat femina templo?* See the story in Ios. Antiq. XVIII 3 § 4 of the Egyptian priests who were crucified A.D. 19, their temple destroyed, and the image of Isis thrown into the Tiber. Herod. II 64. Preller Röm. Myth. 728 cites Tibull. I 3 23 sq. Propert. II 33. Ou. Amor. II 2 25. 13 7. Ars Amat. I 77. III 393. Trist. II 297. Epp. ex Pont. I 1 51. Iuu. 6 488. Theodoret Hist. Eccl. V 22. Rufin. II 25. Jacobs Verm. Schr. IV 257.

COMPONI of assignation, Hor. Carm. I 9 19—20 *lenesque sub noctem susurri composita repetantur hora.*

p. 52 l. 4 Prudent. Peristeph. II 525 *uittatus olim pontifex* cf. Mart. Capella I § 10 Kopp. Sil. Ital. XIII 779. Greg. Naz. Or. 4 114 (I 140[d]) *αὐτοὶ τοὺς ἑαυτῶν προέδρους γραψάτωσαν. ἁλουργὶς αὐτοὺς κοσμήσει καὶ ταινία καὶ στεφάνων ἄνθος καὶ κάλλος.*

APICIBVS Lexx. De Pall. 4 f. p. 944 *pallium...super...omnes apices et tutulos sacerdos suggestus.* Seru. ad Aen. VIII 664. Gell. X 15 § 9. Festus p. 10 12 M. Dion. Halic. II 70 (the Salii). Arnob. IV 35 *sedent diales cum apicibus flamines.* CIL. I 33.

p. 52 l. 5 EXPVNGI c. 2 n. 20 f. 35 Oehler. De Anim. 35. 55. Adu. Marc. II 20 f. III 11 med. IV 34. V 21. Adu. Iud. 11. 14. De Idolol. 1. 13. Scorpiac. 10 Oehler. De Pudic. 2 p.m. De Paenit. 3 p.m. *adeo quod prohibetur administrare, satis periculose animus sibi repraesentat et temere per uoluntatem—it effectum.* [Rufin. i.e.] Iulian.-Aecl. in Am. I (5 9).

NE same words in ad nat. I 10 p. 80 l. 18 Wiss. *nescio ne plus de uobis dei uestri quam de nobis querantur.* On *ne* see c. 3 pr. n. Cf. Bayle œuvres III 296—7.

p. 52 l. 6 SACRILEGI Iuu. ind. s.u. Lucian Peregrin. 24. Deor. Concil. 12. Icaromen. 17. Schmidt (?) 264. Keim Rom. und das Christenthum 222. Sen. Nat. Qu. II 42 § 1 *impunitis sacrilegis.* Chrys. XI 713[ab]. Iustin. XXXII 3 §§ 9—11. Clem. Recogn. V 15. Hom. X 8.

DE VESTRIS c. 44 f. *de uestris semper aestuat carcer* cet.

p. 52 l. 7 ADPREHENDVNTVR Plin. Ep. III 20 § 9. Iren. III 16 § 7 (dig. Gell.).

p. 52 l. 8 SPOLIARENT Melito Apol. 10 (Otto IX 430 ex Syr.) *num id est deus quod custodiendum est?...ecce enim, si hostes tui te deuincunt, etiam eum decorticant.* Ep. ad Diognet. 2. Iustin. Apol. I 9 *ἀθέμιτον καὶ τὸ νοεῖν ἢ λέγειν ἀνθρώπους θεῶν εἶναι φύλακας.*

p. 52 l. 10 SVBIACET it is obvious. Polyb. *ὑπόκειται νοεῖν* Ashton. *subiacens materia* (*ὑποκειμένη ὕλη*) adu. Marc. I 15 p. 310 l. 6 Kr. ad nat. I 10 p. 74 l. 22 Wiss. *de reliqua uero conuersationis humanae dispositione palam subiacet, quanta a maioribus mutaueritis.*

NEC...AMPLIVS *nec iam a.* Sil. Ital. VIII 163. XVII 381 *haud a.* XV 789. Cic. De Or. I § 54 *non a.* of time.

p. 52 l. 12 SACRAMENTI Kaye 337.

p. 52 l. 13 REPERCVSSIS 41 pr. Adu. Marc. II 20 Oehler, 29. IV 23 a.m. Adu. Hermog. 12 p. m. De Idolol. 5. De Pudic. 2. 7 pr. Oehler. Cf. infra 16 f. *irrepercussum.*

Cap. XVI

p. 52 l. 14 CAPVT ASININVM ad nat. I 11 pr. 14. Minuc. 9 § 4 *audio eos turpissimae pecudis caput asini consecratum inepta nescio qua persuasione uenerari: digna et nata religio talibus moribus.* ib. 28 § 8 *inde est quod audire te dicis caput asini rem nobis esse diuinam. quis tam stultus ut hoc colat? quis stultior ut hoc coli credat?* Ios. contr. Ap. II 9. E. Rösch in Stud. u. Krit. 1882 Heft 3. Ferd. Becker, Das Spottcrucifix der röm. Kaiserpaläste, Breslau 1866 (cf. Theol. Jahresber. 1867 p. 110). Ophite diagram in Orig. contr. Cels. VI 30 (Keim p. 88 n. 2). Keim Jesu von Nazara III 81 n. 4. Tac. Hist. V 3 and 4. Diod. Sic. XXXIV 1 (Phot. Bibl. c. 244) § 3 Antiochus Epiphanes *εἰσῆλθεν εἰς τὸν*

ἄδυτον τοῦ θεοῦ σηκόν, οὗ νόμιμον εἰσιέναι μόνον τὸν ἱερέα· εὑρὼν δὲ ἐν αὐτῷ λίθινον ἄγαλμα ἀνδρὸς βαθυπώγωνος καθήμενον ἐπ᾽ ὄνου μετὰ χεῖρας ἔχον βιβλίον, τοῦτο μὲν ὑπέλαβε Μωϋσέως εἶναι. Th. Hasaeus, Diatribe de Onolatria olim Iudaeis et Christianis impacta. Lips. 1817. 4to. E. A. Schulz, De Ononychoto deo Christianis quondam afficto, in his Exercitatt. Philol. fasc. 1. Berol. 1755. Münter, Die Christin im heidn. Hause p. 15 sq. Augusti, Beiträge zur christl. Kunstgesch. I 116 seq. (Kurz Handb. I (1853) 100 n. 2). Epiphan. Haer. I 26 Gnostics. Some gave to Sabaoth the form of an ass, some of a swine. Schürer Gesch. d. jüd. Volkes II^2 550 seq. 785. III^3 104. On Apion Lightfoot in Smith I 128—130. Müller Fr. Hist. Gr. III 506—516. Ios. contr. Apion. II 6 said that Jews worshipped the head of an ass. Suidas s.v. Ἰούδας.

p. 52 l. 21 ONAGRIS Varro Verg. Colum. Plin. Mart. Petron. 38. Cels. II 18 p. 64 l. 20 D. Solin. 27. Hier. Vit. Hilarion. 31. [Aug. gen. ad litt. III. 11. A. S.]

p. 52 l. 22 SVPERFICIEM Chalcid. Tim. p. 46 *a*.

p. 52 ll. 23—29 ad nat. I 11 p. 81 ll. 6—14 Wiss.

p. 52 l. 24 Testim. Anim. 5 p. 141 l. 21 Wiss. *diuinae scripturae, quae penes nos uel Iudaeos sunt, in quorum oleastro insiti sumus.* Cf. Pusey p. 36 n. Z.

p. 52 l. 25 TACITVS...LOQVACISSIMVS ad nat. I 11 p. 81 l. 7 Wiss. *at enim—loquacissimus. oblitus affirmationis suae in posterioribus refert Pompeium Magnum de Iudaeis debellatis captisque Hierosolymis templum adisse et perscrutatum nihil simulacri repperisse. ubi ergo is deus fuerit? utique nusquam magis quam in templo tam memorabili, praesertim omnibus praeter* < *quam* A.S. > *sacerdotibus clauso, quo non uererentur extraneum.* Sidon. c. XXIII 153—4 *et qui pro ingenio fluente nulli,* | *Corneli Tacite, es tacendus ori.* II 192 *quà pompa Tacitus numquam sine laude loquendus.*

p. 52 l. 26 POMPEIVM Tac. Hist. V 9, cf. 5.

p. 52 l. 28 from Ios. contr. Apion. II 7 § 82 *et cum uarii casus nostram ciuitatem, sicut etiam aliorum, uexauerint, et* < *Antiochus* > *Theos ac Pompeius Magnus ac Licinius Crassus et ad nouissimum Titus Caesar bello uincentes obtinuerint templum, nihil huiusmodi illic inuenere.* Ios. Ant. XIV 7 §§ 105 ff. B. I. I 8

§ 8 (179). Diodor. Sicul. XL 5 § 4. Tac. Hist. II 78 *est Iudaeam inter Syriamque Carmelus: ita montem uocant deumque. nec simulacrum deo aut templum—sic tradidere maiores—: ara tantum et reuerentia.* ibid V 5. 9. Dio XXXVII 17 n.

SIMVLACRVM ad nat. I 11 p. 81 l. 7 Wiss. Iuu. 14 97 n. *nil praeter nubes et caeli numen adorant.*

p. 52 l. 29 REPRAESENTABATVR c. 15 p. 50 l. 20.

p. 52 l. 31 CVLTVRA (late in this sense) c. 21 dub. p. 74 l. 8 n. ad nat. I 10 p. 75 l. 5 Wiss. *deorum.*

p. 52 l. 32 SOLIS SACERDOTIBVS holy of holies Hebr. 9 6 and 7. So Lucian De Dea Syr. 31, of her temple.

p. 52 l. 33 OPPANSO c. 48 p. 138 l. 30. Gratt. cyneg. Prudent. (-sum n. s. Tert.).

p. 54 l. 1 CANTHERIOS ad nat. I 14. Auson. Epist. 21 39. Arnob. V 11 f. Plaut. Varr. (add Sat. 5 Bücheler). Lucil. Cic. de nat. Deor. III § 11 Mayor (p. 69). Liu. Sen. Cato in Macrob. sat. III 14 § 9. Gallicis -is Hier. Ep. 27 § 3. in Jona c. 4. Apul. Metam. III 27. IX 13 ter κανθήλιος.

CVM SVA EPONA Tert. ad nat. I 11 p. 81 l. 16 Wiss. *credatur deus noster asinina aliqua persona: certe negabitis uos eadem habere nobiscum! sane uos totos asinos colitis et cum sua Epona et omnia iumenta et pecora et bestias, quae perinde cum suis praesepibus consecratis. et hoc forsitan crimini datis, quod inter cultores omnium tantum asinarii sumus.* Minuc. 29 § 8 *nisi quod uos et totos asinos in stabulis cum uestra uel Epona consecratis et eosdem asinos cum Iside religiose deuoratis.* Iuu. 8 157 n. and Journ. Phil. XX 275—6.

p. 54 l. 2—56, 3 ad nat. I 11 fin.

p. 54 l. 4 CRVCIS Kaye 432—3. On the fanciful discovery of the cross everywhere, cf. Blunt First Three Centuries 130, Right Use 103. 55. Adu. Iud. 10 (cl. Kaye 442). Iust. Mart. Apol. I 55. Minuc. Fel. 29 § 6 *cruces etiam nec colimus nec optamus.*

RELIGIOSOS Boissier La Relig. Rom. I 429 (inscr.) *-i magnae Matris.* On the worship of the cross La Cerda cites Ambr. Orat. Funebr. de Obitu Theodosii §§ 45. 46 *habeat Helena quod legat, unde crucem Domini recognoscat. inuenit ergo titulum, regem adorauit, non lignum utique, quia hic gentilis est error,*

et uanitas impiorum. sed adorauit illum qui pependit in ligno, scriptus in titulo. Heathen gave out that Christians worshipped all crucified men. Orig. contra Cels. II 47 f. Tert. ad nat. I 12 pr. *sed et qui nos crucis antistites affirmat, consacerdos erit noster.* ibid. c. 7 p. 68 l. 11 Wiss. *tot cruces diuinitatem consecutae.* Pusey p. 37 n. C and append. B pp. 109—116. Pamel. Sinker in DCA. under 'cross.' Petron. 126 p. 777 B. Lact. IV 26 § 29 Bünemann. Arnob. I 36 pr. VII 36. Elmenhorst on Arnob. p. 31. Cyril contr. Iul. l. 6. Athan. Vit. Ant. 74. 75.

CONSECRANEVS also in Capitolin. [See also Thes.]

p. 54 l. 5 Tert. ad nat. I 12 pr. *crucis qualitas signum est de ligno; et eandem materiam colitis penes uos cum effigie: quamquam sicut uestrum humana figura est, ita et nostrum sua propria. uiderint nunc liniamenta, dum una sit qualitas; uiderit forma, dum ipsum sit dei corpus. quodsi de hoc differentia intercedit, quanto distinguitur a crucis stipite Pallas Attica et Ceres Pharia, quae sine forma rudi palo et solo staticulo ligni informis repraesentatur? pars crucis, et quidem maior, est omne robur quod derecta statione defigitur.* (See n. on p. 54 l. 9.)

VIDERIT 25 n. 42 n. Adu. Valentin. 9 a. m. De Testim. Anim. 1 pr. Adu. Hermog. 1. De Cor. Milit. 13 Oehler. De Pallio 6 *uiderit nunc philosophia, quid prosit.* De Paenit. 2 p. m. *uiderit ergo ingratia hominum, si etiam bonis factis paenitentiam cogit. uiderit et gratia, si captatio eius ad benefaciendum incitamento est, terrena, mortalis utraque.* 3 p. m. Adu. Marcion. V 10 pr. De Anima 10 pr. *uiderint artes et disciplinae, uiderint et haereses.* De Spectac. 15 pr. *σὺ ὄψει* Matt. 27 4 (that's your look out). Cic. de nat. Deor. I § 17 n. III § 9 n. Lucian. Mort. Dial. 3 1 Ἀμφίλοχος μὲν οὗτος ἂν εἰδείη ὅ τι αὐτῷ ἀποκριτέον ὑπὲρ αὐτοῦ, ἐγὼ δὲ ἥρως εἰμί. Contemplantes (Charon) 4 ἀκούω καὶ ταῦτα· εἰ δὲ ἀληθῆ, σὺ ἄν, Ἑρμῆ, καὶ οἱ ποιηταὶ εἰδείητε. Orig. contr. Cels. VIII 14 αὐτὸς ἂν εἰδείη. ib. 16 p. 388 f. εἴσονται.

p. 54 l. 7 STIPITE Adu. Iudaeos 10 p. 728 Oehler, *nam et in antenna nauis, quae crucis pars est, hoc* <i.e. *cornua*> *extremitates huius uocantur, unicornis autem medius stipitis palus.*

PALLAS ATTICA Frazer's Pausan. I 26 6 (II 340).

p. 54 l. 8 Lucan III 412—3 *simulacraque maesta deorum | arte carent caesisque exstant informia truncis.* 415—6 *non uulgatis sacrata figuris | numina sic metuunt.*

p. 54 l. 9 CRVCIS. Fanciful analogies in Adu. Marc. III 18. Adu. Iud. 10. Ad nat. I 12 p. 82 l. 2 Wiss. (see note on p. 54 l. 5; then follows) *sed nobis tota crux imputatur, cum antemna scilicet sua et cum illo sedilis excessu. hoc quidem nos incusabiliores, qui mutilum et truncum dicastis lignum, quod alii plenum et structum consecrauerunt.*

p. 54 l. 10 SI FORTE Munro on Lucr. V 719. Cic. De Oratore III § 47 Wilkins. infr. l. 17 and c. 20 f. 23 p. m. 43 pr. Ad Mart. 1 f. 2. Adu. Marcion. III 24, p. 421 l. 7 Kr. IV 10 bis. 17 pr. V 10 pr. Adu. Hermog. 36 m. De Cor. Milit. 5, Oehler.

p. 54 l. 11 DIXIMVS c. 12 pr.

PLASTIS Idolol. 3 a.m. Vell. Plin.

p. 54 l. 12 CRVCE Tert. De Idolol. 12 p. 43 l. 14 Wiss. *corpus..., quod in modum crucis est.*

VICTORIAS Tert. ad nat. I 12 p. 83 l. 13 Wiss. *con<structio>ne quo melius extollant, cruces erunt, intestina quodammodo tropaeorum. itaque in Victoriis et cruces colit castrensis religio, si signa adorat, signa deierat, signa ipsi Ioui praefert.* Minuc. 29 § 7 *tropaea uestra uictricia non tantum simplicis crucis faciem, uerum et adfixi hominis imitantur.* Iustin. Apol. I c. 55 p. 90c *θάλασσα μὲν γὰρ οὐ τέμνεται, ἢν μὴ τοῦτο τὸ τρόπαιον, ὃ καλεῖται ἱστίον, ἐν τῇ νηῒ σῶον μείνῃ.* Prudent. contr. Symm. I 486—8 *Christus purpureum gemmanti textus in auro | signabat labarum, clipeorum insignia Christus | scripserat, ardebat summis crux addita cristis.* The labarum (Euseb. Vita Const. I 28 § 2) *σταυροῦ τρόπαιον, ἐκ φωτὸς συνιστάμενον.* Cf. 40 § 1. Laus Const. 9 § 8. Hist. Eccl. IX 9 § 10. Iustin. Apol. I 55 p. 90de (cited on p. 54 l. 16). Heraldus cites Ios. Antiq. XV 11 (8 §§ 1, 2) Herod built an amphitheatre at Jerusalem and set up trophies which gave great offence. He invited the leaders and asked what they supposed them to be. They replied 'images of men.' He ordered the trophies to be stript: *ἐπιδείκνυσιν αὐτοῖς γυμνὰ τὰ ξύλα.* Laughter and tranquillity,

p. 54 l. 14 SIGNA VENERATVR Blunt Right Use 380. 253.

Marquardt II^2 438 n. 6—8. Tert. ad nat. I 12 (see last note). De Cor. Milit. 11 med. *uexillum quoque portabit aemulum Christi?* Dionys. Halicar. VI 45 § 2 *ἀφίστανται τῶν ὑπάτων ἁρπάσαντες τὰ σημεῖα· τιμιώτατα γὰρ Ῥωμαίοις ταῦτ' ἐπὶ στρατείας καὶ ὥσπερ ἱδρύματα θεῶν ἱερὰ νομίζονται.* Ios. De Bell. Iud. VI 6 § 1 = (32). Claudian in Rufin. II 366. Tac. Ann. I 39 *illic <Plancus> signa et aquilam amplexus religione sese tutabatur, ac ni aquilifer Calpurnius uim extremam arcuisset, rarum etiam inter hostes, legatus populi Romani Romanis in castris sanguine suo altaria deum commaculauisset.* II 17. Hist. III 10 f. *conuersus ad signa et bellorum deos.* Suet. Tib. 48 f. *munera Syriacis legionibus, quod solae nullam Seiani imaginem inter signa coluissent.* Calig. 14 f. (of Artabanus) *transgressus Euphratem aquilas et signa Romana Caesarumque imagines adorauit.* Cf. Vitell. 2. Lasaulx 225 n. 97.

IVRAT Liu. XXVI 48 § 12 (B. C. 210) *stare hinc legionarios milites, hinc classicos, per omnes deos paratos iurare magis quae uelint quam quae sciant uera esse, et obstringere periurio non se solum suumque caput, sed signa militaria et aquilas sacramentique religionem.* Sen. Ep. 95 § 35. Tac. Ann. XV 16 *adicit iure iurando Paeti cautum apud signa.* Cf. Caes. B. G. VII 2 § 2.

OMNIBVS DIS c. 28 f. *citius denique apud uos per omnes deos, quam per unum genium Caesaris peieratur.*

p. 54 l. 15 SVGGESTVS Rigalt Gloss. Tert. Adu. Marcion. II 22 a. m. III 2. IV 7 a. m. De Carne Christi 16 a. m. De Cor. Milit. 13 Oehler. Ad nat. I 12 f. Gothofr. (an exact parallel throughout) *sed ille imaginum suggestus et totius auri cultus monilia crucum sunt.* De Bapt. 2 med. 3 pr. De Spectac. 7. 12.

p. 54 l. 16 SIPARA Arnob. II 18. Apul. met. I 8 (*-ium*) X 29 fin. Cf. Iuu. 8 186. So = sails, Tert. Adu. Marcion. III 18. Adu. Iud. 10. Iustin. Apol. I c. 55 f. p. 90de *καὶ τὰ παρ' ὑμῖν δὲ* [*δὴ?* A. S.] *σύμβολα τὴν τοῦ σχήματος τούτου δύναμιν δηλοῖ, λέγω δὲ τὰ τῶν οὐηξίλλων καὶ τῶν τροπαίων, δι' ὧν αἵ τε πρόσοδοι ὑμῶν πανταχοῦ γίνονται, τῆς ἀρχῆς καὶ δυνάμεως τὰ σημεῖα ἐν τούτοις δεικνύντες, εἰ καὶ μὴ νοοῦντες τοῦτο πράττετε.* Not known to Saglio. Hier. Ep. 107 (=7 ad Lae-

tam) 2 *uexilla militum crucis insignia sunt.* Tert. ad nat. I 12 f. *sic etiam <in canta>bris atque uexillis, quae non minore sanctitate militia custodit, siphara illa uestes crucum sunt. erubescitis, opinor, incultas et nudas cruces colere.* So the *cross* in birds. Tert. De Orat. 29 f. *sed et aues mane exsurgentes eriguntur ad caelum et alarum crucem pro manibus expandunt, et dicunt aliquid, quod oratio uideatur.*

CANTABRORVM Minuc. 29 § 7 *uos plane, qui ligneos deos consecratis, cruces ligneas ut deorum uestrorum partes forsitan adoratis. nam et signa ipsa et cantabra et uexilla castrorum quid aliud quam inauratae cruces sunt et ornatae?* Cf. *cantabrarius.*

p. 54 l. 18 SOLEM ad nat. I 13 pr. *alii plane humanius solem Christianum deum aestimant, quod innotuerit ad orientis partem facere nos precationem, uel die solis laetitiam curare.* A prayer to Sol (Iul. Firm. Matern. Math. I 4 § 9) in Lasaulx Studien 157.

p. 54 l. 19 PERSAS Brisson. De Regno Persarum l. 2 pr. (op. min. 512 sq.). Kaye 116. 384. Orig. contr. Cels. VI 22. VII 65.

SI FORTE p. 54 l. 8 n.

p. 54 l. 21 CLIPEO = sun's disk also in Ou. Of medallions also Tac. Suet. in lexx. Migne XC 128^{b} 129^{d}. IRN. 5029.

p. 54 l. 22 ORIENTIS. Newman's Fleury III 232 (bk 26 c. 54 n. r.), Kaye 384, Marquardt III^{2} 178 n. 7. [Iustin.] Quaestt. ad Orthodoxos 118 (p. 470^{d} 471^{ab}). Bingham ind. s. v. 'East.' Kortholt Paganus obtrectator 288 sq. Gass Zeitschr. für hist. Th. (1842) 119 120. Kinnuel(?) Monum. Fidei Eccl. Or. II p. 198. Iac. Thomasius De Ritu ueterum Christianorum precandi uersus Orientem. Lips. 1670, 4to. Lactant. Diu. Instt. II 9 § 5 Bünemann *oriens Deo accensetur, quia ipse luminis fons et illustrator est rerum et quod oriri nos faciat ad uitam sempiternam; occidens autem conturbatae illi prauaeque menti ascribitur, quod lumen abscondat, quod tenebras semper inducat, et quod homines faciat occidere atque interire peccatis.* Lord King Primitive Church II 18 22 (chiefly from Zech. 6 12 whose name is ἀνατολή). In the renuntiation the baptised turned to the W., in confession to the E. Iustin. c. Tryph. 106 p. 334 a. Gratian Decret. 5 223. Cyril in Bingham XIII 5 7 n. 59 60.

Bingham XIII 8 15. Origen Hom. 5 in Num. (II 284). De Orat. 32 (XVII 289 n.—291 n. with Ruaeus). La Cerda ad l. omn. Clem. Alex. Strom. VII 7 § 43 f. p. 856 f. P. Pacat. Paneg. 3 § 2 (cf. Barth in Arntz. p. 162 b) *diuinis rebus operantes in eam caeli plagam ora conuertimus, a qua lucis exordium est.* Plut. Numa 14 § 6 *πρὸς ἕω τῶν ἱερῶν βλεπόντων.* Marcell. 6 § 9. Lasaulx Studien 154 n. 95. Ioan. Damascen. De Fide Orthod. IV 13. Pusey h. l. p. 38 n. k. Verg. Aen. XII 172 Forbiger. VIII 68 Forb. and Gossrau. Ou. Fast. IV 777. Philo De Vita Contemplatiua 3 (II 475 M.) *δὶς δὲ καθ' ἑκάστην ἡμέραν εἰώθασιν εὔχεσθαι, τάς τε ὄψεις καὶ ὅλον τὸ σῶμα πρὸς τὴν ἕω στάντες.* Constit. Apost. II 57 Cotelier. VII 28. 44. V 7 (the Phoenix !). Tac. Hist. III 24 f. Lucian Necyom. 7. Harnack on Herm. Vis. I 4 1 Funk ib. Basil. De Spir. Sancto 27 *τὸ πρὸς ἀνατολὰς τετράφθαι κατὰ τὴν προσευχήν, ποῖον ἐδίδαξεν ὑμᾶς γράμμα.* Brisson. De Formulis I 61. Brouer De Vett. et Recentt. Adoratt. c. 20 (Poleni Suppl. Thes. II 1003. Dict. Christ. Antiq. 'East.' Dict. Nat. Biog. 'Asplin, Wm.' controversy 1722—40 between two Oxford men, Asplin and John Andrews. J. A. Fabricius Bibliogr. Antiquaria 3rd ed. Hamburg, 1760, p. 361, c. XI 10 p. 506 sq. Aug. De Sermone Domini in Monte II 5 § 18 *cum ad orationem stamus, ad orientem conuertimur, unde caelum surgit.* Sid. Ep. II 10 § 4 l. 5—7 *aedes...ortum prospicit aequinoctialem.* Mayor on Cic. De Nat. Deor. I § 79 p. 183.

p. 54 l. 23 LABIA VIBRATIS. ad nat. I 13 pr. *non plerique affectatione adorandi aliquando etiam caelestia ad solis initium labia uibratis?* Iuu. 10 289 n. comm. on Petron. 85. Scriver on Mart. XII 90. Ouid Ars Amat. II 327 *multa uoue sed cuncta palam.* Mithra-worship, Iul. Or. 4 *εἰς τὸν βασιλέα ἥλιον* and ind. Hertlein "sol."

p. 54 l. 24 DIEM SOLIS ad nat. I 13 pr. De Ieiun. 15 p. 293 l. 13 Wiss. *duas in anno hebdomadas xerophagiarum nec totas, exceptis scilicet sabbatis et dominicis, offerimus deo.* De Cor. Milit. 3 p. m. *die dominico ieiunium nefas ducimus.* Philastr. Haer. 113=112. Bingham XX 2 1. Friedländer I[5] 389 2. Iustin. Apol. I 67 ter. Const. Apost. II 59. V 20. VII 23. VIII 33. Cf. Theophil. II 12 (where Otto cites Grotius De Verit. Rel. Chr. I

§ 16 n. Selden De Iure Natur. et Gent. III 13 seq. 21. Philo Opp. II p. 137. Euseb. Praep. Euang. XIII 12. Aristobulus in Clem. Alex. Strom. V 14 § 108 *τὴν ἑβδόμην ἱερὰν οὐ μόνον οἱ Ἑβραῖοι ἀλλὰ καὶ οἱ Ἕλληνες ἴσασι*). Cf. Schürer Eng. tr. II 2, p. 83. Barnab. 15 § 9 (with Harnack) *ἄγομεν τὴν ἡμέραν τὴν ὀγδόην εἰς εὐφροσύνην*. Kaye 388 n. 2. Brissonius ad l. 5 (Cod. Theod. XV 5) *dominico, de spectaculis* (Opera minora ed. Trekell, Lugd. 1749, pp. 231 sq.). Auson. Idyll. (Eclog. n. 5) = 9 p. 97 Peiper *nomina quae septem uertentibus apta diebus annus habet*. Julius Charles Hare "On the Names of the Days of the Week" (Philolog. Mus. Cambr. 1832 pp. 1—73). Dio XXXVII 18 n.

p. 54 l. 25 DIEM SATVRNI ad nat. I 13 f. *quare...qui solem et diem eius nobis exprobratis, agnoscite uicinitatem; non longe a Saturno et sabbatis uestris sumus.* Aug. Consens. Euangel. I 30 pr. *alii dicunt, Saturnus est: credo propter sabbati sanctificationem, quia isti eum diem Saturno tribuerunt.* Selden De Iure Nat. et Gent. III 15 sq.

p. 54 l. 26 EXORBITANTES ad nat. I 13 p. 84 l. 2 Wiss. *quod quidem facitis exorbitantes et ipsi a uestris ad alienas religiones. Iudaei enim festi sabbata et cena pura, et Iudaici ritus lucernarum et ieiunia cum azymis et orationes litorales, quae utique aliena sunt a diis uestris.* Friedländer III[5] 628 n. 1. Iuu. 14 96. The word *exorbitare* 6 n. 20. De Pallio 5. De Praescr. Haer. 4 pr. fin. 44 f. De Pudic. 8 pr. De Virg. Vel. 8 pr. Adu. Marc. II 10. III 2 med. Cypr. Ep. 70 § 2. Lactant. Diu. Instt. II 5 § 12. Aug. De Ciu. Dei IX 3. De Corrept. et Grat. 24. Iren. V 20 § 1. Koffmane I 96. [Add Sanday, N. T. S. Irenaei, Introd. A. S.]

p. 54 l. 28 QVIDAM a Jew (ad nat. I 14 pr.: see below). No Jewish polemic of this age remaining, but on the Christian side Iustin. c. Tryph., Tert. Adu. Iud. (which Semler asserted to be a compilation from the books Adu. Marc.); Origen (e.g. contr. Cels. I 55 pr. p. 42) mentions debates which he held with Jews. The Jew in Celsus is a lay figure (Tzschirner 182 sq.). Iustin. c. Tryph. 17 p. 235 the Jews the authors of libels against Christians. Tert. ad nat. I 14 p. 84 l. 16 Wiss. *et credidit uulgus infami Iudaeo. quid enim? aliud genus seminari est infamiae nostrae.* Orig. c. Cels. VI 27 p. 293 Jews charged

Christians with incest in the dark and with cannibalism. Bar-Cochba Iustin. Apol. I 38. Dio LXVIII 18 § 1 (?), LXIX 12 slaughtered Christians.

p. 54 l. 30 ὀνοκοίτης ad nat. I 11 f. 14 bis. Minuc. 9. 28. ASININIS Varr. Plin. Fulgent. Mythol. III 9 *aures*. Cass. Fel. 40 p. 92 *lac.* Apul. Metam. VIII 28 *lactem*. Renan Antéchr. p. 40 n. 1. Celsus in Orig. VI 31 (p. 88 n. e Keim) 37 bis (ὀνοκεφάλους). VII 40 p. 359 ὀνοειδής bis. 'Asinarii' by Hatch in Dict. Chr. Antiq. Bernays (Die Gottesfürchtigen bei Juvenal) Comm. philol. in honorem Mommseni Berl. 1877 563—9 interprets the Spottcrucifix of a proselyte. (Iuu. 14 101 n.) Empusa (Weizsäcker in Roscher II 1243) ὀνοκώλη or ὀνόσκελις. His worshippers not Christians, but Ophites, Epiphan. Haer. XXVI 12. Harnack Ueberlieferung u. s. w. I 167.

p. 54 l. 31 VNGVLATVS Minuc. 22 § 5 (Martian. Capella).

p. 54 l. 32 BIFORME Verg. Ou. Hor. Tac. Serenus c. 23 1 Müller. Firmicus Matern. math. VII 7 (Bas. 1551 p. 200 29) *biformes hermaphroditique* [= ed. Teubn. II 270 12 A. S.].

p. 54 l. 33 CANINO cet. Luc. Iupp. Trag. 8 f. 9. Minuc. 28 § 8 *de capro enim et homine mixtos et leonum et canum uultus deos dedicatis.* Ambros. Apolog. David alt. § 30 *gentiles, qui deos suos (quoniam homines fuisse negare non possunt) humana specie uisos esse testantur, an rex eorum, quem illi suis dis omnibus anteponunt, prodigiales formas potuit pro amore suscipere?* Aug. De Ciu. Dei IV 27 *poëticum sane deorum genus cur Scaeuola respuat, eisdem litteris non tacetur: quia sic uidelicet deos deformant, ut nec bonis hominibus comparentur, cum alium faciunt furari, alium adulterare; sic item aliquid aliter, turpiter atque inepte dicere ac facere...Iouem ipsum conuerti in bouem aut cygnum, ut cum aliqua concumbat.* Otto on Athenag. 20 p. 20^{a} n. 21.

LEONINO De Pall. 4. Arnob. VI 10, Hild. p. 502 and Orelli. Varr. Plin. dig. Vitruu. p. 82 26 Rose, *capita*. Sid. Ep. VII 14. Athanas. contra Gentes 9 m. (I 19^{ab} Migne) λογικὰ γὰρ ἀλόγοις ἐπιμίξαντες καὶ ἀνόμοια τῇ φύσει ἐγείραντες, ὡς θεοὺς θρησκεύουσιν· οἷοί εἰσιν οἱ παρ' Αἰγυπτίοις κυνοκέφαλοι καὶ ὀφιοκέφαλοι καὶ ὀνοκέφαλοι καὶ ὁ παρὰ Λίβυσι κριοκέφαλος Ἄμμων. Porphyr. De Abst. IV 9 εἴκασται γὰρ παρ' αὐτοῖς τις

μέχρι τραχήλου ἀνθρωποειδής, τὸ δὲ πρόσωπον ὀρνέου ἢ λέοντος, ἢ ἄλλου τινὸς ζῴου κεκτημένος...ὅθεν καὶ ὁ λέων ὡς θεὸς θρησκεύεται, καὶ μέρος τι τῆς Αἰγύπτου, ὃ καλοῦσι νομόν, ἐπώνυμον ἔχει Λεοντοπολίτην. Orig. c. Cels. VII 40 p. 359 the λέων, or λεοντοειδής (bis), not Christians but Ophites.

p. 54 l. 34 CAPRO Theodoret Graec. Affect. Curat. VII § 8 p. 103 45 sq.

CORNVTOS cap. 21 p. 68 l. 14. Fulgent. Mytholog. praef. 1 p 613 Stav. *-us adulter* (Jupiter with Europa). Hygin. astr. II 20 f bis. Hier. VI 322ᵃ. [Add exx. in Thes. A. S.]

A Apul. Mag. c. 4 *ab ore honestissimos.*

p. 56 l. 1 HAEC cet. Apul. Apol. c. 3 *tamen uel mea causa refellenda sunt...ne. uidear cuiquam, si quid praeteriero, id agnouisse potius quam contempsisse.* Cypr. Ad Demetrian. 2 *tacere ultra non oportet, ne iam non uerecundiae sed diffidentiae esse incipiat quod tacemus, et dum criminationes falsas contemnimus refutare, uideamur crimen agnoscere.*

EX ABVNDANTI Oehler on Tert. Ad Scap. 2 p. 540 14 pr. Adu. Marc. III 7 pr. IV 19 m. 38 p. 551 l. 1 Kr. V 4 pr. 9 pr. Adu. Prax. 15 m. De Cor. Milit. 7 pr. Ad Vxor. I 8. De Carne Chr. 2 f. 25. Iren. III 12 § 11. Sen. Benef. I 11 § 5. Quintil. Archiv für lat. Lexik. VII 216—7. [See Thes.] *ἐκ περιουσίας* H. St. Thes. (= *ex superfluo* Iren. [II xxiii I A. S.]. Hier. Ep. 84 § 11 f. 89 f. Adu. Iouin. I 28 pr. (?). Comm. in Amos VI 315ᴱ).

p. 56 l. 2 IRREPERCVSSVM also in Iul. in Aug. c. sec. resp. Iul. II § 98. Cf. supr. 15 f. *repercussis.*

p. 56 l. 4 REPVRGABIMVS the simple *purgo* (*factum, crimen, se*). Gell. X 19 § 3 *peccatum suum...purgatum ibat.* Cf. *expurgo.*

Cap. XVII

Ch. 17—23. Cf. De Praescrip. Haeret. 13.

p. 56 l. 5 QVOD COLIMVS, DEVS VNVS EST Lucian Antioch. ap. Rufin. Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IX 6 *in occulto non est quod nos Christiani quem colimus, Deus unus est.* Bingham XIII 3 1. Hennecke Aristid. ind. p. 52 col. 2 (*θεός* b). Harnack on Hermas Mandat. I § 1.

l. 5 seq. c. 21 *iam ediximus deum uniuersitatem hanc mundi uerbo et ratione et uirtute molitum...et nos etiam sermoni atque rationi itemque uirtuti, per quae omnia molitum deum ediximus, propriam substantiam spiritum inscribimus, cui et sermo insit pronuntianti et ratio adsit disponenti et uirtus praesit praeficienti.* Minuc. 18 § 7 *cum palam sit parentem omnium Deum nec principium habere nec terminum: qui natiuitatem omnibus praestet, sibi perpetuitatem; qui ante mundum fuerit sibi ipse pro mundo; qui uniuersa, quaecumque sunt, uerbo iubet, ratione dispensat, uirtute consummat. hic nec uideri potest; uisu clarior est; nec comprehendi.* Tzschirner 325 seq. Christians no atheists because (Iustin. Apol. I 16) they worship a Creator. Esp. Athenag. c. 4 p. 5 b God and matter distinct: the reign of law proves a providence.

p. 56 l. 9 INVISIBILIS cet. Athenag. 10 p. 10 b *ἀόρατον,...ἀκατάληπτον,...ἀχώρητον.* Tatian 4 p. 6 c, d *ἀόρατός τε καὶ ἀναφής.* The whole passage identical with Minuc. 18. Hennecke Aristid. ind. p. 53 col. 1 f. and 2 pr. [adu. Val. 7. Nouat. trin. 31 pr. A. S.].

p. 56 l. 10 INCOMPREHENSIBILIS Athanasian creed (Bailey Rituale Anglocath. 48 seq.). Iren. II 18 2. IV 19 2. [Niceta de symb. 2 A. S.] Aug. Serm. 384 de Trin. (V 1485 bis).

p. 56 l. 11 INAESTIMABILIS Minuc. 18 § 8 *nec aestimari [potest], sensibus maior est, infinitus, immensus, et soli sibi tantus quantus est notus: nobis uero ad intellectum pectus angustum est et ideo sic eum digne aestimamus, dum inaestimabilem dicimus.* [Study of Ambst. p. 111 A. S.]

p. 56 l. 16 CAPIT = ἐνδέχεται Tert. De Idolol. 10. De Fuga in Persec. 1 p. m. Oehler. De Cultu Fem. I 2 p. m. *haec non capit aestimare.* De Carn. Res. 26 fin. Adu. Haer. 44 f. Adu. Marc. I 6 p. 298 l. 10 Kr. II 9 p. 346 l. 7 Kr. III 6 p. 385 l. 20 Kr. 13 f = Adu. Iud. 9 [references here wrong] IV 5 p. 431 l. 8 Kr. Adu. Prax. 7 p. m. Bapt. 15. Ad nat. II 3 p. 98 l. 13 Wiss. De Monogam. 2 pr. 15 m. Vulg. Luc. 13 33. Rönsch Ital. 351. Gaudent. Tr. 9 (in Migne XX). Iren. II 28 4. III 11 8. [cet. See N. T. S. Irenaei chap. i. sect. C. A. S.] [See also Thes. p. 333. A. S.]

p. 56 l. 18 Adu. Marc. V 16 p. 630 l. 19 Kr. *creatori autem*

etiam naturalis agnitio debetur, ex operibus intellegendo et exinde in pleniorem notitiam requirendo. illius est ergo etiam ignorantes deum plectere, quem non liceat ignorari. De Paenit. 5 *etiam ignorantes dominum nulla exceptio tueatur a poena (quia deum in aperto constitutum et uel ex ipsis caelestibus bonis comprehensibilem ignorare non licet), quanto cognitum despici periculosum est.* Cf. De Anima 2. 6. Cypr. Idol. Van. 5 § 9 *haec est summa delicti, nolle agnoscere quem ignorare non possis.* Minuc. 17 § 3 *nos, quibus...sermo et ratio, per quae deum agnoscimus, sentimus, imitamur, ignorare nec fas nec licet ingerentem sese oculis nostris caelestem claritatem.* Lact. Diu. Instt. II 1 § 6 *quam sibi ueniam sperare possint impietatis suae? qui non agnoscunt cultum eius, quem prorsus ignorari ab homine fas non est.*

p. 56 l. 19 EX OPERIBVS Wetst. on Rom. I 20. Athenag. 4 p. 5c. Lact. Diu. Instt. I 2 § 5 from Cic. Nat. Deor. II § 4. Minuc. 17 § 4. Cf. 18 § 11. Greg. Naz. Or. 28 c. 16. 28—30.

p. 56 l. 21 ANIMAE...TESTIMONIO Test. Anim. 2. ad Scap. 2 pr. (cited on p. 56 l. 27). De Spectac. 2 p. 2 l. 22 Wiss. *nemo negat, quia nemo ignorat, quod ultro natura suggerit, deum esse uniuersitatis conditorem.* Arnob. II 3 *da uerum iudicium, et haec omnia circumspiciens quae uidemus magis an sint di ceteri dubitabit quam in deo cunctabitur, quem esse omnes naturaliter scimus, siue cum exclamamus 'o deus' siue cum illum testem [deum] constituimus improborum et quasi nos cernat faciem sublevamus ad caelum.* Adu. Marc. I 10 p. 303 l. 6 Kr. *denique maior popularitas generis humani, ne nominis quidem Moysei compotes, nedum instrumenti, deum Moysei tamen norunt; etiam tantam idololatria dominationem obumbrante, seorsum tamen illum quasi proprio nomine 'deum' perhibent et 'deum deorum,' et 'si deus dederit' et 'quod deo placet' et 'deo commendo.'* Iustin. Apol. II 6 *θεὸς προσαγόρευμα οὐκ ὄνομά ἐστιν, ἀλλὰ πράγματος δυσεξηγήτου ἔμφυτος τῇ φύσει τῶν ἀνθρώπων δόξα* (pr. 44e). Christianity as old as creation, Aug. in Lasaulx Studien 85. Orig. contr. Cels. I § 4.

p. 56 l. 22 CARCERE CORPORIS Cic. Paulin. Nol. Ep. 32 6 v. 3 *libera corporeo mens carcere.* Carm. XI 57 *solutus corporali carcere.* Senec. Ben. III 20 1 *corpora obnoxia sunt et adscripta*

dominis: mens quidem sui iuris, quae adeo libera et uaga est, ut ne ab hoc quidem carcere, cui inclusa est, teneri queat. Prudent. Cath. 10 22. Ioseph. De Bell. Iud. II 8 11 pr. (Essenes) The world a prison, Tert. ad Mart. 2.

p. 56 l. 24 EVIGORATA: pall. 4.

EXANCILLATA: ἅπ. εἰρ.

p. 56 l. 25 RESIPISCIT Ter. Afran. Cic. Liu. Prop. Plin. h. n. Tac. Suet. Apul. Metam. VIII 31. Ambr. De Elia et ieiunio § 45 f. (of Polemo) *certe ille si resipuit a uino, fuit tamen semper temulentus sacrilegio.* Sid. Ep. IX 6 m.

p. 56 l. 26 PATITVR De Spect. 15 p. 17 l. 9 Wiss. *nemo ad uoluptatem uenit sine affectu, nemo affectum sine casibus suis patitur.* De Anima 9 p. 310 l. 19 Wiss. *est hodie soror apud nos reuelationum charismata sortita, quas in ecclesia inter dominica sollemnia per ecstasin in spiritu patitur.*

p. 56 l. 27 DEVS BONVS ad Scap. 2 pr. *nos unum deum colimus, quem omnes naturaliter nostis, ad cuius fulgura et tonitrua contremiscitis, ad cuius beneficia gaudetis.* De Carn. Resur. 3 pr. *quaedam enim et natura nota sunt, ut immortalitas animae penes plures, ut deus noster penes omnes...utar et conscientia populi contestantis deum deorum; utar et reliquis communibus sensibus, qui deum iudicem praedicant: 'deus uidet' et 'deo commendo.'* De Anima 2 p. 300 l. 24 Wiss. *sed et natura pleraque suggeruntur quasi de publico sensu, quo animam deus dotare dignatus est.* ib. 41 p. 368 l. 30 Wiss. *sic et diuinitas animae in praesagia erumpit ex bono priore, et conscientia dei in testimonium prodit: 'deus bonus' et 'deus uidet,' et 'deo commendo.'* Adu. Marc. I 10 fin. *habet deus testimonia; totum hoc quod sumus et in quo sumus.* De Testim. Anim. 2 pr. *dic testimonium, si ita scis. nam te quoque palam et tota libertate, qua non licet nobis, domi ac foris audimus ita pronuntiare, 'quod deus dederit,' et 'si deus uoluerit.'...de natura quoque dei quem praedicamus, nec te latet: 'deus bonus,' 'deus bene facit,' tua uox est.* De Cor. Milit. 6 pr. *quaeris igitur dei legem? habes communem istam in publico mundi, in naturalibus tabulis, ad quas et apostolus solet prouocare....ipsum deum secundum naturam prius nouimus, sed deum appellantes deorum, bonum praesumentes et iudicem inuocantes.* Pusey p. 40 n. Z. Kaye 164—170. 308.

Blunt Right Use 593. Minuc. 18 § 11 *quid quod omnium de isto habeo consensum. audio uulgus, cum ad caelum manus tendunt, nihil aliud quam* Deum *dicunt et* Deus magnus est *et* Deus uerus est *et* si Deus dederit (ἢν θεὸς παρασχῇ Herodot. σὺν θεῷ Aristoph. Soph. [add οὐκ ἄνευ θεῶν τινός. A. S.]. ἐὰν θεὸς ἐθέλῃ Plat. Alcib. 1 ad fin. [1 Cor. 4 19, James 4 15. A. S.]. Xenoph. Cyrop. IV 2 § 13. Aristoph. Plut. 114). *uulgi iste naturalis sermo est an Christiani confitentis oratio?* Neander Antignost. and Ch. Hist. Arnob. II 3 (cited on p. 56 l. 21). Cypr. De Idol. Van. 5 § 8. 6. Lact. Diu. Instt. II 1 § 7 *nam cum iurant et cum optant et cum gratias agunt, non Iouem aut deos multos, sed deum nominant: adeo ipsa ueritas cogente natura etiam ab inuitis pectoribus erumpit.*

p. 56 l. 28 CONTESTATVR c. 44 p. 124 l. 15.

p. 56 l. 29 DEVS VIDET De Testim. Anim. 2 p. 137 l. 8 Wiss. *hinc ergo tibi, anima, de conscientia suppetit domi ac foris, nullo irridente uel prohibente praedicare, 'deus uidet omnia' et 'deo commendo' et 'deus reddet' et 'deus inter nos iudicabit.' unde tibi hoc non Christianae!* Plaut. Captiu. 310 Br. *est profecto deus, qui quae nos gerimus auditque et uidet.* Hier. in Malachi II 13 seq. (VI 967[d] Ven. 1768) of the law written in the heart: *haec...impellit etiam incredulos dicere* Deus iudicet *et* Deus uideat. [Hier.] Breuiar. in Ps. XCV (VII (2) Ven. 1769 col. 356 pr.) *denique gentiles idola colunt, hoc est, lapides et ligna uenerantur: et si forte rixam fecerint et si iuramentum aliquod inter illos uenerit, non dicunt 'lapides isti uident,' 'ligna uident'; sed 'deus uidet' et 'deus audit.'*

In the De Testim. Anim. 5 p. 141 l. 24 Wiss. cap. 19 of Apol. is cited (*'ut loco suo edocuimus.'*) [No reference in Wissowa. A. S.] Cf. De Carne Chr. 12 p. m. *plenius haec prosequitur libellus, quem scripsimus de testimonio animae.* Lasaulx 85 n. 41.

p. 56 l. 31 AD CAELVM infr. cap. 30 p. 96 l. 21. Arnob. II 3 a. m. *quasi nos cernat faciem subleuamus ad caelum.* Cic. De Nat. Deor. II § 4 Mayor. Lact. Diu. Instt. I 2 § 5.

Cap. XVIII

p. 58 l. 1 IMPRESSIVS De Carn. Chr. 20 a. m. *hoc quidem impressius, quod factum dicit, quam natum, simplicius enim enuntiasset natum.* (Ib. 12 a. m. cited in lexx. some read *pressius.*) Oehler (p. 133[a] on Apol. c. 5 f. *inpressit*) cites the positive from De Exhort. Cast. 3 pr. Adu. Marc. III 8 p. 389 l. 24 Kr.: cited in material sense from Cael. Aurelian.

p. 58 l. 2 INSTRVMENTVM c. 21 pr. p. 66 l. 13 n. c. 47 p. 132 l. 31. c. 31 p. 98 l. 12 *inspice dei uoces, litteras nostras, quas neque ipsi supprimimus et plerique casus ad extraneos transferunt.*

p. 58 l. 5 A PRIMORDIO antiquity. c. 19 pr. 46 f. 47 pr. Character of the prophets, Orig. Contr. Cels. VII 18 p. 336. Philo Quis Rer. Diu. Her. 52 §§ 258 ff. (III p. 59 Cohn and Wendland). Theophil. II 9 p. 87[d]. Iustin. Dial. c. 7 p. 224[d]. Semisch, Justin Martyr Book IV c. 3 Art. 3.

p. 58 l. 6 INVNDATOS Cypr. ad Donat. 5 *quantum illuc fidei capacis adferimus, tantum gratiae inundantis haurimus.* Inspiration, Tzschirner 103 sq. Ioseph. Contr. Apion. I 8. Philo De Monarchia I § 9 (I 222 M.). De Praemiis et Poenis cc. 9. 10 §§ 55 ff. (II p. 417 M.). [Iustin.] Cohort. ad Gr. 8 p. 9[b]. Athenag. 7 p. 8[b], 9 p. 9[d] (Maximus). Clem. Al. Protrept. p. 53 Col. Cypr. testim. adu. Iud. praef. p. 36 l. 22 H. calls the Bible *diuinae plenitudinis fontes.* Novatian De Trin. c. 29. Origen Philocal. c. 1 pp. 7 ff. Rob. proves inspiration from the divinity of Christ's teaching and the enthusiasm which we experience from Bible reading.

p. 58 l. 8 PROMETHEVS Adu. Marc. I 1 p. 291 l. 21 Kr. *uerus Prometheus deus omnipotens.* De Carn. Chr. 9 pr. *ipsum certe corpus hoc nostrum, quod de limo figulatum est, etiam ad fabulas nationum ueritas transmisit, utriusque originem elementi confitetur, carne terram, sanguine aquam.* Iuu. 4 133 n. 14 35 n. Lasaulx Studien 332.

p. 58 l. 10 IVDICANTIS Woodham compares Cypr. De Vnit. Eccl. 18 f. *in conspectu statim domini iudicantis extincti sunt.*

PER IMBRES PER IGNES 2 Pet. 2. 5 6. Cf. Iuu. 11 63 n. Euseb. Praep. Eu. X 9 § 9 p. 484[c] γίγνεται γὰρ μετὰ Κέκροπα ὁ

κατὰ Δευκαλίωνα κατακλυσμὸς καὶ ἡ ἐπὶ Φαέθοντος ἐκπύρωσις. Cf. § 21 p. 486c.

p. 58 l. 13 PRODACTO 48 p. m. Hieron. VII 755c. Pacian. ep. I 15.

De Anim. 33 fin. *deus itaque indicabit plenius, quia extremius, per sententiam aeternam tam supplicii quam refrigerii.*

p. 58 l. 15 REFORMATIS c. 48 p. 136 l. 12 *quis in quam bestiam reformari uideretur.* Prudent. Perist. VI 94—6 *non est, credite, poena, quam uidetis, | quae puncto tenui citata transit: | nec uitam rapit illa sed reformat.* Often in Apul.

p. 58 l. 16 DISPVNCTIONEM infra c. 19. Fuld. p. 62 l. 8. De Anima 33 p. 358 l. 9 Wiss.

p. 58 l. 17 RISIMVS c. 19 Fuld. p. 62 l. 12 c. 47 f. p. 134 l. 17 *itaque et ridemur deum praedicantes iudicaturum.*

DE VESTRIS cet. Minuc. 28 § 1 *quam autem iniquum sit incognitis et inexploratis iudicare, quod facitis, nobis ipsis paenitentibus credite; et nos enim idem fuimus et eadem nobiscum quondam adhuc caeci et hebetes sentiebamus.* Sen. De Ira II 10 § 6 *non irascetur sapiens peccantibus. quare? quia scit neminem nasci sapientem sed fieri.* Kaye 11 n. 6 cites other proofs that T. was once a heathen.

FIVNT as catechumens (*audientes*) De Paenit. 6. Cf. Kaye 240 sq. De Testim. An. 1 p. 135 l. 28 Wiss. *non es, quod sciam, Christiana; fieri enim non nasci solet Christiana.* [Ps. Aug. Quaest. 81. A. S.] Hier. Ep. 60 (=3) 8 *ab eo tempore censemur, ex quo in Christo renascimur.* 107 (=7) 1 *fiunt non nascuntur Christiani.* Aug. De Peccator. Meritis III 9 § 17 if you say that of men cleansed from sin sinless children should be born, *cur non adtenditis eo modo nobis posse dici, de Christianis parentibus Christianos nasci filios debuisse? cur ergo eos Christianos fieri debere censetis?*

p. 58 l. 18 PRAEDICATORES Adu. Valent. 5 fin. Adu. Marc. V 15 p 627 l. 12 Kr. Cypr. p. 791 23. Vulg. Sulp. Seu. [and in a host of other authors. I have 6 exx. from Aug. Cf. Sanday N. T. S. Irenaei. A. S.]

p. 58 l. 19 PRAEFANDI c. 14 p. 48 l. 29.

VIRTVTES Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. p. 225 *διὰ τὰς δυνάμεις, ἃς ἐπετέλουν, πιστεύεσθαι δίκαιοι ἦσαν,* = miracles. Tert. Adu.

Marc. II 27 p. 374 l. 5 Kr. *miscente in semet ipso hominem et deum, in uirtutibus deum, in pusillitatibus hominem.* III 3 p. 379 l. 24 Kr. 8 p. 389 l. 16 Kr. 16 p. 403 l. 15 Kr. *angelum quidem eum dixit ob magnitudinem uirtutum, quas erat editurus.* Lact. Diu. Instt. IV 3 § 17 Bünem. 15 § 6. VII 17 § 2. Eugipp. Ep. ad Paschasium §§ 5. 6. Clem. Recogn. I 6. Aug. De Trin. I § 22. Iren. II 32 § 5. V 17 § 2. Oros. VII 4 § 5. Hier. Didym. Spir. S. 9 44. Druthm. in Matth. c. 14 = Migne CVI 1323[a]. Koffmane I 93—4.

p. 58 l. 21 Ptolemy II Phil. (283—247 B.C.). Cf. Schürer II 697—701, esp. 698 n. 2 p. 704. Susemihl Gesch. der griech. Lit. in der Alexandrinerzeit I 138—9, II 604 seq. On the zeal of Euergetes Susemihl II 667. Ritschl Opusc. I 13 sq. Philarchus (Müller Fragm. Hist. Gr. I 345 in Athen. 536[e]) calls the second Ptolemy *παιδείας εἴ τινα καὶ ἄλλον καὶ αὐτὸν ἐπιμεληθέντα.* Strabo 789 f. calls him *φιλιστορῶν.* Ios. Antiq. praef. § 3 *εὗρον τοίνυν ὅτι Πτολεμαίων μὲν ὁ δεύτερος, μάλιστα δὴ βασιλεὺς περὶ παιδείαν, καὶ βιβλίων συναγωγὴν σπουδάσας ἐξαιρέτως ἐφιλοτιμήθη τὸν ἡμέτερον νόμον καὶ τὴν κατ᾽ αὐτὸν διάταξιν τῆς πολιτείας εἰς τὴν Ἑλλάδα φωνὴν μεταβαλεῖν* cet. (Eleazar sent Pentateuch only). Euseb. Praep. Eu. VIII 1 § 5—c. 5. Ioseph. Contr. Apion. II 4. Philo Vit. Mosis II 5—7 (II 138 sq. M.). Aug. De Ciu. Dei XVIII 42 43.

p. 58 l. 22 SVPERNOMINO in this sense only here; 'to name after,' Aug. [rather Exod. 20 24 ap. Aug. A. S.] in Georges.

LITTERATVRAE c. 47 pr. De Testim. Anim. 1 p. 135 l. 11 Wiss. 5 p. 141, l. 10 Wiss. De Idolol. 15 p. 48 l. 6 Wiss. Ad nat. I 10 p. 78 l. 22 Wiss. II 2 p. 95 l. 20 Wiss. 12 p. 120 l. 11 Wiss. Wölfflin in Rhein. Mus. 1882 p. 91. Paucker Supplem. Lex. I 455—6 (earlier: alphabet; scholarship cet.).

STVDIO Ritschl. I 19 n*. Strabo 608 f. *ὁ γοῦν Ἀριστοτέλης τὴν ἑαυτοῦ* < *βιβλιοθήκην* > *Θεοφράστῳ παρέδωκεν, ᾧπερ καὶ τὴν σχολὴν ἀπέλιπε, πρῶτος, ὧν ἴσμεν, συναγαγὼν βιβλία καὶ διδάξας τοὺς ἐν Αἰγύπτῳ βασιλέας σύνταξιν.*

p. 58 l. 23 BIBLIOTHECARVM Susemihl I 337 n. 39—344.

PISISTRATVM Ritschl Opusc. I 6 31—60 (die Sammlung der Homerischen Gedichte) 205 seq.

p. 58 l. 24 MEMORIARVM c. 19 p. 62 l. 25. Minuc. 7 § 2.

16 § 6. 31 § 2. Cypr. ad Demetrian. 17 p. 363 8 *ut memorias taceamus antiquas.* Oudend. on Caes. Bel. Gal. I 13 f.

p. 58 l. 25 SVGGESTV c. 33 f. *suggeritur enim ei a tergo.*

DEMETRI PHALEREI c. 19 p. 64 l. 13. Aristobul. in Euseb. Praep. Eu. XIII 12 § 1. Cf. § 2 ἡ δε ὅλη ἑρμηνεία τῶν διὰ τοῦ νόμου πάντων ἐπὶ τοῦ προσαγορευθέντος Φιλαδέλφου βασιλέως, σοῦ δὲ προγόνου, προσενεγκαμένου μείζονα φιλοτιμίαν, Δημητρίου τοῦ Φαληρέως πραγματευσαμένου τὰ περὶ τούτων. Ritschl Opusc. Phil. I 15. Cf. p. 5 f. 28. 30 (foreign books translated cf. Susemihl I 344 n. 86). Susemihl I 138 6 n. 18 sq. Hier. Ep. 34 1 *beatus Pamphilus martyr,...cum Demetrium Phalereum et Pisistratum in sacrae bibliothecae studio uellet aequare.*

p. 58 l. 27 VERNACVLAS c. 19 p. 64 l. 15 *Iosephus antiquitatum Iudaicarum uernaculus uindex.*

p. 58 l. 28 O.T. [Iustin.] Coh. 9 p. 9[c]. 35 p. 32[d]. Dial. c. Tryph. 7 p. 224[d]. Tatian 29 p. 165[b]. Athenag. 9 p. 9[d] 10[d]. 7 p. 8[a]. 24 p. 27[d]. Theophil. II 34 p. 110[a].

p. 58 l. 30 RETRO Cic. Hor. inscr. Apol. c. 1 p. 4 l. 7. De Spect. 9 pr. Oehler. De Idolol. 3 pr. 15 p. 47 l. 18 Wiss. De Orat. 1 p. 180 l. 8 Wiss. Adu. Valentin. 7 bis (p. 184 l. 11 Kr. p. 185 l. 10 Kr.). Adu. Hermog. 23 p. 151 l. 23 Kr. 29 p. 158 l. 9 Kr. 40 p. 170 l. 1 Kr. 44 p. 174 l. 4 Kr. Cf. *retrosior* c. 19 p. 64 l. 3.

HEBRAEI...IVDAEI Zahn Forschungen V 232.

p. 58 l. 32 PTOLOMAEO Philad. and the library and the rivalry with Eumenes. Plin. Nat. Hist. XIII § 70 *mox aemulatione circa bybliothecas regum Ptolemaei et Eumenis, subprimente chartas Ptolemaeo idem Varro membranas Pergami tradit repertas.* Clinton Fast. Hell. III 384—6.

SVBSCRIPTVM c. 6 p. 20 l. 30. Tert. in lexx.

SEPTVAGINTA. On the LXX [Iustin.] Cohort. ad Gr. 13 pp. 13 14 had seen the cells in which the translators worked, and heard in Alexandria of their miraculous agreement. Apol. I 31 p. 72[c] he sent to Herod! Clem. Alex. Strom. I pp. 288 342 ed. Col. (Tzschirner 111—3).

p. 58 l. 33 MENEDEMVS cir. 352—278 B.C. Diog. Laert. II 125 seq. Zeller II[3] (1) 237 sq. 'Was Jos. Ant. xii 2 § 12 und

nach ihm Tert. Apol. 18 über Menedemus und seinen Vorsehungsglauben sagen, stammt aus dem Aristeasbuch (Ios. II App. p. 121 Hav.) und ist natürlich geschichtlich so werthlos, wie die ganze Aristeasfabel' (Zeller III (2)³ 267—270).

p. 60 l. 1 SVSPEXIT c. 32. Minuc. 16 § 5. Plin. Ep. III 3 § 1 n. Sen. Ep. 14 § 10 *non minus contemni quam suspici nocet.* 18 § 8. Ad Marc. 10 § 2. Ad Helu. 11 § 5 Nat. Qu. IV praef. § 10 (cf. § 11 *mirari*). I praef. § 5. Hor.

p. 60 l. 2 ARISTEAS. Aristeae ad Philocratem epistula cum ceteris de origine uersionis LXX interpretum testimoniis Ludouici Mendelssohn schedis usus edidit Paulus Wendland. Leipz. Teubner. 1900 pp. xxxii 229. 8vo. H. B. Swete, An Introduction to the O.T. in Greek. With an appendix containing the letter of Aristeas edited by H. St John Thackeray, pp. 499—574. Cambr. Univ. Press 1900 pp. xi 592 8vo. 7/6 (Theolog. Literaturber. XX, 1901 pp. 78—80). Iustin. Apol. I 38. Clem. Alex. Strom. I pp. 288 342. The letter of A. in Ioseph. Ant. II 12 and Euseb. Praep. Eu. VIII 2 sq. pp. 350 sq. IX 1—37 p. 370 sq. (officer of the bodyguard of Ptol. Philad.). Cf. Mendelssohn in Rhein. Mus. XXX 631—2. First doubted by Lud. Vives on Aug. Ciu. Dei XVIII 42. Even Ussher and Is. Voss upheld it, but Humphry Hody de bibliorum textibus originalibus uersionibus Gr. et Lat. uulgata libri IV (Oxf. 1705 fol.) disproved it. See Selwyn in Dict. Bible s.v. Septuagint. Fritzsche in Herzog-Plitt Real-Encykl. I 280 sq. Susemihl Gesch. d. griech. Lit. in der Alexandrinerzeit II (Teubner 1892) c. 38 die jüdisch-hellenistische Litt. 602—622. Schürer II² 819—824 (Arist.) and 697—726 (Greek Bible). Harnack Gesch. der altchristl. Lit. I (1893) 863.

p. 60 l. 3 EX APERTO Sen. n. q. III 30 § 5. IV praef. § 5. Liu.

SERAPEVM De Spectac. 8 p. 10 l. 18 Wiss. ad nat. I 10 p. 76 l. 23 Wiss. Surpassed only by the Roman Capitol, Ammian. XXII 16 §§ 12—13 *in quo duo bybliothecae fuerunt inaestimabiles: et loquitur monumentorum ueterum concinens fides septingenta uoluminum milia, Ptolomaeis regibus uigiliis intentis composita, bello Alexandrino, dum diripitur ciuitas, sub dictatore Caesare conflagrasse.* Destroyed by order of Theodosius and a Christian temple reared on the site, Hier. Ep. 107 (7) § 2 *iam Aegyptius*

Serapis factus est Christianus. On the two libraries Susemihl I 335—344. Clinton Fasti Rom. a 389 390 (destroyed 390, for Ammian in that year speaks of it as still standing, loc. cit.).

p. 60 l. 4 BYBLIOTHECAE Daremberg and Saglio s.v. Pauly-Wissowa Real-Encycl. 'Bibliotheken.' Smith Dict.-Ant. ind. Gell. and Scr. Hist. Aug. Vitruu. Plin. Ep. III 7 § 8 n. p. 123. Marquardt Privatleben I 113. Still extant in Hebrew in Egypt, Iustin. Apol. I 31 p. 72[d]. Ios. Antiq. XII 2 § 1 sq.

p. 60 l. 5 LECTITANT [Iustin.] Cohort. ad Gr. p. 14. Divine Providence, by making Jews the guardians of Scripture, frees us from the suspicion of interpolation. Cf. Aug. in Ps. 40 14 the Jews are our *capsarii*, so to say, *studentibus nobis codices portant.*

VECTIGALIS De Fug. in Persec. 13 f. *nescio dolendum an erubescendum sit, cum in matricibus beneficiariorum et curiosorum, inter tabernarios et lanios et fures balnearum et aleones et lenones, Christiani quoque uectigales continentur.* ib. 12 prope fin. *stipendiariae sectae.* Ambr. Off. III § 134 *non uectigalis amicitia est.* Schürer II² 207 n. 108. 109. III² 75 n. 63. 94 n. 15.

Cap. XIX

p. 60 l. 8 INSTRVMENTIS c. 18 pr. 21 pr. n. p. 66 l. 13 46 f. 47 pr. De Pudic. 12 pr. *de apostolico -o.* De Monogam. 4 pr. *euoluamus communia -a scripturarum pristinarum.* 7 *ad uetera transeamus -a legalium scripturarum* (argument from antiquity 4. 7).

ANTIQVITAS c. 46 pr. 47. ad nat. I 11 the heathen too have forsaken their fathers' ways. Rufin. Hist. Eccl. I 1 pr. and f. Arnob. II 66. 69. Ambr. in Ps. 118 s. 2 § 5. Otto de Iustini scriptis et doctrina p. 105 seq. Theophil. ad Autol. II 30. III 20 seq. Lact. Diu. Instt. I 23. II 6 § 7. IV 5. Clem. Alex. Strom. I 15 § 72. 21 § 101. [Iustin.] Coh. ad Gr. 9 p. 9, Col.—13 p. 14. Tzschirner 99 seq. Iustin. Apol. I 57 Moses older than any Greek writer. Tatian c. 31 p. 166[a] sq. col. 36—41 p. 171 sq. Orig. contra Cels. I § 14, Keim 15. 26. IV 11 p. 167. This argument not in Minuc. or Arnob. See Arnob. I 57 does antiquity guard from error; may not falsehoods have been

circulated 10,000 years ago? Do not things which happened in our neighbourhood deserve more credit, are they not freer from fabulous admixture, than what is wrapt in the darkness of antiquity? 72. II 66. 71 religion to be judged by its intrinsic worth, not by its duration. c. 57 antiquity no safeguard against error, rather teems with fables. c. 66 better evidence for modern times. ibid. progress and growth is from lower to higher, from acorns to wheat, from skins to cloth. c. 69—70 everything, all sciences, your religion, has had a beginning. c. 72 *non ergo quod sequimur, nouum est; sed nos sero addidicimus, quidnam sequi oporteat et colere.* Theophilus III 1. 4. 16. 29 *οὐ πρόσφατος ὁ λόγος*, ib. 26. 28. This chapter is referred to in De Testim. Anim. 5 prope fin. cited on p. 274 l. 15. Euseb. Hist. Eccl. I c. 2 c. 4 § 5 sq. c. 5 § 1. Tac. Hist. V 5 pr. *hi ritus, quoquo modo inducti, antiquitate defenduntur.* Theodoret Graec. Affect. Cur. II §§ 43—50 pp. 28 29 he calls Moses the ocean of theology, *ἐξ οὗπερ πάντες ποταμοὶ καὶ πᾶσα θάλασσα.* Prudent. Perist. X 411. 583. 613. 621. Confutation of the heathen argument from antiquity (Tzschirner 399) Minuc. 20 (Scylla, Chimaera, Centaurs). Iustin. Apol. I 23 p. 68^{b}. 44 p. 81^{e}. 59 p. 92^{c}. Dial. c. Tryph. 7 p. 224^{d}. Clem. Alex. Strom. I § 72. § 101. Euseb. Praep. Eu. I 2 p. 5. 5 p. 16. X 9 p. 483 sq. Hist. Eccl. I 2 § 1. Cyril. adu. Iul. I 1 (VI p. 739 14). Philastr. Haer. 109. Greek philosophy new [Iustin.] Coh. ad Graec. 12 p. 12^{c}. Euseb. Praep. Eu. X 14 p. 502 sq.

p. 60 l. 12 CONDITIONEM c. 48 p. 138 l. 19 *conditionis* (qu. *condicionis*) *tuae legem.* De Spectac. 2 p. 4 l. 6 Wiss. *quando haec sit tota ratio damnationis peruersa administratio conditionis a conditis.* Adu. Hermog. 11 p. 138 l. 15 Kr. 25 p. 153 l. 21 Kr. De Cor. Mil. 6 bis. De Hab. Muliebr. (= De Cult. Fem. I 8 f.) *dei conditio est et tus et merum et ignis.* Adu. Marc. IV 30 pr. V 12 p. 617 l. 12 Kr. Iren. III 11 § 1. IV 6 § 6. 7 § 4. 19 § 2. 22 § 1. 24 § 1. 32 § 1. 33 § 2. 15. V 1 § 1. 12 § 2. 18 saepe. 19 § 1. 22 § 2. 23 § 2 ter. 29 § 1. 32 § 1. 36 § 1. Thomae Thes. p. 48. Hieron. VII 548. 578 fin. 626 fin. sq. Phoebad. c. Arian. 1 praef. Oros. VII 20 p. 514 *annus millesimus a conditione Romae.* cf. VII 43 p. 586 fin. Hier. Ep. 140 2 and 3 and 6 (col. 1053^{c}. 1054^{abc}).

PVLLVLATIONEM Riddle-White only Prisc. add Cypr. p. 352 16. Aug. contr. Iulian. II 105. Hier. Orig. in Ezech. 11 5. [Rufin.] in Amos I (c. 4, v. 7 8). metaph. Praedestinat. II (Migne LIII 626[a]).

p. 60 l. 13 CATACLYSMI c. 40 p. 116 l. 27 n.

p. 60 l. 14 Iliad I 70 (Kalchas) ὃς ῥ' ᾔδη τά τ' ἐόντα τά τ' ἐσσόμενα πρό τ' ἐόντα. Apollo in Ou. Metam. I 517 *per me quod eritque fuitque estque patet.* Proteus Verg. Georg. IV 392 *nouit namque omnia uates, quae sint, quae fuerint, quae mox uentura trahantur.* Suid. s.u. τρίπους. Clem. Hom. II 6 § 12. III 11 § 12. VIII 10. Iren. IV 33 § 1 (of the Spirit) *ab initio in uniuersis dispositionibus dei adfuit hominibus et futura annuntiauit et praesentia ostendit et praeterita enarrat.*

p. 60 l. 16 SVPPVTATIONEM Paucker Add. Lex. Lat. I 104. Hier. Ep. 14 § 7. in eccl. (?) p. 395. in Tit. III 9. Macrob. Sat. I 16 § 42. Bonif. p. 319 m. Vulg. Sulp. Seu. Chron. I 29 9. Cassian. Coll. VII 3 (in Vitr. only a conj.). Aug. De Ciu. Dei XVIII 36. [See N. T. S. Irenaei introd. A. S.]

p. 60 l. 17 Joshua died in the reign of Danaus, Aug. De Ciu. Dei XVIII 11 fin. Ios. Contr. Apion. I 16 proves from Manetho (c. 14. 15) that the so-called shepherds, our ancestors, left Egypt and settled in this land 393 years before the arrival of Danaus at Argos: the Exodus about 1000 years before the Trojan war.

p. 60 l. 18 PROELIO war. Iustin. Vopisc. Frontin. in Georges. Aurel. Vict. Caes. 26 1. Hier. Quaest. Hebr. in Gen. 10 2. Ampelius 14 5. Chronogr. 354. Momms. p. 644 11.

p. 60 l. 20 THALLI Theophil. p. 139[a]. Lact. Diu. Instt. I 22 § 2.

p. 60 l. 25 ALIQVANTVLO Aurel. Victor Rufin. Hist. Mon. I col. 402[c] M. Clem. Recogn. praef. [See Thes. A. S.]

p. 60 l. 26 LATORIBVS LEGIS Cic. Macrob. sat. III 17 § 13, *legislator* [Ps. Aug. Quaest. 115 § 1. A. S.]. Paulin. Nol. Ep. 23 15. Ioseph. Ant. p. 2 (1524) quater. p. 3 pr. bis. I 23 p. m. p. 22. Clem. Recogn. I 21 f. III 61. X 47 f.: on *legislatio* (Vulg. Rufin. Orig. Princ. IV 1 15 cet.) cf. De Vit.

p. 60 l. 27 THALES Plut. Plac. Phil. I 3 Θαλῆς...δοκεῖ δὲ ὁ ἀνὴρ οὗτος ἄρξαι τῆς φιλοσοφίας. [Iustin.] Coh. ad Gr. 3

(p. 4c) ὁ πρῶτος τῆς φυσικῆς φιλοσοφίας ἄρξας. Cic. Nat. Deor. I § 25 *Th. Milesius, qui primus de talibus rebus quaesiuit.*

p. 60 l. 29 SOLON Iuu. 10 274—5. Lasaulx Studien p. 487 n. 137. Magirus Polymnemon (?) s.v. beatus n. 5—7. [Iustin.] Coh. ad Gr. 14 p. 15b.

p. 62 l. 3 AFFECTATIO c. 46 p. 128 l. 23 *mimice philosophi affectant ueritatem et affectando corrumpunt.*

c. 47 p. 132 l. 9 *homines gloriae, ut diximus, et eloquentiae solius libidinosi, siquid in sanctis offenderunt digestis, exinde regestum pro instituto curiositatis ad propria uerterunt.* De Anim. 1 p. 299 l. 10 Wiss. *philosophus gloriae animal.* De Ieiun. 17 p. 297 l. 5 Wiss. *merito homines solius animae et carnis spiritalia recusatis.* De Bapt. 8 (of the dove) *animal simplicitatis et innocentiae.* De Fug. in Pers. 13 p. m. *mammonae hominibus.* Apul. Apol. 523 (defended by Oud. II p. 556). Plin. Hist. Nat. XXX 2, 6 § 18 *Apion grammaticae artis* (Woodham).

p. 62 l. 5 from this point cf. c. 20.

p. 62 l. 6 CONSISTEREM c. 4 pr. (*al.* concurram) 46 pr.

p. 62 l. 9 DISPVNCTIO c. 18 p. 58 l. 15 (cf. c. 44 p. 124 l. 16 n.). De Test. An. 4 pr. *adfirmamus te manere post uitae dispunctionem.* De Anim. 33 f. *bene philosophi docetis utiliter suadetis leuiora post mortem supplicia uel praemia, cum, si quod iudicium animas manet, grauius debeat credi in dispunctione uitae, quam in administratione.* Sen. Breu. Vit. 7 § 7 *dispunge, inquam, et recense uitae tuae dies: uidetis paucos admodum et reiculos apud te resedisse.*

p. 62 l. 10 DISPOSITIONES c. 30 pr. *sciunt quis illis dederit imperium.*

p. 62 l. 14 PRAESVMPTIONEM c. 49 pr. *haec sunt quae in nobis solis praesumptiones uocantur.* ibid. *falsa nunc sint quae tuemur, et merito praesumptiones, attamen necessaria.* c. 25 pr. Adu. Marc. V 9 p. 601 l. 13 Kr. Adu. Valent. 4 p. 181 ll. 3 and 18 Kr. De Anim. 32 pr. *hic dimicemus necesse est aduersus portentosiorem praesumptionem.* Hier. Ep. 108 26 *a me ipso, id est a praesumptione, pessimo praeceptore.* Aug. De Trin. II 1. Ambr. Fid. Res. 27. Hexaëm. V 32. Apul. Metam. IX 14 f. Clem. Recogn. I 15 pr.

IDONEA EST...FVTVRORVM c. 20 p. 66 l. 3. Adu. Iud. 8 prope pr. [Iustin.] Coh. ad Gr. 37. 38 p. 37[a]. Procop. Bell. Goth. I 14. Iustin. Apol. I 52 p. 87[a]. 33 p. 74[e]. Dial. c. Tryph. 84 p. 310[b].

p. 62 l. 17 VNVM EST TEMPVS c. 20 p. 66 l. 7.

p. 62 l. 20 SIBYLLAM. Passages from Clem. Alex. in Le Nourry ap. Sprengerthes (?) III 172 sq. e.g. p. 761 (Strom. VI § 43 pr.). First cited (among Christians) by Hermas vis. II 4 § 1 (see Harnack pp. 24—5). Tert. ad nat. II 12 p. 120 l. 10 Wiss. Blunt Early Fathers 60—63. Orig. contr. Cels. V 61 f. *εἶπε δέ τινας εἶναι καὶ Σιβυλλιστάς· τάχα παρακούσας τινῶν ἐγκαλούντων τοῖς οἰομένοις προφῆτιν γεγονέναι τὴν Σίβυλλαν καὶ Σιβυλλιστὰς τοὺς τοιούτους καλεσάντων.* VII 53. 56. Keim p. 115 n. 4. Cf. n. XIX 284—5 Lomm. Lact. Diu. Instt. I 6 §§ 7 ff. 15 § 15. IV 15 § 26 *his testimoniis quidam reuicti solent eo confugere, ut aiant, non esse illa carmina Sibyllina, sed a nostris conficta atque composita.* [Numerous references in Brandt and Laubmann's index, pp. 348 f. A.S.] Aug. De Ciu. Dei XVIII 47 f. *sed quaecumque aliorum prophetiae de dei per I. C. gratia proferuntur possunt putari a Christianis esse conjictae. ideo nihil est firmius ad conuincendos quoslibet alienos, si de hac re contenderint, nostrosque faciendos, si recte sapuerint, quam ut diuina praedicta de Christo ea proferantur, quae in Iudaeorum codicibus scripta sunt.* 23. Last ed. ed. Iohannes Geffcken, Leipzig 1902. Schürer II[2] 790 ff. Klausen Aeneas u. die Penaten (1839) 203—312. Alexandre Orac. Sib. 1856 II 1—101. Lücke Einleitung in die Offenbarung 2 ed. pp. 81 sq. Opsopoeus (1599) 56—143. Susemihl Gesch. der griech. Litt. in d. Alexandrinerzeit II 635—642. Lardner Credibility pt 2 c. 29 n. 2 (II 333—346 ed. 1829). Semisch Iust. Mart. I 224 244. II 208. Coh. ad Gr. 37 p. 34[c] sq.—36[b]. 38 p. 36 37. 15 p. 15[bc]. Apol. I 20 p. 55. 14 p. 70.

p. 62 l. 23 DEI VESTRI c. 29.

p. 62 l. 26 MEMORIARVM c. 18 p. 58 l. 23.

p. 62 l. 28 DEOS. Moses 604 years before the apotheosis of Dionysos, which was 63 years before Herakles and the Argonauts; from the rule in Argos to the apotheosis of Herakles and Asklepios 308 years; from that to the apotheosis of

Kastor and Polydeukes 53 years. (Clem. Alex. Strom. I 21 § 105 pp. 381—2 P.)

p. 62 l. 29 c. 47.

p. 62 l. 30 THESAVRVS 47 pr.

p. 62 l. 31 SACRAMENTI Kaye 337.

NOSTRI [Iustin.] Coh. ad Gr. 13 fin. p. 14de.

p. 62 l. 32 MOYSEN c. 45 p. 126 l. 11. Moses earliest prophet. Iustin. Apol. I 31 p. 73^{b}. 32 p. 73^{b}. 59 p. 92^{c}. Coh. ad Gr. 9—13 p. 9^{c}. 10 p. 11^{c}. the story of Otos and Ephialtes from the tower of Babel [Iustin.] Coh. ad Gr. 28 p. 28^{ab}. replied to by Julian ap. Cyr. 135^{ab}. age of M. set forth by heathen Cohort. 9. 9^{d}. 10^{cd}. Plato learnt M. in Egypt 20 p. 18^{d})(Julian 49^{a}. Coh. c. 9 p. 9^{c}. c. 11 p. 11^{e}. c. 12 p. 12^{c} sq. c. 35 p. 32^{c}. c. 38 p. 36^{d})(Julian 253^{b}. Plato again Coh. 25 p. 24^{a}. 25 p. 23^{b} sq. 27 p. 25^{c}. Tert. De Test. An. 5 p. 141 l. 21 Wiss. *at enim cum diuinae scripturae, quae penes nos uel Iudaeos sunt, in quorum oleastro insiti sumus, multo saecularibus litteris, quarum uel modica tantum aetate aliqua, antecedant, ut loco suo* (h. l.) *edocuimus ad fidem earum demonstrandam; et si haec eloquia de litteris usurpauit anima, utique de nostris credendum erit, non de uestris; quia potiora sunt ad instruendam animam priora, quam postera, quae et ipsa a prioribus instrui sustinebant,* cet. Clem. Alex. Protrept. p. 50 Colon. *οἱ χρησμοὶ θεμελιοῦσι τὴν ἀλήθειαν.* Iustin. Martyr Apol. I 44 p. 81^{e} n. 8 Otto. Coh. ad Gent. 8 (c. Tryph. 7 p. 224^{d} Col.), Tatian (29 p. 165^{b} Col.) and Theophilus (I 14 pr. p. 78 Col.) owed their conversion to the O.T. Cf. below c. 47 pr. *adhuc enim mihi proficit antiquitas praestructa diuinae litteraturae, quo facile credatur thesaurum eam fuisse posteriori cuique sapientiae. et si non onus iam uoluminis temperarem, etiam excurrerem in hanc quoque probationem. quis poetarum, quis sophistarum, qui non de prophetarum fonte potauerit? inde igitur philosophi sitim ingenii sui rigauerunt; nam quia quaedam de nostris habent, ea propter nos comparant illis.* Cf. c. 46 fin. Celsus (I § 21 Keim) makes Moses borrow from Egypt. Tert. De Anim. 28 p. 346 l. 28 Wiss. Orig. contr. Cels. IV 11 *οὐκ ἐπέστησε τῇ Μωϋσέως ἀρχαιότητι, ἱστορουμένου ὑπό τινων Ἑλληνικῶν συγγραφέων κατὰ τοὺς χρόνους γεγονέναι Ἰνάχου*

τοῦ Φορωνέως. 12. 21. 36. VII 28. 30. 59. VI 7. 43, M. older than Pherecydes, Heraclitus, Homer, later than Job. Date of Moses Euseb. Praep. Eu. X 8 § 18 p. 482d (Greeks the borrowers). c. 9 § 1 p. 483e, many wrote of the antiquity of Moses and succeeding prophets. § 8 p. 484b. ib. § 10 484d, Moses contemporary with Kekrops. § 9 p. 484c, after Kekrops the rape of Proserpine and Europa, the birth of Apollo cet. c. 9 § 11. 12 Porphyry from Sanchoniathon, comments by Euseb. §§ 13—25 (§ 18 Inachus 150 years later than Moses). Inachus, contemporary of Moses (Apion in Iul. Africanus ap. Euseb. Praep. Eu. X 10 § 16 p. 490b). Ptolemy, a priest of Mendes, agrees, Africanus ib. § 13 p. 493d and Tatian (38 [59] p. 171d) ibid. § 18 p. 494b. Aug. Ciu. Dei XVIII 3 (II 260 6 D.), Inachus contemporary with Isaac. ib. c. 37 tit. *quod prophetica auctoritas omni origine gentilis philosophiae inueniatur antiquior.*

p. 62 l. 33 DANAVM p. 60 l. 17 n.

p. 64 l. 2 QVOS SEQVAR Theopompus Fr. 221b (I 315 Müller) in Clem. Alex. Strom. I p. 389 (in his Philippica book 43) dates Homer 500 years after the Trojan war. Christianity as old as creation, Euseb. Hist. Eccl. I 4. Vit. Constant. II 57. Iustin. Apol. I 69. [cf. n. on c. 17 p. 56 l. 21. A. S.]

p. 64 ll. 2 ff. Euseb. Praep. Eu. X 4 § 11 the latest Jewish prophets more than 600 years later than the Trojan war, and not less than 1500 years later than Moses. Orig. contr. Cels. VI 7 pr. Moses and the prophets before not Plato only, but Homer.

p. 64 l. 3 POSTVMANT only twice.

EXTREMISSIMI Neue-Wagener Formenlehre II³ 243—4 earliest ex. *postremissimus*, C. Gracchus; commonest *proximior* Sen. cet. *extremior* Tert. De Anim. 33 p. 358 ll. 10—11 Wiss. bis. Apul. Aug. Salu. *infimior. intimius. nouissimior* Perpet. et Felicit. praef. 1. *optimissimus. summior.*

RETROSIORES ἅπαξ εἰρ.: in local sense posit. in Plin. and Apul. Neue-Wagener II³ 748 (omits *iusum*).

p. 64 l. 4 LEGIFERIS Prudent. in lexx. Paulin. Nol. and Alcim. Auit. in Faber. Lact. Diu. Inst. IV 17 § 7 *denuntiauit scilicet dominus per ipsum legiferum.* Apul. Metam. X 33 *quale autem et illud iudicium apud legiferos Athenienses, catos illos et*

omnis scientiae magistros? gl. *θεσμοφόρος legifer*. Solon, [Iustin.] Coh. ad Gr. 14 p. 15[b].

p. 64 l. 7 DIGITORVM cf. 'digit.' Cerda h. l. Tert. De Idolol. 9 fin. (of the *numeri* of astrologers) *non potest regna caelorum sperare cuius digitus aut radius abutitur caelo.* Plin. Ep. II 20 § 3 *quo die, qua hora nata esset, interrogauit. ubi audiit, componit uultum, intendit oculos, mouet labra, agitat digitos, computat.* Iuu. X 249 *iam dextra computat annos.* Sen. De Ira III 33 § 3. Plut. II 78 F (Anacharsis) = Ath. p. 159. Lucian Timon (of Plutus) 13 p. 122 *συνεσπακὼς τοὺς δακτύλους πρὸς τὸ ἔθος τῶν συλλογισμῶν.* Anthol. Palat. XI 289 4. Gow History of Greek Mathematics 6 7 9—12 13 24—27 39 40.

p. 64 l. 9 ARCHIVA v. l. in c. 21 p. 72 l. 9. Cf. Rufin. Hist. Eccl. V 18 p. 292. I 15 p. 49.

p. 64 l. 10 MVNICIPES later *com-* so *conciuis.*

ALIQVI c. 11 f. p. 42 l. 20 *aliquem de sapientia Socraten.* c. 50 p. 142 l. 30 n. *aliqua Carthaginis conditrix.* Cf. Grotius De Verit. Rel. Chr. III 16 pp. 150—1.

p. 64 l. 11 MANETHON Böckh M. und die Hundsternperiode in A. Schmidt Zeitschrift f. Geschichtswiss. II 385 sq. 592 sq. Berl. 1845 (v in Works ?). C. Müller Fr. Hist. Gr. II 511—616 and Syncellus p. 16[d], = p. 29 ed. Bonn.

BEROSVS Müller Fr. II 495—510. Cf. A. v. Gutschmid Rhein. Mus. VIII 252—7.

HIEROMVS correspondence between Suron [= Hiram] of Phoenicia and Solomon, about the building of the temple, Eupolemos in C. Müller Fr. III 207 sq. fr. Euseb. Praep. Eu. IX 31—34. Clem. Alex. Strom. I 21 § 130. Chron. Pasch. I 168 Dind. 2 Chron. 2 2—15. 1 Kings 5 15—25. Schürer II 732—4. Susemihl II 648—51. Ios. Contr. Ap. I 17 correspondence between Solomon and Hieram still at Tyre.

p. 64 l. 13 PTOLEMAEVS Schürer II 780: cited by Tatian 38. [Iustin.] Cohort. ad Graecos 9 and Clem. Alex. Strom. I 21 § 101. Euseb. Praep. Eu. X 11 p. 493[d]. 12 p. 497[a]: of Mendes, priest, author of a history of Egypt.

MENANDER C. Müller Fragm. IV 445—7. Susemihl I 636 'acts of Greek and barbarian kings.'

DEMETRIVS c. 18 p. 58 l. 24. C. Müller Fragm. II 362—369.

Clinton Fast. Hell. III 478 sq. Iosephus c. Ap. I 23 also cited Dem. Phaler. as speaking of the antiquity of the Jews. '*uerum nullus dubito, quin Demetrius ille sit non Phalereus, sed Demetrius is qui Iudaeorum historiam scripsit, Ptolemaeo IV uel V coaeuus*' (Clem. Alex. Strom. I § 141 p. 403 P.). Clem. there cites Dem. ἐν τῷ περὶ τῶν ἐν τῇ Ἰουδαίᾳ βασιλέων. A Jew Schürer II² 730—2. omn. Susemihl I 486 n. 145.

p. 64 l. 14 IVBA C. Müller Fragm. Gr. III 465—484. Clinton Fast. Hell. III² 578 sq. Schürer I 375—6 (ob. A.D. 23). Susemihl II 402—14 and ind.

APION C. Müller III 506—516. Schürer II² 777—781. Lightfoot Dict. Chr. Biog. I 128—130.

THALLVS c. 10 p. 38 l. 1. C. Müller Fragm. III in title only (between Hermogenes and Memnon), but does not occur p. 524—5; also before Memnon in title of book VII p. 329, comes out of his place between Apion and Pamphila pp. 517—519. Josephus does not name Thallus as a writer, but Antiq. XVIII 6 § 4 a Samaritan freedman of Tiberius, who lent Agrippa 100 myriads.

p. 64 l. 15 VERNACVLVS c. 18 p. 58 l. 26 *proprias atque uernaculas litteras*. c. 25 p. 86 l. 31 *uiderit Cybele, si urbem Romanam ut memoriam Troiani generis adamauit, uernaculi sui scilicet*. c. 35 p. 102 l. 33 *ipsos Quirites, ipsam uernaculam septem collium plebem*. Apul. Apol. 18 pr. *paupertas olim philosophiae uernacula*. Hence Paula and Eustochium to Marcella (Hier. Ep. 46 = 17 c. 4 *Iosephum, qui uernaculus scriptor est Iudaeorum*), so also Hier. (VIII 649 ed. Ven. 1769), i.e. Euseb. Chron. A.D. 33 *Iosephus etiam u. I. s.*

p. 64 l. 16 CENSVALES Symm. Ep. IV 8 § 3 and Relat. 23 2. 46 2 *officium*. CIL II 4248 *tabularii*. Cod. Theod. XI 28 12. XIV 1 § 1. 9 § 1. [Seeck] in Pauly [-Wissowa III 1911—1914. A.S.] Tert. Adu. Marc. IV 7 p. 435 l. 12 Kr. *de censu denique Augusti, quem testem fidelissimum Dominicae natiuitatis Romana archiua custodiunt*.

p. 64 l. 17 CONCATENATIO Aug. Cael.-Aurel. Cassiod. [See also Thes. A. S.]

p. 64 l. 21 DIFFERRE cf. c. 20 p. 64 l. 23.

Cap. XX

p. 64 l. 23 DILATIONE cf. c. 19 p. 64 l. 21.

p. 64 l. 24 VETVSTATE cf. c. 19.

p. 64 l. 26 SAECVLVM c. 41.

p. 64 l. 27 VIDETVR De Spect. 25 (cf. Ou. Ars Am. I 99 *spectatum* cet.) *nemo denique in spectaculo ineundo prius cogitat, nisi uideri et uidere.* Cic. Acad. II § 81 *pisces illos qui neque uidentur a nobis.* Sen. Nat. Quaest. I 5 § 11. Ep. 94 § 56.

p. 64 l. 28 EXTERNA and INTERNA not acc. as Oehler. On earthquakes cet. infr. c. 40 Hiera, Anaphe, Delos cet. De Pallio 2 (pp. 921—3 Oehler).

p. 64 l. 29 DILANIANT Hier. Ep. 57 13 *inter mulierculariem radios et textrina dilanior.*

COMPVLSO another ex. in Apul. *συναράττω. συνωθῶ* gl. The subst. *-atio* infr. 21. 38. [See also Thes. A. S.]

On the decline of Rome Woodham compares Tac. Hist. I 2, Sall. Cat. 2. 10, and generally Is. 40 4, Ezek. 5 17. 21 31. Matt. 24 6—7.

p. 64 l. 30 LOCALES lexx. cite Tert. Amm. Charis. Cf. Tert. De Carn. Res. 21 p. 54 l. 14 Kr. Adu. Hermog. 41 bis. p. 171 ll. 14. 18 Kr. [Iren. see N. T. S. Irenaei Introd. A. S.] Firmilian in Cypr. p. 817 3. Aug. Ep. 120 § 10. Fulgent. c. Fabian. fr. 29 [localia 'localities' Firm. Math. III 8 s. 1 p. 68 11 Bas. 1551 [now emended in ed. Kroll and Skutsch, 1897. A.S.].] Cassian Coll. III 7 § 7. XVIII 16 § 2 cet. Cass. Fel. 3 12. 10 14. 63 8 cet.

p. 64 l. 32 MVTANTVR De Paenit. 6 a. m. *quis enim seruus, postquam libertate mutatus est, furta sua et fugas sibi imputat?*

RARESCIT generally 'becomes rarified,' 'depopulated.' As here Lact. Diu. Instt. VII 15 § 8 *ita iustitia rarescet, ita impietas et auaritia crebrescent.* Clement. Recogn. IV 30 f. *religio Dei...rarescere inter homines atque aboleri propemodum coepit* (here LS. better than RW., from Georges). Paulin. Nol. c. 18 407 *noctis et extremae fuga rarescentibus astris.*

p. 64 l. 33 INCREBRESCO on *increbesco* Bücheler in Jahrbb. 1873 113 sq.

p. 64 l. 34 OFFICIA TEMPORVM De Patientia 2 p. 2 l. 21 Kr. De Pall. 2 pr. *quippe si mundus ex diuersis substantiis officiisque constabit.* [Ps.-Aug. Quaest. 28, 2, see my index. A.S.] *uitae* (functions) Apul. Metam. II 29 Price (p. 129). *spiritus* ib. I 16. *manus non iam pedes sunt, sed in erecta porriguntur officia* [whence ?]. Hermes XXV 130 p. m. *uentris.* Theod. Prisc. II 18 § 52 (p. 152 l. 22 ed. Rose) *uentris officium inoffense procurabo.* Ter. (1). Lucr. (1).

MVNIA Cic. Caes. Bell. Gall. VI 18 § 3 cet. Sall. Liu. Tac. Apul. Metam. VIII 7 *obiens...uiuentium -ia.* Paulin. Nol. Ep. 18 7 pr. *muniis.*

EXORBITANT c. 6 pr. c. 9 p. 34 l. 6. c. 16 p. 54 l. 24. De Pall. 5. De Praescr. Haer. 4. De Pudic. 8 (not classical). Cf. *orbita culpae* Iuu. 14 37. *exorbitatio* cited by Oehler De Idolol. 8 should be 14 p. 91 l. 1 Oehler (p. 45 l. 22 Wiss.).

p. 66 l. 1 NATVRALIVM var. lect. 1 fin. *naturalia mali.* Adu. Marc. IV 1 p. 425 l. 24 Kr. *-ia creatoris.* I 22 (5 exx. e.g. *naturalibus suis fungi* p. 319 l. 13 Kr.). I 13 p. 307 l. 18 Kr. *ad interpretationem -ium refugit.* Iren. IV 13 § 1 *naturalia legis.*

p. 66 l. 2 PROVIDENTER (Cic. Sall. Plin. iun.) comparative De Fug. in Persec. 13 f. posit. Prudent. Peristeph. X 19. Lact. Diu. In. III 17 § 18. VI 15 § 2. De Ira 10 § 35.

p. 66 l. 3 TESTIMONIVM...DIVINITATIS c. 22 fin. of demons: *dispositiones etiam dei et tunc prophetis contionantibus exceperunt et nunc lectionibus resonantibus carpunt. ita et hinc sumentes quasdam temporum sortes aemulantur* d i u i n i t a t e m, *dum furantur* d i u i n a t i o n e m. Arnobius alone, of the early apologists, neglects the argument from prophecy. Iustin. Apol. I c. 37 of prophecy: ἥπερ μεγίστη καὶ ἀληθεστάτη ἀπόδειξις καὶ ὑμῖν, ὡς νομίζομεν, φανήσεται. For Justin cf. Tzschirner pp. 130—3, 134—7. Cyprian, Quod idola di non sint 7. Origen very often, e.g. contr. Cels. I c. 54 pp. 41—2. II c. 28 p. 78. III cc. 1—3 pp. 112—3. c. 27 p. 127. So Theophilus II cc. 9. 10 p. 88. Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. 7 p. 224[d], Tatian c. 29 p. 165, Theophilus I 14 (19) p. 78[d] owed their conversion to prophecy. Christian Sibyllines and Testam. XII Patriarch. (Tzschirner 141—7).

p. 66 l. 4 DIVINATIONIS cf. De Anima 28 pr. *multo antiquior Moyses etiam Saturno nongentis circiter annis, nedum pronepotibus eius, certe* diuinior *multo, qui decursus generis humani ab exordio mundi quoque per singulas natiuitates nominatim temporatimque digessit, satis probans* [*probatus* Wiss. A.S.] diuinitatem *operis ex* diuinatione *uocis.* Cf. Orig. contr. Cels. VI 10 p. 281 f. *τὸ γὰρ χαρακτηρίζον τὴν θεότητα ἡ περὶ μελλόντων ἐστὶν ἀπαγγελία, οὐ κατ' ἀνθρωπίνην φύσιν λεγομένων καὶ ταῖς ἐκβάσεσι κρινομένων ὅτι θεῖον πνεῦμα ἦν τὸ ταῦτα ἀπαγγέλλον.* Semisch I 264 cites Plat. Men. c. 41. Cic. De Diuinat. I c. 52 sq. Sen. Suas. 4. Ios. Antiq. XI 1 § 1. XIII 10 § 7. XV 10 § 5. Clem. Alex. Strom. I § 181. Hil. De Trin. I 9. Lact. Diu. Instt. VII 8 § 10 *uerum nobis diuinatione opus non est, quibus ueritatem diuinitas ipsa patefecit.*

p. 66 ll. 4—6 Same argument in Barnab. Ep. I § 7 where Harnack cites Iustin. Apol. I 52 p. 87[a]. Theophil. I 14 p. 78[d]. II 9 f. 33 p. 109[d]. Iren. IV 33 § 1. Hippol. De Chr. et Antichr. 2.

p. 66 l. 7 VNVM TEMPVS supr. c. 19 Fuld. p. 62 l. 16 n. Cypr. De Mortalit. 2 *fiunt ecce quae dicta sunt et quando fiunt quae ante praedicta sunt, sequentur et quaecumque promissa sunt.* Iustin. Apol. I 52 p. 87[a] *ἐπειδὴ τοίνυν τὰ γενόμενα ἤδη πάντα ἀποδείκνυμεν πρὶν ἢ γενέσθαι προκεκηρύχθαι διὰ τῶν προφητῶν, ἀνάγκη καὶ περὶ τῶν ὁμοίως προφητευθέντων, μελλόντων δὲ γενέσθαι, πίστιν ἔχειν ὡς πάντως γενησομένων.* Orig. contr. Cels. IV 21 f.

p. 66 l. 8 SI FORTE Ad. Mart. 1 f. [cf. above 16 m. n. A. S.].

p. 66 l. 9 EXPVNGITVR cc. 2. 15. 21 a. m. 35 Oehler. Adu. Marc. III 24 p. 419 l. 28 Kr. IV 34 p. 537 l. 14 Kr. V 7 p. 596 l. 22 Kr. De Idolol. 1 pr. 13 p. 44 l. 26 Wiss. Scorpiac. 10 Oehler (p. 169 l. 19 Wiss.). De Cor. Milit. 1 pr. Pers. 2 13 *proximus expungam.* schol. *tractum a militibus, qui expuncti dicuntur dum foras a militia emittuntur.* Dirksen Manuale.

p. 66 l. 10 DEPVTATVR 'is reckoned of future present, and then of present past.'

p. 66 l. 11 ORO VOS infra c. 47 f. De Carn. Christ. 2 m. *ex qua, oro te, auctoritate?* 19 f. *oro uos, si dei spiritus non de uulua carnem participaturus descendit in uuluam, cur descendit in uuluam?* Cic. in lexx.

CAP. XXI

p. 66 l. 13 IVDAEORVM Tac. Ann. XV 44 *Iudaea origo eius mali.* Keim on Orig. contr. Cels. I § 2 p. 4 n. 2. Orig. II 4—6. Tac. Fr. Hist. [ed. C. D. Fisher, Oxon. 1910] ap. Sulpic. Seu. II 30 § 6 (Bernays Abhandlungen II 174—5) *has superstitiones, licet contrarias sibi, isdem tamen auctoribus profectas. Christianos ex Iudaeis exstitisse. radice sublata stirpem facile perituram.* Namat. I 389 calls the Jews *radix stultitiae*, i.e. (Barth, Bernays) *Christianismi.*

INSTRVMENTIS c. 18 pr. Oehler 19 pr. De Pudic. 10 p. 240 l. 12 Wiss. Adu. Iud. 1 f. (p. 702 Oehler). Koffmane I 58. Rönsch N. T. Tertullians 47—49. Paucker Suppl. I 411. Moses and the prophets teachers of Christianity, [Iustin.] Coh. ad Gr. 10 p. 15, 38 p. 35. Quaest. et Resp. 101 p. 482. Theophilus (I 14 p. 346) and Tatian 29 30 (p. 267). Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. 7 p. 109.

p. 66 l. 14 SECTAM infra p. 74 l. 5. c. 1 p. 2 l. 7. c. 40 p. 116 l. 32 n. Ad nat. I 10 p. 76 l. 10 Wiss. Ad Scap. 1 pr. 3 cet. Cf. Lact. De Opific. 1 § 2 *philosophi nostrae sectae quam tuemur.*

p. 66 l. 15 NOVELLAM Ignat. Ep. ad Magnes. 9 καινότης. esp. Ep. ad Diogn. 1, 2. Bingham vol. I p. 23 n. 18 (1855). Hennecke Aristides ind. καινός. [Ambst. on 1 Cor. 1 26. A. S.] Aug. Ep. 102 qu. 2 de tempore Christianae religionis §§ 8—15.

TIBERIANI c. 7 p. 24 l. 21 *census istius disciplinae, ut iam edidimus, a Tiberio est.* c. 5 p. 18 l. 24 *Tiberius ergo, cuius tempore nomen Christianum in saeculum introiuit.* c. 40 pr. p. 116 l. 18 *ante Tiberium, id est ante Christi aduentum.* infr. c. 37 p. 108 l. 9 *hesterni.* Ad nat. I 9 p. 73 l. 11 Wiss. *ut supra edidimus, aetatis nostrae nondum anni trecenti....* c. 7 p. 68 l. 2 Wiss. *principe Augusto nomen hoc ortum est...igitur aetati nostrae nondum anni* CCL. De Monogam. 3 f. *annis circiter* CLX *exinde productis.* Adu. Marc. I 15 p. 309 l. 14 Kr. cet. 19 p. 314 l. 8 Kr. 22 fin. IV 6 p. 432 l. 26 Kr. 7 pr. De Anim. 43 (wrong). Adu. Iud. 8 p. 719 Oehler (birth under Augustus p. 717). Celsus in Orig. I § 26 p. 10 n. 3 Keim. Tac. Ann. XV 44. Euseb. Hist. Eccl. I 2 § 1 fin. ταύτῃ δὲ ἤδη καὶ τῆς Χρι-

στιανῶν ἀρχαιότητος τὸ παλαιὸν ὁμοῦ καὶ θεοπρεπὲς τοῖς νέαν αὐτὴν καὶ ἐκτετοπισμένην, χθὲς καὶ οὐ πρότερον φανεῖσαν ὑπολαμβάνουσιν ἀναδειχθήσεται. 4 §§ 1. 2. 4. Kortholt Paganus Obtrectator cc. 1 and 5 (Kiloni 1698 4to) and on Iustin. pp. 31 55^{c}. Mark 1 27 *τίς ἡ διδαχὴ ἡ καινὴ αὕτη;* Acts 17 19. 20. Sueton. Ner. 16 *afflicti suppliciis Christiani, genus hominum superstitionis nouae ac maleficae.* The inscr. doubted by Ios. Scaliger there is CIL. II app. p. 25* n. 231. Prudent. Peristeph. X 583—4 *tantus nouelli dogmatis regnat furor. | hinc nempe uester Christus haud olim fuit.* Christianity as old as the world, cf. Philastr. Haer. 110 (109). Prudent. Perist. VI 37—8 *nouellum commenti genus.* X 401—413. 578—9. Minuc. 6 § 3 *quippe antiquitas caerimoniis atque fanis tantum sanctitatis tribuere consueuit quantum adstruxerit uetustatis,* e.g. § 1.

p. 66 l. 16 FORTASSE AN Acc. Varr. Gell.

p. 66 l. 17 VMBRACVLO Aldhelm De Virginitate 8 *furuo facessante ueteris instrumenti umbraculo et clara coruscante euangelii gratia.*

LICITAE c. 4 p. 16 l. 13. c. 18 fin. p. 60 l. 4. c. 38 init. n. Neander (where ?). Liebenam Röm. Vereinswesen 268. Blunt Right Use 345. Lamprid. Alex. Seu. 22 *Iudaeis priuilegia reseruauit.* Renan Les Evang. 482 citing dig. XXVII 1 15 6. L 2 3 3. Plainly not after Severus' edict against proselytes to Judaism (199—201). Bonwetsch 10. 14. Spartian. Seu. 17 § 1.

p. 66 ll. 19—22 Ep. ad Diognet. 4 *ἀλλὰ μὴν τό γε περὶ τὰς βρώσεις ψοφοδεές, καὶ τὴν περὶ τὰ σάββατα δεισιδαιμονίαν καὶ τὴν τῆς περιτομῆς ἀλαζονείαν, καὶ τὴν τῆς νηστείας καὶ νουμηνίας εἰρωνείαν, καταγέλαστα καὶ οὐδενὸς ἄξια λόγου οὐ νομίζω σε χρῄζειν παρ' ἐμοῦ μαθεῖν.* Iustin. c. Tryph. 20 p. 237^{b} (= p. 71 n. 1 Otto). 10 p. 227^{c}. 8 p. 226^{a}. Cf. Tert. Adu. Iud. 2 seq. where he urges that patriarchs were *incircumcisi* and *non sabbatizantes.*

p. 66 l. 19 EXCEPTIONIBVS Adu. Marc. V 5 p. 587 l. 20 Kr. *quid tam contemptibile quam ciborum exceptio.* De Ieiun. 2 p. 276 l. 1 Wiss. *xerophagias uero nouam adfectati officii nomen et proximum ethnicae superstitioni, quales castimoniae Apim Isidem et Magnam Matrem certorum eduliorum exceptione purificant* (where Hier. in Oehler's n. has *abstinentia*).

p. 66 l. 20 SIGNACVLO CORPORIS Kaye 406. De Spectac. 4 pr. *ad principalem auctoritatem conuertar ipsius signaculi nostri. cum aquam ingressi Christianam fidem in legis suae uerba profitemur, renuntiasse nos diabolo et pompae et angelis eius ore nostro contestamur.* ib. 24 *hoc erit pompa diaboli, aduersus quem in signaculo fidei eieramus...ceterum sic nos eieramus et rescindimus signaculum rescindendo testationem eius?* Adu. Iud. 3 *dari enim habebat circumcisio sed in signum, unde Israel in nouissimo tempore dignosci haberet, quando secundum sua merita in sanctam ciuitatem ingredi prohiberetur,* cet. De Pudic. 9 p. 237 l. 9 Wiss. *anulum* (in the parable of the Prodigal) *signaculum lauacri.* Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. 16 p. 234[a] *ἡ γὰρ ἀπὸ Ἀβραὰμ κατὰ σάρκα περιτομὴ εἰς σημεῖον ἐδόθη, ἵνα ἦτε ἀπὸ τῶν ἄλλων ἐθνῶν καὶ ἡμῶν ἀφωρισμένοι, καὶ ἵνα μόνοι πάθητε ἃ νῦν ἐν δίκῃ πάσχετε, καὶ ἵνα γένωνται αἱ χῶραι ὑμῶν ἔρημοι καὶ αἱ πόλεις πυρίκαυστοι καὶ τοὺς καρποὺς ἐνώπιον ὑμῶν κατεσθίωσιν ἀλλότριοι καὶ μηδεὶς ἐξ ὑμῶν ἐπιβαίνῃ εἰς τὴν Ἱερουσαλήμ· οὐ γὰρ ἐξ ἄλλου τινὸς γνωρίζεσθε παρὰ τοὺς ἄλλους ἀνθρώπους, ἢ ἀπὸ τῆς ἐν σαρκὶ ὑμῶν περιτομῆς.* The Jew says ibid. 10 p. 227[c] *ἐκεῖνο δὲ ἀποροῦμεν μάλιστα εἰ ὑμεῖς εὐσεβεῖν λέγοντες καὶ τῶν ἄλλων οἰόμενοι διαφέρειν, κατ' οὐδὲν αὐτῶν ἀπολείπεσθε οὐδὲ διαλλάσσετε ἀπὸ τῶν ἐθνῶν τὸν ὑμέτερον βίον, ἐν τῷ μήτε τὰς ἑορτὰς μήτε τὰ σάββατα τηρεῖν μήτε τὴν περιτομὴν ἔχειν, καὶ ἔτι ἐπ' ἄνθρωπον σταυρωθέντα ἐλπίδας ποιούμενοι, ὅμως ἐλπίζετε τεύξεσθαι ἀγαθοῦ τινος παρὰ τοῦ θεοῦ μὴ ποιοῦντες αὐτοῦ τὰς ἐντολάς.* 18 p. 235[c]. 19. 20 pp. 236[a]—237[b]. 46 p. 265[b]. 92 p. 319[d] 320[ab]. 137 p. 366[d]. Ep. ad Diognet. 4 p. 496[bc]. The word *signaculum* Ambr. De Abrah. II 11 ter. De Isaac IV 4 § 37. Hegesip. I 39 p. 76 41. Clem. Recogn. III 11 f. Ennod. p. 421 8 H. Rönsch p. 38. Bailey Rituale Anglocath. 263—4. Iren. IV 30. [Also Ambst. Hier. Rufin. Aug. cet., very frequent. A. S.]

p. 66 l. 22 SCIT c. 5 Oehler's ind. supr. p. 20 l. 2. Lact. III 29 § 15. *Deum* VI 6 § 5. Clem. Recogn. VII 8. VIII 9 *neque initium neque finem.* Hier. in Eccles. 11 col. 482. in Is. III c. 6 9. Rönsch Itala u. Vulgata 380.

p. 66 l. 24 cf. De Praescr. Haer. 7 *uiderint qui Stoicum*

et Platonicum et dialecticum Christianismum protulerunt. nobis curiositate opus non est post Christum Iesum nec inquisitione post euangelium. cum credimus, nihil desideramus ultra credere. hoc enim prius credimus, non esse quod ultra credere debemus. Aug. in Ps. 141 9 *usque adeo de cruce non erubesco, ut non in occulto loco habeam crucem Christi, sed in fronte portem.* Matth. 8 38, Luke 9 26, Rom. 1 15.

p. 66 l. 25 DEPVTARI 'reckoned.' De Cult. Fem. I 2 pr. *damnati in poenam mortis deputantur...angeli.*

IVVAT Neumann I 153 n. 8. infr. c. 50 n. p. 146 l. 10.

p. 66 l. 28 Cypr. De Idol. Vanit. 6 § 1 *Iudaeis primum erat apud Deum gratia. sic olim iusti erant, sic maiores eorum religionibus obediebant.* § 2 *inde illis et regni sublimitas floruit et generis magnitudo prouenit.*

ORIGINALIVM AVCTORVM c. 18 pr. p. 58 l. 4. De Monogam. 7 *originales personae* (from Adam to Moses).

p. 66 l. 29 SVBLIMITAS c. 25 pr. p. 86 l. 24 of Romans.

p. 66 l. 31 SED QVANTA cet. Cypr. De Idol. Vanit. 10 *quam fuerit illis profana uita, quae contracta sit uiolatae religionis offensa, ipsi quoque testantur, qui etsi uoce tacent, exitu confitentur.* Wailing of the Jews on the day of the destruction of the Temple. Hier. in Sophon. I 15 (VI 692).

p. 66 l. 33 EXITVS Adu. Iud. 13 p. 737 l. 10 sup. cf. p. 738 f. Schliemann Clementinen 402 n. 64. 407 n. Philo Legat. Gai. § 32. Dio. Cass. LXV 7 § 2. Grot (?) p. 158. Cels. in Or. VIII 69 neither clod (βῶλος) nor hearth remains to Jews.

p. 66 l. 34 DISPERSI Ios. De Bell. Iud. VII 3 § 3 τὸ γὰρ Ἰουδαίων γένος πολὺ μὲν κατὰ πᾶσαν τὴν οἰκουμένην παρέσπαρται τοῖς ἐπιχωρίοις. Sibyll. III. 271 (B. C. 140) πᾶσα δὲ γαῖα σέθεν πλήρης καὶ πᾶσα θάλασσα. Schürer II[2] § 31 'Das Judenthum in der Zerstreuung. die Proselyten,' p. 493 sq. Westcott 'Dispersion' in D. B. Tzschirner 303 sq. Kaye 151 n. 2. Clem. Recogn. I 39 f. Cyprian De Idol. Vanit. 10 *dispersi et palabundi uagantur, soli et caeli sui profugi per hospitia aliena iactantur.* Iustin. Apol. I c. 47 p. 84[b] εἴρηται δὲ καὶ περὶ τῆς ἐρημώσεως αὐτῆς καὶ περὶ τοῦ μὴ ἐπιτραπήσεσθαι μηδένα αὐτῶν οἰκεῖν (Is. 1 7, Jer. 50 3, cf. 2 15)...ὅτι δὲ φυλάσσεται ὑφ' ὑμῶν ὅπως μηδεὶς ἐν αὐτῇ γένηται, καὶ θάνατος

κατὰ τοῦ καταλαμβανομένου Ἰουδαίου εἰσιόντος ὥρισται, ἀκριβῶς ἐπίστασθε. Dial. c. Tryph. 12 p. 229[a] sq. c. 40 p. 259[b]. c. 92 p. 319[d]. esp. c. 16 p. 234[a]. War with Bar Cochba 132—135. Clinton Fasti. Hänel s. v. 131 (p. 87[b]. 88[a]). Aristo Pellaeus in Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IV 6 § 3 (and with comm. at end of Otto's Hermias (Apol. IX) pp. 356—9) cited below. infra c. 26 fin. *Romani...numquam dominaturi eius* < *Iudeae* >, *si non ultimo deliquisset in Christum.* Adu. Iud. 10 f. *post passionem enim Christi etiam captiuitas uobis et dispersio obuenit, praedicta per spiritum sanctum.* cf. ib. 11. Orig. contr. Cels. I c. 47 pp. 35 36. II c. 8 p. 62. c. 34 med. IV c. 22 p. 174. VIII c. 69. Prud. Apoth. 538—544. Scaliger Anim. Euseb. p. 216. Theodoret Graec. Affect. Cur. VI § 89 p. 101 54. XI §§ 70 71 p. 163 23 sq. Aug. in Ps. 124 3 pr. De Ciu. Dei XVIII 46.

PALABVNDI Cypr. p. 27 14. 611 3 and v. l. in 602 20 (also cited from Itiner. Alexandri).

SOLI ET CAELI Adu. Iud. 13 more (earlier) and later *de longinquo eam oculis tantum uidere permissum est.* Cypr. quod idola di non sint 10 (above). Auson. Ep. 52 (= 33 Peiper) *orta salo, suscepta solo, patre edita caelo,* | *Aeneadum genetrix, hic habito alma Venus.* Tac. Hist. V 7 *solo caeloque iuxta graui.* Paulin. Nol. Carm. 15 82 *ille solum caelo uertit.* Symm. Ep. I 47 1 *non illius caeli aut soli illecebram retinax aduenarum lotos aequauerit.* Conc. Trull. (quinisextum) can. 11 [Mansi xi 945 E. A. S.] *μηδεὶς τῶν ἐν ἱερατικῷ τάγματι ἢ λαϊκὸς τὰ παρὰ τῶν Ἰουδαίων ἄζυμα ἐσθιέτω ἢ τοιούτους προσοικειούσθω, καὶ ἰατρείας παρ᾽ αὐτῶν λαμβανέτω, ἢ ἐν βαλανείῳ παντελῶς τούτοις συλλουέσθω* (penalty unfrocking, or for laity excommunication). Marcus first Gentile bp of Jerusalem. Sulpic. Seu. Chron. II 31. Cf. Euseb. H. E. IV 5.

p. 68 l. 2 Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IV 6 § 3 Aristo Pellaeus *τὸ πᾶν ἔθνος ἐξ ἐκείνου* (after Bar Cochba's revolt) *καὶ τῆς περὶ τὰ Ἱεροσόλυμα γῆς ἐπιβαίνειν εἴργεται, νόμου δόγματι καὶ διατάξεσιν Ἁδριανοῦ, ὡς ἂν μηδ᾽ ἐξ ἀπόπτου θεωροῖεν τὸ πατρῷον ἔδαφος ἐγκελευσαμένου.* Tert. Adu. Iud. 13 pr. *exinde quod interdictum est, ne in confinio ipsius regionis demoraretur quisquam Iudaeorum.* Cf. Adu. Marc. III 23 p. 418 l. 22 Kr. Aug. in Ps. 68. Serm. 2 10 pr. *consecuta est postea*

uindicta Domini; expugnata est ciuitas, debellati Iudaei, occisa nescio quot hominum milia. nullus illuc modo permittitur accedere Iudaeorum; ubi potuerunt aduersus Dominum clamare, ibi a Domino non permittuntur habitare. perdiderunt locum furoris sui: atque utinam uel nunc agnoscant locum quietis suae!...nam loca illa omnia et hominibus plena sunt et Iudaeis inania. Schürer I^3 699 n. 146. Renan, Égl. Chrét. 221.

p. 68 l. 3 Theodoret Gr. Aff. Cur. XI § 69 p. 163 15 sq.

PRAEMINARENTVR: the word Adu. Marc. V 19 p. 645 l. 22 Kr., Apul.

p. 68 l. 4 EADEM Adu. Marc. IV 5 p. 431, l. 4 Kr.

FORE VTI cet. Cypr. De Idolor. Vanit. 5 § 4 = c. 11 Hartel (p. 28 l. 1 seq. H.) *nec non deus ante praedixerat fore ut uergente saeculo et mundi fine iam proximo ex omni gente et populo et loco cultores sibi* allegeret *deus multo et fidei fortioris et melioris obsequii, qui indulgentiam de diuinis muneribus haurirent....* § 5 l. 5 *cuius igitur gratiae disciplinaeque arbiter et magister sermo et filius dei mittitur, qui per prophetas omnes retro* illuminator *et* deductor *humani generis praedicabatur. hic est uirtus dei, hic ratio, hic sapientia eius et gloria. hic* cet.

EXTIMIS De Anim. 48 pr. *sub extimis noctibus.* Amm. XXIX 5 48 *usque diei extimum.*

p. 68 l. 5 Arnob. II 12 Gospel in India, among the Seres, Persians, Medes, in every isle and province.

ADLEGERET De Carn. Resur. 8 p. 36 ll. 28—29 Kr. (but he reads *alligatur, alligari*). Adu. Marc. I 24 p. 323 l. 27 Kr. II 23 p. 366 l. 12 Kr. (bis). 24 p. 367 l. 16 Kr. 25 p. 370 l. 27 Kr. (*adlectio*). 28 (bis). p. 371 ll. 17—18 Kr. IV 9 p. 440 l. 18 Kr. 11 pr. (4 exx.) V 1 p. 568 l. 27 Kr. Hier. II 292^b and *in sacerdotium* Ep. 82 a (col. 518^b).

p. 68 l. 8 REFORMANDAM De Orat. 7 p. 186 l. 7 Wiss. *ut legem in melius reformaret.* Adu. Hermog. 43 p. 173 l. 10 Kr. *in bonum...de malo.* Adu. Iud. 2 p. 704 *in melius...in hominis salutem.* Aug. De Spir. et Litt. § 37 f. Clem. Recogn. V 13 *uos ad ipsius imaginem.* [Many exx. in my index to Ps.-Aug. Quaest. A. S.]

p. 68 l. 9 Orig. contr. Cels. I 7 says that almost all the world was better acquainted with the birth, crucifixion, passion

of Christ than with the teaching of philosophers. So little is ours a *κρύφιον δόγμα*.

p. 68 l. 10 INLVMINATOR Adu. Marc. IV 2 fin. 7 p. 434 l. 17 Kr. 17 f. 25 p. 504 l. 23 Kr. 40 p. 560 l. 11 Kr. Adu. Valent. 15 f. De Cor. Milit. 7 a. m. Cypr. p. 28 l. 7 (above). Vulg. Aug. Serm. 153 1 pr. 216 9. Contra Maximin. I 4 5 cet. (*inluminatio* Adu. Hermog. 15 p. 142 l. 25 Kr.). Paulin. Nol. Ep. 23 34 pr.

p. 68 l. 11 DEDVCTOR Adu. Prax. 30 fin. 2 pr. *paracletum, deductorem scilicet omnis ueritatis.* De Cor. Milit. 4. De Fug. in Persec. 1 (cf. 14) *qui si forte paracletum non recipiendo, deductorem omnis ueritatis.* Hil. Ambr.

FILIVS DEI Zahn Forschungen V 310.

NON ITA GENITVS Orig. contr. Cels. I 28. Clem. Alex. Protr. 2 § 31 p. 27. Clem. Hom. V 12 sq. Recogn. X 22 sq. Aristaen. II 2 p. 630 Boiss. Aetna 88—90.

p. 68 l. 13 SORORIS INCESTO c. 9 p. 3 l. 15. 11 p. m. (p. 42) the heathen gods worthier of hell than heaven. *illuc enim abstrudi solent impii quique in parentes et in sorores incesti et maritarum adulteri et uirginum raptores et puerorum contaminatores.* Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. VII § 5 p. 103 14. § 8 p. 103 43. Athan.-Euagr. Vit. Anton. 74. 75. 76 *libidinum principem Iouem.* Maury Hist. d. Rel. de la Grèce III 320_6. Porphyr. De Abstin. III 16 p. 138 20 Nauck. Aug. Ep. 91 4 and 5. Iul. Firm. 12 § 2. Clem. Alex. Protrept. § 38. Ambr. Abr. I 9 § 84 vol. I 556 2 Schenkl. Athenag. 32 p. 36^b (= 166 Otto). Theophil. III 3. Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. III § 81 p. 51 1—5, Ganymede, Leda, Danae. § 97 p. 53 46 sq. sister Hera, mother Rhea, daughter *Φερρέφαττα* (Orph. 30 67) § 98 p. 54 1 (cf. § 37 p. 43 l. 45). Epiphan. Ancorat. 105 p. 108^{ab} *Ζεὺς...ἐκινδύνευε πασῶν τῶν γυναικῶν ἀνὴρ γίνεσθαι. τράγος* for Penelope, Danae, Leda, Ganymede, Pasiphae and Europa. Lucian Iupp. Trag. 2.

STVPRO FILIAE Otto on Tatian c. 8 (p. 148 a or Otto's p. 38 n. 17). Arn. V 20 21. (*filiae* 'Proserpine' Clem. Hom. V 14.)

p. 68 l. 14 SQVAMATVM Arnob. V 21. Swan and eagle Tatian 10. Sidon. Carm. 15 174—8. 23 281—8. 11 69 *cygno Ioue nata* 89—90; also in Vulg. 1 Regg. 17 5 *lorica.* Cic. De Nat. Deor.

I § 42 M. Senec. De Vita Beata 26 § 7 *sic uestras alucinationes fero, quemadmodum Iuppiter O. M. ineptias poetarum; quorum alius illi alas imposuit, alius cornua, alius adulterum* (cf. Sen. fr. 119) *illum induxit.* Stat. Silu. I 2 134—6 *quod nisi me longis placasset Iuno querellis, falsus huic pinnas et cornua sumeret aethrae rector, in hanc uero cecidisset Iuppiter auro.* Lucian Charidem. 7 fin. Achilles Tatius II 37. Max. Tyr. V 1 p. 84. Tert. De Carne Chr. 4 f. *et tamen apud illam < sapientiam saecularem > facilius creditur Iuppiter taurus factus aut cygnus, quam uere homo Christus penes Marcionem.* Cypr. ad Donat. 8 f. (p. 10, 18—23). Clem. Hom. V 13. Athanas. Contr. Gentes 15 f. 11 p. m. (I 26^{ab} Migne) 12 pr. Firmic. 12 §§ 2 and 4 (ap. La Cerda). 13. Prudent. Contr. Symm. I 59—78. Aug. De Ciu. Dei XVIII 13 p. m. Friedländer III^5 661—3.

CORNVTVM c. 16 f. n. (p. 54 l. 32). Ad nat. I 14 fin. Adu. Marc. III 18 p. 406 l. 26 Kr. (= Adu. Iud. 10 p. 728 Oehler). Europa and Leda Athenag. 22 f. (p. 24^c). Arnob. V 21. VI 12 (Hammon 13 pr.). Tatian 9 10. Athenag. 20 32. Clem. Alex. Protrept. § 16.

PLVMATVM Aug. De Ciu. Dei IV 27 (I 180 16 D.), Cic. poet. Apul. Metam. II 1 *aues indidem -as.* c. Sodoma 113 (Peiper's Cypr. Gall. Poet. p. 218) *si quis plumat senio modulatior ales.* Tatian 19 n. (p. 149^c or Otto's p. 44). *θεός, εἰπέ μοι, κύκνος γίνεται καὶ τὴν ἀετοῦ μορφὴν ἀναλαμβάνει καὶ δι᾽ οἰνοχοΐαν τοῦ Γανυμήδους τῇ παιδεραστίᾳ σεμνύνεται.* Tert. De Spectac. 8 p. 9 l. 20 Wiss. *oua honori Castorum adscribunt, qui illos ouo editos credendo de cygno Ioue non erubescunt.* Aristid. Apol. 9 8 (Syr.). Lucian Deor. Dial. 4 pr. 20 6. Apollodor. III 12 2. Prudent. Perist. X 221 (Roman) *cygnus stuprator.* Arnob. IV 23. 26. Hild. p. 384. V 20 (*taurus* cf. 35). 29. 44. Elmenh. on Arnob. l. c. p. 143. Greg. Naz. t. II c. 61 p. 142 Bill *ταῦρος, κύκνος, χρυσός, ὄφις, πόσις, ἄρκτος, ἅπαντα.* Aug. De Ciu. Dei V 27. Hier. in Ion. c. 2 p. 406^d. Prudent. contr. Symm. I 77. Germ. Arat. Phaenom. Plin. N. II § 17. Ou. Fast. V 605—6. Octauia 203—7. 762—772. As an eagle with Aegina (Clem. Hom. V 13), as a vulture with Aetna (ib.), Lamia as a hoopoe (*ἔποψ*) (ib.), Phthia as a dove Aelian Var. Hist. I 15, Hera as a cuckoo, Pausan.

II 17 6. Schol. Theocr. XV 64. Aristoph. Birds 819 sq. Trypho (in Iustin. Dial. 67 pr. p. 291b) 'the Christians speak as the Greeks in their myths, who represent Perseus as born of the virgin Danae, on whom Iupiter descended in a shower of gold.' So Iustin. himself (Apol. I 22 f. p. 68 b) *εἰ δὲ καὶ διὰ παρθένου γεγεννῆσθαι φέρομεν, κοινὸν καὶ τοῦτο πρὸς τὸν Περσέα ἔστω ὑμῖν.* Clem. Hom. V 13. Leda, Danae, Semele, Alcmene, Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. III § 98.

p. 68 l. 16 IMPVDICITIA Aug. Enchirid. 34 *qualem de uirgine nasci oportebat, quem fides matris, non libido, conceperat.* [Mr Payne adds De Trin. xiii 23.]

p. 68 l. 19 EDIXIMVS c. 17 pr. Kaye 517.

p. 68 l. 21 RATIONEM c. 23 p. 82 l. 11. Adu. Prax. 5 p. 233 l. 7 Kr. *ante omnia enim deus erat solus, ipse sibi et mundus et locus et omnia. solus autem, quia nihil aliud extrinsecus praeter illum. ceterum ne tunc quidem solus; habebat enim secum, quam habebat in semet ipso, rationem, suam scilicet. rationalis enim deus, et † ratio in ipsum prius, et ita ab ipso omnia, quae ratio sensus ipsius est. hanc Graeci λόγον dicunt, quo uocabulo etiam sermonem appellamus. ideoque iam in usu est nostrorum per simplicitatem interpretationis sermonem dicere in primordio apud deum fuisse, cum magis rationem competat antiquiorem haberi, quia non sermonalis a principio, sit rationalis deus, etiam ante principium, et quia ipse quoque sermo ratione consistens, priorem eam ut substantiam suam ostendat.* Kaye p. 500 n. 6. Harnack Gesch. d. altchr. Lit. (1893) I 877. On Tertullian's knowledge of Greek Kaye 61.

ARTIFICEM of God Lact. Diu. Instt. II 2 § 18. 17 § 9. Senec. Ep. 113 § 16 *diuini artificis ingenium* (*δημιουργός*). Antisthenes in Lact. I 5.

p. 68 l. 22 ZENO Pearson (Cambr. 1891) Zeno Fr. 44 (pp. 92 93, where he gives Lact. IV 9 § 2 twice, not knowing that bk IV = De Vera Sapientia). infr. c. 46 pr. Christians and philosophers. Minuc. 19 § 10 *Zeno et Chrysippus et Cleanthes sunt et ipsi multiformes, sed ad unitatem prouidentiae omnes reuoluuntur...Zenon eiusdem < Cleanthis > magister naturalem legem atque diuinam et aethera interim interdumque rationem uult omnium esse principium; idem interpretando Iunonem*

aëra, Iouem caelum, Neptunum mare, ignem esse Vulcanum et ceteros similiter uulgo deos elementa esse monstrando publicum arguit grauiter et reuincit errorem. Cic. De Nat. Deor. I § 36. The λόγος known to Orpheus ([Iustin.] Cohort. ad Gr. 15 p. 16 Col.). Orig. contra Cels. VI c. 8 p. 280 Plato in a letter to Hermeias and Koriskos speaks of the son of God.

FACTITATOREM c. 46 p. 128 l. 31. Adu. Valent. 21 bis. Adu. Prax. 18 p. 260 l. 12 Kr. (cited from no other author).

p. 68 l. 25 CLEANTHES Fr. 13 p. 245 Pearson.

PERMEATOREM ἅπ. λεγ. Cic. De Nat. Deor. I § 36 (of Zeno) *aliis autem locis rationem quandam per omnem naturam rerum pertinentem ui diuina esse affectam putant.* Marc. Aurel. V 32 ὁ διὰ τῆς οὐσίας διήκων λόγος. Heraclit. in Plut. Moral. 885[a] cet. in Lasaulx Studien p. 78 n. 20. Athenag. 6 p. 7[c] (56) de Stoicis.

p. 68 l. 26 VIRTVTI Adu. Iud. 9 prope fin. (p. 726 Oehler) *duplici enim, nisi fallor, operatione distinctum eum legimus, praedicationis et uirtutis.* Adu. Prax. 7 p. 236 l. 7 Kr. 30. Adu. Marc. I 19. III 6 p. 384 l. 16 Kr. 16. IV 21 p. 489 l. 22 Kr.

p. 68 l. 27 EDIXIMVS c. 17 pr. Kaye 523—4.

PROPRIAM SVBSTANTIAM Orig. in Io. p. 56 ἰδίαν οὐσίαν i.e. ὑπόστασιν. Ashton. Kaye 524 n. 9. 526 n. 6. Grot. on Mark 2 8. Hippol. c. Noët. 16 (I 242) *quid est quod ex ipso genitum est, nisi Spiritus, id est Verbum?* Celsus in Orig. VI 72 says: ἐπείπερ πνεῦμά ἐστιν ἀπὸ τοῦ θεοῦ ὁ υἱὸς ἐν ἀνθρωπίνῳ γεγονὼς σώματι, οὐδ' ἂν αὐτὸς εἴη ἀθάνατος ὁ τοῦ θεοῦ υἱός. Mosheim's Orig. contra Cels. p. 712. On the Trinity Pamel. I p. 39[c] sq. n. 31. Lightfoot on [Clem.] 2 c. 9 (II[2] 230). Dorner I 205 sq. Maximilla in Euseb. Hist. Eccl. V 16 § 17 ῥῆμά εἰμι καὶ πνεῦμα καὶ δύναμις. Georgii in Studien der evang. Geistlichkeit Würtembergs 1838 72 sq. 107. 110. 112. 116—7. Iren. V 1 § 2. Iustin. Apol. I 33. [Cyprianic tract] De Montibus Sina et Sion 3 *Sion...in quo monte Spiritus sanctus Filius Dei rex constitutus est.* Cypr. Quod idola di non sint 11 *carnem spiritus sanctus induitur*; where in Migne is cited Herm. Sim. V 5 § 2. C. Taylor in Class. Rev. VII 201. R. Seeberg in Zahn Forschungen V 330 and 223. (Aristid. 2 6. Herm. Sim. IX 1 § 1.)

p. 68 l. 28 SPIRITVM c. 23 p. 82 l. 11. omn. De Orat. 1 bis. p. 180, 3. 12 Wiss. Adu. Marc. III 16 *spiritus creatoris qui est Christus.* Pamelius I 33^{EF} n. 13. 2 [Clem.] 9, Χριστὸς...ὢν μὲν τὸ πρῶτον πνεῦμα. Otto on Athenag. Suppl. 10 p. 10^{c} (p. 46 n. 9).

p. 68 l. 30 PROLATVM cet. Adu. Prax. 8 pr. *hoc si qui putauerit me probolen aliquam introducere, id est prolationem rei alterius ex altera, quod facit Valentinus, alium atque alium aeonem de aeone producens; primo quidem dicam tibi: non ideo non utitur et ueritas uocabulo isto et re ac censu eius, quia et haeresis utitur; immo haeresis potius ex ueritate accepit, quod ad mendacium suum strueret. prolatus est sermo dei an non? hic mecum gradum fige. si prolatus est, cognosce probolen ueritatis et uiderit haeresis, si quid de ueritate imitata est.* 6 fin. *nam ut primum deus uoluit ea quae cum Sophiae ratione et sermone disposuerat intra se, in substantias et species suas edere, ipsum primum protulit sermonem habentem in se indiuiduas suas rationem et sophiam, ut per ipsum fierent uniuersa, per quem erant cogitata atque disposita, immo et facta iam, quantum in dei sensu.* Adu. Valentin. 7 p. 185 l. 6 Kr. *namque ibidem Nus simul accepit prolationis suae officium; emittit et ipse ex semet ipso Sermonem et Vitam.* Cf. 37 p. 211 l. 4 Kr. *prolatio uocis* Lact. Diu. Instt. IV 8 § 12. Aug. Gen. ad litt. IV § 39. Hilar. De Trin. IV 3. VI 5 cet. Rufin.-Orig. Princ. IV 1 28. Iren. II 28 §§ 3 fin. 4 pr. 5. 6. 31 § 1. Hier.-Didym. Sp. S. 26. The term disapproved by Iren. II 13 § 5. 28 § 6 (Baur I 172 n. 12). Blunt Right Use 162—3. Kaye 496 seq.

p. 68 l. 31 VNITATE Adu. Prax. 2 p. 229 l. 26 Kr. *quasi non sic quoque unus sit omnia, dum ex uno omnia, per substantiae scilicet unitatem.*

p. 68 l. 32 CVM RADIVS EX SOLE cet. Adu. Prax. 8 p. 239 l. 7 Kr. *tertius enim est Spiritus a Deo et Filio, sicut...tertius a sole apex ex radio.* 27 pr. *undique enim obducti distinctione patris et filii, quam manente coniunctione disponimus, ut solis et radii et fontis et fluuii.* Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. 61 p. 284^{bc} Otto ad l. cf. 128 λόγον γάρ τινα προβάλλοντες, λόγον γεννῶμεν, οὐ κατ' ἀποτομήν, ὡς ἐλαττωθῆναι τὸν ἐν ἡμῖν λόγον, προβαλλόμενοι. καὶ ὁποῖον ἐπὶ πυρὸς ὁρῶμεν ἄλλο γινόμενον,

οὐκ ἐλαττουμένου ἐκείνου ἐξ οὗ ἡ ἄναψις γέγονεν, ἀλλὰ τοῦ αὐτοῦ μένοντος, καὶ τὸ ἐξ αὐτοῦ ἀναφθὲν καὶ αὐτὸ ὂν φαίνεται, οὐκ ἐλαττῶσαν ἐκεῖνο ἐξ οὗ ἀνήφθη. μαρτυρήσει δέ μοι ὁ λόγος τῆς σοφίας, αὐτὸς ὢν οὗτος ὁ θεὸς ἀπὸ τοῦ πατρὸς τῶν ὅλων γεννηθεὶς καὶ λόγος καὶ σοφία καὶ δύναμις καὶ δόξα τοῦ γεννήσαντος ὑπάρχων. Cf. Lact. Diu. Instt. IV 29 §§ 4 5. Iren. II 13 disapproves these analogies. Tat. 5 = 8 (p. 146[bc]) *ὥσπερ γὰρ ἀπὸ μιᾶς δᾳδὸς ἀνάπτεται μὲν πυρὰ πολλά, τῆς δὲ πρώτης δᾳδὸς διὰ τὴν ἔξαψιν τῶν πολλῶν δᾳδῶν οὐκ ἐλαττοῦται τὸ φῶς, οὕτω καὶ ὁ λόγος προελθὼν ἐκ τῆς τοῦ πατρὸς δυνάμεως οὐκ ἄλογον πεποίηκε τὸν γεγεννηκότα. καὶ γὰρ αὐτὸς ἐγὼ λαλῶ καὶ ὑμεῖς ἀκούετε, καὶ οὐ δήπου διὰ τῆς μεταβάσεως τοῦ λόγου κενὸς ὁ προσομιλῶν λόγου γίνομαι· προβαλλόμενος δὲ τὴν ἐμαυτοῦ φωνὴν διακοσμεῖν τὴν ἐν ὑμῖν ἀκόσμητον ὕλην προήρημαι.*

p. 68 l. 33 SEPARATVR Adu. Prax. 2 fin. *numerum sine diuisione patiuntur.* 8 p. 238 l. 17 Kr. *prolatum dicimus filium a Patre sed non separatum.* Tat. Apol. 8 *οὐ κατ' ἀποκοπήν.* Iust. Dial. c. Tryph. 61 p. 284 c. 128 p. 358 Col.

p. 68 l. 35 LVMEN DE LVMINE Suicer s. u. *φῶς.* Athenag. 10 f. (p. 10 d) *καίτοι καὶ αὐτὸ τὸ ἐνεργοῦν τοῖς ἐκφωνοῦσι προφητικῶς ἅγιον πνεῦμα ἀπόρροιαν εἶναί φαμεν τοῦ θεοῦ, ἀπορρέον καὶ ἐπαναφερόμενον ὡς ἀκτῖνα ἡλίου.* Euseb. Caes. in a letter to his flock (appended to Athan. De Decr. Syn. Nic. and in Theodoret H. E. I 12 § 4) proposed at Nicaea the form we believe *εἰς ἕνα κύριον Ἰησοῦν Χριστόν, τὸν τοῦ θεοῦ λόγον, θεὸν ἐκ θεοῦ, φῶς ἐκ φωτός, ζωὴν ἐκ ζωῆς* cet. Epiphan. Haeres. LXII 1. LXIX 7 (Arius ad Alex.). Paulin. Nol. Ep. 42 2 *Deum ex Deo.*

INDEFECTA lexx. give De Pallio 3 and Apul. Cassiod. in Forcellini (not Bailey's ed.) and RW., but not in LS. or Georges or Mühlm. or Faber. Faber and Mühlmann have h. l., Gesner F and G with ref. to Salm.

p. 68 l. 36 MATRIX cet. Adu. Prax. 2 p. 229 l. 4 Kr. *sermo ipsius qui ex ipso processerit* cet. 8 fin. *tertius est spiritus a deo et filio, sicut tertius a radice fructus ex frutice, et tertius a fonte riuus ex flumine, et tertius a sole apex ex radio, nihil tamen a matrice alienatur, a qua proprietates suas ducit. ita*

trinitas per consertos et conexos gradus a patre decurrens, et monarchiae nihil obstrepit et oikonomiae statum protegit. ibid. p. 238 l. 18 Kr. *protulit deus sermonem, quemadmodum etiam Paracletus* (in Montanus) *docet, sicut radix fruticem, et fons fluuium, et sol radium. nam et istae species probolae sunt earum substantiarum, ex quibus prodeunt. nec dubitauerim filium dicere et radicis fruticem et fontis fluuium et solis radium, quia omnis origo parens est, et omne, quod ex origine profertur, progenies est.* 13 fin. *nam et radium solis seorsum solem uocabo; solem autem nominans, cuius est radius, non statim et radium solem appellabo. nam nec soles duos faciam, tamen et solem et radium eius tam duas res et duas species unius et indiuisae substantiae numerabo, quam deum et sermonem eius, quam patrem et filium.* Kaye 504. 519 seq. 527. Baur Dreieinigkeit I 176.

TRADVCES c. 7 fin. De Praescr. Haer. 32 m. *seminis apostolici traduces.* De Patient. 5 p. 7 l. 18 Kr. De Anima 9 p. 311 l. 18 Wiss. De Test. An. 3 p. 138 l. 7 Wiss. De Carne Chr. 22 *sui.* 20 p. m. *neruum umbilicarem, quasi folliculi sui traducem.* Vinc. Vict. ap. Aug. De Nat. et Orig. An. I 17 [more exx. in index to Corp. Scr. Eccl. Lat. vol. LX A. S.]. De Pecc. Orig. 3 § 3. Hier. Adu. Ruf. II 4 8. Caelest. Symb. 1. Mar. Mercator Subnot. 7 2. Rufin. XXI 626[a] Migne. [Ambst. frequently: see Study of Ambst. p. 145, Ps.-Aug. Quaest. p. 574 (index): also Pelag. A. S.]

p. 70 l. 2 MODVLO Adu. Prax. 9 p. 239 l. 19 Kr. *necessitate autem hoc dico, cum eundem patrem et filium et spiritum contendunt, aduersus oikonomian monarchiae adulantes, non tamen diuersitate alium Filium a Patre, sed distributione, nec diuisione alium, sed distinctione, quia non sit idem pater et filius uel* modulo *alius ab alio.* 14 p. 250 l. 22 Kr. *consequens erit, ut inuisibilem patrem intellegamus pro plenitudine maiestatis, uisibilem uero Filium agnoscamus pro* modulo *deriuationis, sicut nec solem nobis contemplari licet, quantum ad ipsam substantiae summam, quae est in caelis, radium autem eius toleramus oculis pro temperatura portionis, quae in terram inde porrigitur.* Adu. Marc. IV 18 p. 478 l. 16 Kr. *forma prophetici moduli* (L. and S. omit the 3 passages from Tert. of which this and Prax. are in RW.) [Very often in Aug. A. S.]

p. 70 l. 3 NVMERO)(Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. 128 p. 358[c] *ἀριθμῷ ἕτερόν τι.* 62 p. 285[c]. 129 pr. p. 358[d]. ib. p. 359[ab]. 56 p. 276[d]. GRADV NON STATV Adu. Prax. 8 p. 239 l. 11 Kr. 19 fin. *rationem reddimus, qua dei non duo dicantur nec domini, sed qua pater et filius duo, et hoc non ex separatione substantiae, sed ex dispositione, cum indiuiduum et inseparatum filium a patre pronuntiamus, nec statu, sed gradu alium, qui etsi deus dicatur, quando nominatur singularis, non ideo duos deos faciat, sed unum, hoc ipso, quod et deus ex unitate patris uocari habeat.* ib. 2 fin. *quasi non sic quoque unus sit omnia, dum ex uno omnia, per substantiae scilicet unitatem, et nihilominus custodiatur oikonomiae sacramentum, quae unitatem in trinitatem disponit, tres dirigens, patrem et filium et spiritum,—tres autem non statu, sed gradu, nec substantia, sed forma, nec potestate, sed specie,—unius autem substantiae et unius status et unius potestatis, quia unus deus, ex quo et gradus isti et formae et species in nomine patris et filii et spiritus sancti deputantur.* 21 p. 264 l. 5 Kr. *non eundem autem non quasi separatum, dispositione alium, non diuisione.* [Cf. Ps.-Aug. Quaest. 122 § 26 A. S.]

RECESSIT Aug. Ep. 137 § 6 *et putamus nobis de omnipotentia Dei incredibile dici aliquid, cum dicitur Verbum Dei, per quod omnia facta sunt, sic desumpsisse corpus ex uirgine...ut a sinu Patris, id est a secreto, quo cum illo et in illo est, non recesserit.* § 10 f. *homo quippe Deo accessit, non Deus a se recessit.*

p. 70 l. 4 PRAEDICABATVR c. 18 p. 58 l. 17 *quos diximus praedicatores prophetae de officio praefandi uocantur.* infr. p. 70 l. 18 *manifestius praedicatum sperant.* infr. p. 72 l. 8 *id super Christo praedicatum non scierunt.* De Fug. in Persec. 6 a. m. *atquin persecutiones eos passuros praedicabat et tolerandas docebat.* 12 p. m. *persecutiones praedicatas non praecaueret.* Adu. Iud. 13 pr. *igitur quoniam filii Israel affirmant, nos errare recipiendo Christum, qui iam uenit, praescribamus eis ex ipsis scripturis, iam uenisse Christum, qui praedicabatur, quamuis ex temporibus Danielis praedicantis probauerimus,* cet. Adu. Marc. IV 1 p. 423 l. 17 sq. Kr. Lact. Diu. Instt. IV 12 § 3 cites psalm of Solomon (not found there) [but it is, as we know now, in the 'Odes' of Solomon 19 v. 6 A. S.]. Is. VII 14. (Is. VII 10 seq. cited by Cypr. Test. II 9.)

Here and De Carne Christi 5. 18, Adu. Prax. 27 no express mention of Christ's human soul (Ziegler Irenaeus 244 n. 1), but elsewhere, e.g. [adu. Prax. 30 A. S.].

p. 70 l. 5 DELAPSVS Cypr. De Idolor. Van. 11 *hic in uirginem delabitur, carnem Spiritus Sanctus induitur, Deus cum homine miscetur, hic Deus noster, hic Christus est.*

p. 70 l. 6 MIXTVS Pusey. Aug. Ep. 137 § 11 throughout, e.g. *nam si anima in sua natura non fallatur, incorpoream se esse comprehendit: multo magis incorporeum est Verbum Dei, ac per hoc Verbi Dei et animae credibilior debuit esse permixtio, quam animae et corporis.*

p. 70 l. 8 INTERIM 'provisionally' cf. 8 pr.

SIMILIS EST VESTRIS Tatian 21 p. 159[cd] *οὐ γὰρ μωραίνομεν, ἄνδρες Ἕλληνες, οὐδὲ λήρους ἀπαγγέλλομεν, θεὸν ἐν ἀνθρώπου μορφῇ γεγονέναι καταγγέλλοντες...διόπερ ἀποβλέψαντες πρὸς τὰ οἰκεῖα ἀπομνημονεύματα κἂν ὡς ὁμοίως μυθολογοῦντας ἀποδέξασθε.* Orig. contr. Cels. I 37 (cl. Tert. Adu. Valent. 10. Spencer ad l. c.) compares the parthenogenesis of vultures, and the virgin mother of Plato. Iustin. Apol. I 21 *τῷ δὲ τὸν Λόγον, ὅ ἐστι πρῶτον γέννημα τοῦ Θεοῦ, ἄνευ ἐπιμιξίας φάσκειν ἡμᾶς γεγεννῆσθαι Ἰησοῦν Χριστόν,...οὐ παρὰ τοὺς παρ' ὑμῖν λεγομένους υἱοὺς τῷ Διὶ καινόν τι φέρομεν.* cf. 54.

p. 70 l. 9 QVI PENES VOS cf. c. 22. 47 p. 134 l. 10 *omnia aduersus ueritatem de ipsa ueritate constructa sunt, operantibus aemulationem istam spiritibus erroris.*

p. 70 l. 10 PRAEMINISTRAVERINT De Anim. 58 p. 394 l. 22 Wiss. Adu. Marc. IV 14 p. 461 l. 15 Kr. V 6 p. 589 l. 10 Kr. 18 p. 641 l. 14 Kr. Ad nat. I 7 p. 70 l. 11 Wiss. II 3 p. 98 l. 8 Wiss. Ad Vxor. I 2 f. De Paenit. 2 m. De Bapt. 10 p. 209 l. 11 Wiss. (Oehler ind.). Apul. Met. I 7. II 11. VI 15 f. 26 (p. 325 Price) VII 11.

p. 70 l. 11 Adu. Iud. 7 p. 713 5 *uenturum enim Christum et Iudaeos non refutare scimus, utpote qui in aduentum eius spem suam porrigant.* Cypr. De Idolor. Van. 12 *sciebant et Iudaei Christum esse uenturum, nam hic illis semper prophetis monentibus adnuntiabatur.* Kaye 203.

p. 70 l. 12 Adu. Iud. 7 and 14.

p. 70 l. 13 Tzschirner 184. Clem. Recogn. I 43 50 f. Hier. Prol. in Ierem. c. 30 (V 282 ed. 1684). Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. c. 8 p. 226 the Messiah still to come. c. 32 p. 249 with victory, not on the cross. c. 49 p. 268 Elias has not yet come. Isaiah 7 not a *virgin*, but a *young woman* shall conceive. (Iustin. c. Tryph. c. 67 p. 291 cf. Iustin. Apol. I 43.) Isaiah 52—53 (the sufferer) explained by a Jew, with whom Origen (contr. Cels. I c. 55 p. 42) argued, of the Jewish nation.

CONPVLSATIO c. 38, cf. *conpulso* c. 20.

p. 70 l. 14 DVOBVS ADVENTIBVS. Adu. Iud. 14 pr. Adu. Marc. III 7 pr. *duos dicimus Christi habitus a prophetis demonstratos totidem aduentus eius praenotasse: unum in humilitate, utique primum, cum tamquam ouis ad uictimam deduci habebat...quae ignobilitatis argumenta primo aduentui competunt, sicut sublimitatis secundo.* Orig. contr. Cels. I c. 56 p. 43 l. 13 Spencer. II 29 pr. Clem. Recogn. I 43. 49. 50 f. Iren. IV 22 § 2. Cypr. De Idolor. Van. 12 *sed significato duplici eius aduentu, uno qui exercitio et exemplo hominis fungeretur, altero qui deum fateretur, non intellegendo primum aduentum, quod in passione praecessit occultus, unum tantum credunt qui erit in potestate manifestus. quod autem hoc Iudaeorum populus intellegere non potuit, delictorum meritum fuit. sic erant sapientiae et intellegentiae caecitate multati, ut qui uita indigni essent, haberent uitam ante oculos nec uiderent.* Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. 8 p. 226[b] (above). 14 p. 232[d]. Apol. I 52 p. 87[a] (Otto's n. p. 139 n. 4). Lact. Diu. Instt. IV 16 § 13 *non credebant filium Dei esse, ignorantes duos eius aduentus a prophetis esse praedictos, primum in humilitate carnis obscurum, secundum in fortitudine maiestatis manifestum.* Tzschirner 295 sq.

p. 70 l. 15 EXPVNCTVS [c. 2 n. A. S.] 15 p. 52 l. 3. 35 p. 102 l. 23 n. 48 p. 138 l. 31. Adu. Iud. 11 fin. *post quem habebant expungi quae nuntiabantur.* 12 fin. *quae si per Christum euenniunt, non in alium erunt prophetata, quam per quem expuncta consideramus.* Ad Martyr. 6. Scorpiac. 10 p. 169 l. 9 Wiss. Ad nat. I 7 p. 71 l. 7 Wiss.

p. 70 l. 16 CONDITIONIS HVMANAE cf. adu. Iud. 14 (p. 741).

p. 70 l. 17 EXSERTAE cf. 37 a. m. p. 108 l. 5 *hostes exsertos non tantum uindices occultos.* Stat. Silu. V 2 39 *bello.* Ad

Vxor. II 1 *exserte iubet.* Cypr. p. 398 16 H. *exertum ac seminudum pectus,* p. 420 11 *exerte atque aperte.*

p. 70 l. 22 FRVGE c. 40 f. p. 271 1 Oehler *ab omni uitae fruge dilati.*

p. 70 l. 24 SEQVEBATVR VTI Senec. De Benef. VII 11 1. Cicero Orat. §§ 75. 191. 221. Cf. *restat, superest.* [So with *consequitur, consequens est,* very frequently. A. S.]

MAGVM c. 23 p. 82 l. 7 n. Adu. Marc. III 6 p. 385 l. 24 Kr. *planum in signis.* Aug. Contr. Faust. XII 45 p. m. *quia etsi attestabantur miracula, non defuissent (sicut adhuc nunc quidam mussitant) qui magicae potentiae cuncta illa tribuerent, nisi talis eorum cogitatio contestatione prophetica uinceretur.* De Ciu. Dei XVIII 53. Cons. Euang. I c. 9 § 14 sq. (Christ wrote magic books). cf. c. 14 § 22. Clem. Recogn. I 42 fin. 58. Euseb. Demonstr. Euang. III c. 6. 7 § 3 (Oehler says falsely Praep. Euang. III 8). Real wizards Simon and Menander (Euseb. Hist. Eccl. III 26), Saturninus and Basilides (IV 7). Hippolytus Haer. VII 1—28. Apul. [metam., apologia passim]. [Ign.] Philipp. 4. 5 Lightf. vol. II pp. 777 13. 778 28. Epist. Pilati ad Claudium, Euangel. Nicodemi 2 A and B. Tischend. Euangel. Apocr. 2nd ed. pp. 216. 223. 288—293 sexies. Tischend. Apocal. Apocr. p. 143. Apocryphal gospels (Proteuangelium Iacobi, Euangelium Infantiae, Tzschirner 158 seq.) teem with miracles. (See below.) Arn. (Tzsch. 133—4) I 42. 48. 50—3. II 11. 12 the chariot and fiery horses of Simon Magus dispersed by Peter's breath. Demonstration of spirit and of power, Orig. contr. Cels. I c. 2 p. 5. 2 f. ἴχνη remains of miracles in his day. Moral distinction between miracles and magic (Tzschirner 152—3) I 39. 68. (Egyptian magic) 71. II 9 f. 14 f. 16 p. 70 fin. 48 the prophets foretold miracles. 49—51. III 1 fin. 8. 9. 23 fin. 24. 25. 27. 28. VI 42. VIII 47 f. Jews converted by miracles rather than by the argument of unlearned apostles. Spencer annotat. on Orig. contr. Cels. pp. 6 and 7. Sueton. Nero 16 *afflicti suppliciis Christiani, genus hominum superstitionis prauae ac maleficae.* Ἰουδαίοις συμμαχεῖ εἰς ἄρνησιν τοῦ σταυροῦ. Ἕλλησιν εἰς συκοφαντίαν μαγείας [whence? A. S.]. Cypr. De Idol. Van. c. 4. c. 13 *itaque cum Christus Iesus secundum a prophetis ante praedicta uerbo et uocis imperio daemonia* (cf.

Bingham I 2. 5) *de hominibus excuteret, paralyticos restringeret, leprosos purgaret, inluminaret caecos, clodis gressum daret. mortuos rursus animaret, cogeret sibi elementa famulari, seruire uentos, maria oboedire, inferos cedere, Iudaei, qui illum crediderant hominem tantum de humilitate carnis et corporis, existimabant magum de licentia potestatis.* Edm. Le Blant Recherches sur l'accusation de magie dirigée contre les premiers chrétiens, Nogent le Rotrou, 1869, 8vo. Kortholt 474—487 'de magia Christo huiusque cultoribus exprobrata.' Lact. Diu. Instt. II 16. IV 13. 16. 15. 1. V 3 § 9 sq. 18. Marcellinus Augustino Ep. 136 (4) § 1 f. (II 598[d] Gaume) *Apollonium suum nobis et Apuleium aliosque magicae artis homines in medium proferant quorum maiora* (than Christ's) *contendunt exstitisse miracula.* Cf. Tzschirner 44 45 (Matt. 9 34. 12 24. Luke 11 17). Eisenmenger's Entdecktes Iudenthum I 148—168 either an enchanter, who learnt magic in Egypt, or one who wrought miracles by the Schem Hamphorash, 'den erklärten Namen Jehovahs,' Tzschirner Gesch. Apol. 149 ff. Iustin. Apol. I. 24 work by help of demons. 30. 34, cf. 73 Simon Magus. II 6 (cf. Matt. 9 32 sq. 12 22 sq. with parallels) regards miracles rather as a fulfilment of prophecy. Dial. c. Tryph. 69, p. 295. 6. Minuc. 26 § 9. Quadratus (Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IV 3) appealed to Christ's miracles. Hippolytus (I 268 Fabr.) preserved by Theodoret, Eranistes, attaches weight to the evidence of miracles.

p. 70 l. 25 VERBO Matt. 8 16.

RELVMINARET De Carne Chr. 4 p. m., De Anima 34 p. 359 l. 14 Wiss.

p. 70 l. 26 LEPROSOS RW has Prudent. Sedul. add Tert. De Pudic. 20 p. 267 l. 8 Wiss. Adu. Marc. IV 9 p. 443 l. 20 Kr. Vulg. Hier. Ep. 121 1 (852[c]). In Eccl. 10 p. 472 cet. Greg. Turon. Hist. Francor. I 19. [I have 5 exx. from Ambst. and 5 from Aug. A. S.]

p. 70 l. 27 FAMVLARET c. 39 p. 114 l. 23 *affectant ad gloriam famulandae libertatis.* Cf. Oehler on the present passage.

p. 70 l. 29 λόγον. On T.'s knowledge of Greek Kaye 61. On the doctrine ib. 517 n. 1 519 n. 9.

p. 70 l. 31 AD DOCTRINAM cet. hence Cypr. De Idol. Van. 13 fin. *hunc magistri eorum atque primores, hoc est, quos et*

doctrina ille et sapientia reuincebat, accensa ira et indignatione prouocati insecuti sunt et postremum detentum Pontio Pilato, qui tunc ex parte Romana Syriam procurabat, tradiderunt, crucem eius et mortem suffragiis uiolentis ac pertinacibus flagitantes.

REVINCEBANTVR c. 1 p. 2 l. 21. De Testim. Anim. 1 pr. Oehler. De Virg. Veland. 1 pr. Lucr. IV 489 *an confutabunt nares oculiue reuincent?*

p. 70 l. 32 PRIMORES...MVLTITVDO Lact. IV 16 § 5 *ergo cum magnus populus ad eum uel ob iustitiam quam docebat, uel ob miracula quae faciebat, subinde conflueret...tum primores Iudaeorum et sacerdotes ira stimulati, quod ab eo tamquam peccatores increpabantur et inuidia deprauati quod confluente ad eum multitudine contemni se ac deseri uidebant,...coierunt aduersus eum impiumque consilium de eo tollendo cruciandoque ceperunt.*

p. 72 l. 1 SYRIAM *Iudaeam.* Ios. Antiq. XVIII 3 § 1, 4 § 2 Vitellius governor of Syria, yet Cypr. Quod Idola cet. 13 f. (quoted above) *Pontio Pilato, qui tunc ex parte Romana Syriam procurabat.* Lactant. Diu. Instt. IV 18 § 4 *Pontio Pilato, qui tum legatus Syriam regebat.* Epit. 40 (45) § 8 *Pontius Pilatus, qui tum legatus in Syriam iudicabat.* (In A.D. 30 there was no acting *legatus*; hence none named in Luke 3 1.) Harnack Gesch. d. altchristl. Lit. (1893) I 865.

p. 72 l. 3 PRAEDIXERAT Cypr. De Idolor. Van. 14 *hoc facturos et ipse praedixerat et prophetarum omnium testimonium sic ante praecesserat, oportere illum pati...Fidem itaque rerum cursus impleuit. nam et crucifixus praeuento carnificis officio spiritum sponte dimisit, et die tertio rursus a mortuis sponte surrexit.* Iustin. Apol. I 14 had foretold the sufferings of his disciples. Orig. contr. Cels. I c. 62 p. 49 cites Matth. 9 37 (great harvest, few reapers). II c. 13 pp. 68 9 cites Matth. 10 18 (ye shall be brought before kings and rulers). Matth. 24 14 (gospel preached in all the world). Luke 21 20 (Jerusalem besieged).

PARVM SI c. 6 p. 134 l. 2 Oehler with n. g. De Fug. in Persec. 13 p. 489 l. 4 up. De Idolol. 7 p. 36 l. 17 Wiss. Lact. I 10 § 12. *parum est* c. inf. Iuu. 15 166 n.

p. 72 l. 4 SVFFIXVS Lips. De Cruce I 3. Lact. Diu. Instt. IV

26 § 32 *suffixus itaque quia spiritum deposuerat, necessarium carnifices non putauerunt ossa eius suffringere, sicut mos eorum ferebat.* Cypr. De Idol. Van. (= Quod idola di non sint), 14, quoted above. Orig. contr. Cels. II 16 p. 71 *καὶ τάχα διὰ τοῦτο* (Ioan. 10 18) *προλαβὼν ἐξελήλυθεν ἀπὸ τοῦ σώματος, ἵνα αὐτὸ τηρήσῃ καὶ μὴ καταχθῇ τὰ σκέλη, ὡς τὰ τῶν σὺν αὐτῷ σταυρωθέντων λῃστῶν.* III 32 p. 130 (Ioan. 10 18) *καὶ κράξας φωνῇ μεγάλῃ, ἀφῆκε τὸ πνεῦμα· προλαβὼν τοὺς ἐπὶ τῶν ἀνεσκολοπισμένων δημίους, ὑποτέμνοντας τὰ σκέλη τῶν σταυρουμένων, καὶ διὰ τοῦθ' ὑποτέμνοντας, ἵνα μὴ ἐπὶ πλέον τιμωρίαν τίσωσιν.*

p. 72 l. 5 CVM VERBO: Bünem. on Lact. IV 15 § 22 cites *sub uerbo* and *uerbum, in uerbo* and the common *cum dicto.*

p. 72 l. 6 MEDIVM ORBEM Wetstein N. T. tom. I p. 539. Keim III 438 n. 3. Speech of Lucian the martyr in Rufin. Hist. Eccl. IX 6 f. *solem uobis ipsum horum produco testem: qui cum haec fieri per impios uideret in terris, lumen suum meridie abscondit in caelo. requirite in annalibus uestris, inuenietis temporibus Pilati, Christo patiente, fugato sole interruptum tenebris diem* (of course no astronomical eclipse (Sepp, Leben Christi I² 298)). Clem. Recogn. I 41 *cum pateretur, omnis ei compassus est mundus.* Cf. 42.

SIGNANTE Senec. Cons. ad Marc. 18 § 2 *solem cottidiano cursu diei noctisque spatia signantem.* Cic. Tuscul. I 28 § 68 *lunam festorum signantem...dies.* Manil. Astr. I 596 *et per quinque notat signantes tempora fines.* [Cf. Lucan II 645. A. S.]

p. 72 l. 7 DELIQVIVM. Add to lexx. [even to Thes. A. S.] Ad Scap. 3 m. p. 544 l. 2 (Plin. Seru. Fest. [etc. see Thes. A. S.]) Acta Pilati in Thilo Cod. Apocr. N. T. (1832) I 809 *σκότος ἐγένετο ἐφ' ὅλην τὴν οἰκουμένην, τοῦ ἡλίου κρυβέντος τελείου καὶ τοῦ πόλου σκοτεινοῦ φαινομένου ἡμέρας οὔσης.* Iul. Africanus in Syncellus (Routh Reliq. II 297—8 and nn. 477—480). No eclipse except at the time of new moon. Daillé I 4 p. 26 sq. no eclipse. Cramer's Cat. Matth. 27 45. [Dionys. Areopag.] Ep. 7 § 3 ad Polycarpum (I 1081ᶜ Migne) and 12 ad Apolloph. (opp. II 91). Cf. Amos 8 9. Jer. 15 9. Rev. 6 12. Sib. I 372—5. VIII 232 (cf. Aug. De Ciu. Dei XVIII 23. Const. ad sanct. coet. 2 18). Athan. Ep. ad Epictet. 10 fin. (II 1068 A Migne) *διὰ τοῦτο*

γοῦν ὁ μὲν ἥλιος, ὁρῶν τὸν δημιουργὸν ἑαυτοῦ ἐν τῷ ὑβριζομένῳ σώματι ἀνεχόμενον, τὰς ἀκτῖνας συνέστειλε καὶ ἐσκότισε τὴν γῆν. Suid. s.u. Dionysius, *ἢ τὸ θεῖον πάσχει ἢ τῷ πάσχοντι συμπάσχει.* Aug. De Ciu. Dei III 3 (compares the eclipses at Romulus' death). Sun and moon as accessories of crucifixion from first cent. to renaissance. (Krause s. v. Sonne.) Oros. VII 3. Lardner (1829) VII 105—124 heathen pt 2 c. 13. Bayle. Chapman 1734—5. Clarke cited Phlegon in Boyle Lect. 1706 p. 325, but afterwards omitted him, e.g. 8th ed. 1732 p. 357.

p. 72 l. 8 PRAEDICATVM c. 48 p. 138 l. 20. Adu. Iud. 13 pr. (p. 736 l. 5) in this chap. twice. Adu. Marc. IV 10 a. m. bis, p. 445 ll. 25, 27 Kr. 42 p. 564 l. 16 Kr. Cypr. Ep. 63 2, 7, 8 cet. Migne CVI 48[d] Jahrbb. 1888 508—9. So *-ator* a prophet c. 18 p. 58 l. 17. Cypr. De Bon. Patient. 16. Adu. Iud. 10 f. p. 730 ult. *nam quod in passione eius accidit, ut media dies tenebresceret, Amos propheta adnuntiat, dicens: et erit, inquit, in die illa, dicit Dominus, occidet sol media die, tenebrescet super terram dies luminis...et ponam eum quasi luctum dilecti et eos qui cum illo quasi diem maeroris...et ut prophetiae implerentur, properauit dies uesperam facere, id est tenebras efficere, quae media die factae sunt.* Lactant. IV 18 § 3 cites Amos 8 9, 10 and § 4 Jer. 15 9 (from Cypr. Testim. II 23 (p. 91)) as the source of Matth. 27 45. De Ieiun. 10 p. 287 l. 21 Wiss. *itaque in eam usque horam celebranda pressura est, in qua a sexta contenebratus orbis defuncto domino lugubre fecit officium, ut tunc et nos reuertamur ad iucunditatem, cum et mundus recepit claritatem.* Amos l. c. cited also Aug. Ep. 199 § 34 = De Ciu. Dei III 15. Breu. Rom. Oct. 9 lect. IV *Dionysius...cum adhuc in gentilitatis errore uersaretur, eo die quo Christus Dominus cruci affixus est, solem praeter naturam defecisse animaduertens, exclamasse traditur: 'aut Deus naturae patitur, aut mundi machina dissoluetur.'* Whiston Testimony of Phlegon vindicated. Lond. 1732, with replies by A. A. Sykes (1733—4). Seru. ad Verg. Georg. I 465 ff. (*solem quis dicere falsum audeat?...ille etiam exstincto miseratus Caesare Romam cum caput obscura nitidum ferrugine texit...insolitis tremuerunt motibus Alpes*) *constat occiso Caesare in senatu prid. Id. Mart. solis fuisse defectum ab hora sexta usque ad noctem.* A whole year Plut. Iul. Caes. 69 p. 741. Plin. II 30 § 98. At

the death of Aug., Dio LVI 29. Euang. Nicod. c. 11 p. 592 Thilo, Pilate to the Jews: *ἐθεωρήσατε τὰ γενόμενα; οἱ δὲ εἶπον αὐτῷ· Ἔκλειψις ἡλίου γέγονε κατὰ τὸ εἰωθός.* Pilate in one MS (cf. Theophyl. and in c. Euthym. Zig. 27, 45) replied not possible. Phlegon in C. Müller Fr. III 606 n. 15 (Ὀλυμπιάδες ἢ Χρονικά). Orig. contr. Cels. II 33 fin. p. 80 (XVIII 187 Lomm.) 59 pr. p. 96. 14 p. 69 (Jesus a prophet), cites Phlegon, but Hom. 35 in Matt. he says that Phlegon's (Syncell. I 614 Bonn) eclipse cannot be that meant in the gospel. (So Basnage Annal. A.D. 29 and 31 vol. I p. 249. Voss Harm. Euang. II c. 10. Mosheim Orig. Cels. transl. p. 197—8.) Tzschirner 104 sq. 114—5. Wetst. and [?] on Matt. 27 45 (cf. Joel 2 10). All the evidence collected by Clinton Fast. Rom. II 279—280.

p. 72 l. 9 RELATVM IN ARCANIS VESTRIS. In Adu. Marc. IV 7 p. 435 ll. 12 ff. Kr. Tert. appeals to the census in the Roman archives. Kaye 148—150. For phrase cf. *in acta referre.* Iuu. 2 136 *in litteras.* Arnob. IV 14 *in tabulas.* Cic. often 'to enter, register.'

p. 72 l. 13 SVSPECTOS suspicious (Cat. Dist. IV 43 2 in lexx. *nam timidis et suspectis aptissima mors est*). Apul. Metam. IX 20. Tert. Adu. Marc. V 3 p. 575 l. 14 Kr. Adu. Valentin. 21 fin. Amm. XXIX 4 § 5. Bed. I 15 f. Baron. 601 20. Claud. 4 Cons. Hon. 278 *neu dubie suspectus agas neu falsus amicis.* With *ne* Greg. Turon. Hist. Francor. IX 3. With acc. Spart. Seu. 15 § 5. So *ὕποπτος* Eur. *τὸ -ον* Thuc. Ind. Oehler.

p. 72 l. 16 sq. Tzschirner 46. Matth. 27 64. 28 12—15. Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. 108 § 2 p. 335. Eisenmenger's Entdecktes Iudenthum I 193—4. Toledóth Iéschu says, Judas stole the body and buried it in his garden. Rabbi Abraham Pèrizol in his book Màggen Abraham (against Christianity) says the disciples stole the body in the Sabbath night, while the Jews were busy with their meetings and with eating the Paschal lamb.

p. 72 l. 20 NE Lact. Diu. Instt. IV 20 § 1 *profectus ergo in Galilaeam* (*noluit enim se Iudaeis ostendere, ne adduceret eos ad paenitentiam atque impios resanaret*), *discipulis iterum congregatis scripturae sacrae litteras, id est prophetarum arcana patefecit.* So, answering the question why Pythagoras and

Plato, who went in quest of religion to the Egyptians, Magi, and Persians, did not seek it among the Jews, he says (IV 2 § 5) *sed auersos esse arbitror diuina prouidentia, ne scire possent ueritatem, quia nondum fas erat alienigenis hominibus religionem dei ueri iustitiamque notescere.* Celsus in Orig. II 78 pr. makes the Jew ask: 'ἢ ἐπὶ τούτῳ κατῆλθεν, ἵν' ἀπιστήσωμεν;' πρὸς ὃν λελέξεται, οὐκ ἐπὶ τούτῳ μὲν ἦλθεν, ἵν' ἐργάσηται τὴν ἀπιστίαν Ἰουδαίοις· προγιγνώσκων δ' αὐτὴν ἐσομένην προεῖπε.

p. 72 l. 23 Cypr. De Idolor. Van. 7 § 5 *ad dies quadraginta remoratus est, ut de eo ad praecepta uitalia instrui possent, et discerent quae docerent.*

p. 72 l. 24 Kaye 331 1. 215 n. 2.

CIRCVMFVSA Cypr. De Idol. Van. 7 § 6 *tunc in caelum circumfusa nube sublatus est.* Lact. Diu. Instt. IV 21 § 1 *ordinato uero discipulis suis euangelio ac nominis sui praedicatione circumfudit se repente nubes eumque in caelum sustulit quadragesimo post passionem die.*

p. 72 l. 25 Tert. De Spectac. 30 p. 20 l. 20 Wiss. *ubi gaudeam, ubi exsultem, tot spectans reges, qui in caelum recepti nuntiabantur, cum Ioue ipso et ipsis suis testibus in imis tenebris congemescentes?* Sueton. Aug. 100 *nec defuit uir praetorius, qui se effigiem cremati euntem in caelum uidisse iuraret.* Cf. D. Cass. LVI 46 § 2 (Numerius Atticus. Dio refers to Proculus). Liuius Geminius, a senator, swore the same oath as a witness of Drusilla's ascension (A.D. 38) Dio LIX 11 § 4. Sen. Apocolocynt. 1 § 2 (Drusilla). On the eagle in consecrations cf. Artemidor. II 20.

p. 72 l. 26 PROCVLI ad nat. II 7 p. 106 l. 17 Wiss. *inrideri peierantes.* Aug. De Ciu. Dei III 15 Haverc. Arnob. I 41. Lactant. I 15 § 32. So respecting the visible ascension of emperors Tatian 10 p. 149[d]. Minuc. 21 § 9 (= Cypr. Quod idola di non sint 4 p. 21 6) *nisi forte post mortem deos fingitis et periurante Proculo deus Romulus.* Liu. I 16. Plut. Romulus 28. Iustin. Apol. I 21. Apol. II c. 14 p. 52. Tert. Adu. Marc. IV 7 p. 434 l. 5 Kr. *indignum denique, ut Romulus quidem ascensus sui in caelum habuerit Proculum adfirmatorem.* Schwegler I p. 520 l. 9. 531 l. 10 A.V. Pilatus c. 5 p. 18 l. 26 n. cited by Iustin. Apol. I 35. 48 pp. 76 c. 84 c. On the Acts of Pilate,

Cotelier on c. 3 n. 2 of Acta Martyr. Ignat. (vol. II ed. 1698 p. 162). Blasphemous acta Pilati cited A.D. 304 by the judge of Andronicus, c. 9 (Ruinart p. 485), perhaps by the judge of Theodotus, c. 23 (Ruinart 365), was distributed broadcast by order of Maximin A.D. 311, read aloud and placarded on walls and taught to children in schools (Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IX 5 § 1). Cf. Allard Persécution de Dioclétien II 183—6. Tzschirner 115 sq. Iustin. Apol. I 45, 63. The gospels do not state that Pilate heard of the resurrection. The two Latin letters of Pilate to Tiberius (Fabric. Cod. N. T. Apocr. III 456). From such sources the Euang. Nicodemi (ib. I 238) was compiled. Another version of Pilate's letter to Tiberius and one of Tiberius to Pilate, from a Vienna MS, to be published by Birch among apocryphal writings of N. T. (Tzschirner 117—8). Aurel. Victor Epitome 16 § 14 *et quod de Romulo aegre creditum est, omnes pari sensu praesumpserunt, Marcum caelo receptum esse* (on *caelo rec.* see Arntzen). Pearson Lect. in Acta Apost. III 4 (Minor Theological Works I 341—3). ad nat. I 10 m. (I 77 26 Wiss.) *manifeste coram populo non peieraret contemplator* [caelit- *or* homin-]-*is in caelum recepti, nisi contemneret quos deieraret.* In De Praescrip. Haer. 36 pr. he refers to the *authenticae litterae* (autographs) preserved in the apostolic churches. Kaye 103.

p. 72 l. 27 CAESARI TVNC TIBERIO cf. 2 p. 8 l. 2 *tunc Traianum imperatorem.* Adu. Prax. I p. 228 l. 6 Kr. *tunc episcopum Romanum.* Paulin. Vit. Ambr. 5. 8. 26. 31 bis, 34 bis (*missis militibus tunc ab Stilichone comite...quod ubi uidit tunc Stilicho comes*). In Adu. Iud. 9 (II 719 Oehler) T. gives the day, month, year of the crucifixion. All the notices from Tert. collected by Clinton Fast. Rom. A.D. 29 and Keim III 480—2. Pilate cited by Greg. Turon. I 21. Cf. Acta Andronici ap. Baron. Ann. 290 n. 26. Harnack Die Ueberlieferung u. d. Bestand der altchristl. Lit. bis Euseb. Leipz. 1893 I 21—22 a saint in the Ethiopic calendar 25 June, the Copts make a martyr of him. Cf. Leyrer Pilatus (Herzog-Plitt s.v. Pilatus).

p. 72 l. 30 POTVISSENT Ignat. Ep. ad Smyrn. 6 rulers visible and invisible, if they believe not in the blood of Christ, await judgement. Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. 39 p. 258[cd] *καὶ διὰ τοῦτο*

διστάζετε ὁμολογῆσαι ὅτι οὗτός ἐστιν ὁ Χριστός, ὡς αἱ γραφαὶ ἀποδεικνύουσι καὶ τὰ φαινόμενα καὶ τὰ γινόμενα ἐπὶ τῷ ὀνόματι αὐτοῦ, ἵνα μὴ διώκησθε ὑπὸ τῶν ἀρχόντων, οἳ οὐ παύσονται ἀπὸ τῆς τοῦ πονηροῦ καὶ πλάνου πνεύματος, τοῦ ὄφεως, ἐνεργείας θανατοῦντες καὶ διώκοντες τοὺς τὸ ὄνομα τοῦ Χριστοῦ ὁμολογοῦντας, ἕως πάλιν παρῇ καὶ καταλύσῃ πάντας καὶ τὸ κατ' ἀξίαν ἑκάστῳ προσνείμῃ.

p. 72 l. 31 PER ORBEM omn. Adu. Iud. 7 p. 713 Oehler, Britain, Spain, Gaul cet. p. 714 the only universal empire.

p. 72 l. 32 IVDAEIS on the Jews as the chief instigators of persecutions Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. 17 Otto p. 234^{e}. 16 Otto p. 234^{bc}. Orig. Contr. Cels. VI 27 f. Tert. Scorp. 10 p. 168 l. 12 Wiss. *synagogas Iudaeorum fontes persecutionum.* Bingham vol. I (1855 Oxf.) p. 13. Zahn Forschungen V 170.

p. 72 l. 33 NERONIS c. 5 p. 18 l. 31 n. Scorp. 15 p. 178 l. 11 Wiss. *uitas Caesarum legimus; orientem fidem Romae primus Nero cruentauit* cet. Prud. Symm. II 669—71 *illius <Iouis> instinctu primus Nero matre perempta sanguinem apostolicum bibit ac me strage piorum polluit et proprium facinus mihi saeuus iussit.* Lact. m. p. 2. Kaye 105 n. 8.

p. 74 l. 1 SEMINAVERVNT 50 f. *semen est sanguis Christianorum.*

p. 74 l. 2 MVLTVM EST Clem. Recogn. I 45 *multum est ire per singula.*

p. 74 l. 5 SECTAE h. c. pr. p. 66 l. 14.

p. 74 l. 8 CVLTVRAM c. 16 p. 52 l. 29. Scorp. 2 f. (I 150 16 Wiss.) *ab omni factura atque cultura idolorum cauere.* Adu. Marc. I 5 p. 297 l. 5 Kr. uulg. Minuc. 23 § 12 Halm. Lact. Diu. Instt. V 7 § 2. Epit. 23 § 1. Apul. Met. XI 22. Hier. Ep. 78 mansio 1 f. (471 *b*) *peruersarum doctrinarum.* Rufin. in Num. 17 1. Cassian Inst. II 5 cet. [More in Thes. A. S.] Firmic. Matern. Mathes. VIII 26 l. 92 *aeterna* [but text doubtful. vol. II p. 339 l. 14, ed. Kroll-Skutsch-Ziegler, Lips. 1913. A. S.]. Prud. Psychom. 28—9 *ecce lacessentem conlatis uiribus audet | prima ferire Fidem ueterum cultura deorum,* cet. cet. [Ps.-Aug. A. S.]

p. 74 l. 11 VOCIFERAMVR c. 2 p. 10 l. 8 *uociferatur homo, Christianus sum.*

p. 74 l. 12 HOMINEM PVTATE argumentum ad hominem, as Iustin. Apol. I 22 pr. 'The Son of God, called Jesus, may well enough be called the Son of God on account of his wisdom, even if he be but a mere man, for all writers call God the Father of gods and men' (Blunt Right Use 188—9).

PER EVM cf. l. 13 *per hominem Moysen.*

p. 74 l. 14 Tert. De Anim. 2 p. 301 l. 7 Wiss. *quia plerosque auctores etiam deos existimauit antiquitas.* l. 11 *ut Orpheum, ut Musaeum.* ib. 46 p. 337 l. 10 *nam et oraculis hoc genus stipatus est orbis, ut...Trophoni in Boeotia.* Trophonius at Lebadea (Lucian Dial. Mort. 10 3). Bouché-Leclercq Hist. de la divin. dans l'antiquité III 321—332. Aemil. Paullus 167 B.C. (Liu. XLV 27 § 8) *Lebadiae quoque templum Iouis Trophonii adit. ibi cum uidisset os specus, per quod oraculo utentes sciscitatum deos descendunt.* Welcker Götterlehre III 122—3 'der Nährende.' Cic. De Nat. Deor. III § 49 n. (p. 134) temple taxed.

ORPHEVS [Iustin.] Cohort. ad Graec. c. 36 37, and Musaeus, unknown to Homer. Ibycus, Simonides, and Pindar name Orpheus. Maury III 300—337. Preller in Pauly. Bouché-Leclercq II Musaeus 110—2 Orpheus 113—5. Both in Plato Republ. 364e. Busts of Christ and Orpheus, Abraham, Pythagoras and Apollonius Tyaneus in the chapel of Alex. Seu. Vit. 29 2.

p. 74 l. 15 MELAMPVS Bouché-Leclercq II 13—19.

TROPHONIVS Plut. De Oracul. Defect. 5 p. 411e Boeotia, once vocal with oracles, has now been spent, like springs, and in Lebadea alone can you still receive a response; elsewhere there is deep silence—or desolation. id. De Genio Socrat. 21 fin.—23 (599^{a} sq.). Sulla 17 §§ 1 2. Max. Tyr. 14 § 2. Theodoret X § 3 p. 136—7 ἐν Λεβαδίᾳ μέν, Τροφωνίου. ib. § 46 all oracles dumb, T. among them. Plutarch and Dicaearchus on the or. lost. Philostrat. Vit. Apollon. VIII 19. Pausan. IX 39 §§ 2—14 (he himself consulted the oracle). Aristoph. Nub. 507 n. Tert. De Anim. 46 p. 377 l. 12 Wiss. (cited above) speaks of Tr. as still subsisting: he is the last author who names him. Dan. Clasenius [Theologia Gentilis?] Helmst. 1673 4to. Limburg-Brouwer VI 1—179. Dict. Ant. II^{2} 291. Preller in Pauly.

Müller Orchomenus 250—260. Wieseler Das Orakel des Trophonius 1848.

p. 74 l. 16 INITIATIONIBVS c. 7 p. 26 l. 8. LS cites 1 ex. Sueton. add h. l. Adu. Marc. IV 33 p. 532 l. 6 Kr. Hier. in Amos III (9 1) (R.W. cites Apul.) add Hier. in Abacuc I (2 15 sq.).

DOMINATORES Adu. Iud. 6 f. Adu. Marc. IV 20 pr. My note on Cic. De Nat. Deor. II § 4 (p. 69 f.). Many exx. in Sen. add Clem. Recogn. V 8 f. VII 28 pr. Prud. Apoth. 448 and 88. Lact. II 14 § 2. Hermae Pastor I Vis. II 2 cet. Aurel. Vict. Caes. 19 (Did. Iulian.) § 1. Sedul. V 209. Sil. XI 151. Greg. Tur. Glor. Mart. prooem. Bonifat. p. 225. Chromat. Contio I f. (V 989[c] Bibl. max. Patr.) [I have seven exx. from Aug. with 'cet.' added. A.S.]. Cf. Verg. Aen. I 282 *Romanos rerum dominos.*

p. 74 l. 17 c. 25 p. 88 l. 34 (cf. l. 21) De Praescr. Haeret. 40 a.m. (II 38 Oehler) *ceterum si Numae Pompilii superstitiones reuoluamus, si sacerdotalia officia et insignia et privilegia, si sacrificalia ministeria et instrumenta et uasa ipsa sacrificiorum ac piaculorum et uotorum curiositates consideremus, nonne manifeste diabolus morositatem illam Iudaicae legis imitatus est?* Arnob. II 12 (after speaking of the spread of the gospel) *ipsam denique apud dominam Romam, in qua cum homines essent Numae regis artibus atque antiquis superstitionibus occupati, non distulerunt tamen res patrias relinquere et ueritati coalescere Christianae* (cf. Elmenhorst ad loc.). VII 26 *religionibus artifex in commiscendis Numa.* IV 31 (cf. Cic. har. resp. § 23, a graphic picture of the painful preciseness of Roman ritual (*simpuuia* indicates Numa)). Lact. Diu. Instt. I 22 § 9 *Pompilius apud Romanos institutor ineptarum religionum fuit.* Cic. De Republ. II § 27 *sacrorum ipsorum diligentiam difficilem, apparatum perfacilem esse uoluit. nam quae perdiscenda quaeque obseruanda essent multa constituit, sed ea sine impensa.* Liu. I 21 § 1 *deorum adsidua insidens cura, cum interesse rebus humanis caeleste numen uideretur, ea pietate omnium pectora imbuerat.* Plut. Coriol. 25. Preller-Jordan ind. s.u. Numa (e.g. 'the apocryphal books of Numa,' B.C. 181 (II 368—372) burnt (7 Gr. 7 Lat.). I[2] 119—142). Marquardt III[2] 6 n. 3, 18 n. 9. Cf. Schwegler I 541.

Ambrosch üb. d. Religionsbücher der Röm. (Bonn 1843) 27—8. Lasaulx Studien p. 135 n. 213.

p. 74 l. 18 LICVERIT Adu. Iud. 9 m. (II 724 l. 5 Oehler) *licuit ergo et Christo Dei in psalmis sine bellicis rebus ense sermonis Dei praecingi.*

p. 74 l. 19 RVPICES lexx. cite Lucil. Gell. and 3 other exx. from Tert. (Apul. *rupico*). Cf. *stipes, lapis, saxum* in Otto Sprichwörter.

p. 74 l. 21 NVMA c. 25 p. 88 l. 34 *a Numa concepta est curiositas superstitiosa.* De Praescr. Haer. 40 cited above. Cic. Republ. II §§ 26 27 (above) V § 3 *illa diuturna pax Numae mater huic urbi iuris et religionis fuit.* Tac. An. III 26 *Numa religionibus et diuino iure populum deuinxit.*

p. 74 l. 22 Arnob. II 65 *ut enim di certi certas apud uos habent tutelas licentias potestates neque eorum ab aliquo id quod eius non sit potestatis ac licentiae postulatis, ita unius pontificium Christi est dare animis salutem et spiritum perpetuitatis adponere.*

VRBANITATE DECEPTOS cf. c. 17 p. 56 l. 20 (*anima*) *institutionibus prauis circumscripta.* esp. De Testim. Anim. 1 p. 135 l. 4 Wiss. Liu. I 19 § 4 *omnium primum rem ad multitudinem imperitam et illis saeculis rudem efficacissimam deorum metum iniciendum ratus est.*

p. 74 l. 23 OCVLARET Cypr. De Idolor. Vanit. 7 § 6 *discipuli...caecos et ignaros ad* agnitionem ueritatis ocularent. Tert. De Paenit. 12 m. (I 664 Oehler) *hirundo, si excaecauerit pullos, nouit illos oculare rursus de sua chelidonia.* De Pudic. 8 pr. (I 234 2 Wiss.) *in uestibus purpura oculandis.* Adu. Marc. IV 36 p. 546 l. 25 Kr. *fidem...melius oculatam.* [Ps.-Aug. Quaest. and in Matth. 2 exx. in my index, p. 562. A. S.] Vit. Cyprian. (p. XCII l. 8 Hartel) *nondum secunda natiuitas nouum hominem splendore toto diuinae lucis oculauerat.*

SI...EST c. 6 pr. n. infra c. 25 p. 86 l. 31 n. c. 42 p. 122 l. 8. Oehler on Ad Mart. 2 (both si in indir. interr. and indic. in or. obl.). Aug. Serm. 162 § 1 pr. *nescio si.* Bentley and Obbar on Hor. Ep. I 3 30. Cf. I 7 39. Liu. IV 20 § 8. XXX 16 § 13. Early authors indic. Dräger II 460 seq., poets and late Latin 474 sq. Petron. Apul. Gell. Hist.-Aug.-Scr. Lact. e.g. Diu.

In. IV 16 § 9 Bünem. (from Wisdom ii 17) *uideamus ergo si sermones illius ueri sunt.*

p. 74 l. 24 internal evidence c. 45. Cf. n. on p. 126 l. 20.

REFORMATVR supra p. 68 l. 8. Infr. c. 48 pr. p. 136 l. 13 *quis in quam bestiam reformari uideretur.* Cypr. p. 448 2 (sententiae episc. n. 29 f.). Orig. Contr. Cels. III 42 f. *τί τηλικοῦτον Ἀσκληπιὸς ἢ Διόνυσος ἢ Ἡρακλῆς εἰργάσαντο; καὶ τίνας ἕξουσιν ἀποδεῖξαι βελτιωθέντας τὰ ἤθη καὶ κρείττους γενομένους ἀπὸ τῶν λόγων καὶ τοῦ βίου αὐτῶν, ἵνα γένωνται θεοί;* Apul. Metam. XI 16 *ad hominem.*

p. 74 l. 25 RENVNTIETVR c. 38 n. p. 110 l. 14.

p. 74 l. 26 RATIONE c. 2 fin. *nomen (Christianum) quod quaedam ratio aemulae operationis insequitur...nomen illius aemulae rationis inimicum* (for OMNI Herald. *inani* or *aemula*).

DELITESCENS Lact. Diu. Instt. II 16 § 19 *sed illorum sunt isti lusus, qui sub nominibus mortuorum delitescentes, uiuentibus plagas tendunt. itaque siue illud periculum quod imminet uitari potest, uideri uolunt id placati auertisse; siue non potest, id agunt, ut propter illorum contemptum accidisse uideatur.*

p. 74 l. 27 ORACVLIS infr. c. 22. De Cult. Fem. I 2 pr. 3 pr. Socr. III 18. Clem. Alex. p. 1002 P. Bouché-Leclercq, Astrol. 606.

CAP. XXII

p. 74 l. 29 Kaye, 198, 200 seq.

p. 74 l. 30 DAEMONES cc. 23. 27. 37. Ad Scap. 2. De Praescr. Haer. 40. Lact. II 14 § 5. Euseb. Praep. Euang. IV 17 §§ 5 6. V 4 § 1. Minuc. 26 § 9 *eos spiritus daemonas esse poetae sciunt, philosophi disserunt, Socrates nouit, qui ad nutum et arbitrium adsidentis sibi daemonis uel declinabat negotia uel petebat.*

p. 74 l. 31 SOCRATE...A PVERITIA ADHAESISSE Plat. Apol. p. 31[d]. Phaedr. p. 242. Tert. Apol. 46 p. 128 l. 14 *Socratis uox est: 'si daemonium permittat.'* De Anim. 39 p. 366 l. 29 Wiss. *sic igitur et Socraten puerum adhuc spiritus daemonicus inuenit.* 1 p. 299 l. 23 Wiss. (*Socrati*) *aiunt daemonium a puero adhaesisse.* Lact. II 14 § 9 *et Socrates esse circa se assiduum daemona loquebatur, qui sibi a puero adhaesisset, cuius arbitrio et*

nutu sua uita regeretur. Epit. 28 § 2. Minuc. 26 § 9 cited above. Orig. c. Cels. VI 8. Cypr. Quod idola di non sint 6 (p. 23 15) *hos et poetae daemonas norunt et Socrates instrui se et regi ad arbitrium daemonii praedicabat* (the only reference in Cyprian to Socrates). Aug. De Ciu. Dei VIII 14 speaking of Apul. De Deo Socr. [especially De Philosophia Libri, but see Teubner indexes to all works. A.S.]. Cf. Plut. De Genio Socr. Max. Tyr. [Hobein's index, p. 507. A. S.].

AD ARBITRIVM Cic. pro Murena § 19 *uixit ad aliorum arbitrium, non ad suum.* Hor. Carm. III 6 40 *matris ad arbitrium recisos fustes,* so III 2 20. Suet. Tac.

p. 74 l. 32 DEHORTATORIVM only ex. in lexx. add Hieronym. in Ezech. VII 10. *-ator* add to lexx.; it occurs Aug. in Ps. 80 11 cet. [Thes. has Donat. (1 ex.) Aug. (1 ex.). A.S.]

p. 74 l. 33 POETAE Lact. II 14 § 7 *eos poetae et sciunt esse daemonas et loquuntur. Hesiodus ita tradit* (Opera et Dies 122—3) *οἱ μὲν δαίμονές εἰσι Διὸς μεγάλου διὰ βουλὰς ἐσθλοί, ἐπιχθόνιοι, φύλακες θνητῶν ἀνθρώπων* (cf. Minuc. 26 § 9 (cited on l. 30)).

p. 74 l. 34 De Test. Anim. 3 p. 137 l. 23 Wiss. *daemonium uocas hominem aut immunditia aut malitia aut insolentia aut quacumque macula, quam nos daemoniis deputamus, ad necessitatem odii importunum. Satanan denique in omni uexatione et aspernatione et detestatione pronuntias, quem nos dicimus malitiae angelum, totius erroris artificem,* where Rigault supposes that the interjection 'malum' (cf. malus = malignus, the Evil one) is meant. Heathen gods demons Keil Opusc. Acad. ed. Goldhorn II 584 601 often in Orig. Contr. Cels. III 2, who cited Psal. 95 5, the gods of the heathen *δαιμόνια.*

p. 76 l. 1 EXSECRAMENTI Vulg. and Adu. Iud. in lexx. Add Aug. Haer. 46. [Add Num. 5, 21 ap. Aug. quaest. hept. IV 11, Deut. 7. 26 ap. Aug. ep. 47, 3. A.S.]

PLATO cf., on demons, Tim. 40[de] cited by Athenag. 23. Lact. II 14 § 9 *philosophi quoque de his dixerunt; nam Plato etiam naturas eorum in Symposio exprimere conatus est.*

p. 76 l. 3 DE ANGELIS cet. Gen. vi 2. Iustin. Apol. II 5 (see Pusey p. 54 n. c. Zahn Forschungen II 301—2) *οἱ δ' ἄγγελοι, παραβάντες τήνδε τὴν τάξιν, γυναικῶν μίξεσιν ἡττή-*

θησαν καὶ παῖδας ἐτέκνωσαν, οἵ εἰσιν οἱ λεγόμενοι δαίμονες. Athenag. 24—5. Clem. Alex. Strom. v 1 § 10. Pseudo-Clem. Hom. vi 13. Lact. ii 14—15. Cf. Ioseph. Antiq. i 4. Tert. De Idolol. 9 p. 38 l. 10 Wiss. (Oehler's n. a p. 77) *unum propono, angelos esse illos desertores Dei, amatores feminarum.* Adu. Marc. v 18 fin. (p. 640 ll. 20—21 Kr.).

p. 76 l. 5 LITTERAS SANCTAS probably Enoch, which he cites De Cult. Fem. i 3 ii 10. De Idolol. 4 p. 33 l. 22 Wiss. 15 p. 48 l. 16 Wiss.: perh. however Gen. vi 2, Ashton. For Enoch cf. Orig. Contr. Cels. v 54 f. (Spencer's n. in Lommatzsch 269 270).

p. 76 l. 7 EVERSIO Minuc. 26 § 8 *ad solacium calamitatis suae non desinunt perditi iam perdere et depranati errorem prauitatis infundere et alienati a Deo inductis prauis religionibus a Deo segregare.* Lact. ii 14 § 11 *solacium perditionis suae perdendis hominibus operantur.* 16 §§ 9. 20, 17 § 10. Epit. 27 § 11. [Cf. also Ps.-Aug. Quaest. 110 § 1, 127 § 11, 2 nov. 50. Gaud-Brix. serm. 18. Ambros. in psalm. cxviii i 13. Leo Serm. 22, 1. A.S.]

p. 76 l. 8 cf. de Spect. 22 fin.

CORPORIBVS Minuc. 27 § 2 *inrepentes etiam corporibus repente ut spiritus* tenues *morbos fingunt.* Lact. ii 14 § 14 *qui, quoniam sunt spiritus* tenues *et incomprehensibiles, insinuant se corporibus hominum et occulte in uisceribus operati ualetudinem uitiant, morbos citant.* Id. Epit. 2 § 8. Cypr. Quod idola di non sint c. 7 (p. 24 H.). Tatian 31 f. p. 70. Origen Contr. Cels. viii 31. Clem. Hom. iv 4 (Simon at Tyre) *πολλοὺς δὲ γόητα αὐτὸν ἐλέγχειν πειρωμένους διαλλάξας πρὸς ἑαυτὸν εὐθύστερον προφάσει εὐωχίας βοῦν θύσας, καὶ ἑστιάσας αὐτούς, διαφόροις νόσοις περιέβαλεν καὶ δαίμοσιν ὑπέβαλεν.* Recogn. iv 19. Iustin. Apol. i 5, ii 5 p. 44[b]. [Cf. Ps.-Aug. Quaest. 112 § 9 p. 290 ll. 22 ff. A.S.]

p. 76 l. 11. Origen xx 301 L.

p. 76 l. 17 EADEM cet. Athenag. 27 *οἱ περὶ τὴν ὕλην δαίμονες...ἀπατηλοὶ δὲ ἀνθρώπων, προσλαβόντες τὰς ψευδοδόξους ταύτας τῶν πολλῶν τῆς ψυχῆς κινήσεις, φαντασίας αὐτοῖς ὡς ἀπὸ τῶν εἰδώλων καὶ ἀγαλμάτων, ἐπιβατεύοντες αὐτῶν τοῖς νοήμασιν, εἰσρεῖν παρέχουσι· καὶ ὅσα καθ' ἑαυτήν,*

ὡς ἀθάνατος οὖσα, λογικῶς κινεῖται ψυχή, ἢ προμηνύουσα τὰ μέλλοντα ἢ θεραπεύουσα τὰ ἐνεστηκότα, τούτων τὴν δόξαν καρποῦνται οἱ δαίμονες. Euseb. Praep. Euang. v 2 § 1 ἔγγυθεν ἔφεδροι καὶ συνεργοὶ τῆς πλάνης παρῆσαν, τοῖς τῶν ἀνθρώπων κακοῖς ἐπεντρυφῶντες καὶ τοὺς ἠλιθίους τὰς ψυχὰς εὐχερῶς ἀπατῶντες κινήσεσί τε ξοάνων, ἃ δὴ ἐπὶ τιμῇ τῶν κατοιχομένων ἀνδρῶν πρὸς τῶν παλαιῶν ἀφιέρωται καὶ ταῖς διὰ χρησμῶν φαντασίαις. Minuc. 27 § 1 *isti igitur impuri spiritus, daemones, ut ostensum magis, a philosophis et a Platone, sub statuis et imaginibus consecrati delitescunt et adflatu suo auctoritatem quasi praesentis numinis consequuntur, dum inspirantur interim uatibus, dum fanis immorantur, dum nonnumquam extorum fibras animant, auium uolatus gubernant.*

p. 76 l. 21 c. 23. c. 35 p. 104 l. 32. Pusey n. e. p. 55. Ad Scap. 2 *haec enim [odor et sanguis] daemoniorum pabula sunt.* De Idolol. 6 p. 36 4 Wiss. Adu. Marc. v 5 f. p. 587 l. 16 Kr. (*nidorosorum*). Iustin. Apol. I 5. II 4 (5) of demons, τὸ ἀνθρώπειον γένος ἑαυτοῖς ἐδούλωσαν...τὰ δὲ διὰ διδαχῆς θυμάτων καὶ θυμιαμάτων καὶ σπονδῶν, ὧν ἐνδεεῖς γεγόνασι μετὰ τὸ πάθεσιν ἐπιθυμιῶν δουλωθῆναι. Cf. Minuc. 27 § 3 Holden, *membra distorquent, ut ad cultum sui cogant, ut nidore altarium uel hostiis pecudum saginati remissis quae constrinxerant curasse uideantur.* Clem. Alex. Protrept. 50 cites as the demons' own confession of gluttony λοιβῆς τε κνίσσης τε, τὸ γὰρ λάχομεν γέρας ἡμεῖς. Euseb. Praep. Euang. v 2 § 1 αἵμασί τε καὶ λύθροις καὶ παντοίων ζώων σώμασι τῇ τε ἐκ τῶν ἀναθυμιωμένων καὶ ἀπὸ τῆς γῆς ἐξατμιζομένων ἀναδόσει χαίροντες, οἵ τε τούτων ἄρχοντες ἀέριοί τινες ὑπάρχοντες, ἢ καὶ καταχθόνιοι δυνάμεις, ἐπεὶ κατέμαθον τὸ ἀνθρώπινον γένος κάτω που περὶ νεκρῶν ἀνδρῶν θεοποιΐαν ἰλυσπώμενον, θυσίαις τε καὶ κνίσαις ταῖς δὴ μάλιστα αὐτοῖς κεχαρισμέναις διὰ πάσης σπουδῆς ἐκπονούμενον. Origen XX p. 297 L. Id. Contr. Cels. III 29. 37, p. 133. IV. 32. VI 6 p. 335 a. f. 336 pr. VII 5 p. 334 fin. 35. 56 f. 64. VIII 18. 30. Athenag. c. 26 pr. (p. 29[b] fin.). c. 27 p. 30[d]. Tatian 12 p. 151[d]. Oenomaus (temp. Hadr.) says to Apollo (Euseb. Praep. Euang. v 21 5 p. 213[c]) τί δὲ σὺ κνισιᾷς; Luc. bis acc. 2 bis. Iliad IV 49. IX 458. Aristoph. Aues 187. 193. 1514—24 cet. Ps. 40 8—11. 50 13. 51. 16, 17, ps.-

Aq. = 50 9—11. 1 Sam. 15 22. Is. 1 10—20. Jer. 6 20. Amos 5 21—27 cet. Clem. Hom. VII 3. VIII 20. IX 15. Theodoret Gr. Affect. Curat. V § 60 p. 47 l. 25. § 66 p. 48 20 sq. VII (of sacrifices) § 14 p. 104 29 sq. § 22 sq. p. 106 1 sq. (from O.T.). Denied by Aug. Contr. Faust. XX 22 m. (VIII 547a sq.) *illi quippe superbi et impii spiritus, non nidore ac fumo, sicut nonnulli uani opinantur, sed hominum pascuntur erroribus: non sui corporis refectione, sed maleuola delectatione cum quoquo modo decipiunt, uel arroganti fastu simulatae maiestatis cum diuinos sibi honores exhiberi gloriantur.* Porphyr. De Abst. II 42 fin. p. 204 in Aug. C. D. II 11 (I 419 19 D.), of evil demons, *οὗτοι οἱ χαίροντες λοιβῇ τε κνίσσῃ τε, δι' ὧν αὐτῶν τὸ πνευματικὸν καὶ σωματικὸν πιαίνεται. ζῇ γὰρ τοῦτο ἀτμοῖς καὶ ἀναθυμιάσεσι, ποικίλως διὰ τῶν ποικίλων, καὶ δυναμοῦται ταῖς ἐκ τῶν αἱμάτων καὶ σαρκῶν κνίσσαις* [*θυσίαις* Euseb.] (cited by Euseb. Praep. Euang. IV 22 § 12). Cf. Porphyr. Epist. ad Anebon. in Euseb. Praep. Euang. V 10 § 2 p. 197[d]. Greg. Naz. Or. 38 (I 614[c] = P.G. XXXVI 316[d]) *θεοὺς...κνίσσαις χαίροντας.*

p. 76 l. 23 ACCVRATIOR more exquisite Cic. Brut. § 283 *accuratius et exquisitius dicendi genus.*

PASCVA (*ἅπ. λεγ.*) Ronsch p. 101 (but Ep. Barn. 16 has *-ui* [gen. sing.]), also in Arn. iun. in Ps. 78 etc. Aug. in Ps. 129 4. Cael. Aurel. tard. IV 3 § 55. [Add Aug. in Iob, tom. III p. 501 E of ed. Bened. Antv. A. S.]

RECOGITATV Adu. Marc. IV 43 p. 566 l. 2 Kr. and in lexx.

p. 76 l. 28 VELOCITAS Athanas. (and Euagr.) Vit. Anton. 31, 32.

p. 76 l. 29 ET SVNT and indeed. Woodham cites Kritz Sall. Iug. 86. Tac. Hist. I 72.

p. 76 l. 30 PLANE...TAMEN c. 37 f. *hostes iudicare maluistis: qui sumus plane, non generis humani tamen, sed potius erroris.*

p. 76 l. 31 DISPOSITIONES c. 41. Lact. Diu. Instt. II 16 § 14 *cum dispositiones Dei praesentiant, quippe qui ministri eius fuerunt, interponunt se in his rebus, ut quaecumque a Deo uel facta sunt uel fiunt, ipsi potissimum facere aut fecisse uideantur: et quoties alicui populo uel urbi secundum Dei statutum boni quid impendet, illi se id facturos uel prodigiis uel somniis uel oraculis pollicentur, si sibi templa, si honores, si sacri-*

ficia tribuantur. quibus datis, cum illud acciderit quod necesse est, summam sibi pariunt uenerationem. Firmilian in Cypr. Ep. 75 10 (817 3 seq.) a prophetess, *ita autem principalium daemoniorum impetu ferebatur ut per longum tempus sollicitaret et deciperet fraternitatem, admirabilia quaedam et portentosa perficiens ut facere se terram moueri polliceretur: non quod daemoni tanta esset potestas ut terram mouere aut elementum concutere ui sua ualeret, sed quod nonnumquam nequam spiritus praesciens et intellegens terrae motum futurum id se facturum esse simularet quod futurum uideret.* Kaye 203. Lasaulx Studien p. 134 n. 206. Harnack on Hermas Mand. 11 § 3. A familiar spirit revealed to Apollon. Tyan. the future. Eus. c. Hier. 35.

EXCERPVNT Plin. ep. III 5, 10 n.

p. 76 l. 33 SORTES Iuu. 1 82 n. pp. 129—130.

AEMVLANTVR supra c. 2 f. *illius aemulae rationis.* De Ieiun. 16 p. 296 l. 11 Wiss. *diabolus diuinorum aemulator.* De Anim. 20 p. 333 l. 8 Wiss. *praesunt; secundum nos quidem Deus dominus et diabolus aemulus.*

DIVINITATEM c. 11 pr. p. 38 l. 30.

DIVINITATEM...DIVINATIONEM c. 20 p. 66 l. 4.

p. 76 l. 34 FVRANTVR c. 47 p. 134 l. 10 n. Iustin. Apol. I c. 4 pp. 54[e] 55. c. 54 p. 89[d] *τούτων οὖν τῶν προφητικῶν λόγων ἀκούσαντες οἱ δαίμονες Διόνυσον μὲν ἔφασαν γεγονέναι υἱὸν τοῦ Διός, εὑρετὴν δὲ γενέσθαι ἀμπέλου παρέδωκαν.* Clem. Alex. Strom. I c. 17 § 81 (4) p. 366 *εἴτ' οὖν δύναμις ἤ ἄγγελος μαθών τι τῆς ἀληθείας καὶ μὴ καταμείνας ἐν αὐτῇ, ταῦτα ἐνέπνευσε καὶ κλέψας ἐδίδαξεν.* VII c. 2 § 6 (4) p. 832 *οὗτός [ὁ κύριος] ἐστιν ὁ διδοὺς καὶ τοῖς Ἕλλησι τὴν φιλοσοφίαν διὰ τῶν ὑποδεεστέρων ἀγγέλων.* V c. 1 § 10 (2) p. 650 the amorous angels of Gen. 6 communicated higher truths to the women their paramours.

ORACVLIS Minuc. 27 § 1 *sortes regunt, oracula efficiunt falsis pluribus inuoluta.* 26. Lactant. II 7 § 7 seq. 14 § 6 seq. Tzschirner 401—3. Arnob. IV 11—12. Orig. Contra Cels. VII cc. 3—6 pp. 333—5. Bk X of Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. § 2 sq. p. 135 sq. is on true and false oracles (the demons inspire them). He cites Plut. 418[e] demons, but good ones. Myers Essay on

Oracles. Iamblichus and Porphyry ascribe them to Serapis and Hecate, Gods of Hell. Cf. Van Dale 1—50. Euseb. Praep. Euang. III 17 p. 127.

p. 76 l. 35 AMBIGVITATES Luc. Iupp. Trag. 28. 31. Vit. Auct. 14. Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. X § 25 p. 139 l. 40. Clem. Hom. III 24. Ammian. XXIII 5 §§ 8 9. Hier. IV 504a. Capella § 9. Herodot. VII 111. Cic. De Diuinat. I § 116. II §§ 115—6 (see below). Plut. II 408—9 399. Arnob. III 23 Hild.

TEMPERENT Lact. Diu. Instt. II 14 § 6 *sciunt illi quidem futura multa, sed non omnia, quippe quibus penitus consilium Dei scire non licet, et ideo solent responsa* in ambiguos exitus temperare. Semisch Iustin Märt. II 381 seq. Luc. Dial. Mort. 3 1. Deor. Dial. 16 1 ὁ δ' Ἀπόλλων προσποιεῖται μὲν πάντ' εἰδέναι,...καὶ καταστησάμενος ἐργαστήρια τῆς μαντικῆς ...ἐξαπατᾷ τοὺς χρωμένους αὐτῷ, λοξὰ καὶ ἐπαμφοτερίζοντα πρὸς ἑκάτερον τῆς ἐρωτήσεως ἀποκρινόμενος, ὡς ἀκίνδυνον εἶναι τὸ σφάλμα. Plut. ed. Reiske VII 569 sq. 609 f.

CROESI the stock ex. of ambiguity Aristot. Rhet. III 5 § 4, Cope. Tert. ad nat. II 17 p. 131 l. 16 Wiss. Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. X § 26 p. 139 47 (other oracles follow). Chalcid. in Tim. c. 167. See Myers (op. cit.). Herodot. I 46—56. 91. Arnob. IV 24 *numquid a nobis dicitur...Apollinem ditem factum eos ipsos reges quorum gazis fuerat locupletatus et donis, ambiguitate fefellisse responsi.* Cic. De Diuinat. II §§ 115 116, Davies. Cf. I § 37. Neither mentioned by Plutarch. Both in Amm. XXIII 5 9. esp. Lucian Alex. 48 f. Charon 11 12. Iup. Conf. 14 pr. Iup. Trag. 20 pr. 30. 43, bis acc. 1. Lasaulx 312 313. Dio Chrys. X p. 149 [= II 671[d] ed. Paris, 1834]. Nonnus Hist. 94 in Gr. Naz. στηλιτ. Suid. Κροῖσος and Λοξίας.

PYRRHI Aug. De Ciu. Dei III 17 § 2 (I p. 124 l. 34 ff. ed. Dombart[2]). Enn. in Cic. De Diuinat. II § 116 Davies. (Quintil. VII 9 § 6 (*amphibolia = ambiguitas*). Minuc. 26 § 6 *de Pyrrho Ennius Apollinis Pythii responsa confinxit, cum iam Apollo uersus facere desisset: cuius tunc cautum illud et ambiguum defecit oraculum, cum et politiores homines et minus creduli esse coeperunt.* Arnob. III 23 p. 127 26. IV 24 p. 161 5. 28 p. 164 30. Euseb. Praep. Euang. V 20 21. Limburg-Brouwer VI 76 sq.

p. 78 l. 1. Max. Tyr. 19 (= 3) 3. Cf. 3 p. 362 (= 13 [19] 3a, p. 160 ed. Hobein) *τὸ δὲ θεῖον δοκεῖ σοι γινώσκειν πάντα ἑξῆς, καὶ τὰ καλὰ καὶ τὰ αἰσχρά, καὶ τὰ τίμια καὶ τὰ ἄτιμα; φείδομαι τῶν ῥημάτων καὶ αἰδώς με τοῦ θεοῦ ἔχει. σεμνὸν γάρ τι τὸ πάντα εἰδέναι, καὶ ἀριθμὸν ψάμμων καὶ θαλάττης μέτρα, καὶ ξυνιέναι ἀτόπου λέβητος ἑψομένου ἐν Λυδοῖς.* Cf. 17 6 Davies, 11 (= 30) [= 5 Hobein] 2 p. 190 [pp. 53 f. Hobein] (oracle cited) schol. Luc. III 272. See esp. the fragments of Oenomaus (Mullach Fr. Phil. II 359—385, preserved by Euseb. Praep. Eu. V 18 sq. VI 7), esp. Praep. Eu. V 20 § 8. 21 §§ 1—5 pp. 211ᶜ—213ᵈ. *Obliquoloquus* Λοξίας Gloss. Philox. Cic. De Diuinat. II c. 56 § 140(?). Hier. in Esai. c. 41. Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. X § 25 sq.

p. 78 l. 2 MOMENTO cf. p. 76 l. 26.

p. 78 l. 3 HABENT SAPERE 37 pr. n. 36 pr. n. Oehler on De Fug. in Persec. 12 p. 485 n. t.

INCOLATVS the word in Varro ap. Tert. ad Nat. II 5 p. 102 l. 20 Wiss. 3 other exx. in Oehler's ind. add De Cor. Milit. 13. Arch. f. lat. Lexik. VIII 239. Ps. 119 5 in Psalt. Veron. and Aug. [cf. Le Texte du Psautier Latin en Afrique, par P. Capelle, Rome, 1913, p. 107. A.S. and] Paulin. Nol. Ep. 13, cf. 28 4. Lexx. cite inscr. dig. Cod. Theodos. [Add Exod. 12 40 ap. Aug. quaest. hept. II 47, Cyprian of Toulon in Migne P. L. LXVII 1002 C. Hil. Ambr. Hier. A. S.]

p. 78 l. 4 PARATVRAS Oehler ind. c. 47 p. 134 l. 2 n. c. 27 p. 92 l. 18. Scorp. 10 p. 169 l. 2 Wiss. Adu. Valentin. 26 p. 202 l. 16 Kr. De Ieiun. 11 p. 289 l. 4 Wiss. De Monog. 7 pr. Adu. Marc. I 11 p. 305 l. 22 Kr. III 10 p. 393 l. 2 Kr. IV 1 p. 422 l. 23 Kr. 3 p. 427 l. 15 Kr. 31 p. 526 l. 25 Kr. 43 p. 565 l. 23. Pontius Vit. Cypr. 2 p. XCII 10 H. 11 p. CII 6 H. Oehler on De Spectac. 4 p. 6 l. 8 Wiss. De Cor. Milit. 1 a. m. De Virg. Veland. 12 f. uulg.

PLVVIAS c. 23 p. 80 l. 8 *ista ipsa uirgo caelestis pluuiarum pollicitatrix.*

p. 78 l. 5 PLANE ironical c. 35 p. m.

p. 78 l. 6 LAEDVNT cet. Tatian 18 fin. Minuc. 27 § 3 *irrepentes etiam corporibus occulte, ut spiritus tenues, morbos fingunt, terrent mentes, membra distorquent, ut ad cultum sui*

cogant: ut nidore altarium uel hostiis pecudum saginati, remissis quae constrinxerant, curasse uideantur. Lact. Diu. Instt. II 14 § 13 *et scientes daemonas uenerantur, quasi terrestres deos et quasi depulsores malorum, quae ipsi faciunt et irrogant.* 15 § 1 *prodesse enim eos putant, cum nocere desinunt, qui nihil aliud possunt quam nocere.* Iren. II 31 § 2 *nec enim caecis possunt donare uisum neque surdis auditum neque omnes daemones effugare* [he is speaking of magicians], *praeter eos qui ab ipsis immittuntur, si tamen et hoc faciunt.* Euseb. Praep. Eu. V 2 § 1 fin. θεραπείαις τε σωμάτων, ἃ διὰ τῆς οἰκείας αὐτῶν ἐνεργείας ἀφανῶς αὐτοὶ λυμαινόμενοι, πάλιν οἱ αὐτοὶ διὰ τῆς ἐξ αὐτῶν ἀνέσεως ἐλευθέρους παθῶν ἠφίεσαν. Athenag. 23 τὸ μὲν δὴ κατὰ τόπους καὶ πόλεις καὶ ἔθνη γίνεσθαί τινας ἐπ' ὀνόματι εἰδώλων ἐνεργείας οὐδ' ἡμεῖς ἀντιλέγομεν· οὐ μήν, εἰ ὠφελήθησάν τινες καὶ αὖ ἐλυπήθησαν ἕτεροι, θεοὺς νοοῦμεν τοὺς ἐφ' ἑκάτερα ἐνεργήσαντας. Diog. Laert. VIII § 32 (Pythag.) εἶναί τε πάντα τὸν ἀέρα ψυχῶν ἔμπλεων· και ταύτας δαίμονάς τε καὶ ἥρωας ὀνομάζεσθαι· καὶ ὑπὸ τούτων πέμπεσθαι ἀνθρώποις τούς τ' ὀνείρους καὶ τὰ σημεῖα νόσου τε καὶ ὑγιείας. Porphyr. De Abst. II 43 (?). Clem. Hom. IX 16. 18. Cf. Tert. De Anim. 9 p. 310 l. 23 Wiss. of the Montanist prophetess, *medicinas desiderantibus submittit.*

p. 78 l. 7 Io. Sarisbur. Policrat. VI 24 p. 623[d] (of presbyters and cardinals) *nocent saepius et in eo daemones imitantur, quod tunc prodesse putantur cum nocere desistunt.*

p. 78 l. 9 PHANTASMATA CASTORVM...ET NAVEM CINGVLO PROMOTAM Minuc. 7 § 3 *testis mater Idaea, quae aduentu suo et probauit matronae castitatem et urbem metu hostili liberauit: testes equestrium fratrum in lacu, sicut ostenderant, statuae consecratae, qui anhelis spumantibus equis atque fumantibus de Perse uictoriam eadem die qua fecerant nuntiauerunt.* ib. 27 § 4 *de ipsis* [*daemonibus*] *etiam illa quae paullo ante tibi dicta sunt...ut cum equis Castores uiderentur, ut cingulum matronae nauicula sequeretur.* Lact. Diu. Inst. II 7 § 9 Castor and Pollux at Iuturna's lake in the Latin war. § 10 in the Macedonian war. Cf. Cic. De Nat. Deor. II § 6 (both). Lact. II 7 § 9. Val. Max. I 8 1 and 2? Flor. I 11. II 12. Baylé œuvres III 282. CASTORES Kühner vol. II p. 50 n. 2. Cf. ἀδελφοί

Amm. XIX 10 4. Minuc. 22 § 7. Plin. VII § 86. XXXV §§ 27. 71. 93. Tac. Hist. II 24. Apul. Oros. VII 8 6. Capitolin. Maximin. 16 § 1. Auson. Grat. Act. ad fin. (cf. *reges* Iuu. XIII 52 n. *Quirinos* XI 105 n.). Cypr. p. 19 10. Namatian I 155 *gemino...Castore*. *domini* = *dominus* and *domina* Ou. Am. II 2 32. Arnob. quater. Pacat. 39 § 4 *Castoras geminos*. Itin. Alex. 90. Neue I^2 393—4. Nothing in Roby or Kennedy. Ruddiman-Stallb. II 36—7. Quintil. IX 3 63 (of συνεζευγμένον) *iungit autem et diuersos sexus, ut cum marem feminamque* filios *dicimus*. De Vit. Onom. [cf. Expositor for July, 1914, p. 95. Jan., 1915, pp. 94 ff. A.S.]

p. 78 l. 10 AQVAM CRIBRO GESTATAM Otto Sprichwörter *cribrum* n. 3 p. 98. Valer. Maxim. VIII 1 absol. § 5. Plin. XXVIII 2 § 12. Dionys. Halicarn. II 69 (uulg. Λουκία). Liu. Epit. 20 (*incesti damnata est*). Acc. to Detlefsen in Plin. A.U.C. 619 (135 B.C.), acc. to Livy in 2nd decad of 6th cent. Aug. De Ciu. Dei X 16 § 2 (I 427 32 D.), by Tuccia, XXII 11 (II 586 11 D.). Sidon. Carm. 24, 41—3 *qualis nec Phrygiae dicata Vestae, quae contra satis Albulam tumentem, duxit uirgineo ratem capillo*. Claud. Laus Serenae 18 *ducens Claudia uirgineo cunctantem crine Cybelen*. (Aug. *zona*.)

CINGVLO Lact. Diu. Instt. II 7 § 12. 16 § 11. Sil. XVII. 34 seq. Savaro on Sidon. Carm. 24, 42 43 p. 207 (cited above) B.C. 204 Claudia Quinta prob. granddaughter of Caecus (Cic. pro Cael. § 34 *progenies Caeci*). Cic. Har. Resp. § 27. Liu. XXIX 14. Plin. VII 35 § 120. App. Hannibal 56. Ou. Fast. IV 305 seq. Diodor. Sicul. XXXIV 33 § 2. Valer. Maxim. I 8 § 11 (wrongly called a Vestal by Aurel. Vict. Ill. 46 and Hdn (reference below) and Aug. de Ciu. Dei X 16, *matrona* in Cic. and Liu. Orelli Onom. Tull. 149. Herodian I 11 §§ 4 5. Claudian Laus Serenae 17—8 (cited above). Cf. 28—30. De Vit. Onom. II p. 301 col. 2. Solin. I § 126. Arnob. VII 49. Iulian. Or. 5 p. 159 seq. Hier. Adu. Iouin. I 41 (II 307^b).

BARBAM Sueton. Nero 1. 2. Plut. Aemil. Paul. 25. Coriolan. 3. Dion. Halicarn. VI 13. [Cic. De Nat. Deor. II c. 2 § 6 (battle with Latins at Lake Regillus (B.C. 496) M.] Mart. VIII 52 3.

p. 78 l. 11 IRRVFATAM De Ieiun. 17 p. 296 l. 22 Wiss.

(wrongly 16 in R.W.) *si tibi lenticulam defruto inrufatam obtulero.* Hier. Ep. 107 (al. 7) ad Laetam c. 5 pr. *nec capillum inrufes.*

LAPIDES infr. c. 41 pr. *apud quos Deus spernitur, statuae adorantur.* Arnob. VII 48 49, on the statue of the Magna Mater as an ally against Hannibal.

CAP. XXIII

p. 78 l. 13 MAGI c. 21 p. 70 l. 24, infra p. 82 l. 7. Oehler ad De Idolol. 9 p. 38 l. 16 Wiss. Minuc. 26 § 9 *magi quoque non tantum sciunt daemonas, sed etiam quidquid miraculi ludunt per daemonas faciunt, illis adspirantibus et infundentibus praestigias edunt, uel quae non sunt uideri uel quae sunt non uideri.* Lact. II 14 § 10 *magorum quoque ars omnis ac potentia horum aspirationibus constat. a quibus inuocati uisus hominum praestigiis occaecantibus fallunt, ut non uideant ea quae sunt, et uidere se putent illa quae non sunt.* 16 § 4. VII 13 § 7 *certis carminibus cieri ab inferis animas et adesse et praebere se humanis oculis uidendas et loqui et futura praedicere.* Iustin. Apol. I 18 p. 65a 24. 34. 73. Clem. Recogn. II. 13. I 5 (Hom. I 5 II 30). Herodian IV 12 8. Tzschirner 149 seq. Cyprian Quod idola di non sint c. 4. Elmenhorst on Arnob. I 43 p. 40 41. Aug. Consens. Euang. I 8—10. 14. Geffcken Zwei Apologeten (1907) p. 240 n. 9.

DEFVNCTORVM Porphyr. in Euseb. Praep. Euang. V 10 § 3. Philostr. Vit. Apollon. Tyan. IV 16 evokes Achilles (Eus. c. Hierocl. 28 and 35 f.), a girl IV 45 (Euseb. 35 f.). Iustin. Apol. I 18 (and 8 ?). Bouché-Leclercq Divination I 97 n. 1. ψυχαγωγεῖν. Stallbaum on Plat. Tim. 71 A, esp. Tert. de Anim. 57. Pauly 'Magia' pp. 1411—2. Winer Real-Wörterb. and Schenkel Bibel-Lex. "Todtenbeschwörung." Hor. Epod. 17 e.g. 79 *possim crematos excitare mortuos.* Sat. I 8 e.g. 28—9 *cruor in fossam confusus, ut inde manes elicerent, animas responsa daturas.* Tac. Ann. II 28 *temptatus ut infernas animas carminibus eliceret.* Lucan VI 423—827. Stat. Theb. IV 406—645. Broukh. on Tibull. I 2 45—6. Cerda on Verg. Ecl. 8 98. Ou. Metam. VII 206. Cf. Grote Plato II 202.

p. 78 l. 14 PVEROS Iuu. 6 552. Hor. Epod. 5. 12 cet. Döllinger Heidenthum 660 sq. Böhringer [ed.² III 194].

p. 78 l. 15 MIRACVLA Arnob. I 43 Herald.

CIRCVLATORIIS Quintil. in lexx. (*uolubilitas* and *iactatio*). Add Tert. De Idolol. 9 p. 39 l. 4 Wiss. *Simon Magus iam iam fidelis, quoniam aliquid adhuc de circulatoria secta cogitaret.* [See Thes. A.S.] Epiphan. haer. XXXIV. Arn. I 43. Lact. II 14 § 12. Kaye 202 (8).

SOMNIA Minuc. 27 § 3 *somnos inquietant*, where Holden cites Tatian c. 18. Iustin. Apol. I c. 14. Thilo Cod. Apocr. Nou. Test. I 525. Lact. Diu. Instt. II 14 § 14.

p. 78 l. 17 CAPRAE Clem. Protrept. c. 2 § 11 p. 11 P. (in Euseb. Praep. Eu. II 3 § 5) *συνέμποροι τῆσδε τῆς γοητείας αἶγες αἱ ἐπὶ μαντικὴν ἠσκημέναι καὶ κόρακες ἀνθρώποις χρᾶν ὑπ' ἀνθρώπων διδασκόμενοι.*

MENSAE Sozom. VI 35, certain would-be philosophers, anxious to learn who would succeed Valens, made a wooden tripod of bay, which they consecrated with their customary invocations, so that the name of the future emperor was signified letter by letter, through the art of the tripod and divination. The order of letters tallied down to δ with the name of Theodorus, a soldier of mark about court. He and they were put to death. Amm. XXIX 1 29 (Maitland, False Worship 263 seq.), the letters were on the margin of the circular table. Maitland (op. cit. 226 seq.). Table-lifting among Jews cent. 17 (Harless, das Buch der ägyptischen Mysterien, München 1858 pp. 107—8. 130—2).

p. 78 l. 20 gods of the heathen, demons, 1 Chron. 16 26 *οἱ θεοὶ τῶν ἐθνῶν εἴδωλα*, and Ps. 95 5 *οἱ θεοὶ τῶν ἐθνῶν δαιμόνια*, Conflated in Iustin. Apol. I 41 p. 80ᵃ *πάντες οἱ θεοὶ τῶν ἐθνῶν εἴδωλα δαιμονίων εἰσί* (cf. Otto p. 116 n. 4). Zahn Forschungen V 233.

p. 78 l. 27 DEMENTIRE De Anim. 18 p. 329 l. 1 Wiss. Lact. Diu. Instt. VII 12 § 14. Bünem. on de Mortibus Persecutorum VII 10. Lucr. Apul. [See also Thes. A. S.]

TVRRES PERVOLAT Iuu. 3 78 n. *Graeculus esuriens in caelum, iusseris, ibit.* Schliemann, Clementinen 126. Lipsius, die Quellen der röm. Petrussage, Kiel 1872, pp. 164. 21. 42.

55 n. 1. 58—59. 77. 83 n. 1 and 2. 88. 89. 90 (cf. Matt. 4 5 and 6. Luke 4 9 and 10) 91. 92. 142. 157 f. 158. 160—1—2. Theodotus in Rufin. Hist. Eccl. v 16 p. 285. [Add Ambst. in Rom. 8, 38—9. A. S.]

p. 78 l. 29 LACERTOS cf. c. 9 p. 32 l. 18. Lact. Diu. Inst. I 21 § 17. Sen. in Aug. De Ciu. Dei VI 10.

p. 80 l. 3 power of exorcism. Matt. 7 22. Luke 10 17. Acts 3 6. Dionys. Alexandr. in Euseb. Hist. Eccl. VII 10 § 4 (cf. Heinichen ad l. p. 334). Bingham III 4. XVI 6. 3 f. Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. III § 105 p. 55 26. Athanas. Vit. Ant. passim e.g. 78 f. 80. Kaye 89—97. 389 seq. 399. 433. infr. 25 pr. n. 27. 32. 37 p. 108 l. 29 n. Ad Scap. 2. De Spectac. 26 p. 25 l. 23 Wiss. 29 p. 27 l. 22 Wiss. *quae maior uoluptas... quam mortis timor nullus? quod calcas deos nationum! quod daemonia expellis!...hae uoluptates, haec spectacula Christianorum sancta, perpetua, gratuita.* Minuc. 27 § 6 *haec omnia sciunt pleraque pars uestrum ipsos daemonas de semetipsis confiteri, quoties a nobis et tormentis uerborum et orationis incendiis de corporibus exiguntur.* Cypr. Ep. 75 10 sq. Ad Demetrian. 15 *o si audire eos uelis et uidere, quando adiurantur a nobis, torquentur, spiritalibus flagris et uerborum tormentis de obsessis corporibus eiciuntur, quando heiulantes et gementes uoce humana et potestate diuina flagella et uerbera sentientes uenturum iudicium confitentur. ueni et cognosce uera esse quae dicimus: et quia sic deos colere te dicis, uel ipsis crede quos colis. aut si uolueris et tibi credere, de te ipso loquetur audiente te qui nunc tuum pectus obsedit, qui nunc mentem tuam ignorantiae nocte caecauit. uidebis nos rogari ab eis quos tu rogas, timeri ab eis quos tu adoras: uidebis sub manu nostra stare uinctos et tremere captiuos quos tu suspicis et ueneraris ut dominos. certe uel sic confundi in istis erroribus tuis poteris, quando conspexeris et audieris deos tuos quid sint interrogatione nostra statim prodere et praesentibus licet nobis praestigias illas et fallacias suas non posse celare.* Quod idola di non sint 7 (25 3). Zeno De Resur. in Bibl. Max. Patr. III 412[bc] (= ed. Ballerini, Verona, 1739, p. 122), a very graphic description of exorcism —, *ubi uentum fuerit ad diuini certaminis campum coeperintque sacri nominis telo pulsari...cum diuina adiuratione in eculeo spiritali et qui sint*

nolentes edicant et inuiti discedant. Paulin. Vit. Ambr. 14. 15. 20. 21. 28. 33 fin. 43 *spiritus immundus arreptum discerpere coepit, quo uiso non minimo timore repleti sumus et admiratione. multos etiam diebus illis imponente illo manus et imperante ab spiritibus immundis uidimus esse purgatos.* Iustin. Apol. II 6 p. 45[ab] (n. 15 p. 216 Otto). Dial. 30 p. 247[c] Otto, 85 p. 311[b] Otto, 121 p. 350[b]. Theophil. II 8. Lact. Diu. Instt. II 15 § 3 Bünem. IV 27 (sign of cross) II 17 § 11 V 21 §§ 4—6 22 § 23. Epit. 51 7. Clem. Recogn. IV 7 8 13—19 (on demoniacs). Blunt Right Use sec. 2. c. 6 wholly taken up with the question of exorcisms, healings, visions etc. which he allows against Kaye. Orig. Contr. Cels. I. 7 ἰδιῶται τὸ τοιοῦτον πράττουσιν. Spencer on Orig. Contr. Cels. I c. 2 f. p. 5 l. 46 (p. 6 annot.) cf. 6. 22. 24. 25. 46 p. 34 f. II 8 f. (miracles seen by Origen), III 24 f. VII 4 (even ἰδιῶται). 17 fin. (numbers recovered from the dominion of demons). 35 f. 67. Allard les dernières persèc. 50. Iren. II 32 § 4 in Euseb. Hist. Eccl. V 7 § 4. Rufin. Hist. Eccl. X 4.

p. 80 l. 7 NVMEN—CONCIPIVNT Dido Aen. IV 474 *concepit furias.* Ou. Metam. II 640 *mente uaticinos furores.* Lucan I 630 *fata.* [Closer still V 163 *numen.* A. S.]

p. 80 l. 8 CAELESTIS c. 12 p. 44 l. 13 c. 24 p. 86 l. 4 n.

POLLICITATRIX cf. c. 22 p. 78 l. 4.

p. 80 l. 9 DEMONSTRATOR Cic. lex. Colum. Tert. De Pat. 4 p. 6 l. 4 Kr. 'very rare' LS [more in Thes., to which add two from Aug. in C.S.E.L. LIII p. 373. A.S.]. Arnob. I 41 pr. *Aesculapium medicaminum repertorem.* Rufin. Apol. II 43 pr. *tamquam si unius hominis membra diuulsa rursus in eiusdem corporis soliditatem Aesculapii arte reficerentur.*

ALIAM = *alteram.* Spartian Ant. Pi. 12 § 45. Hadr. 17 § 7. Seuer. 7 § 4. Paucker Hist. Aug. pp. 66—7. Iuu. 7 114. Harnack (Texte VIII 4) Medicinisches aus der ältesten Kg. 55 n. 1.

p. 80 l. 10 Kellner in his Germ. transl., Kempten 1870, points out that these are names of medicines, *Teucrum Scordium* Linn. Cf. Dierbach Flora Mythol. p. 213. Ascl. gift of A. panacea. *Th.* if not corrupted from *mithridation* cet. must be from θάνατος.

p. 80 l. 22 FACIT c. 29 *ad causam.*

AEMVLIS De Virg. Vel. 1. De Exhort. Cast. 13. De Ieiun. 16 p. 296 l. 11 Wiss. Ad Vx. I 8. De Cor. Milit. 15. De Praescr. Haer. 40. De Pat. 16 p. 23 l. 21 Kr.

p. 80 l. 25 DIRECTO Adu. Prax. 27 p. 281 l. 17 Kr. *sed enim inuenimus illum directo et Deum et hominem expositum* ( )(*schemate* Madvig Aduers. I 37). *reuelatus directo* Adu. Marc. I 26 p. 327 l. 3 Kr. II 14 p. 354 l. 19 Kr. IV 10 p. 448 l. 1 Kr.

p. 80 l. 31 CONCVRRIT c. 24 m.

p. 80 l. 34 DAEMONAS cet. Harnack Medicinisches (Texte VIII 4) p. 116. Socr. Hist. Eccl. VII 8 § 19. IV 27 § 5.

p. 82 l. 2 IN CONTINENTI De Praescr. Haer. 5 pr. Iustin. I 9 § 16. V 3 § 7. 5 § 4. VI 7 § 10. XI 4 § 12. Ps.-Cypr. p. 61 7. 62 6. 73 22. 265 14. Cypr. Ep. 80 § 1. [See also Thes. IV 710 78 A. S.]

p. 82 l. 7 MAGVS c. 23 pr. p. 78 l. 13. Aug. De Ciu. Dei XVIII 53 (some acquitted Christ but fastened witchcraft on Peter). ib. 54 confuted by Euseb. Demonstr. Eu. III 2 § 78 (called *γόητα καὶ πλάνον*). c. 3 no *πλάνος*. c. 6 no *γόης* cet. Arnob. I 43 (cf. 53 p. 36 l. 12) *occursurus forsitan rursus est cum aliis multis calumniosis illis et puerilibus uocibus: magus fuit, clandestinis artibus omnia illa perfecit, Aegyptiorum ex adytis angelorum potentium nomina et remotas furatus est disciplinas.* Orig. Contr. Cels. I 6 p. 7 *κατηγορεῖ δ' ἐν τοῖς ἑξῆς καὶ τοῦ σωτῆρος, ὡς γοητείᾳ δυνηθέντος ἃ ἔδοξε παράδοξα πεποιηκέναι.* 28 (p. 12 n. 3 Keim). 38 p. 30. 46 p. 34 fin. 68 p. 53. II 48 pr. p. 87. Clem. Recogn. I 58 pr. *et ecce quidam de scribis de medio populi exclamans ait: Iesus uester signa et prodigia quae fecit, ut magus non ut propheta fecit.* Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. c. 69 f. p. 269[a] *οἱ δὲ καὶ ταῦτα ὁρῶντες γινόμενα φαντασίαν γίνεσθαι ἔλεγον· καὶ γὰρ μάγον εἶναι αὐτὸν ἐτόλμων λέγειν καὶ λαοπλάνον.* Apol. I c. 30 pr. p. 72[a] *ὅπως δὲ μή τις εἴπῃ ἀντιτιθεὶς ἡμῖν τί κωλύει καὶ τὸν παρ' ἡμῖν λεγόμενον Χριστόν, ἄνθρωπον ἐξ ἀνθρώπων ὄντα, μαγικῇ τέχνῃ ἃς λέγομεν δυνάμεις πεποιηκέναι καὶ δόξαι διὰ τοῦτο υἱὸν θεοῦ εἶναι;* Lact. Diu. Instt. V 3 § 19 *fecit mirabilia: magum putassemus, ut et nos nunc putatis et Iudaei tunc putauerunt, si non illa ipsa facturum Christum prophetae omnes uno spiritu praedicassent.* Cf. ib. §§ 7—9

(Apollonius Tyanaeus and Apuleius). Aug. Cons. Euangel. I 11 § 17. 14 § 22. [Hier.] in Ps. 81 (VII app. 296 fin. ed. Ven. 1769) and Aug. Ep. 136 (= 4) 1 f. (II 598[d] Gaume). 138 (= 5) § 18 pr. (II 623[a]).

p. 82 l. 11 SPIRITVS c. 21 p. 68 l. 28. Kaye p. 526 n. 6. RATIO supr. c. 21 p. 68 l. 28. Kaye p. 500 n. 5.

p. 82 l. 13 PRO TRIBUNALI Cic. Liu. Suet. Vit. 9 *pro tribunali iura reddenti.* 13 exx. in Suet.

p. 82 l. 14 SI FORTE 16 m. n. 38 fin.

MINOEM—RHADAMANTHVM Lact. Diu. Instt. III 20 § 17. VII 22 § 5. Cic. Tusc. I 41. Iustin. Apol. I 8 p. 14.

p. 82 l. 17 SANGVINE Athenag. Suppl. 27 *οἱ περὶ τὴν ὕλην δαίμονες, λίχνοι περὶ τὰς κνίσας καὶ τὸ τῶν ἱερείων αἷμα ὄντες.* Porphyry in Euseb. Praep. Euang. IV 10 p. 147[d] (thence in Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. X § 15 p. 138 11) *μὴ χρῆναι φάσκων θεοὺς ὑπολαμβάνειν τοὺς ταῖς διὰ ζῴων θυσίαις χαίροντας· εἶναι γάρ φησι πάντων ἀδικώτατον τὸ ζῳοθυτεῖν, καὶ ἀνόσιον καὶ μυσαρὸν καὶ βλαβερόν, καὶ διὰ τοῦτο μηδὲ θεοῖς προσφιλές.* See more in Euseb. Praep. Eu. IV p. 166[b] (Theodoret Graec. Aff. Cur. X § 16 p. 138 22) sq. (Porphyry corrected Pythia's verses). § 25 p. 139 40 *τὸ λοξὸν* of oracles. Lucian Iup. Trag. 18. 22. 32.

p. 82 l. 19 PRAEDAMNATOS 27 p. m. *praedamnatione.*

p. 82 l. 22 Matt. 7 22. Infr. 37 f. p. 108 l. 28 n. 43. Lact. Diu. Instt. V 21 § 4. Otto on Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. 85 p. 311 b. Arnob. I 43. 45. 46. II 12 the chariot and fiery horses of Simon Magus vanished when Peter named the Name of Christ. The work of Middleton, A Free Inquiry cet. Lond. 1749. A Vindication of the Free Inquiry 1751. So Schröckh VI 381—2. Gibbon. Münscher Handb. der Dogmengesch. I 165. Münter Handb. der ältesten christl. Dogmengesch. I 136—8. Kaye 433 n. 9. Spencer on Orig. c. Cels. p. 17 l. 14 (annot. p. 16 f. 17—8) Demons and wizards impotent in presence of higher powers. Orig. c. Cels. I 60. 67 f. 68 magicians. V c. 45 p. 261—2 virtue of the conjuration by the God of Abraham Isaac Jacob. Magicians rely on strange names of gods. VI 39 pr. 40, C. had seen in Christian hands barbarian books containing *δαιμόνων ὀνόματα καὶ τερατείας.* 41, Christians unassailable by demons. Aug. Tr. 7 in Ioan. f. III 2 344[b] enchanters employed the name

of Christ. Prudent. Peristeph. [where ?]. Vincent. [where ?] *pulsi e latebris corporum uirtute Christi et nomine.* Apotheosis Iustin. Apol. II 6. 8. Dial. 30.

p. 82 ll. 24—28 Bünemann on Lact. Diu. Instt. II 15 § 3.

p. 82 l. 26 AFFLATV On exsufflation see Bingham X 2 8 n. 72. Pusey h. l. Julian in Hermes IX (1875) 257 ff. l. 35 (new letter on the bp Pegasius).

p. 82 l. 30 HONOREM Lact. Diu. Instt. II 15 § 3 *iustos autem, id est cultores Dei, metuunt, cuius nomine adiurati de corporibus excedunt. quorum uerbis tamquam flagris uerberati, non modo daemonas esse se confitentur, sed etiam nomina sua edunt, illa, quae in templis adorantur, quod plerumque coram cultoribus suis faciunt, non utique in opprobrium religionis, sed honoris sui, quia nec Deo per quem adiurantur, nec iustis quorum uoce torquentur, mentiri possunt. itaque maximis saepe ululatibus editis uerberari se et ardere et iam iamque exire proclamant.*

p. 82 l. 36 QVOD SCIAM infr. c. 25 p. 88 l. 14. ad nat. I 7 p. 69 l. 16 Wiss. *quod s. et conuersatio notior facta est.* 8 fin. *ubi saltem Aegyptii, et ipsi, q. s., priuatae curiosaeque religionis.* Ad Vxor. II 3 a. m. *q. s. non sumus nostri, sed pretio empti.*

CAP. XXIV

p. 84 l. 6 MANCIPAMVR c. 21 pr. p. 66 l. 22 *si eidem deo manciparemur.* De Idolol. 1 fin. Iren. I 39 § 4 [more exx. in Study of Ambrosiaster p. 117. A.S.].

CRIMEN LAESAE cet. Celsus ed. Keim p. 1.

p. 84 ll. 7—9 PRO CERTO Ter. Ad. 478. Caes. B.G. VII 5 § 6 *pro certo esse proponendum.* Cic. Sall. Liu. Quintil. Suet. Clem. Recogn. I 64 pr. *p. c. comperimus quod.* III 9 *p. c. nescierit.* V. 35 f.

p. 84 l. 10 Plut. mor. I. [De Superstitione, ed. Bernardakis, I 402 ff. ?]

p. 84 l. 12 IRRELIGIOSITATIS Aug. De Cura pro Mortuis 10 (VI 877[b] Gaume). Iren. II 14. 2 (Hil. and Salu. in lexx.). [add Aug. C. D. IV 12. A.S.]

p. 84 l. 13 VT c. 35 p.m.

p. 84 l. 14 SVBLIMIOREM c. 11 pr. *in primis quidem necesse*

est concedatis esse aliquem sublimiorem deum et mancipem quendam diuinitatis, qui ex hominibus deos fecerit. Apul. Apol. c. 64 *idem Maximus optime intellegit, ut de nomine etiam uobis respondeam, quisnam sit ille, non a me primo, sed a Platone βασιλεύς nuncupatus,...totius rerum naturae causa et ratio,* cet. Arnob. passim.

p. 84 l. 17 PENES VNVM Keim's Celsus p. 135.

p. 84 l. 18 Plato Phaedr. 246ᶜ ὁ μὲν δὴ μέγας ἡγεμὼν ἐν οὐρανῷ Ζεύς, ἐλαύνων πτηνὸν ἅρμα, πρῶτος πορεύεται, διακοσμῶν πάντα καὶ ἐπιμελούμενος· τῷ δ' ἕπεται στρατιὰ θεῶν τε καὶ δαιμόνων, κατὰ ἕνδεκα μέρη κεκοσμημένη. Arnob. III 30 f. *nam quid de ipso dicemus Ioue, quem solem esse dictitauere sapientes, agitantem pinnatos currus, turba consequente diuorum?* cf. 34 f.

p. 84 l. 20 SVSPICI c. 18 p. 58 l. 33. c. 32 *iudicium Dei suspicimus in imperatoribus.* Arnob. VII 11 *efficiturque ut uideatur magnus quem suspectio minoris extulerit.*

p. 84 l. 27 LACVNARIA 40 f. *caelum apud Capitolium quaeritis, nubila de laquearibus expectatis.*

HIRCI Lucian bis acc. 10.

p. 84 l. 28 ELOGIVM c. 2 p. 6 l. 23. De Idolol. 1 p. 30 l. 8 Wiss. De Cor. Milit. 5 f. Oehler: the inscription on a statue; a brief summary of the case against a prisoner (*eligo*, cf. *toga*); brief, minutes, protocol; charge on police-sheet. cf. Neumann I 33 n. 1. Perizon. on Ael. Var. Hist. XIV 43. Casaub. on Vulcat. Gall. Hist. Aug. I 470.

CONCVRRAT c. 23 p.m.

p. 84 l. 30 COLERE QVEM VELIM c. 28 init. ad Scap. 2 pr. *humani iuris et naturalis potestatis est unicuique quod putauerit colere nec alii obest aut prodest alterius religio. sed nec religionis est cogere religionem, quae sponte suscipi debeat, non ui; cum et hostiae ab animo libenti expostulentur. ita etsi nos compuleritis ad sacrificandum, nihil praestabitis dis uestris; ab inuitis enim sacrificia non desiderabunt, nisi si contentiosi sunt.* Lact. Diu. Instt. V 19 § 23 *nam si sanguine, si tormentis, si malo religionem defendere uelis, iam non defendetur illa, sed polluetur atque uiolabitur. nihil est enim tam uoluntarium quam religio, in qua si animus sacrificantis auersus est, iam sub-*

lata, iam nulla est. ib. 20 §§ 5—11 *libet igitur ex eis quaerere, cui potissimum praestare se putent cogendo inuitos ad sacrificium. ipsisne quos cogunt? at non est beneficium quod ingeritur recusanti. sed consulendum est etiam nolentibus, quando, quid sit bonum nesciunt. cur ergo tam crudeliter uexant, cruciant, debilitant, si saluos uolunt? aut unde pietas tam impia, ut eos miseris modis aut perdant aut inutiles faciant, quibus uelint esse consultum? an uero dis praestant? at non est sacrificium, quod exprimitur inuito. nisi enim sponte atque ex animo fiat, exsecratio est,* cet. Id. Epit. 53 §§ 6—11. Themist. Or. 12 ad Iouian. (p. 57 of Amberg edition, 1605) *καὶ τοῦτο ζηλῶν τὸν θεόν, ὃς τὸ μὲν ἔχειν πρὸς εὐσέβειαν ἐπιτηδείως τῆς φύσεως κοινὸν ἐποίησε τῆς ἀνθρωπίνης· τὸν τρόπον δὲ τῆς θεραπείας ἐξῆψε τῆς ἐν ἑκάστῳ βουλήσεως. ὁ δὲ προσάγων ἀνάγκην ἀφαιρεῖται τὴν ἐξουσίαν ἣν ὁ θεὸς συνεχώρησε.* Bailey Rituale Anglocath. 259.

p. 84 l. 32 AEGYPTIIS ad nat. I 8 fin. *ubi saltem Aegyptii, et ipsi, quod sciam, priuatae curiosaeque religionis.* Minuc. 28 § 9 *nonne et Apim bouem cum Aegyptiis adoratis et pascitis? nec eorum sacra damnatis instituta serpentibus crocodilis beluis ceteris et auibus et piscibus, quorum aliquem deum si quis occiderit, etiam capite punitur.* Athenag. Suppl. 1 p. 2[a] *οἱ δὲ Αἰγύπτιοι καὶ αἰλούρους καὶ κροκοδείλους καὶ ὄφεις καὶ ἀσπίδας καὶ κύνας θεοὺς νομίζουσι. καὶ τούτοις πᾶσιν ἐπιτρέπετε καὶ ὑμεῖς καὶ οἱ νόμοι.* Clem. Alex. Paedag. III 2 § 4. Arnob. I 28 p. 18 l. 28 *templa faelibus, scarabaeis et buculis, sublimibus sunt elata fastigiis: silent inrisae numinum potestates, nec liuore afficiuntur ullo, quod sibi comparatas animantium uilium conspiciunt sanctitates.* Hennecke Aristid. ind. *ζῷα* (p. 52a). Zahn Forschungen V 191 n. 1.

p. 86 ll. 3—4 Friedländer III[5] 542. Iustin. Apol. I c. 24 p. 68[de]. Tatian 10. Orig. contr. Cels. V 27. Athenag. cc. 1 princ. 14. cc. 12—15 pp. 13. 14 different nations have different gods; are the Christians atheists, because they do not accept your gods? Athanas. contr. Gentes c. 23 *καὶ ὅλως ἑκάστη πόλις καὶ κώμη τοὺς ἐκ γειτόνων οὐκ εἰδυῖα θεούς, τοὺς ἑαυτῆς προκρίνει καὶ μόνους τούτους εἶναι νομίζει θεούς* ... ibid. *καὶ ὅλως πάντων τῶν ἐν εἰδώλοις μανέντων ἐθνῶν*

διάφορός ἐστιν ἡ δόξα καὶ ἡ θρησκεία καὶ οὐ τὰ αὐτὰ παρὰ τοῖς αὐτοῖς εὑρίσκεται. cf. Iuu. 15. 36—38 n.

p. 86 l. 3 ASTARTE ad nat. II 8 p. 108 l. 12 Wiss. *at enim cum illi quoque, quos totus orbis communiter colit, excidant probationi uerae diuinitatis, quanto magis isti quos ne ipsi quidem municipes sui norunt? nam quae idonea auctoritas praecucurrit eiusmodi theologiae quam etiam fama destituit? quanti sunt qui norint uisu uel auditu Atargatim Syrorum, Caelestem Afrorum, Varsutinam Maurorum, Obodan et Dusarem Arabum* [Euseb. Praep. Eu. I 7 (?) [surely an error for in Const. 13 or Theoph. II 12. A.S.]], *Belenum Noricum, uel quos Varro ponit, Casiniensium Deluentinum, Narniensium Visidianum, Atinensium Numiternum, Asculanorum Ancharium, †et quam praeuerint. Vulsiniensium Nortiam, quorum ne nominum quidem dignitas humanis cognominibus distat? satis rideo etiam deos decuriones cuiusque municipii, quibus honor intra muros suos determinatur.* Cic. De Nat. Deor. III § 59 Mayor. Minuc. 6 § 1 *inde adeo per uniuersa imperia prouincias oppida uidemus singulos sacrorum ritus gentiles habere et deos colere municipes, ut Eleusinios Cererem, Phrygas Matrem, Epidaurios Aesculapium, Chaldaeos Belum, Astarten Syros, Dianam Tauros, Gallos Mercurium, <numina> uniuersa Romanos.* Winer Bibelwörterb. 'Aschera' and 'Astarte.' Merx in Schenkel 'Aschera.' Schlottmann in Riehm (cuts) s.v. Astarte. Arnob. IV 4 *peculiares deos.*

p. 86 l. 4 BĔLĒNVS ad nat. II 8 (quoted above). Auson. bis (Commemor. Professor. Burdigalens. IV 9. X 24 (16)). Greg. Turonens. Glor. Conf. 7. Iul. Capitolin. in Maximin. 22 § 1 (Apollo). Preller-Jordan Röm. Myth. I³ 312. 270 (old Celtic sun-god Beal, Grimm Deutsche Myth. 579 sqq.). Inscr. found at Aquileia, Venice, Tibur, Vienne, the village Belin (near Autun), the islands Grado and Corgle. Herodian VIII 3. 8 [Pauly-Wissowa s.v. A.S.]. Belis = Apollo, prophetic. CIL V ind. p. 1178.

CAELESTIS De-Vit, Onomast. [and now Thes. A.S.] Tanit. CIL VIII. ind. p. 1082. Corp. Inscr. Semit. I c. 13. Her temple destroyed at Carthage A.D. 421 by order of the emperor Constantius, [Prosper] Liber Promissionum et Praedictorum Dei III 38 § 5 (the author was present). Obscene rites, supr. c. 23

p. 80 l. 8 and Oehler's note, c. 12 p. 44 l. 13. ad nat. II 8 (quoted above). Aug. De Ciu. Dei II 4. 26. Ambros. Ep. 18. 30. Trebell. Pollio Trig. Tyr. 29. Victor Vitensis Hist. Persec. Vandal. I 3. Capitolin. Maximin 3. Pertin. 4 pr. Apul. Metam. VI 4 pr. Saluian. Gub. VIII 9—13. Occurs in Rome, Dacia and elsewhere (inscr.). P. Faber Semestr. l. III (Col. Agr. 1611) p. 22 sq. Münter, Religion der Karthager[2] 62. Originally identical with Astarte. Evoked in the 3rd Punic war and brought to Rome (Seru. Aen. XII 841). Marquardt III[2] 83 n. 3. Preller-Jordan Röm. Myth. II[3] 406—7.

MAVRITANIAE Minuc. 23 § 2 *Iuba Mauris uolentibus deus est et diui ceteri reges, qui consecrantur, non ad fidem numinis sed ad honorem emeritae potestatis.* So Hiempsal CIL VIII 8834 *Iemsali L. Percenius L. f. Stel. Rogatus u. [s. l. a.].* Mommsen Röm. Gesch. V 622. 2. Lact. Diu. Instt. I 15 § 6 *hac scilicet ratione Romani Caesares suos consecrauerunt et Mauri reges suos.* cf. § 8 *Mauri Iubam <coluerunt>.* So the Aethiopians Diodor. Sicul. III 9 § 1, and Persians Brisson c. 1. Cyprian Quod idola di non sint 2 f. *Mauri uero manifeste reges colunt nec ullo uelamento hoc nomine obtexunt.* Isidor. Orig. VIII 11 § 1.

p. 86 l. 7 MVNICIPALI Minuc. 6 § 2 (quoted above, on *Astarte*) *deos* municipes.

CENSENTVR c. 15 p. m. p. 50 l. 31 n. note on local gods supr. c. 10 p. 36 l. 25 seq.

p. 86 l. 11 IVNO Cupra whose worship after the conquest of Veii was transferred to Rome, Liu. V 21—22. XXVII 37 (I. Curitis or Quiritis). Inscr. Orelli 1304. Henzen 5659 (from Tibur Orelli 1303). Iuno Curis in Paulus (Preller Röm. Mythol. 248). Jordan in Hermes VIII 219 sq. [See Thes. s. u. *Curritis.* A.S.]

NOS SOLI cf. the end of the chapter. Tzschirner 305 sq. (Iustin. Apol. I 32 cf. 24). Athenag. c. 1 pp. 1—2 all Rome's subjects enjoy religious freedom, the Trojan, Lacedaemonian, Athenian; even the Egyptian may adore his brute gods; we alone are denied the exercise of our religion. Iustin. Apol. I 34. 35 Simon of Samaria, and his pupil Menander, who professed to be gods, are honoured by you. We alone are persecuted.

So Tertullian c. 46 contrasts heathen tolerance of philosophy with the persecution of Christians.

p. 86 l. 12 NEC ROMANI HABEMVR c. 36 pr.

p. 86 l. 13 BENE QVOD c. 7 (p. 26 l. 30). 40 med. (p. 118 l. 8 n.). De Idolol. 5 fin. Oehler. 23 p. 56 l. 21 Wiss. ad nat. I 7 p. 67 l. 25 Wiss. *bene quod omnia tempus reuelat.*

p. 86 l. 14 VELIMVS...NOLIMVS Lact. Diu. Instt. V 20 § 9 *at nos contra non expetimus ut deum nostrum, qui est omnium uelint nolint, colat aliquis inuitus.* Paulin. Nol. Ep. 16. 5 *uelimus nolimus.* Hier. Ep. 60. 14 [add Min.-Fel. Ambst. Aug. Ps.-Aug. A.S.]. Aemilian to Dionys. Alexandrin.: 'You may worship your own god as much as you will, if you will but worship our gods also,' Euseb. Hist. Eccl. VII 11.

Cap. XXV

p. 86 l. 20 TESTIMONIIS c. 46 pr. *constitimus, ut opinor, aduersus omnium criminum intentationem, quae Christianorum sanguinem flagitat. ostendimus totum statum nostrum et quibus modis probare possimus ita esse, sicut ostendimus, ex fide scilicet et antiquitate diuinarum litterarum, item ex confessione spiritalium potestatum.* 37 f. n. *quis autem uos ab illis occultis et usquequaque uastantibus mentes et ualetudines uestras hostibus raperet! a daemoniorum incursibus dico, quae de uobis sine praemio, sine mercede depellimus. suffecisset hoc solum nostrae ultioni, quod uacua exinde possessio immundis spiritibus pateret.* c. 23 passim e.g. *edatur hic aliqui ibidem sub tribunalibus uestris, quem daemone agi constet. iussus a quolibet Christiano loqui spiritus ille, tam se daemonem confitebitur de uero, quam alibi deum de falso...quid isto opere manifestius, quid hac probatione fidelius...credite illis cum uerum de se loquuntur, qui mentientibus creditis...haec denique testimonia deorum uestrorum Christianos facere consuerunt, quia plurimum illis credendo in Christo domino credimus. ipsi litterarum nostrarum fidem accendunt, ipsi spei nostrae fidentiam aedificant.*

p. 86 l. 22 OCCVRRIT c. 24 f.

CONGRESSIONEM Scorpiac. 4 p. 152 l. 29 Wiss. De Idolol. 21 p. 54 l. 32 Wiss. *certe quisquis ille est, aut amica aut inimica*

congressione adstringit. Adu. Valentin. 6 p. 183 l. 4 Kr. *quamquam autem distulerim congressionem, solam interim professus narrationem, sicubi tamen indignitas meruerit suggillari, non erit delibationi transpunctoria* (Kroymann wrongly *transfunctoria*) *expugnatio. congressionis lusionem* [prelude, mock-fight] *deputa, lector, ante pugnam.* (Often in Justin of an engagement.) De Praescrip. Haer. 16 *c. scripturarum* i.e. *de scripturis.* Lact. Epit. 52 § 4 *quia ratione congredi non queunt, uiolentia premunt.* Tert. Apol. 4 a.m. *de legibus prius concurram uobiscum.*

p. 86 l. 23 supra c. 14 p. 48 l. 26 n. Posid. in Athen. p. 274. Polyb. VI 56 § 6. Hor. Carm. III 6 5 *dis te minorem quod geris imperas.* Minuc. 25 § 1 *at tamen ista ipsa superstitio Romanis dedit auxit fundauit imperium, cum non tam uirtute quam religione et pietate pollerent.* ib. 6 § 3 *sic imperium suum ultra solis uias et ipsius Oceani limites propagauit; dum exercent in armis uirtutem religiosam, dum urbem muniunt sacrorum religionibus, castis uirginibus, multis honoribus ac nominibus sacerdotum.* Cic. De Nat. Deor. II § 8 n. Harusp. Resp. c. 19 § 79. Dionys. Halicarn. II 18. 19. 66—73. Valer. Max. I 1 § 8. Marquardt III² 53—5. Sall. Catil. 12. Proof of heathen religion from the greatness of Rome, Tzschirner 399 seq. Cypr. Quod idola di non sint 3. Celsus (Orig. VIII 69 p. 213 L.) points to the low estate of Jews and Christians. Aug. De Ciu. Dei IV, especially cc. 8. 9. 28. 29. 34. Symm. epist. X 3 § 9 (pro ara Victoriae) makes Rome say:—*hic cultus in leges meas orbem redegit.* Prudent. Contra Symm. II passim. Oros. VI 1.

PRAESVMPTIO DICENTIVM 'prejudiced assertion.'

p. 86 l. 24 SVBLIMITATIS c. 21 p. 66 l. 29 (of Jews).

p. 86 l. 27 STERCVLVS Marquardt III² 17 n. 3. Mutunus 15 n. 6. ad nat. II 9 p. 112 l. 26 Wiss. *quid Sterculinus meruit ad diuinitatem! si agros stercoribus iuuando diligens fuit, plus fimi Augias conferebat.* 17 pr. p. 130 l. 3 Wiss. *nobis superest adhuc illa Romanarum superstitionum praegrandis praesumptio ...propterea scilicet Romanos totius orbis dominos atque arbitros factos fuisse, quod officiis religionum meruerint dominare...nimirum Sterculus et Mutunus et Larentina prouexit hoc imperium.* Festus 154ᵇ. Prudent. Peristeph. II 449 (*Laurentii*) *Ianum bi-*

frontem et Sterculum | colit senatus: horreo | tot monstra patrum dicere | et festa Saturni senis.

p. 86 l. 28 LARENTINA c. 13 p. 46 l. 30, infra p. 88 l. 23.

PROVEXIT Verg. Aen. VI 796 *proferet imperium.*

PEREGRINOS c. 10 p. 36 l. 26 n. ad nat. II 17 p. 130 l. 10 Wiss. *peregrinos enim* cet.

p. 86 l. 31 TRANSFRETANIS ἅπ. εἰρ.

VIDERIT c. 16 m. 42 n. De Test. Anim. 1 p. 135 l. 3 Wiss. *iam igitur nihil nobis erit cum litteris et doctrina peruersae felicitatis, cui in falso potius creditur quam in uero. uiderint si qui de unico et solo Deo pronuntiauerunt.* Adu. Hermog. 1 p. 126 l. 16 Kr. *sed uiderit persona, cum doctrina mihi quaestio est.* Adu. Valentin. 9 p. 187 l. 7 Kr. *ex illis duodecim Aeonibus, quos Homo et Ecclesia ediderant, nouissima natu Aeon (uiderit soloecismus, Sophia enim nomen est).* Gronou. ad Sen. De Prou. 3.

VIDERIT SI ADAMAVIT c. 6 pr. n. c. 21 p. 74 l. 23 n.

CYBELE Bayle œuvres III 47. Adu. Marc. I 13 p. 307 l. 21 Kr. Minuc. 24. Arnob. II 73. VII 49. Liu. XXIX 11 and 14. Lact. Diu. Instt. II 7 § 12. Aug. De Ciu. Dei I 30. III 12. Claudian De Raptu Proserpinae I 200 seq. Herodian I 11. 7. Zoega Bassirilievi Antichi (Rome, 1808) 188 f. Marquardt Röm. Staatsverwaltung III 355—9.

p. 86 l. 32 VERNACVLI c. 19 p. 64 l. 15 n. c. 35 *ipsam uernaculam septem collium plebem.*

p. 86 l. 33 TRANSIRE PROSPEXIT had the forethought to cross over.

p. 86 l. 34 DEBELLATRICEM Adu. Iud. 9 p. 723 m. Oehler (= Adu. Marc. III 13 p. 398 l. 21 Kr.) *sic et Babylon apud Ioannem nostrum Romae urbis figura est, proinde et magnae et regno superbae et sanctorum debellatricis.* Cassian Coll. XXII 3. Lact. in lexx. [see also Thes. A.S.].

p. 88 l. 1 Death of Marcus 17 Mar. 180 Clinton Fasti.

p. 88 l. 2 ARCHIGALLVS De Carn. Resur. 16 p. 46 l. 7 Kr. *et tamen calicem, non dico uenenarium, in quem mors aliqua ructarit, sed frictricis uel archigalli uel gladiatoris aut carnificis spiritu infectum, quaero, an minus damnes, quam oscula ipsorum.* Plin. inscr. Firmic. Matern. Math. III 6 § 22 *faciet*

eunuchos, aut abscisos, archigallos aut hermafroditas. Prud. contr. Symm. II 863.

p. 88 l. 3 SANGVINEM IMPVRVM Minuc. 24 § 6 *quid? qui sanguine suo libat et uulneribus suis supplicat, non profanus melius esset, quam sic religiosus? aut cui exta sunt obscena demessa, quomodo deum uiolat, qui hoc modo placat!* The 24th March is *dies sanguinis* Marquardt IV 318 = III² 327 n. 2. Preller 737. esp. Prud. Peristeph. X 1061 sq. Allard Les dernières Persec. 196—7. Mart. XI 84. 3. Stat. Theb. X 170 [Tert.] poem ad senatorem [a] Chr. religione ad idola conversum [best published in Corp. Scr. Eccl. Lat. vol. XXIII pp. 227 ff. A.S.] 19.

LACERTOS La Cerda cites Sen. De Vita Beata 26 § 8 *cum sistrum aliquis concutiens, ex imperio mentitur; cum aliquis secandi lacertos suos artifex bracchia atque umeros suspensa manu cruentat.* id. Agamem. 687 *tristis lacerat bracchia tecum* cet. Mart. XI 84 3 *alba minus saevis lacerantur bracchia cultris, cum furit ad Phrygios enthea turba modos.* Prudent. peristeph. X 1061 *cultrum in lacertos exserit fanaticus, sectisque Matrem bracchiis placat deum.* Apul. Metam. VIII 27 *sua quisque bracchia dissicant.*

p. 88 l. 4 INTERCEPTI ἀποθανών gl. Colum. Quintil. Tac. Suet. (add Claud. 1. Nero 35 fin. Tib. 7). Ammian. Marcel.

p. 88 l. 6 DIPLOMATA Cic. Suet. (add Nero 12). Sen. dig. Plin. ad Tra. 64. 120. 121. Capitolin. Pertin. 1 § 6. CIL VIII 1027. Daremberg and Saglio Dict. art. 'Cursus Publicus' 1647. 1652.

EXCESSVM absol. cf. ἔξοδος. Also (with *excedere*, with which Cic. joins *e uita* or *uita*) in Tac. Suet. Cypr. Tert. ad Vxor. I 1 m.

p. 88 l. 8 CRETAM SVAM supr. 12 p. 44 l. 16 Origen contr. Cels. III 43 (Keim p. 40 n. 1). Clem. Hom. V 23. Arnob. I 34 fin. III 30. IV 14. Pacat. pan. 4. Prudent. contr. Symm. II 492. Claud. 4 Cons. Hon. 134 *Cretaque se iactat tenero raptata Tonanti.* Euseb. Praep. Eu. III 10 § 21 p. 107ᵇ.

p. 88 l. 8 sq. = ad nat. II 17 p. 130 l. 13 Wiss. 13 p. 123 l. 5 Wiss.

p. 88 l. 9 ANTRVM Verg. Georg. IV 152 *Dictaeo caeli*

regem pauere sub antro. Cic. De Nat. Deor. III 17 sq. 21. Clem. Alex. Protr. c. 2 p. 24 P. Lact. Diu. Instt. I 11 § 45. 21 § 37 seq.

AERA CORYBANTIA Lucr. II 633 sq. Aen. III 111. Ou. Fast. IV 207 sq. Arnob. III 41. Hygin. Fabulae 139.

p. 88 l. 10 NVTRICIS Minuc. 21 § 10 *et quae Iouis sacra sunt?* nutrix *capella est et auido patri subtrahitur infans, ne uoretur: et Corybantum cymbalis, ne pater audiat uagitus, tinnitus eliditur.*

p. 88 l. 12 IVNO Prudent. contr. Symm. II 495 *concessit et ipsa Iuno suos Phrygiis seruire nepotibus Afros, et quam subiectis dominam Dea gentibus esse, si qua fata sinant, iam tum tenditque fouetque, iussit Romuleis addictam uiuere frenis.* Iuu. 16 6 n. Lact. Diu. Instt. I 15 § 9 *Athenae Mineruam, Samos Iunonem.* Apul. Metam. VI 4 (Flor. § 15 (?)) *Magni Iouis germana et coniuga, siue tu Sami, quae sola partu uagituque et alimonia tua gloriatur,...siue celsae Carthaginis.*

p. 88 l. 14 QVOD SCIAM c. 23 fin. n.

p. 88 l. 22 DESTINATVM Liu. Curt. Sen. Tac. Suet.

p. 88 l. 23 LVPAE ad nat. I 4 p. 64 l. 29 Wiss. II 10 p. 113 l. 11 Wiss. Arnob. IV 3. Lact. I 20 § 1. Cic. Liu. Iuu.

LARENTINAE c. 13 p. 46 l. 30. Lact. I 20 § 2.

p. 88 l. 31 INCIDERENTVR c. 50 p. m. *imagines inscribitis et titulos inciditis in aeternitatem.*

p. 88 l. 32 RELIGIOSITATIS ad nat. II 17 p. 132 l. 6 Wiss. *seruant urbem Romam qui suas perdiderunt, si hoc religiositas Romana meruit. atqui non post summum imperium auctis iam rebus superstitio quaesita est? etsi a Numa sacra introducta sunt, nondum tamen aut simulacris aut templis res uestras diuina frustrabant. frugi religio et paupertina superstitio; altaria temeraria et uasa sordida et nidor paruus ex illis et deus ipse nusquam.*

POST Scorpiace c. 11 p. 526 Oehler, with note d (= p. 170 l. 22 Wiss.).

p. 88 l. 34 NVMA c. 21 *Pompilius Numa, qui Romanos operosissimis superstitionibus onerauit.* De Praescr. Haer. 40 *si Numae superstitiones reuoluamus, si sacerdotalia officia, insignia et priuilegia, si sacrificalia ministeria et instrumenta et*

uasa ipsorum sacrificiorum, ac piaculorum et uotorum curiositates consideramus, nonne manifeste diabolus morositatem Iudaicae legis imitatus est! Cic. Rep. II c. 14 § 26. De Nat. Deor. III § 43. Iuu. 6 343 n. [unpublished A.S.]. Lasaulx Studien p. 135 n. 214. 211 n. 58. Schwegler I 541 n. 4.

CONCEPTA c. 38 *aeque spectaculis uestris in tantum renuntiamus, in quantum originibus eorum, quas scimus de superstitione conceptas.*

CVRIOSITAS Aug. De Ciu. Dei VII 35 (I 319 2) *in illa igitur hydromantia curiosissimus rex ille Romanus et sacra didicit, quae in libris suis pontifices haberent, et eorum causas, quas praeter se neminem scire uoluit.* 'very rare' (1 Cic. 2 Tert. 1 Macrob.) LS. add ad nat. II 2 p. 95 l. 20 Wiss. 4 fin. De Cult. Fem. I 2. Ad Vxor. II 5. De Idolol. 9 p. 38 l. 11 Wiss. De Praescr. Haer. 8 pr. 14 pr. Apul. Metam. I 12 fin. III 14 pr. V 15. 19. 20 fin. 21. IX 13. XI 15. 22 fin. 23. [See Thes. for many more. A.S.]

NONDVM...SIMVLACRIS De Idolol. 3 pr. *idolum aliquamdiu retro non erat. priusquam huius monstri artifices ebullissent, sola templa et uacuae aedes erant, sicut in hodiernum quibusdam locis uetustatis uestigia permanent. tamen idololatria agebatur, non in isto nomine, sed in isto opere. nam et hodie extra templum et sine idolo agi potest. at ubi artifices statuarum et imaginum et omnis generis simulacrorum diabolus saeculo intulit, rude illud negotium humanae calamitatis et nomen de idolis consecutum est et profectum.* Plut. Numa 8. Varro in Aug. De Ciu. Dei IV 31. Ou. Fast. VI 295—8. More in Marquardt III 5 n. 1. Lasaulx 109 n. 40. 110—111. supra c. 16 no image in the Temple.

p. 88 l. 36 FRVGI RELIGIO ET PAVPERES RITVS *Numa pauper* Mart. XI 5 2. Plin. XVIII 2. 2 § 7 *Numa instituit deos fruge colere et mola salsa supplicare.*

CAPITOLIA Arnob. I 34.

p. 90 l. 1 TEMERARIA DE CAESPITE ALTARIA Iuu. 12 2—3 *festus promissa deis animalia caespes expectat.* Lucan IX 988 *erexit subitas congestu caespitis aras.* Apul. Metam. VII 10. βωμοὺς αὐτοσχεδίους Dionys. Halicarn. and Iamblich. in Oehler.

VASA Pers. II 59—60 *aurum uasa Numae Saturniaque*

impulit aera Vestalesque urnas et Tuscum fictile mutat. Schwegler I 541. Plut. Num. 8 (his offerings) *ἀναίμακτοι ἦσαν αἱ πολλαί, δι᾽ ἀλφίτου καὶ σπονδῆς καὶ τῶν εὐτελεστάτων πεποιημέναι.* Iuu. 6 342—5 *et quis tunc hominum contemptor numinis? aut quis simpuuium ridere Numae nigrumque catinum et Vaticano fragiles de monte patellas ausus erat?* 11 109. 116. Preller-Jordan I 129.

p. 90 l. 3 TVSCORVM De Spectac. 5 p. 6 l. 25 Wiss. *igitur in Etruria inter ceteros ritus superstitionum suarum spectacula quoque religionis nomine instituunt. inde Romani arcessitos artifices mutuantur, tempus, enuntiationem, ut ludi a Lydis uocarentur.* Liu. V 1 § 6 (of the Etruscans) *gens...ante omnes alias eo magis dedita religionibus, quod excelleret arte colendi eas.* Plin. Hist. Nat. XXXIV c. 7 § 34 *signa quoque Tuscanica per terras dispersa, quin in Etruria factitata sint non est dubium.*

p. 90 l. 5 OB HOC not ante-Aug. Liu. Sen. Colum. Suet. Aug. 94. Dom. 17. gr. 3. 16 (also *ob id, ea, haec, quae*).

p. 90 l. 6 INRELIGIOSITATE [The word c. 24 p. 84 l. 12, n. l. 28. A.S.] cf. Minuc. 25 *impiatum* cet. Iustin. Apol. I 12 p. 59[cd]. Dial. c. Tryph. 14 p. 213[d].

p. 90 l. 7 NI FALLOR cet. ad nat. II 17 p. 132 l. 16 Wiss. *nisi fallor enim, omne regnum imperium bellis quaeritur, et bellis ampliatur. porro laeduntur uictoribus et dei urbis. nam eadem strages et moenium et templorum, pares caedes et ciuium et sacerdotum, eaedem rapinae profanorum et sacrorum. tot sacrilegia...triumphi. manent et simulacra captiua.* infr. 40 p. 118 l. 8.

p. 90 l. 9. So Marcellus from Syracuse, Plut. Marcell. 21. Liu. XXV 40 §§ 1. 2.

p. 90 l. 13 DE DIS so the verb often e.g. Apul. Metam. XI 15 *de sua fortuna.*

p. 90 l. 15 CAPTIVORVM 10 a. m. *nunc ergo per singulos decurram tot et tantos, nouos ueteres, barbaros Graecos, Romanos peregrinos, captiuos adoptiuos.*

SVSTINENT 8 fin. *certe postea cognoscunt et sustinent et ignoscunt.* c. 15 p. 50 l. 16.

p. 90 l. 16 IMPERIVM SINE FINE Verg. Aen. I 278—9

Iuppiter to Venus of the Romans: *his ego nec metas rerum nec tempora pono, imperium sine fine dedi.* Archiv für lat. Lex. VII 300 f.

p. 90 l. 17 REMVNERASSE pass. c. 11 p. 40 l. 33. c. 46 p. 128 l. 10 cf. De Cult. Fem. I 2 p. m. *illud ipsum bonum feminarum naturalis decoris, ut causam mali, sic remunerauerunt.* Paulin. Nol. ep. 23, 31. 26, 2. Plin. ep. Quintil. decl. Petron. Apul. dig. [I have exx. from Ambst. Aug. and Ps.-Aug. A.S.]

QVI NIHIL SENTIVNT La Cerda cites Lact. Diu. Inst. II 4 § 9. 7 § 7 (?). VI 7 § 3 (?) n. on Iuu. 13 119 *statuamque Vagelli.*

p. 90 l. 24 sq. l. 31 seq. ad nat. II 17 p. 133 l. 8 Wiss. *regnum uniuersae nationes...habuerunt, ut Assyrii ut Medi ut Persae ut Aegyptii...quaerite quis temporum uices ordinauit. idem regna dispensat.* Minuc. 25 § 12 *et tamen ante eos Deo dispensante diu regna tenuerunt Assyrii, Medi, Persae, Graeci etiam et Aegyptii, cum Pontifices et Aruales et Salios et Vestales et Augures non haberent.*

Cap. XXVI

p. 90 l. 24 NE Hermas cod. Pal. uis. III 10. 9 *uidete, ergo, filii, ne forte hae dissensiones uestrae deserant uitam uestram.*

p. 90 l. 25 REGNATVR So in Tac.: the poets have *regnatus, regnandus.*

p. 90 l. 26 SAECVLVM c. 32 *clausulam saeculi.* c. 41 *finem saeculi.* Lact. Epit. 70 § 14 *cum certa et constituta diuinitus tempora compleri coeperint, interitum et consummationem rerum fieri necesse est, ut innouetur a Deo mundus....* § 15 *sed cum sint innumerabilia, quae de fine saeculi et conclusione temporum dicta sunt.*

p. 90 l. 29 SILVESTRIS Verg. Aen. VIII 346 *ad Capitolia ducit aurea nunc, olim siluestribus horrida dumis.*

p. 92 l. 1 IVDAEA cet. same argument Minuc. 33 *prius eos deseruisse comprehendes, quam esse desertos; nec, ut impie loqueris, cum Deo suo esse captos, sed a Deo ut disciplinae transfugas deditos.*

p. 92 l. 3 Schürer II³ 302.

FOEDERIBVS Ios. Antiq. XIV 16 relates the foedus between

the Jews and Romans, and c. 17 the decree of C. Caesar concerning the privileges, immunities and honours of the Jews (Woodham). cf. c. 21 p. 66 l. 34 sq.

p. 92 l. 4 DOMINATVRI EIVS: so *regnare, desinere, desistere* c. gen. Graece. The gen. also De Cult. Fem. I 1. (scripture ap. De Pudicit. 17 p. 256 l. 29 Wiss.). Apul. Asclep. 39. Lact. Diu. Instt. IV 14 § 3. Hermae Past. III 9. 23. Hieron. VI 194[a]. [Other exx. in Hier. Add Clem. Hil. Iren. lat. Priscill. Filast. Greg.-Illib. Aug. A.S.]

Cap. XXVII

p. 92 l. 6 INTENTATIONEM Here as 46 pr. u. l. *intentionem.* De Cult. Fem. I 4 *alteri ambitionis crimen intendimus, alteri prostitutionis.* Arnob. II 66 *quod nobis obiectare consuestis, ratione intenditur nulla.* In Cic. *int. actionem, litem,* etc. In Cic. Cornif. Quintil. *intentio*)(*depulsio.* Lact. Epit. 45 § 7 *intentabant autem pro crimine id ipsum, quod se Dei filium diceret.* On impiety see Arnob. I 29 pr. (Elmenh. p. 20).

p. 92 l. 7 NON ESSE 1 Cor. 8 4.

p. 92 l. 8 OBSTRVIMVS GRADVM c. 1 pr. *uiam.* De Virgin. Vel. 15 f. *temptationibus gradum.* De Praescr. Haer. 15 *hunc igitur potissimum gradum obstruimus, non admittendos eos.* cf. De Carn. Resur. 48 p. 98 l. 20 Kr. Many other metaphorical uses of *gradus* (from the palaestra) cited by Oehler on Scorp. 8 pr.

p. 92 l. 11 CONSECRATIONE De Cor. Milit. 10 pr. *nam et mortuorum est ita coronari, uel quoniam et ipsi idola statim fiunt et habitu et cultu consecrationis, quae apud nos secunda idololatria est.*

DEMENTIAM c. 50 *propterea...desperati et perditi existimamur.* De Spectac. 1 p. m. p. 1 l. 18 Wiss. *sunt qui existiment Christianos, expeditum morti genus, ad hanc obstinationem abdicatione uoluptatium erudiri, quo facilius uitam contemnant, amputatis quasi retinaculis eius.* Lact. Diu. Instt. V 13 § 2 *stultosque arbitrantur esse, qui cum habeant in potestate, supplicia sua uitare, cruciari tamen et emori malunt.* ibid. 18 § 12 *docui, ut opinor, cur populus noster apud stultos stultus*

habeatur. nam cruciari atque interfici malle, quam tura tribus digitis comprehensa in focum iactare, tam ineptum uidetur, quam in periculo uitae alterius animam magis curare quam suam. Plin. Ep. Trai. 96. Arr. Epict. IV 7 εἶτα ὑπὸ μανίας μὲν δύναταί τις οὕτω διατεθῆναι πρὸς ταῦτα (death, etc.) καὶ ὑπὸ ἔθους ὡς οἱ Γαλιλαῖοι, ὑπὸ λόγου δὲ καὶ ἀποδείξεως οὐδεὶς δύναται. M. Aurel. XI 3 οἵα ἐστὶν ἡ ψυχὴ ἡ ἕτοιμος, ἐὰν ἤδη ἀπολυθῆναι δέῃ τοῦ σώματος, καὶ ἤτοι σβεσθῆναι ἢ σκεδασθῆναι ἢ συμμεῖναι; τὸ δὲ ἕτοιμον τοῦτο, ἵνα ἀπὸ ἰδικῆς κρίσεως ἔρχηται, μὴ κατὰ ψιλὴν παράταξιν, ὡς οἱ Χριστιανοί, ἀλλὰ λελογισμένως καὶ σεμνῶς καὶ ὥστε καὶ ἄλλον πεῖσαι ἀτραγῴδως. Minuc. 11 §§ 2 3. 37 § 4. Lact. Epit. 57 § 13 *et si hominibus ineptum uidetur ac stultum torqueri et mori malle quam libare dis et abire sine noxa.* Euseb. Praep. Euang. VIII 6 § 10.

CVM POSSIMVS cet. c. 49 p. 142 l. 2 n.

p. 92 l. 13 OBSTINATIONEM c. 50 f. n. Iustin. Apol. II 12 pr. Otto's n. Kaye 110—1.

p. 92 l. 14 Scorpiac. 11 p. 170 l. 14 Wiss. *ipsi denique praesides cum cohortantur negationi: 'serua animam tuam' dicunt, et 'noli animam tuam perdere.'*

p. 92 l. 15 VNDE i.e. by demons c. 2 p. m. *suspecta sit uobis ista peruersitas, ne qua uis lateat in occulto, quae uos aduersus formam, aduersus naturam iudicandi, contra ipsas quoque leges ministret.* ibid. *nomen quod quaedam ratio aemulae rationis insequitur...nomen illius aemulae rationis inimicum.* Lact. Diu. Instt. II 1 § 13 *quanam istud ex causa fieri putemus? nisi esse aliquam peruersam potestatem, quae ueritatis sit semper inimica.* ib. V 21 § 3. Iustin. Apol. I 5 f. 10 f. 44. II 1. 5. 8. 11. 12. Dial. c. Tryph. 39. Minuc. 28 pr.

p. 92 l. 16 ASTVTIA SVADENDI Scorpiac. 11 pr. (cited above). Keim on Cels. I § 8 p. 6 n. 4.

p. 92 l. 17 DEICIENDAM c. 2 p. 10 l. 14 (cited above) De Spectac. 29 f. *uis et pugilatus et luctatus? praesto sunt...adspice impudicitiam deiectam a castitate.* In Cyprian *deici* ( )(*stare*) is used of the lapsed, who are laid low, receive a fall, from the devil. Cf. ind.

p. 92 l. 18 PARATVRAE make. c. 47 p. 134 l. 2 n.

p. 92 l. 19 DE as from a stronghold.

p. 92 l. 21 IN PRIMORDIO c. 1. 2.

p. 92 l. 22 SUBIECTA see below h. c. c. 37 p. 108 l. 29 n. De Cor. Milit. 11 a. m. *et quos interdiu exorcismis fugauit, noctibus defensabit, incumbens et requiescens super lonche, qua perfossum est latus Christi.* Harnack Medicinisches (Texte VIII 4) p. 120.

p. 92 l. 23 METVI is not wrong. Ou. Col. Verg. Aen. VII 661. VIII 432. Liu. XXIII 4 § 7. XXIV 31 § 3 etc. Plin. Ep. VII 27 § 13. VIII 8 § 5. ad Trai. 61 (= 69) § 2.

p. 92 l. 25 ODIVM cet. Minuc. 27 § 9 *ideo inserti mentibus imperitorum odium nostri serunt occulte per timorem: naturale est enim et odisse quem timeas et quem metueris infestare si possis.* Cic. De Off. II 7 § 23 *quem metuunt, oderunt; quem quisque odit, perisse expetit.* Persecution due to demons, Iustin. Apol. I 5 p. 55^{d}. 9 p. 57^{c}. 12 p. 59^{d}. 44 p. 82^{c}(?). II c. 5 p. 44^{b}. c. 8 p. 46^{c}. c. 11 p. 49^{e}. 50^{a}. Dial. c. Tryph. 39. Lact. Diu. Instt. V 21.

p. 92 l. 26 PRAEDAMNATIONE cult. fem. II 4 pr. Apol. c. 23 p. m. p. 82 l. 19 *renuant ob malitiam praedamnatos se in eundem iudicii diem.* Matt. 8 29. 2 Pet. 2 4: verb also De Ieiun. 15 pr. De Cult. Fem. I 2 f. De Idolol. 4 p. 33 l. 22 Wiss. Paulin. Nol. Ep. 18 7 f. 25 2 f.

p. 92 l. 28 SVCCIDVNT De Pudic. 1 p. 221 l. 15 Wiss. *quotiens uolunt nubunt, ne moechiae et fornicationi succidere cogantur.* De Cor. Milit. 6 *conditionem inuitam uanitati succidisse.*

DE LONGINQVO De Idolol. 12 p. 44 l. 1 Wiss. Scorpiac. 1 p. 146 l. 14 Wiss. De Cor. Milit. 10 p. m. De Pat. 3 pr. Adu. Hermog. 44 fin. De Spectac. 2 (see below). Is. 33. 13 bis in Adu. Iud. 13. Adu. Marc. III 5 pr. Cassian Coll. XI 1.

p. 92 l. 29 DE PROXIMO cet. De Spectac. c. 2 p. 2 l. 26 Wiss. *de longinquo, non de proximo.* c. 30 pr. Ad Vxor. I 8. II 3. De Cult. Fem. II 9. Apul. Metam. II 4. 21 pr. XI 6. 23 f. Minuc. 27 § 9 *Christianos de proximo fugitant, quos longe in coetibus per nos lacessebant.* Harnack (Texte VIII 4) p. 121.

VICE c. 34 pr. n. *dei uice.* De Idolol. 12 p. 44 l. 1 Wiss. De Pat. 1 p. 1 l. 17 Kr. Sall. hist. IV Fr. 67 (but Maurenb. *uicem*). Cic. ad Attic. X 8 *Sardanapalli uice* (but Müller

uicem) in suo lectulo mori. Apul. Metam. I 12 *uice Calypsonis.* IV 6 fin. *exigui tramitis uice.*

p. 92 l. 30 ERGASTVLORVM Adu. Marc. II 2 p. 335 l. 24 Kr. *in ergastulum terrae laborandae relegatus* (the fallen Adam). Plin. Hist. Nat. XVIII 3 § 21 fin. Iuu. 6. 151 *pueros omnes, ergastula tota.* 14. 24 n. *quem mire afficiunt inscripti, ergastula, carcer.* Casaub. ad Hist. August. I 386 (ed. 1671).

CARCERVM Ter. Lucil.

METALLORVM c. 12 p. 44 l. 14. c. 29 p. 94 l. 27. c. 39 p. 112 l. 17 n. c. 44 p. 124 l. 22. omn. De Cult. Fem. I 5 pr. *aurum et argentum principes materiae cultus saecularis id sint necesse est, unde sunt, terra scilicet, plane gloriosior, quoniam in maledictorum metallorum feralibus officinis poenali opera deplorata nomen terrae in igni reliquit, atque exinde de tormentis in ornamenta, de suppliciis in delicias, de ignominiis in honores, metalli refuga mutatur.* Dirksen Manuale s. u. *metallicus* subst. and *metallum.* In Egypt Diodor. Sicul. III 12 with Wesseling. V 35—38 Spanish mines. Leading (*honorati*) Manichaeans sentenced to the mines, Mos. et Rom. Leg. Collat. XV 3 § 7 (others to be burnt or beheaded). Misery of miners, Chrysost. Hom. in Matt. pp. 464[b]. 559[d]. Ambr. II 499 16. The fallen Adam (Tert. De Pall. 3 m. p. 928 Oehler) *pellitus orbi, ut metallo, datur.* Const. Apost. V 1 pr. Prayers for, Const. Apost. VIII 10 (I 1088 c Migne). Suet. Calig. 27, Caligula branded and sentenced to the beasts or the mines *multos honesti ordinis* (a slave's punishment). Kern in Pauly VI 1122–3 'seruitus poenae.' Mommsen Strafrecht 947 2.

p. 92 l. 31 HOC GENVS De Orat. 27 *alleluia...et hoc genus psalmos.* Suet. Tit. 7 f. Dom. 4. Aug. 75. Claud. 34. gr. Cato Varro Cic. Lucr. Apul. Metam. II 5 *lapillis et id genus friuolis.* III 17.

SERVITVTIS concr. as in Plaut. and Hor.

p. 92 l. 32 De Orat. 1 p. 181 l. 11 Wiss. *Dominum quem ultro suis prospicere certi sumus.*

p. 92 l. 34 DETRIVMPHAMVS Adu. Marc. I 2 [wrong reference A.S.]. Cypr. de Spect. 10 *diabolum illum, qui totum detriumphauerat mundum.* Minuc. 25 § 7 [see also Thes. A.S.].

p. 92 l. 35 FIDEI OBSTINATIONE *sententiae,* Cic. *animi,* Sen.

Tac. Hist. III 39 *Blaeso super claritatem natalium et elegantiam morum fidei obstinatio fuit*, a stubborn loyalty. plur. ad nat. I 17 pr. 19 pr.: sing., Apol. 50 f. n. ad nat. I 4 p. 64 l. 23 Wiss. 18 pr. De Exhort. Cast. 13 m.

Cap. XXVIII

p. 94 l. 1 cf. c. 24.

p. 94 l. 2 INVITOS Ad Scap. 2 pr. *ita etsi nos compuleritis ad sacrificandum, nihil praestabitis dis uestris; ab inuitis enim sacrificia non desiderabunt, nisi si contentiosi sunt; contentiosus autem deus non est.* Apol. 9 pr. *cum propriis filiis Saturnus non pepercit, extraneis utique non parcendo perseuerabat, quos quidem ipsi parentes sui offerebant, et libentes respondebant, et infantibus blandiebantur, ne lacrimantes immolarentur.*

AD SACRIFICANDVM Dispensation Euseb. Hist. Eccl. VIII 1 § 2 *τῶν κρατούντων αἱ περὶ τοὺς ἡμετέρους δεξιώσεις, οἷς καὶ τὰς τῶν ἐθνῶν ἐνεχείριζον ἡγεμονίας, τῆς περὶ τὸ θύειν ἀγωνίας κατὰ πολλήν, ἣν ἀπέσῳζον περὶ τὸ δόγμα, φιλίαν αὐτοὺς ἀπαλλάττοντες.* Cf. 2 § 5 *πάσῃ μηχανῇ θύειν ἐξαναγκάζεσθαι.* Conc. Illiber. c. 3 excommunication of flamens, *qui non immolauerint, sed munus tantum dederint.* Cf. 4. 55. Lact. De Mort. Persec. 15 § 1 *primam omnium filiam Valeriam coniugemque Priscam sacrificio pollui coegit.* § 4 *indices per omnia templa dispersi uniuersos ad sacrificia cogebant.* § 5 *ne cui temere ius diceretur, arae in secretariis ac pro tribunali positae, ut litigatores prius sacrificarent atque ita causas suas dicerent.* Euseb. De Mart. Palaest. 2 § 1.

p. 94 l. 5 PRAE MANV De Test. Anim. 4 f. *si de aliquo iam pridem defuncto tamquam de uiuo quis requirat, prae manu occurrit dicere: abiit iam et reuerti debet.* Scorpiac. 10 p. 168 l. 22 Wiss. Apul. Metam. VI 18 *aes si forte prae manu non fuerit.* Plaut. Ter. Gell. dig.

p. 94 l. 6 De Idolol. 21 p. 55 l. 7 Wiss. *scio quendam, cui Dominus ignoscat, cum illi in publico per litem dictum esset: Iuppiter tibi sit iratus, respondisse: "immo tibi." quid aliter fecisset ethnicus, qui Iouem deum credidit?*

p. 94 l. 7 QVA VELIT = *utrauis.*

QVID TIBI MECVM EST my n. on Plin. ep. III 9 § 27 p. 162—3. Tert. De Cor. Milit. 15 m. *quid tibi cum flore morituro?* Adu. Marc. I 25 p. 325 l. 19 Kr. *quid illi cum Christo, molesto et Iudaeis per doctrinam et sibi per Iesum?...et quid illi cum Epicuro, nec sibi nec Christianis necessario?* ib. 11 p. 304 l. 1 Kr. *quid ergo illi cum extraneis?*

p. 94 l. 10 AD SECVNDVM TITVLVM c. 10 pr. *deos, inquitis, non colitis et pro imperatoribus sacrificia non impenditis. sequitur ut eadem ratione pro aliis non sacrificemus, quia nec pro nobis ipsis, semel deos non colendo. itaque sacrilegii et maiestatis rei conuenimur.* infr. c. 32 Christians swore *per salutem* (but not *per genium*) *imperatoris.* ad Scap. 2. ad nat. I 17 pr. *prima obstinatio est, quae secunda a deis religio constituitur Caesarianae maiestatis, quod inreligiosi dicamur in Caesares, neque imagines eorum ture propitiando neque genios deierando hostes populi nuncupamur.* Theophil. I 11 pr. τοιγαροῦν μᾶλλον τιμήσω τὸν βασιλέα, οὐ προσκυνῶν αὐτῷ, ἀλλ᾽ εὐχόμενος ὑπὲρ αὐτοῦ (he had been speaking of idols). Bayle œuvres III 381.

p. 94 l. 12 Minuc. Oct. 29 § 5 *sic eorum* (*principum et regum*) *numen uocant, ad imagines supplicant, genium, id est daemonem eorum implorant, et est eis tutius per Iouis genium peierare quam regis.*

OBSERVATIS Verg. Georg. IV 210—2 *praeterea regem non sic Aegyptos et ingens Lydia nec populi Parthorum aut Medus Hydaspes obseruant.* Cic.

p. 94 l. 13 ET MERITO Adu. Marc. V 4 p. 582 l. 6 Kr. Adu. Iud. 9.

p. 94 l. 14 MORTVO POTIOR c. 29 pr. c. 30 pr. n. *homines qui utique uiuunt et mortuis antistant.* Chrys. De Sancto Babyla oper. I 664—5 cited in Bayle Babylas n. E. Eccles. 9 4 a living dog is better than a dead lion. Cypr. Ad Demetrian. 14.

p. 94 l. 15 PRAESENTANEAE (cf. *consecraneus* 16. *consentaneus* classical) ad nat. I 7 p. 68 l. 23 Wiss.: generally with *remedium* Plin. and Marcel. Empir. p. 313 8. Sen. Suet., *uenenum* Plin. and Gell. VII (VI) c. 4 § 1 [but Hosius reads *praesentarium* A. S.].

p. 94 l. 16 IRRELIGIOSI Arnob. IV 30 pr. [cf. c. 13 pr. n. A.S.]. DEPREHENDEMINI c. 13 pr.

p. 94 ll. 17—18 Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IV 15 §§ 18. 19. 21 (to Polycarp, the proconsul) ὄμοσον τὴν Καίσαρος τύχην. § 21 "If you vainly imagine that I shall swear by the fortune of Caesar, as pretending that you know not who I am, be assured once for all that I am a Christian." Apol. c. 16 p. m. *religio Romanorum tota castrensis signa ueneratur, signa iurat, signa omnibus dis praeponit.* infr. c. 32 (p. 98 l. 29 n.) *sed et iuramus, sicut non per genios Caesarum, ita per salutem eorum, quae est augustior omnibus geniis.* c. 35 p. 104 l. 20. ad nat. I 17 p. 89 l. 16 Wiss. *sed aliud opinor est non iurare per genium Caesaris.* I 10 p. 78 l. 6 Wiss. *immo iam per deos deierandi periculum euanuit, potiore habita religione per Caesarem deierandi, quod et ipsum ad offuscationem pertinet deorum uestrorum; facilius enim per Caesarem peierantes punirentur quam per ullum Iouem.* Ad Scap. 2 *iidem ipsi, qui per genios eorum in pridie usque iurauerant, qui pro salute eorum hostias et fecerant et uouerant, qui Christianos saepe damnauerant, hostes eorum sunt reperti.* Melito Apol. 4 pr. (ex Syr. IX 425 Otto) *ego uero dico quod etiam Sibylla de eis dixit, eos simulacra regum mortuorum adorare. atque hoc facile est intellectu; nam ecce etiamnunc adorant simulacra Caesarum ac magis uenerantur quam illa priora.* Philostr. Apoll. I 15 § 2 in a dearth in Pamphylia the mob rose against the governor and were about to burn him καίτοι προσκείμενον τοῖς βασιλείοις ἀνδριᾶσιν, οἳ καὶ τοῦ Διὸς τοῦ ἐν Ὀλυμπίᾳ φοβερώτεροι ἦσαν τότε καὶ ἀσυλότεροι, Τιβερίου γ' ὄντες. Minuc. 29 § 5 cited above. dig. XII 2 13 § 6 *siquis iurauerit in re pecuniaria per genium principis, dare se non oportere, et peierauerit,...imperator noster cum patre* [Septim. Seu. et Antonin. Carac.] *rescripsit fustibus eum castigatum dimitti et ita ei superdici:* προπετῶς μὴ ὄμνυε.—cod. IV 1 2 Imp. Alexander A. Felici *iurisiurandi contempta religio satis Deum ultorem habet. periculum autem corporis uel maiestatis crimen secundum constituta diuorum parentum meorum, etsi per principis uenerationem quodam calore fuerit peieratum, inferri non placet.* Cf. On offences against diuus Augustus Suet. Tib. 58. On swearing by the *genius Caesaris*, Lightfoot on Martyr. Polycarpi 9 (II 962—3). E. Beurlier, Le Culte impérial, son histoire et son organisation depuis Auguste jusqu'à Justinien.

Paris 1891 (p. 156 n. 12), 'il est très rare, dans les dédicaces faites à la fois à Auguste et à un autre dieu, fût-ce Jupiter, de voir le nom du prince au second rang' (but see Mommsen Staatsr. II² 784 n. 4, cf. p. 783). Orig. Exhort. ad Mart. 7 (XX 240—1 L.). Lasaulx Studien d. klass. Alterthums (1854) p. 212 n. 27. Lightfoot Ignatius II 762—3. Acta Mart. Scillit. § 1 (cf. 2. 3). Rufin. Hist. Eccl. IV 15 p. 209 sq. Apul. Metam. IX 41 (Hildebrand p. 867).

Cap. XXIX

p. 94 l. 22 PERDITI CONSERVANT De Cult. Fem. I 2 *haec qualia sint, interim iam ex doctorum suorum qualitate et condicione pronuntiari potest, quod nihil ad integritatem peccatores, nihil ad castitatem adamatores, nihil ad timorem dei desertores spiritus aut monstrare potuerunt aut praestare.* Cypr. De Idol. Van. 3 f. [from Minuc. 26 § 7] *spiritus insinceri et uagi…non desinunt perditi perdere et deprauati errorem prauitatis infundere.*

p. 94 l. 24 VIVOS c. 30 pr. n.

p. 94 l. 25 AEDES struck by lightning Sen. Nat. Quaest. II 42 1. Lucr. II 1101—4. VI 416—9. Aristoph. Nub. 399 sq. Minuc. 5 § 9. Mart. IV 21. Diog. Laert. VI 74. Lucian Iupp. Conf. 17. Cic. De Diuinat. II § 104 cet.: arson Arnob. VI 23.

p. 94 l. 26 EXCVBIIS Clem. Recogn. V 15. Iuu. 14 260 n. sq. *ad uigilem ponendi Castora nummi, ex quo Mars Vltor galeam quoque perdidit et res non potuit seruare suas.* De Cor. Milit. 11 a. m. *et excubabit pro templis, quibus renuntiauit?…quos interdiu exorcismis fugauit, noctibus defensabit.* De Idolol. 11 (Christians not to sell things used for idolatry) p. 42 l. 22 Wiss. *qua constantia exorcizabit alumnos suos, quibus domum suam cellarium praestat!* Arnob. VI 20 *cur eos* [*deos*] *sub ualidissimis clauibus ingentibusque sub claustris habetis inclusos, ac ne forte fur aliquis aut nocturnus irrepat latro, aedituis mille protegitis atque excubitoribus mille!* Cypr. ad Demetr. 14 *quid praestare colentibus possunt qui se de non colentibus uindicare non possunt! nam si eo qui uindicatur pluris est ille qui uindicat, tu dis tuis maior es. si ergo his quos colis maior es, non tu eos colere, sed*

ab illis coli debes. sic illos laesos ultio uestra defendit, quomodo et clausos ne pereant tutela uestra custodit. pudeat te eos colere quos ipse defendis, pudeat tutelam de eis sperare quos tu tueris. Ambros. De Virginit. II 5 §§ 36—7. Lact. Diu. Instt. II 4 § 5. V 20 § 3. Aristid. Apol. 3. Iustin. Apol. I 9 p. 58[a]. [Melito] Apol. 10. Ep. Diognet. 2 p. 495[c]. omn. Chrys. II 547[c] sq. Hennecke Aristid. ind. τηρέω. Mommsen Strafrecht 311 1.

MATERIAE cet. c. 12 f. *in metalla damnamur. inde censentur di uestri.* 27 (p. 92 l. 30 n.).

p. 94 l. 28 IRATVM Bayle œuvres III 85. Sen. De Ira I 20 § 8.

p. 94 l. 29 FACIT c. 23 p. 80 l. 22.

PROPITIVM 5 pr. *facit et hoc ad causam nostram, quod apud uos de humano arbitratu diuinitas pensitatur. nisi homini deus placuerit, deus non erit; homo iam deo propitius esse debebit.* Ambr. ad Valentinian. adu. Symm. [= epist. 18 A. S.] § 8 *uos pacem dis uestris ab imperatoribus obsecratis, nos ipsis imperatoribus a Christo pacem rogamus.*

p. 96 l. 3 PLVMBATIS c. 12 p. 44 l. 11 *ante plumbum et glutinum et gomphos sine capite sunt di uestri.* c. 42 f. *denique porrigat manum Iuppiter et accipiat.*

CAP. XXX

p. 96 l. 7 cf. end of chapter. c. 19 Fuld. p. 62. c. 39 pr. *oramus etiam pro imperatoribus, pro ministeriis eorum ac potestatibus.* Ad Scap. 2 m. *Christianus nullius est hostis, nedum imperatoris, quem sciens a deo suo constitui necesse est ut et ipsum diligat et reuereatur et honoret et saluum uelit cum toto Romano imperio...itaque et sacrificamus pro salute imperatoris, sed deo nostro et ipsius, sed quomodo praecepit deus, pura prece...ita nos magis oramus pro salute imperatoris, ab eo eam postulantes, qui praestare potest.* Cypr. ad Demetrian. 20 f. *pro pace ac salute uestra propitiantes et placantes deum diebus ac noctibus.* Arn. IV 36 f. heathen prayers for the state. Lasaulx Studien 152 n. 85. Mart. VII 59 in Hau. Chrys. XI 579[a]. Bingham XIII 10 5. Galerius A.D. 311 asked for the prayers of the Church and gave indulgence for Christians, on condition

of praying for the state. Lact. De Mort. Persec. 34 § 5 *unde, iuxta hanc indulgentiam nostram, debebunt deum suum orare pro salute nostra et rei publicae ac sua, ut undique uersum res publica praestetur incolumis et securi uiuere in sedibus suis possint* = Euseb. Hist. Eccl. VIII 17 § 10. (Hänel Corp. Leg. p. 185.) Rufin. Hist. Eccl. VIII 19. IX 10 p. 539. *iugiter atque instanter oramus* [whence? A.S.]. Athenag. c. 37 (concludes with a prayer for the Antonines. Cf. 1 Tim. 2 vv. 1 2. Prayer to be said by heathen soldiers on behalf of the emperor and his family, Euseb. Vit. Const. IV 20. Schürer II[3] c. 1 304. Clem. Rom. Ep. I 61. edd. Harnack Patr. Apost. I (1)[2] p. 103 sq. and Funk). 1 p. 2[bis] *ἡμεῖς δὲ οἱ λεγόμενοι Χριστιανοί, ὅτι μὴ προενοήσθε καὶ ἡμῶν, συγχωρεῖτε δὲ μηδὲν ἀδικοῦντας, ἀλλὰ καὶ πάντων, ὡς προϊόντος τοῦ λόγου δειχθήσεται, εὐσεβέστατα διακειμένους καὶ δικαιότατα πρός τε τὸ θεῖον καὶ τὴν ὑμετέραν βασιλείαν, ἐλαύνεσθαι καὶ φέρεσθαι καὶ διώκεσθαι.* Tatian 4 pr. *προστάττει φόρους τελεῖν ὁ βασιλεύς; ἕτοιμος παρέχειν. δουλεύειν ὁ δεσπότης καὶ ὑπηρετεῖν; τὴν δουλείαν γινώσκων. τὸν μὲν γὰρ ἄνθρωπον ἀνθρωπίνως τιμητέον, φοβητέον δὲ μόνον τὸν θεόν· ὅστις ἀνθρώπινος οὐκ ἔστιν ὁρατὸς ὀφθαλμοῖς, οὐ τέχνῃ περιληπτός. τοῦτον μόνον ἀρνεῖσθαι κελευόμενος οὐ πεισθήσομαι, τεθνήξομαι δὲ μᾶλλον, ἵνα μὴ ψεύστης καὶ ἀχάριστος ἀποδειχθῶ.* Theophil. I 11 *τοιγαροῦν μᾶλλον τιμήσω τὸν βασιλέα, οὐ προσκυνῶν αὐτῷ ἀλλὰ εὐχόμενος ὑπὲρ αὐτοῦ· θεῷ δὲ τῷ ὄντως θεῷ καὶ ἀληθεῖ προσκυνῶ, εἰδὼς ὅτι ὁ βασιλεὺς ὑπ' αὐτοῦ γέγονεν...τὸν δὲ βασιλέα τίμα εὐνοῶν αὐτῷ, ὑποτασσόμενος αὐτῷ, εὐχόμενος ὑπὲρ αὐτοῦ.* Iustin. Apol. I 14. 17 *θεὸν μὲν μόνον προσκυνοῦμεν, ὑμῖν δὲ πρὸς τὰ ἄλλα χαίροντες, ὑπηρετοῦμεν, βασιλεῖς καὶ ἄρχοντας ἀνθρώπων ὁμολογοῦντες καὶ εὐχόμενοι μετὰ τῆς βασιλικῆς δυνάμεως καὶ σώφρονα τὸν λογισμὸν ἔχοντας ὑμᾶς εὑρεθῆναι.* Euseb. Hist. Eccl. X 8 § 16. Vit. Const. IV § 4. II 12 § 1 Licinius charges the bishops with praying for Constantine and not for him. Orig. contr. Cels. VIII 70 p. 214. (Lomm. t. XX) 73 p. 220 (L. t. XX) sqq. Concil. Chalced. act. 4 (Hefele II [Freib. 1856] p. 489 f.). Bailey Rituale Anglo-cath. 16. 20. 32—34. 174. Prudent. Peristeph. X 426—8. Cypriani Acta Procons. 1 (p. cx l. 18—20).

p. 96 l. 10 QVA HOMINES c. 5 m. *Domitianus, portio Neronis de crudelitate, sed qua et homo, facile coeptum repressit.*

p. 96 l. 12 SECVNDI c. 33 *temperans maiestatem Caesaris infra deum, magis illum commendo deo, cui soli subicio.—sec. a quo.* Hirt. Liu. Hor. Iustin. XVIII 4 § 5. XXXII 1 § 9. Tert. Adu. Prax. 5 fin. 7 fin. Ad Scap. 2 p. m. *colimus ergo et imperatorem sic, quomodo et nobis licet et ipsi expedit, ut hominem a Deo secundum et, quicquid est a Deo consecutum, solo Deo minorem.* My Latin Heptateuch p. 207 l. 10. Barrow in C. Wordsworth Chr. Instt. IV 151.

SVPER OMNES DEOS Ad Scap. 2 p. m. *hoc et ipse < imperator > uolet. sic enim omnibus maior est, dum solo uero Deo minor est; sic et ipsis dis maior est, dum et ipsi in potestate sunt eius.* Veget. Epit. Rei Mil. II 5 *iurant per Deum, et per Christum et per Spiritum sanctum, et per maiestatem imperatoris, quae secundum Deum generi humano diligenda est et colenda.*

p. 96 l. 13 VIVVNT ET MORTVIS ANTISTANT c. 10. c. 29 pr. p. 94 l. 23 *si denique, quod in conscientia uestra est, mortui uiuos tuentur.* c. 28 fin. *quis enim ex uiuentibus non quolibet mortuo tuo* [om. ?] *potior?*

p. 96 l. 14 ANTISTANT De Virg. Veland. 10 p. m. *non enim et continentia uirginitati antistat.* De Fug. in Persec. 3 f. *nos autem, puto, multis passeribus antistamus* (cf. Matt. 10 31 in De Carn. Resur. 13 fin. 35 p. 77 l. 10 Kr.). Sil. IX 538. Gellius VI 5 1. Amm. Apul. Metam. IV 8. Ennius Agam. fr. 11 (271 Trag. Vahlen) *plebes in hoc regi antistat.* Fronto p. 8 4. [See Thes. A.S.]

RECOGITANT Plaut. Cic. (1). Sen. Colum. Tert. Exhort. Cast. 3 pr. 10 pr. 12 a. m. De Cor. Mil. 10 p. m. De Idolol. 11 pr. De Monog. 3 f. LS have 'Ad Max.' read 'Ad Vx. I 4 fin.' not "rare."

p. 96 l. 17 CAPTIVVM as the models of cities, mountains, etc. Hor. epist. II 1 193 *captiua Corinthus.*

p. 96 l. 18 seq. supra c. 25. infr. c. 33 (cited on p. 96, 12) *si homo sit, interest hominis deo cedere.* Ad Scapul. 2 p. m. (cited above on p. 96, 12 and 7) *non enim eget Deus, conditor uniuersitatis, odoris aut sanguinis alicuius.* Hor. Carm. III 6 5 *dis te minorem quod geris, imperas.* Plin. Panegyr. 2 § 4.

p. 96 l. 21 ILLVC SVSPICIENTES Arnob. II 3 (supr. 17 fin.).

p. 96 l. 22 MANIBVS EXPANSIS raising hands. Ps. 119 48. Isai. I 15. I Tim. 2 8 Price. James 4 8. Tert. Adu. Marc. I 23 p. 322 l. 22 Kr. *ad alienum caelum alii deo expanditur.* III 18 p. 407 l. 14 ff. Kr. of Moses. De Orat. 13 p. 188 l. 22 Wiss. Cf. ad fin. cap. *expansos...habitum orantis Christiani.* Kaye 383. 429 (from Adu. Marc. I 23 fin.). De Orat. 14 fin. *nos uero non attollimus tantum, sed etiam expandimus, et dominicam passionem modulantes et orantes confitemur Christo.* 29 fin. *sed et aues mane exsurgentes eriguntur ad caelum, et alarum crucem pro manibus expandunt et dicunt aliquid quod oratio uideatur.* De Baptismo 20 fin. *cum de illo sanctissimo lauacro noui natalis ascenditis et primas manus apud matrem cum fratribus aperitis, petite de patre, petite de domino peculia gratiae.* De Spectac. 25 p. 25 l. 16 Wiss. *illas manus, quas ad deum extuleris, postmodum laudando histrionem fatigare!* Lasaulx 154 n. 97—99. Athanas. Vit. Ant. 54. Paulin. Vit. Ambr. 47 *expansis manibus in modum crucis orauit.* Clem. Alex. Strom. VII § 40 pr. p. 854 P. ταύτῃ < τῇ ἐνδιαθέτῳ ὁμιλίᾳ > καὶ προσανατείνομεν τὴν κεφαλὴν καὶ τὰς χεῖρας εἰς οὐρανὸν αἴρομεν. K. F. Hermann Alterth. II^2 (1858) § 21 n. 10. Marquardt III^2 178 n. 8. [Lucian] Philopatris 29 ἡμεῖς δὲ τὸν ἐν Ἀθήναις Ἄγνωστον ἐφευρόντες καὶ προσκυνήσαντες χεῖρας εἰς οὐρανὸν ἐκτείναντες τούτῳ εὐχαριστήσομεν. Lucret. V 1200—1 *nec procumbere humi prostratum et pandere palmas ante deum delubra.* Prudent. Peristeph. VI 106—8 (like the cross: so Maxim. Taur. hom. 2 de passione, Migne P. L. LVII 342^c 343^a. [Paulin. above and Aug. Serm. 342 § 1. 352 § 6. A.S.]). Aristot. De Mundo VI 31. Lact. De Mort. Persec. 46. Euseb. Vit. Const. IV 18. 19. H. E. VIII 7 § 4. Athan. ep. ad Serapion. 3 (I 270^b) τάς τε χεῖρας ἐκτείνας πρὸς τὸν θεόν. Synes. ep. 11 ad fin. Chrys. XI 664^c. Smith Dict. Chr. Ant. 'Prayer.' Acad. 10 Febr. (1894) p. 125. Prof. Ramsay Ch. in Roman Empire 421. Bingham XIII 8 § 10. Le Blant Les Actes des Martyres III (1883) 100.

CAPITE NVDO)(*capite operto.* Cypr. De Laps. 1 (p. 238 5) *ab impio sceleratoque uelamine quo illic uelabantur sacrificantium capita captiua, caput uestrum liberum mansit. aperto*

capite = Graeco ritu. Suet. Vitell. 2 *idem miri in adulando ingenii, primus C. Caesarem adorare ut deum instituit, cum reuersus ex Syria non aliter adire ausus esset quam capite uelato.* Marquardt III^2 176 n. 6. Plut. Qu. Rom. 10 p. 266^c Wytt. Plaut. Amph. 5 1 44, *capite operto.* Bingham XIII 8 § 9. Kaye 384.

p. 96 l. 23 SINE MONITORE Kaye 387—8 not like the heathen c. 35 *de nostris annis tibi Iuppiter augeat annos.*)(*praeire uerba.* King Primitive Church II 33—42 no forms. Thuc. VI 32 prayers of the fleet before the Sicilian expedition ὑπὸ κήρυκος. Marquardt III^2 178—9. Bingham XIII 5 5 (IV 388). *monitor sacrorum* (Orelli 3142. 5670 = Wilmanns 1761. 1758). Mommsen in Rh. Mus. XIX (1864) 458 esp. Plin. XXVIII § 11.

p. 96 l. 24 PRECANTES cet. c. 33. 39. Arnob. IV 36 f. Cyril. Hierosol. Catech. 5 mystagog. c. 8 (Migne P. G. XXXIII 1116^a). Athenag. Suppl. 37 τίνες γὰρ καὶ δικαιότεροι ὧν δέονται τυχεῖν, ἢ οἵτινες περὶ μὲν τῆς ἀρχῆς τῆς ὑμετέρας εὐχόμεθα, ἵνα παῖς μὲν παρὰ πατρὸς κατὰ τὸ δικαιότατον διαδέχησθε τὴν βασίλειαν, αὔξην δὲ καὶ ἐπίδοσιν καὶ ἡ ἀρχὴ ὑμῶν, πάντων ὑποχειρίων γινομένων, λαμβάνῃ; τοῦτο δ' ἐστὶ καὶ πρὸς ἡμῶν, ὅπως ἤρεμον καὶ ἡσύχιον βίον διάγοιμεν [= 1 Tim. 2 2. A. S.], αὐτοὶ δὲ πάντα τὰ κεκελευσμένα προθύμως ὑπηρετοῖμεν. Tert. Ad Scap. 2 (cited on p. 96, 7). Prudent. Peristeph. X 417—420 (partly cited below). Lightfoot Ignatius I 576. Euseb. Vit. Const. IV 45 § 2. Bailey Rituale Anglo-Cathol. 174 (Church militant prayer). Dionys. Alex. epist. 1 p. 31 l. 4 ed. Feltoe, cited by Herald. in Orelli Arnob. II 259. 1 Tim. 2 2 Grot. Pirke Avoth c. 3 § 2 p. 43 ed. Taylor^2. Ps. 15. Esdr. 6 10. Ioseph. VII 17. XII 17 cet. Elmenhorst on Arnob. IV 36 f. (p. 152) (bk IV f.).

p. 96 l. 26 ORBEM QVIETVM Prudent. Peristeph. 419 420 *atque subiugatis hostibus | ductor quietum frenet orbem legibus* (La Cerda).

p. 96 l. 29 PRAESTAT cet. c. 33 *non solum ab eo postulo eam* [*salutem*] *qui potest praestare, aut quod talis postulo qui merear impetrare.* Lact. De Mort. Persec. 52 f. to a confessor: *tu praecipue, Donate carissime, qui a Deo mereris audiri, Dominum*

deprecare. Woodham. Ad Scap. 2 a. f. *ita nos magis oramus pro salute imperatoris, ab eo eam postulantes, qui praestare potest.*

p. 96 ll. 29—30 c. 33 p. 100 l. 8 cited above. c. 29 f. *insuper eos debellatis, qui eam < salutem imperatorum > sciunt petere, qui etiam possunt impetrare, dum sciunt petere.* c. 45 f. *merito soli innocentiae occurrimus.*

p. 96 l. 31 OPIMAM Plin. VIII § 183 *hinc* (of bulls) *uictimae opimae et lautissima deorum placatio. maiores)(lactentes.* Henzen Acta Fr. Arual. 143.

p. 96 l. 32 the *sacrifice* of prayer 1 Sam. 15 22. Ps. 50 8—14. 51 16—17. Prov. 21 3. Kaye 424. Lact. Diu. Instt. VI 25 § 11. Adu. Iud. 5 ante fin. p. 710 l. ult. Oehler. De Orat. 27 *est optimum utique institutum omne quod praeponendo et honorando deo competit saturatam orationem uelut opimam hostiam admouere.* 28 *haec est enim hostia spiritalis quae pristina sacrificia deleuit....nos sumus ueri adoratores et ueri sacerdotes, qui spiritu orantes spiritu sacrificamus orationem hostiam dei propriam et acceptabilem, quam scilicet requisiuit, quam sibi prospexit. hanc de toto corde deuotam, fide pastam, ueritate curatam, innocentia integram, castitate mundam agapen coronatam cum pompa operum bonorum inter psalmos et hymnos deducere ad dei altare debemus, omnia nobis a deo impetraturam.* De Ieiun. 10 fin. *pinguiorem orationem deo immolat.* De Idolol. 6 fin. *negas te quod facis colere? sed illi non negant, quibus hanc saginatiorem et auratiorem et maiorem hostiam caedis, salutem tuam.* Ad Scap. 2 p. m. (cited on p. 96 l. 7; then after *prece*) *non enim eget deus, conditor uniuersitatis, odoris aut sanguinis alicuius. haec enim daemoniorum pabula sunt.* Iren. IV 14 § 3. Athenag. 13 (n. 7 Otto). Iustin. Apol. I 9. 13. Ep. ad Diogn. 3. Minuc. 32 § 2 seq.

p. 96 l. 33 THVRIS 4 grains Luc. Iupp. Trag. 15 p. 659 (II 356 ed. Jacobitz)(De Mnesitheo). Tert. De Idolol. 11 p. 41 l. 20 Wiss. Arnob. VI 3 pr. VII 27 sq. Prudent. Peristeph. III 121—130, especially 121—5 *haec, rogo, quis labor est fugere? | si modicum salis eminulis | turis et exiguum digitis | tangere uirgo benigna uelis, | poena grauis procul afuerit.* X 916—8 *reponit aras ad tribunal denuo | et tus et ignem uiuidum in carbonibus,*

taurina et exta uel suilla abdomina. Portable altars, Daremberg and Saglio Dictionnaire s.v. *ara* p. 349 fig. 415. 416. Le Blant Les Actes des Martyrs p. 63 § 20 (Allard La Persécution de Dioclétien, 1890 I 48 49). Petri episc. Alexandr. can. 5 (306 A.D.) in Routh Reliq. Sacr. IV 23 seq. Some offered incense by pagans. can. 14 others had their hands held (cf. Concil. Ancyr. A.D. 314 can. 3). Lact. Diu. Instt. V 18 § 12 *docui, ut opinor, cur populus noster apud stultos stultus habeatur. nam cruciari atque interfici malle quam tura tribus digitis comprehensa in focum iactare, tam ineptum uidetur, quam in periculo uitae alterius animam magis curare quam suam.* I 20 § 26 *nec tamen desinunt ea colere quae fugiunt et oderunt: colunt enim ture ac summis digitis quae sensibus intimis horrere debuerunt.* Hieronym. Ep. 14 § 5 *non est tantum in eo seruitus idoli, si quis duobus digitulis tura conprehensa in bustum arae iaciat, aut haustum patera fundat merum.*

VNIVS ASSIS c. 14 pr. n. Catull. 5. 3 Ellis. *passer unius assis* (Matt. 10 29 in Tert. De Fug. in Persec. 3 f. and De Exhort. Cast. 1 f.). Otto Sprichwörter 39 (does not know Tert.). Plaut. Poen. 451 *quiue ullum turis granum sacrificauerit.* Ou. Fast. IV 410 *turea grana.* Plin. XII § 83 *aestimentur postea toto orbe singulis annis tot funera, aceruatimque congesta honori cadauerum quae dis per singulas micas dantur.* On offerings of *tus* Arnob. VII 26—28.

p. 96 l. 34 ARABICAE De Cor. Milit. 10 a. m. *si me odor alicuius loci offenderit, Arabiae aliquid incendo, sed non eodem ritu nec eodem habitu nec eodem apparatu, quo agitur apud idola.* Martian. Cap. § 215 with Kopp. Plin. XII § 51 *tura praeter Arabiam nullis, ac ne Arabiae quidem uniuersae.* Verg. Georg. II 117 *solis est turea uirga Sabaeis* (Cerda there).

LACRIMAS Verg. Colum. Plin. Marc.-Empir. p. 317 17 & 30. Theod. Prisc. I 4 m. I 19 m. & p. m. [I cannot verify the reff. in Theod. Prisc., but see Rose's index. A. S.]

MERI Arnob. VII 26 pr. 32 pr. 29 pr. *merum turis est socium.* 30 *et quae grauior infligi contumelia dis potest, quam si eos credas accepto mero propitios fieri, aut honorem existimes habitum his magnum, si modo uini exigui rores super uiuidam ieceris atque instillaueris prunam?* Cf. 31. Verg. Georg. IV

384 *ter liquido ardentem perfudit nectare Vestam.* Suet. Galb. 18 (in Haverk.).

p. 96 l. 35 REPROBI BOVIS c. 14 pr. n. Iuu. 12 95—7 *libet expectare, quis aegram et claudentem oculos gallinam impendat amico tam sterili.* reprobus ἀδόκιμος. dig. uulg. of bad money; Leu. 22 20—22. Deut. 15 21. Mal. 1 8. Winer Realwörterb. 'Opfer.' Iulian. Misopogon 361[b]—362[d] he went to Daphne to the temple on a great feast, expecting processions and victims and libations and choirs in white raiment. The priest had brought a goose as his offering, the city nothing, though the temple was largely endowed.

INQVINAMENTA 15 a. m. p. 50 l. 22. De Spectac. 8 p. 10 l. 10 Wiss. 10 p. 13 l. 12 Wiss. 15 pr. De Carne Christi 20 f. De Cult. Fem. II 7. Ad Vx. II 2 p. m. 7. De Orat. 13 p. 189 l. 4 Wiss. ad nat. I 10 p. 80 l. 7 Wiss. Ambr. Off. II § 65. De Cain II § 2. Chromat. in Matt. 3 § 6 (Vitr. 1. Gell. 1). [I have a number of exx. from Aug. and Ps.-Aug. A. S.]

p. 98 l. 1 CONSCIENTIAM SPVRCAM 1 Cor. 8 7. Tit. 1 15.

Plin. VIII § 183 *huic tantum animali* <*boui*> *omnium quibus procerior cauda non statim nato consummatae ut ceteris mensurae. crescit uni donec ad uestigia ima perueniat. quamobrem uictimarum probatio in uitulo ut articulum suffraginis contingat. breuiore non litant.* Cic. De Leg. Agr. II § 93 *erant hostiae maiores in foro constitutae, quae ab his praetoribus de tribunali sicut a nobis consulibus de consili sententia probatae ad praeconem et ad tibicinem immolabantur.* Lucian. Sacrif. 12 they bring their victims, the husbandman the ox from the plow, the shepherd a lamb, the goatherd a goat...ἀλλ' οἵ γε θύοντες...στεφανώσαντες τὸ ζῷον, καὶ πολύ γε πρότερον ἐξετάσαντες, εἰ ἐντελὲς εἴη, ἵνα μηδὲ τῶν ἀχρήστων τι κατασφάττωσι, προσάγουσι τῷ βωμῷ. Plut. De Defectu Orac. 49 p. 437.

p. 98 l. 4 EXPANSOS pr. huius cap. Clem. Alex. Strom. II § 125 p. 494 P. Zeno would rather see one Indian roasted alive than learn all demonstrations of endurance. ἡμῖν δὲ ἄφθονοι μαρτύρων πηγαὶ daily, before our eyes, burnt, crucified, beheaded.

VNGVLAE c. 12 p. 44 l. 9. Tert. Scorpiac. 1 p. 146 l. 13 Wiss. De Ieiun. 12 p. 290 l. 24 Wiss. Cf. Theodoret Graec. Affect.

Cur. VIII § 9 *λαμπάσι...ὄνυξι.* Juret on Paulin. Petricord. Vit. Mart. V 278. Cypr. p. 423 24. Prudent. Peristeph. III 133. X 484. 557. XI 57. Aug. Conf. I § 15. [Ps.-Aug. Quaest. 102 14, p. 210, 22 A. S.] Hieronym. Ep. 1 § 3. Greg. Turon. Glor. Mart. § 105 f. (p. 561 1). Ruinart 384. Bolland 18 Aug. Acta Agapeti 11. *ὄνυχες* Synes. Ep. 44 p. 185c (cf. below).

FODIANT cf. *διορύσσω* Synes. Ep. 44 p. 185b.

p. 98 l. 5 IGNES...BESTIAE Polycarp's martyrdom Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IV 15 §§ 23 24 27—38.

LAMBANT Verg. Hor. Sil. XIV 312. Dracont. (see index of Vollmer's edition, 1905). Paulin. Nol. Ep. 28 2 f.

GVTTVRA pl. Ou.

DETRVNCENT Liu. Colum. Plin. Ou. Senec. De Ira III 17 § 3. Hieronym. Ep. 84 11 (*sex librorum caput*). Contra Ruf. I 7. III 5 [many more in Thes. A. S.].

BESTIAE INSILIANT Suet. Ner. 29 in the skin of a wild beast N. sprung on men and women bound to the stake.

p. 98 l. 6 HABITVS ORANTIS Euseb. Vit. Const. IV 15 in his coins *τὴν αὐτὸς αὑτοῦ εἰκόνα ὧδε γράφεσθαι διετύπου, ὡς ἄνω βλέπειν δοκεῖν ἀνατεταμένως πρὸς θεὸν τρόπον εὐχομένου*: in his palace, on statues, *ἑστὼς ὄρθιος ἐγράφετο, ἄνω μὲν εἰς οὐρανὸν ἐμβλέπων, τὼ χεῖρε δ' ἐκτεταμένος εὐχομένου σχήματι.*

p. 98 l. 7 HOC AGITE c. 50 p. m. p. 144 l. 24. Adu. Marc. IV 7 p. 434 l. 26 Kr. *ut dici solet, Ad quod uenimus, hoc age.* Iuu. 7 20 n. 48 n.

PRAESIDES 9 a. m. p. 32 l. 2 *ex ipsis etiam uobis iustissimis et seuerissimis in nos praesidibus.* omn. c. 50 p. m. *sed hoc agite, boni praesides....cruciate torquete, damnate atterite nos.*

EXTORQVETE 9 a. m. p. 32 l. 5 *crudelius in aqua spiritum extorquetis.* Lact. Diu. Inst. V 1 a. m. *dicatas deo mentes euisceratis corporibus extorquent.*

SVPPLICANTEM c. 30 pr.

p. 98 l. 8 VERITAS Prudent. Peristeph. I 48 *ueritas crimen putatur, uox fidelis plectitur.*

CAP. XXXI

p. 98 l. 9 ADVLATI cet. like irony De Cult. Fem. II 8 pr. *uidelicet nunc et uir et sexus aemulus feminas a suis depello.*

Iuu. 6 634—5 *fingimus haec altum satira sumente cothurnum scilicet.*

p. 98 l. 12 DEI VOCES: on inspiration c. 18 pr. p. 58 l. 5.

p. 98 l. 14 EXTRANEOS c. 7 p. 26 l. 7. Cf. *extra* 46 prope fin. De Cor. Milit. 4. De Exhort. Cast. 4. De Anim. 28 (wrong?). Cf. Apol. 21 (inspiration of prophets). *οἱ ἔξω*. Kaye 143. Blunt First Three Centuries 23 'it would appear, I think,... that the scriptures themselves seldom fell into the hands of the heathen, except by accident.' In the persecution of Diocletian, cir. 303 A.D., Eusebius saw churches overthrown, *τὰς δὲ ἐνθέους καὶ ἱερὰς γραφὰς κατὰ μέσας ἀγορὰς πυρὶ παραδιδομένας αὐτοῖς ἐπείδομεν ὀφθαλμοῖς*. [h. e. viii 2 § 1. A.S.]

p. 98 ll. 15—16 c. 37 pr. Aug. De Bono Perseuer. (x 855[c]) *quando enim non oratum est in ecclesia pro infidelibus atque inimicis eius, ut crederent?* Bingham XVI 2 17. Zahn Forschungen zur Gesch. des NTlichen Kanons V 226—7. Aristid. 13 9 (?). 17 3. Didache 1 3. Const. Apost. viii 12 f. Chrys. III 354[d].

p. 98 l. 16 PERSECVTORIBVS De Orat. 29 p. 199 l. 17 Wiss. *nunc uero oratio iustitiae omnem iram Dei auertit, pro inimicis excubat, pro persequentibus supplicat.* (Litany 'enemies, persecutors, and slanderers.') Oros. VII 8 § 5. Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. 35 p. 254[b] *διὸ καὶ ὑπὲρ ὑμῶν καὶ ὑπὲρ τῶν ἄλλων ἁπάντων ἀνθρώπων τῶν ἐχθραινόντων ἡμῖν εὐχόμεθα.* ib. 96 p. 323[d], 324[a]. Apol. I 57 p. 91[d]. 65 p. 97[c] with Otto's n. 2. 14 p. 61[c]. Dionys. Alex. in Euseb. Hist. Eccl. VII 1 § 1 *τοὺς περὶ τῆς εἰρήνης αὐτοῦ καὶ τῆς ὑγιείας πρεσβεύοντας πρὸς τὸν θεὸν ἤλασεν* (Gallus). Some cursed their enemies. Chrys. III 352[b]. 353[a]. Bingham XV 3 21. 8 15.

PRECARI c. 43 *quanti habetis,...non dico iam qui pro uobis quoque uero deo preces sternant.* Ad Scap. 2 *Christianus... necesse est ut et ipsum <imperatorem> saluum uelit cum toto Romano imperio.* Theophil. I 11 fin. quoted on p. 96 l. 7. III. 14. Iustin. Apol. I 17 Otto. Tatian 4 quoted on p. 98 ll. 31—2. Athenag. 1 and 37. Prudent. Peristeph. X 417—420. Arnob. IV 36 f. *nam nostra quidem scripta cur ignibus meruerunt dari? cur immaniter conuenticula dirui, in quibus summus oratur deus, pax cunctis et uenia postulatur magistratibus exer-*

citibus regibus familiaribus inimicis, adhuc uitam degentibus et resolutis corporum uinctione, in quibus aliud auditur nihil nisi quod humanos faciat, nisi quod mites uerecundos pudicos castos, familiaris communicatores rei et cum omnibus uobis solidae germanitatis necessitudine copulatos?

p. 98 l. 17 CONVENIMVR 35 ante m. p. 102 l. 26 *religione secundae maiestatis de qua in secundum sacrilegium conuenimur Christiani.* c. 10 pr. Oehler *maiestatis rei conuenimur.* Adu. Marc. II 8 p. 345 l. 14 Kr. *nec quem excusabilem sciret nomine imbecillitatis, eum definitione mortis conuenisset.*

p. 98 l. 19 INQVIT c. 1 prope f. *sed non ideo, inquit, bonum, quia multos conuertit.* Burm. on Phaedr. III prol. 4. Cic. in Verr. V § 148. Brut. § 287. Att. XIV 12 § 2. Iuu. 3 153 n.

PRO REGIBVS Chrys. X 440e.

POTESTATIBVS cf. Lightfoot, Ignatius I p. 576.

p. 98 l. 20 CVM ENIM cet. c. 41 p. 120 l. 23 *aliqua nos quoque perstringunt ut uobis cohaerentes.*

CONCVTITVR Pind. Pyth. 4 272 *σεῖσαι πόλιν.* Lucan I 5 *certatum totiens concussi uiribus orbis.* Woodham.

Cap. XXXII

p. 98 l. 23 cet. from 2 Thess. 2 6 *ὁ κατέχων.* Dict. Bible 3 app. p. lxxv b. Ad Scap. 2 (quoted on p. 98 l. 16). De Carn. Resur. 24 f. (*ὁ κατέχων*) *quis, nisi Romanus status, cuius abscessio in decem reges dispersa Antichristi superducet?* Apol. c. 39 (quoted below). Cf. Blunt Right Use p. 192, n. 6 and 7. Aug. De Ciu. Dei XX 19. [Ambr.] ad Ep. 2 ad Thess. 2. 1—4 *non prius ueniet dominus, quam regni Romani defectio fiat et appareat Antichristus, qui interficiet sanctos, reddita Romanis libertate, sub suo tamen nomine.* Lact. Diu. Instt. VII 25 *etiam res ipsa declarat lapsum ruinamque rerum breui fore, nisi quod incolumi urbe Roma nihil istiusmodi uidetur esse metuendum. at uero cum caput illud orbis occiderit et ῥύμη esse coeperit, quod Sibyllae fore aiunt, quis dubitet uenisse iam finem rebus Romanis orbique terrarum? illa, illa est ciuitas, quae adhuc sustentat omnia, precandusque nobis et adorandus est Deus caeli, si tamen statuta eius et placita differri possunt, ne citius*

quam putemus tyrannus ille abominabilis ueniat, qui tantum facinus moliatur, et lumen illud effodiat, cuius interitu mundus ipse lapsurus est. He calculated ib. that the world had only 200 years to run of its 6000. Kaye 348 (expectation of speedy second advent 347). Christians retard the judgement Ep. ad Diognet. 6 p. 498[a], Iustin. Apol. II 7 p. 45[b] Otto (see below). The world's decay Cypr. ad Demetrian. 3. Dio LXXV 4. Lamprid. Diadumen. 1. Censorin. 17.

ORANDI c. 39 pr. 1 Tim. 2 2. Theophil. III 14. Euseb. Vit. Const. IV 45 § 2. Const. Apost. VIII 12 p. m. 13. Cyril. Catech. 23. Mystag. 5 n. 6 al. 8 p. 327[d]. Blunt Right Use 192. Kaye 20. Lightfoot Ignatius I 576. Bingham XV 3 15. Hennecke Aristides ind. 'ἔντευξις.' The priest of Isis prayed for the emperor Apul. Metam. XI 17.

p. 98 l. 25 VIM c. 2.

CLAVSVLAM c. 39 p. 110 ll. 31—2. De Idolol. 4 p. 34 l. 5 Wiss. 9 p. 38 l. 6 Wiss. *tus illud et myrram et aurum ideo infanti tunc domino obtulerunt, quasi clausulam sacrificationis et gloriae saecularis, quam Christus erat adempturus.* Scorpiac. 8 p. 161 l. 4 Wiss. of Jo. Baptist, *clausula legis et prophetarum.* Ad Vxor. II 2. De Fug. in Persec. 6 p. m. Paulin. Nol. ep. 19. 4. 22. 3 f.

p. 98 l. 27 COMMEATV respite. infr. c. 46 p. 128 l. 28 n. De Anim. 35 p. 360 l. 11 Wiss. ind. Cypr. Kaye 348.

p. 98 l. 28 DIFFERRI Iustin. Apol. II 7 ὅθεν καὶ ἐπιμένει ὁ θεὸς τὴν σύγχυσιν καὶ κατάλυσιν τοῦ παντὸς κόσμου μὴ ποιῆσαι, ἵνα καὶ οἱ φαῦλοι ἄγγελοι καὶ δαίμονες καὶ ἄνθρωποι μηκέτι ὦσι, διὰ τὸ σπέρμα τῶν Χριστιανῶν, ὃ γινώσκει ἐν τῇ φύσει ὅτι αἴτιόν ἐστιν. ἐπεὶ εἰ μὴ τοῦτο ἦν, οὐκ ἂν οὐδὲ ὑμῖν ταῦτα ἔτι ποιεῖν καὶ ἐνεργεῖσθαι ὑπὸ τῶν φαύλων δαιμόνων δυνατὸν ἦν, ἀλλὰ τὸ πῦρ τὸ τῆς κρίσεως κατελθὸν ἀνέδην πάντα διέκρινεν. Maximilla (Epiphan. Haer. XLVIII 2) μετ' ἐμὲ οὐκέτι προφῆτις ἔσται, ἀλλὰ συντέλεια. Cf. Tert. c. 39 pr. *oramus pro mora finis.* De Orat. 5 p. 184 l. 8 Wiss.

p. 98 l. 29 IVRAMVS Keim's Celsus p. 136 n. 4. Christians the soul of the world, Ep. ad Diognet. 6 § 1, Zahn Forschungen V 304 n. 2.

SICVT...ITA Quintil. X 1 § 1 n. Plin. Ep. III 8 § 2 n. LS I A b.

GENIOS oaths by the genius of the emperors Brisson De Formulis VIII 2. supr. c. 28 p. 94 l. 18. Origen Contr. Cels. VIII 65 p. 206 sq. L. id Exhort. ad Martyrium 7 p. 240–2 (long note). 40 p. 290. Bingham XVI 7 § 7 and § 4 Scillitan martyrs. So Joseph *per salutem Pharaonis νὴ τὴν ὑγίειαν Φαραώ*, Gen. 42. 15. Tert. ad nat. I 17 p. 88 l. 25 Wiss. *prima obstinatio est, quae secunda* {*ab eis* / *a deis*} *religio constituitur Caesarianae maiestatis, quod inreligiosi dicamur in Caesares, neque imagines eorum ture propitiando neque genios deierando. hostes populi nuncupamur.*

SALVTEM Beurlier Le Culte impérial (1891) 272–3. The military oath. (τύχη = genius. σωτηρία = salus.) Epictet. I 14 § 14 *ἀλλ' ὁ θεὸς ἔνδον ἐστί, καὶ ὁ ὑμέτερος δαίμων ἐστί. καὶ τίς τούτοις χρεία φωτὸς εἰς τὸ βλέπειν τί ποιεῖτε;* § 15 *τούτῳ τῷ θεῷ ἔδει καὶ ὑμᾶς ὀμνύειν ὅρκον, οἷον οἱ στρατιῶται τῷ Καίσαρι. ἀλλ' ἐκεῖνοι μὲν τὴν μισθοφορίαν λαμβάνοντες ὀμνύουσι πάντων προτιμήσειν τὴν τοῦ Καίσαρος σωτηρίαν.* Cod. II 4 41 *qui nomina nostra placitis inserentes salutem principum confirmationem initarum iurauerint esse pactionum.* Iust. II 23 1. Mommsen Staatsr. II² 784 n. 3.

p. 98 ll. 31—32 Ad Scap. 2 *circa maiestatem imperatoris infamamur.* Theophil. I 11 (quoted on p. 96 l. 7). Tatian 4 *προστάττει φόρους τελεῖν ὁ βασιλεύς; ἕτοιμος παρέχειν δουλεύειν ὁ δεσπότης καὶ ὑπηρετεῖν; τὴν δουλείαν γινώσκων... τοῦτον [τὸν θεόν] μόνον ἀρνεῖσθαι κελευόμενος οὐ πεισθήσομαι, τεθνήξομαι δὲ μᾶλλον, ἵνα μὴ ψεύστης καὶ ἀχάριστος ἀποδειχθῶ.* Athanas. Apol. 1 ad Constant. 14 (I, 1, 240ᶜ) *ἀξιούντων ἐν τῇ μεγάλῃ ἐκκλησίᾳ συνελθεῖν κἀκεῖ πάντας εὔχεσθαι ὑπὲρ τῆς σῆς σωτηρίας.* Cf. 18 (242ᶜ) *αἱ γὰρ γενόμεναι παρὰ πάντων περὶ τῆς σῆς σωτηρίας εὐχαὶ οὐκ ἐμποδίζουσι τὴν τῶν ἐγκαινίων πανήγυριν.* Ambr. De Elia et Ieiun. 17 (62) *bibamus pro salute imperatorum.*

p. 100 l. 1 ADIVRARE exorcise c. 37 fin. p. 108 l. 28 n. Cypr. Ad Demetrian, 15 pr. *o si audire eos uelis et uidere, quando adiurantur a nobis, torquentur spiritalibus flagris et uerborum tormentis de obsessis corporibus eiciuntur, quando heiulantes et gementes uoce humana et potestate diuina flagella et uerbera*

sentientes uenturum iudicium confitentur. Quod Idola di non sint 7 *hi tamen adiurati per deum uerum nobis statim cedunt et fatentur et de obsessis corporibus exire coguntur.* Cf. ind. rer. p. 388 a under *exorcizare -ista* and ind. uerb. p. 425 b *-cidiare, -cismus, -cista.* Lact. Diu. Instt. II 15 § 3 *iustos autem, id est cultores Dei, metuunt cuius nomine adiurati de corporibus excedunt. quorum uerbis, tamquam flagris uerberati, non modo daemonas esse se confitentur, sed etiam nomina sua edunt.* V 21 § 4 *hi (spiritus contaminati)...cum corpora hominum occupant animasque diuexant, adiurantur ab his et nomine Dei ueri fugantur. quo audito tremunt exclamant et uri se uerberarique testantur.* Paulin. Natal. 4. Felicis = c. 15 108—110 *primis lector seruiuit in annis: | inde gradum sumpsit, cui munus uoce fideli | adiurare malos et sacris pellere uerbis.* Bingham III 4. dig. L 13 1 3 [= Ulpian] *si incantauit, si inprecatus est, si, ut uulgari uerbo impostorum utar, si exorcizauit.* Athan. Vit. Anton. 48. 62. 63. 64. 71. 78. 80.

p. 100 l. 2 DEIERARE De Idolol. 20 fin. *porro quid erit deieratio per eos quos eierasti, quam praeuaricatio fidei cum idololatria? quis enim, per quos deierat, non honorat?* (Cf. the 2 ch. 20 and 21 ib.)

CAP. XXXIII

p. 100 l. 4 Bailey Ritual Anglocath. 162—3 (Prayers for Qu. in Communion Service).

p. 100 l. 5 NECESSE c. 45 pr. n.

p. 100 l. 6 Ad Scap. 2 (quoted on p. 98 l. 16).

p. 100 l. 8 OPEROR IN SALVTEM Cypr. De Opere et Eleemosynis 1 pr. *multa et magna sunt...beneficia diuina quibus in salutem nostram Dei patris et Christi larga et copiosa clementia et operata sit et semper operetur.* Lact. Diu. Instt. IV 17 § 1 *quod sabbatis non uacaret, operans in salutem hominum.* Epit. 47 § 3 *dedit eis potestatem mirabilia faciendi, ut in salutem hominum tam factis quam uerbis operarentur.*

p. 100 l. 9 MEREAR c. 30 med. p. 96 l. 29 *ipse est qui solus praestat et ego sum cui impetrare debetur.* Cf. Zahn Forschungen V 302.

p. 100 l. 11 CVI SOLI SVBICIO c. 30 pr. *a quo sunt secundi, post quem primi.*

p. 100 l. 12 ad nat. I 17 fin. *sed non dicimus deum imperatorem; super hoc enim, quod uulgo aiunt, sannam facimus. immo qui deum Caesarem dicitis et deridetis, dicendo quod non est, et male dicitis, quia non uult esse quod dicitis; mauult enim uiuere quam deus fieri.* Scorp. 14 p. 177 l. 21 Wiss. *condixerat scilicet Petrus regem quidem honorandum, ut tamen tunc rex honoretur, cum suis rebus insistit, cum a diuinis honoribus longe est.* Theoph. ad Aut. I c. 15 p. 76[c]: worship of emperors and kings Arnob. I 64 a. m. Tatian 4 Otto.

p. 100 l. 19 SVGGERITVR c. 18 p.m. p. 58 l. 24.

Cap. XXXIV

p. 100 l. 24 Aug. is *reformator imperii* in Tert. De Anim. 46 p. 376 l. 9 Wiss. *formatores imperii* Ammian. Marcel. XVIII 6 § 6 XXVI 2 § 7. Sen. Colum. Quintil. Plin. epist. Pallad. uulg.

DOMINVM Iuu. 4 96 n. On the Christians' refusal of the title to emperors Walch in Nou. Comm. Soc. Gott. II 18. Sueton. Aug. 53 *domini appellationem ut maledictum* [cf. Tert. ad fin. c.] *et opprobrium semper exhorruit. cum spectante eo ludos pronuntiatum esset in mimo*: o dominum aequum et bonum! *et uniuersi quasi de ipso dictum exsultantes comprobassent, et statim manu uultuque indecoras adulationes repressit et insequenti die grauissimo corripuit edicto dominumque se posthac appellari ne a liberis quidem aut nepotibus suis, uel serio uel ioco, passus est.* id. Tiber. 27 *dominus appellatus a quodam denuntiauit, ne se amplius contumeliae causa nominaret.* Gardthausen Augustus II 291 10. [Cf. G. Milligan, Selections from the Greek Papyri p. 49 n. 6, H. A. A. Kennedy in Expositor VII 7 (1909), 297 f. A.S.]

p. 100 l. 27 DEI VICE 27 fin. *uice rebellantium ergastulorum* [and n. A.S.]. Iren. II 31 § 1, V 24 § 2. Gell. II 6 § 9. Quintil. Plin. Tac. Sueton.

LIBER SVM ILLI c. 13 pr. *nobis dei sunt.*

p. 100 l. 28 VNVS Iustin. Apol. I 17 *θεὸν μὲν μόνον προσκυνοῦμεν, ὑμῖν δὲ πρὸς τὰ ἄλλα χαίροντες ὑπηρετοῦμεν.*

p. 100 l. 29 PATER PATRIAE Iuu. 8 244 n.

p. 100 l. 31 Sen. ep. 47 § 14 *ne illud quidem uidetis, quam omnem inuidiam maiores nostri dominis, omnem contumeliam seruis detraxerint! dominum patrem familiae appellauerunt: seruos, quod etiam in mimis adhuc durat, familiares.*

TANTO ABEST VT De Cor. Milit. 14 pr. De Test. Anim. 1 p. 135 l. 9 Wiss. De Fug. in Persec. 2 fin. (no ellipsis of *magis*) but abl. differ. Adu. Marc. I 23 p. 321 l. 21 Kr.

p. 102 l. 3 OFFENSAM Suet.

p. 102 l. 8 MALEDICTVM ad nat. I 17 fin. quoted on p. 100 l. 12. Minuc. 23 § 3 *inuitis denique hoc nomen adscribitur; optant in homine perseuerare, fieri se deos metuunt; etsi iam senes, nolunt.* Sueton. cited hoc cap. pr. Tac. An. XV 74 Cerealis Anicius proposed *ut templum diuo Neroni quam maturrime pecunia publica poneretur. quod quidem ille decernebat tamquam mortale fastigium egresso et uenerationem hominum merito, quod ad omina olim sui exitus uerteretur.* Caracalla of his brother Geta (Spartian Antonin. Geta 2 § 8) *sit diuus, dum non sit uiuus.*

Cap. XXXV

p. 102 l. 10 PVBLICI HOSTES c. 2 p. 6 l. 22. p. 8 l. 14 *in reos maiestatis et publicos hostes omnis homo miles est.* Cf. c. 35. 37 p. 108 l. 25 n. Ad Scap. 2, after the charge of impiety, *sic et circa maiestatem imperatoris infamamur, tamen numquam* (below), 4 f. *pro deo uiuo cremamur; quod nec sacrilegi nec hostes publici nec tot maiestatis rei pati solent.* ad nat. I 7 p. 68 l. 6 Wiss. *hostis publicus*, cf. c. 17. Sueton. Cal. 28. Prudent. Peristeph. X 423. Spartian Seu. 14 §§ 5, 9 de Plautiano. Mommsen Staatsr. III 1026.

p. 102 l. 12 SOLLEMNIA De Spectac. 6 p. 8 l. 8 Wiss. *reliqui ludorum de natalibus et sollemnibus regum et publicis prosperitatibus et municipalibus fastis superstitionis causas habent.* Ambr. De Obit. Valentin. 15 *ferebatur primo ludis circensibus delectari: sic istud abstersit, ut ne sollemnibus quidem princi-*

pum natalibus uel imperialis honoris gratia circenses putaret esse celebrandos. 16 *coepit ita frequentare ieiunium, ut plerumque ipse imprausus conuiuium sollemne suis comitibus exhiberet.* Maxim. Serm. [Migne P.L. LVII 221[a] A.S.] inter Ambrosianos 14 [in oldest editions, omitted in Bened. and Migne A.S.] pr. *laetitia quanta sit quantusque concursus cum imperatoris mundi istius natalis celebrandus est, bene nostis* cet. Plin. ad Trai. 35 (44) *sollemnia uota pro incolumitate tua, qua publica salus continetur, et suscepimus, domine, pariter et soluimus, precati deos, ut uelint ea semper solui semperque signari.* ibid. 102 (103) *diem quo in te tutela generis humani felicissima successione translata est, debita religione celebrauimus, commendantes dis imperii tui auctoribus et uota publica et gaudia.* Tac. An. IV 70 § 1 *Caesar sollemnia incipientis anni Kalendis Ianuariis epistula precatus.* On the stadium and the theatre cf. De Spectac. 18 and passim.

p. 102 l. 14 FOCOS ad Mart. 2 (of a confessor in prison) *non uides alienos deos, non imaginibus eorum incurris, non sollemnes nationum dies ipsa commixtione participas, non nidoribus spurcis uerberaris.*

IN PVBLICVM c. 42 p. 122 l. 14 *non in publico Liberalibus discumbo.* Tac. Ann. XV 37 pr. *ipse, quo fidem adquireret nihil usquam perinde laetum sibi, publicis locis struere conuiuia totaque urbe quasi domo uti.* Ioseph. De Bell. Ind. VII 10.

VICATIM Ad Vxor. II 4. Sisenn. Hor. Liu. Plin. Tac. Suet. e.g. Calig. 35.

p. 102 l. 15 TABERNAE HABITV Mart. VIII 61 9—10 *tonsor caupo coquus lanius sua limina seruant, nunc Roma est, nuper magna taberna fuit.*

ABOLEFACERE marked * by LS. De Cult. Fem. I 3 *abolefactam* [more in Thes. and Georges ed. 8. A.S.].

LVTVM Anth. Pal. XI 8 3—4 *ζῶντί μοι, εἴ τι θέλεις, χάρισαι· τέφρην δὲ μεθύσκων πηλὸν ποιήσεις, κοὐχ' ὁ θανὼν πίεται.* Cf. Plut. II 463 a *οἴνου πηλὸν ποιεῖν.* Toup Emend. Suid. II 66. Casaub. Ath. 661.

p. 102 l. 16 CATERVATIM cet. c. 39 p. 114 l. 36 *inde disceditur non in cateruas caesionum neque in classes discursationum neque in eruptiones lasciuiarum.* Apul. Metam. II 18 p. 39 l. 22 Hehn,

nam uesana factio nobilissimorum iuuenum pacem publicam infestat; passim trucidatos per medias plateas uidebis iacere. Philo Adu. Flacc. § 17 p. 537 M. of the *θίασοι* at Alexandria. cf. Iuu. 3 278 *ebrius ac petulans, qui nullum forte cecidit* cet. The word in Sall. Lucr. Verg. Liu. Colum. Plin.: add Bell. Afr. 32. Rufin. Hist. Eccl. IX 8 p. 520 pr. [but ed. Mommsen, p. 821 l. 20, apparently with all MSS, *aceruatim.* A.S.] Sidon. Ep. I 11 m. [more in Thes. A.S.].

CVRSITARE 'rare.' Ter. Cic. Hor. (2). Cornif. Suet. (ter). add Apul. Metam. IX 33. Hieronym. Apol. c. Rufin. I 30 [see Thes. A.S.].

p. 102 l. 18 Ad Mart. 2 p. m. (cf. p. 102 ll. 28—9) cited on l. 14. then follows: *non clamoribus spectaculorum, atrocitate uel furore uel impudicitia celebrantium caederis.*

p. 102 l. 21 OCCASIO LVXVRIAE De Idolol. 1 p. 31 l. 3 Wiss. *quae enim idololatriae sollemnitas sine ambitione cultus et ornatus? in illa lasciuiae et ebrietates, cum plurimum uictus et uentris et libidinis causa frequententur.*

p. 102 l. 23 EXPVNGERE In Forcell. ed. Germ. and LS *expung. effectum* (which occurs in De Paenit. 3) is cited from this ch. See c. 2 p. m. n. and add Adu. Iud. 11 fin. 12 fin. 13 p. m. 14 p. m. bis. De Paenit. 3 fin. 9 fin. De Idolol. 1 pr. 13 p. 44 l. 26 Wiss. 16 p. 50 l. 1 Wiss. (*expunctio*). Ad Mart. 6.

LAVREIS infr. h. c. De Cor. Milit. 13 f. (where more) *at enim Christianus nec ianuam suam laureis infamabit, si norit quantos deos etiam ostiis diabolus affixerit.* De Idolol. 15 p. 48 l. 18 Wiss. *autem <eorum daemonum> sunt, qui in ostiis adorentur, ad eos et lucernae et laureae pertinebunt. idolo feceris, quicquid ostio feceris. hoc in loco ex auctoritate quoque Dei contestor, quia nec tutum est subtrahere, quodcumque uni fuerit ostensum utique omnium causa. scio fratrem per uisionem, eadem nocte castigatum grauiter, quod ianuam eius subito adnuntiatis gaudiis publicis serui coronassent. et tamen non ipse coronauerat aut praeceperat; nam ante processerat, et regressus reprehenderat factum: adeo apud deum in huiusmodi etiam disciplina familiae nostrae aestimamur.* Iuu. 6 79 *ornentur postes et grandi ianua lauro.* Sen. Thyest. 54—56 *ornetur altum columen et lauro fores | laetae uirescant: dignus aduentu tuo | splendescat ignis.*

Eurip. Ion 103—105 πτόρθοισι δάφνης | στέφεσίν θ' ἱεροῖς ἐσόδους Φοίβου | καθαρὰς θήσομεν. D. Cass. LXIII 20 § 4 de Nerone ἐς τὸ Καπιτώλιον ἀνέβη, καὶ ἐκεῖθεν ἐς τὸ παλάτιον, πασης μὲν τῆς πόλεως ἐστεφανωμένης καὶ λυχνοκαυτούσης καὶ θυμιώσης. Stat. S. III 1 69—70 *angustasque fores assuetaque tecta grauati frondibus* [this passage should be omitted as wrongly punctuated and misunderstood. A. S.]. Lucan. II 354 *festa coronato non pendent limine serta, infulaque in geminos discurrit candida postes.* Rutil. Namatian. I 425 *exornent uirides communia gaudia rami.* Tac. XV 17 in Hau. Plin. XVI c. 30 § 124 Hau. Hist. Apollon. Tyr. 49 *et facta est laetitia omni ciuitati maxima, coronantur plateae.*

p. 102 l. 24 LVCERNIS c. 46 p. 128 l. 6. De Idolol. 15 fin. *accendant igitur cotidie lucernas, quibus lux nulla est; affigant postibus lauros postmodum arsuras, quibus ignes imminent: illis competunt et testimonia tenebrarum et auspicia poenarum. tu lumen es mundi et arbor uirens semper. si templis renuntiasti, ne feceris templum ianuam tuam.* Conc. Eliber. c. 34. 37 (Bingham XVI 4 17 n. 84 sq.). Baron. A.D. 58 n. 2. Chrys. I 701ᵇ (cf. Bingham XX 1 3 n. 18). Iuu. 10 65 n. 12 91—2 n. *longos erexit ianua ramos et matutinis operatur festa lucernis.* Mart. X. 6. Chrys. Hom. 20 ad Pop. [where?] ὅπερ οὖν τότε ἐποιήσατε στεφανώσαντες τὴν ἀγορὰν καὶ λύχνους ἅψαντες καὶ στιβάδας πρὸ τῶν ἐργαστηρίων συνθέντες. Herodian IV 8 § 8 δᾳδουχίαις τε καὶ ἀνθέων βολαῖς ἐτίμων τὸν βασιλέα. Euseb. Hist. Eccl. X 9 § 7 ἦν δὲ φωτὸς ἔμπλεα πάντα. Can. Apost. 70 εἴ τις Χριστιανὸς ἔλαιον ἐπενέγκῃ εἰς ἱερὰ ἐθνῶν ἢ εἰς συναγωγὴν Ἰουδαίων ἐν ταῖς ἑορταῖς αὐτῶν ἢ λύχνους ἅπτει, ἀφοριζέσθω. Ioseph. De Bell. Iud. VII 10. Dio (in Seuer.) LXXIV 1 § 4 ἄνθεσι καὶ δάφναις ἐστεφάνωτο.

p. 102 l. 26 NOVI LVPANARIS De Idolol. 15 fin. *si lupanaribus renuntiasti, ne indueris domi tuae faciem noui lupanaris.* Ad Vxor. II 6 *procedet de ianua laureata et lucernata, ut de nouo consistorio libidinum publicarum.* De Cor. Milit. 13 fin. *a saeculo coronantur et lupanaria et latrinae et pistrinae.* Apul. Metam. IV 26 *domus tota lauris obsita, taedis lucida, strepebat hymenaeum.*

p. 102 l. 27 c. 28 in. *uentum est igitur ad secundum titu-*

lum laesae angustioris maiestatis. ad nat. I 17 pr. quoted on p. 98 l. 29.

SACRILEGIVM Saluian. VII 12 § 55 *latro aut sacrilegus, cum flammis exuritur,* cet. Vlp. ad l. 6 D. ad l. Iul. de pecul. *scio multos ad bestias damnasse sacrilegos, nonnullos etiam uiuos exussisse.* Cf. Herald.

CONVENIMVR c. 31 p. 98 l. 17 n.

p. 102 l. 28 SOLLEMNIA supr. p. 102 l. 12.

p. 102 ll. 32—3 Kaye 48.

p. 104 l. 1 VERNACVLAM c. 19 p. 64 l. 15 n. Cf. 38 p. 110 l. 17 n. *insania circi.* (ad nat. I 17 cited below.) De Spectac. 16 fin. *sed circo quid amarius, ubi ne principibus quidem aut ciuibus suis parcunt?* Tac. Hist. II 88 *et effusa plebs totis se castris miscuerat. incuriosos milites uernacula urbanitate quidam spoliauere abscisis furtim balteis an accincti essent rogitantes.* III 32 *mox tertiadecimanos ad exstruendum amphitheatrum relictos, ut sunt procacia urbanae plebis ingenia, petulantibus iurgiis illuserant.*

CONVENIO c. 28 *me conueniat Ianus iratus ex qua uelit fronte.* De Spectac. 16 f. cited above. ad nat. I 17 p. 89 l. 12 Wiss. *uanitatis sacrilegia conueniam, et ipsius uernaculae gentis inreuerentiam recognoscam, et festiuos libellos, quos statuae sciunt, et illa obliqua nonnumquam dicta a concilio atque maledicta, quae circi sonant. si non armis, saltim lingua semper rebelles estis.*

p. 104 l. 2 LINGVA ROMANA Hau. cites Sueton. Ner. 39. Vesp. 19.

p. 104 l. 3 TRANSLVCENDVM cet. Themist. Or. 14 (= 2) p. 29^a διανοίγεται γάρ μοι τὸ στῆθος καὶ ἡ καρδία καὶ διαυγεστέρα γίνεται. ἡ ψυχὴ καὶ τὰ ὄμματα ὀξύτερα τῆς διανοίας.

p. 104 l. 5 NOVI AC NOVI Adu. Marc. I 8 p. 300 l. 11 Kr. *haec erit nouitas, quae etiam ethnicis deos peperit nouo semper ac nouo titulo consecrationis cuiusque.*

p. 104 l. 6 CONGIARIO Daremberg-Saglio s.u.

p. 104 l. 8 Ambr. De Obit. Valent. 43 *nec ego abnuo immatura obisse aetate, quem nostrae uitae temporibus fulcire cuperemus, ut de nostris annis uiueret, qui fungi non potuit suis.* Acclamation of the fratres Aruales A.D. 213 *de nostris annis*

augeat tibi Iuppiter annos (probably from Ou. Fast. I 613 *augeat imperium nostri ducis, augeat annos*), repeated by fr. Aru. A. D. 218 (p. CCVII n. 36 cf. p. 108 Henz.) 9. Herm. Peter die Scriptt. Hist. Aug. Leipz. 1892 p. 221. Brisson De Formul. p. 719 ed. Francof. 1592. Ferrar. De Acclamat. II 19 sq.

p. 104 l. 10 VT though, as c. 24 pr. *ut constaret illos deos esse, nonne conceditis?*

p. 104 l. 11 DEPOSTVLATORES Scorpiac. 8 p. 161 l. 28 Wiss. *Danielum nullius praeter dei supplicem et idcirco a Chaldaeis delatum ac depostulatum.* ib. 7 fin. ἅπ. εἰρ. (Lewis-Short falsely 'cf. ib. 50 f.'). On the fierceness of the mob c. 50 p. m. *sed hoc agite, boni praesides, meliores multo apud populum, si illis Christianos immolaueritis.*

p. 104 l. 12 VVLGVS infr. c. 37 pr. 49 fin. *proinde et uulgus uane de nostra uexatione gaudet.* De Carn. Resur. 22 p. 56 l. 9 Kr. *quis inimicos Christi iam subiecit pedibus eius secundum Dauid, quasi uelocior patre, omni adhuc popularium coetu reclamante: 'Christianos ad leonem'?* De Spectac. 27 pr. *odisse debemus istos conuentus et coetus ethnicorum, uel quod illic nomen Dei blasphematur, illic in nos cotidiani leones expostulantur, inde persecutiones decernuntur, inde temptationes emittuntur.* De Idolol. 14 p. 45 l. 20 Wiss. *totus circus scelestis suffragiis nullo merito nomen lacessit.* De Ieiun. 10 p. 288 l. 21 Wiss. Ep. Smyrn. in Cotelier II 193 sq. Euseb. Hist. Eccl. V 1. Cypr. Ep. 56 § 1 59 § 8. Polycarp. Mart. 10 § 2 πεῖσον τὸν δῆμον.

PLANE sq. Kaye 111.

p. 104 l. 14 Ad Scap. 2 *sic et circa maiestatem imperatoris infamamur; tamen numquam Albiniani, nec Nigriani uel Cassiani inueniri potuerunt Christiani; sed idem ipsi, qui per genios eorum in pridie usque iurauerunt, qui pro salute eorum hostias et fecerant et uouerant, qui Christianos saepe damnauerant, hostes eorum sunt reperti.* ad nat. I 17 p. 89 l. 8 Wiss. *nulla in prouinciis affectata maiestas.* At the 4th council of Toledo c. 75 the whole clergy and people thrice exclaimed *Quicumque a modo ex nobis uel cunctis Hispaniae populis qualibet meditatione uel studio sacramentum fidei suae, quod pro patriae salute gentisque Gothorum statu uel incolumitate regiae*

potestatis pollicitus est, uiolauerit aut regem nece attrectauerit aut potestate regni exuerit aut praesumptione tyrannica regni fastigium usurpauerit, anathema sit. Cf. Conc. Tolet. 6 c. 18. Neumann I 96 n. 3 seq. 239 4. 240 1.

p. 104 l. 15 LAVRVS Herodian *μεγίστοις κατάσκιον δαφνηφόροις ἄλσεσιν.* Lampr. Comm. 17 §§ 1—2. *Q. Aemilius Laetus praef. et Marcia concubina eius inierunt coniurationem ad occidendum eum. primumque ei uenenum dederunt; quod cum minus operaretur, per athletam, cum quo exerceri solebat, eum strangularunt.* Allard Persécution de Dioclétien I 131.

p. 104 l. 16 PALAESTRICAM De Spectac. 18 p. 20 l. 7 Wiss. *et palaestrica diaboli negotium est.* Quintil.

PALATIVM Capitol. Pertin. 11 § 1 *trecenti igitur de castris armati ad imperatorias aedes cuneo facto milites uenere.* § 4 *sed subito globus ille in Palatium peruenit neque aut arceri potuit aut imperatori nuntiari.* § 6 *superuenerunt Pertinaci, cum ille aulicum famulicium ordinaret, ingressique porticus Palatii usque ad locum qui appellatur Sicilia et Iouis cenatio.* § 8 *uerum cum ad interiora prorumperent, Pertinax ad eos processit eosque longa et graui oratione placauit.* § 9 *sed cum Tausius quidam, unus e Tungris, in iram et in timorem milites loquendo adduxisset, hastam in pectus Pertinacis obiecit. tunc ille precatus Iouem Vltorem toga caput operuit atque a ceteris confossus est.* § 13 *multi sane dicunt etiam cubiculum milites inrupisse atque illic circa lectum fugientem Pertinacem occidisse.* Herodian II 1 § 1 (?).

p. 104 l. 17 SIGERIIS Sueton. Domit. 17 *Stephanus Domitillae procurator ... professus conspirationis indicium et ob hoc admissus legenti traditum a se libellum et attonito suffodit inguina. saucium ac repugnantem adorti Clodianus et Maximus Parthenii libertus et Saturius decurio cubiculariorum et quidam e gladiatorio ludo uulneribus septem contrucidarunt.* Mart. IV 78 5—8 *et sine te nulli fas est prodire tribuno, nec caret officio consul uterque tuo; et sacro deciens repetis Palatia cliuo Sigeriosque meros Partheniosque sonas.* D. Cass. LXVII 15. Zosim. I 7 (?).

p. 104 l. 18 DE ROMANIS c. 44 f. *de uestris semper aestuat carcer.*

NON CHRISTIANIS Oehler on c. 2 p. 117 n. g. [= our p. 8 ll. 3—4.]

ATQVE ADEO c. 4 pr. 22 pr. 24. 25.

p. 104 l. 19 ERVPTIONE c. 39 f. p. 114 l. 37 n.

p. 104 l. 20 GENIVM Ad Scap. 2 cited in note on p. 104 l. 14. cf. c. 28 f. p. 94 l. 18 n.

p. 104 l. 22 PLAVSORES De Paenit. 10 m. Hor. Petron. Suet. Sid. ep. 4 25 *promiserat ecclesiastica plausoribus suis praedae praedia fore.* Kaye 49.

p. 104 l. 23 PARRICIDARVM Tac. Ann. XV 73. Hist. I 85.

RACEMATIO ἅπ. εἰρ. Spartian Seu. 15 § 3 *sed postea in Syriam redit, ita ut se pararet ac bellum Parthis inferret. inter haec Pescennianas reliquias Plautiano auctore persequebatur, ita ut nonnullos etiam ex amicis suis quasi uitae suae insidiatores appeteret.* id. Geta 4 *Bassianus* (Caracalla) encouraged, Geta deprecated wholesale executions.

p. 104 l. 24 RAMOSISSIMIS superl. also in Plin. hist. nat.

PRAESTRVEBANT Adu. Marc. V 16 p. 632 l. 1 Kr. *qui a primordio rerum naturam operibus beneficiis plagis praedicationibus testibus ad agnitionem sui praestruxit.* Iuu. 10. 65 n.

p. 104 l. 25 NEBVLABANT: word nowhere else found. [An error. It occurs Aug. Serm. 164, 12, and Benoist-Goelzer cite Victor Vitensis. A. S.]

p. 104 l. 29 Capitolini M. Antonin. Phil. 6 §§ 8 9 *erat autem in summis obsequiis patris Marcus, quamuis non deessent qui aliqua aduersum eum insusurrarent et prae ceteris Valerius Homullus, qui cum Lucillam matrem Marci in uiridario uenerantem simulacrum Apollinis uidisset, insusurrauit 'illa nunc rogat ut diem tuum claudas et filius imperet.' quod omnino apud Pium nihil ualuit.*

p. 104 l. 30 ASTROLOGOS c. 43 p. 124 l. 6 Spartian Seu. 15 § 5 *multos etiam, quasi Chaldaeos aut uates de sua salute consuluissent, interemit, praecipue suspectus unum quemque idoneum imperio, cum ipse paruulos adhuc filios haberet, idque dici ab his uel crederet uel audiret, qui sibi augurabantur imperium.* Against Valens A.D. 371 Ammian. (in Hau.) XXIX 2 § 27 (below). Tac. Ann. XII 52. XVI 30 cited by Oehler ad fin. cap. When *legatus proconsulis Africae,* Septimius Seuerus (Spart. 2 f.) *cum*

sollicitus mathematicum consuluisset positaque hora ingentia uidisset astrologus dixit ei 'tuam, non alienam pone genituram.' cumque Seuerus iurasset suam esse, omnia ei dixit quae postea facta sunt. Cf. c. 4 f. ibid. pr. *in Sicilia quasi de imperio uel uates uel Chaldaeos consuluisset reus factus est, praefectis praetorio, quibus audiendus datus fuerat, iam Commodo in odio* (-*um* vulg.) *ueniente absolutus est, calumniatore in crucem acto.* Cf. Spartian Geta 1. 2. 3. Paulus Sentent. v 21 3 *qui de salute principis uel summa re publica mathematicos hariolos haruspices uaticinatores consulit, cum eo qui responderit, capite punitur.* Firmic. Matern. Math. II 30 § 4 ff. forbids such enquiries.

p. 104 l. 32 AB ANGELIS c. 21 f. 22. De Idolol. 9 pr. *animaduertimus inter artes etiam professiones quasdam obnoxias idololatriae. de astrologis ne loquendum quidem est....non allego quod idola honoret, quorum nomina caelo inscripsit, quibus omnem dei potestatem addixit; quod propterea homines non putant deum requirendum, praesumentes stellarum nos immutabili arbitrio agi: unum propono, angelos esse illos desertores dei, amatores feminarum, proditores etiam huius curiositatis, propterea quoque damnatos a deo. o diuina sententia usque ad terram pertinax, cui etiam ignorantes testimonium reddunt! expelluntur mathematici, sicut angeli eorum. urbs et Italia interdicitur mathematicis, sicut caelum angelis eorum. eadem poena est exitii* (*exilii* Gel.) *discipulis et magistris.* De Cult. Fem. I 2 pr. of the angels who married the children of men: *cum et materias quasdam bene occultas et artes plerasque non bene reuelatas saeculo multo magis imperito prodidissent, siquidem...et incantationum uires prouulgauerant et omnem curiositatem usque ad stellarum interpretationem designauerant.* ib. 3. II 10 he cites Enoch as the authority for these traditions. Tatian 8 *διάγραμμα γὰρ αὐτοῖς* [*τοῖς ἀνθρώποις*] *ἀστροθεσίας ἀναδείξαντες* [*οἱ δαίμονες*], *ὥσπερ οἱ τοῖς κύβοις παίζοντες, τὴν εἱμαρμένην εἰσηγήσαντο λίαν ἄδικον.* Ammian. Marcel. XXIX 2 f. § 27 (below) Lindenbr., *constellationem principis colligere.* Hermias pp. 213—4 c. Book of Enoch. Clem. Alex. p. 1002 P. Strom. I. p. 366 P. 368 sq. V 650. VI 822. VII 832. Iustin. Apol. II 5 p. 44b. Aug. De Ciu. Dei v 7. Kaye 201. Bouché-Leclercq Astrol. p. 619 2.

p. 104 l. 33 CHRISTIANI La Cerda cites Conc. Tolet. 4 c. 29 and 7 c. 18.

PERSCRVTARI Tac. Ann. III 22 sq. *adiciebantur adulteria uenena quaesitumque per Chaldaeos in domum Caesaris.* Herald. cites Ios. XVII 7.

p. 106 l. 2 SVSTINETVR Minuc. 39 § 6 *nec adnectimus arescentem coronam, sed a deo aeternis floribus uiuidam sustinemus.* Holden ad l. cites uulg. Tob. 5 9 *sustine me* (ὑπόμεινόν με), *obsecro, donec et ipsa nuntiem patri meo.* Acts 20 5 *sustinuerunt* (ἔμενον) *nos Troade.* Add Iren. IV 20 § 6 pr. Rönsch Itala 381—2. Oehler on De Fug. in Persec. 11 pr. p. 480. Ad Mart. 2 a. m. [Ps.-Aug. Quaest. 1 § 2 p. 14 l. 5. A. S.]

p. 106 l. 3 CARIS Apul. Metam. IX 36 pr. *suam suorumque carorum salutem.*

p. 106 l. 4 SOLLICITVDO SANGVINIS Tac. Ann. XVI 30 *recens discrimini patris filiam conectebat, quod pecuniam magis dilargita esset. acciderat sane pietate Seruiliae (id enim nomen puellae fuit) quae caritate erga parentem, simul imprudentia aetatis, non tamen aliud consultauerat quam de incolumitate domus, et an placabilis Nero.* Ammian. Marcel. XXIX 2 § 27 *in chartis cuiusdam municipis clari genitura cuiusdam Valentis inuenta est, repellensque calumnias is, cuius intererat, cum obiectaretur ei quamobrem constellationem principis collegisset, patrem suum fuisse Valentem dudumque obisse documentorum plena fide monstrare pollicitus, inexspectato ueritatis indicio laniatus, lacer trucidatus est.*

CAP. XXXVI

p. 106 l. 5 ROMANI c. 24 f. *laedimus Romanos nec Romani habemur, quia non Romanorum deum colimus:* argument as c. 1 med. *cum ergo propterea oderint homines, quia ignorant quale sit quod oderunt, cur non liceat eiusmodi illud esse, quod non debeant odisse?*

p. 106 l. 10 HOSTILITAS LS has only one ex. (from Cassiod.), not in Mühlmann, Scheller has only (the false) Seneca. It occurs Tert. De Pall. 2 fin. p. 925 *eradicato omni aconito hostilitatis.* Forc. and Georges and LS have Cassiod. Var. IV 50, RW. Paull. Pellaeus, Benoist-Goelzer Sid. ep. V 3. Add [Cypr.] 217 12.

Ennod. 245 10 H. Seru. ad Aen. IX 438. Greg. Turon. Glor. Mart. I 57. 105 pr. (collective) [add Siric. ap. De-Vit and Ps.-Aug. Serm. 298, 1. A. S.].

p. 106 l. 12 NECESSE HABENT EXHIBERI cf. c. 33 pr. *quem* [*imperatorem*] *necesse est suspiciamus ut eum, quem dominus noster elegerit.* 37 pr. n. De Anim. 35 p. 360 l. 13 Wiss. *totiens animam reuocari habere.* Adu. Prax. 4 p. 232 l. 9 Kr. *adeo autem manet* [*monarchia*] *in suo statu, licet trinitas inferatur, ut etiam restitui habeat patri a filio.* Cf. ibid. l. 19 *uidemus igitur non obesse monarchiae* [*filium*], *etsi hodie apud filium est, quia et in suo statu est apud filium, et cum suo statu* restituetur *patri a filio.* De Paenit. 6 m. *quidam autem sic opinantur, quasi deus necesse habeat praestare etiam indignis, quod spopondit.* Lact. Diu. Instt. IV 30 § 2 *et ipsum et legatos eius praedixisse, quod plurimae sectae et haereses haberent existere.* Woodh. Cf. the Romance futures. [Arch. f. lat. Lex. II 48—89. 157—202. A.S.]

p. 106 l. 14 SVB Plin. ep. I 2 § 5 *sub hac exceptione ueniam postulare.* Sueton. Caes. 78.

p. 106 l. 16 EXACTORE Not in Cic. Below c. 40 p. m. (=avenger) *nocentiae iudicem et exactorem.* De Cult. Fem. II 4 *omnis maritus castitatis -or est.*

REMVNERATORE De Paenit. 2 bis. Aug. uulg. CIL VIII 7174. Paulin. Nol. ep. 13 23 f. 23 31 [add Ps.-Aug. serm. ter A.S.].

p. 106 l. 18 Conc. Carth. 4 can. 10 (II 1200[c]) *psalmista, id est cantor, potest absque scientia episcopi, sola iussione presbyteri, officium suscipere cantandi, dicente sibi presbytero: Vide ut, quod ore cantas, corde credas: et, quod corde credis, operibus comprobes.*

MALE COGITARE cet. cf. *contritio cordis, confessio oris, satisfactio operis.* Cowell in Journ. of Phil. III (1871) 215 ff. on thought, word and deed. Athenag. 32 p. 36[b] *οἷς οὖν μηδὲν τὸ πλέον ἔξεστιν ὁρᾶν ἢ ἐφ' ἃ ἔπλασεν τοὺς ὀφθαλμοὺς ὁ θεός, ἡμῖν φῶς αὐτοὺς εἶναι, καὶ οἷς τὸ ἰδεῖν ἡδέως μοιχεία, ἐφ' ἕτερα τῶν ὀφθαλμῶν γεγονότων, μέχρις ἐννοίας κριθησομένοις, πῶς ἂν οὗτοι ἀπιστηθεῖεν σωφρονεῖν;* Minuc. 31 § 5 *at nos pudorem non facie sed mente praestamus.* Theophil. III 13 pr. *καὶ περὶ σεμνότητος οὐ μόνον διδάσκει ἡμᾶς ὁ ἅγιος λόγος τὸ μὴ ἁμαρτά-*

νειν ἔργῳ, ἀλλὰ καὶ μέχρις ἐννοίας. Orig. Contr. Cels. praef. § 2 f. alleges the virtuous life of Christians as their best defence.

p. 106 l. 19 EX AEQUO Oehler on ad Scap. 2 where he also cites *ex pari, ex diuerso, ex abundanti* [and might have cited *ex facili.* A.S.]. De Bapt. 17 bis p. 214 l. 29 Wiss. ad nat. I 10 p. 77 l. 11 Wiss. Ad Vx. I 6 fin. 8. II 8 fin. Sueton. Tib. 11. Schwarz on Plin. Panegyr. 83 § 6. Lucr. Liu. Ou. (*saepe*) Tac.

CAP. XXXVII

p. 106 l. 22 De Orat. 29 p. 199 l. 17 Wiss. *nunc uero oratio iustitiae omnem iram dei auertit, pro inimicis excubat, pro persequentibus supplicat.* ad Scap. 1 pr. *itaque hunc libellum non nobis timentes misimus, sed uobis et omnibus inimicis nostris, nedum amicis; ita enim disciplina iubemur diligere inimicos quoque, et orare pro eis qui nos persequuntur, ut haec sit perfecta et propria bonitas nostra, non communis.* Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IX 8 §§ 13—15. Athenag. c. 10 pp. 11, 12 the Christians' love of enemies and other virtues inconsistent with atheism. Theodoret Graec. Affect. Cur. IX § 65 p. 133 l. 45 *καὶ οὐ μόνον τοὺς φίλους εὐεργετεῖν, ἀλλὰ καὶ τοὺς ἐχθροὺς ἐκέλευσεν εὖ ποιεῖν.* Greg. Naz. Or. 33 = 25 c. 5 f. (I 607[b]) Contr. Arian. *ἡμεῖς δὲ καὶ τοὺς φονεῖς, εἰ μὴ φορτικὸν εἰπεῖν, ἐξητησάμεθα κινδυνεύοντας* (Hau.). SVPRA c. 31 p. 98 ll. 15—16.

p. 106 l. 23 HABEMVS ODISSE c. 22 prope fin. *habent de incolatu aeris et de uicinia siderum et de commercio nubium caelestes sapere paraturas.* 36 init. n. Oehler on De Fug. in Persec. 12 p. 485 note t. Adu. Iud. 13 a. m. *cum...pati haberet.* De Cult. Fem. I 1 *etiam filius dei mori habuit.* De Idolol. 5 p. 34 l. 16 Wiss. *uiuere.* De Carn. Resur. 27 pr. *hoc habeo dicere* etc. Adu. Valent. 14 p. 193 l. 20 Kr. *nec habens superuolare crucem.* n. on Zumpt § 562. Cypr. 653 11. Ps. Cypr. 263 10: cf. ind. Valer. Flac. I 671—2 *tollique uicissim pontus habet.* Cic. Vlp. (dig. xlviii 5. 16 (15) § 3) *laborare.* Macer (dig. xlviii 19. 10 § 1) *operari* [and countless others, cf. e.g. Hoppe Syntax u. Stil des Tert. pp. 43 ff., my Study of Ambrosiaster p. 109. A. S.].

p. 106 l. 26 LEGIBVS c. 4 p. 16 l. 9 *postremo legum obstruitur auctoritas.* c. 1, of truth, *quid hinc deperit legibus*

in suo regno dominantibus si audiatur? Blunt Right Use 342. Kaye 111.

p. 106 l. 27 VVLGVS c. 35 p. 104 l. 12 n. c. 49 fin. ad Scap. 3 pr. *sub Hilariano praeside, cum de areis sepulturarum nostrarum acclamassent: 'areae non sint.'* See Heraldus from Euseb. IV 15 § 26.

p. 106 l. 28 LAPIDIBVS ET INCENDIIS c. 48 p. 136 l. 6. Aen. I 150 *iamque faces et saxa uolant.* Tac. Ann. XIV 45 *multitudine saxa ac faces minitante.* Greg. Naz. in Epitaphio Basilii Or. 43 c. 57 § 4 (I 812[d]) *αἱ δᾷδες ἐν χερσίν, οἱ λίθοι προβεβλημένοι.* La Cerda. Iuu. 15 63—5. Euseb. ep. eccl. Vienn. Hist. Eccl. V 1 § 7 *λίθων βολάς.*

BACCHANALIVM FVRIIS Prochor. Vit. Ioann. (?) c. 39.

p. 106 l. 29 REQVIE SEPVLTVRAE Apul. II 29 *me in meam quietem permitte.* (de lamiis, corpses disinterred for magical uses, as in Lucan.) [Quintil.] Decl. 15 § 5 *facinus...tumulos busta scrutari et amputatis cadaueribus ipsas in scelera armare manus.* Cassiodor. Var. VI 8 *defunctorum quin etiam sacram quietem, aequabilia iura tuae conscientiae commiserunt.* *τυμβώρυχοι.* Iul. Firm. Math. I 2 § 10 *illum quiescentium securas animas et iam Lethaei fluminis obliuione purgatas Mercurius cogit nefariis carminibus excitare.* Persecution of Maximin, Euseb. Hist. Eccl. VIII (Herald.). [The passage is really Mart. Palaest. 9 § 10. A.S.]

p. 108 l. 1 REPENSATVM De Idolol. 8 p. 37 l. 15 Wiss. *minor merces frequentiore actu repensatur.* Paulin. Nol. ep. 29 9 *illi uotiuus Samuel in plures partus repensatus est.* Vell. Sen. Colum. Lact. [add Aug. c. Acad. II 3 (but Aug. prefers *rependo*). Ps.-Aug. serm. ter. A.S.].

p. 108 l. 2 FACVLIS Scorp. 6 p. 158 l. 7 Wiss. *qui—is oleum non praeparassent.* Cato Varro Cinc. ap. Gell. Plaut. uulg. Paulin. ep. 41 1. Hist. Apollon. regis Tyri 26 fin. [I have 5 exx. from Aug., and one from Ps.-Aug. Serm. A. S.] Nero's fire. Lact. De Mort. Persec. 14 (cited by Woodham) *sed Caesar non contentus est edicti legibus. aliter Diocletianum aggredi parat. nam ut illum ad propositum crudelissime persecutionis impelleret, occultis ministris palatio subiecit incendium. et cum pars quaedam conflagrasset, Christiani arguebantur uelut hostes*

publici, et cum ingenti inuidia simul cum palatio Christianorum nomen ardebat. Christian loyalty Iustin. Apol. I 11. 12. 23.

LARGITER VLTIONIS ἐκδικήσεως ἄδην Ashton. Plaut. Rud. IV 4 144 *illic inesse auri et argenti largiter.* ib. V 2 28 *largiter mercedis indipiscar.* (The Plaut. in lexx.) Apul. De Magia 28 *largiter aquae.* Petron. 71 *uinearum largiter.*

p. 108 l. 3 DISPVNGI Oehler h. l. ad nat. I 2 p. 61 l. 1 Wiss. *non statim confesso eo nomen homicidae dispuncta causa est aut satiata cognitio.* De Exhort. Cast. 2 a. m. *quae uult praecipit et accipit et aeternitatis mercede dispungit.* Adu. Marc. II 4 p. 337, l. 28 Kr. 23 p. 367 l. 1 Kr. De Monogam. 8 a. m.

p. 108 l. 4 IGNI HVMANO)(48 p. 140 ll. 8—9.

SECTA c. 40 a. m. *nec iam illic Christianae sectae origo consederat.* De Spectac. 2 p. 2 l. 19 Wiss. ad nat. I 4 pr. 6 p. 66 l. 15 Wiss. 10 p. 76 l. 10 Wiss. saepe. Minuc. 40. Prudent. Contr. Symm. II 93. 276. Apoth. praef. 2 1. Lact. De Opif. Dei 1 § 2 [see Bünemann's note. A. S.]. With *diuinitas sectae* of Fuld. cf. c. 39 *d. disciplinae.* De Orat. 18 p. 191 l. 24 Wiss. De Cor. Milit. 1. Kaye 85 sq.

p. 108 l. 5 SI ENIM cet. Cypr. Ad Demetrian. 17 pr. *inde est enim quod nemo nostrum quando adprehenditur reluctatur nec se aduersus iniustam uiolentiam uestram quamuis nimius et copiosus noster populus ulciscitur.*

EXSERTOS declared, downright, overt. De Baptismo 12 p. 211. 14 Wiss. *probatio exserta.* 18 p. 216 l. 2 Wiss. *manifestam et exsertam dignationem domini intercessisse.* De Monogam. 3 prope fin. *iam non oblique a nuptiis auocans, sed exserte.* Adu. Marc. I 29 p. 331 l. 2 Kr. *tunc denique coniugium exserte defendentes, cum inimice accusatur spurcitiae nomine in destructionem creatoris.* Adu. Valent. p. 180 l. 14 Kr. *qui talia neque facile producunt neque exserte defendunt.* De Spectac. 3 p. 4 l. 23 Wiss. *plane nusquam inuenimus, quemadmodum aperte positum est: 'non occides'..., ita exserte definitum: 'non ibis in circum.'* Apul. Metam. II 22 *exsertis oculis.* 30 pr. *exsertam uigiliam.*

p. 108 l. 6 AGERE cf. c. 10 p. 36 l. 30.

NVMERORVM Ammian. XX 4 § 7. Tac. Plin. ep. III 8 § 4

n. pp. 134—5. Suet. dig. Mommsen in Hermes XIX (1884) 219—231 [=Gesammelte Schriften, 6ter Bd, 103—115. A. S.], CIL X 1202. Capitolin. Max. Balb. 5 § 7. Greg. Dial. IV 35 (p. 428) n. a. Coripp. Iust. III 354, Dempster. Philolog. XLI 486—9. 493. Passio S. Hieronis (ed. Surius 7 Nov.) *in numeros militum ascriberent eos qui essent idonei.* Sozom. Hist. Eccl. I 8 § 11 *τὰ Ῥωμαίων τάγματα, ἃ νῦν ἀριθμοὺς καλοῦσιν.*

p. 108 l. 7 PLVRES cet. Kaye 49.

MAVRI Adu. Iud. 7 in Hau.

p. 108 l. 8 PARTHI cf. Rawlinson's Great Monarchies. On the Parthians as rivals of Rome Tac. Ann. II 2, XII 10 where Parthian ambassadors say: *subueniendum sociis uirium aemulis cedentibusque per reuerentiam.* Luc. VIII 252—351. Woodham. Cf. Apocal. 21. 2 sq. In Adu. Marc. III 24 p. 419 l. 27 Kr. 'a recent expedition to the east, probably that of Severus against the Parthians.' Geffcken Zwei Apologeten 242 n.

p. 108 l. 9 HESTERNI cet. supr. c. 21 pr. p. 66 l. 15 n. adu. Prax. 2 p. 229 ll. 16, 17 Kr. ad nat. I 8 p. 72 l. 19 Wiss. *non ulla gens non Christiana.* Adu. Iud. 7 fin. *Christi autem regnum et nomen ubique porrigitur, ubique creditur, ab omnibus gentibus supra enumeratis* (i.e. Babylonians, Parthians, Egyptians, India, Aethiopia, Alexander's empire, Asia, Germans, Moors, Britons, Roman empire) *colitur, ubique regnat, ubique adoratur.* Novelty, Orig. Contr. Cels. II 4. Arnob. I 55. 54 (p. 51 Elmenhorst). Blunt 3 Cent. 201—2. Tert. ib. 203—5, cites Adu. Marc. III 20 p. 410 l. 13 Kr. *uniuersas nationes de uoragine erroris humani exinde emergentes ad deum creatorem, ad deum Christum...Christo, qui totum iam orbem euangelii sui fide cepit.* Blunt op. cit. 200 citing Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. 91 p. 318d (*ἐν πᾶσι τοῖς ἔθνεσι*). c. 117 pr. (p. 344c) eucharist over all the world. ib. f. p. 345c in every nation Greek, Barbarian, nomads in wagons and homeless, herdsmen in tents, prayers and thanksgivings in the name of Christ crucified. Origen in Blunt 208—211 and generally ch. 10 pp. 183—225. Clem. Alex. Protrept. § 110 pp. 85, 86. Orig. Contr. Cels. I 53. 62 p. 48 f. II 79. Iren. I 10 2 and 1. III 11 8. IV 36 2. Ep. ad Diognet. 1 *τί δή ποτε καινὸν τοῦτο*

γένος ἢ ἐπιτήδευμα εἰσῆλθεν εἰς τὸν βίον νῦν καὶ οὐ πρότερον. Aug. ep. 197 § 4 (A.D. 419) of the 2nd coming of Christ: some may think that the conversion of the world may take place even in our lifetime. ib. 199 § 46 *sunt enim apud nos, hoc est in Africa, barbarae innumerabiles gentes, in quibus nondum esse praedicatum euangelium, ex eis qui ducuntur inde captiui et Romanorum seruitiis iam miscentur, cotidie nobis addiscere in promptu est. pauci tamen anni sunt, ex quo quidam eorum rarissimi atque paucissimi, qui pacati Romanis finibus adhaerent, ita ut non habeant reges suos, sed super eos praefecti a Romano constituantur imperio, et illi ipsi eorum praefecti Christiani esse coeperunt.*

ET and yet c. 2 post med. p. 10 l. 27 *Christianum hominem omnium scelerum reum...existimas et cogis negare, ut absoluas.* Iuu. 13 91 *hic putat esse deos et peierat.* 7 124 n. Verg. ecl. 9 57.

OMNIA IMPLEVIMVS c. 1 p. 4 l. 11 n. c. 50. Cf. ad Scap. 2. 5. De Fuga in Persec. 12 p. m. *tanta cotidie aerario augendo prospiciuntur remedia censuum uectigalium collationum stipendiorum, nec umquam usque adhuc ex Christianis tale aliquid prospectum est, sub aliqua redemptione capitis et sectae redigendis, cum tantae multitudinis nemini ignotae fructus ingens meti posset.* Maximin (A.D. 313) rescript. § 1 ad calc. Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IX 9 § 1 *συνεῖδον σχεδὸν ἅπαντας ἀνθρώπους, καταλειφθείσης τῆς τῶν θεῶν θρησκείας, τῷ ἔθνει τῶν Χριστιανῶν ἑαυτοὺς συμμεμιχότας.* Lact. Diu. Instt. V 13 §§ 1—5. Neumann I 20. 120. 121. Orig. Contr. Cels. I 26 p. 21. 27 p. 22. 30 p. 24. 43 p. 33. 47 p. 35. 57 p. 44. 67 fin. II 13. 30 p. 79. 42. III 24. V 62. VI 11. Christian officials, Zahn Forschungen V 300. Otto on Iust. Apol. I 1 pp. 4, 5. Lucian Alex. 2 fin. Minuc. 9 § 1 *ac iam, ut fecundius nequiora proueniunt, serpentibus in dies perditis moribus per uniuersum orbem sacraria ista teterrima impiae coitionis adolescunt.* Epiphan. Haer. XXX 9 p. 133 and Petau. n. p. 158. Harnack on Hermas Sim. VIII 3 § 2. Harnack Die Mission...des Christentums (1902) 360—376. Arnob. I 55 *si falsa, ut dicitis, historia illa rerum est, unde tam breui tempore totus mundus ista religione completus est? aut in unam coire qui potuerunt mentem gentes regionibus dissitae, uentis*

caeli conuersionibusque dimotae? II c. 5 p. 50 l. 18 c. 12. Friedländer III[5] 646 n. 4. Ep. ad Diognet. 5 § 4 *κατοικοῦντες δὲ πόλεις Ἑλληνίδας τε καὶ βαρβάρους, ὡς ἕκαστος ἐκληρώθη.* 6 § 2 *ἔσπαρται κατὰ πάντων τῶν τοῦ σώματος μελῶν ἡ ψυχή, καὶ Χριστιανοὶ κατὰ τὰς τοῦ κόσμου πόλεις.* Iren. III 1 § 1. Tzschirner 172—5. Clem. Alex. Protr. c. 8 p. 68.

p. 108 l. 10 CASTELLA cet. c. 1 p. 4 l. 12 lex Rubria between 49 and 42 (CIL I 205 tab. II 3. 26. 53. 56. 58) *o(ppido) m(unicipio) c(olonia) p(raefectura) u(ico) c(onciliabulo) c(astello) t(erritorio)ue* [= Bruns, Fontes Iuris Romani Antiqui[6], pp. 98 ff. A. S.]. Frontinus De Controuersiis Agrorum p. 35 12 *ager colonicus)(municipalis aut alicuius castelli aut conciliabuli.* Iul. Paulus Sentent. IV 6 2 *testamenta in municipiis coloniis oppidis praefecturis* (u.l. *-a*) *castellis* (u.l. *-o*) *conciliabulis facta in foro uel basilica.*

p. 108 l. 11 CASTRA c. 42 p. 122 l. 7. ad Scap. 4. Semisch Iustin. (Eng.) I 39. Tarachus (Ruinart 458) on his conversion retired from the army. Sulp. Seu. Chron. II 33 2 *Licinius, quia aduersum Constantinum de imperio certauit, milites suos litare praeceperat: abnuentes militia reiciebat.* Conc. Nic. Can. 12. [C. H. Turner, Ecclesiae Occidentalis Monumenta I pp. 214 ff. A. S.] 40 martyrs of the legio XII fulminata [R. Knopf, Ausgewählte Märtyrerakten, 2 aufl. (Tübingen, 1913) pp. 101 ff. A. S.] (many fathers in Allard Persécution de Dioclétien II 307). [Add the interesting epitaph of M. Iulius Eugenius, discovered by W. M. Calder in 1908, and published, for example, in Ramsay, Luke the Physician, pp. 339 ff. A. S.]

PALATIVM Iren. IV 49 (Grabe) *quid autem et hi qui in regali aula sunt fideles? nonne ex eis, quae Caesaris sunt, habent utensilia, et his qui non habent, unusquisque eorum secundum suam uirtutem praestat?* Minuc. 8 § 4 *de ultima faece collectis imperitioribus et mulieribus credulis.* 31 § 7 *nec de ultima statim plebe consistimus, si honores uestros et purpuras recusamus.*

SENATVM De Idolol. 19. De Cor. Milit. 11. Minuc. 31 § 7 (cited above). Cf. Keim's Celsus p. 11 n. 1. Orig. Contr. Cels. I 29. Ruinart 263 seq. Harnack Mission...des Christentums (1902), 388—395. We first meet a Christian senator in

the middle of century IV, Apollonius Euseb. Hist. Eccl. V 21 (who does not expressly call him so, as Jerome does in his catalogue). See Evans Biography of the Early Church I 270—284 e.g. 283 'Even after Caesar had become the conscious servant of Christ, his senate, at the head-quarters of the old religion of the empire, followed him with scarcely half its numbers into the assembly of the church.' He refers to Lardner's Credibility IX 150 in proof that 200 years after the death of Apollonius, it is at least questionable whether a majority of the senate were Christians. The controversy of Symmachus with Ambrose and Prudentius shows the state of things long after. Lact. Diu. Instt. V 1 *haec in primis causa est, cur apud sapientes et doctos et principes huius saeculi scriptura sancta fide careat, quod prophetae communi ac simplici sermone, ut ad populum, sunt locuti* (partly Woodham). Cf. 1 Cor. 1 27.

p. 108 l. 12 TEMPLA Minuc. 10 § 2 *cur nullas aras habent, templa nulla?* 32 § 1 *putatis autem nos occultare quod colimus, si delubra et aras non habemus?* Orig. Contr. Cels. VIII 17 p. 389 ὁ Κελσὸς φησὶν ἡμᾶς βωμοὺς καὶ ἀγάλματα καὶ νεὼς ἱδρύεσθαι φεύγειν. Arnob. VI 1—8. Vopiscus Aurelian 20 § 5 *in Christianorum ecclesia, non in templo deorum omnium.* Neumann I 125 n. 3. Blunt Early Church ser. 2 lect. 1 pp. 271—293. Plin. ep. Tr. 96.

p. 108 l. 14 Hau. cites Sen. ad Helu. 13. Publil. Syr. 259. 422. Luc. I 459 sq. Add Aug. ep. (127 =) 100 § 2 *necessitate nobis impacta et indicta, ut etiam occidi ab eis eligamus, quam eos occidendos uestris iudiciis ingeramus.* Lact. Diu. Instt. V 20 *defendenda est religio non occidendo, sed moriendo, non saeuitia, sed patientia.* Plato Gorgias 469^{c} ἑλοίμην ἂν μᾶλλον ἀδικεῖσθαι ἢ ἀδικεῖν. 473^{d}. 474^{b}. 479^{c}. 508^{b}. 509^{c}. 527^{b}. Ast on Plat. Rep. p. 358^{e}, p. 391^{a}. Plato Crito 49^{a} cet. Gataker on Anton. VIII 55. Adu. c. 5. Hierax in Stob. X 77. Plut. Phocion 32 § 5 p. 78^{bc}. comp. Ag. et Cleom. c. Ti. et C. Gracch. 4 § 2. Plut. II 36^{b}. Musonius in Stob. III 19 § 16. 20 § 61. 40 § 9 fin. [= ed. Hense pp. 52, 126. A.S.]. Aristot. Rhet. I 7 § 22. Eth. V 15 p. 1138 a 28. Socrates in Gell. XII 9 § 6. Sen. ep. 95 § 52. Xen. Anab. VII 6 § 21. Cic. Tusc. V § 56. Phil. XI § 9. Wolf on Liban. ep. 1188. Arnob. I 6 *iniuriam perpeti quam irrogare esse*

praestantius. ind. Chrys. s.u. *iniuria.* comm. on Sall. Cat. 9 § 5. Lucian Phalaris prior 9. Max. Tyr. 18 (2) c. 7. Democrit. fr. 224 Mullach (Democrat. in Orelli n. 11) *ὁ ἀδικέων τοῦ ἀδικεομένου κακοδαιμονέστερος.* Boissonade Anecd. II 162 sq. Philo de Iosepho 4 fin. II 44 M. 8 II 47 M (?). Aristid. II p. 65 sq. Jebb. Albinus in Fabric. Biblioth. Graec. III c. 30 f. Antiphon or. 13 p. 84. Boeth. de Consol. Phil. IV prosa 4 f. Isidor.-Pelus. ep. lib. II 257. Synesius ep. 67 fin. p. 215. Synes. epigr. 30 is the same as Liban. l.c. Kaye 85 seq. 136 seq. 139 sq.

p. 108 l. 17 ABRVPISSEMVS De Pudic. 7 p. 232 l. 26 Wiss. *ob tale quid extra gregem datus est uel et ipse forte ira, tum ore, aemulatione, quod denique saepe fit, dedignatione castigationis abrupit.* Adu. Valent. 4 p. 181 l. 1 Kr. *de ecclesia authenticae regulae abrupit.* Adu. Marc. V 1 p. 570 l. 24 Kr. So in Celsus (VIII 61. 71. 75) the supposition of active hostility or withdrawal of Christians.

p. 108 l. 18 SVFFVDISSET abashed. supr. c. 4 p. 18 l. 2 *bonorum adhibita proscriptio suffundere maluit hominis sanguinem quam effundere.* Scorp. 10 a. m. p. 521 Oehler (= p. 166 l. 17 Wiss.) with his n.

p. 108 l. 19 DESTITVTIO Cic. uulg. Tert. De Cor. Milit. 2 a. m. *d. obseruationis* [more in Thes.].

p. 108 l. 20 PROCVL DVBIO 'very rare' LS (1 Lucr. 1 Liu. 1 Plin. Hist. Nat. *dubio procul.* 2 Lucr.) add Apul. Metam. IV 3. 25. Under *procul* LS give Quintil. 2. Liu. 1. Plin. Hist. Nat. 1. Sueton 1 *dub. pr.* Flor. 1. Lucr. 1. *procul uero* Colum. [Add also Rufinus *often*, Ambst. *sometimes*, Aug. *often*: and many other authors. A. S.]

EXPAVISSETIS AD c. 39 p. 112 l. 29. c. 1 pr. p. 2 ll. 4—5 *timet ad.* Adu. Prax. 3 p. 230 l. 12 Kr. *exp.* (absol.). ad Mart. 3 a. m. *ne corpora atque animi expauescant de umbra ad solem.* De Spectac. 17 p. 19 ll. 9—10 Wiss. *ad lucem.* De Orat. 22 p. 196 l. 14 Wiss. (= 17 fin.) *uelandas ex ea die esse, qua ad primum uiri corpus osculo et dextera expauerint.* Iuu. 13 223 n. *hi sunt qui trepidant et ad omnia fulgura pallent.*

p. 108 l. 21 STVPOREM palsy.

p. 108 l. 22 QVAESISSETIS See Woodham: also Lucan VI

154. Burm. ad Ou. Metam. II 239. Plin. ep. II 1 § 7. VI 2 § 1. Hau. cf. Flor. III 21 § 25 *uiuere aliquos debere, ut essent quibus imperarent* and Sall. in Seru. Aen. VIII 557 [= hist. I 30 Maurenb. *speciem captae urbis efficere.* A.S.].

HOSTES c. 2 p. 10 l. 28. c. 32 *publicorum hostium nomen Christianis dabant.* 35 pr. *publici hostes Christiani.* Arnob. I 1 *neque enim negauerim ualidissimam esse accusationem istam, hostilibusque condignos odiis nos esse.* Tac. Ann. XV 44 *multitudo ingens haud proinde in crimine incendii quam odio humani generis conuicti sunt*, where Zeller (Zeitschr. f. wiss. Theol. 1891 356—367), recanting his former opinion (Vorträge II 195), sees μισανθρωπία Menschenscheu rather than Menschenhass.

p. 108 l. 27 VSQVEQVAQVE Scorp. 15 pr. ad nat. I 18 fin. II 12 p. 119 l. 8 Wiss. De Monogam. 17 pr. Sidon. Ep. II 10 § 1. IX 3 § 7. 15 ver. 41. Aug. ep. 153 14 pr. 185 25. [Add Ps. 118, 8. 43: probably as many as 100 instances in Aug. A. S.]

p. 108 l. 28 DAEMONIORVM c. 23 p. 82 l. 22 n. (last half), c. 25 pr. n., c. 27, c. 32 fin., c. 43 *quanti habetis, non dico iam qui de uobis daemonia excutiant?* Iustin. Apol. II 6 f. (Otto p. 216 n. 15). cf. Lact. Diu. Instt. IV 27 §§ 2—14. Tzschirner 175 sq.

INCVRSIBVS De Anim. 57 p. 392 l. 5 Wiss. *pluribus notum est daemoniorum quoque opera et immaturas et atroces effici mortes, quas incursibus deputant*: he goes on to speak of exorcisms. De Praescr. Haer. 15. Clem. Recogn. IV 14. 17, *incursio daemonis.* Chrysolog. Serm. 18, Migne P. L. LII p. 248[b] *pelluntur a nobis daemones.* Lact. Diu. Instt. II 15 § 6 *affirmat eos Hermes, qui cognouerint deum, non tantum ab incursibus daemonum tutos esse, uerum ne fato quidem teneri.* IV 27 § 2 *nam sicut ipse, cum inter homines ageret, uniuersos daemones uerbo fugabat hominumque mentes emotas et malis incursibus furiatas in sensus pristinos reponebat.* ib. § 14 *denique si constituatur in medio et is, quem constat incursum daemonis perpeti, et Delphici Apollinis uates, eodem modo dei nomen horrebunt, et tam celeriter excedet de uate suo Apollo, quam ex homine spiritus ille daemonicus.* Appeal to contemporary

miracles: Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. p. 258. Iren. II 31. 32. V 6. Cypr. Quod Idola di non sint 7. ad Demetrian. 15. ad Donat. 5 p. 8 l. 5 H. *ut quis expiatus* (Herald.). Minuc. 27. Arnob. I 46. Orig. Contr. Cels. I 2 f. p. 5. 46 p. 34 f. 67 f. p. 53. III 24 f. p. 124 (had himself seen many men cured of lunacy etc.). 36 f. exx. in Dodwell Diss. Cyprianica IV. Accepted by Mosheim, Comm. de rebus Christ. ante Const. p. 220, and Cramer in die Fortsetzung von Bossuet's Einleitung in die Geschichte der Welt I 432—3.

p. 108 l. 29 SINE MERCEDE Iren. in Euseb. Hist. Eccl. V 7 §§ 4 5 ap. Herald. (= Iren. II 32 § 4).

p. 108 l. 30 VACVA POSSESSIO LS II D *uacuus* (*possessio, bona* cet.) also *uacantia bona*: undisputed, empty, swept and garnished. Milton P. L. XI 103 vacant possession. Kaye p. 89.

p. 108 l. 31 COMPENSATIONEM Cic. Gai. dig. ad nat. I 7 p. 70 l. 17 Wiss. De Fuga in Persec. 11 *in compensationem*. [See Thes. A.S.]

p. 110 l. 1 PLANE...TAMEN c. 22 p. m. p. 76 l. 28 *sic et auctores interdum uideri uolunt eorum, quae adnuntiant: et sunt plane malorum nonnumquam, bonorum tamen numquam.*

CAP. XXXVIII

p. 110 l. 5 INLICITIS FACTIONIBVS c. 21 init. Minuc. 8 § 3 *homines, inquam, deploratae, inlicitae ac desperatae factionis grassari in deos non ingemescendum est?* Orig. Contr. Cels. I 1 *ὡς συνθήκας κρύβδην παρὰ τὰ νενομισμένα ποιουμένων.* Kaye 110.

p. 110 l. 9 CONPVLSATIONIBVS c. 21 med. p. 70 l. 13: a rare word. [See Thes. A. S.]

IN QVAESTV *esse* Quintil.

p. 110 ll. 11—12 Cf. c. 46 p. 130 l. 13 *Christianus uero nec aedilitatem* <*affectat*>. Kaye 342—3. Neumann I 124 9.

p. 110 l. 13 Minuc. 17 § 2 *nec possis pulchre gerere rem ciuilem, nisi cognoueris hanc communem omnium mundi ciuitatem.* Lucian Hermotim. 22—24. Vit. Auct. 8. Plut. De Alex. fort. seu uirt. I 6 p. 329. In Philo the world is *μεγαλόπολις*, de Opificio Mundi § 4 fin. (I 4 M.). De Iosepho 6

pr. (II 46 M.). Ep. ad Diogn. 5 p. 497[b]. κοσμοπολίτης Diogenes in Diog. Laert. VI 63. 72. Philo quod omnis probus liber 20 (I 468 M.). (de Antigenida) 445 M. Antonin. IV 4. X 15. Const. Apost. VII 39. Aristoph. Plut. 1151 πατρὶς γάρ ἐστι πᾶσ' ἵν' ἂν πράττῃ τις εὖ. Epictet. III 24 § 66 (of Diog.) πᾶσα γῆ πατρὶς ἦν ἐκείνῳ μόνῳ, ἐξαίρετος δ' οὐδεμία. Democrit. fr. 225 ἀνδρὶ σοφῷ πᾶσα γῆ βατή· ψυχῆς γὰρ ἀγαθῆς πατρὶς ὁ ξύμπας κόσμος (Stob. Flor. XL 7). Sen. de Otio Sap. 4 § 1. ep. 28 § 4 n. [unpublished A. S.]. 48 § 3. 95 § 52. De Ira II 31 § 7. Clem. Alex. Strom. IV § 172 p. 642 P.

p. 110 l. 14 Kaye 366—8 (De Spectac.).

RENVNTIAMVS cf. c. 42 p. 122 l. 20 n. De Anima 35 p. 360 l. 24 Wiss. *tum si in diabolum transfertur aduersarii mentio, ex obseruatione comitante cum illo quoque moneris eam inire concordiam, quae deputetur ex fidei conuentione: pactus es enim renuntiare ipsi et pompae et angelis eius. conuenit inter nos de isto. haec erit amicitia obseruatione sponsionis, ne quid eius postea resumas ex his, quae eierasti, quae illi reddidisti, ne te ut fraudatorem, ut pacti transgressorem iudici deo obiciat.* De Spectac. 1 p. 1 l. 19 Wiss. 2. 4 p. 6 l. 2 Wiss. *cum aquam ingressi Christianam fidem in legis suae uerba profitemur, renuntiasse nos diabolo et pompae et angelis eius ore nostro contestamur. quid erit summum atque praecipuum, in quo diabolus et pompae et angeli eius censeantur, quam idololatria?...igitur si ex idololatria uniuersam spectaculorum paraturam constare constiterit, indubitate praeiudicatum erit etiam ad spectacula pertinere renuntiationis nostrae testimonium in lauacro, quae diabolo et pompae et angelis eius sint mancipata scilicet per idololatrian.* 6 f. (also *renuntiatio*). 13 pr. 24 p. 24 l. 20 Wiss. *hinc uel maxime intellegunt factum Christianum, de repudio spectaculorum.* ad Mart. 2 *non sollemnes nationum dies ipsa commixtione participas, non nidoribus spurcis uerberaris, non clamoribus spectaculorum, atrocitate uel furore uel impudicitia celebrantium caederis, non in loca libidinum publicarum oculi tui impingunt.* De Idolol. 6 pr. 15 f. bis. 24 fin. De Paenit. 5 m. 6 pr. De Cult. Fem. I 2 f. De Cor. Milit. 3 med. *denique ut a baptismate ingrediar, ibidem, sed et aliquanto prius in ecclesia sub antistitis manu contestamur, nos renuntiare diabolo*

et pompae et angelis eius. Ambr. De Mysteriis 2 § 5 (II 326[b]) *renuntiasti diabolo et operibus eius, mundo et luxuriae eius ac uoluptatibus.* [Cf. De Sacr. I 2 § 5. A. S.] Coll. 3rd S. after Easter. omn. Saluian. VI § 31—33. Chrys. Hom. in Coloss. 6 c. 4 pr. (XI 369[c]) *ὁρᾶτε οὖν μὴ τούτῳ ἁλῶμεν μετὰ τὸ εἰπεῖν ἀποτάσσομαι τῷ σατανᾷ.* ib. p. 370[b] (of baptism) *εἶτα ἵνα μὴ τοῦ ὄφεως ἀκούσῃς, εὐθέως διδάσκει λέγειν ἀποτάσσομαί σοι.* Bailey Rituale Anglo-Cathol. 256—7. 268—9. 282. Bingham bk XI c. 7 §§ 1—5. Const. Apost. VII 41 (or 42). Oresiesis Inst. Mon. (Bibl. Max. Patr. IV 96[d] *mundo.* 95[b] *saeculo*). Lact. Diu. Instt. I 1 § 4 *uniuersis uoluptatibus.* Cypr. ep. 13 5 (508 13 H.) *saeculo renuntiaueramus cum baptizati sumus.* De Habitu Virg. 7 (192 19) *mundus..., cuius pompis et deliciis iam tum renuntiauimus, cum meliore transgressu ad deum uenimus.* cf. 6 (p. 191 23). De Lapsis 2 fin. (p. 238 21) *saeculo.* 8 (p. 242 24) *diabolo et saeculo.* De Orat. Dominica 13 (p. 276 8) *saeculo.* 19 pr. (p. 281 3) *qui saeculo renuntiauimus et diuitias eius et pompas fide gratiae spiritalis abiecimus.* De Bono Patientiae 12 f. (p. 406 3) [cf. also *abrenuntio* in Thes. A.S.]. Neumann I 130 n. 9 sq. Minuc. 12 § 5. 37 § 11. Kaye 366 seq. Theophil. III 15. Prudent. Contr. Symm. I 379 seq. Athenag. Suppl. 35 *τίς οὐχὶ τῶν περὶ σπουδῆς τὰς δι' ὅπλων ἀγωνίας καὶ διὰ θηρίων καὶ μάλιστα τὰς ὑφ' ὑμῶν ἀγομένας ἔχει; ἀλλ' ἡμεῖς πλησίον εἶναι τὸ ἰδεῖν τὸν φονευόμενον τοῦ ἀποκτεῖναι νομίζοντες ἀπηγορεύσαμεν τὰς τοιαύτας θέας. πῶς οὖν μηδὲ ὁρῶντες, ἵνα μὴ ἑαυτοῖς ἄγος καὶ μίασμα προστριψαίμεθα, φονεύειν δυνάμεθα;* Lact. Diu. Instt. VI 20 § 9 *quae [spectacula publica] quoniam maxima sunt irritamenta uitiorum et ad corrumpendos animos potentissime ualent, tollenda sunt nobis, quia non modo ad beatam uitam nihil conferunt, sed etiam nocent plurimum.* § 27 *in scenis quoque nescio an sit corruptela uitiosior. nam et comicae fabulae de stupris uirginum loquuntur aut amoribus meretricum et, quo magis sunt eloquentes, qui flagitia illa finxerunt, eo magis sententiarum elegantia persuadent et facilius inhaerent audientium memoriae uersus numerosi et ornati.* § 28 *item tragicae historiae subiciant oculis parricidia et incesta regum malorum et cothurnata scelera demonstrant.* § 29 *histrionum quoque impudicissimi motus quid aliud nisi libidinem*

docent et instigant? cet. § 33 *uitanda ergo spectacula omnia non solum ne quid uitiorum pectoribus insideat, quae sedata et pacifica esse debent, sed ne cuius nos uoluptatis consuetudo deleniat et a deo atque a bonis operibus auertat.* Cf. Epit. 63.

On the word *renuntiamus* see also Blunt Ch. First 3 Cent. p. 39 n. 1. 104 n. 1. 105—6. supr. 6 p. m. p. 24 l. 1. De Exhort. Castitatis 10 pr. *carnalibus fructibus.* Cypr. p. 426 8. 652. 11. Aug. Bapt. c. Donat. v 28 § 39. Symm. Pro Patre 6 fin. 8 fin. (ed. Seeck pp. 333—4). Saluian De Gubernat. Dei III § 15 ter. Rönsch 380. Quintil. x 7 § 1 n. *ciuilibus officiis.* Sen. Plin. Suet. Iustin. Apol. I 49 § 5 p. 85b τοῖς εἰδώλοις ἀπετάξαντο.

p. 110 l. 15 SVPERSTITIONE De Spect. 5—11. Lact. Diu. Instt. VI 20 § 34 *nam ludorum celebrationes deorum festa sunt, siquidem ob natales eorum uel templorum nouorum dedicationes sunt constituti.* § 35 *et primitus quidem uenationes, quae uocantur munera, Saturno attributae sunt, ludi autem scenici Libero. circenses uero Neptuno. paullatim tamen et ceteris dis idem honos tribui coepit, singulique ludi numinibus eorum consecrati sunt. sicut Sisinnius Capito in libris spectaculorum docet.* § 36 *si quis igitur spectaculis interest, ad quae religionis gratia conuenitur, discessit a Dei cultu et ad deos se contulit, quorum natales et festa celebrauit.* Epit. 63. [Cypr.] De Spect. 4 *quid scriptura interdixit? prohibuit enim spectari quod prohibet geri. omnia, inquam, ista spectaculorum genera damnauit, quando idololatriam sustulit ludorum omnium matrem, unde haec uanitatis et leuitatis monstra uenerunt. quod enim spectaculum sine idolo, quis ludus sine sacrificio, quod certamen non consecratum mortuo?* Bingham XVI 4, 9 n. 43.

CONCEPTAS c. 25 post med. p. 88 l. 34 *nam etsi a Numa concepta est curiositas superstitiosa.*

p. 110 l. 16 PRAETERSVMVS ἅπ. εἰρ.

p. 110 l. 17 INSANIA De Spectac. 14. 16 pr. *cum ergo furor interdicitur nobis, ab omni spectaculo auferimur, etiam a circo, ubi proprie furor praesidet. adspice populum ad id spectaculum iam cum furore uenientem...unius dementiae una uox est. cognosce dementiam de uanitate.* Adu. Marc. I 27 p. 329 l. 4 Kr. *quid non frequentas tam sollemnes uoluptates circi furentis et caueae saeuientis et scaenae lasciuientis?* Prud. Hamartigenia

361—2 *nec equum uesania feruida circi auctorem leuitatis habet rapidiue fragoris.* Stat. Silu. III 5, 14 *certe lasciuia corde nulla nec aut rapidi mulcent te proelia circi aut intrat sensus clamosi turba theatri.* [Add Aug. cat. rud. 16 § 25 *plus aduersus se ipsos insanientes ipsi spectatores alter pro altero, quam illi quorum* insaniam *insani prouocant, sed insaniendo spectare desiderant.* A. S.] Blunt Right Use 361. Marquardt III^{2} 517 n. 2.

p. 110 l. 18 INPVDICITIA THEATRI De Spectac. 18. 10 p. 12 l. 7 Wiss. *saepe censores nascentia cum maxime theatra destruebant, moribus consulentes, quorum scilicet periculum ingens de lasciuia prouidebant.* Aug. II De Symb. 2 § 1. Cypr. Ad Donat. 8. [Cypr.] De Spect. 3.

ATROCITATE HARENAE De Spectac. 18, cited below. Salvian VI § 10 *in spectaculis...primum deliciarum genus est mori homines, impleri ferarum aluos humanis carnibus cum circumstantium uoluptate et conspicientium laetitia: utque hoc fiat, orbis impendium est: adeuntur loca abdita, lustrantur inuii saltus, peragrantur siluae inexplicabiles et, ut deuorari possint homines, non licet naturam rerum habere aliquid secretum.* Petron. 119 14—18 *quaeritur in siluis auro fera et ultimus Hammon Afrorum excutitur, ne desit belua dente ad mortes pretiosa; fames premit aduena classes, tigris et aurata gradiens uectatur in aula, ut bibat humanum populo plaudente cruorem.* Hieron. Vit. Hilarion. § 2 *non circi furoribus, non harenae sanguine, non theatri luxuria delectabatur.* Pelagius ep. ad Demetriad. Hier. XI 2 p. 17^{e} (also in editions of Aug.) 14 *ad consulatum eorum diuersae totius orbis prouinciae, ad quas domus uestrae potentia extenditur, peregrinas feras et ignota animalia transmiserunt, quae crudelis harenae solum uel suo uel hominum sanguine cruentarent.* Iren. I 6 § 3 *καὶ ἐπὶ πᾶσαν ἑορτάσιμον τῶν ἐθνῶν τέρψιν εἰς τιμὴν τῶν εἰδώλων γιγνομένην πρῶτοι συνίασιν, ὡς μηδὲ τῆς παρὰ Θεῷ καὶ ἀνθρώποις μεμισημένης τῆς τῶν θηριομάχων καὶ μονομαχίας ἀνδροφόνου θέας ἀπέχεσθαι ἐνίους αὐτῶν.* Cypr. ad Donat. 7. Neumann I 235 9—11. (Orig.). Chrys. Hom. 13 in 1 Cor. 4 (Hauerc.).

XYSTI *xystici* De Spectac. 30 p. 29 l. 9 Wiss. (Sueton. Galba 15) *tunc xystici contemplandi, non in gymnasiis sed in*

igne...iaculati. ib. 18 p. 20 l. 3 Wiss. *non probabis usquam uanos cursus et iaculatus et saltus uaniores; nusquam tibi uires aut iniuriosae aut uanae placebunt, sed nec cura facticii corporis, ut plasticam dei supergressa. et propter Graeciae otium altiles homines oderis. et palaestrica diaboli negotium est: primos homines diabolus elisit. ipse caestus colubrina uis est, tenax ad occupandum, tortuosa ad obligandum, liquida ad elabendum.* Cyril. Hieros. catech. I 4 ap. Hau. 319 a.

p. 110 l. 20 INIVRIA c. 40 p. 116 l. 24 *haec utique non sine iniuria incolentium accidere potuerunt.* c. 44 pr. *illam iniuriam ciuitatis nullus expendit, cum tot iusti impendimur.* Otto on Iustin. Apol. I c. 8 f. p. 57c εἰ μὲν οὖν ἄπιστον ἢ ἀδύνατον τοῦτο φήσει τις, πρὸς ἡμᾶς ἤδε ἡ πλάνη ἐστὶν ἀλλ' οὐ πρὸς ἕτερον, μέχρις οὗ ἔργῳ μηδὲν ἀδικοῦντες ἐλεγχόμεθα.

SI FORTE c. 16 med. p. 54 l. 8 n. *nos, si forte, integrum et totum deum colimus.* 20 f. 41. 43 pr. ad nat. I 15 p. 85 l. 23 Wiss. De Pudic. 1 p. 222 l. 4 Wiss. De Paenit. 10. De Fug. in Persec. 2 p. m. De Cor. Milit. 5, Oehler p. 427 15 f.

p. 110 l. 21 SED REPROBAMVS cet. De Spectac. 28 pr. *nostrae cenae, nostrae nuptiae nondum sunt, non possumus cum illis discumbere, quia nec illi nobiscum.*

p. 110 l. 22 EPICVREIS De Spectac. 28 p. 27 l. 8 Wiss. *delicatus es, Christiane, si et in saeculo uoluptatem concupiscis, immo nimium stultus, si hoc existimas uoluptatem. philosophi quidam hoc nomen quieti et tranquillitati dederunt, in ea gaudent, in ea auocantur, in ea etiam gloriantur. tu mihi metas et scaenam et puluerem et harenam suspiras.* Usener Epicurea p. 158 5.

Cap. XXXIX

p. 110 l. 26 CORPVS Licin. in Lact. De Mort. Persec. 48 *quae omnia corpori Christianorum protinus per intercessionem tuam ac sine mora tradi oportebit. et quoniam idem Christiani non ea loca tantum, ad quae conuenire consueuerunt, sed alia etiam habuisse noscuntur ad ius corporis eorum, id est ecclesiarum non hominum singulorum, pertinentia, ea omnia lege qua superius comprehendimus, citra ullam prorsus ambiguitatem uel*

controuersiam isdem Christianis, id est corpori et conuenticulis eorum, reddi iubebis...in quibus omnibus supradicto corpori Christianorum intercessionem tuam efficacissimam exhibere debebis. Cassian Inst. II 5 p. 21 l. 24 Petsch. *quinam modus cotidiano cultui per uniuersum fraternitatis corpus decerni deberet, tractaturi conueniunt.* Arnob. I 16 *corporis non nostri*)(*Christianos*, 1 Cor. 10 12. Tzschirner [where?].

p. 110 l. 28 MANV FACTA Ad Scap. 5 *Arrius Antoninus in Asia cum persequeretur instanter, omnes illius ciuitatis Christiani ante tribunalia eius se manu facta obtulerunt.* Woodham cites Arnob. I 14 *collatis precibus adoramus* etc. Pont. Vit. Cypr. 16 *sic autem comitatui eius infinitus exercitus adhaerebat, quasi ad expugnandam mortem manu facta ueniretur.* Liebenam Röm. Vereinswes. 271 n. 1.

p. 110 l. 30 ORAMVS c. 30—33. Fragments of primitive liturgy Blunt First Three Centuries c. 2 e.g. p. 36. cf. De Orat. 22 [rather 23? A. S.]. Euseb. Vit. Const. IV 20. Athanas. Apol. ad Const. (I 1, 239[a]). Arnob. IV 36 *nam nostra quidem scripta cur ignibus meruerunt dari? cur immaniter conuenticula dirui, in quibus summus oratur deus, pax cunctis et uenia postulatur magistratibus exercitibus regibus familiaribus inimicis, adhuc uitam degentibus et resolutis corporum uinctione, in quibus aliud auditur nihil nisi quod humanos faciat, nisi quod mites uerecundos pudicos castos familiaris communicatores rei?* Cyril. Hieros. Cat. 5 Myst. 8, Migne P. G. XXXIII p. 1116[a] παρακαλοῦμεν τὸν θεὸν ὑπὲρ κοινῆς τῶν ἐκκλησιῶν εἰρήνης, ὑπερ τῆς τοῦ κόσμου εὐσταθείας, ὑπερ βασιλέων, ὑπὲρ στρατιωτῶν καὶ συμμάχων, ὑπὲρ τῶν ἐν ἀσθενείαις, ὑπερ τῶν καταπονουμένων καὶ ἁπαξαπλῶς ὑπὲρ πάντων βοηθείας δεομένων. Martyrium Sebastiani 23 § 85 *pro salute tua semper Christum colui et pro statu orbis imperii Romani* [*Romani orbis* Migne P.L. XVII. A. S.] *illum qui in caelis est semper adoraui.* Dionys. Alex. in Euseb. Hist. Eccl. VII 1. Acta SS. Achatii (in Ruinart). Iustin. Apol. I c. 65 pr. p. 97[c] κοινὰς εὐχὰς ποιησόμενοι ὑπέρ τε ἑαυτῶν καὶ τοῦ φωτισθέντος καὶ ἄλλων πανταχοῦ πάντων εὐτόνως. c. 14 p. 61[e] ὑπὲρ τῶν ἐχθρῶν εὐχόμενοι. c. 17 p. 64[d] ὅθεν θεὸν μὲν μόνον προσκυνοῦμεν, ὑμῖν δὲ πρὸς τὰ ἄλλα χαίροντες ὑπηρετοῦμεν, βασιλεῖς καὶ

ἄρχοντας ἀνθρώπων ὁμολογοῦντες καὶ εὐχόμενοι μετὰ τῆς βασιλικῆς δυνάμεως καὶ σώφρονα τὸν λογισμὸν ἔχοντας ὑμᾶς εὑρεθῆναι. c. 79. 85—9. Dial. c. Tryph. c. 35 f. p. 254[bc]. c. 96 f. p. 323[d]. Athenag. c. 37. Theophilus III 4. Tzschirner 307 sq. Bailey Rituale Anglo-Cath. 79. 80. 102. 174. Acta Cypriani p. 216 Ruinart.

p. 110 l. 31 POTESTATIBVS Iuu. 10 100 n. Arnob. II 32 *tyrannos dominos alias innumeras potestates.* uulg. for *ἐξουσία.*

PRO RERVM QVIETE Kaye 20. Bailey Rituale Angl. 137 (5th Sun. after Trin.). 98 prayer in war. Hennecke Aristid. ind. *ἔντευξις.*

PRO MORA FINIS c. 32 pr. *quae nolumus experiri, ea dum precamur differri, Romanae diuturnitati fauemus.* Kaye 348. Zahn V 304 n. 3.

p. 110 l. 32 Iustin. Apol. I 23. 28. 67 *καὶ τῇ τοῦ ἡλίου λεγομένῃ ἡμέρᾳ πάντων κατὰ πόλεις ἢ ἀγροὺς μενόντων ἐπὶ τὸ αὐτὸ συνέλευσις γίνεται, καὶ τὰ ἀπομνημονεύματα τῶν ἀποστόλων ἢ τὰ συγγράμματα τῶν προφητῶν ἀναγινώσκεται, μέχρις ἐγχωρεῖ. εἶτα παυσαμένου τοῦ ἀναγινώσκοντος ὁ προεστὼς διὰ λόγου τὴν νουθεσίαν* [cf. p. 112 l. 2 *exhortationes.* 1 Tim. 4 13 *πρόσεχε τῇ ἀναγνώσει, τῇ παρακλήσει, τῇ διδασκαλίᾳ*] *καὶ πρόκλησιν τῆς τῶν καλῶν τούτων μιμήσεως ποιεῖται.* Tert. De Praescr. Haer. 36, in the apostolical sees the apostles' writings are read. a reader ib. 41 f. Among Montanists Tert. De Anim. 9 p. 310 l. 24 Wiss. *iam uero prout scripturae leguntur aut psalmi canuntur aut allocutiones proferuntur aut petitiones delegantur.* Orig. Contr. Cels. III 50 p. 142 *ἢ τί τούτοις παραπλήσιον πράττομεν, οἱ καὶ δι' ἀναγνωσμάτων καὶ διὰ τῶν εἰς αὐτὰ διηγήσεων προτρέποντες μὲν ἐπὶ τὴν τὸν Θεὸν τῶν ὅλων εὐσέβειαν.* Bailey Rituale 6—8.

p. 112 l. 3 CENSVRA DIVINA 1 Cor. 6 9 ff. 1 Tim. 3 10. Bailey Rituale Anglo-Cath. 354—5 (commination).

p. 112 l. 7 RELEGETVR Orig. Contr. Cels. III c. 51 *ἵνα τοὺς μὲν τὰ ἐπίρρητα πράττοντας ἀποκωλύσωσιν ἥκειν ἐπὶ τὸν κοινὸν αὐτῶν σύλλογον.* Cf. both indd. Cypr. *abstinere.* Kaye 342.

PRAESIDENT Ad Vxor. I 7. De Monogam. 12. De Cor. Mil. 3. De Pudic. 14 p. 248 l. 21 Wiss. De ieiun. 17 p. 297 l. 2 Wiss. Liebenam Röm. Vereinswes. 271 n. 5. Cypr. ep. 72

§ 1 fin. *coepiscopos in Numidia praesidentes.* id. De Vnitat. Eccl. 5 pr. *quam unitatem tenere firmiter et uindicare debemus, maxime episcopi qui in ecclesia praesidemus.* Lucian Peregr. 11. cf. Keim's Celsus 148 n. Iustin. Apol. I 67, προστάτης. cf. Otto on Iustin. Apol. I 66 p. 97[c] τῷ προεστῶτι τῶν ἀδελφῶν. cf. p. 98[d]. Lord King Prim. Church p. 61 (citing Cave Primitive Christianity pt. 3 c. 5 p. 379) says that Firmilian in Cypr. ep. 75 § 7 fin. is used to expound this place: *quando omnis potestas et gratia in ecclesia constituta sit, ubi praesident maiores natu qui et baptizandi et manum imponendi et ordinandi possident potestatem:* 'By these approved elders, bishops and presbyters must necessarily be understood.' Harnack on Hermas Vis. II 4 § 3 (προιστάμενοι. προεστώς. προστάτης. *praesides. praepositi*).

SENIORES Kaye 208 seq. 220. 236. 334 seq. *presbyteri* = *episcopi* Ziegler's Irenaeus 141.

HONOREM cet. De Praescr. Haer. 43 fin. *promotio emerita.*

p. 112 l. 8 NON PRETIO against simony Can. Apostol. 29 with Beveridge p. 465 Cotel.

TESTIMONIO Bingham IV 3 4.

p. 112 l. 9 ARCAE cf. Blunt First Three Centuries 113—5. Beveridge on Can. Apostol. 3 p. 456 Cotel. Iulian. ep. 49 p. 429[d] οὐδὲ ἀποβλέπομεν, ὡς μάλιστα τὴν ἀθεότητα συνηύξησεν ἡ περὶ τοὺς ξένους φιλανθρωπία καὶ ἡ περὶ τὰς ταφὰς τῶν νεκρῶν προμήθεια καὶ ἡ πεπλασμένη σεμνότης κατὰ τὸν βίον (to Arsacius high priest of Galatia). Misopogon p. 363[a] νυνὶ δὲ ὑμῶν ἕκαστος ἐπιτρέπει μὲν τῇ γυναικὶ πάντα ἐκφέρειν ἔνδοθεν εἰς τοὺς Γαλιλαίους, καὶ τρέφουσαι ἀπὸ τῶν ὑμετέρων ἐκεῖναι τοὺς πένητας πολὺ τῆς ἀθεότητος ἐργάζονται θαῦμα πρὸς τοὺς τῶν τοιούτων δεομένους. Fragmentum Epistulae p. 305[b c]. Gaius in dig. III 4 1 1 (quoted in note on p. 112 l. 17).

HONORARIA fee.

p. 112 l. 11 STIPEM De ieiun. 13 p. 872 l. 9. Iustin. Apol. I c. 67 p. 99[a] οἱ εὐποροῦντες δὲ καὶ βουλόμενοι κατὰ προαίρεσιν ἕκαστος τὴν ἑαυτοῦ ὃ βούλεται δίδωσι, καὶ τὸ συλλεγόμενον παρὰ τῷ προεστῶτι ἀποτίθεται, καὶ αὐτὸς ἐπικουρεῖ ὀρφανοῖς τε καὶ χήραις, καὶ τοῖς διὰ νόσον ἢ δι' ἄλλην αἰτίαν λειπομένοις,

καὶ τοῖς ἐν δεσμοῖς οὖσι καὶ τοῖς παρεπιδήμοις οὖσι ξένοις, καὶ ἁπλῶς πᾶσι τοῖς ἐν χρείᾳ οὖσι κηδεμὼν γίνεται. c. 14 p. 61[c] *ἃ ἔχομεν εἰς κοινὸν φέροντες καὶ παντὶ δεομένῳ κοινωνοῦντες.* c. 67 pr. p. 98[c] *καὶ οἱ ἔχοντες τοῖς λειπομένοις πᾶσιν ἐπικουροῦμεν.* c. 13 pr. p. 60[c] *τοῖς δεομένοις προσφέρειν.* Dial. c. Tryph. c. 47 p. 266[b] *κοινωνεῖν ἁπάντων.* Cypr. De Opere et Eleemos. 15 *locuples et diues dominicum celebrare te credis quae corban omnino non respicis, quae in dominicum sine sacrificio uenis, quae partem de sacrificio quod pauper obtulit sumis?* Mosheim Dissert. ad Hist. Eccl. vol. II (Alt. 1743) p. 36 seq. Uhlhorn Die christl. Liebesthätigkeit 1882 seq. 3 vols. Blunt First Three Centuries 27—31 (N.T. and early Church). Cf. *τέλη* Rom. 13. 7. Heinrici Stud. u. Kr. 1881 520 sq.

MENSTRVA DIE Bingham V 4 2 and 3 salaries paid monthly: *mensurna diuisio* Cypr. ep. 34 4 (p. 571 2), 39 5 (p. 585 2). De Opere et Eleemos. 9—13. 15. Allard Les dernières persécutions (1887) 39 40. Henzen 6086 (= Dessau 7212 = CIL XIV 2112). omn. dig. XLVII 22. 3 1. Euseb. Hist. Eccl. VI 43 § 11. Liebenam Vereinswesen pp. 40 41 172 320, 11.

p. 112 l. 14 POTACVLIS elsewhere only De Carn. Resur. 4 p. 30 l. 22 Kr.

VORATRINIS in Amm. Cf. Liebenam 41. 262.

DISPENSATVR cet. Cf. Cypr. ep. 72 § 5. 5 § 1 *quantum ad sumptus suggerendos, siue illis qui gloriosa uoce dominum confessi in carcere sunt constituti, siue his qui pauperes et indigentes laborant et tamen in domino perseuerant, peto nihil desit, cum summula omnis quae redacta est illic sit apud clericos distributa propter eiusmodi casus, ut haberent plures unde ad necessitates et pressuras singulorum operari possint.* Iustin. Apol. I 67 (cited on l. 11). [Greek inscr. in Ramsay Luke the Physician p. 352. A. S.] Blunt Right Use 315. Charge against the presidents, De Ieiun. 13 p. 291 l. 28 Wiss. (avarice) 17 p. 296 l. 18 ff. Wiss. (gluttony).

p. 112 l. 15 HVMANDISQVE Ad Scap. 3 pr. (I 543 2) *sub Hilariano praeside cum de areis sepulturarum nostrarum adclamassent: areae non sint!* Cypr. ep. 8 § 3 *siue uiduae siue thlibomeni qui se exhibere non possunt siue hi qui in*

carceribus sunt siue exclusi de sedibus suis utique habere debent qui eis ministrent: sed et catecumini adprehensi infirmitate decepti esse non debebunt, ut eis subueniatur. et quod maximum est, corpora martyrum aut ceterorum si non sepeliantur, grande periculum imminet eis quibus incumbit hoc opus. cp. 12 § 1 *corporibus etiam omnium, qui etsi torti non sunt, in carcere tamen glorioso exitu mortis excedunt, impertiatur et uigilantia et cura propensior.* Bingham XXIII 3, 7. Neumann I 111 sq.

PVERIS AC PVELLIS orphans taught a trade and supplied with tools (Const. Apost. IV 2), not, as Gibbon said, foundlings (Blunt 332—7). The childless to adopt orphans (Const. Apost. IV 1). Orphans, Zahn Forschungen zur Gesch. des NTlichen Kanons V 227. Harnack on Herm. Mand. VIII 10 pp. 100—1.

p. 112 l. 15 PARENTIBVS cf. Hennecke Aristides ind. *χήρα*.

p. 112 l. 16 Ad Mart. 1 init. *inter carnis alimenta, benedicti martyres designati, quae uobis et domina mater ecclesia de uberibus suis et singuli fratres de opibus suis propriis in carcerem subministrant, capite aliquid et a nobis quod faciat ad spiritum quoque educandum.* ib. 2 *ipsam interim conuersationem saeculi et carceris comparemus, si non plus in carcere spiritus acquirit, quam caro amittit: immo et quae iusta sunt caro non amittit per curam ecclesiae et agapen fratrum, et insuper quae semper utilia fidei, spiritus adipiscitur.* De Ieiun. 12 p. 290 l. 27 Wiss. *plane uestrum est in carceribus popinas exhibere martyribus incertis, ne consuetudinem quaerant, ne taedeat uitae, ne noua abstinentiae disciplina scandalizentur.* Story of Pristinus who recanted on the first application of torture, having been gorged before with meat and wine. Iulian. Misopogon 363[a] (cited on p. 112 l. 9). fragm. ep. p. 305[bc] (Hercher I 391 13 sq.) *ἐπειδὴ γὰρ οἶμαι συνέβη τοὺς πένητας ἀμελεῖσθαι παρορωμένους ὑπὸ τῶν ἱερέων, οἱ δυσσεβεῖς Γαλιλαῖοι κατανοήσαντες ἐπέθεντο ταύτῃ τῇ φιλανθρωπίᾳ, καὶ τὸ χείριστον τῶν ἔργων διὰ τοῦ δοκοῦντος τῶν ἐπιτηδευμάτων ἐκράτυναν.* ep. 49 p. 429[d] recommended for imitation the *φιλανθρωπία* of Christians. Kaye 132. Neumann I 230 3 4. Christian hospitality Hennecke Aristides ind. *ξένος*. Zahn Forschungen V 301.

Const. Apost. V 1 pr. and (prisoners) I col. 829[b]. V 2. Matth. 25 43—4. When Peregrinus Proteus was in prison (Lucian de Morte Peregr. 12, 13) the Christians endeavoured to procure his release; when that failed, from early dawn widows and orphans might be seen waiting about the prison, *οἱ ἐν τέλει* bribed the watch and spent the night with him. *εἶτα δεῖπνα ποικίλα εἰσεκομίζετο καὶ λόγοι ἱεροὶ αὐτῶν ἐλέγοντο.* 13, crowds came from the cities of Asia with rich presents: *ἐν βραχεῖ γὰρ ἀφειδοῦσι πάντων*....Their first lawgiver persuaded them that they were all brethren.

p. 112 l. 17 METALLIS c. 12 p. 44 l. 14 n. *in metalla damnamur.* c. 27 p. 92 l. 30 n. Const. Apostol. IV 9. Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IX 1 § 10. De Mart. Palaest. 7 § 2 (Phaeno). 8 § 1 (Thebais) § 13. 11 § 6 (Cilicia) Aug. Serm. 178 4 (V 850). Bingham XV 1, 2 n. 13 (V p. 221 col. 2).

IN INSVLIS supra c. 12 p. 44 l. 15 n. *in insulas relegamur.* c. 1 p. 4 l. 11 *obsessam uociferantur ciuitatem, in agris, in castellis, in insulis Christianos.* De Pudic. 22 p. 271 l. 19 Wiss. Iuu. 1 73 n. Friedländer III[5] 631 n. 10. Mines, Dionys. in Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IV 23 § 10 to the Romans, *ἐξ ἀρχῆς γὰρ ὑμῖν ἔθος ἐστὶ τοῦτο, πάντας μὲν ἀδελφοὺς ποικίλως εὐεργετεῖν.* Const. Apostol. VIII 9 *ἐν μετάλλοις δὲ ἀδελφοῖς ὑπάρχουσιν ἐπιχορηγοῦντας δι᾽ ὧν πέμπετε ἀρχῆθεν ἐφοδίων.* Hippolyt. Haer. IX 12 (in Sardinia). dig. XLVIII 19 28 pr. *proxima morti poena metalli coercitio.* Neumann I 77—79. Cassian. coll. XVIII 7 8. Rufin. Hist. Eccl. IV 23 p. 230.

IN CVSTODIIS Ad Vxor. II 4 *quis in carcerem ad osculanda uincula martyris reptare patietur?* Ad Mart. I 2 (Hau.). Aug. Breuiculus Coll. cum Donat. III 25 *quidam etiam in eadem epistula facinerosi arguebantur et fisci debitores, qui occasione persecutionis uel carere uellent onerosa multis debitis uita, uel purgare se putarent et quasi abluere facinora sua, uel certe acquirere pecuniam et in custodia deliciis perfrui de obsequio Christianorum.* Cf. Acta Saturnini in Baluze Misc. I[2] § 18 [= Migne P.L. VIII 701[a]. A. S.]. Prisoners Zahn Forschungen V 228 (Aristid. Syr. 15 8) 224. 227. Cyprian sent £800 (*sestertia centum milia numorum*) to the Numidian bishops for the redemption of Christian slaves, collected from his clergy

and laity (ep. 62 § 4). Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IX 10 = Rufin. Hist. Eccl. IX 10 p. 540. Care for prisoners Bingham XX (?) 2 3 n. 68 sq. Const. Apostol. IV 9. V 2. Iustin. [Apol. I 67 § 5. (?) A. S.]. Business of deacons. cf. Deutscher Merkur 1889 313. Acta Perpetuae 3. Lucian De Morte Peregrini 12. 13 (see p. 112 l. 16 n.).

p. 112 l. 19 NOTAM INVRIT De Cult. Fem. I 4 pr. *nulla nunc muliebri pompae nota inusta sit.* Lact. De Mort. Persec. 3 *etiam mortuo notam inureret* (Woodham). Orig. Contr. Cels. III 30.

p. 112 l. 20 VT INVICEM SE DILIGANT Friedländer III^{5} 642 n. 3. 643 n. 1. Minuc. 9 § 2 (cited below).

p. 112 l. 21 Kaye 131.

p. 112 l. 23 FRATRES ad Scap. 1 *ita enim disciplina iubemur diligere inimicos quoque et orare pro eis qui nos persequuntur, ut haec sit perfecta et propria bonitas nostra, non communis. amicos enim diligere omnium est, inimicos autem solorum Christianorum.* Scorpiac. 1 p. 145 l. 16 Wiss. *haeccine pati homines innocentes? ut putes fratrem aut de melioribus ethnicum.* De Virgin. Velandis 2 *cum quibus <psychicis> communicamus ius pacis et nomen fraternitatis; una nobis et illis fides, unus Deus, idem Christus, eadem spes, eadem lauacri sacramenta, semel dixerim, una ecclesia sumus.* Iuu. 5 135 n. cf. Neumann I 140 n. 3 sq. 237 n. 1. 243 n. 8. Luc. Peregr. 13^{c}. Aristid. ed. Hennecke ind. ἀδελφός. Liebenam röm. Vereinswes. 273. Arnob. IV 36 fin. (*germanitas*). Arn. iun. in Ps. 133. Clem. Alex. Strom. II c. 9 § 41 p. 450 P. ᾗ καὶ ἀδελφοὺς τοὺς τῷ αὐτῷ λόγῳ ἀναγεννηθέντας προσαγορεύομεν. Minuc. 9 § 2 *passim etiam inter eos quaedam libidinum religio miscetur ac se promisce appellant fratres et sorores, ut etiam non insolens stuprum intercessione sacri nominis fiat incestum.* Athenag. Suppl. 11 p. 11^{d} asks what philosophers οὕτω ἐκκεκαθαρμένοι εἰσὶ τὰς ψυχὰς ὡς ἀντὶ τοῦ μισεῖν τοὺς ἐχθροὺς ἀγαπᾶν, καὶ ἀντὶ τοῦ, τὸ μετριώτατον, κακῶς ἀγορεύειν τοὺς προκατάρξαντας λοιδορίας εὐλογεῖν, καὶ ὑπὲρ τῶν ἐπιβουλευόντων εἰς τὸ ζῆν προσεύχεσθαι; ib. 12 p. 12^{d} μέχρι τοσούτου δὲ φιλανθρωπότατοι ὥστε μὴ μόνον στέργειν τοὺς φίλους. 32 p. 36^{c}. Cypr. ad Demetrian. 25. Iustin. Apol. I 14

p. 61^{c}. 39 p. 78^{b}. 57 p. 91^{d}. Dial. c. Tryph. 35 p. 254^{b}. 96 p. 323^{b}. 133 p. 363^{c}. Julian in a letter to the Galatian priest Arsacius, Sozomen Hist. Eccl. v 16 *μάλιστα τὴν ἀθεότητα συνηύξησεν ἡ περὶ τοὺς ξένους φιλανθρωπία.* Hier. Adu. Heluid. 15 *affectu fratres dici, qui in duo scinditur, in spiritale et in commune. in spiritale, quia omnes Christiani fratres nocamur.* Chrysost. Hom. 9 ad pop. *τοῖς ἀδελφοῖς ἀναμιχθείς.* Fulbert Carnot. Ep. 5 (1) Migne P. L. CXLI 196^{b} *pro aedificandis fratribus adhuc infirmis.* Albaspinaei Obseru. in Optat. De Schism. Donat. I 1 pr. *clarissimi fratres.* IV 2. Acta Saturnini etc. 14 in Optat. [ed. Dupin, Paris, 1702. A. S.] p. 154 col. 2 *ad haec proconsul, 'vis' inquit, 'ire cum Fortunatiano fratre tuo?' respondit, 'nolo, quia Christiana sum, et illi sunt fratres mei qui Dei praecepta custodiunt.'* Lact. Diu. Instt. v 15 § 2 *nec alia causa est, cur nobis inuicem fratrum nomen impertiamus, nisi quia pares esse nos credimus.* ib. c. 6 § 12. 8 § 6. 22 § 7. VI 10 §§ 4—8. Epit. 65 § 3. [Euseb. Emisen.] Homil. 4. Gottfr. Arnold De fratrum appellatione. Buddei Sel. Iur. Nat. et Gent. p. 753.

p. 112 l. 27 Eph. 4 3 sq. Ep. Petr. ad Iac. 1 2 p. 608 Cotel. *εἷς θεός, εἷς νόμος, μία ἐλπίς.*

p. 112 l. 29 AD VNAM LVCEM c. 37 p. 108 l. 20. ad Mart. 3 *sudore omnia constant, ne corpora atque animi expauescant de umbra ad solem.* De Spectac. 17 p. 19 l. 8 Wiss. *ipsae illae pudoris sui interemptrices de gestibus suis ad lucem et populum expauescentes, semel anno erubescant.* Optat. I 3 *nemo miretur eos me appellare fratres, qui non possunt non esse fratres. est quidem nobis et illis spiritalis una natiuitas, sed diuersi sunt actus.* Archiv f. lat. Lexik. I 507 (*exp.* also with *super* c. abl.).

p. 112 l. 32 DIRIMIT Cassian Coll. XXIV 26 *fratrum dirimit caritatem contentiosa diuisio.* Chrysolog. Serm. I (Migne P.L. LII 185^{a}) *ceterum facultates unitatem scindunt, fraternitatem separant, cognationem spargunt, parentum perdunt et uiolant caritatem.* Sen. ep. 88 § 11 *quid mihi prodest scire agellum in partes diuidere, si nescio cum fratre diuidere?*

p. 112 l. 34 INDISCRETA cet. c. 9 p. 34 l. 30. Kaye 344. Ep. ad Diognet. 5 § 7 *τράπεζαν κοινὴν παρατίθενται ἀλλ' οὐ*

κοίτην (so Maranus, Overbeck, Dräseke). Chastity of Christians Iustin. Apol. I 37 (general morality c. 17).

p. 112 l. 35—p. 114 l. 1 De Patient. 16 p. 23 l. 23 Kr. the devil teaches his followers patience, *quae maritos dote uenales aut lenociniis negotiantes uxorum potestatibus subicit.* De Cult. Fem. II 1. Cypr. De Habitu Virg. 4 etc. Chastity of Christians. Athenag. 31—34 pp. 35—37. Minuc. 31 § 5)(c. 2 supra p. 6 l. 27. In his tr. De Ieiunio 17 p. 296 l. 24 Wiss. *sed maioris est agape, quia per hanc adulescentes tui cum sororibus dormiunt. appendices scilicet gulae lasciuia atque luxuriae*)(cc. 7. 8 supr. cf. Kaye 403—4. Galen. (Arabice in Abulfeda Hist. anteislamitica ed. Fleischer p. 109) *homines illi, qui Christiani uocantur, quod mortem contemnunt, id quidem omnes ante oculos habemus; item quod uerecundia quadam ducti ab usu rerum uenerearum abhorrent. sunt enim inter eos et feminae et uiri qui per totam uitam a concubitu abstinuerint.* Schwegler Montan. 127 sqq. Semisch Iustin. I 198 sqq. Stäudlin Sittenlehre Iesu II 114 sqq. 432 sqq.

p. 114 l. 3 SOCRATIS Clem. Recogn. X 5. Saluian. VII § 101 *uideamus ergo quas Socrates de pudicitia leges sanxerit et quas illi, de quibus loquimur. uxorem, inquit Socrates, propriam nullus habeat, matrimonia enim cunctis debent esse communia....* § 103 *nec suffecit sapientissimo, ut quidam aiunt, philosopho docere hoc, nisi ipse fecisset; uxorem enim suam alteri uiro tradidit, scilicet sicut etiam Romanus Cato, id est alius Italiae Socrates. ecce quae sunt et Romanae et Atticae sapientiae exempla: omnes penitus maritos, quantum in ipsis fuit, lenones uxorum suarum esse fecerunt. sed uicit tamen Socrates, qui de hac re et libros condidit et memoriae haec pudenda mandauit. plus habet unde gloriari sibi praeceptis suis possit, quantum ad doctrinam suam pertinet, lupanar fecit e mundo.*

CATONIS Quintil. X 5 § 13 n. Elmenhorst on Arnob. I 64 p. 58. Hier. c. Iouin. II 36. Aug. c. Iul. V § 46. So Agetus cedes his wife to Aristo, Herodot. VI 62.

p. 114 l. 5 CREANDORVM Spartian Pesc. Nig. 6 § 6 *rei ueneriae nisi ad creandos liberos prorsus ignarus.* [Ambr.] in 1 Cor. 7 5 *si enim causa filiorum creandorum ducitur uxor, non multum tempus concessum uidetur ad ipsum usum.*

p. 114 l. 6 FACILE Hor. Sat. II 5 75 *scortator erit: caue te roget, ultro Penelopen facilis potiori trade.*

p. 114 l. 7 LENONES cet. Minuc. 39 § 7 *philosophorum supercilia contemnimus, quos corruptores et adulteros nouimus et tyrannos et semper aduersus sua uitia facundos.* Lactant. Diu. Instt. III 15. IV 24.

p. 114 l. 8 CONVIOLATVR Herm. Vis. I § 3 (p. 6 1 Hilg.). Prudent. Psychomach. 398. περὶ στ. VI 56.

p. 114 l. 11 MEGARENSES Hier. ep. 123. cf. 129, 4. Frazer's Pausan. vol. II p. 538.

p. 114 l. 13 STIPVLAM ad nat. I 20 p. 92 l. 26 Wiss. *auferte stipulam de oculo uestro, aut <trabem> de oculo uestro, ut stipulam de alieno extrahatis.* Wetst. on Matth. 7 3—4. Plin. ep. VI 1 (?) [VIII 22 § 1 might be cited. A. S.] ad Trai. 117 (?), dig. XXX. 122 (?), XXXV 1, 73 (?).

p. 114 l. 14 RVCTANTIBVS c. 9 p. m.

ACESCIT Sidon. carm. 5 340 *ganeaque perenni pressus acescentem stomachus non explicat auram.*

p. 114 l. 15 SALIIS Marquardt III^2 232 n. pr.

p. 114 l. 16 DECIMARVM c. 14 p. 48 l. 7.

p. 114 l. 17 Preller-Jordan Röm. Myth. II 383 n. 3.

p. 114 l. 18 FVMVM Apul. Apol. 57 fin. *est quidem Crassus iste summus heluo et omnis fumi non imperitus, sed profecto pro studio bibendi, quo solo censetur, facilius ad eum Alexandriam uini aura quam fumi perueniret.*

SPARTEOLI firemen. Sen. ep. 64 § 1 *maior fumus...ex lautorum culinis terrere uigiles solet.*

p. 114 l. 19 CENA NOSTRA Bingham XV 7, 8 and 10. Kaye pp. 403—4. De Orat. 28 p. 198 l. 30 Wiss. *hanc* [*hostiam* i.e. *orationem*] *agapen coronatam...deducere ad dei altare debemus.* Aug. contr. Faust. XX 20 *agapes nostrae pauperes pascunt siue frugibus, siue carnibus.* Serm. 178 4 (v. 850 f.). Hier. [ad Eustoch.] epist. 22 § 32 *cum ad agapen uocauerint, praeco conducitur.* Vit. S. Ludgeri 32 *inuitat ad agapen egentes ac miseros.* The word in ad Martyr. 2 Oehler. De Bapt. 9 p. 208 l. 23 Wiss. De Ieiun. 17 (cited in note on p. 112 l. 35 ff.). Cypr. p. 107 5. p. 112 14. Cassian Collat. XVI 14. XXIV 12. Warnefr. De Gest. Longobard. I c. 26 *signat adesse dapes agapes, sed liuidus obstat.*

Orig. cont. Cels. I § 1 p. 4 *καὶ βούλεται διαβαλεῖν τὴν καλουμένην ἀγάπην Χριστιανῶν.* In Spanish caridad)(*ἔρανος, collecta, collecticia, symbolica.* Conc. Gangr. Can. 11 *εἴ τις καταφρονοίη τῶν ἐκ πίστεως ἀγάπας ποιούντων καὶ διὰ τιμὴν τοῦ Κυρίου συγκαλούντων τοὺς ἀδελφούς, καὶ μὴ ἐθέλοι συγκοινωνεῖν ταῖς κλήσεσι διὰ τὸ ἐξευτελίζειν τὸ γινόμενον, ἀνάθεμα ἔστω: si quis despicit eos, qui fideliter agapas* (*id est conuiuia pauperibus*) *exhibent et propter honorem domini conuocant fratres et noluerit communicare huiuscemodi uocationibus,...anathema sit.* [Turner, Eccl. Occid. Monum. II p. 196 ff. A. S.] Chrys. Hom. 27 in 1 Cor. pr. p. 240[c]. Cypr. Testim. III 3. Ducange s.v. agape. Renan Saint-Paul 226 sq. Marc-Aurèle 519 n. 3.

p. 114 l. 22 REFRIGERIO infr. c. 49 p. 140 l. 22. Hieron. praef. § 1 ad reg. S. Pachomii, speaking of Paula (II 53[a]) *multorum incisa illius morte refrigeria suspirarem.* After death inscr. (Kraus Realencyckl. des christl. Alterth. II 684 sq.).

p. 114 l. 23 PARASITI Valerian Episc. Hom. 10, of parasites tweaked by the nose, having their seat drawn from under them etc., *tanta est igitur libido uiuendi, ut putent miseri nullum sine laetitia transire conuiuium, nisi in cibos uerterint aut uestimenta corporum aut ministeria poculorum.* Names of parasites, Gnatho, Saturio, Artotrogus, peniculus (sweeping the table clean), curculio. Herald. Digress. I c. 21 (p. 237), cites De Patient. 16 p. 23 l. 20 Kr. *nam ut in isto quoque domino diabolus aemularetur, quasi plane ex pari...docuit et suos patientiam propriam, illam dico,...quae uentris operarios contumeliosis patrociniis subiectione libertatis gulae addicit.* Iuu. 5, 171 n.

p. 114 l. 24 FAMVLANDAE cf. c. 21, p. 70 l. 27.

p. 114 l. 26 ORDINEM De Exhort. Cast. 7. De Monogam. 11.

p. 114 l. 28 VILITATIS Apul. Flor. I 7 3 *morum.* Amm. XIV 6 § 2 (a disgraceful story). Woodh.

p. 114 l. 29 & 35 ORATIO grace before and after meat. Bas. ep. 2 6 (III 74) *εὐχαὶ πρὸ τῆς τροφῆς, εὐχαὶ μετὰ τροφήν.* Hieron. (ad Eustoch.) epist. 22 § 35, 4 *post hoc concilium soluitur et unaquaeque decuria cum suo parente pergit ad mensas...*§ 37, 1 *nec cibus a te sumatur nisi oratione praemissa* etc. Lasaulx

Studien 151 n. 67. Orig. Contr. Cels. VIII 33 fin. Herald. on Arnob. IV pp. 151—2.

p. 114 l. 29—30 QVANTVM cet. Clem. Alex. Paedagog. II 4. Vit. S. Postumii [Pachomii] [c. 6 = Migne P. L. LXXIII 432^{c}. A. S.] *panem etiam suum ad mensuram accipiebat, et aquam ad mensuram bibebat; numquam pleno uentre a mensa recessit.* Ambr. (?) [probably De exc. fr. Satyri I § 56 *non umquam accuratioribus epulis aut congestis ferculis delectatus est, nisi cum amicos rogaret: quantum naturae satis esset, non quantum uoluptati superesset, requirens.* A. S.]

p. 114 l. 31 Ad Vxor. II 4 *quis nocturnis conuocationibus, si ita oportuerit, a latere suo adimi libenter ferat?* Hieron. (ad Laetam) epist. 107 § 10, 1 *sic comedat,...ut statim post cibum possit legere orare psallere.* (Ad Furiam) epist. 54 § 11, 1 *quando comedis, cogita, quod statim tibi orandum, ilico legendum sit.* (Ad Eustoch.) epist. 31 § 3, 3 *ita tibi semper comedendum est, ut cibum et oratio sequatur et lectio.* Kaye p. 404 n. 5.

p. 114 l. 33 POST Scorpiace 11 (p. 170 l. 22 Wiss.) with Oehler's note.

AQVAM De Orat. 13 *quae ratio est, manibus quidem ablutis, spiritu uero sordente, orationem obire, quando et ipsis manibus spiritales munditiae sint necessariae...? hae sunt uerae munditiae, non quas plerique superstitiose curant, ad omnem orationem, etiam cum a lauacro totius corporis ueniunt, aquam sumentes. id cum scrupulosius percontarer et rationem requirerem, comperi commemorationem esse Pilatum manus abluisse in domini deditione. nos dominum adoramus, non dedimus, immo et aduersari debemus deditoris exemplo nec propterea manus abluere, nisi ob aliquod conuersationis humanae inquinamentum conscientiae causa lauemus.* In the panegyric on church-building addressed to Paulinus bp of Tyre (Euseb. Hist. Eccl. X 4 § 40) the atrium was surrounded with porches, *ἱερῶν δ' ἐνταῦθα καθαρσίων ἐτίθει σύμβολα, κρήνας ἄντικρυς εἰς πρόσωπον ἐπισκευάζων τοῦ νεώ, πολλῷ τῷ χεύματι τοῦ νάματος τοῖς περιβόλων ἱερῶν ἐπὶ τὰ ἔσω προϊοῦσι τὴν ἀπόρρυψιν παρεχομένας.* called *φρέαρ* Socr. Hist. Eccl. II 38 (Migne P. G. LXVII 332^{a}); *cantharus* Paulin. Nol. ep. 32 (ad Sulp. Seu.)

§ 15 p. 290 l. 3 Hartel [see also his index. A. S.]. Chrys. Hom. 73 in Io., t. viii (Paris, 1836) 3 p. 496 (= 433[d]), complains of those who on entering the temple washed their hands only, not their hearts, and in Ps. 140, v (Paris, 1835) p. 520 (= 431[c]) urges men to cleanse the hands rather by alms, by love and charity to the needy: if you are loath to raise in prayer hands unwashed, how much more hands stained by sin. Praying with unwashed hands is not so offensive as praying with an impure mind. Custom (which led to holy water stoups) borrowed from the heathen, who retained it in Julian's time. Sozom. Hist. Eccl. vi 6 (Migne P. G. lxvii 1307[c]). Bähr Symbolik i 491.

scriptvris Ad Vxor. ii 6 *quae dei mentio? quae Christi inuocatio? ubi fomenta fidei de Scripturarum interlectione? ubi spiritus refrigerium? ubi diuina benedictio?*

p. 114 l. 35 canere Cypr. ad Donat. 16 *quoniam feriata nunc quies ac tempus est otiosum, quidquid inclinante iam sole in uesperam dies superest, ducamus hunc diem laeti nec sit uel hora conuiuii gratiae caelestis immunis. sonet psalmos conuiuium sobrium: ut tibi tenax memoria est, uox canora, adgredere hoc munus ex more. magis carissimos pascis, si sit nobis spiritalis auditio, prolectet aures religiosa mulcedo.* Harnack Gesch. der altchristl. Lit. i 795. Medicinisches aus der ältesten Kirchen-gesch. (Texte viii 4) 51 citing 1 Cor. 11 21. Eph. 5 18. Acts 2. Apostol. Const. (in Texte ii 5 23).

p. 114 l. 36 dirimit Hier. (ad Eustoch.) epist. 22 § 37, 1 *non recedatur a mensa, nisi referantur gratiae Creatori.* Ambr. De Virg. iii 4 § 18 *certe sollemnes orationes cum gratiarum actione sunt deferendae, cum e somno surgimus, cum prodimus, cum cibum paramus sumere, cum sumpserimus.* Chrysost. Or. de Bapt. Christi [ii 375[b]] *μετὰ τὴν τράπεζαν ἐπὶ εὐχὴν τρέπῃ.* Clem. Alex. Paedag. ii 9 § 77 (1) p. 216 P. *μετὰ γὰρ τὴν εὐωχίαν εὐλογήσαντες τὸν θεόν.* ib. 10 § 96 (2) p. 228 P. *ἑσπέρας δὲ ἀναπαύσασθαι καθήκει μετὰ τὴν ἑστίασιν καὶ μετὰ τὴν ἐπὶ ταῖς ἀπολαύσεσιν εὐχαριστίαν.* Maxim. Hom. 88 De non timendis hostibus carnalibus (P. L. lvii 456[ab]) *a nobis exspectat qui nos pascit deus, ut pro praestitis ab eo escis illi gratias referamus, et saturati donis ipsius laudes dicamus.* Clem. Recogn. i 19 (P. G. i p. 1217[b]) *post cibum cum*

laudem dedisset deo et gratias egisset. Cf. c. 35 pr. heathen excess.

CAESIONVM Iuu. 3 88 (?). Sueton. Aug. 45 *spectauit autem studiosissime pugiles et maxime Latinos, non legitimos atque ordinarios modo, quos etiam committere cum Graecis solebat, sed et cateruarios oppidanos inter angustias uicorum pugnantes temere ac sine arte.* Perhaps an allusion to gladiators. Nicol. Dam. ed. C. Müller, Fragm. Hist. Graec. vol. III p. 417 fr. 84.

p. 114 l. 37 DISCVRSATIONVM Theodoret H. E. V 20 *καὶ οἱ τοῦ Διονύσου τὰ ὄργια τετελεσμένοι μετὰ τῶν αἰγίδων ἔτρεχον, τοὺς κύνας διασπῶντες καὶ μεμηνότες καὶ βακχεύοντες καὶ τὰ ἄλλα δρῶντες ἃ τὴν τοῦ διδασκάλου πανήγυριν δηλοῖ.*

ERVPTIONES c. 35 p. m. p. 104 l. 19 ad nat. I 17 p. 89 l. 7 Wiss. (sensu proprio, Caes. Cic. Plin. Sen.).

LASCIVIARVM Conc. Laod. c. 54 *ὅτι οὐ δεῖ ἱερατικοὺς ἢ κληρικούς τινας θεωρεῖν ἐν γάμοις ἢ δείπνοις, ἀλλὰ πρὸ τοῦ εἰσέρχεσθαι τοὺς θυμελικοὺς ἐγείρεσθαι αὐτοὺς καὶ ἀναχωρεῖν.* Conc. Trull. c. 24. Hieron. Adu. Heluid. 20 m., of a dinner with its timbrels and pipes, harps and cymbals: *ingrediuntur expositae libidinum uictimae et tenuitate uestium nudae impudicis oculis ingeruntur.* Clem. Alex. Paedag. II 7 *καθόλου μὲν οὖν νέοι μὲν καὶ νεανίδες.* Arnob. II 42. more in La Cerda. Poenitent. Rom. tit. 5 c. 2 *remoueantur a conuiuio cuncta turpitudinum argumenta.* Iuu. 11 162 sq.

p. 116 l. 2 COITIO Vlp. l. 1 D. de off. praef. urb. I 12 1 § 14. *Diuus Seuerus rescripsit eos etiam, qui illicitum collegium coisse dicuntur, apud praefectum urbi accusandos.* cf. Keim on Orig. contr. Cels. I 1 pp. 3 4. Liebenam Röm. Vereinswesen 41. 270—1.

p. 116 l. 4 TITVLO c. 42 pr.

p. 116 l. 5 Minuc. 31 § 7 *nec fastidiosi sumus, si omnes unum bonum sapimus, eadem congregati quiete qua singuli: nec in angulis garruli, si audire nos publice aut erubescitis aut timetis*)(ibid. 8 § 4 *plebem profanae coniurationis instituunt, quae nocturnis congregationibus et ieiuniis sollemnibus et inhumanis cibis non sacro quodam sed piaculo foederantur.* Plin. ad Trai. 96 (97) § 7 *adfirmabant...summam culpae suae,...*

quod essent soliti stato die ante lucem conuenire carmenque Christo quasi deo dicere secum inuicem.

p. 116 l. 8 FACTIO Sall. Iug. 31 § 15 *haec inter bonos amicitia, inter malos factio est.*

CAP. XL

p. 116 l. 10 c. 40. cf. c. 20. Aug. in Ps. 80 § 1 med. (IV 1225[d] Gaume) heathen's taunts: *abundare pressuras temporibus Christianis...prouerbium: non pluit Deus, duc ad Christianos.* De Ciuitat. Dei in. Oros. Arn. pr. Aug. ep. 5 Ad Marcellinum [now epist. 138 § 16. A. S.] *haec generalis conquestio calumniosa est* etc. Oros. I 8 § 14. IV 6 §§ 34—42. 23 § 10. VII 37 §§ 6—10. esp. the letter of Maximinus copied from a brazen pillar at Tyre (Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IX 7 §§ 2—14, cf. note on l. 14). Elmenhorst on Arnob. p. 2. §§ 3. 4 fin. Elmenhorst and Godefroy cite Nouell. Theodosii II tit. 3 § 8 [l. 75 Mommsen-Meyer], which turns the tables on Jews, Samaritans, heretics, Pagans (*an diutius perferemus mutari temporum uices irata caeli temperie, quae paganorum exacerbata perfidia nescit naturae libramenta seruare? unde enim uer solitam gratiam abiurauit...nisi quod ad inpietatis uindictam transit legis suae natura decretum?*) Firmilian in Cypr. ep. 75 § 10, persecution consequent on earthquake. Cypr. Ad Demetrianum c. 2. 3. 4. 5. Aug. Serm. 87 13 fin. *nemo dicat: antea melior erat mundus quam modo: ex quo coepit iste medicus artem suam exercere, multa hic uidemus horrenda.* omn. Aug. De Ciu. Dei II 2. 3 e.g. proverb quoted below on line 15. Arnob. I § 1 *postquam esse in mundo Christiana gens coepit, terrarum orbem perisse.* Passio (Gr.) Porphyrii in Elmenhorst p. 2. III § 36 *audetis intendere, nostri nominis causa res humanas ab dis premi.* IV § 24 *nam nos quidem quid de illis < dis uestris > aliquando aut inconueniens sensimus aut conscriptionibus edidimus indecoris, ut in inuidiam iaciantur nostram labores generis humani et commoditates quibus uiuitur imminutae?* Orig. in Matt. c. 24 v. 9 (IV 270 Lomm.) *cum haec ergo contigerint mundo, consequens est quasi derelinquentibus hominibus deorum culturam, ut propter multitudinem Christianorum dicant fieri bella et fames et pestilentias. frequenter enim famis causa*

Christianos culparunt gentes, et quicumque sapiebant quae gentium sunt; sed et pestilentiarum causas ad Christi ecclesiam rettulerunt. scimus autem et apud nos terrae motum factum in locis quibusdam, et factas fuisse quasdam ruinas, ita ut qui erant impii extra fidem causam terrae motus dicerent Christianos, propter quod et persecutiones passae sunt ecclesiae, et incensae sunt. non solum autem illi, sed et qui uidebantur prudentes, talia in publico dicerent, quia propter Christianos fiunt grauissimi terrae motus. Heinichen on Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IX 7 § 9.

p. 116 l. 11 ODIVM Tac. Ann. XV 44 *odio humani generis.* Rufin. Hist. Eccl. IX c. 7.

p 116 l. 12 CONCLAMANT De Idolol. 14 p. 45 l. 18 Wiss. *si de omni blasphemia dictum est, Vestra causa nomen meum blasphematur, perimus uniuersi, cum totus circus scelestis suffragiis nullo merito nomen lacessit.* De Spectac. 27 pr. *odisse debemus istos conuentus et coetus ethnicorum, uel quod illic nomen dei blasphematur, illic in nos cotidiani leones expostulantur, inde persecutiones decernuntur, inde temptationes emittuntur.* The Christian retort, leg. Novell. Theodos. II 1 3 p. 10 Rittershusius, *paganorum exacerbata perfidia* cause of all trouble [quoted more fully on l. 10. A. S.].

p. 116 l. 14 CLADIS ad nat. I 9 pr. *uos recognoscendo miremini, in quantam stultitiam incidatis, qui omnis cladis publicae uel iniuriae nos causas esse uultis.* Cypr. ad Demetrian. 2 *cum dicas plurimos conqueri et quod bella crebrius surgant, quod lues, quod fames saeuiant, quodque imbres et pluuias serena longa suspendant nobis imputari, tacere ultra non oportet.* 3 *dixisti per nos fieri et quod nobis debeant imputari omnia ista quibus nunc mundus quatitur et urguetur.* 7. 10. Friedländer III[5] 610. In the time of Maximin the children in the schools had to learn by heart of Jesus and Pilate καὶ τὰ ἐφ' ὕβρει πλασθέντα ὑπομνήματα (Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IX 7 § 1). Euseb. (l.c. §§ 2—15) transcribed from a pillar at Tyre a sort of lay-sermon of M.'s against the Christians: all convulsions of nature διὰ τὴν ὀλέθριον πλάνην τῆς ὑποκένου ματαιότητος τῶν ἀθεμίτων ἐκείνων ἀνθρώπων. Maximin. (Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IX 8 § 3) boasted that his devotion to idols and persecution of Christians

would secure him from famine, plague, war, but all came upon him A.D. 311 (IX 8 §§ 1. 2. 4—15). Aug. De Ciu. Dei I—V, especially II c. 2, worship of the gods not necessary for temporal, VI—X nor for eternal happiness. Retract. II 43 (cf. Fleury XXIII 7). in Ps. 136. 9. Oros. I prol. §§ 9 10. Melito (Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IV 26) retorts the charge. The Empire rose and grew with the church under Augustus. Orig. contr. Cels. III 15 p. 269 4. In Matt. tract. 28. 39 (III 857). Arnob. I 1 and 3. III 36. Blunt Right Use 360. Bayle œuvres III 46. 52 (Liu.) 53 sq. Symm. ep. X 54 (?) [34?] the Vestals a prop of the state; loss of Cannae owing to Juno's jealousy, Valer. Max. I 1 § 16. Lasaulx 34.

IN CAVSA c. 2 prope f. (p. 12 l. 6) *intellegere potestis non scelus aliquod esse in causa, sed nomen.* ad nat. I 3 p. 62 l. 11 Wiss. *nomen in causa est. quod quaedam occulta uis per uestram ignorantiam oppugnat.* ad Scap. 5 fin. *quisque enim tantam tolerantiam spectans, ut aliquo scrupulo percussus; et inquirere accenditur, quid sit in causa, et ubi cognouerit ueritatem, et ipse statim sequitur.* Iuu. 14 105 *sed pater in causa.* Cic. Liu. Quintil. Plin. hist. nat. and Plin. ep. add Liu. XXXIV 56 §§ 9. 11. XL 26 § 5. Quintil. Decl. 12 cap. 24. Plin. ep. VI 1 § 2. 10 § 3. VII 5 § 1. ad Trai. 39 (48) § 1. 21 (32) fin. Arnob. I 3 p. 5 l. 29. [See Thes. A. S.]

p. 116 l. 15 ad nat. I 9 p. 73 l. 6 Wiss. *si Tiberis redundauerit, si Nilus non redundauit, si caelum stetit, si terra mouit, ...tiua uastauit, si famis afflixit, statim omnium uox Christi....* Aug. De Ciu. Dei II 3 *memento me ista commemorantem adhuc contra imperitos agere, ex quorum imperitia illud quoque ortum est uulgare prouerbium: pluuia defit, causa Christiani sunt.* III 17. 18. Tac. Ann. I 76 § 1 sq. on the rising of the Tiber the Sibylline books consulted. Hist. I 86 another inundation. Hor. carm. I 2 13 *uidimus flauum Tiberim retortis* cet. History of these floods, Friedländer I⁵ c. 1 fin. pp. 27—29. Iuu. 15 123 *inuidiam facerent nolenti surgere Nilo.* Io. Bapt. Scortia S. I. Libri II De natura et incremento Nili.

NILVS Sozomen h. e. VII 20. Cf. Rufin. h. e. IX 7 f. Jortin Christian Religion 82–3; so by witchcraft Luc. VI 474 *Nilum non extulit aestas.* Symmachus in Ambr. epist. 18 § 19.

p. 116 l. 16 STETIT Same words in ad nat. I 9 pr. quoted on l. 15. Arnob. I 45 *stabant profluuia sanguinis* (Woodh.). Prayers for rain, Cypr. Ad Demetrian. 7. 8.

TERRA MOVIT Euseb. h. e. IX 7. IV 13 § 2 *σεισμῶν.* Earthquake A.D. 191. Hdn. I 14. *mouit* intrans.: ad nat. I 9 pr. Sueton. Cl. 22. Gell. II 28 lemma and § 2. IV 6 § 1 (also §§ 1. 2 *hastas Martias mouisse.* ib. lemma).

LVES Porphyr. later (Theodoret Graec. Affect. Curat. xii fin. IV 1040) *νυνὶ δέ, φησί, θαυμάζουσιν εἰ τοσούτων ἐτῶν κατείληφε νόσος τὴν πόλιν, Ἀσκληπιοῦ μὲν ἐπιδημίας καὶ τῶν ἄλλων θεῶν οὐκέτι οὔσης. Ἰησοῦ γὰρ τιμωμένου οὐδὲ μιᾶς δημοσίας τις θεῶν ὠφελείας ᾔσθετο.* Popular outcries in the circus: *usque quo genus tertium?* Scorp. 10 p. 168 l. 15 Wiss. De Pudic. 22 p. 271 l. 25 Wiss. *puta in stipite iam leoni concesso.* De Spectac. 27 pr.

p. 116 l. 17 AD LEONEM c. 50 p. 144 l. 29. De Exhort. Cast. 12 p. m. *ne non sint qui acclament, 'Christianis leonem.'* De Carn. Resur. 22 p. 56 l. 12 Kr. De Pat. 15 (?) 5 (?). Ad Scap. 3 fin. De Spectac. 21. 27 pr. quoted on p. 116 l. 12. Arnob. I 26 p. 17 l. 8. Polycarpi mart. 12. Rufin. Hist. Eccl. VIII 7. Kaye 119. 111. Prudent. Cathemer. 157 (?). [3, 162? A. S.] Vit. Cypr. 7 *cum et suffragiis saepe repetitis ad leonem postularetur.* Cypr. ep. 59 § 6 *totiens ad leonem petitus,...his ipsis etiam diebus, quibus has ad te litteras feci ob sacrificia quae edicto proposito celebrare populus iubebatur clamore popularium ad leonem denuo postulatus in circo.* Lamprid. Comm. 18 § 15 *te salue delatores ad leonem.* Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IV 15 § 27 *ταῦτα λέγοντες ἐπεβόων καὶ ἠρώτων τὸν ἀσιάρχην Φίλιππον, ἵνα ἐπαφῇ τῷ Πολυκάρπῳ λέοντα· ὁ δὲ ἔφη μὴ εἶναι ἐξὸν αὐτῷ, ἐπειδὴ πεπληρώκει τὰ κυνηγέσια.* Renan Les Evangiles 487. Hadrian ad calc. Iustin. Apol. I p. 164 n. 4 Otto. Shouts of spectators at games in Hist. Aug. Scr. cf. Ferrar De Vett. Acclam. et Plausu VII c. 18. Tatian 22 p. 161[a] called the pantomime *καταδικαζομένων ἀφορμήν.* Euseb. Hist. Eccl. V 1 § 47 (at Lugudunum) *ὅσοι μὲν οὖν ἐδόκουν πολιτείαν Ῥωμαίων ἐσχηκέναι, τούτων ἀπέτεμνε τὰς κεφαλάς, τοὺς δὲ λοιποὺς ἔπεμπεν εἰς θηρία.* VIII 7 § 1 leopards, bears, boars, bulls. § 2 turning on the heathen.

cf. §§ 3 4 5, a wild bull. Cf. Rufinus h. e. IX 6 pr. Spencer on Orig. Contr. Cels. III c. 30 p. 129 l. 9. omm. Comm. on Matt. 39 (IV 270 L., on Matt. 24 9). Aug. Contr. Faust. XXII 79 fin.

TANTOS c. 1. c. 50 p. m.

ORO cet. Arnob. I 3 '*sed pestilentias,*' *inquiunt,* '*et siccitates, bella, frugum inopiam, locustas, mures et grandines, resque alias noxias, quibus negotia incursantur humana, di nobis important iniuriis uestris atque offensionibus exasperati.*' *si in rebus perspicuis et nullam desiderantibus defensionem non stoliditatis esset diutius immorari, ostenderem profecto replicatis prioribus saeculis mala ista quae dicitis non esse incognita, non repentina...*'*penuria,*' *inquit,* '*frugum et angustiae frumentariae artius nos habent.*' *antiqua enim et uetustissima saecula necessitatis istius aliquando fuerunt expertia?...*'*difficiles pluuiae sata faciunt emori et sterilitatem indicunt terris.*' *immunis enim antiquitas malis ab his fuit? cum etiam flumina cognouerimus ingentia limis inaruisse siccatis.* '*pestilentiae contagia urunt genus humanum.*' *annalium scriptores percurrite linguarum diuersitatibus scripta, uniuersas discetis gentes saepenumero desolatas et uiduatas suis esse cultoribus...*'*terrarum ualidissimis motibus tremefactae nutant usque ad periculum ciuitates.*' *quid? hiatibus maximis interceptas urbes cum gentibus superiora tempora non uiderunt?...* c. 4 *quando est humanum genus aquarum diluuiis interemptum? non ante nos? quando mundus incensus in fauillas et cineres dissolutus est? non ante nos? quando urbes amplissimae marinis coopertae sunt fluctibus? non ante nos?* III 40 *feras.* Jeremiah 44 15—19 (neglect of the queen of heaven).

ORA VOS cf. *oro te* Cic. Liu. Sen. Tert. De Exhort. Cast. 8 pr. Ad Vxor. I 3 a. m. 4 f. De Cor. Milit. 14 m. ad nat. I 7 p. 68 l. 25 Wiss. II 4 p. 102 l. 2 Wiss.

p. 116 l. 18 TIBERIVM c. 5 n. c. 21 pr. p. 66 l. 15 n. Adu. Marc. I 15 p. 309 l. 14 Kr. Adu. Iud. 8.

p. 116 l. 19 ORBEM ET VRBES earliest ex. Cic. Catil. I 9 *urbis atque adeo orbis.*

HIERAN cet. ad nat. I 9 p. 73 l. 15 Wiss. *ubi tunc Christiani, cum res Romana tot historias laborum suorum subministrauit? ubi tunc Christiani, cum Hierennape* [l. *Hiera, Napea* or

Anaphe] *et Delphos* [l. *Delos*] *et Rhodos et Cea insulae multis cum milibus hominum pessum ierunt.* Sibyll. IV 92 cf. Δῆλος ἄδηλος. Ammian. XVII 7 § 13 *fiunt autem terrarum motus modis quattuor: aut enim brasmatiae sunt, qui humum more aestus imitus suscitantes, sursum propellunt inmanissimas moles, ut in Asia Delos emersit, et Hiera et Anaphe et Rhodus, Ofiusa et Pelagia prioribus saeculis dictitata...aut chasmatiae qui grandiore motu patefactis subito uoratrinis, terrarum partes absorbent, ut in Atlantico mari, Europaeo orbe spatiosior insula.* Euseb. Chron. a. d. 7 *in insula Co terrae motu plurima conciderunt.* Plin. Hist. Nat. II c. 8 § (?). 79 § 191. 88 § 203 sq. 89 § 204. On earthquakes De Pallio 2 *cum inter insulas nulla iam Delos.*

p. 116 l. 20 DELON Herodot. VI 98 §§ 1—2. Thucyd. II 8 § 3. Seneca Nat. Quaest. VI 26 3. Dittenberger Sylloge Inscr. Gr. I² 155. Bouché-Leclercq Divination II 22 1. On Rhodes Oros. IV 13 § 13.

p. 116 l. 21 PLATO Amm. XVII 7 § 13. ad nat. I 9 p. 73 l. 19 Wiss. *uel quam Plato memorat maiorem Asia aut Africa in Atlantico mari mersam...cum terrae motu mare Corinthium ereptum est? cum totum orbem cataclysmus abolevit?* Plin. Hist. Nat. II 90 § 205 *in totum (mare) abstulit terras, primum omnium ubi Atlanticum mare est, si Platoni credimus, inmenso spatio.* Arnob. I 5 pr *ut ante milia annorum decem ab insula quae perhibetur Atlantica Neptuni, sicut Plato demonstrat, magna erumperet uis hominum et innumeras funditus deleret atque exstingueret nationes, nos fuimus causa?* De Pallio 2 a. m. *aeon in Atlantico Libyam aut Asiam adaequans quaeritur nunc.* [Aristot.] Mirab. Audition. § 103 etc. Diodor. Sicul. XVIII 5 § 2 sq. (?).

MAIOREM ASIAE Dräger I 494 (Apul. 5 exx.). Amm. XVI 12 § (?). Passio Sanctorum IV coronatorum p. 333 n. 2. Rönsch 435. Archiv f. lat. Lex. VII 117—129. Clem. Recogn. I 60. 66 f. II 10. 53. 54 bis. 55. 56. 57 pr. III 58. 63. IV 15. V 19. Rufin. Hist. Mon. 9. in Cant. II p. 390 L. περὶ ἀρχῶν I 1 7. Dan. 13 4 uulg. Corippus Iust. IV 30. Kopp on Capella § 6 fin. p. 25. Hier. ep. 108 3. in Matt. 2. 11 11. Sidon. carm. 11 52 *magnorum maior auorum* (lexx. under *prior*).

[Stolz-Schmalz Lat. Gramm.[4] p. 385, Souter Study of Ambrosiaster p. 117. A. S.]

p. 116 l. 22 CORINTHIVM Plin. Hist. Nat. II 92 § 206 *Helicen et Buram sinus Corinthius (abstulit), quarum in alto uestigia apparent.* Oros. III 3 § 1.

p. 116 l. 23 VIS VNDARVM cet. De Pallio 2 a. m. *Italiae quondam latus Hadria Tyrrhenoque quassantibus medio tenus interceptum reliquias Siciliam facit, cum tota illa plaga discidii contentiosos aequorum coitus angustiis retorquens, nouum uitium maris induit, non exspuentis naufragia sed deuorantis.* La Cerda on Aen. III 414–9 (417–9 = *uenit medio ui pontus et undis Hesperium Siculo latus abscidit, aruaque et urbes litore diductas angusto interluit aestu*) ann. in Niceph. Constant. [which?] Lasaulx Studien p. 31 n. 109. 108. Strabo I 3 10 p. 82 Kr. VI 1 6 p. 410 Kr. Valer. Flac. I 589 *cum flens Siculos Oenotria fines | perderet et mediis intrarent montibus undae.*

ABSCISSAM Strabo (cited above). Mela II 7 § 115. Sall. Hist. Fr. IV 26* (Maurenb. p. 168). The word Hor. Carm. I 3 21. Stat. Silu. III 2 61. Valer. Flac. II 615. Flor. II 8 § 9.

p. 116 l. 24 INIVRIA c. 38 f. p. 110 l. 20. c. 44 pr. ad nat. I 9 p. 73 l. 22 Wiss. *ubi tunc, non dicam contemptores deorum Christiani, sed ipsi dei uestri, quos clade illa posteriores loca, oppida approbant, in quibus nati morati sepulti sunt, etiam quae condiderunt? non alias enim superfuissent ad hodiernum nisi postuma cladis illius.*

p. 116 l. 25 NON DICAM c. 4 pr. = ad nat. I 9 p. 73 l. 23 Wiss. Apol. c. 43 f. bis.

p. 116 l. 26 DEORVM CONTEMPTORES *contemptor diuom Mezentius* Verg. Aen. VII 648. *superum* Ou. ad nat. I 9 ter. 10 p. 75 l. 6 Wiss. (I 9 cited above). Arnob. I 30.

p. 116 l. 27 CATACLYSMVS ad nat. I 9 p. 73 l. 22 Wiss. II 12 p. 120 l. 15 Wiss. De Cult. Fem. I 3 ter. Ad Scap. 3 pr. Adu. Marc. IV 3 p. 428 l. 14 Kr. Adu. Iud. 8 a. m. Cypr. append. 56 15 18 (Ad Nouatian. c. 4 fin. 5 pr.). Lact. Diu. Instt. II 10 §§ 10 11. id. De Ira 23 § 4. First in Varro.

PLATO Legg. p. 677. Tert. De Pallio 2 a. m. *cupientes Platoni probare etiam ardua fluitasse.*

p. 116 l. 28 CAMPESTRE in Tac. and Plin. Hist. Nat. plur. *-ia.*

p. 116 l. 29 MORTVI c. 12 pr. p. 42 l. 33 n. Cf. c. 10. c. 11 pr. Arnob. I 37. IV 29 Hildebr.

p. 116 l. 30 ALIAS = *aliter* Lewis and Short n. 5. De Idolol. 1 p. 31 l. 10 Wiss. [See Thes. *alias*. III. A. S.]

IN HODIERNVM De Idolol. 3 pr. CIL VIII 10570. *ad hod.* ad nat. I 9 p. 73 l. 26 Wiss. Scorp. 7 f. p. 160 l. 5 Wiss.

p. 116 ll. 30—1 c. 10 fin. *etiam Iouem ostendemus tam hominem quam ex homine et deinceps totum generis examen tam mortale quam seminis sui par.*

p. 116 l. 31 POSTVMAE c. gen. ad nat. I 9 (a parallel ch.) p. 73 l. 26 Wiss. *non alias enim superfuissent ad hodiernum, nisi postuma cladis illius.*

p. 116 l. 32 EXAMEN hence Lact. IV 10 § 14 *postea uero cum in deserta quadam parte Syriae consedissent, amiserunt uetus nomen Hebraei: et quoniam princeps examinis eorum Iudas erat, Iudaei sunt appellati.* supr. c. 10 fin. cf. Hor. ep. I 19 23 *dux regit examen.*

SECTAE c. 21 pr. n. (p. 66 l. 14). ad nat. I 10 p. 76 l. 9 Wiss. *habetis igitur in maioribus uestris, etsi non nomen, attamen sectam Christianam, quae deos neglegit.* Minuc. 40 § 2. Prudent Contr. Symm. II 93. 96. Apoth. praef. II 1. Lact. De Opif. 1

p. 116 l. 34 IGNEVS IMBER Paulin. Nol. c. 23 221. Rufin. Hist. Eccl. I 1 p. 13 *populatione ignei imbris.*

SIQVA cet. Pseudo-Cypr. De Sodoma 134—8 *semiperempta etiam siqua illic iugera laetas | autumni conantur opes, facile optima sese | promittunt oculis pira persica et omnia mela, | donec carpantur: nam protinus indice tacta | soluitur in cinerem uacui fallacia pomi.* Tac. Hist. V 7 *haud procul inde campi quos ferunt olim uberes magnisque urbibus habitatos fulminum iactu arsisse, et manere uestigia terramque ipsam, specie torridam, uim frugiferam perdidisse. nam cuncta sponte edita aut manu sata, siue herba tenus aut flore, seu solitam in speciem adoleuere, atra et inania uelut in cinerem uanescunt.* Ioseph. De Bell. Iud. IV 8 § 4 ἥτις ἐστὶ πικρὰ μὲν...καὶ ἄγονος...γειτνιᾷ δὲ ἡ Σοδομῖτις αὐτῇ, πάλαι μὲν εὐδαίμων γῆ καρπῶν τε ἕνεκα καὶ τῆς κατὰ πόλεις περιουσίας, νῦν δὲ κεκαυμένη πᾶσα· φασὶ δὲ ὡς δι' ἀσέβειαν οἰκητόρων κεραυνοῖς κατεφλέγη· ἔστι γοῦν ἔτι λείψανα τοῦ θείου πυρός, καὶ πέντε μὲν πόλεων ἰδεῖν σκιάς,

ἔτι δὲ κἂν τοῖς καρποῖς σποδιὰν ἀναγεννωμένην, οἵ χρόαν μὲν ἔχουσι τοῖς ἐδωδίμοις ὁμοίαν δρεψαμένων δὲ χερσὶν εἰς καπνὸν ἀναλύονται καὶ τέφραν. Prudent. Hamartigen. 725 sq. Tert. De Pallio 2 m. *aspice ad Palaestinam, qua Iordanis amnis finium arbiter: uastitas ingens et orba regio et frustra ager et urbes retro et populi frequentes...dehinc ut deus censor est, impietas ignium meruit imbres: hactenus Sodoma, et nulla Gomorra, et cinis omnia, et propinquitas maris iusta cum solo mortem bibit.* Aug. De Ciu. Dei XXI 8 p. m. (II² 507 1 D.). Solin. 48.

p. 118 l. 1 OCVLIS TENVS Adu. Marc. I 24 p. 323 l. 22 Kr. *anima tenus.* (Oehler ad loc. pp. 75—6.)

p. 118 l. 2 CINERESCVNT Fulgent. Mytholog. Cael. Aurelian [see Thes. and add now Laber. (?) in inscr., Not. Scavi, 1912, p. 87. A. S.].

p. 118 l. 3 VVLSINIOS De Pallio 2 m. *ex huiuscemodi nubilo et Tuscia Vulsinios [pristinos] deusta, quo magis de montibus suis Campania speret, erepta Pompeios.* Gataker on Antonin. IV 48 'think...how many cities are entirely dead, so to speak, Helice and Pompeii and Herclanum and others innumerable!'

p. 118 l. 4 cf. Ambr. ep. 18, 4 sq. Aug. C. D. II 8. III 17. 31.

p. 118 l. 6 MODIO Otto Sprichwörter 225. Funck in Archiv f. lat. Lex. VIII 406. Iuu. 3 220 *hic modium argenti.* 10 165—6 n. Aug. De Ciu. Dei III 19. Oros. IV 16 § 5. Hor. Sat. I 1 95 *diues, ut metiretur nummos.* Comm. in hon. Momms. 340. Hemst. on Luc. Dial. Mort. 12 2.

p. 118 l. 7 SENONES Iuu. 8 234 n. Oros. II 19 § 5. Aug. De Ciu. Dei II 22 asks were the gods asleep.

p. 118 l. 8 BENE QVOD c. 7 p. 26 l. 30 n. c. 24 p. 86 l. 13. Apul. Metam. III 25. VI 8 f. X 14 fin. Paulin. Nol. Carm. 24 15. ep. 32 2.

p. 118 ll. 8—9 c. 25 f. p. 90 l. 8 *bella et uictoriae captis et euersis plurimum urbibus constant. id negotium sine deorum iniuria non est. eaedem strages moenium et templorum, pares caedes ciuium et sacerdotum.*

p. 118 l. 10 IPSIS EVENIT c. 25 p. 90 l. 10 cf. 86 l. 30 Mart. (where ?). Lightning Arnob. III 23 Vulcan.

HVMANA GENS = *genus* so Cic. De Finib. v § 65. Hor. Carm. I 3 26.

p. 118 l. 11 INOFFICIOSA c. gen. as *reus* and *ingratus* below.

p. 118 l. 12 EX PARTE De Fug. in Persec. 3 pr. Cic. Liu.

p. 118 l. 13 DEHINC c. 41 n.

INNOCENTIAE MAGISTRVM c. 45 pr. *innocentiam a deo edocti et perfecte eam nouimus ut a perfecto magistro reuelatam et fideliter custodimus, ut ab incontemptibili dispectore mandatam.*

p. 118 l. 14 NOCENTIAE Adu. Marc. II 13 p. 353 l. 14 Kr. *quomodo innocentiae mercedem secter, si non et nocentiae spectem?* (no other ex. cited), no other known to me.

EXACTOREM De Spectac. 2 p. 4 l. 4 Wiss. *deus exactor innocentiae.* Adu. Marc. II 13 p. 353 l. 7 Kr. *quis boni auctor, nisi qui et exactor?* La Cerda cites Greg. Nyss. Or. Funebr. Placillae (Migne P. G. XLVI 888^C) τὸν διηνεκῆ φορολόγον, τὴν γαστέρα λέγω.

p. 118 l. 15 SEQVEBATVR infr. c. 41 p. 120 l. 19 n. ad nat. I 7 p. 68 l. 24 Wiss. 15 pr.

p. 118 l. 19 c. 5 pr. *Tiberius ergo, cuius tempore nomen Christianum in saeculum introiuit.*

p. 118 l. 22 INGRATA c. gen. Adu. Marc. II 24 p. 24 l. 11 Kr. *beneficii.* III 24 p. 422 l. 1 Kr. *promissionis* [cf. on p. 118 l. 11. A. S.].

ET TAMEN cet. Arnob. I 5 pr. *quamquam ista quae dicitis bella religionis nostrae ob inuidiam commoueri, non sit difficile comprobare post auditum Christum in mundo non tantum non aucta, uerum etiam maiore de parte furiarum compressionibus imminuta.* Aug. C. D. III 20, of Saguntum. The world's decay ascribed to the Christians. Lasaulx 34 n. 120.

p. 118 l. 24 DEPRECATORES Caes. Cic. Liu. Tac. Cypr. ep. 11 (al. 8) § 5 p. 499, l. 18 H. [also ep. 55 § 18 p. 637 l. 7 H. See also Thes. A. S.].

p. 118 l. 25 Ashton quotes Sen. Quaest. Nat. III 27 § 1 *elisa aestate hiems pertinax inmensam uim aquarum ruptis nubibus eiciat.* Cf. Ambr. ep. 18 17.

p. 118 l. 27 LVPANARIBVS Plaut. Catull. Quintil. Iuu. add Sen. Contr. I 2 §§ 1—4. 30 §§ 13 14. Valer. Maxim. IX 1 § 8. Sen. Nat. Quaest. I 16 6. Quintil. v 10 § 39. VII 3 §§ 9 10.

Suet. Tiber. 58. Calig. 41. Apul. Metam. VII 9. 10. X 21. Rufin. Hist. Eccl. VIII 12 p. 487 f.

p. 118 l. 28 etc. c. 24 med. *colat alius deum, alius Iouem, alius ad caelum supplices manus tendat, alius ad aram Fidei, alius, si hoc putatis, nubes numeret orans, alius lacunaria.* Marquardt III^2 262 n. 3.

AQVILICIA only h. l. and Festus p. 2 M. [see Thes. and Lindsay, who spell *aquaelicium.* A.S.]: at Carthage c. 23 p. 80 l. 8 *ista ipsa Virgo Caelestis pluuiarum pollicitatrix.* Hor. Carm. Saec. 31 32 *nutriant fetus et aquae salubres | et Iouis aurae.* epist. II 1 132—5 *castis cum pueris ignara puella mariti | disceret unde preces, uatem ni Musa dedisset? | poscit opem chorus et praesentia numina sentit; | caelestes implorat aquas docta prece blandus.* Frazer on Paus. I 32 2 (II 426).

NVDIPEDALIA De Ieiun. 16 p. 295 l. 24 Wiss. cited by Oehler. Hier. Suet. Aug. 100 f. Cas. *primores discincti pedibusque nudis.* Petron. 44 *nemo enim caelum caelum putat, nemo ieiunium seruat, nemo Iouem pili facit, sed omnes opertis oculis bona sua computant. antea stolatae ibant nudis pedibus in cliuum, passis capillis, mentibus puris, et Iouem aquam exorabant. itaque statim urceatim plouebat: aut tunc aut numquam: et omnes redibant udi tamquam mures.* Iuu. 6 159—160 *obseruant ubi festa mero pede sabbata reges et uetus indulget senibus clementia porcis.* 524—6 *inde superbi totum regis agrum nuda ac tremebunda cruentis erepet genibus.* Ioseph. Bell. Iud. II 15 § 1 Βερενίκη γυμνόπους τε πρὸ τοῦ βήματος ἱκέτευσε τὸν Φλῶρον. Iamblich. Vit. Pythagor. 51. 85 θύειν χρὴ ἀνυπόδετον καὶ πρὸς τὰ ἱερὰ προσιέναι. inter symbola Pythag. *nudis pedibus rem sacram facito et adorato.* Zöckler Gesch. d. Askese 92 sq. Clem. Alex. Strom. V 8 § 56. Knobel cet. on Exod. 3 5 (Iustin. Apol. I 62 p. 95^a attributes the heathen practice to an imitation of Moses). Ou. Metam. VII 182 of Medea, *egreditur tectis uestes induta recinctas, nuda pedem, nudis umeris infusa capillos.* Fasti VI 397 *huc pede matronam uidi descendere nudo.* Flor. I 13 (= I 7) § 12 *uirgines simul ex sacerdotio Vestae nudo pede fugientia sacra comitantur.* Cobet Collectan. 330. Preller Röm. Mythol. 173. 313. Lasaulx Studien 295 78.

p. 118 ll. 30—1 Cf. supr. 5 ad fin. ad Scap. 4.

p. 118 l. 31 IEIVNIIS ARIDI De Ieiun. 1 p. 275 l. 1 Wiss. *arguunt nos, quod ieiunia propria custodiamus, quod stationes plerumque in uesperam producamus, quod etiam xerophagias obseruemus, siccantes cibum ab omni carne et omni iurulentia et uuidioribus quibusque pomis, nec quid uinositatis uel edamus uel potemus; lauacri quoque abstinentiam, congruentem arido uictui.* 13 p. 291 l. 27 Wiss. *bene autem, quod et episcopi uniuersae plebi mandare ieiunia adsolent, non dico de industria stipium conferendarum, ut uestrae capturae est, sed interdum et ex aliqua sollicitudinis ecclesiasticae causa. itaque si et ex hominis edicto et in unum omnes* ταπεινοφρόνησιν *agitatis, quomodo in nobis ipsam quoque unitatem ieiunationum et xerophagiarum et stationum denotatis?* 15 p. 294 l. 7 Wiss. *esca nos deo non commendat* [= 1 Cor. 8. 8. A.S.] *non ut de arida dictum putes, sed potius de uncta et accurata.* ad Scap. 4 (p. 549, l. 1) *quando non geniculationibus et ieiunationibus nostris etiam siccitates sunt depulsae?* Cypr. ep. 11 pr. § 1 *admoneo...relligiosam sollicitudinem uestram ut ad placandum atque exorandum deum non uoce sola sed et ieiuniis et lacrimis et omni genere deprecationis ingemescamus.* 60 § 5 *hortamur...ut, quoniam...admonemur appropinquare iam certaminis et agonis nostri diem, ieiuniis uigiliis orationibus insistere cum omni plebe non desinamus.* Bailey Rituale Anglo-Cath. 75—6 (tempest), 89 (fruits of the earth), 94 (for rain), 96—7 (prayer in dearth).

EXPRESSI ? shrunk, shrivelled, pinched. Greg. Naz. Or. 1 in Iulian. 7 (Migne P. G. XXXV 593[a]) ὁρᾷς τοὺς ἀβίους τούτους καὶ ἀνεστίους καὶ ἀσάρκους μικροῦ καὶ ἀναίμονας, καὶ θεῷ κατὰ τοῦτο πλησιάζοντας;

p. 118 l. 32 IN SACCO ET CINERE De Paenitent. 11 pr. *deuersari in asperitudine sacci.* ib. 9 *de ipso quoque habitu atque uictu mandat sacco et cineri incubare, corpus sordibus obscurare, animum maeroribus deicere.* De Patient. 13 p. 20 l. 9 Kr. *in primis adflictatio carnis,...cum sordes cum angustia uictus domino libat, contenta simplici pabulo puroque aquae potu, cum ieiunia coniungit, cum cineri et sacco inolescit.* De Ieiun. 16 p. 295 l. 26 Wiss. *saccis uelati et cinere conspersi idolis suis inediam* (*inuidiam* cod.) *supplicem obiciunt.* Cedren. 'p. 300' of the emperor ἐν σάκκῳ καὶ σποδῷ. Ambr. [rather Niceta. A. S.]

De Lapsu Virg. 8 § 35 *totum corpus incuria et ieiuniis maceretur, cinere adspersum et opertum cilicio perhorrescat. quia male sibi de pulchritudine placuit.* Maxim. Taurin. Hom. de Litaniis [= Migne, P. L. LVII 459[b]. A.S.]. Hier. epist. 77 § 4 (I p. 455[d]). Ruric. ep. 21 *ut deponant saeculi byrrum et sumant ecclesiae uestimentum, quod est cilicium, contritionis indicium.* Greg. Naz. Or. 1 [= 2 § 59, Migne, P. G. XXXV 469[ab]. R.W.] ἐν σποδῷ καὶ σάκκοις καὶ λίαν ταπεινῶς κατὰ γῆς ἐρριμμένους. Concil. Mogunt. can. 4. Herald. Digressionum l. II c. 4 (ad calc. Apol. 275 sq.). Bingham XVIII 2 § 2. Sidon. ep. V 14 Mamercus established rogations: *erant quidem prius...oscitabundae supplicationes,...maxime aut imbres, aut serenitatem deprecaturae.* Cyprian. Ad Demetrian. 20 p. 365 l. 23 H. *et tamen pro arcendis hostibus et imbribus impetrandis et uel auferendis uel temperandis aduersis rogamus semper et preces fundimus.* Euseb. Hist. Eccl. V c. 28 § 12 ἐνδυσάμενον σάκκον καὶ σποδὸν καταπασάμενον.

INVIDIA De Ieiun. 16 p. 295 l. 25 Wiss. *apud quasdam uero colonias praeterea annuo ritu* (then as cited on l. 32) cf. Oehler (from La Cerda). De Orat. 5 p. 184 l. 12 Wiss. *clamant ad dominum inuidia animae martyrum sub altari.* De Fug. in Persec. 10 f. *si perire me uolet, ipse me perdat, dum me ego seruo illi. malo inuidiam ei facere per uoluntatem ipsius pereundo, quam bilem per meam euadendo.* Stat. Silu. V 5 77—78 *nonne horridus ipsos inuidia superos iniustaque Tartara pulsem?* Pseudo-Cypr. Sodom. 21—2 *pulsabant caelum inuidia, conubia mixta incestu parili.* Iuu. 15 123 n. Heraldus cites δυσωπῆσαι θεόν from Ioseph. *A. J.* XII 4 (cf. Greg. Naz.). *inuidiam facere*: Oehler on Tert. De Orat. 5 (cited above). Adu. Marc. II 9 fin. Herald. on Arnob. IV p. 180. [Mayor's own note on Plin. epist. III 4 § 7. A. S.]

p. 120 l. 1 EXTORSERIMVS wrung.

CAP. XLI

p. 120 l. 3 VOS Cyprian. Ad Demetrian. 5 *non enim, sicut tua falsa querimonia et inperitia ueritatis ignara iactat et clamitat, ista accidunt, quod di uestri a nobis non colantur, sed*

quod a uobis non colatur deus...utique quando ea fiunt quae iram dei indignantis ostendunt non propter nos fiunt a quibus deus colitur, sed delictis et meritis uestris inrogantur, a quibus deus omnino nec quaeritur nec timetur. Arnob. I 2 *efficietur enim profecto rationum consequentium copulatu, ut non impii nos magis sed illi ipsi reperiantur criminis istius rei, qui se numinum profitentur esse cultores atque inueteratis religionibus deditos.* Lact. V 8 § 5 *discite igitur (si quid uobis reliquae mentis est) homines ideo malos et iniustos esse, quia di coluntur, et ideo mala omnia rebus humanis cotidie ingrauescere, quia deus huius mundi effector et gubernator relictus est, quia susceptae sunt contra quam fas est, impiae religiones, postremo quia ne coli quidem uel a paucis deum sinitis.* § 11 *uniuersa igitur mala, quibus humanum genus se ipsa conficit, iniustus atque impius deorum cultus induxit; nec enim poterant retinere pietatem qui communem omnium patrem deum tamquam prodigi ac rebelles liberi abnegassent.* cf. § 8. Maximin in Euseb. Hist. Eccl. IX 7 §§ 8—11 ascribes misfortunes to the spread, prosperity to the downfall of Christianity. Euseb. c. 8 confutes him. Aug. De Ciu. Dei V 22. Zeno Veronensis Sermo de Iob (ed. Ballerini, Veron. 1739, p. 190) *scidit uestimenta sua, non ut deo inuidiam faceret* cet.

p. 120 l. 4 INLICES De Paenit. 9 *conuersationem misericordiae inlicem.* Paulin. Nol. ep. 40 9. 41 2. carm. 24 719. 25 119. Plaut. Apul. Prudent.

p. 120 l. 5 Cf. 22 fin. p. 78 *ut numina lapides crederentur ut deus uerus non quaereretur.*

p. 120 l. 7 Arnob. II 76. Aug. De Ciu. Dei I 29.

p. 120 ll. 8—10 Holden on Minuc. 12 § 2. Otto on Iustin. Apol. II 5 pr. Cels. in Orig. VIII 69. Arnob. II 76 pr. Orelli. Euseb. Hist. Eccl. V 2 § 5. D. E. X 8. Clem. Alex. Strom. IV cc. 11. 12 pp. 599. 600 P. Lact. V 22. Gaudent. Praef. ad Beneu. pp. 46. 47.

p. 120 l. 9 REPERCVTERE c. 15 fin. De Idolol. 5 p. 34 l. 16 Wiss. De Pudic. 7 p. 231 l. 5 Wiss. with Oehler's n. (Adu. Hermog. 12 p. 139 l. 20 Kr. De Anim. 23 fin. in Hau.) Adu. Marc. I 9 pr. Plin. h. n. Quintil.

p. 120 l. 11 RETORQVEBITIS (Apul. Metam. VII 20. Iustin.

dig.) ad nat. I 14 p. 84 l. 21 Wiss. De Cor. Milit. 2 fin. *maledictum* De Idolol. 21 p. 55 l. 10 Wiss. with *cur* ad nat. I 5 p. 65 l. 26 f. Wiss. with inf. ib. I 10 p. 79 l. 21 Wiss.

p. 120 l. 12 NON PRAECIPITAT Aug. (where?) God is patient, because eternal. Lact. De Ira Dei 20. Aug. De Ciu. Dei I 8. Lucan II 106. V 795. VII 52, 353 in Havercamp. cf. Apul. Metam. IX 1 pr. *consilium.*

DISCRETIONEM cf. Aug. De Ciu. Dei XVIII 54.

p. 120 l. 15 Arnob. I 22. III 24.

p. 120 l. 19 SEQVITVR VT c. 40 p. 118 l. 15 [n. A.S.].

SI FORTE c. 38 fin. c. 43 pr.

p. 120 l. 21 cf. Arnob. II 76. Kaye 133 sq.

p. 120 l. 22 EXCEDERE De Spectac. 28 fin. *non possumus uiuere sine uoluptate, qui mori cum uoluptate debemus. nam quod est aliud uotum nostrum, quam quod et apostoli, exire de saeculo et recipi apud dominum? hic uoluptas, ubi et uotum.* De Orat. 5 p. 184 l. 5 Wiss. *si ad dei uoluntatem et ad nostram suspensionem pertinet regni dominici repraesentatio, quomodo quidam pertractum quendam in saeculo postulant, cum regnum dei, quod ut adueniat oramus, ad consummationem saeculi tendat? optamus maturius regnare et non diutius seruire.* De Patient. 9 fin. *cupio, inquit apostolus, recipi iam et esse cum domino* [= Phil. 1. 23. A. S.]. *quanto melius ostendit uotum? Christianorum ergo uotum, si alios consecutos impatienter dolemus, ipsi consequi nolumus.* De Idolol. 12 p. 43 l. 25 Wiss. 24 p. 57 l. 21 Wiss.

DEHINC so c. 40 p. 118 l. 13 *primo...dehinc.* So in Sall. Verg. Sen. Suet.

p. 120 l. 24 LAETAMVR cet. supr. c. 31 fin. *cum enim concutitur imperium,...utique et nos...in aliquo loco casus inuenimur.* c. 20 *quicquid agitur, praenuntiabatur* cet. The same answer (fulfilment of prophecy) in Clem. Alex. Strom. IV 11 §§ 80—82. Woodham cites Cypr. De Mortal. 2 *fiunt ecce quae dicta sunt et quando fiunt quae ante praedicta sunt sequentur et quaecumque promissa sunt* cet. Ad Demetrian. 4. cf. the whole tract.

Cap. XLII

p. 120 ll. 31 ff. cf. supra c. 37 p. 108. ll. 28—29 n. Neander (where ?). Blunt First Three Centuries 149 priests and lawyers. 150 soldiers. 150 teachers. 150–1 all who lived by the games (Apost. Const. VIII 32). 151–2 temples (architects, builders, artists). Blunt Right Use 257–8 (from Tert. De Idolol. 17 p. 50 l. 14 Wiss. magistrates) 291–2. Zeller Ztschr. f. wiss. Theol. 1891 356—367 interprets (correcting his Vorträge II 195) the Christians' *odium humani generis* (Tac. Ann. XV 44) *μισανθρωπία*, also nicht ein zu Verbrechen geneigter Menschenhass, sondern weltflüchtiger Menschenscheu. omn. Ep. Ad Diognet. 5 1 sq. cited on p. 122 l. 1. Minuc. 8 § 4 *latebrosa et lucifuga natio, in publico muta, in angulis garrula.* Iustin. Apol. I 11 12. Orig. Contr. Cels. VIII 73.

TITVLO c. 39 f. 44.

p. 120 l. 32 Kaye 122. Suet. Dom. 15 (Flauius Clemens) *contemptissimae inertiae.* Philostrat. Vit. Apollon. V 33 p. 216. De Cult. Fem. II 11 med. *ac si necessitas amicitiarum officiorumque gentilium uos uocat, cur non uestris armis indutae procedatis? tanto magis, quanto ad extraneas fidei? ut sit inter dei ancillas et diaboli discrimen, ut exemplo sitis illis.* Clem. Alex. Paedag. III § 78 f. p. 299 P. ἐξὸν δὲ ἀκροᾶσθαι μὲν σοφίας θεϊκῆς, ἀλλὰ καὶ πολιτεύσασθαι ἐξόν, ἀλλὰ καὶ τὰ ἐν κόσμῳ, κοσμίως κατὰ θεὸν ἀπάγειν οὐ κεκώλυται. *infructuosi* lit. Colum. trop. infra hoc cap. et 43. Sen. rhet. Tac. Plin. ep. Hier. Adu. Heluid. I (II 205). Paulin. Nol. ep. 10 2. 21 5 p. m. 34 1. 43 4 f. Philastr. Haer. 49. Rufin. Hist. Eccl. V 3 p. 259. Iren. IV 17 5: 36 4. [Aug. very often. A. S.] Migne LII 496^d. 497^ab. 703^b. 704^c. 710^c. 719^b. 750^c.

p. 120 l. 33 INSTRVCTVS c. 6 p. 22 l. 33. De Anim. 19 p. 330 l. 12 Wiss. (*anima*) *quam dicimus cum omni instructu suo nasci.* 32 p. 353 l. 27 Wiss. Exod. 12 37 ap. Aug. Qu. in Hept. II 47 pr. [= ἀποσκευή. A. S.]. Oros. II 14 § 18. IV 6 § 24. V 4 § 3. 6 § 3. 14 § 1. Symm. ep. V 11. 20 (19) § 2. Rönsch p. 315 (once in Cic.). Cassian. Inst. V 37 tit. *de traditis nobis ab abbate Archibio cum instructu suo cellis.* Apul. Metam. XI 30. Seru. Aen. V 402. Paulin. Nol. ep. 3. 3.

[= Paul. Nol. ap. Aug. epist. 24 § 3. A. S.] Cf. De Idolol. 13 p. 44 l. 12 Wiss. *de hoc quidem primo consistam, an cum ipsis quoque nationibus communicare in huiusmodi seruus dei debeat, siue habitu, siue uictu, uel quo alio genere laetitiae earum.*

p. 120 l. 34 No monks at this time. Kaye 356.

BRACHMANAE Philostr. Vit. Apollon. III c. 10 ff. [Other references in the index to Phillimore's translation, vol. II (Oxford 1912) p. 285. A. S.] Eus. c. Hierocl. § 17 p. 443. Sid. ep. VIII 3 p. 489 Savaro. Aug. De Ciu. Dei IV 16. Tert. Adu. Marc. I 13 p. 307 l. 15 Kr. Theodoret Graec. Affect. Curat. I § 25 p. 8 l. 2. V § 58 p. 79 l. 40. XII § 44 p. 172 l. 15. Apul. flor. 15 p. 56. Plin. VI 64. Prud. Hamart. 403. Diod. Sic. XVII 102 fin. Strabo XVII p. 703 etc. Porphyr. De Abst. IV c. 17. V. M. (1 ex.). [add Ps.-Ambrose De Moribus Brachmanorum (Migne P. L. XVII 1167—1184) and exx. in Thes. s.v. Bragmani. A.S.]

p. 122 l. 1 GYMNOSOPHISTAE De Idolol. 14 p. 46 l. 10 Wiss. *si non prohibet nos conuersari cum idololatris et adulteris et ceteris criminosis, dicens, Ceterum de mundo exiretis, non utique eas habenas conuersationis immittit, ut, quoniam necesse est et conuiuere nos et commisceri cum peccatoribus, idem et compeccare possimus. ubi est commercium uitae, quod apostolus concedit, ibi** peccare, quod nemo permittit. licet conuiuere cum ethnicis, commori non licet. conuiuamus cum omnibus, conlaetemur ex communione naturae, non superstitionis. pares anima sumus, non disciplina, compossessores mundi, non erroris.* Clem. Alex. Strom. I c. 15 § 71 fin. III 7 § 60 *οὔτε δὲ οἱ γυμνοσοφισταὶ οὔθ' οἱ λεγόμενοι σεμνοὶ γυναιξὶ χρῶνται* (*exsules vitae*). On the charge of unsociable seclusion Ep. ad Diogn. 5 pr. *Χριστιανοὶ γὰρ οὔτε γῇ οὔτε φωνῇ οὔτε ἔθεσι διακεκριμένοι τῶν λοιπῶν εἰσιν ἀνθρώπων. οὔτε γάρ που πόλεις ἰδίας κατοικοῦσιν οὔτε διαλέκτῳ τινὶ παρηλλαγμένῃ χρῶνται, οὔτε βίον παράσημον ἀσκοῦσιν...κατοικοῦντες δὲ πόλεις Ἑλληνίδας τε καὶ βαρβάρους, ὡς ἕκαστος ἐκληρώθη. καὶ τοῖς ἐγχωρίοις ἔθεσιν ἀκολουθοῦντες, ἔν τε ἐσθῆτι καὶ διαίτῃ καὶ τῷ λοιπῷ βίῳ, θαυμαστὴν καὶ ὁμολογουμένως παράδοξον ἐνδείκνυνται τὴν κατάστασιν τῆς ἑαυτῶν πολι-*

τείας. πατρίδας οἰκοῦσιν ἰδίας, ἀλλ' ὡς πάροικοι. μετέχουσι πάντων ὡς πολῖται καὶ πάνθ' ὑπομένουσιν ὡς ξένοι· πᾶσα ξένη πατρίς ἐστιν αὐτῶν...ἐπὶ γῆς διατρίβουσιν, ἀλλ' ἐν οὐρανῷ πολιτεύονται· πείθονται τοῖς ὡρισμένοις νόμοις, καὶ τοῖς ἰδίοις βίοις νικῶσι τοὺς νόμους. ἀγαπῶσι πάντας καὶ ὑπὸ πάντων διώκονται. Aug. De Ciu. Dei XIX 19 says that converts make no change in non-essentials.

EXSVLES ad nat. I 8 p. 71 l. 23 Wiss. *exsules uocis humanae.* So Ou. in Ib. *exsul mentisque domusque.* Publil. Syr. *ciconia auis exsul hiemis.*

p. 122 l. 2 GRATIAM Bailey Rituale Anglo-Cath. 105–6 (general thanksgiving).

p. 122 l. 5 BALNEIS Clem. Alex. Paedag. III 9 (Harnack Texte VIII 4 56).

STABVLIS Petron. Plin. ep. Mart. Suet. Vitell. 7. Apul. Metam. I 4 fin. 15 pr. 21 pr. X 1.

p. 122 l. 6 COHABITAMVS Hier. Aug. Ios. Ant. I 3 p. 4 p. m. (Bas. 1524). Conc. Carth. 3 c. 17. Rufin. Hist. Eccl. VII 26 p. 444 [see Thes. A. S.].

p. 122 l. 7 MILITAMVS c. 37 p. 108 l. 11. 38. 46. Kaye 344. Blunt Right Use 253–4. Yet he says De Idolol. 19 *at nunc de isto quaeritur, an fidelis ad militiam conuerti possit, et an militia ad fidem admitti, etiam caligata uel inferior quaeque, cui non sit necessitas immolationum uel capitalium iudiciorum. non conuenit sacramento diuino et humano, signo Christi et signo diaboli, castris lucis et castris tenebrarum; non potest una anima duobus deberi, deo et Caesari.* Cf. De Cor. Milit. 11, where he draws a distinction between a Christian enlisting and a soldier converted. 11 fin. *puta denique licere militiam usque ad causam coronae.* Lactant. V 17 §§ 12 13. VI 20 § 16 *ita neque militare iusto licebit, cuius militia est ipsa iustitia.* V 10 § 10 *dicet hic aliquis 'quae ergo aut ubi aut qualis est pietas?' nimirum apud eos, qui bella nesciunt.* Grotius De Iure Belli et Pacis I 2 §§ 9 10. Cf. Acta Maximiliani (Ruinart p. 309 sq.) c. 1 *mihi non licet militare, quia Christianus sum.* Neumann I 115 n. 8. 127 n. 10. 241 n. 1. 240. Orig. Contr. Cels. VIII 73 p. 220 L. Constit. Apost. VIII 32 allowed soldiers to be baptized, provided they would

promise to abstain from violence, from false accusation and to be content with their wages [Cf. Luke 3 14. A.S.] Tert. De Patient. 7 fin. p. 12, l. 24 Kr Gentiles prefer gain to their soul, *cum...ludo et castris sese locant.* Euseb. (Hist. Eccl. VIII 4 § 3) thinks it matter for high commendation that Christian soldiers under Diocletian suffered themselves to be turned out of the army rather than renounce their religion, and represents their station as very honourable and very lucrative. Soldiers Zahn Forschungen V 300. Aug. Ep. 128 (?). 189 § 4 ff. De Ciu. Dei I 21. 26. Conc. Arelat. (A.D. 314) can. 3 (Hefele I[2] Freib. 1873 p. 206). Paulin. ep. 18 § 7 S. Martin retires from service.

RVSTICAMVR Cic. Colum. Sidon.

p. 122 l. 8 QVOMODO...VIDEMVR, NON SCIO: indic. cf. c. 21 p. 74 23 n.

p. 122 l. 11 De Cult. Fem. II 11 pr. *nam nec templa circuitis nec spectacula postulatis nec festos dies gentilium nostis.*

DILVCVLO Plaut. Cic. Censorin. Fronto uulg. Suet. Vit. 15. Apul. Metam. III 25 f. IV 21.

p. 122 l. 13 RIGERE ET PALLERE stiff and pale with the bath in midwinter. Ennius Ann. frag. 111 (Baehrens) *Tarquinii corpus bona femina lauit et unxit.* Greg. Hom. 39 (?). of his deceased sister, *cumque corpus eius ex more mortuorum ad lauandum nudatum esset.* Dial. III 17 *quem ex more lotum et uestimentis indutum.* Acts 9 37 of Tabitha. Pet. Damian. ep. 5. Nicet. Choniat. in Vit. Isaaci I 3. Greg. Turon. De Gloria Confess. I 4 (La Cerda). Herald. Digress. I 27 p. 253. Bingham XXIII 3 3.

p. 122 l. 15 LIBERALIBVS 17 March. De Idolol. 16 pr. *togae purae.* De Spectac. 5 p. 7 l. 5 Wiss. *et cum promiscue ludi Liberalia uocarentur, honorem Liberi patris manifeste sonabant. Libero enim a rusticis primo fiebant ob beneficium quod ei adscribunt demonstrati gratia uini.* Aug. De Ciu. Dei VII 21. Valer. Max. V 4 § 4. App. B. C. IV 30.

SVPREMAM CENANTIBVS Woodham cites [after La Cerda comm. on Iuu. 11 20 *miscellanea ludi*] Liu. XXVI 14. Tac. Ann. II 31, of Libo, *ipsis quas in nouissimam uoluptatem adhibuerat epulis excruciatus,* i.e. *ultimam cenam.* Herald. cites

Apul. IV 13 *gladiatores isti famosae manus, uenatores illi probatae pernicitatis, alibi noxii perdita securitate suis epulis bestiarum saginas instruentes.* Marquardt III² 561 n. 8.

p. 122 l. 16 VBI VBI Ter. Eunuch. 295. 1042. Andr. 684. Attius 425. Publil. 154. [Sall.]. Inuect. in Cic. I § 1. Fronto p. 70 Naber. [Add Aug. ord. II 19 p. m. conf. IX 11. X 34. A. S.]

CAPITI De Cor. Milit. 5 pr. *haec* [*natura*] *prima praescribet coronam capiti non conuenire...utere itaque floribus uisu et odoratu, quorum sensuum fructus est...tam contra naturam est florem capite sectari, quam cibum aure, quam sonum nare.* cf. 7 on its connexion with idolatry.

p. 122 l. 17 CORONAM cet. cor. mil. 2 *neminem dico fidelium coronam capite nosse alias extra tempus temptationis eiusmodi.* 5, cited above. De Spectac. 18 f. *nullus tibi coronarum usus est.* Minuc. 12 § 6 *non floribus caput nectitis.* 38 § 2. 39 §§ 3—4 *his enim* [*floribus*] *et sparsis utimur mollibus ac solutis et sertis colla complectimur. sane quod caput non coronamus, ignoscite. auram boni floris naribus ducere, non occipitio capillisue solemus haurire.* Holden ib. cites Lucian. Nigrin. 32 *ᾐτιᾶτο τῶν στεφανουμένων, ὅτι μὴ ἴσασι τοῦ στεφάνου τὸν τόπον· εἰ γάρ τοι, ἔφη, τῇ πνοῇ τῶν ἴων τε καὶ ῥόδων χαίρουσιν, ὑπὸ τῇ ῥινὶ μάλιστα ἐχρῆν αὐτοὺς στέφεσθαι παρ' αὐτὴν ὡς οἷόν τε τὴν ἀναπνοήν, ἵν' ὡς πλεῖστον ἀνέσπων τῆς ἡδονῆς.* Cypr. De Lapsis 2 (p. 258 5—8). Conc. Illiber. c. 55. Clem. Alex. in Neumann I 114 n. 3 sq. e.g. Paedag. II 8 § 72 p. 213 P. *στεφάνων δὲ ἡμῖν καὶ μύρων χρῆσις οὐκ ἀναγκαία· ἐξοκείλει γὰρ εἰς ἡδονὰς καὶ ῥᾳθυμίας. εἴργονται τοίνυν στεφάνων οἱ τῷ λόγῳ παιδαγωγούμενοι.* Kaye 362–6. Bingham XVI 4 8. XXIII 3 9.

p. 122 l. 20 NOVIMVS De Paenitent. 9 *pastum et potum pura nosse, non uentris scilicet, sed animae causa.*

VIDERINT c. 25 p. 86 l. 31 n. De Spectac. 15 pr. De Idolol. 7 fin. 11 p. 41 l. 20 Wiss. Adu. Prax. 1 p. 227 l. 16 Kr. De Patient. 16 p. 24 l. 5 Kr. Minuc. 39 § 7. ind. Cypr. Pseudo-Cypr. p. 294 (= Sodoma, CSEL XXIII p. 218) l. 112.

SPECTACVLIS cf. c. 38 p. 110 l. 14 sq. De Spect. 24 p. 24 l. 19 Wiss. *atquin hinc uel maxime intellegunt factum*

Christianum, de repudio spectaculorum. cf. c. 1. 2. 19. Clem. Alex. Paedag. III c. 11 §§ 76 77 p. 298. Minuc. 12 § 5. 37 § 11. Neumann I 130 n. 9.

p. 122 l. 21 Blunt Right Use 361.

p. 122 l. 22 Kaye 360–1 (trades forbidden to Christians in the De Idolol.).

TVRA De Idolol. 11 p. 42 l. 21 Wiss. (cf. Neumann I 135) *quo ore Christianus turarius, si per templa transibit, quo ore fumantes aras despuet et exsufflabit, quibus ipse prospexit!* De Cor. Milit. 10 m. *et si me odor alicuius loci offenderit, Arabiae aliquid incendo; sed non eodem ritu nec eodem habitu nec eodem apparatu, quo agitur apud idola.* Optat. III p. 59 (62) *nulli dictum est 'aut tus pone aut basilicas dirue.' istae enim res solent martyria generare.* Bingham XXIII 2 5 p. 123. Clem. Alex. Paedag. III 8 *εἰ μύροις καὶ στεφάνοις χρηστέον.* Lactant. IV 3 § 9 (§ 8 if a philosopher is a priest, *philosophia inter sacra cessabit*): *illa enim religio muta est, non tantum quia mutorum est, sed quia ritus eius in manu et digitis est, non in corde aut lingua, sicut nostra, quae uera est.* cf. I 20 § 26. Ou. Met. I 248 *quis sit laturus in aras tura*; cf. VIII 277.

p. 122 l. 24 CARIORIS)(Migne LII 754 '*ad hoc solum uilius emitur ut carius distrahatur.*' So Cic. Suet. in lexx. and Apul. Metam. IX 10. Aug. De Trinit. XIII 3 *uili uelle emere et caro uendere.* [Add Conf. XI 2. Serm. 86 7. A. S.] Paulin. Nol. ep. 23 34 f. *caro aestimauit.*

CHRISTIANIS SEPELIENDIS De Idolol. 11 p. 41 l. 20 Wiss. *uiderint, si eaedem merces, tura dico et cetera peregrinitatis ad sacrificium idolorum etiam hominibus ad pigmenta medicinalia, nobis quoque insuper ad solacia sepulturae usui sunt.* De Carn. Resur. 27 p. 65 l. 3 Kr. *corpora medicata condimentis sepulturae mausoleis et monumentis sequestrantur.* Apul. Florid. § 19 ed. Helm p. 40 l. 2 (= Oud. p. 94) *iam miseri illius membra omnia aromatis perspersa.* Cassian. Collat. XV 3. Greg. Nyss. in Fun. Meletii (Migne P. G. XLVI 853[b]). Iren. I 21 § 3. Ou. Fast. III 561 *mixta bibunt molles lacrimis unguenta fauillae.* n. on Iuu. 4. 109 and ind. vol. II s.v. *tura.* Plin. Hist. Nat. XII 41 § 83 *aceruatim congesta honori cadauerum quae dis per*

singulas micas dantur. Lactant. II 4 § 9 *pari enim ratione defunctorum corpora odoribus ac pretiosis uestibus illita et conuoluta humi condunt, qua deos honorant.* Minuc. 12 § 6 *non corpus odoribus honestatis, reseruatis unguenta funeribus.* Prud. Καθημ. X 169 *nos tecta fouebimus ossa uiolis et fronde frequenti, titulumque et frigida saxa liquido spargemus odore.* dig. XI 7 § 37.

p. 122 l. 25 TEMPLORVM VECTIGALIA De Idolol. 17 p. 50 l. 26 *non hostias locet, non curas templorum deleget, non uectigalia eorum procuret.* Plin. ep. ad Trai. 96 (97) § 10 *certe satis constat prope iam desolata templa coepisse celebrari et sacra sollemnia diu intermissa repeti pastumque uenire uictimarum, cuius adhuc rarissimus emptor inueniebatur.* Marquardt III² 211 n. 4.

p. 122 l. 26 STIPES Varro De Ling. Lat. V § 182 in lexx. *dis cum thesauris asses dant stipem dicunt.* Arnob. I 24. Ou. Fast. IV 351 '*contulit aes populus, de quo delubra Metellus fecit,' ait: 'dandae mos stipis inde manet.*' Turneb. ad Cic. Leg. II §§ 22. 40 *stipem* ἐλεημοσύνην gl. Apul. Metam. VII 4 fin. (cf. 8 fin.) *nec manum ualidam erogandae stipi porrigeret.* Sen. ep. 115 § 5. Ind. to Marquardt III.

QVOTVSQVISQVE Cic. Cornif. Ou. Sen. Curt. Plin. ep. Tac. Tert. De Idolol. 12 p. 43 l. 26 Wiss.

p. 122 l. 27 MENDICANTIBVS supr. 13 *circuit cauponas religio mendicans.* Apul. Metam. VIII 24. Minuc. 24 § 4 *mendicantes uicatim deos ducunt.*

p. 122 l. 29 DENIQVE Adu. Marcion. I 24 p. 324 l. 2 Kr. [Cf. Watson Style and Language of St Cyprian 316. Thes. V 533, 52. A. S.]

PORRIGAT MANVM cf. c. 29 p. 96 ll. 2 f. cf. *caua manus* Tibull. II 4 14. Sen. ep. 90 § 14. 119 § 3. Suet. Aug. 91. Vesp. 23. Aristoph. Thesm. 937. [Liddell and Scott s.v. *κοιλαίνω, κοιλός.* A. S.]

p. 122 l. 30 MISERICORDIA Cic. pro Rosc. Amer. § 145 *aliena misericordia uiuo.* Lactant. II 1 § 10 *uictum precibus exposcit, deum solum obtestatur et per eius diuinum atque unicum nomen hominum sibi misericordiam quaerit.*

VICATIM Sisenn. Liu. Hor. Suet. (add Aug. 40. 43. 57. Cal. 35). Tac. Plin. h. n.

p. 122 l. 31 TEMPLATIM ἅπ. εἰρ. cf. c. 15 *Christiani templa nec interdiu norunt.*

VECTIGALIA Iustin. Apol. I. 17 φόρους δὲ καὶ εἰσφορὰς τοῖς ὑφ' ὑμῶν τεταγμένοις πανταχοῦ πρὸ πάντων πειρώμεθα φέρειν, ὡς ἐδιδάχθημεν παρ' αὐτοῦ (citing Luke 20 22. 25).

p. 122 l. 32 ALIENO ad nat. I 4 fin. *abstinentiam, qua ab alieno temperamus.* ib. 5 p. 65 l. 24 Wiss. *cur ille, inquitis, fraudator, si abstinentes Christiani?*

p. 124 l. 1 PROFESSIONVM Adu. Marc. V 1 p. 569 l. 12 Kr.

p. 124 l. 2 PRO Ashton (ap. Woodh.) omits or changes into *cum* (as c. 43). Ad Mart. 4 m. *cum se unum...pro multis... compensari noluisset.*

CAP. XLIII

p. 124 l. 3 cet. Arnob. I 24 *uestra sunt haec, uestra sunt irreligiose opinata et irreligiosius credita. quin immo, ut uerius proloquar, haruspices has fabulas, coniectores arioli uates et numquam non uani concinnauere fanatici, qui ne suae artes intereant ac ne stipes exiguas consultoribus excutiant iam raris, si quando † uos uelle rem uenire in inuidiam compererunt, 'negleguntur di' clamitant, 'atque templis iam raritas summa est. iacent antiquae derisui caerimoniae et sacrorum quondam ueterrimi ritus religionum nouarum superstitionibus occiderunt; et merito humanum genus tot miseriarum angustiis premitur.'*

SI FORTE c. 16 p. 54 l. 8 n. 38 f. p. 110 l. 20 n 41 p. 120 l. 19. ad nat. I 12 (?) 15 p. 85 l. 23 Wiss. De Pall. 2 p. m. p. 127. Ad Mart. 1 f. De Cor. Milit. 5.

p. 124 l. 4 LENONES c. 50.

PERDVCTORES Cic. in Verr. II (1) § 33 *lenonum, aleatorum, perductorum.* Ps. Ascon. ad l. *lenones sunt scortorum, perductores etiam inuitarum personarum, et in quibus stupra exercita legibus uindicantur.* The verb is used by Cic. Hor. Ou. Suet. Woodham cites Ern. ad Tac. Hist. I 25. Plaut. Asin. I 3 12.

p. 124 l. 5 AQVARIOLI *puer lenonis sic dicitur* Loewe Prodrom. 419. Cf. Apul. Apol. 78.

SICARII c. 37 *apud istam disciplinam magis occidi licet, quam occidere.*

VENENARII Petr. Suet. Apul. Rufin. Hist. Eccl. VIII 6 p. 473. Rose Anecd. I 122 2.

MAGI c. 35.

HARVSPICES c. 35 fin. Arnob. I 46 f. *cuius nomen auditum fugat noxios spiritus, imponit silentium uatibus, haruspices inconsultos reddit, arrogantium magorum frustrari efficit actiones, non horrore ut dicitis nominis sed maioris licentia potestatis.* Prudent. Apoth. 438 sq.

p. 124 l. 6 HARIOLI Plaut. Ter. Cic. Phaedr. Arn. I 24 (quoted on p. 124 l. 3). Paulin. Nol. ep. 16 10. Conc. Tolet. 4 can. 28. Conc. Rom. an. 721 can. 42 (VI 1457[b]). Cod. Theod. IX 16 4 [add Ps.-Aug. Quaest. 46 § 3. A. S.].

MATHEMATICI c. 35 *quas artes ut ab angelis desertoribus proditas et a deo interdictas ne suis quidem causis adhibent Christiani.* De Idolol. 9 p. 38 l. 13 Wiss. *expelluntur mathematici, sicut angeli eorum. urbs et Italia interdicitur mathematicis, sicut caelum angelis eorum.* Bingham XVI 5 1. Const. Apost. VIII 32. Aug. Haer. 70. Conc. Tolet. 1 reg. fid. c. Priscillianistas. Artemidor. II 39 (in Herald. Digress. I 29 pp. 256–7).

p. 124 l. 8 SECTAM c. 46 pr.

p. 124 l. 9 DAEMONIA c. 32 fin. 37 fin. p. 108 l. 28 n. Heraldus on Arnob. I 46 f. (p. 45). Kaye 89.

NON DICO Oehler on ad nat. I 2 p. 307 [=p. 60 l. 29 Wiss.].

p. 124 l. 10 VERO DEO cet. c. 29 f. 30 p. m. 33 pr.

PRECES c. 31. 32.

STERNANT lay at His feet.

CAP. XLIV

p. 124 l. 14 IMPENDIMVR Adu. Marcion. II 14 fin. 26 p. 372 l. 12 Kr. De Spectac. 19 p. 20 l. 16 Wiss. *et tamen innocens de supplicio alterius laetari non potest, cum magis competat innocenti dolere, quod homo par eius tam nocens factus est, ut tam crudeliter impendatur.* So *dependere* Scorpiac. 6 p. 157 l. 23 Wiss. *sed respice compensationem, cum caro et anima dependitur—quibus in homine carius nihil est, alterum manus dei, alterum flatus;—ipsa dependi in profectu, quorum est*

profectus, ipsa erogari, quae lucri fiant, eadem pretia, quae et merces.

INNOCENTES Ad Scap. 4 fin. *pro tanta innocentia, pro tanta probitate, pro iustitia, pro pudicitia, pro fide, pro ueritate, pro deo uiuo crematur, quod nec sacrilegi nec hostes publici ueri nec tot maiestatis rei pati solent.*

EROGAMVR c. 48 f. n. De Spectac. 12 p. 14 l. 16 Wiss. *itaque quos parauerant, armis quibus tunc et qualiter poterant eruditos, tantum ut occidi discerent, mox edicto* [Mayor. *edito*] *die inferiarum apud tumulos erogabant.* ad nat. I 10 p. 80 l. 5 Wiss. *plane religiosiores estis in gladiatorum cauea, ubi super sanguinem humanum, super inquinamenta poenarum, proinde saltant dei uestri argumenta et historias nocentibus erogandis, aut in ipsis deis nocentes puniuntur.*

p. 124 l. 15 CONTESTAMVR c. 17 f. De Cor. Milit. 3 m. *in ecclesia sub antistitis manu contestamur nos renuntiare diabolo et pompae et angelis eius.*

ACTVS c. 5 p. 18 l. 30 *consulite commentarios uestros.* c. 19 *archiua.*

p. 124 l. 16 CVSTODIIS prisoners, as often in Suet. supr. c. 9 post med. *et utique non deesset uobis in auditione custodiarum et damnatione sanguis humanus.* Cf. Plin. h. n. XXI § 12 Sen. ep. 5 § 7 *eadem catena et custodiam copulat et militem.* ep. 70 § 23 *inter custodias quidam ad matutinum spectaculum missus.* ep. 77 § 18 *unus ex custodiarum agmine.* uulg. Act. 27 1 *tradi Paulum cum reliquis custodiis centurioni nomine Iulio.*

SENTENTIIS ELOGIA DISPVNGITIS 'by passing sentence strike out from the calendar the name and charge of the criminal' (Woodh.). c. 2 p. 10 l. 24 n. *debito poenae nocens expungendus est, non eximendus.* 15 pr. 24 Oehler ind. Ad Scap. 4 a. m. *Pudens etiam missum ad se Christianum in elogio concussione eius intellecta dimisit, scisso eodem elogio, sine accusatore negans se auditurum hominem secundum mandatum.* De Idolol. 1 pr. De Carn. Resur. 21 p. 54 l. 8 Kr. *spes resurrectionis, nisi manifesta de periculo et praemio. neminem ad eiusmodi praesertim religionem, publico odio et hostili elogio obnoxiam, persuaderet.* ib. 34 pr. *transgressio, quae perditionis humanae causa est,...totum hominem elogio transgressionis in-*

scripsit. Allard Persécutions des Chrétiens du IIIe siècle I 421–4.

ELOGIA Orelli on Arnob. IV 36 and app. p. 51. Muncker on Fulgent. Mythol. I 1. Scorpiace 8 pr. p. 160 l. 18 Wiss. 15 pr. p. 178 l. 6 Wiss. ad nat. I 10 p. 80 l. 5 Wiss. De Cor. Milit. 5 f. Oehler p. 428. Migne LII 53 ob. (?)

DISPVNGITIS cf. c. 18 *dispunctionem utriusque meriti.* fragm. Fuld. c. 19 p. 62. cf. 37 Oehler, *si malum malo dispungi penes nos liceret.* 45. De Orat. 23 p. 197 l. 1 Wiss. De Cor. Milit. 18. De Test. Animae 4 pr. *adfirmamus te manere post uitae dispunctionem.* De Anima 33 p. 358 l. 8 Wiss. *si quod iudicium animas manet, grauius debeat credi in dispunctione uitae, quam in administratione.* ib. pr. p. 355 l. 25 Wiss. *si demutantur, non ipsae dispungentur, quae merebuntur.* Vlp. dig. L 16 56 '*dispungere*' *est conferre accepta et data.* Optat. III 4. Pseudo-Cypr. 291 39. 295 126. Gron. Obs. p. 673.

p. 124 l. 17 seq. c. 2 f.

p. 124 l. 18 MANTICVLARIVS inscr. in Rh. Mus. XXXV (1880) p. 154 (Brambach 956). Verein von Alterthumsfreunde im Rheinlande LXVII (1879) p. 4.

p. 124 l. 19 LAVANTIVM PRAEDO (= λωποδύτης) De Fug. in Persec. 13 fin. *inter tabernarios et lanios et fures balnearum et aleones et lenones.* Diog. Laert. VI § 52 (of Diogenes) *ἰδὼν μειρακύλλιον ἱματιοκλέπτην ἐν τῷ βαλανείῳ, ἔφη ἐπ' ἀλειμμάτιον ἢ ἐπ' ἄλλ' ἱμάτιον;* Corp. Gl. III 216. 46.

p. 124 l. 20 TITVLO Euseb. Hist. Eccl. V 1 § 44 de Attalo martyre, *καὶ περιαχθεὶς κύκλῳ τοῦ ἀμφιθεάτρου, πίνακος αὐτὸν προάγοντος ἐν ᾧ ἐγέγραπτο Ῥωμαϊστὶ 'οὗτός ἐστιν Ἄτταλος ὁ Χριστιανός', καὶ τοῦ δήμου σφόδρα σφριγῶντος ἐπ' αὐτῷ.*

OFFERVNTVR c. 2 p. 8 l. 7 *Traianus rescripsit hoc genus inquirendos quidem non esse, oblatos uero puniri oportere...solum Christianum inquiri non licet, offerri licet, quasi aliud esset actura inquisitio, quam oblationem. damnatis itaque oblatum, quem nemo uoluit requisitum.* c. 21 *oblatum Pontio Pilato.*

p. 124 l. 21 c. 7 fin. 15 fin. *certe sacrilegi de uestris semper apprehenduntur.* Ad Scap. 2 a. m. *tamen nos, quos sacrilegos*

existimatis, nec in furto umquam deprehendistis, nedum in sacrilegio. omnes autem, qui templa despoliant et per deos iurant et eosdem colunt, et Christiani non sunt et sacrilegi tamen deprehenduntur. fin. *et utique ex disciplina patientiae diuinae agere nos, satis manifestum esse uobis potest, cum tanta hominum multitudo, pars paene maior ciuitatis cuiusque, in silentio et modestia agimus, singuli forte noti magis, quam omnes, nec aliunde noscibiles, quam de emendatione uitiorum pristinorum.* Lactant. V 9 § 15 *non enim de nostro, sed ex illorum numero semper exsistunt, qui uias obsideant armati, maria praedentur, uel, si palam grassari non licuit, uenena clam temperent, qui uxores necent, ut dotes earum lucrentur, aut maritos, ut adulteris nubant.* Minuc. 35 § 5 *si uobiscum Christiani comparemur, quamuis in nonnullis disciplina nostra minor est, multo tamen uobis meliores deprehendemur.* § 6 *...denique de uestro numero carcer exaestuat, Christianus ibi nullus nisi aut reus suae religionis aut profugus.* On the innocence of Christians Blunt First Three Centuries c. 6. Pliny's Letter [ad Trai. 96 (97) § 8]. infr. 46 f.

AESTVAT Rufin. Hist. Eccl. VIII 6 fin. *cum peruenisset ad principem aestuare carceres.*

p. 124 l. 22 METALLA c. 27 p. 92 l. 30 n.

p. 124 l. 23 MVNERARII Bingham XVI 4 8 n. 34.

p. 124 l. 25 NON-CHRISTIANVS Oehler on c. 2 p. 117 n. g. de re 46 fin. *sed dicet aliquis, etiam de nostris excedere quosdam a regula disciplinae: desinunt tum Christiani haberi penes nos.*

CAP XLV

p. 124 l. 26 Blunt Right Use 322.

NECESSE c. 33 pr. *sed quid ego amplius de religione atque pietate Christiana in imperatorem? quem necesse est suspiciamus ut eum, quem dominus noster elegerit.*

p. 124 l. 27 INNOCENTIAM cet. c. 40 prope f. *humana gens... non inquirendo innocentiae magistrum et nocentiae iudicem et exactorem omnibus uitiis et criminibus inoleuit.* Athenag. 32 p. 36[bis] *οὐ γὰρ πρὸς ἀνθρωπικοὺς νόμους ὁ λόγος ἡμῖν, οὓς ἄν τις γενόμενος πονηρὸς καὶ λάθοι (ἐν ἀρχῇ δὲ ὑμῖν, δεσπόται,*

θεοδίδακτον εἶναι τὸν καθ' ἡμᾶς λόγον ἐπιστούμην), ἀλλ' ἔστιν ἡμῖν νόμος ὃς δικαιοσύνης μέτρον ἐποίησεν αὐτοὺς καὶ τοὺς πέλας ἔχειν. Orig. Contr. Cels. praef. § 2 fin. I § 1 fin. c. 9 fin. 26. 43 fin. 47 fin. 62 p. 49. 63 fin. 64 fin. 67 fin. 68. II 8 pr. 29. 30. 45. 48 fin. 50 fin. III 29. 30. 31. 39. 40 pr. 42. 44. 51. 54. 56. 57. 59—61. 65. 68. 69 fin. 78. 81. IV 26. 27. V 57 fin. 62. VI 40 fin. 79. VII 8 fin. 35. 48. 49. Iustin. Apol. p. 61^{bc}. Ep. ad Diogn. 5 6. Lactant. III 26.

p. 124 l. 29 CVSTODIMVS *τηροῦμεν.* De Baptismo 15 p 213 l. 29 Wiss.

INCONTEMPTIBILI *ἅπ. εἰρ.*

DISPECTORE (cl. *necesse*) c. 49 pr. *falsa nunc sint quae tuemur et merito praesumptiones, attamen necessaria...si quidem meliores fieri coguntur qui eis credunt, metu aeterni supplicii et spe aeterni refrigerii.* De Test. Anim. 2 p. 136 l. 23 Wiss. *sunt qui, etsi deum non negent, dispectorem plane et arbitrum et iudicem non putent.* De Cult. Fem. II 10 p. m. (add these to the two exx. from Tert., the only exx. in L. S.).

p. 124 ll. 29—30 Tzschirner 96 few allusions in the early apologists to the necessity of revelation or the insufficiency of reason (? the frequent citation of Plat. Tim. infr. c. 46 p. 128 l. 31). Orig. Contr. Cels. VII 42 p. 360 Sp. *ἡμεῖς δὲ ἀποφαινόμεθα, ὅτι οὐκ αὐτάρκης ἡ ἀνθρωπίνη φύσις ὁπωσποτανοῦν ζητῆσαι τὸν θεὸν καὶ εὑρεῖν αὐτὸν καθαρῶς, μὴ βοηθηθεῖσα ὑπὸ τοῦ ζητουμένου.* No opponent, says Tzschirner, of these days disputed the possibility of a special revelation.

p. 126 l. 6 OCVLORVM ad nat. I 4 fin. *pudicitiam, quam nec oculis contaminamus.* Iuu. 13 209 210 *nam scelus inter se tacitum qui cogitat ullum, facti crimen habet.* Pseudo-Prosper De Promiss. II c. 1 § 2 e.g. *non solum non moechandum, sed nec oculis consentiendum ad concupiscentiam.* Saluian. De Gubernat. Dei III 8 p. 31 l. 12 ed. Halm *hinc intellegere plene possumus, quam castos nos esse saluator iusserit, qui etiam licentiam uisionis abscidit...idcirco itaque ait dominus petulcos impudicorum hominum intuitus noxa adulterii non carere; scilicet ut qui bona fide fugeret adulterium, custodiret aspectum.*

SOLITARIA of God Lactant. I 7 § 4. Minuc. 10 § 3. cf. Gennad.

Eccl. Dogm. 10 4. [More exx. in my index to Ps.-Aug. Quaest. p. 534. Brewer's Der sog. Athanasianische Glaubensbekenntnis (Paderborn 1909) p. 12 n. 1: add Nouat. trin. 27. A. S.]

p. 126 l. 7 MALILOQVIO De Spectac. 2 bis p. 3 l. 23 Wiss. Ios. Antiq. XVII 1 p. 478 f. (Bas. 1524) c. 3 p. 481 f. Ignat. Polyc. 11. [Sulp. Seu.] p. 247. 13 Halm. [Aug.] Serm. 76 6. Porphyr. on Hor. [not in Holder's index].

p. 126 l. 8 Adu. Marc. IV 16 p. 468 l. 22 Kr. *Christus etiam uicem iniuriae cohibens.* II 28 p. 375 l. 15 Kr. *uicem prohibens* (*deus*). De Patient. 8 p. 13 l. 19 Kr. *reddam et ipse amaritudinis uicem necesse est.* Lactant. VI 18 § 12 *innocentiam semper et ubique custodiat. quod praeceptum non ad hoc tantum ualet, ut ipse iniuriam non inferat, sed ut illatam sibi non uindicet* [*uicem reddere*, passim in Ambst. Pelag. etc. A. S.].

p. 126 l. 11 DIXIMVS cet. c. 19 p. 62. [Iustin.] cohort. ad gr. 9 p. 9e. Diod. Sic. I c. 4. Clem. Alex. Strom. [where ?].

QVANTA as in Phaedr. II 8 24 *quantum est laboris!* how little! [cf. Lucan. IV 378. A. S.]

p. 126 l. 14 INVOLVNTATE the conj. of Latinius [i.e. Latinio Latini, a sixteenth century Italian, one of the ablest patristic scholars who ever lived. A. S.] has a place in lexx. *ἅπ. εἰρ.*

RECOGITATE 'rare.' Ad Mart. 2 pr. Plaut. Cic. (1). Colum. (1) [also Sen. and uulg. in LS. A. S.].

p. 126 l. 17 DEPRETIAT Oehler h. l. Adu. Marc. I 6 p. 298 l. 9 Kr. *si depretiari capit in creatore.* 14 fin. *depretias in quibus et uiuis et moreris.* II 27 fin. De Anim. 17 p. 323 l. 23 Wiss. Ad Vxor. I 3 a. m. *quod autem necessitas praestat, depretiat ipsa.* ad nat. I 10 p. 77 l. 9 Wiss. *nec contenti estis deis honorem non habuisse, nisi etiam quemcumque habetis depretietis aliqua indignitate.* De Fug. in Persec. 10 m. *depretiasti Christum qui in te est.* De Spectac. 22 p. 23 l. 5 Wiss. Dirksen Corp. Gl. II 44 5. Commodian. Carm. Apol. 196. Sidon. carm. 22 203 (in Burgo) *depretiata suas turpant pigmenta figuras.* ep. II 10 fin. *igitur incumbe, neque apud te litterariam curam turba depretiet imperitorum.* [See Thes. A. S.]

MODICVM cet. Sen. ep. 94 § 7 *optimam doloris esse naturam, quod non potest nec qui extenditur magnus esse, nec qui est magnus extendi.* Cic. De Finib. II § 22 *iam doloris medicamenta illa Epicurea tamquam de narthecio proment: si grauis, breuis; si longus, leuis.* ib. §§ 94. 95. Oehler h. l. cites Diog. Laert. X 140 (Menage). Plut. De Audiend. Poet. 36[b]. M. Antonin. VII 5 and 38. cf. Usener Epicurea Fr. 446 447 pp. 291–2.

p. 126 l. 19 SPECVLATORE Minuc. 32 § 9 *quanto magis deus auctor omnium ac speculator omnium, a quo nullum potest esse secretum, tenebris interest, interest cogitationibus nostris, quasi alteris tenebris!* Lactant. VI 18 § 12 *sedet enim maximus et aequissimus iudex speculator ac testis omnium.* ib. 24 §§ 11—20 remarkable extracts from Seneca. II 16' § 8. De Ira 8 § 8. Prudent. Cathem. II 105 *speculator adstat desuper, qui nos diebus omnibus actusque nostros prospicit a luce prima in uesperam. hic testis, hic est arbiter*, etc.

DISPVNGIMVR c. 18 p. 58 *suscitatis omnibus ab initio defunctis et reformatis et recensitis ad utriusque meriti dispunctionem.* c. 37 *si malum malo penes nos dispungi liceret.* c. 44 n.

p. 126 l. 20 SOLI c. 30 p. 96 l. 30 *qui eum* (i.e. *Deum*) *solus obseruo.*

p. 126 ll. 20 ff. Internal evidence in Tert.: c. 49 p. 140 l. 21 appeals not only to the intrinsic excellence of Christian doctrine, but to its fruits (Tzschirner 165) in Christian life. c. 21 fin. *quaerite ergo, si uera sit ista diuinitas Christi. si ea est, qua cognita ad bonum quis reformetur, sequitur, ut falsa renuntietur quaeuis alia contraria comperta.* Arnob. I 6 38 39. Orig. Contr. Cels. I c. 3 p. 2 the life of Christians the best apology of Christ. c. 31 pp. 23 24 Jesus not taught of man. ib. c. 67 p. 53 gentleness, discipline, kindness of Christians. cf. p. 21 Christians from heathens. III c. 30 pp. 128–9 churches at Athens and Corinth, compared with heathen neighbours. Iustin. Apol. I c. 30 p. 21 *υἱὸς δὲ θεοῦ ὁ Ἰησοῦς λεγόμενος, εἰ καὶ κοινῶς μόνον ἄνθρωπος, διὰ σοφίαν ἄξιος υἱὸς θεοῦ λέγεσθαι.* Evidence of Christian life, ib. Apol. I 12 (no exposition of children c. 36 37). cf. Athenag. c. 11 pp. 11 12:

among Christians artisans, old women, are models of virtue, and love their neighbours as themselves. Testimony of Pliny, ep. Trai. 96 (97).

p. 126 l. 21 PLENITVDINE De Spectac. 20 fin. *haec est ueritatis integritas et quae ei debetur disciplinae plenitudo.* ib. 21 pr. *ethnici, quos penes nulla est ueritatis plenitudo.*

p. 126 l. 23 TIMENTES Tatian 4 *τὸν μεν γὰρ ἄνθρωπον ἀνθρωπίνως τιμητέον· φοβητέον δὲ μόνον τὸν θεόν.* Matth. 10 28. Kaye 48 n. 3.

CAP. XLVI

p. 126 l. 25 CONSTITIMVS c. 4 pr. *iam de causa innocentiae consistam.* c. 19 Fuld. p. 62 5. infr. hoc c. p. 130 l. 17 *si de simplicitate consistam.* De Idolol. 13 Oehler, p. 44 l. 12 Wiss. *de hoc quidem primo consistam, an.* Marcian. l. 2 de lege Corn. de falso, dig. XLVIII 10 § 7 *nullo modo serui cum dominis suis consistere possunt.* cf. Dirksen s.v. n. 2 '*iudicio congredi. actione experiri.*'

p. 126 l. 26 INTENTIONEM strain, pressure. c. 27 pr. *satis haec aduersus intentionem laesae diuinitatis.*

FLAGITAT Cypr. Ad Demetrian. 12 *dei seruos et maiestati ac numini eius dicatos iniustis persecutionibus flagitatis.* id. ep. 20 § 1 *orto statim turbationis impetu primo, cum me clamore uiolento frequenter populus flagitasset, non tam meam salutem quam quietem fratrum publicam cogitans interim secessi.*

p. 126 l. 28 ANTIQVITATE c. 19 pr. 47 pr.

p. 126 l. 29 CONFESSIONE cc. 19—23. 25 pr. n. cf. Harnack Texte VIII 4 pp. 110—1.

p. 126 l. 33 SECTAE c. 43 f.

OBDVCITVR cc. 39. 50. De Pudic. 7 p. 232 l. 14 Wiss. *obducero diuersae partis praesumptionem.* De Carne Chr. 19 pr. *cum adulteratores eius obducero.* De Carn. Resur. 2 p. 27 l. 2 Kr. *obducti dehinc de deo carnis auctore.* Adu. Hermog. 38 p. 168 l. 16 Kr. De Ieiun. 11 p. 289 l. 15 Wiss. Adu. Marc. I 21 p. 318 l. 7 Kr. III 16 fin. V 10 p. 606 l. 16 Kr. Adu. Prax. 27 pr.

p. 126 l. 34 DIVINVM De Pall. c. ult. fin. *at ego iam illi etiam diuinae sectae ac disciplinae commercium confero. gaude pallium et exsulta, melior iam te philosophia dignata est, ex quo Christianum uestire coepisti.* Athan. Or. Contr. Gent. 1 *πῶς εἰκότως...ἔτι ἀνθρώπινόν ἐστιν ἐπινοεῖν τὸ πρᾶγμα, καὶ οὐ μᾶλλον ὁμολογεῖν θεοῦ λόγον καὶ σωτῆρα εἶναι τοῦ παντὸς τὸν ἐπὶ τοῦ σταυροῦ ἀναβάντα;*

PHILOSOPHIAE GENVS supr. c. 21 p. 68 Zeno and Cleanthes knew of the *Λόγος*. Test. Anim. 1. De An. 2. Minuc. 20 § 1 *ut quiuis arbitretur, aut nunc Christianos philosophos esse, aut philosophos fuisse iam tunc Christianos.* [Iustin.] Cohort. ad Gr. c. 14 p. 15[b] etc. says that Homer Orpheus Pythagoras etc. learnt from Moses. Keim's Celsus I § 4 p. 3 n. 2. Tzschirner 315 sq. Iustin. Apol. I 24 immortality. 27 judgement and fire of purgatory. 28 creation and *ἐκπύρωσις*; idols rejected by Menander; crucifixion, resurrection and ascension resemble stories of sons of Zeus. 30 the *Λόγος* and Hermes; Perseus born of a virgin; miracles of healing ascribed to Aesculapius; Arnob. II 13 14 unity of God, resurrection, gehenna. Orig. Contr. Cels. V 57. VII 59.

p. 128 l. 2 CVR ERGO etc. Athenag. Suppl. 2 p. 4[a] (cf. pp. 6—8, Eurip. Soph. Plat. Aristot. Stoics hold one God) *οὕτω καὶ τοὺς ἀπὸ φιλοσοφίας κρινομένους ὁρῶμεν. οὐδεὶς αὐτῶν πρὸ κρίσεως διὰ τὴν ἐπιστήμην ἢ τέχνην ἀγαθὸς ἢ πονηρὸς τῷ δικαστῇ εἶναι δοκεῖ, ἀλλὰ δόξας μὲν εἶναι ἄδικος κολάζεται, οὐδὲν τῇ φιλοσοφίᾳ προστριψάμενος ἔγκλημα (ἐκεῖνος γὰρ πονηρὸς ὁ μὴ ὡς νόμος φιλοσοφῶν, ἡ δὲ ἐπιστήμη ἀναίτιος), ἀπολυσάμενος δὲ τὰς διαβολὰς ἀφίεται.* c. 5 pr. *καὶ ποιηταὶ μὲν καὶ φιλόσοφοι οὐκ ἔδοξαν ἄθεοι, ἐπιστήσαντες περὶ θεοῦ.* Iustin. Apol. I 4 p. 55[c] *καὶ γάρ τοι φιλοσοφίας ὄνομα καὶ σχῆμα ἐπιγράφονταί τινες, οἳ οὐδὲν ἄξιον τῆς ὑποσχέσεως πράττουσι· γινώσκετε δ' ὅτι καὶ οἱ τὰ ἐναντία δοξάσαντες καὶ δογματίσαντες τῶν παλαιῶν τῷ ἑνὶ ὀνόματι προσαγορεύονται φιλόσοφοι· καὶ τούτων τινὲς ἀθεότητα ἐδίδαξαν καὶ τὸν Δία ἀσελγῆ ἅμα τοῖς αὐτοῦ παισὶν οἱ γενόμενοι ποιηταὶ καταγγέλλουσι· κἀκείνων τὰ διδάγματα οἱ μετερχόμενοι οὐκ εἴργονται πρὸς ὑμῶν, ἆθλα δὲ καὶ τιμὰς τοῖς εὐφώνως ὑβρίζουσι τούτους τίθετε.* ib. 20 *εἰ οὖν καὶ ὁμοίως τινὰ τοῖς*

παρ' ὑμῖν τιμωμένοις ποιηταῖς καὶ φιλοσόφοις λέγομεν, ἔνια δὲ καὶ μειζόνως καὶ θείως καὶ μόνοι μετ' ἀποδείξεως, τί παρὰ πάντας ἀδίκως μισούμεθα; ib. 24 *πρῶτα μὲν ὅτι τὰ ὅμοια τοῖς Ἕλλησι λέγοντες μόνοι μισούμεθα δι' ὄνομα τοῦ Χριστοῦ, καὶ μηδὲν ἀδικοῦντες ὡς ἁμαρτωλοὶ ἀναιρούμεθα.* [id.] Cohort. ad Gent. 14. Orig. c. Cels. II 13. Pfanner System. Theolog. Gent. (Bas. 1679) 4to c. 2. A similar argument to that early in the treatise, c. 2 pr. if we are criminals, why are we not treated like other criminals?

p. 128 l. 4 Arnob. III 7 zealous pagans declared that Cicero De Nat. Deor. should be burnt: *oportere statui per senatum, aboleantur ut haec scripta quibus Christiana religio comprobetur et uetustatis opprimatur auctoritas? quin immo, si fiditis explоratum uos dicere quicquam de dis uestris, erroris conuincite Ciceronem, refellitote, redarguite, temeraria et impia dictitare comprobate.*

p. 128 l. 5 impunity of philosophic criticism ad nat. I 4.

p. 128 l. 6 DEIERARE c. 32 Christians swore *per salutem*, not *per genium Caesaris.* ib. fin. *ceterum daemonas, id est genios, adiurare consueuimus, ut illos de hominibus exigamus, non deierare, ut illis honorem diuinitatis conferamus.*

LVCERNAS c. 35 p. 102 l. 24 *nec lucernis diem infringimus.* Iuu. 12 91—2 n.

p. 128 l. 7 Theophil. ad fin. (cf. Arnob. I 64 p. 44 l. 20 sq. on the licence of philosophers). supra c. 12 p. 44 l. 21 *idem estis qui Senecam aliquem pluribus et amarioribus de uestra superstitione perorantem* [? *non* or *depr.*] *reprehendistis.*

QVIN IMMO Arnob. I 20. 24 pr. 37 pr. 51 pr. 64 f. 65 p. 46 l. 5. 75. II 39 p. m. 55 pr. 58 f. 63. 64. 69 m. 70 pr. and f. 76 p. m. III 7. 44. VI 11. 35 f. (?) For subject matter, see Bayle œuvres III 111.

DESTRVVNT c. 13 pr. 14 p. 48 l. 31. ad nat. I 4 p. 64 l. 3 Wiss. *denique Socrates ex ea parte damnatus est, qua propius temptauerat ueritatem, deos uestros destruendo.* Lactant. V 20 § 14 *num peius nos destruimus, quam quidam philosophi, qui omnino nullos deos esse aiunt?* Cf. I 2 § 2. (Athenag. 5 pr. cited above.) id. Epitome 55 § 3 *cur audiuntur philosophi, qui aut nullos deos esse aiunt aut si sunt nihil curare nec humana*

respicere, aut nullam esse omnino, quae regat mundum, prouidentiam disserunt? See the fragments (in Lactant.) of Seneca De Superstitione. [' Lactant.' is probably an error for ' Augustine.']

p. 128 ll. 8—9 LAVDANTIBVS VOBIS...SVSTINENTIBVS VOBIS Woodham compares c. 15 *luget Sol filium iactatum de caelo laetantibus uobis et Cybele pastorem suspirat fastidiosum, non erubescentibus uobis.*

p. 128 l. 9 (OB)LATRANT Suet. Vesp. 13 *Demetrium Cynicum in itinere obuium sibi post damnationem ac neque assurgere neque salutare se dignantem, oblatrantem etiam nescio quid, satis habuit canem uocare.* Vincent. Lirin. Common. 13 *haec ergo Nestorius, Apollinaris, Photinus aduersus catholicam fidem rabidi canes latrant.* Paulin. Nol. ep. 21 4 *omnia diaboli, quae in haereticis latrant, ora clauduntur.* Migne LII 542[c] *lingua pietatem latrat.* Boissier L'opposition sous les Césars.

p. 128 l. 10 STATVIS Mart. IX 47. Lucian. Nigrin. 2. cf. Arnob. I 64 p. 44 20 sq. esp. 45 l. 1 2. Iuu. 2 4—7 *plena omnia gypso Chrysippi inuenias; nam perfectissimus horumst, si quis Aristotelem similem uel Pittacon emit, et iubet archetypos pluteum seruare Cleanthas.* Friedländer III[5] 193 227 228. M. Aurelius procured statues in honour...of his teacher Iunius Rusticus after his death from the senate (Vita M. Antonini 3).

SALARIIS Iul. Capitolin. Anton. Pius 11 § 3 *rhetoribus et philosophis per omnes prouincias et honores et salaria detulit.* Aug. De Ciu. Dei I 3 p. 6 l. 24 D[2] *o nimium miserabilem errorem! et nobis suscensent, cum de dis eorum talia dicimus, nec suscensent auctoribus suis, quos ut ediscerent, mercedem dederunt, doctoresque ipsos insuper et salario publico et honoribus dignissimos habuerunt.*

REMVNERANTVR c. 25 p. 90 l. 17 n.

AD BESTIAS ad Scap. 3 f. *cum...Mauilum ad bestias damnasses.* ad nat. I 3 p. 62 l. 6 Wiss. *ut ita pronuntiaretur in nos: illum homicidam,...ad bestias dari placet.* ib. fin. *et utique non gladio aut cruce aut bestiis punienda sunt nomina.* Septimius Seuerus (Vita S. S. 18. Vita Getae 2) favoured philosophy; so his wife Iulia Domna (Dio LXXV 15. Philostr. Soph. II 30. Vita Apollonii written at her bidding).

PRONVNTIANTVR of the judge's sentence. Apul. Metam. III 1 *innocentem.* [Cf. Study of Ambrosiaster, p. 178. A. S.]

p. 128 l. 11 PHILOSOPHI NON CHRISTIANI On the moral impotence of philosophy Iuu. 2. Lactant. III 15. Sen. De Vita Beata 18. Friedländer III 568.

p. 128 l. 13 QVIDNI? i.e. *quidni non fugat?* why should it not fail to expel them? Herald h. l. c. 22 pr. p. 74 l. 31. Apul. Metam. XI 26 fin. 28 fin. 30. LS *quis* I II B 3 say that *quidni non* in Sen. ep. 52 § 10 is pleonastic: wrongly (Madvig, Adu. II 379 409. Sen. De Breu. Vit. 7 § 7. ep. 6 § 3. 52 § 10).

SECVNDVM DEOS supr. c. 24 *sic plerique disponunt diuinitatem, ut imperium summae potestatis esse penes unum, officia eius penes multos uelint; ut Plato Iouem magnum in caelo comitatum exercitu describit deorum pariter et daemonum.* De Anim. 1 (below).

p. 128 l. 14 SI DAEMONIVM PERMITTAT Herald. Adu. II 5 on ἢν θεὸς θέλῃ, θεῶν τὰ ἴσα νεμόντων, σὺν θεῶν δόσει, *si di uolunt, si dis placet,* De Anim. 57 p. 392 l. 4 Wiss. *nam et suggessimus nullum paene hominem carere daemonio.* Kaye 205.

DAEMONIVM supr. c. 22 pr. cf. Hermas 2 Mand. 6 2. De Anima 1 p 299 l. 22 Wiss. (much about Socr.) *sane Socrates facilius diuerso spiritu agebatur. siquidem aiunt daemonium illi a puero adhaesisse, pessimum re uera paedagogum, etsi post deos et cum deis daemonia deputantur penes poetas et philosophos...quodsi idcirco sapientissimus Socrates secundum Pythii quoque daemonis suffragium, scilicet negotium nauantis socio suo, quanto dignior atque constantior Christianae sapientiae adsertio, cuius adflatui tota uis daemonum cedit? haec sapientia de schola caeli deos quidem saeculi negare liberior, quae nullum Aesculapio gallinaceum reddi iubens praeuaricetur, nec noua inferens daemonia, sed uetera depellens, nec adulescentiam uitians, sed omni bono pudoris informans, ideoque non unius urbis, sed uniuersi orbis iniquam sententiam sustinens pro nomine ueritatis, tanto scilicet perosioris, quanto plenioris, ut et mortem non de poculo per habitum iucunditatis absorbeat, sed de patibulo et uiuicomburio per omne ingenium crudelitatis exhauriat.* 39. 56.

p. 128 l. 15 VERITATE ad nat. I. 10 p. 79 l. 15 Wiss. *taceo de*

philosophis, quos superbia seueritatis et duritia disciplinae ab omni timore securos, nonnullus etiam adflatus ueritatis aduersus deos erigit. denique et Socrates in contumeliam eorum quercum et canem et hircum iurat. De Anima 2 pr. *plane non negabimus aliquando philosophos iuxta nostra sensisse. testimonium est ueritatis euentus ipsius.* cet. Kaye 162.

DEOS NEGANS c. 14 fin. *propterea damnatus est Socrates, quia deos destruebat.*

p. 128 l. 16 GALLINACEVM Plat. Phaedo p. 118[a] (ad fin. dial.). Wyttenbach on Plat. l. c. ad nat. II 2 p. 96 l. 17 Wiss. *Socrates ipse deos istos quasi certus negabat; idem Aesculapio gallinaceum secari quasi certus iubebat;* De Cor. Milit. 10 m. *nam et ego mihi gallinaceum macto, non minus quam Aesculapio Socrates.* De Anima 1 p. m. quoted on l. 14. Lasaulx 268 n. 236. Grote's Plato II 195. Artemidor. Oneirocritica V 9 *ηὔξατό τις τῷ Ἀσκληπιῷ, εἰ διὰ τοῦ ἔτους ἄνοσος* [? *ἀνόσως*. A.S.] *ἔχῃ, θύσειν αὐτῷ ἀλεκτρυόνα.* Luc. Bis Acc. 5, where *Δίκη* says: *πάνυ γοῦν αὐτὸν ὃν φής, ἐκεῖνον ὤνησαν οἱ περὶ ἐμοῦ λόγοι, ὃς παραδοθεὶς τοῖς ἕνδεκα καὶ εἰς τὸ δεσμωτήριον ἐμπεσὼν ἔπιεν ἄθλιος τοῦ κωνείου, μηδὲ τὸν ἀλεκτρυόνα τῷ Ἀσκληπιῷ ἀποδεδωκώς.* Chrys. IX 491 d. Theodoret Graecar. Affect. Cur. VII 47 p. 109 47. Lactant. III 20 § 16 *illud uero nonne summae uanitatis, quod ante mortem familiares suos rogauit, ut Aesculapio gallum, quem uouerat, prosecarent?* § 17 *timuit uidelicet ne apud Rhadamanthum recuperatorem uoti reus fieret ab Asclepio. dementissimum hominem putarem, si morbo adfectus perisset. cum uero hoc sanus fecerit, est ipse insanus, qui eum putet esse sapientem.* Orig. cont. Cels. VI 4 Spencer. Herondas 4 11—13 (after summoning Aesculapius, his wife and children etc.) *ἵλεῳ δεῦτε, τοῦ ἀλέκτορος τοῦδ' ὅντιν' οἰκίης τοίχων | κήρυκα θύω, τἀπίδορπα δέξαισθε.*

p. 128 l. 17 SAPIENTISSIMVM ad nat. I 4 p. 64 l. 3 Wiss. *Socrates ex ea parte damnatus est, qua propius temptauerat ueritatem, deos uestros destruendo.* cet. Minuc. 13 §§ 1—2 *quamquam, si philosophandi libido est, Socratem sapientiae principem, quisque uestrum tantus est, si potuerit, imitetur. eius uiri, quotiens de caelestibus rogabatur, nota responsio est:* quod

supra nos, nihil ad nos. *merito ergo de oraculo testimonium meruit prudentiae singularis: quod oraculum, idem ipse praesensit, idcirco uniuersis esse praepositum, non quod omnia comperisset, sed quod nihil se scire didicisset.* ib. 38 § 7 *proinde Socrates scurra Atticus uiderit, nihil se scire confessus, testimonio licet fallacissimi daemonis gloriosus.* Saluian. De Gubern. Dei VII § 101 *numquid non sapientissimus omnium Socrates semper existimatus, testimonio scilicet etiam Delphici daemonis, qui quasi princeps philosophorum, sicut ille daemoniorum erat?* Iustin. Apol. I 5. II 11 compares the persecutions of Socrates and of the Christians. Valer. Maxim. III 4 ext. § 1. Plin. Hist. Nat. VII c. 34 § 120. Plat. Apol. ed. Adam pp. xxvi ff. Diog. Laert. II 37. Schol. Aristoph. Nubes 145. Themist. p. 27[bc]. 161[c].

p. 128 l. 19 Lactant. V 14 § 14 *Socrates negabat deos.* Iustin. Apol. I 61, Socrates and Heraclitus, though atheists, were in truth Christians, as they lived according to the Logos. Indictment against Socrates below l. 34 n. cf. Xen. Memorab. I 1. Orig. contr. Cels. IV 67. Iustin. Apol. I 5 p. 55[e]. II 10 p. 48[d]. Aelian Var. Hist. II 13 with Perizonius' n. Themist. 313[d] general: Wetstein on Acts 17 18. Dio Cass. LII 36 § 2 *καινά τινα δαιμόνια...ἀντεσφέροντες.* Bornemann on Xen. Apol. 10 p. 48 ed. 1824. Theodoret Graec. Affect. Curat. VII § 47 p. 109 47 *ἐγὼ δὲ οἶμαι καὶ Σωκράτην τὸν Σωφρονίσκου τὸν ἀλεκτρύονα θῦσαι κελεύειν, ἵνα τὴν κατ᾽ αὐτοῦ γεγενημένην διελέγξῃ γραφήν. ἐγραψάσθην γὰρ αὐτὸν Ἄνυτός τε καὶ Μέλητος, ὡς εἶναι θεοὺς οὐ νομίζων.*

p. 128 l. 20 ODIO Ashton cf. 7 *cum odio sui coepit ueritas, simul atque apparuit, inimica esse.* c. 14 p. 48 l. 31 Hieron. [epist. 40 § 1. A. S.] *de Onaso ita se natura habet, ut amara sit ueritas.* Cassiod. Amic. 24 (?) *plerumque molesta est ueritas.* Sidon. ep. vii 7 § 4 *ueritatis asperitas.* Lactant. V 9 § 6 *huius tanti et tam pertinacis odii quam potissimum causam esse dicamus? utrumne* ueritas odium parit, *ut ait poeta quasi diuino spiritu instinctus?* 21 § 1 *non ergo ideo aduersus nos insaniunt, quia di non coluntur a nobis; a multis enim non coluntur, sed quia ueritas penes nos est, quae (ut est uerissime dictum) odium parit.* Epit. 64 § 17. Socr. Hist. Eccl. 6 praef. § 6 *τὸ ἀληθὲς πικρόν.*

p. 128 l. 21 ADVLTERAT Cic. Plin. uulg. Tert. De Monogam. 2 bis. [See Thes. and add exx. in Study of Ambrosiaster p. 82. A. S.]

p. 128 l. 22 INSECTATORES LS one ex. from Liu. one from Quintil. 'very rare.' Tert. Adu. Marc. IV 15 pr. bis. Aug. in Ps. 55 10 p. m. 99 12 a. m. [Other exx. in Benoist-Goelzer. Add also [Aug.] Serm. 279 § 3. A. S.]

ILLVSORES Tert. (1). Aug. (1). Paul. Nol. (1) (add this place to lexx.). [Add also Hier. and uulg. from Benoist-Goelzer. A. S.]

p. 128 l. 23 MIMICE Sen. ep. 26 § 5 *simulatio: mimus.* 55 § 4 *mendacium.* 5 § 1 *conspici cupiunt.* 6 passim (word 3 exx. in lexx. h. l. Catull. Sen. Rh.). [Not now read in Sen. Rh. A.S.]

AFFECTANT c. 19 Fuld. p. 62 l. 2. ad nat. I 4 p. 63 l. 29 Wiss. *sed ueritatem saeculo operosissimam philosophi quidem affectant, possident autem Christiani, ideoque qui possident, magis displicent, quia qui affectat, inludit, qui possidet, defendit.* Herald. Digr. I c. 33 p. 260—1.

p. 128 l. 24 GLORIAM infr. c. 47 p. 132 l. 9 n. Cypr. De Bono Patientiae 2 fin. *si sapientia illic uera non est, esse non potest et uera patientia. nam si patiens ille est qui est humilis et mitis, philosophos autem nec humiles esse uidemus nec mites sed sibi multum placentes et hoc ipso quod sibi placeant deo displicentes, apparet illic non esse patientiam, ubi sit insolens adfectatae libertatis audacia et exerti ac seminudi pectoris inuerecunda iactantia.*

p. 128 l. 25 INTEGRE Cic. Tac. Gell. [Plin. ep. Suet. in lexx. Add Aug. gen. ad litt. summ. p. 439, 13 Zy., loc. hept. III 4, quaest. hept. III 40 a. m. CSEL LX p. 679. Rufin. (CSEL XLVI.) A. S.]

SALVTI SVAE CVRANT Apul. De Deo Socr. 2 fin. *potentiae uero animis coniectatae per uarias utilitates in uita agenda animaduersae in eis rebus, quibus eorum singuli curant.* id. Apol. 1 *alteram uero caelitem Venerem, praedita quae sit optimati amore solis hominibus et eorum paucis curare.* Lexx. cite Attius and Plaut. [See Thes. IV 1502 83. A. S.]

p. 128 l. 26 DISCIPLINA De Paenit. 3. De Cult. Fem. II 1 and 10. Orig. contr. Cels. VI 17 denies that Plato's persuasive words can train his disciples to piety.

p. 128 l. 27 THALES c. 19 Fuld. p. 60 l. 26. Minuc. 13 § 4 *quid? Simonidis melici nonne admiranda omnibus et sectanda cunctatio? qui Simonides cum de eo quid et quales arbitraretur deos ab Hierone tyranno quaereretur, primo deliberationi diem petiit, postridie biduum prorogauit, mox alterum tantum admonitus adiunxit, postremo cum causas tantae morae tyrannus inquireret, respondit ille, quod sibi, quanto inquisitio tardior pergeret, tanto ueritas fieret obscurior.* ib. 38 § 7 *Simonides etiam in perpetuum comperendinet.* Bayle s.u. *Simonides* rem. F. Lactant. III 14 § 5 *Milesium Thalem, qui de rerum natura primus traditur disputasse.* cf. ib. I 5 § 16 (*Thales...primus omnium quaesisse de causis naturalibus traditur*).

p. 128 l. 28 COMMEATVS respite. c. 32 pr. Adu. Marc. II 10 p. 350 l. 1 Kr. De Anim. 30 p. 350 l. 21 Wiss. 35 p. 360 l. 11 Wiss. *in primo quoque huius uitae commeatu.* ad nat. II 2 p. 96 l. 15 Wiss. *Thales Milesius Croeso sciscitanti, quid de deis arbitraretur, post aliquot deliberandi commeatus, Nihil, renuntiauit.* Oehler on De Fuga in Persec. 9 p. 497 note g. Minuc. 11 § 8 *quis unus ullus ab inferis uel Protesilai sorte remeauit, horarum saltem permisso commeatu?* Cypr. ind. [See Thes. III 1825 81. A. S.]

p. 128 l. 29 OPIFEX cet. Theodoret Graecar. Affect. Curat. V § 68 p. 81 30 seq.; (very important) VIII §§ 2—8. Clem. Alex. Strom. IV § 59 p. 590 P. Orig. contr. Cels. VII 41 fin. Arnob. I 52 challenges Zoroaster etc. to a contest of healing with any Christian peasant. Popular style of Scripture, Orig. Contr. Cels. III 44. 52. 55. VII 59. 60. Harnack Mission u. Ausbreitung des Christenthums (1902) pp. 155—6. Athenag. 12 p. 12[d] sq., of philosophers, *οἳ τοὐναντίον ἀεὶ διατελοῦσι κακῶς τὰ ἀπόρρητα ἑαυτοῖς ταῦτα μεταλλεύοντες καὶ ἀεί τι ἐργάσασθαι ἐπιθυμοῦντες κακόν, τέχνην λόγων καὶ οὐκ ἐπίδειξιν ἔργων τὸ πρᾶγμα πεποιημένοι. παρὰ δ' ἡμῖν εὕροιτε ἂν ἰδιώτας καὶ χειροτέχνας καὶ γραΐδια, εἰ λόγῳ τὴν ὠφέλειαν παριστᾶν εἰσιν ἀδύνατοι τὴν παρὰ τοῦ λόγου, ἔργῳ τὴν ἀπὸ τῆς προαιρέσεως ὠφέλειαν ἐπιδεικνυμένους· οὐ γὰρ λόγους διαμνημονεύουσιν, ἀλλὰ πράξεις ἀγαθὰς ἐπιδεικνύουσιν, παιόμενοι μὴ ἀντιτύπτειν καὶ ἁρπαζόμενοι μὴ δικάζεσθαι, τοῖς αἰτοῦσι διδόναι καὶ τοὺς πλησίον ἀγαπᾶν ὡς ἑαυτούς.* Cf. Otto

ad l. Minuc. 38 § 8 *non eloquimur magna, sed uiuimus.* Tatian c. 32 p. 167[b] φιλοσοφοῦσί τε οὐ μόνον οἱ πλουτοῦντες, ἀλλὰ καὶ οἱ πένητες προῖκα τῆς διδασκαλίας ἀπολαύουσι...τοὺς δὲ ἀκροᾶσθαι βουλομένους πάντας οὕτως προσιέμεθα, κἂν πρεσβύτιδες ὦσι κἂν μειράκια. See Origen's reply bk III §§ 44—71 to the sneer of Celsus that weavers, coblers, fullers, old women and children were won by Christians. Semisch Iustin d. Mart. I 32. Lactant. V 15 §§ 3 sq. (?). Iulian. in Cyrill. VII p. 229 with his reply. In all towns and villages, by learned and unlearned, the gospel is preached: even slaves teach their masters' families. Euseb. Demonstrat. Euang. I 6 p. 24. Orig. contr. Cels. II 79. III c. 9 p. 453 Ru. c. 55 p. 484 Ru. Iustin. Apol. I 60 fin. παρ' ἡμῖν οὖν ἔστι ταῦτα ἀκοῦσαι καὶ μαθεῖν παρὰ τῶν οὐδὲ τοὺς χαρακτῆρας τῶν στοιχείων ἐπισταμένων, ἰδιωτῶν μὲν καὶ βαρβάρων τὸ φθέγμα, σοφῶν δὲ καὶ πιστῶν τὸν νοῦν ὄντων, καὶ πηρῶν καὶ χηρῶν τινῶν τὰς ὄψεις· ὡς συνεῖναι οὐ σοφίᾳ ἀνθρωπείᾳ ταῦτα γεγονέναι, ἀλλὰ δυνάμει θεοῦ λέγεσθαι (cf. Iren. III 4 § 1). ib. II 10 fin. to the poor the gospel is preached.

p. 128 l. 30 RE Cypr. De Bono Patient. 3 *qui philosophi non uerbis sed factis sumus, nec uestitu sapientiam sed ueritate praeferimus, qui uirtutum conscientiam magis quam iactantiam nouimus, qui non loquimur magna sed uiuimus.* Minuc. 38 § 8 *nos non habitu sapientiam sed mente praeferimus; non eloquimur magna sed uiuimus.* Cf. Lactant. IV 23 and 24.

p. 128 l. 31 PLATO cet. supr. p. 124 l. 30. Plato Tim. p. 27[c]. Minuc. 19 § 17 *Platoni itaque in Timaeo deus est ipso suo nomine mundi parens, artifex animae, caelestium terrenorumque fabricator, quem et inuenire difficile prae nimia et incredibili potestate et, cum inueneris, in publicum dicere impossibile praefatur.* Cited also by Iustin. Apol. II 10 p. 48[e]. Cohort. ad Gent. 38 p. 37[b]. Athenag. 6 p. 6[d]. 23 p. 26[c]. Clem. Alex. Protrept. VI 68 § 1 p. 59 P. Strom. V c. 12. 79 § 2. Orig. contr. Cels. VII 42. 43. Lactant. I 8 § 1. Euseb. Demonstr. Euang. III 6. Cyrill. Adu. Iulian. I 1 (VI 30[e]). Cic. De Nat. Deor. I § 30 p. 117 M. Tert. and Minuc. have *difficile (-em)*, the others ἀδύνατον exc. Iustin. ll. cc. (ἀσφαλές). Brucker Hist. Crit. Philos. III 374. Eisenlohr Argumenta ab Apologetis

t. II p. 201. My note on Luther and good works p. 42. Ios. Contr. Apion. II 31 (p. 385 l. 7—9 ed. Dind.).

FACTITATOREM c. 21 p. 68 l. 22 (ib. *uniuersitas*). Two other exx. in Oehler's ind. [Thes. knows no others. A. S.]

p. 128 l. 33 On the moral change in Christians ad nat. I 16. Iustin. Apol. I 14. 36. Ep. ad Diogn. 5 seq. Tatian cc. 24. 25 pp. 161—2. Minuc. 28—31. Cypr. Ad Donat. 4 p. 4 seq. ed Brem. De Bono Patient. 16. Arnob. II 15. Bingham VI 1 1 and 2. Semisch II 191 seq. Neander Hist. Planting (Eng. 1851) II 244 ff.

p. 128 l. 34 Arnob. I 64 m. *qui matrimonia persuadent habenda esse communia, qui cum pueris cubitant formosis lasciuientibus nudis.* Bremi on Cic. De Fato c. 5.

CORRVPTOREM De Anim. 1 (p. 300 l. 6 Wiss.) *adulescentiam uitians.* Cassian. Collat. XIII 5 § 3 *denique famosissimus ille ipsorum Socrates hoc (ut ipsi concelebrant) de se non erubuit profiteri. nam cum intuens eum quidam φυσιογνώμων dixisset: ὄμματα παιδεραστοῦ, id est, oculi corruptoris puerorum, et inruentes in eum discipuli inlatum magistro uellent ultum ire conuicium, indignationem eorum hac dicitur conpressisse sententia, παύσασθε, ἑταῖροι· εἰμὶ γάρ, ἐπέχω δέ.* Minuc. 38 § 7 *philosophorum supercilia contemnimus, quos corruptores et adulteros nouimus et tyrannos et semper aduersus sua uitia facundos.* Sen. ep. 104 § 28 *obiecta est religionum uiolatio, et iuuentutis corruptela, quam immittere in deos, in patres, in r. p. dictus est.* Xen. Mem. I 1 § 1 *ἡ μὲν γὰρ γραφὴ κατ' αὐτοῦ τοιάδε τις ἦν. ἀδικεῖ Σωκράτης οὓς μὲν ἡ πόλις νομίζει θεοὺς οὐ νομίζων, ἕτερα δὲ καινὰ δαιμόνια εἰσφέρων· ἀδικεῖ δὲ καὶ τοὺς νέους διαφθείρων.* ib. I 2 § 1 *θαυμαστὸν δὲ φαίνεταί μοι καὶ τὸ πεισθῆναί τινας, ὡς Σωκράτης τοὺς νέους διέφθειρεν, ὃς πρὸς τοῖς εἰρημένοις πρῶτον μὲν ἀφροδισίων καὶ γαστρὸς πάντων ἀνθρώπων ἐγκρατέστατος ἦν.* Apol. 19 seq. cf. the testimony of Alcibiades in Plat. Sympos. (cf. 212^{b}), cited by Lucian Vit. Auct. 15 (see below), and the admiring language of Justin, Origen (Contr. Cels. III 66; cf. Plin. ep. III 11 § 5 n. p. 186), Clem. Alex. Lasaulx p. 14. Luc. Vit. Auct. 15 *παιδεραστής εἰμι καὶ σοφὸς τὰ ἐρωτικά.* Diog. Laert. II 38 (of Anytus) *ἔπειτα καὶ Μέλητον συνέπεισεν ἀπενέγκασθαι κατ'*

αὐτοῦ γραφὴν ἀσεβείας καὶ τῶν νέων διαφθορᾶς. cf. § 40 Menage. Theodoret Graec. Affect. Cur. XII §§ 59. 63. 68. 69.

p. 130 l. 1 PHRYNEN Diog. Laert. VI 60 (of Diogenes the Cynic) *Φρύνης Ἀφροδίτην χρυσῆν ἀναθείσης ἐν Δελφοῖς. τοῦτο ἐπιγράψαι, Τῆς ἀπὸ τῶν Ἑλλήνων ἀκρασίας.*

p. 130 l. 2 SVBANTEM c. 14 p. 48 l. 18 n. De Monog. 15 p. m. Oehler (ed. 1849) ad h. l.

p. 130 l. 3 QVENDAM so *aliquis* in Tert.

SPEVSIPPVM *ἡδονῶν ἥττων ἦν* Diog. Laert. IV 1. cf. 2. Athenaeus VII 279^{d-f}.

ADVLTERIO Sen. ep. 29 § 5, of philosophers, *ostendet mihi alium in adulterio, alium in popina.* Suidas s.u. Moschus.

p. 130 l. 4 VXORI cet. Minuc. 35 § 6 *uos enim adulteria prohibetis et facitis: nos uxoribus nostris solum modo uiri nascimur.* Salùian. De Gubernat. Dei VII § 100 *ita isti de quibus loquimur, qui sic inhibuerunt scorta, ut adulteria, qui et feminas nullis uoluerunt esse feminas nisi maritis suis, et uiros nullis uoluerunt mulieribus esse masculos nisi uxoribus suis, qui euagari obscenas libidines extra legitimum torum non sinunt, leges suas scilicet ad diuinae legis regulam dirigentes, ut nihil sibi in hac re crederent licere, quod deus uoluit non licere.* Clem. Alex. Paedag. II 10 *καὶ ἀρούρης θηλείας ἀπέχεσθαι πάσης, ὅτι μὴ τῆς ἰδίας.* ib. ad fin. *καὶ πρόσωπον εὐπρεπές, ἀλλὰ μόνου τοῦ γεγαμηκότος.*

DEMOCRITVS Lasaulx p. 443 n. 313. Gell. X 17 § 1 to escape distraction. Cic. De Fin. V § 87 *uere falsone.* Plut. II 521^c rejects the tale. Himerius in Phot. Biblioth. (cod. 165. 243).

p. 130 l. 7 OCVLIS Athenag. 32 p. 36^b *ἡμεῖς δὲ τοσοῦτον ἀδιάφοροι εἶναι ἀπέχομεν, ὡς μηδὲ ἰδεῖν ἡμῖν πρὸς ἐπιθυμίαν ἐξεῖναι* cet. Orig. Contr. Cels. I (where cf. cc. 12. 27. 29) *οἱ δὲ ὑπὸ αὐτῶν ἰδιῶται* etc. Theophil. III 13 pr. *καὶ περὶ σεμνότητος οὐ μόνον διδάσκει ἡμᾶς ὁ ἅγιος λόγος τὸ μὴ ἁμαρτάνειν ἔργῳ, ἀλλὰ καὶ μέχρις ἐννοίας, τὸ μηδὲ τῇ καρδίᾳ ἐννοηθῆναι περί τινος κακοῦ ἢ θεασάμενον τοῖς ὀφθαλμοῖς ἀλλοτρίαν γυναῖκα ἐπιθυμῆσαι.* Iustin. Apol. I 11. Minuc. 31 e.g. § 5 *at nos pudorem non facie, sed mente praestamus.* Blunt Right Use 325.

p. 130 l. 9 DIOGENES De Pall. 4 p. m. (I 940 Oehler) *quod si iam tunc locorum Diogenes de dolio latraret, non caenulentis pedibus, ut tori Platonici sciunt,* < *insultasset* Oehler > *sed omnino totum Empedoclem in adyta Cloacinarum detulisset.* Diog. Laert. VI 25 Men. *πατῶν αὐτοῦ ποτε στρώματα κεκλη-κότος φίλους παρὰ Διονυσίου, ἔφη, Πατῶ νὴν Πλάτωνος κενοσπουδίαν. πρὸς ὃν ὁ Πλάτων Ὅσον, ὦ Διόγενες, τοῦ τύφου διαφαίνεις, δοκῶν μὴ τετυφῶσθαι. οἱ δέ φασι τὸν Διογένην εἰπεῖν,* Πατῶ *τὸν* Πλάτωνος *τῦφον, τὸν δὲ φάναι, Ἑτέρῳ γε τύφῳ, Διόγενες.*

p. 130 l. 10 DECVLCAT Vit. Patr. III 86, of Zacharia, *qui pallium suum deposuit subtus pedes suos et conculcauit illud, et dixit: 'nisi quis fuerit conculcatus, monachus esse non potest.'* The word also in Plin. and Stat. [See also Thes. A. S.]

p. 130 l. 11 PYTHAGORAS Arnob. I 40 *Pythagoras Samius suspicione damnationis iniusta uiuus concrematus in fano est.* Athenag. 31 p. 35[a]. Diog. Laert. VIII 39.

p. 130 l. 12 TYRANNIDEM AFFECTANT Quintil. bis. *tyrannis* Cic. Liu. Ou. Valer.-Max. cet.

p. 130 l. 13 supr. c. 38 p. 110 l. 11. Tatian 11 pr. Kaye 342. Neumann I 125 n. 1. 241 n. 4.

AEQVANIMITATE De Patient. 2 pr. *caninae aequanimitatis stupore.* 3 p. 4 l. 19 Kr. Ter. Plin. Lact. [See Thes. A. S.]

CONGREDIAR ad nat. II 1 pr. *de deis uestris uobiscum.*

p. 130 l. 14 *ἀποκαρτέρησις* in Quintil. VIII 5 § 23. Tert. Adu. Marc. I 14 p. 309 l. 2 Kr. *ἀποκαρτερῶν* (*per inediam discedens*) in Cic. Tusc. I c. 34 § 84. cf. Liddell and Scott *ἀποκαρτερέω* and add Plut. Pericl. 16 § 4. Cf. also my note on Plin. Ep. III 7 § 1 and lexx. s.u. inedia. Supra 4 p. m. p. 16 *non enim et ipsius Lycurgi leges a Lacedaemoniis emendatae tantum auctori suo doloris incusserunt, ut in secessu inedia de semet ipso iudicarit?*

p. 130 l. 15 ETIAM DAMNATVS GRATIAS AGIT c. 1 fin. c. 50 fin. n.

p. 130 l. 16 DEPOSITVM R. Seeberg in Zahn Forschungen V 396. Iuu. 13 60 n.

p. 130 l. 17 EXTRA cf. *extranei* cc. 7. 31.

SIMPLICITATE plain dealing.

CONSISTAM pr. cap. p. 126.

p. 130 l. 19 Ambr. De Elia et Ieiunio c. 12 § 45 (after telling the story of Polemo's conversion) *philosophus postea tantus euaserit, ut esset sobrietatis exemplum, qui fuerat ante ebrietatis ludibrium. non enim unum emendatum illis inuideo; ut doceam genus eorum luxuriae a me non esse simulatum. certe ille si resipuit a uino, fuit tamen semper temulentus sacrilegio.*

p. 130 l. 20 ARISTOTELES from Tatian Or. ad Gr. 2 (cited under *Aristippus* below by Oehler). Diog. Laert. V 4 *Ἀρίστιππος δ' ἐν τῷ πρώτῳ περὶ παλαιᾶς τρυφῆς φησιν ἐρασθῆναι τὸν Ἀριστοτέλην παλλακίδος τοῦ Ἑρμείου, τοῦ δὲ συγχωρήσαντος ἔγημέ τε αὐτὴν καὶ ἔθυεν ὑπερχαίρων τῷ γυναίῳ, ὡς Ἀθηναῖοι τῇ Ἐλευσινίᾳ Δήμητρι.*

p. 130 l. 21 PLATO from Tatian (see last note). The same story in Elias Cret. ap. Greg. Naz. Or. 3 (= 4) [but see Migne P. G. XXXVII p. 702[a] ll. 306 ff., also Chrys. hom. Matth. 33 (34) § 1 pr. A. S.]. cf. Menage on Diog. Laert. III 19 20. Plut. Dio 5. Sen. ep. 47 § 12 *nescis qua aetate...seruire coeperit...Plato.* Lactant. III 25.

p. 130 l. 22 IN PVRPVRA De Pall. 4 a. m. (p. 939) *audio enim et in purpura philosophatum. si philosophus in purpura, cur non et in baxa?* Luc. Vit. Auct. 12 *Ζεύς. ἄλλον κάλει τὸν Κυρηναῖον, τὸν ἐν τῇ πορφυρίδι, τὸν ἐστεφανωμένον.* Hermotimus 86. H., disenchanted of philosophy, vows no more to wear a beard: *τάχα δὲ καὶ πορφυρίδα μεταμφιάσομαι, ὡς εἰδεῖεν ἅπαντες ὅτι μηκέτι μοι τῶν λήρων ἐκείνων μέτεστιν.* Gnomolog. Vat. 41 (Wiener Studien IX 195—6).

SVPERFICIE De Cult. Fem. II 13 (of chastity) *eructat a conscientia in -em*)(*mores.* ib. 11. ad nat. I 5 p. 66 l. 1 Wiss. *qui -e uocabuli infamant ueritatem.*

NEPOTATVR once in Sen. Lactant. III 14 (saying of Aristippus): *illud inter me et nepotes interest, quod isti percaro, ego gratis uoluptates consequar.* On the form (Woodham) cf. *iuuenatur* Hor. Art. Poet. 246.

p. 130 l. 25 SED DICET cet. c. 44 fin. *nemo illic [in carcere] Christianus nisi plane tantum Christianus; aut, si et aliud, iam non Christianus.* Blunt Right Use p. 325.

p. 130 l. 27 ad nat. I 5 ad fin. cf. Lucian Hermotim. e.g. 80—82 (82 f. the master of philosophy bids the parents examine his son their scholar in axioms, syllogisms cet. *εἰ δὲ ἢ τὴν μητέρα ἔτυπτεν ἢ παρθένους συνήρπαζε, τί ταῦτα πρὸς ἐμέ; οὐ γὰρ παιδαγωγόν με ἐπεστήσατε τούτῳ*).

p. 130 l. 28 Lightfoot on Col. 2 8 p. 245. Dict. Bible s.u. philosophy. See esp. omn. De Praescr. Haer. 7 fin. *quid ergo Athenis et Hierosolymis? quid academiae et ecclesiae? quid haereticis et Christianis? nostra institutio de porticu Solomonis est. qui et ipse tradiderat dominum in simplicitate cordis esse quaerendum. uiderint, qui Stoicum et Platonicum et dialecticum Christianismum protulerunt. nobis curiositate opus non est post Christum Iesum, nec inquisitione post euangelium.* ib. 8. 14. De Anim. 3 p. 302 l. 30 Wiss. De Carne Christi 5. Hier. Eph. III 6 4 (VII 666[b]). ep. 22 29 (I 114[c]) *quid facit cum psalterio Horatius? cum euangeliis Maro? cum apostolo Cicero?* Ritter Gesch. der Phil. I 362)(Iustin. Apol. I 46 (Otto ind. s.u. Logos). Iustin. Dial. 75 (?) (with the old man). Clem. Alex. Strom. VI c. 17 § 160. cf. Prud. Contr. Symm. (where ?). Firmic. VIII 6 § 4 *aliud ex fronte pollicentur, aliud latenter in moribus celant: sunt enim austera facie, prolixa barba, obstinata fronte, ut Catonis prorsus institutum imitari uideantur; sed totum hoc fucato mentiuntur affectu; sunt enim natura petulantes, lasciui, semper desideriorum prauis ac libidinosis uoluptatibus inplicati, et qui latenter amorum cupiditatibus semper exaestuent.* Athenag. 11 p. 11[d]. Minuc. 38. Cypr. De Bon. Pat. 3 (quoted above on p. 128 l. 30). Epiphan. Ancorat. 107 (cited by Semisch I 12 Eng. tr.). Eulogy of philosophy Orig. Contr. Cels. I 9. Clem. Alex. Strom. IV §§ 63. 71.

p. 130 l. 29 FAMAE NEGOTIATOR Hieron. ep. (ad Pammach.) 66 § 8. ib. 118 § 5 both cited below c. 47 p. 132 l. 9. Kaye 163.

p. 130 l. 30 OPERATOR u. l. in c. 23 p. m. Lact. Firm. math. uulg. Paulin. Nol. ep. 5 10 f. [add Iren. lat. Hil. Hier. 4 exx. and Aug. 9 exx. at least. Oros. A. S.]. Opposition of word and deed. Sen. ep. 117 § 33 n. [unpublished. A. S.]. Cypr. De Bono Patient. 3 (quoted on p. 128 l. 30).

AEDIFICATOR)(*uastator* Aug. ep. 185 22 pr.

p. 130 l. 31 DESTRVCTOR Adu. Marc. v 5 pr. 15 (p. 628 l. 7 Kr.) (RW cite only h. l. and Cassiod. LS also Hier.). De Spectac. 30 p. 29 l. 14 Wiss. *sabbati*. [See Thes. A. S.]

INTERPOLATOR garbler. De Cult. Fem. I 8 *non ergo natura optima sunt ista, quae a deo non sunt, auctore naturae; sic a diabolo esse intelleguntur, ab interpolatore naturae.* De Anim. 16 fin. De Spectac. 2 p. 3 l. 6 Wiss. *multum interest inter corruptelam et integritatem, quia multum est inter institutorem et interpolatorem*...(p. 4 l. 8 Wiss.) *nos igitur, qui domino cognito etiam aemulum eius inspeximus, qui institutore comperto et interpolatorem una deprehendimus, nec mirari neque dubitare oportet: cum ipsum hominem, opus et imaginem dei, totius uniuersitatis possessorem, illa uis interpolatoris et aemulatoris angeli ab initio de integritate deiecerit.* De Test. Anim. 3 p. 138 l. 1 Wiss. *Satanan denique in omni uexatione et aspernatione et detestatione pronuntias, quem nos dicimus malitiae angelum, totius erroris artificem, totius saeculi interpolatorem.* De Praescr. Haer. 7 p. m. *fuerat < Paulus > Athenis et istam sapientiam humanam, affectatricem et interpolatricem ueritatis, de congressibus nouerat, ipsam quoque in suas haereses multipartitam uarietate sectarum inuicem repugnantium.* Lucif. Calarit. Moriend. Esse 1 p. 284 ll. 3—4 Hartel *interpolator ueritatis* (*Constantius*). [Hier.] Ad Amic. Aegr. ep. II (= 6) 20 (t. XI (2) 105^{b}). Zahn Forschungen v 310 (cf. 312 n. 2). Lucian Hermotim. 59 *καὶ οἱ φιλόσοφοι ἀποδίδονται τὰ μαθήματα ὥσπερ οἱ κάπηλοι, κερασάμενοί γε οἱ πολλοὶ καὶ δολώσαντες καὶ κακομετροῦντες.*

p. 130 l. 32 EXPRESSOR here only.

FVRATOR *ἅπ. εἰρ.*

Cap. XLVII

Ch. XLVII cf. De Praescr. Haer. 7.

p. 130 l. 33 Argument from antiquity c. 19 cod. Fuld. cf. p. 62. De Praescr. Haer. 29—32. Adu. Prax. 2 p. 229 Kr. bis. Philo Vita Mos. II 4. Ioseph. Contr. Apion. I c. 22. Clem. Alex. Strom. I 15 § 72. 21 § 101. 22 § 150. v 14 § 98. Iustin. Apol. I 44 p. 81^{e} seq. *καὶ πάντα, ὅσα περὶ ἀθανασίας ψυχῆς ἢ τιμωριῶν τῶν μετὰ θάνατον ἢ θεωρίας οὐρανίων ἢ τῶν ὁμοίων*

δογμάτων καὶ φιλόσοφοι καὶ ποιηταὶ ἔφασαν παρὰ τῶν προφητῶν τὰς ἀφορμὰς λαβόντες καὶ νοῆσαι δεδύνηνται καὶ ἐξηγήσαντο. cf. c. 54. 59 (Plato borrowed from Moses). Cohort. ad Gent. 14 seq. Theophil. I 14. II 30. 37. III 20 seq. Lactant. IV 5 §§ 8 9. Tatian 31 (the earliest Christian to use the argument, but anticipated by Philo (Geffcken Zwei Apologeten (1907) 31)). Kaye 276.

p. 132 l. 1 Harnack Gesch. der altchristl. Lit. (1893) I 877.

p. 132 l. 2 THESAVRVM c. 19 p. 62 l. 29.

p. 132 l. 4 POETARVM c. 19. Athenag. 24 p. 28^{a} *εἰ δέ τις ἐκ μέρους εἴρηται περὶ τῶν γιγάντων καὶ ποιηταῖς λόγος, μὴ θαυμάσητε, τῆς κοσμικῆς σοφίας καὶ θεολογικῆς ὅσον ἀλήθεια πιθανοῦ διαφέρει διαλλαττουσῶν.* Clem. Alex. Strom. I 17 § 87. Tatian 40 *οὐκοῦν πέφηνε Μωυσῆς ἀπό γε τῶν προειρημένων πρεσβύτερος ἡρώων παλαιῶν, πολέμων, δαιμόνων. καὶ χρὴ τῷ πρεσβεύοντι κατὰ τὴν ἡλικίαν πιστεύειν, ἤπερ τοῖς ἀπὸ τῆς πηγῆς ἀρυσαμένοις Ἕλλησιν οὐ κατ' ἐπίγνωσιν τὰ ἐκείνου δόγματα.* So Justin makes the stories of mythology an invention of demons, garbling true prophecies. Cf. Iustin. Apol. I 20 p. 55. 44 p. 82^{d}. 60 p. 93^{c}. II 10 p. 95. 13 p. 97.

p. 132 l. 6 PHILOSOPHI ad nat. II 2. De Anima 1. 2. 3. 23. 39. De Praescr. Haer. 7. 8. 31. Adu. Hermog. 8. [Iustin.] Cohort. 22 p. 20^{d}. 25 p. 24^{c}. 30 p. 30^{d}. Apol. I 44 p. 81^{c}. 54 p. 89^{c}. 59 p. 92^{c}. Tatian 40 p. 173^{a}. Theophil. I 14 p. 79^{a}. II 37 p. 115^{d}. Cyrill. Adu. Iul. I 1 (VI 7$^{d\,e}$). Euseb. Hist. Eccl. X 1 seq. p. 460 seq. So Pythagoras (Constantine Or. ad Sanct. Coet. (ad calc. Euseb. Vit. Const.) c. 9 § 2). Orig. Contr. Cels. VII 30. Clem. Hom. V 10. 18. Baur Gnosis 376 sqq. 468—471. Philosophy is not originally *κατὰ προηγούμενον*, as O. and N.T., but mediately *κατ' ἐπακολούθημα* from God. Clem. Alex. Strom. I 5 § 30 p. 333. 7 § 37 p. 337. Its source is partly in the law and the prophets ib. V 14 § 140 p. 733 *ἐκ τῆς βαρβάρου* (i.e. Jewish) *φιλοσοφίας πᾶσαν φερομένην τὴν παρ' Ἕλλησι ἐνδεικνύμενοι σοφίαν* and therefore the Lord calls all philosophers thieves (Io. X 8) ib. and I 20 § 100 p. 377. V 13 §§ 86 87 p. 698; with the better reason, because they passed off the stolen goods as their own property, and disfigured it by

additions etc. I 17 §§ 86 87 p. 369 (cited below); and stole from one another VI 2 § 4 p. 737. Still they discovered much for themselves I 17 § 85 p. 369, and added the ornament of form to the stolen goods VI 7 § 55 p. 768. Above all Plato *ὁ τὴν ἀλήθειαν ἐζηλωκὼς τῶν φιλοσόφων, τὸ ἔναυσμα τῆς Ἑβραϊκῆς φιλοσοφίας ζωπυρῶν* Paedag. II 1 § 18 p. 176; *ὁ καὶ ἐν τούτῳ ζηλωτὴς Μωυσέως ὁ πάντα ἄριστος Πλάτων* ib. III 11 § 54 p. 286. The O.T. translated before the LXX (Strom. I 22 § 150 p. 411 agreeing with Aristobulus). Partly the Greeks derived their knowledge mediately through Egypt and the East, [Iustin.] Cohort. 60. Clem. Strom. I 15 § 71 p. 359. V 4 § 26 p. 660 Potter (from Redepenning Origenes I 141). Plato had read the prophets, Orig. Contr. Cels. IV c. 39 fin. p. 533. VII c. 30 p. 715. Euseb. Praep. Euang. XIII 13 § 4 thought that Aristotle held God ordered all things above the moon only, misconstruing Ps. 35 6 *Κύριε, ἐν τῷ οὐρανῷ τὸ ἔλεός σου καὶ ἡ ἀλήθειά σου ἕως τῶν νεφελῶν.* Clem. Alex. Strom. I 17 § 87 *ταῦτα δ᾽ ἂν εἶεν κλέπται καὶ λησταὶ οἱ παρ᾽ Ἕλλησι φιλόσοφοι καὶ πρὸ τῆς τοῦ Κυρίου παρουσίας παρὰ τῶν Ἑβραϊκῶν προφητῶν μέρη τῆς ἀληθείας οὐ κατ᾽ ἐπίγνωσιν λαβόντες, ἀλλ᾽ ὡς ἴδια σφετερισάμενοι δόγματα, καὶ τὰ μὲν παραχαράξαντες, τὰ δὲ ὑπὸ περιεργίας ἀμαθῶς σοφισάμενοι.* Christianity is called *φιλοσοφία*: Suicer s.u. Otto on Tatian 1 n. 1. 31 n. 2. Iust. Dial. c. Tryph. 8 p. 225[b] etc. Tatian 31 pr. *νῦν δὲ προσῆκόν μοι νομίζω παραστῆσαι πρεσβυτέραν τὴν ἡμετέραν φιλοσοφίαν τῶν παρ᾽ Ἕλλησιν.* 40 n. 3. Aug. De Doctr. Christ. II c. 28 thought that Plato had seen Jeremiah in Egypt and read the LXX! an opinion which he abandoned on chronological grounds. De Ciu. Dei VIII 11 p. 337 l. 9 D.[3] Clem. Alex. Strom. V c. 2 §§ 14 ff. pp. 652 ff. (?). Aug. De Ciu. Dei XVIII 37 p. 311 l. 27 D.[3] *tempore prophetarum nostrorum, quorum iam scripta ad notitiam fere omnium gentium peruenerunt, et multo magis post eos fuerunt philosophi gentium...ac per hoc, quantum ad Graecos adtinet, in qua lingua litterae huius saeculi maxime ferbuerunt, nihil habent unde sapientiam suam iactent, quo religione nostra...uideatur antiquior.* Antiquity of Moses, Euseb. Praef. Chron. Praep. Euang. 470[c]. 492[d]. cf. ind. s.u. Moses. [See also Gifford's index, tom. II p. 525. A. S.]

M. the ocean of theology. Theodoret Graec. Affect. Cur. II § 50. Lactant. IV 5 § 6. Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. c. 7 p. 224[d], prophets before philosophers. id. Apol. II 81. 92. Cohort. ad Gr. 28. 31. 32. Plato took much from the Bible, without naming the source, fearing Socrates' fate. [Iustin.] Cohort. 20 p. 18[de]. cf. Clem. Alex. Strom. I fin. II pr. Iustin, of Perseus, Aeacus, Bellerophon, Apol. I 21 § 2. 54 §§ 7. 8. Cyrill.-Alex. 10 in Iulian. pp. 340. 342, ed. Spanheim, 1696. Chrys. in Io. 60 (59) § 4 (?). Euseb. Praep. Eu. 410[bc]. 462[d]. 463[d]. 663[d]. Scripture read by Numa 410[b], by Plato 410[d], by Pythagoras and Numenius 411[a], Amelius the Platonist 540[b]. Ambr. ep. 37 ad Simplician. § 6 *unde tamen hoc* [*omnis sapiens liber*] *plenius hauserit philosophia, de qua patrum disciplina et prudentia, consideremus. nonne primus Noe?* § 28 *quis est qui Sophoclea in medium ferat carmina? ... quanto antiquior Iob, quanto uetustior Dauid? agnoscant ergo de nostris se habere quaecumque praestantiora locuti sunt.* ep. 28 § 1, of Pythagoras, id. De Paradis. § 14 fin., the cardinal virtues a plagiarism from the four rivers of Paradise. id. in Ps. 118, Serm. 2 § 13 fin. Athenag. 9. Iustin. Apol. I 44. Cohort. ad Gent. 14 sq. 19 sq. Minuc. 34 § 4 Holden. Keim Celsus p. 77 n. 2 fin. Arnob. III 6 7 philosophers', especially Cicero's, criticism of Olympian gods. Some muttered that the senate ought to proscribe these writings which confirm Christianity, ib. 7. Orig. Contr. Cels. VI 19 (XIX 332 n. 4 L.).

p. 132 l. 9 HOMINES cet. c. 19 Fuld. p. 62 l. 2 *gloriae homines siquid inuenerant, ut proprium facerent, adulterauerunt.* c. 46 m. p. 128 *mimice philosophi affectant ueritatem et affectando corrumpunt, ut qui gloriam captant.* De Anim. 1 p. 299 l. 9 Wiss. *uir quilibet...nedum philosophus gloriae animal.* ib. 3 pr. *nihil omnino cum philosophis super anima quoque experiremur, patriarchis, ut ita dixerim, haereticorum.* Adu Hermog. 8 fin. *haereticorum patriarchae philosophi.* De Praescr. Haer. 7 (quoted on p. 130, l. 28). ad nat. II 2 (p. 96 l. 1 Wiss.) *ita accedente libidine gloriae ad proprii ingenii opera mutasse.* Theodoret Graec. Affect. Cur. II p. 33 l. 39 philosophers concealed their obligations from vainglory. XII § 32 p. 170 l. 19 [cf. VI § 29 p. 90 l. 9. A. S.]. Arnob. II 50. Hier. ep. 66 § 8

plus debet Christi discipulus praestare quam mundi; philosophus gloriae animal et popularis aurae atque rumorum uenale mancipium est. ib. 118 5 (796b) *philosophus gloriae animal et popularis aurae uile mancipium.* Aug. ep. (56) 118 (of philosophers) *inanis gloriae mancipia*, from Cresoll. Theatrum Veterum Rhetorum v 2. Cic. pro Archia § 26 *ipsi illi philosophi etiam in eis libellis, quos de contemnenda gloria scribunt, nomen suum inscribunt: in eo ipso, in quo praedicationem nobilitatemque despiciunt, praedicari de se ac nominari uolunt.*

p. 132 l. 10 LIBIDINOSI De Virg. Vel. 13 p. m. *ergo quod non potest uideri propter deum fieri, quia sic fieri deus non uult, sequitur, ut hominum gratia fiat, utique primo illicitum, ut gloriae libidinosum.* De Carn. Resur. 32 p. 71 l. 10 Kr. *quis ergo discendi magis adfinis quam praesumendi et credendi diligentior quam contendendi, et diuinae potius sapientiae religiosus quam suae libidinosus.*

p. 132 l. 11 DIGESTIS Kaye 299 cites Adu. Marc. IV 3 p. 428 l. 11 Kr. (he says wrongly c. 2) *et inde sunt nostra digesta.* ibid. IV 5 p. 431 l. 8 Kr. *Lucae digestum.* Cf. ad nat. II 1 p. 94 l. 15 Wiss. *elegi ad compendium Varronis opera, qui rerum diuinarum ex omnibus retro digestis commentatus, idoneum se nobis scopum exposuit.* Oehler there. De Bapt. 1 pr. *felix sacramentum aquae nostrae...non erit otiosum digestum istud, instruens tam eos, qui cum maxime formantur, quam et illos, qui simpliciter credidisse contenti, non exploratis rationibus traditionum intemptatam probabilem fidem per imperitiam portant.*

p. 132 l. 12 Clem. Strom. VI c. [2. 4 § 3 p. 737 P. A.S.].

p. 132 l. 14 etc. ad nat. II 2 p. 95 l. 24 Wiss. (lexx. Col. (1). Tert. De Virg. Vel. 11 [more in Oehler's index. A.S.] Hier. (1) *nam et alias ueritatis simplicitas per scrupulositatem passiuae fidei nutat, et ita accedente libidine gloriae ad proprii ingenii opera mutasse, per quod in incertum abiit etiam quod inuenerant, et facta est argumentationum inundatio de stillicidio uno atque alio ueritatis. inuento enim solum modo deo, non ut inuenerunt exposuerunt, ut de qualitate eius et de natura, et iam de sede disceptent.*

p. 132 l. 17 Ashton (in Woodham) reads from ad nat. l. c. *inuento...Deo adeo* etc.

p. 132 l. 18 seq. De Test. Anim. 1 p. 135 l. 13 Wiss. *consiste in medio, anima, seu diuina et aeterna res es secundum plures philosophos, eo magis non mentieris; seu minime diuina, quoniam quidem mortalis, ut Epicuro soli uidetur, eo magis mentiri non debebis, seu de caelo exciperis, seu de terra conciperis, seu numeris seu atomis concinnaris, seu cum corpore incipis, seu post corpus induceris, unde unde et quoquo modo hominem facis animal rationale, sensus et scientiae capacissimum.* De Anima passim e.g. 3 p. 303 l. 3 Wiss. *alii immortalem negant animam, alii plus quam immortalem adfirmant, alii de substantia, alii de forma, alii de una quaque dispositione disceptant: hi statum eius aliunde ducunt, hi exitum aliorsum abducunt, prout aut Platonis honor aut Zenonis uigor aut Aristotelis tenor aut Epicuri stupor aut Heracliti maeror aut Empedoclis furor persuaserunt.* Cf. Sir John Davies on the soul.

p. 132 l. 20 De Anima 5 pr. *si non alios e contrario inspexerint et quidem plures, corpus animae uindicantes. nec illos dico solos, qui eam de manifestis corporalibus effingunt, ut Hipparchus et Heraclitus ex igni, ut Hippon et Thales ex aqua, ut Empedocles et Critias ex sanguine, ut Epicurus ex atomis, si et atomi corpulentias de coitu suo cogunt, ut Critolaus et Peripatetici eius ex quinta nescio qua substantia, si et illa corpus, quia corpora includit; sed etiam Stoicos allego, qui spiritum praedicantes animam paene nobiscum....*Aug. De Ciu. Dei XVIII 41 (II 318 20 sq. Dombart).

p. 132 l. 21 ATOMIS Usener Epicurea fr. 354 p. 238)(Lactant. De Ira Dei 10 § 28.

p. 132 l. 22 PLATONICI ad nat. II 2 p. 96 l. 6 Wiss. *Platonici quidem curantem rerum et arbitrum et iudicem, Epicurei otiosum et inexercitum et, ut ita dixerim, neminem; positum uero extra mundum Stoici, intra mundum Platonici.* De Spectac. 30 p. 29 l. 1 Wiss. *praeterea sapientes illos philosophos coram discipulis suis una conflagrantibus erubescentes, quibus nihil ad deum pertinere suadebant.* cf. Spencer on Orig. Contr. Cels. I c. 21 p. 17 l. 10 (annot. p. 16[a]). Arnob. II 56 f. *deos nonnulli esse abnegant; prorsus dubitare se alii an sint uspiam dicunt; alii uero exsistere neque humana curare: immo alii perhibent et*

rebus interesse mortalium et terrenas administrare rationes. Cic. De Nat. Deor. I § 123 *omnino nihil curantem, nihil agentem.* Ennius Telamo (Fr. 269 R.: 353—5 Vahlen, in Cic. Diu. II § 104, cf. I § 132. De Nat. Deor. III § 79) *ego deum genus esse semper dixi et dicam caelitum, | sed eos non curare opinor, quid agat humanum genus: | nam si curent, bene bonis sit, male malis, quod nunc abest.*

p. 132 l. 23 EPICVREI omn. Adu. Marc. I 25 p. 325 l. 14 Kr. etc. IV 15 p. 463 l. 28 Kr. V 19 p. 645 l. 11 Kr. Usener's Epicurea fr. 363 p. 242, fr. 360 pp. 241. 234. Menage on Diog. Laert. X 139. See the doctrines of Damis in Luc. Iup. Trag. 4. 17. 35—49. Icaromen. 9. 35 pr. Ennius (quoted in last note). Cic. De Nat. Deor. I § 85 *nonnullis uideri uides Epicurum, ne in offensionem Atheniensium caderet, uerbis reliquisse deos, re sustulisse.* Lucr. II 59. 646—651. Lactant. III 17 § 4 (from Epicurus) *inreligiosus audit deos nihil curare.*

p. 132 l. 24 VT ITA DIXERIM = ad nat. II 2 p. 96 l. 8 Wiss. De Cult. Fem. II 9 f. De Bapt. 8 p. 207 l. 25 Wiss. [add Adu. Marc. I 3 p. 294 l. 7 Kr. A. S.]. Pacian Paraen. 3 *quadrantis unius, ut ita d., rei.* Paulin. Nol. ep. 13 26 *ut sic dixerim.*

p. 132 l. 25 EXTRA MVNDVM so Epicurus Sen. ben. IV 19 §§ 1, 2. VII 13 § 1 (Usener p. 242 l. 3 n. 30 p. 243 l. 10).

p. 132 l. 28 INNATVS cf. *infectus, indictus.* c. 11 p. 63 l. 22. Adu. Hermog. 5 p. 131 l. 16 Kr. *innatus deus: an non innata et materia? semper deus: an non semper et materia? ambo sine initio, ambo sine fine.* 12 p. 139 l. 10 Kr. 18 p. 145 l. 26 Kr. Adu. Marc. I 3 p. 293 l. 22 Kr. 15 p. 310 l. 4 Kr. Adu. Prax. 19 p. 262 l. 16 Kr. De Anim. 4 p. 303 l. 27 Wiss. *hoc Plato excludit, innatam et infectam animam uolens.* ibid. 21 p. 335 l. 5 Wiss. cf. Ambr. Hexaëmeron I 1 § 1. 3 § 8. Clem. Recogn. III 11 pr. and f. Lucian Icaromen. 8 πρῶτα μὲν γὰρ αὐτοῖς ἡ περὶ τοῦ κόσμου γνώμη διάφορος, εἴ γε τοῖς μὲν ἀγέννητός τε καὶ ἀνώλεθρος εἶναι δοκεῖ. Arnob. II 58 *si suspicionum exponere uolueritis audaciam, potestis explicare ac promere, mundus iste qui nos habet utrumne non sit genitus an tempore in aliquo constitutus?* Lactant. VIII 1 §§ 6—10.

p. 132 l. 29 DISSOLVBILEM (the word Cic. Tert. De Anim. 14 pr. ter. (Lact. in LS not in RW) Chalcid. in Tim. p. 54 [Aug.

in LS. A. S.]) (The question argued. Aug. ep. 137 12.) De Test. An. 4 (p. 138 l. 18 Wiss.) *opinio Christiana et... Epicurea grauior quae te ab interitu defendit.* De Carn. Resur. 1 p. 25 l. 14 Kr. *nihil esse post mortem Epicuri schola est.* Plin. VII 55 § 188 *post sepulturam uariae manium ambages. omnibus a suprema die eadem quae ante primum, nec magis a morte sensus ullus aut corpori aut animae quam ante natalem* cet. §§ 189 190. Arnold Die Unsterblichkeit der Seele betrachtet nach den vorzüglichsten Ansichten des Alterthums 1870. Spiess Entwickelungsgeschichte der Vorstellungen vom Zustande nach dem Tode auf Grund vergleichender Religionsforschung 1877. Rohde Psyche^3 (Tübingen 1903) passim. Friedländer III c. 6 (last). Boissier La Fin du Paganisme, l. III c. 1.

p. 132 l. 31 INSTRVMENTVM c. 17 pr. 18 pr. *litteraturae.* De Praescr. Haer. 38. Adu. Marc. IV 1 p. 423 l. 4 Kr. *alterius instrumenti, uel, quod magis usui est dicere, testamenti.* ib. IV 25 (?). ib. 2 bis e.g. *euangelicum* p. 426 l. 7 Kr. ib. V 1 *creatoris* p. 569 l. 22 Kr. 2 fin. *Actorum.* 6 p. 590 l. 2 Kr. 3 p. 619 l. 18 Kr. 14 p. 625 l. 16 Kr. *prophetae.* 16 fin. *euangelii.* De Ieiunio 11 (*testamenti*, p. 289 l. 4 Wiss.). De Monogam. 7 infr. De Cult. Fem. I 3 fin. *omne instrumentum Iudaicae litteraturae per Esdram constat restauratum.* De Pudic. 10 p. 240 l. 12 Wiss. *diuinum i.*)(*apocrypha.* Adu. Prax. 20 p. 263 l. 11 Kr. *totum instrumentum utriusque testamenti.* De Carne Chr. 2 *originalia -a Christi.* Adu. Hermog. 19 pr. *originale -um Moysi.* 20 p. 149 l. 2 Kr. Hier. ep. 106 2. 108 11 and 26. Kaye 299. [In [Pelag.] Ps.-Hier. in Rom. 7 12 it is an editorial interpolation. A. S.]

INTERVERTERVNT Sen. Frontin. Apul. Apol. 83 fin. *ueritas olim -sa nunc se fert* (or to embezzle, *argentum* Plaut. Petr. 107 cf. dig. XVI 3 22 bis).

p. 134 l. 1 NOVICIOLAM: *-lus* 'a catechumen.' De Paenit. 6 pr. 'modern.' cf. 37 *hesterni.* Keim's Celsus p. 10 n. 3. [Cf. Ambst. *nouellus*, passages in Study of Ambrosiaster, p. 121. A. S.]

p. 134 l. 2 PARATVRAM in this sense De ieiun. 11 pr. *utriusque testamenti paraturam.* De Monogam. 7 pr. *ad uetera transeamus instrumenta legalium scripturarum, ut per ordinem de omni nostra paratura retractemus.* The word also Apol. 22

p. 78 l. 4. 27. Scorp. 10 p. 169 l. 2 Wiss. Adu. Valent. 16 p. 196, l. 8 Kr. Oehler on De Spectac. 4.

Scorpiace c. 10 p. 168 l. 12 Wiss. *illic constitues et synagogas Iudaeorum, fontes persecutionum, apud quas apostoli flagella perpessi sunt, et populos nationum cum suo quidem circo, ubi facile conclamant, 'usque quo genus tertium?'* (heathen, Jews, Christians). ad nat. I 7 fin. (al. 8 pr.) *tertium genus dicimur. an cynopennae aliqui uel sciapodes uel aliqui de subterraneo antipodes?* (Elsewhere ad nat I 20, Lamprid. Alex. Seu. 23 § 7 mean by *tertium genus* eunuchs.) Praedicatio Petri in Clem. Alex. Strom. VI 5 § 41 *τὰ γὰρ Ἑλλήνων καὶ Ἰουδαίων παλαιά, ὑμεῖς δὲ οἱ καινῶς αὐτὸν τρίτῳ γένει σεβόμενοι Χριστιανοί.* Ep. ad Diogn. 1 p. 494^c *καὶ τί δή ποτε καινὸν τοῦτο γένος ἢ ἐπιτήδευμα εἰσῆλθεν εἰς τὸν βίον νῦν καὶ οὐ πρότερον;* (Otto ad loc.) 2 p. 494^d *λόγου καινοῦ.* Apol. Aristid. 2 *φανερὸν...ὅτι τρία γένη εἰσὶν ἀνθρώπων ἐν τῷδε τῷ κόσμῳ· ὧν εἰσιν οἱ τῶν παρ' ὑμῖν λεγομένων θεῶν προσκυνηταί, καὶ Ἰουδαῖοι, καὶ Χριστιανοί.*

p. 134 l. 3 ADVLTERAVERVNT c. 46 p. 128 l. 21.

p. 134 l. 4 similar *caueat* c. 46 f. *sed dicet aliquis, etiam de nostris excedere quosdam a regula disciplinae; desinunt tum Christiani haberi penes nos.*

p. 134 l. 5 NOTA VARIETAS SECTAE Woodham cites Orig. Contr. Cels. V c. 64 p. 273. VI c. 11 p. 282 ed. Cant.

p. 134 l. 6 Fuld. Hau. *et ex uarietate defectionem uindicet ueritatis.*

p. 134 l. 7 EXPEDITE Plaut. Cic. Sen. ep. 40 § 12 *disputabat.* Suet. Tert. De Cult. Fem. I 3 med. *hoc si non tam expedite haberet.*

ADVLTERIS i.e. heretics. germ of Praescr. Haer. (Bonwetsch p. 45). cf. Adu. Marc. I 1 p. 292 l. 7 Kr. cf. 22 (?). De Carne Chr. 2. Heraldus pp. 181 259.

p. 134 l. 8 REGVLAM See Havercamp. Kaye 270.

p. 134 l. 9 COMMENTATORES Apul. Seru. ad Aen. IX 748. cod. Tert. Apol. 10. De Cor. Milit. 7 p. m. De Carn. Resur. 33 (this ex. in lex.) p. 72 l. 18 Kr. De Carne Chr. 22 pr. Adu. Valent. 34 fin. De Anima 46 p. 377 l. 3 Wiss. Adu. Marc. IV 2 p. 426 l. 26 Kr. Charis. I p. 98. [Rufin.] Comm. in Joel. I 1. [See Thes. A. S.]

p. 134 l. 10 Kaye 203. 545. supr. c. 22 p. 76 l. 31 n. De Praescr. Haer. 40 *quaeritur, a quo intellectus interpretetur eorum quae ad haereses faciant: a diabolo scilicet, cuius sunt partes interuertendi ueritatem...ideo neque a diabolo immissa esse spiritalia nequitiae* [= Eph. 6 12. A. S.], *ex quibus etiam haereses ueniunt, dubitare quis debet.*

p. 134 l. 11 Tatian 40. Iustin. Apol. I 54. Athenag. 24 f.

AEMVLATIONEM c. 2 a. f. *intellegere potestis non scelus aliquod in causa esse, sed nomen, quod quaedam ratio aemulae operationis insequitur.*

p. 134 l. 12 ADVLTERIA De Idolol. p. 30 l. 13 Wiss. *qui falsis deis seruit, sine dubio adulter est ueritatis, quia omne falsum adulterium est.* De Cult. Fem. I 8 *colorum iniustorum.* Adu. Marc. I 20 pr. *aiunt enim Marcionem non tam innouasse regulam separatione legis et euangelii, quam retro adulteratam recurasse.* De Praescr. Haer. 17 *tantum ueritati obstrepit adulter sensus, quantum et corruptor stilus.* 18 fin. *necesse est enim et illos dicere a nobis potius adulteria scripturarum et expositionum mendacia inferri, qui proinde sibi defendant ueritatem.* 30 p. m. *hos ut insigniores et frequentiores adulteros ueritatis nominamus.* 31 pr. *parabolae...quae bonum semen frumenti a domino seminatum in primore constituit, auenarum autem sterilis faeni adulterium ab inimico diabolo postea superducit.* De Spect. 2 p. 3 l. 1 Wiss. *uis aemula ex aduerso adulterandis usibus diuinae conditionis.* 23 p. 23 l. 25 Wiss. *non amat falsum auctor ueritatis; adulterium est apud illum omne quod fingitur.* De Pudic. 10 p. 240 l. 11 Wiss. *scriptura Pastoris...adultera et ipsa.*

p. 134 l. 18 RIDEMVR c. 18 (after speaking of the judgement) *haec et nos risimus aliquando.*

IVDICATVRVM Geffcken Zwei Apologeten (1907) 279 n. 10 and p. 96.

p. 134 l. 19 GEHENNAM Kaye 247 seq. 327 seq. De Carn. Resur. 34 p. 74 l. 10 Kr. *porro autem recipimus animae inmortalitatem, ut perdita non in interitum credatur, sed in supplicium, id est, in gehennam.* 35 saepe. De Paenit. 5 fin. 12 bis.

p. 134 l. 21 DECACHINNAMVR ad nat. I 19 p. 19 l. 12 Wiss. *quo facilius rideatis et resolutius decachinnetis.* gl. in Mai Auct. Class. VI 519 *decachinnantem, deridentem.*

PYRIPHLEGETHON ad nat. I 19 fin. *apud nos quoque Pyriphlegethontis et Elysii non alias condicio disponitur. nec mythici ac poëtici soli talia canunt.* Arnob. II 14 pr. citing Plat. Phaed. p. 113 *audetis ridere nos, cum gehennas dicimus et inexstinguibiles quosdam ignes, in quos animas deici ab earum hostibus inimicisque cognouimus? quid Plato idem uester in eo uolumine, quod de animae immortalitate composuit, non Acherontem, non Stygem, non Cocytum fluuios et Pyriphlegethontem nominat, in quibus animas asseuerat uolui mergi exuri.* Lactant. VII 26. Martian. Cap. §§ 166 195. Euseb. Praep. Euang. XIV 7. Derided Cic. De Nat. Deor. II § 5 (Hippocentaur).

p. 134 l. 22 PARADISVM Kaye 249 citing De Carn. Resur. 26 fin. (Pamel. I p. 31 E. n. 9.) cf. 17. 63. De Spect. 30. Adu. Marc. III 24. IV 34 p. m. A lost treatise of T.'s de paradiso named De Anim. 55 fin. 56. 58 pr. De Patient. 9. 16. Scorpiac. 12 p. m. Pusey n. c pp. 116—120.

p. 134 l. 24 ZONAE Verg. Ou. Plin. Mela Macr. Mart. Cap. cf. Scorp. 10 p. 168 l. 19 Wiss. *erit certe etiam carcer in caelo, carens sole aut ingratis luminosus, et uincula fortasse de zonis, et eculeus axis ipse qui torquet.* Luc. IV 675 *zonae exusta calentis.* IX 314 *aequora...zonae uicina perustae.* Claud. Idyll. 4 9 *flammigerae.* Arnob. I 52 pr. *per igneam zonam.*

p. 134 l. 25 ELYSII Adu. Marc. IV 34 p. 537 l. 5 Kr. Zeno De Resurr. (III 412[b] Bibl. Max. Patr. [= ed. Ballerini, Veron. 1739, p. 121. A. S.]) *poetae autem melius, qui duplicem uiam apud inferos ponunt, impiorum unam, quae ducit in Tartarum, piorum aliam quae ducit ad Elysium, eo fortius addentes, quod defunctorum ibidem non tam formae quam facta noscantur.*

ORO VOS c. 20 f. 40 a. m. (*o. te* Cic. Att. bis. Liu. Sen. in lexx.) De Carne Chr. 2 m. 19 fin. *oro te* De Exhort. Cast. 8 pr. Ad Vxor. I 3. 4 fin. De Cor. Milit. 14. ad nat. I 7 p. 68 l. 25 Wiss. p. 70 l. 7 Wiss. II 4 p. 102 l. 2 Wiss. (Apul. Metam. V 31 *-amus.*)

p. 134 l. 26 DE NOSTRIS SACRAMENTIS Minuc. 34 § 4 Holden, *animaduertis philosophos eadem disputare, quae dicimus, non quod nos simus eorum uestigia subsecuti, sed quod illi de diuinis praedicationibus prophetarum umbram interpolatae ueritatis imitati sint.* Cf. De Testim. An. 5 p. 141 l. 9 Wiss. Adu.

Marc II 17 p. 358 l. 27 Kr. *sed ante Lycurgos et Solonas omnes Moyses et deus. nulla posteritas non a primordiis accipit.* Kaye 337.

p. 134 l. 32 VERITATEM)(IMAGO Ambr. Off. I § 239. [Add Pelag. in Rom. 2, 26 and often. A. S.] '*-ate*' in reality Ambr. ib. § 235 pr. Cic. Orator § 38 Sandys. 158 191 231. Quintil. II 10 § 11.

CAP. XLVIII

p. 134 l. 33 LABERIVS incert. XXI (p. 301 Ribbeck).

p. 134 l. 34 PYTHAGORAE on metempsychosis De Anima 28 p. 347 l. 7 Wiss. (cf. n. on p. 136 l. 8). 31 p. 352 l. 5 Wiss. (cf. n. on p. 136 l. 3). 32 pr. *thamnus et piscis fui, inquit* (Empedocles) ; *cur non magis et pepo?* 33 fin. *deus itaque iudicabit plenius, quia extremius per sententiam aeternam tam supplicii quam refrigerii, nec in bestias sed in sua corpora reuertentibus animabus.* 34 p. 358 l. 22 Wiss. 35 p. 360 l. 10 Wiss. De Carn. Resurr. 1 p. 25 l. 15 Kr. *satis est autem, si non minor philosophia Pythagorae et Empedoclis et Platonici immortalem animam e contrario reclamant, immo adhuc proxime etiam in corpora remeabilem adfirmant. etsi non in eadem, etsi non in humana tantum modo, ut Euphorbus in Pythagoram, Homerus in pauum re* <*dire*> *censeantur. certe recidiuatum animae corporalem pronuntiauerunt.* De Testim. Anim. 4 p. 138 l. 18 Wiss. *ea opinio Christiana etsi honestior multo Pythagorica, quae te non in bestias transfert ; etsi plenior Platonica, quae tibi etiam dotem corporis reddit.* ad nat. I 19 p. 91 l. 15 Wiss. *attamen quanto acceptabilior nostra praesumptio est, quae in eadem corpora redituras defendit. nobis autem quanto uanius traditum est, hominis spiritum in cane uel mulo aut pauone rediturum!* Menage on Diog. Laert. VIII 5. Rohde Psyche 427. 568 3. 454—6. Ambr. De Exc. Fratr. II 65—70, 127—131. De Fide Resurr. §§ 50. 129—133. 136. Aug. De Gestis Pelagii § 18 x 486 c Gaume. ib. x 1089 bc, 1094 a. in Ps. 88 serm. 2 § 5. ib. 146 18 a. m. Rittershusius on Porph. Vit. Pythag. 45. Arnob. II 16 fin. *quod si et illud est uerum, quod in mysteriis secretioribus dicitur, in pecudes aeque alias beluas ire animas improborum, postquam sunt humanis corporibus exutae, manifestius comprobatur*

uicinos nos esse neque internallis longioribus disparatos. Chrys. Hom. 66 (65) in Ioann. 3 (VIII 399[a]) ἀλλ' ἅπερ ἡ παρ' ἡμῖν χήρα ἐπίσταται, ταῦτα Πυθαγόρας οὐδέπω ᾔδει· ἀλλ' ἔλεγον [ἔλεγεν? A. S.] ὅτι θάμνος ἐστὶν καὶ ἰχθὺς καὶ κύων γίνεται ἡ ψυχή. Lasaulx Studien p. 26. Orig. Contr. Cels. V 21 (p. 245 with Spencer's note, n. pp. 200—1 L.). Ridiculed by Lucian, Menipp. 20. Minuc. 11 § 1. 34 § 5 (Holden's n. pp. 171—2) *sic etiam condicionem renascendi sapientium clariores, Pythagoras primus et praecipuus Plato, corrupta et dimidiata fide tradiderunt; nam corporibus dissolutis solas animas nolunt et perpetuo manere et in alia noua corpora saepius commeare. addunt istis et illa ad retorquendam ueritatem, in pecudes aues beluas hominum animas redire.* Athenag. Suppl. 36 and Tert. Carn. Resurr. passim. Cf. also the doctrine of Empedocles, ἤδη γάρ ποτ' ἐγὼ γενόμην κοῦρός τε &c. Aristot. De Anima I 3 Πυθαγορείους μύθους. Lactant. III 18 §§ 15–16. VII 12 § 30. 23 § 2. Ennius ap. Lucr. I 116. Ou. Metam. XV 160. Tatian. 10 p. 149[c]. Plat. Polit. X 618 sq. Pyth.-Euph.(?) Hermias 2 οἱ δὲ ἀποθηριοῦσιν αὐτήν [the soul]...ὕδωρ γίνομαι, ἀὴρ γίνομαι, πῦρ γίνομαι· εἶτα μετ' ὀλίγον οὔτ' ἀὴρ οὔτε πῦρ, θηρίον με ποιεῖ, ἰχθύν με ποιεῖ· πάλιν οὖν ἀδελφοὺς ἔχω δελφῖνας. [Tert. De Anim. 32] ὅταν δὲ ἐμαυτὸν ἴδω, φοβοῦμαι τὸ σῶμα καὶ οὐκ οἶδα ὅπως αὐτὸ καλέσω, ἄνθρωπον ἢ κύνα ἢ λύκον ἢ ταῦρον ἢ ὄρνιν ἢ ὄφιν ἢ δράκοντα ἢ χίμαιραν. εἰς πάντα γὰρ τὰ θηρία ὑπὸ τῶν φιλοσοφούντων μεταβάλλομαι. Resurrection derided. Paul at Athens [Acts 17 31]. Lucian Gallus 1. 5 ἀλεκτρυὼν φιλόσοφος and ind., Peregrin. 13 p. 336 πεπείκασιν αὑτοὺς οἱ κακοδαίμονες τὸ μὲν ὅλον ἀθάνατοι ἔσεσθαι καὶ βιώσεσθαι τὸν ἀεὶ χρόνον. Hier. Contr. Rufin. I c. 20 (t. II 476[b]) *Origeni tuo licet tractare de* μετεμψυχώσει, *innumerabiles mundos introducere, et rationabiles creaturas aliis atque aliis uestire corporibus, Christumque dicere saepe passum, et saepius passurum.* id. ep. [ad Auitum] 124 § 7 (923[c]) [also in Matth. 11 vv. 14—15 etc. A. S.]. Rufin. Comm. in Symbol. 39 a. m. of Manichaeus (cf. Aug. Contr. Faust. XX 20 f.) *coaeternas deo animas secundum Pythagoreos in pecudes et animalia et bestias redire per diuersos nascendi circulos adstruit.* Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. 4 §§ 2 ff. Iren. II 33 § 2.

p. 136 l. 3 De Anima 31 p. 351 l. 20 Wiss. *sed et Pyrrhus ille fallendis piscibus agebat, Pythagoras contra nec edendis ut animalibus abstinens.*

p. 136 l. 5 ad nat. I 19 p. 91 l. 17 Wiss.

p. 136 l. 6 LAPIDIBVS c. 37 pr. Theophil. ad Autol. III § 30 (Blunt Right Use 371). *domesticae seditioni tela* [whence?]. St Paul [2 Cor. 11, 25, Acts 14, 5. A. S.].

NEC SALTEM Rönsch Das N. T. Tert.'s 615—16. once in Tac. Ann. III 5. Iuu. 9 147—8 *uotum miserabile nec spes his saltem.* Minuc. 10 § 3. 12 § 1.

p. 136 l. 7 POPVLO c. 49 p. 142 l. 6 n.

SI cet. Ambr. De Fid. Resurr. 65 *transire ac demigrare in corpora dicunt animas ne mundus intereat. sed quid sit difficilius ipsi adserant, transire animas an redire; sua repetere an noua quaerere?* cf. 70 *potestis ergo, gentiles, reformationem negare naturae, qui mutationem potestis adserere!*

p. 136 l. 8 De Spectac. 30 p. 29 l. 4 Wiss. (philosophers) *animas aut nullas aut non in pristina corpora redituras adfirmabant.* ad nat. I 19 fin. *philosophi de animarum reciprocatione et iudicii distributione confirmant.* De Anima 28 pr. *quis ille nunc uetus sermo apud memoriam Platonis de animarum reciproco discursu, quod hinc abeuntes eant illuc, et rursus huc ueniant et uiuant, et dehinc e uita abeant, rursus ex mortuis effici uiuos?* in another sense Liu. XXI 58 § 4 *uentus... cum iam spiritum includeret nec reciprocare animam sineret.*

p. 136 l. 12 QVIS IN QVAM BESTIAM Simonides of Amorgus. [7 (8) l. 2 cet. ed. Hiller-Crusius. A. S.] De Anima 33 p. 356 l. 8 Wiss. *quid putas futuram animam homicidae? aliquod, credo, pecus lanienae et macello destinatum, ut perinde iuguletur, quia et ipsa iugulauerit, perinde decorietur, quia et ipsa despoliauerit*...(p. 357 l. 9 Wiss.) *cui non expediat apud Pythagoran et Empedoclen sententiam pati? nam et qui laboribus atque seruitiis puniendi, in asinos utique et mulos recorporabuntur, quantum sibi de pistrinis et aquilegis rotis gratulabuntur!*...(l. 24) *Age nunc, ut poetae in pauos uel in cycnos transeant, si uel cycnis decora uox est, quod animal indues uiro iusto Aeaco? quam bestiam integrae feminae Didoni? quam uolucrem patientia, quam pecudem sanctimonia, quem*

piscem innocentia sortientur? Aug. De Gen. ad Litt. VII 10 15 (Migne XXXIV 361) *rapaces in miluos (post mortem posse transferri).*

p. 136 l. 17 RATIO cet. De Test. Anim. 4 p. 138 l. 17 Wiss. *nulla ratio sit iudicii sine ipsius exhibitione qui meruit iudicii passionem.* cf. de Carn. Res. 14, 15. Arn. II § 17 (?). Tatian 6 pr. p. 145[d] *καὶ διὰ τοῦτο καὶ σωμάτων ἀνάστασιν ἔσεσθαι πεπιστεύκαμεν μετὰ τὴν τῶν ὅλων συντέλειαν,...ἅπαξ δέ, τῶν καθ' ἡμᾶς αἰώνων πεπερασμένων, [καὶ] εἰς τὸ παντελὲς διὰ μόνων τῶν ἀνθρώπων τὴν σύστασιν [ἔσεσθαι] χάριν κρίσεως.* Ambr. De Fide Resurr. 52 *cum omnis uitae nostrae usus in corporis animaeque consortio sit, resurrectio autem aut boni actus praemium habeat aut poenam improbi; necesse sit corpus resurgere, cuius actus expenditur. quomodo enim in iudicium uocabitur anima sine corpore, cum de suo et corporis contubernio ratio praestanda sit?*

p. 136 l. 19 Arnob. II 14, of Plato, *et homo prudentiae non prauae et examinis iudiciique perpensi rem inenodabilem suscipit, ut cum animas dicat immortales perpetuas et corporali soliditate priuatas, puniri eas dicat tamen et doloribus afficiat sensuum. quis autem hominum non uidet, quod sit immortalis, quod simplex, nullum posse dolorem admittere? quod autem sentiat dolorem, immortalitatem habere non posse?* Athenag. Res. 21 p. 63[d] *καὶ μὴν καὶ πλημμελημάτων κρινομένων οὐ σῴζεται τῇ ψυχῇ τὸ δίκαιον, εἴγε μόνη τίνοι δίκην ὑπὲρ ὧν ἐνοχλοῦντος τοῦ σώματος καὶ πρὸς τὰς οἰκείας ὀρέξεις ἢ κινήσεις ἕλκοντος ἐπλημμέλησεν.* ib. 18 p. 61[a]. Kaye 182 n. 9.

p. 136 l. 20)(De Anima cap. (ult.) 58 why should not the soul suffer before the judgement—is it (p. 394 l. 16 Wiss.) *quia et carnis opperienda est restitutio ut consortis operarum atque mercedum?*...(p. 395 l. 9) *nouit et apud inferos anima et gaudere et dolere sine carne, quia et in carne et inlaesa si uelit dolet et laesa si uelit gaudet*...(l. 16) *ergo uel propter haec congruentissimum est animam, licet non exspectata carne, puniri, quod non sociata carne commisit.* De Test. Anim. 4 pr. *adfirmamus te manere post uitae dispunctionem et exspectare diem iudicii, proque meritis aut cruciatui destinari aut refrigerio utroque sempiterno, quibus sustinendis necessario tibi substantiam pristinam eius-*

demque hominis materiam et memoriam reuersuram. quod et nihil mali ac boni sentire possis sine carnis passionalis facultate, et nulla ratio sit iudicii sine ipsius exhibitione, qui meruit iudicii passionem. omn. Prud. c. Symm. I 328—330 ap. La Cerda.

p. 136 l. 22 MERVERVNT Ambr. De Fide Resurr. 88 *haec est series et causa iustitiae, ut quoniam corporis animique communis est actus (quia quae animus cogitauit, corpus effecit) utrumque in iudicium ueniat utrumque aut poenae dedatur aut gloriae reseruetur. nam propemodum absurdum uidetur, ut...animus subdatur iniuriae, alienae reus culpae, caro quiete potiatur auctor aerumnae.* [Iustin.] Cohort. ad Graec. 27 p. 26[c] (de Aridaeo etc.).

p. 136 l. 23 SED QVOMODO cet. Tatian 6 p. 146[a] *ὥσπερ γὰρ οὐκ ὢν πρὶν ἢ γενέσθαι τίς ἤμην οὐκ ἐγίνωσκον, μόνον δὲ ἐν ὑποστάσει τῆς σαρκικῆς ὕλης ὑπῆρχον, γεγονὼς δὲ ὁ μὴ πάλαι διὰ τῆς γενέσεως τὸ εἶναι πεπίστευκα· τὸν αὐτὸν τρόπον ὁ γενόμενος καὶ διὰ θανάτου μηκέτι ὤν, αὖθίς τε μηκέθ᾽ ὁρώμενος, ἔσομαι πάλιν, ὥσπερ μὴ πάλαι γεγονὼς εἶτα γεννηθείς.* Soul corporeal. Adu. Hermog. 35. De Anim. 5. 6. 7. 8. 9. 22. 36. 37. De Carne Chr. 11. De Carn. Resurr. 17. 45. 53. Adu. Marc. V 10. 15. Aug. Gen. ad Litt. IV c. 34 § 55 and De Haeres. c. 86 and Fulgent. l. 2 (Pamel. I 30 31).

p. 136 l. 24 De Carn. Resurr. 11 fin. *idoneus est reficere qui fecit, quanto plus est fecisse quam refecisse, initium dedisse, quam reddidisse. ita restitutionem carnis faciliorem credas institutione.* Minuc. 34 § 8 *ceterum quis tam stultus aut brutus est, ut audeat repugnare hominem a deo, ut primum potuisse fingi, ita posse denuo reformari? nihil esse post obitum et ante ortum nihil fuisse: sicut de nihilo nasci licuit, ita de nihilo licere reparari! porro difficilius est id quod non sit incipere, quam id quod fuerit iterare.* Prudent. Contr. Symm. II 191—4 *quin et corporibus parilis consortia poenae decernam, possum quoniam renouare fauillas antiquam in faciem, nec desperanda potestas, qui potui formare nouum, renouabo peremptum.* Ambr. De Fide Resurrectionis 64 fin. *cur miremur renasci posse quod fuerit, cum uideamus natum esse quod non fuit?* Lactant. VII 23 § 5 *si a principio deus hominem nescio quo inenarrabili modo instituit, credamus ab*

eodem restitui ueterem posse, qui nouum fecit. Chrysolog. Serm. 59, Migne P. L. LII 365[a] *crede, homo, de morte resurgere te posse, quia antequam uiueres, nil fuisti.* [Aug.] De Verb. Apost. serm. 34 [opp. V app. serm. 109 p. 199] *utique plus est facere quod numquam fuit, quam reparare quod fuerit* etc. Tatian 6 p. 146[a]. Athenag. Res. 3. Greg. Homil. 26 in Euang. § 12 *longe minus est deo reparare quod fuit quam creasse quod non fuit. aut quid mirum, si hominem ex puluere reficit, qui simul omnia ex nihilo creauit?* Aug. De Ciu. Dei I 12.

p. 136 l. 30 Lactant. VII 23 § 5.

p. 138 l. 2 NON DIFFICILE Ashton (ap. Woodh.) *quod difficilius.*

p. 138 l. 8 INTERFECTA Iul. Firm. err. prof. rel. 8 *quis uos... ad hoc tantum facinus impegit, ut profano nefariae cupiditatis errore et mori me dicatis uestro arbitrio et uiuere?*

De Carn. Resurr. 12 pr. *dies moritur in noctem et tenebris usquequaque sepelitur. funestatur mundi honor, omnis substantia denigratur. sordent silent stupent cuncta, ubique iustitium est. [quies rerum] ita lux amissa lugetur. et tamen rursus cum suo cultu cum †dote cum sole eadem et integra et tota uniuerso orbi reuiuescit, interficiens mortem suam, noctem, rescindens sepulturam suam, tenebras, heres sibimet existens, donec et nox reuiuescat, cum suo et illa suggestu. redaccenduntur enim et stellarum radii, quos matutina succensio exstinxerat; reducuntur et siderum absentiae, quas temporalis distinctio exemerat: redornantur et specula lunae, quae menstruus numerus adtriuerat. reuoluuntur hiemes et aestates, uerna et autumna cum suis uiribus moribus fructibus.* Minuc. 34 § 12 *sol demergit et nascitur; astra* cet.: see Holden's note. Pearson Art. XI. Ambr. De Fide Resurrect. § 10 *caelum ipsum non semper stellarum micantium globis fulget, quibus quasi quibusdam insignitur coronis, non semper ortu lucis albescit, radiis solis inrutilat. sed assiduis uicibus ille quidam mundi uultus gratissimus umenti noctium caligat horrore. quid gratius luce? quid sole iucundius? quae cotidie occidunt; decessisse tamen haec nobis non moleste ferimus, quia eum redire praesumimus.* 53 *prima igitur resurrectionis fides usus est mundi rerumque status omnium, generationum series, successionum uices, obitus*

ortusque signorum, diei et noctis occasus eorumque cotidie tamquam rediuiua successio. Catullus 5 4 *soles occidere et redire possunt* etc. Epiphan. Ancorat. 84. Cyrill. Cateches. 18. Theophil. I 13 p. 77[d]. Zeno De Resurr. (Bibl. Max. Patr. III 413[a] seq.) [= ed. Ballerini, Veron. 1739, p. 128. A.S.] *stellae praecipites* cet. *sol cotidie nascitur, eademque die, qua nascitur, moritur.* Clem. ep. I 24 § 3 e.g. *κοιμᾶται ἡ νύξ, ἀνίσταται ἡ ἡμέρα, nox dormitio est, dies surrectio.* Kaye 258.

p. 138 l. 9 Theophil. I 13 *κατανόησον τὴν ἀνάστασιν τῆς σελήνης τὴν κατὰ μῆνα γενομένην, πῶς φθίνει ἀποθνήσκει ἀνίσταται πάλιν.*

p. 138 l. 10 FRVCTVS cet. De Carn. Resurr. 12 p. 41 l. 8 Kr. *etiam terrae de caelo disciplina est: arbores uestire post spolia, flores denuo colorare, herbas rursus imponere, exhibere eadem quam absumpta sint semina nec prius exhibere quam absumpta. mira ratio: de fraudatrice seruatrix; ut reddat, intercipit* etc. Ambr. De Fide Resurr. §§ 9. 53 *nam quid de fructibus loquar? nonne tibi uidentur occidere, cum decidunt; resurgere, cum reuirescunt? quod satum est resurgit, quod mortuum est resurgit et in eadem genera in easdem species reformatur...54 quid dubitas de corpore corpus resurgere? granum seritur, granum resurgit... flos resurrectionis immortalitas est, flos resurrectionis incorruptio est.* 55–57 f. *ex natura est resurgere nascentia omnia, contra naturam est interire.* 132. Chrys. Hom. 66 (65) in Io. c. 2 f. c. 3 pr. Chrysol. Serm. 59 (= 118) *quare dubitas quod resurgas, cum tibi totum quod in rebus est cotidie sic resurgat? sol occidit et resurgit, dies sepelitur et redit, menses, anni, fructus, semina, cum transeunt, ipsa moriuntur, cum redeunt, sua ipsa morte reuiuiscunt, et ut resurrectorum tu iugi et uernaculo instruaris exemplo, quoties dormis et uigilas, toties moreris et resurgis.* Cyrill.-Hier. [cat. 18 c. 10, P. G. XXXIII 1028[c], et passim. A.S.]. Prud. Cathemer. X 15. 129. Adu. Symm. II 195 *non desunt exempla* etc. Maximus in Tradit. Symbol. homil. 83, Migne P.L. LVII 440[a]. Euseb. Emisen. (? Gallican?) Homil. De Resurr. [Aug.] De Verb. Apost. Serm. 34 (opp. V app. serm. 109 p. 199 (on 1 Cor. 15 42)). Zeno ib.[loc]. [see n. on l. 8.] Firmicus 3 p. 79 Halm *mortem ipsius dicunt quod semina collecta conduntur, uitam rursus quod iacta semina annuis*

uicibus refunduntur [so Haupt for *reconduntur*]. Damascen. De Orthod. Fide ad fin. [Pelag. in 1 Cor. 15, 36 seq. A.S.]

p. 138 l. 11 OMNIA PEREVNDO SERVANTVR De Carn. Resurr. 12 p. 41 l. 16 Kr. *semel dixerim: uniuersa conditio* [=*creatura*] *recidiua est. quodcumque conueneris, fuit; quodcumque amiseris,* <*erit*>, *nihil non iterum est; omnia in statum redeunt, cum abscesserint; omnia incipiunt, cum desierint; ideo finiuntur, ut fiant; nihil deperit, nisi in salutem. totus igitur hic ordo reuolubilis rerum testatio est resurrectionis mortuorum.* Zeno Veron. De Resurr. in Biblioth. Max. Patr. III 412[h] [= Ballerini p. 128 A.S.] *non homines tantum sed paene omnia suis mortibus uiuunt.*

p. 138 l. 13 TITVLO PYTHIAE Clem. Alex. Paedag. III 1 p. 250 P. *ἦν ἄρα, ὡς ἔοικεν, πάντων μέγιστον μαθημάτων τὸ γνῶναι αὑτόν.* Minuc. 17 § 1 *nec recuso, quod Caecilius adserere inter praecipua connisus est, hominem nosse se et circumspicere debere, quid sit, unde sit, quare sit.* Lactant. I 1 § 25 *haec enim prauitatis est causa, ignoratio sui.* Archiv f. lat. Lex. IX 72. Iuu. 11. 27 n.

p. 138 l. 14 AD HOC Ad Martyr. 6. Arnob. IV 6 f. Oros. VII 1 3. Migne LII 750[a] pr. 753[b]. Adu. Valent. 25 p. 201 l. 19 Kr. De Praescr. Haer. 1. 2 pr. Adu. Marc. V 10 p. 607 l. 11 Kr. Cic. Sall. Liu. Tac. Hor. Sat. II 1 36. 6 42. 8 25. Hand p. 123. cf. *in hoc enim uenerat* Tert. De Patient. 3 p. 4 l. 15 Kr. Arnob. II 63 pr.

p. 138 l. 15 De Carn. Resurr. 63 pr. Ambr. De Fide Resurr. 58 *sequitur illud quod gentiles plerumque perturbat, quomodo fieri possit ut quos mare absorbuerit, ferae dilacerauerint, bestiae deuorauerint, terra restituat.* Minuc. 34 §§ 9—10 *tu perire et deo credis, si quid oculis nostris hebetibus subtrahitur? corpus omne, siue arescit in puluerem, siue in umorem soluitur uel in cinerem comprimitur uel in nidorem tenuatur, subducitur nobis: sed deo elementorum custodia reseruatur.* Tatian c. 6 p. 146[a b] *κἂν πῦρ ἐξαφανίσῃ μου τὸ σαρκίον, ἐξατμισθεῖσαν τὴν ὕλην ὁ κόσμος κεχώρηκεν· κἂν ἐν ποταμοῖς κἂν ἐν θαλάτταις ἐκδαπανηθῶ, κἂν ὑπὸ θηρίων διασπασθῶ, ταμείοις ἐναπόκειμαι πλουσίου δεσπότου.* Athenag. Res. 2—3 with schol. and Otto's n. 11. Aug. De Ciu. Dei XXII 20 p. 600 l. 10 D.[2] Enchirid. 88 *non perit deo terrena materies, de qua mortalium*

creatur caro, sed in quemlibet puluerem cineremue soluatur, in quoslibet halitus aurasque diffugiat, in quamcumque aliorum corporum substantiam uel in ipsa elementa uertatur, in quorumcumque animalium, etiam hominum, cibum cedat carnemque mutetur, illi animae humanae puncto temporis redit, quae illam primitus, ut homo fieret, uiueret, cresceret, animauit. Constit. Apostol. v 8. Theodoret v § 26 (?), §§ 42 sqq. (?).

p. 138 l. 16 PRODEGERIT Herald. on Apol. 18 a. m. p. 58 l. 12. Adu. Marc. v 6 p. 589 l. 3 Kr.

p. 138 l. 18 SEMPER Tatian 6 *οὐχ ὡς οἱ Στωϊκοὶ δογματίζουσι κατά τινας κύκλων περίοδους, γινομένων ἀεὶ καὶ ἀπογινομένων τῶν αὐτῶν οὐκ ἐπί τι χρήσιμον.* ib. 3 p. 143 *τὸν γὰρ Ζήνωνα διὰ τῆς ἐκπυρώσεως ἀποφαινόμενον ἀνίστασθαι πάλιν τοὺς αὐτοὺς ἐπὶ τοῖς αὐτοῖς, λέγω δὲ Ἄνυτον καὶ Μέλητον ἐπὶ τῷ κατηγορεῖν...παραιτητέον.*

p. 138 l. 19 INGRATIS cc. 4. 27. Adu. Valentin. 26 p. 203 l. 3 Kr. Adu. Marc. v 7 p. 595 l. 14 Kr.

p. 138 l. 20 PRAEDICAVIT c. 21 bis (p. 72 l. 8 n.). Scorpiace 11 fin. (10 exx.). De Cult. Fem. I 3 *de omnibus -atis eius.* Adu. Iud. 13 pr. Adu. Marc. IV 10 a. m. p. 445 l. 11 Kr., p. 446 l. 20 Kr. Cypr. ep. 63 §§ 2 7 8 cet. Jahrbb. 1888 508—9. Migne CVI 48 d: *praedicator* a prophet c. 18 p. 58 l. 17. Cypr. De Bon. Pat. 16.

p. 138 l. 21 EX DIVERSITATE De Pall. 2 *proinde diuersa in unum ex demutatione diuersa sunt. denique diuersitatis discordiam uices foederant.* omn. Adu. Marc. I 16 p. 311 l. 7 Kr.

p. 138 l. 22 INANIMALI Charis. Apul. Macr., MSS and Hertz in Liu. XXI 32 § 7 (Madv. Wölffl. Weissenb. *-nima*) Tert. Adu. Hermog. 44 p. 174 l. 8 Kr. *cui etiam inanimalia et incorporalia laudes canunt apud Danihelem.* ib. 36 p. 166 l. 6 Kr. *omnia denique mouentur aut a semet ipsis, ut animalia, aut ab aliis, ut inanimalia.* ad nat. II 11 pr. Iren. IV 4 3. [Add, for *inanimalis*, also Iren. IV 37. 6, Apul. (?) Porf. Hil. Char. Macr. Hier. Claud.-Don. Aug. A. S.]

p. 138 l. 28 LIMES Sen. ep. 36 § 10 *mors quam pertimescimus et accusamus, intermittit uitam, non eripit; ueniet iterum, qui nos in lucem reponet dies.*

p. 138 l. 30 OPPANSA c. 16 p. 52 l. 31.

p. 138 l. 31 EXPVNGENDVM c. 21 p. 70 l. 15. Kaye 347.

p. 140 l. 4 Kaye 268—9.

p. 140 l. 6 SVBMINISTRATIONEM Adu. Marc. IV 39 p. 554 l. 11 Kr. Ambr. De Virginitate § 100 *pecuniarum*. Hexaëm. 5 § 61. Victorin. in Philipp. I 15. Hier. in Eph. II (c. 4 16). Aug. Enchirid. 27 c. Resp. Iulian. II 146. Iren. praef. § 3. Fulgent. c. Fab. fr. 3 p. 756 Migne bis. ib. fr. 30. [Add Rufin. 3 other exx. fr. Aug. in CSEL LX index. A. S.]

INCORRVPTIBILITATIS lexx. have this ex. and one other of Tert.: add Adu. Valent. 14 p. 193 l. 6 Kr. Ad Vxor. I 7 pr. Aug. ep. 148 11 pr. De Trinitat. IV § 24 fin. Collat. cum Maxim. Max. § 14 (XLII 732 l. 1 Migne). Rönsch. 217. 1 Pet. 3 4 (Sitzungsber. d. bayer. Akad. 1876 630—1). Iren. [I 30 § 11. A. S.] III 11 § 8. IV 38 § 4. 39 § 4. V 2 § 2. 13 § 3 bis. Claud. Mam. An. I 3 17. [Also Lucif. Ambst. Rufin. Pelag. Sulp.-Seu. *Auell.* A. S.]

p. 140 l. 8 HVMANO cf. *igni humano* c. 37 p. 108 l. 4.

p. 140 l. 10 ERVCTANS Aug. De Ciu. Dei XXII 11 p. 587 l. 16 D.[3] *nunc uero non solum in terris, uerum etiam sub terris ita est, ut eum eructent uertices montium.*

NON ABSVMIT Prudent. Hamartig. 838 *carpunt tormenta fouentque materiam sine fine datam, mors deserit ipsa aeternos gemitus ac flentes uiuere cogit.* Cassiod. in Psalm. [20, 10. R. W.] *absumit ut seruet, sic seruit ut cruciet, dabiturque miseris uita immortalis et poena seruatrix.*

p. 140 l. 11 EROGAT spends. c. 44 pr. *cum tot iusti impendimur, cum tot innocentes erogamur.* Oehler on Scorpiac. 6 p. 158 l. 2 Wiss. De Praescr. Haer. 2 pr. *febrem denique inter ceteros mortiferos et cruciarios exitus erogando homini deputatam.* Minuc. 35 § 3 *ignes Aetnae montis et Veseui montis et ardentium ubique terrarum flagrant nec erogantur.* Lactant. VII 21 §§ 3 *non erit caro illa, quam deus homini superiecerit, huic terrenae similis, sed insolubilis ac permanens in aeternum, ut sufficere possit cruciatibus et igni sempiterno, cuius natura diuersa est ab hoc nostro.... 5 una eademque ui ac potentia et cremabit impios et recreabit, et quantum e corporibus absumet, tantum reponet ac sibi ipse aeternum pabulum subministrabit, quod poetae in uulturem Tityi transtulerunt. ita*

sine ullo reuirescentium detrimento aduret tantum ac sensu doloris adficiet. Cf. Orientii Commonitor. 154—5.

MONTES De Paenit. 12 pr. *quid illum thesaurum ignis aeterni aestimamus, cum fumariola quaedam eius tales flammarum ictus suscitent, ut proximae urbes aut iam nullae exstent, aut idem sibi de die sperent? dissiliunt superbissimi montes ignis intrinsecus fetu, et quod nobis iudicii perpetuitatem probat. cum dissiliant, cum deuorentur, numquam tamen finiuntur. quis haec supplicia interim montium non iudicii minantis exemplaria deputabit? quis scintillas tales non magni alicuius et inaestimabilis foci missilia quaedam et exercitoria iacula consentiet?* Pacian paraen. 11, Migne P. L. XIII 1088[d] 1089[a], who borrows the passage, names Aetna *Lisaniculus* (?) [u.l. *Siculus*] *Vesuuius*. Aug. De Ciu. Dei XXI 4 p. 491 l. 22 D.[2] *quidam notissimi Siciliae montes, qui tanta temporis diuturnitate ac uetustate usque nunc ac deinceps flammis aestuant atque integri perseuerant.*

p. 140 l. 12 QVI DE CAELO TANGITVR, SALVVS EST cet. Quintil. Decl. 264 (lex.) *quo quis loco fulmine ictus fuerit, eodem sepeliatur.* Festus p. 190 l. 8 ed. Lindsay *si hominem fulminibus occisit, ne supra genua tollito.* Plin. II 54 § 145 *hominem ita exanimatum cremari fas non est, condi terra religio tradidit.* Artemidor. II 8 p. 81 ed. Rigalt *οὐ γὰρ οἱ κεραυνωθέντες μετατίθενται, ἀλλὰ ὅπου ἂν ὑπὸ τοῦ πυρὸς καταληφθῶσιν, ἐνταῦθα θάπτονται.*

Cap. XLIX

p. 140 l. 16 PRAESVMPTIONES c. 19 cod. Fuld. p. 62 *fiducia, quam praesumptionem uocatis.* De Test. Anim. 4 p. 138 l. 18 Wiss. *ea opinio Christiana* [of the resurrection]...*propter suum nomen soli uanitati et stupori et, ut dicitur, praesumptioni deputatur. sed non erubescimus, si tecum erit nostra praesumptio*...ib. ad fin. *sed forsitan de sensu post excessum tui certior sis quam de resurrectione...,cuius nos praesumptores denotamur.* De Anim. 48 p. 379 ll. 13, 15 Wiss. Rosengren De Elocut. Sen. p. 38.

p. 140 l. 17 POETIS Lactant. VII 22.

p. 140 l. 18 NOS INEPTI Lact. IV 13 § 14 *cur igitur uulgo pro stultis et uanis et ineptis habemur, qui sectamur magistrum*

etiam ipsorum deorum confessione sapientem! VII 26 § 8. Often in Arnob. I 28 *et illi cati sapientes prudentissimi nobis uidentur...nos hebetes stolidi fatui obtusi pronuntiamur et bruti.* II 5 f. (Orelli) (= 2 pr. Hild.) *nisi forte obtusi et fatui uidentur hi uobis, qui per orbem iam totum conspirant et coeunt in istius credulitatis assensum.* II 13 pr. 34 pr. III 15 p. m. Orig. Contr. Cels. III 55. Philosophers V 35. Neander's Julian § 12. [Clem. Alex. Strom. II § 120. VI § 67 devil sent philosophy. I 16, 80 § 5 p. 366. VI 8, 66 § 1 pp. 773. 17, 159 §§ 1 ff. pp. 822—3.] Minuc. 5 § 4. 12 § 7 *satis est pro pedibus aspicere, maxime indoctis impolitis rudibus agrestibus: quibus non est datum intellegere ciuilia, multo magis denegatum est disserere diuina.* Greg. Naz. Or. 4 c. Iulian. 1 § 39, P.G. XXXV 565[a]. Theophil. III 4 p. 119[c] (?) fol. 266 (?). Theodoret Graec. Affect. Curat. prol. [add Ps.-Aug. Quaest. Vet. et Nou. Test. CXXVII, 110 § 6. 114 § 5. A.S.].

p. 140 l. 21 MELIORES FIERI COGVNTVR c. 45 pr. *nos igitur soli innocentes. quid mirum, si necesse est? enimuero necesse est. innocentiam a deo edocti et perfecto eam nouimus ut a perfecto magistro reuelatam et fideliter custodimus ut ab incontemptibili dispectore mandatam.* Ad Scap. 2 fin. *in silentio et modestia agimus, singuli forte noti magis, quam omnes, nec aliunde noscibiles, quam de emendatione uitiorum pristinorum.* Athenag. 36 p. 39[a] *τοὺς δὲ μηδὲν ἀνεξέταστον εἶναι παρὰ τῷ θεῷ, συγκολασθήσεσθαι δὲ καὶ τὸ ὑπουργῆσαν σῶμα ταῖς ἀλόγοις ὁρμαῖς τῆς ψυχῆς καὶ ἐπιθυμίαις πεπεισμένους, οὐδεὶς λόγος ἔχει οὐδὲ τῶν βραχυτάτων τι ἁμαρτεῖν.* Tzschirner 306 sq. Iustin. Apol. I 12. 18—24. Theophilus III cc. 12—13 pp. 125—6.

p. 140 l. 22 REFRIGERII c. 39 p. 114 l. 22.

ITAQVE etc. Athenag. 36 p. 39[b] *εἰ δέ τῳ λῆρος πολὺς δοκεῖ τὸ σαπὲν καὶ διαλυθὲν καὶ ἀφανισθὲν σῶμα συστῆναι πάλιν, κακίας μὲν οὐκ ἂν εἰκότως δόξαν ἀποφεροίμεθα διὰ τοὺς οὐ πιστεύοντας ἀλλ' εὐηθείας· οἷς γὰρ ἀπατῶμεν ἑαυτοὺς λόγοις ἀδικοῦμεν οὐδένα.* Lactant. V 12 §§ 3—4 *si uobis sapientes uidemur, imitamini; si stulti, contemnite aut etiam ridete, si libet. nobis enim stultitia nostra prodest. quid laceratis, quid adfligitis? non inuidemus sapientiae uestrae, hanc stultitiam*

malumus, hanc amplectimur. Iustin. Apol. I 68 pr. *καὶ εἰ μὲν δοκεῖ ὑμῖν λόγου καὶ ἀληθείας ἔχεσθαι, τιμήσατε αὐτά· εἰ δὲ λῆρος ὑμῖν δοκεῖ, ὡς ληρωδῶν πραγμάτων καταφρονήσατε καὶ μὴ ὡς κατ᾽ ἐχθρῶν κατὰ τῶν μηδὲν ἀδικούντων θάνατον ὁρίζετε.*

p. 140 l. 28 INACCVSATIS only ex. in lexx. Add ad nat. I 2 p. 60 l. 31 Wiss. *soletis inaccusatos et indefensos non temere damnare.*

IN EIVSMODI = *in talibus.* c. 15 p. m. *eorum qui eiusmodi factitant.* Oehler on De Bapt. 12 p. 631 (= p. 211, l. 6 Wiss.). De Idolol. 21 fin. *in e. ridere.* ad nat. I 5 p. 66 l. 4 Wiss. 10 fin. Cypr. ep. 3 (62) p. 171. So *huiusmodi*: De Cult. Fem. II 9. De Exhort. Cast. 1 pr. 4 a. m. 12 p. m. Ad Vxor. II 7. ad nat. II 1 p. 94 l. 14 Wiss. De Monogam. 16 p. m. Hermas I 2 3 *quicumque huiusmodi operantur.* uulg. Sap. 16 9 *ab h.* Apul. Metam. VIII 26. XI 16. Iren. III 11 9. Concil. Tolet. 11 c. 12. James Apocr. anecd. (1893) p. 11 l. 7 *pro h.* Archiv f. lat. Lex. VIII 237.

p. 140 l. 30 IGNIBVS ad Mart. 6 accidental fires, beasts escaping from confinement to be expected by Christians and meditated on. e.g. *lamnae* Euseb. Hist. Eccl. V 1 § 21, *tunica molesta* De Martyr. Palaest. 4 § 12, red hot iron chair, Hist. Eccl. V 1 §§ 38. 56.

p. 142 l. 2 NOSTRVM ARBITRIVM c. 27 p. 92 l. 13 n. Lactant. V 13 § 2 *sed illi malitia et furore caecantur ne uideant, stultosque arbitrantur esse qui, cum habeant in potestate supplicia sua uitare, cruciari tamen et emori malunt; cum possint ex eo ipso peruidere, non esse stultitiam, in quam tanta hominum milia per orbem totum una et pari mente consentiant.* Minuc. 37 § 3 *quot ex nostris non dexteram solum sed totum corpus uri cremari sine ullis eiulatibus pertulerunt, cum dimitti praesertim haberent in sua potestate.*

p. 142 l. 6 VVLGVS c. 35 m. *nec ulli magis depostulatores Christianorum, quam uulgus.* 37 pr. *quoties etiam praeteritis uobis suo iure nos inimicum uulgus inuadit lapidibus et incendiis!* 50 p. 144 l. 24 *boni praesides, meliores multo apud populum si Christianos immolaueritis.* 48 p. 136 ll. 6—7 *a populo.*

VANE De Fug. in Persec. 5 pr. (superl. De Pudic. I p. 221

l. 22 Wiss.). De Carn. Resurr. 51 (?). Adu. Marc. I 5 fin. V 6 p. 589 l. 3 Kr. 7 p. 596 l. 11 Kr. 9 p. 603 l. 19 Kr. 10 pr. II 26 pr. *-ius*. IV 10 pr. Adu. Valent. 12 p. 191 l. 14 Kr. De Praescr. Haer. 1. Clem. Rom. 40. Apul. uulg. (6 exx.). Aug. in Ps. 59. 2. Ambr. Off. I § 244 pr. 245 pr. Archiv f. lat. Lex. II 20 [Add Aug. conf. X 38, c. litt. Petil. II 51 § 118. A. S.]

p. 142 l. 7 Ad Scap. 1 *magisque damnati quam absoluti gaudemus* (Blunt Right Use 192 n. 4 5 finds a contradiction, see on l. 12).

Cap. L

p. 142 l. 12 Here 'he represents the Christians as willing to suffer, but having no delight in the danger before them. Then (ad Scap. 1 and 2) he represents them as volunteering persecution, and as having greater satisfaction in being condemned than in being acquitted' Blunt Right Use 192 cf. p. 234. 236. Kaye 134—7 seq. Minuc. 29 § 7 *cruces etiam nec colimus nec optamus*. Cf. Iustin. Apol. I 57. Dial. c. Tryph. 121 pp. 349—50 no sun-worshipper a martyr. Apol. II 11 no follower of Socrates a martyr.

p. 142 l. 16 PROELIVM EST Lactant. V 11 § 11—17, the most cruel judges are those who boast that their administration is bloodless; they employ the sorest tortures: *in excogitandis poenarum generibus nihil aliud quam uictoriam cogitant. sciunt enim certamen esse illud et pugnam*: example of a Christian seen by L. in Bithynia, tortured at intervals during two years. Ambr. Hexaëm. IV § 32 f.

p. 142 l. 17 Minuc. 37 § 1 *uicit enim qui quod contendit obtinuit*. Lactant. De Mort. Persec. 16. Orig. Contr. Cels. I 3 fin. On the persecutions Sagittarius, Gallonius, Kortholt.

p. 142 l. 19 OBDVCIMVR are convicted. c. 46 pr. *incredulitas, dum de bono sectae huius obducitur, quod usui iam et de commercio innotuit*. De Carn. Resurr. 2 p. 26 l. 26 Kr. *carneum enim atque corporeum probantes eum, proinde et obducimus...obducti dehinc < et > de deo carnis auctore et de Christo carnis redemptore, iam et de resurrectione carnis reuincentur*. De Carne Christi 19 pr. *hoc quidem capitulo ego potius utar, cum adulteratores eius obduxero*.

p. 142 l. 20 VICIMVS, CVM OCCIDIMVR Ambr. ep. 18 11. Otto on Iustin. Dial. Tr. 110 p. 337ᵇ. Lactant. v 13 § 5 *contemptus mortis.* § 11 *nam cum uideat uulgus dilacerari homines uariis tormentorum generibus et inter fatigatos carnifices inuictam tenere patientiam; existimant, id quod res est, nec consensum tam multorum nec perseuerantiam morientium uanam esse; nec ipsam patientiam sine deo cruciatus tantos posse superare.* § 12...*nostri autem (ut de uiris taceam) pueri et mulierculae tortores suos taciti uincunt et exprimere illis gemitum nec ignis potest.* ib. 22 §§ 18—23. vi 17 §§ 8—9. Euseb. Hist. Eccl. viii 6 § 4 *νικηφόρος.* § 5 *τῆς ἐνθέου νίκης ἀπηνέγκαντο βραβεῖα.* Iustin. Apol. i 2 fin. *ὑμεῖς δ' ἀποκτεῖναι μὲν δύνασθε, βλάψαι δ' οὔ.* Otto ad loc. ib. 57 *οὐ γὰρ δεδοίκαμεν θάνατον.* Dial. c. Tryph. 96 *μὴ πειθομένων ἡμῖν μήτε ἐκείνων μήτε ὑμῶν, ἀλλὰ ἀρνεῖσθαι ἡμᾶς τὸ ὄνομα τοῦ Χριστοῦ ἀγωνιζομένων, θανατοῦσθαι μᾶλλον αἱρούμεθα καὶ ὑπομένομεν, πεπεισμένοι ὅτι πάνθ' ὅσα ὑπέσχηται ὁ θεὸς διὰ τοῦ Χριστοῦ ἀγαθὰ ἀποδώσει ἡμῖν.* Athenag. Suppl. 3 fin. *νικήσομεν γὰρ αὐτούς, ὑπὲρ ἀληθείας ἀόκνως καὶ τὰς ψυχὰς ἐπιδιδόντες.* Antonin. in Euseb. Hist. Eccl. iv 13 § 3 *οὓς εἰς ταραχὴν ἐμβάλλετε, βεβαιοῦντες τὴν γνώμην αὐτῶν ἥνπερ ἔχουσιν, ὡς ἀθέων κατηγοροῦντες. εἴη δ' ἂν ἐκείνοις αἱρετὸν τὸ δοκεῖν κατηγορουμένοις τεθνάναι μᾶλλον ἢ ζῆν ὑπὲρ τοῦ οἰκείου θεοῦ. ὅθεν καὶ νικῶσι προϊέμενοι τὰς ἑαυτῶν ψυχάς, ἤπερ πειθόμενοι οἷς ἀξιοῦτε πράττειν αὐτούς.* Lactant. De Mort. Persec. 16 *quam iucundum illud spectaculum deo fuit, cum uictorem te cerneret, non candidos equos aut immanes elephantos, sed ipsos potissimum triumphatores currui tuo subiugantem! hic est uerus triumphus, cum dominatores dominantur. uicti enim tua uirtute ac subiugati sunt, quandoquidem nefanda iussione contempta omnes apparatus ac terriculas tyrannicae potestatis fide stabili ac robore animi profligasti* etc. [Hieron.] Regula Monachorum 22 Vall. t. xi (2) 466 c = Migne xxx (ed. 1865) 383 d *tropaea nostrae uitae non pompis sed miseriis reportantur.* Ambros. De Fide Resurrect. 45 *uicerunt mortem, uicti persecutores sunt.* Antony in his life by Athanas. (Euagr.) 79.

p. 142 l. 21 OBDVCIMVR criminals before execution were blindfolded. Cic. Rab. perd. § 16. Liu. i 26 §§ 6, 7 *caput*

obnubito, infelici arbori reste suspendito... i lictor, colliga manus. Ammian. Marcel. XIV 7 § 21 *causarum legitima silente defensione, carnifex rapinarum sequester, et obductio capitum, et bonorum ubique multatio uersabatur per orientales prouincias.* Blunt Right Use 371.

p. 142 l. 22 AXIS cf. De Pudic. 22 p. 271 l. 23 Wiss. *puta nunc sub gladio iam capiti librato, puta in patibulo iam corpore expanso, puta in stipite iam leoni concesso, puta in axe iam incendio adstructo, in ipsa, dico, securitate et possessione martyrii.* Tert. may have seen such spectacles, for Martyrology 6 Jan. *In Africa commemoratio plurimorum sanctorum martyrum, qui in persecutione Seueri ad palum ligati igne consumpti sunt.* La Cerda. Paul. Sent. v 39 1.

REVINCTI Prud. Agon. Fruct. (=Perist. hymn. 10) 103 *nexus denique qui manus retrorsus in tergum reuocauerant reuinctas.* Hymn. 9 43 *uincitur post terga manus, spoliatus amictu.* Agon. Romani (=Perist. hymn. 10) 851 *et iam retortis bracchiis furca eminus Romanus actus ingerebatur rogo.* [cf. ll. 69—70 A.S.] In Symm. II 559 *manibusque in terga retortis.* La Cerda. Eus. h. e. VIII 10 § 5. Heliodor. IX 5 p. 249 l. 13 Bekker νῦν δὲ κατὰ νώτων πρὸς δεσμὸν περιάγοντες.

SARMENTORVM Apul. Metam. III 9 pr. *ignis et rota.* Prud. (Roman.=) Peristeph. X 848 *sarmenta mixtim subdita.* Hymn. 6 50 *ignibus cremandos.* XI (Hippolyt.) 67 *uinctos conice in ignem.* Aldhelm. De Virgin. [c. 34 p. 276 l. 16 ed. Ehwald. A.S.] Act. Mart. prid. Non. Dec. Nicet. Choniat. I 8. Heliodor. VIII 5 p. 223 l. 15 Bekker. Prochor. Vit. Ioann. 17. (As witches.) La Cerda.

p. 142 l. 23 Rejoicing in persecution Arnob. II 77. Kaye 146. *palmata* De Idolol. 18 pr. Christians burnt Ad Scap. 4. ad nat. I 18 fin. *incendiali tunica.* Ad Mart. 5 *in tunica ardente.* Cypr. De Habitu Virg. 6 fin. *aut si carne sit gloriandum, tunc plane quando in nominis confessione cruciatur, quando fortior femina uiris torquentibus inuenitur, quando ignes aut cruces aut ferrum aut bestias patitur ut coronetur. illa sunt carnis pretiosa monilia illa corporis ornamenta meliora.* Hier. ep. 82 10 *fundendo sanguinem et patiendo magis quam faciendo contumelias Christi fundata est ecclesia,*

persecutionibus creuit, martyriis coronata est. Sidon. Carm. 5 4 *meritisque laborum post palmam palmata uenit.* Cassiodor. ep. VI 1 pr. *priscorum iudicio qualis sit consulatus, hinc omnino datur intellegi, quando inter mundi dignitates eximias solus meruit habere palmatas uestes, quas felicitas dabat: praemia uincentium.*

p. 142 l. 24 TRIVMPHAMVS Athenag. 3 f. *νικήσομεν γὰρ αὐτοὺς <τοὺς διώκοντας ἡμᾶς> ὑπὲρ ἀληθείας ἀόκνως καὶ τὰς ψυχὰς ἐπιδιδόντες.* Gaius in Euseb. Hist. Eccl. II 25 § 7 *τρόπαια.* Minuc. 37 § 1 *quam pulchrum spectaculum deo, cum Christianus cum dolore congreditur!...cum triumphator et uictor ipsi qui aduersum se sententiam dixit insultat!* Ambros. Exhort. Virginitat. 1 § 1 *Christi enim nostri principis triumphi sunt martyrum palmae.* ibid. 2 § 9 *crucis tropaea...colligimus sanguinem triumphalem et crucis lignum.* ib. § 12 § 83 *haec [Soteris] triumphales rettulit martyrii cicatrices, ut imaginem dei quam acceperat reseruaret.* Hexaëm. IV c. 2 § 7 *ecclesia...effusi pro Christo sanguinis clarificata uictoriis.* On Christ's triumph on the cross Ambros. Exp. in Luc. X §§ 104—111. [Aug.] Serm. 44 De Sanct. [= app. 223] § 1 calls the martyr's death day *dies triumphalis.* Fulgent., of Stephen, Serm. 3, Migne P.L. LXV 729^{cd} *triumphator...laureatus.*

p. 142 l. 25 DESPERATI c. 27 p. 92 l. 11 n. *quidam dementiam existimant, quod cum possimus et sacrificare in praesenti et illaesi abire manente apud animum proposito obstinationem saluti praeferamus.* cf. ib. fin. *pro fidei obstinatione damnamur.* Iustin. Apol. II 12 pr. Otto's n. Minuc. 8 § 4 *homines...deploratae inlicitae ac desperatae factionis.* Orig. Contr. Cels. VII c. 53 fin. (?) Maximin. in Euseb. Hist. Eccl. VIII 17 § 9 (*ἀπόνοια*). Lactant. V 2 § 6 the author of three books against the Christians, designed *ut, pertinaci obstinatione deposita, corporis cruciamenta deuitent.* ib. 9 § 12 *qui autem magni aestimauerint fidem cultoresque se dei non abnegauerint, in eos uero totis carnificinae suae uiribus, ueluti sanguinem sitiant, incumbunt, et desperatos uocant, quia corpori suo minime parcunt; quasi quidquam desperatius esse possit, quam torquere ac dilaniare eum, quem scias esse innocentem.* id. Epit. 54 §§ 6—7. Diocletian (edict apud Kortholt De Orig. Christianismi ex

mente (Gentilium c. 1, 2) *pertinaciam prauae mentis nequissimorum hominum punire ingens nobis studium est.* Galen Diff. Puls. III c. 3 (tom. VIII p. 657 ed. Kühn) *θᾶττον ἄν τις τοὺς ἀπὸ Μωϋσοῦ καὶ Χριστοῦ μεταδιδάξειεν.* The Pythian oracle to Porphyry, asking how to recover his wife: *forte magis poteris in aqua impressis litteris scribere, aut inflans pennas leues per aera ut auis uolare, quam semel pollutae reuoces impiae uxoris sensum.* Prudent. (Peristeph.) Hymn. 2 17. 63. 581. Kortholt [Paganus Obtrectator] De Vita et Moribus etc. c. 10 pp. 152—169.

p. 142 l. 26 cf. Orig. Contr. Cels. II 45 fin.

p. 142 l. 27 VEXILLVM EXTOLLVNT Ammian. XXVII 10 § 9 *signis ilico fixis ex more, cum undique ad arma conclamaretur, imperio principis et ductorum stetit regibilis miles, uexillum opperiens extollendum: quod erat opportune subeundae indicium pugnae.*)(*uexillum submittere* Pacat. Panegyr. 30. La Cerda. On the thought ad nat. I 18.

MVCIVS Ad Mart. 4 *Mucius ... Empedocles ... Dido ... Regulus...meretrix Atheniensis...apud Lacedaimonas...διαμαστίγωσις.* De Anim. 58 (I 395 6) *respice ad Mutii animam cum dexteram suam ignibus soluit.* called Postumus by Clem. Alex. Strom. IV § 57 p. 589 P. Minuc. 37 §§ 3—4.

p. 142 l. 28 EMPEDOCLES ad Mart. 4 (above). Greg. Naz. Or. 4 c. Iulian. 1 § 59. La Cerda.

p. 142 l. 30 ALIQVA c 12 fin. *idem estis qui Senecam aliquem pluribus et amarioribus de uestra superstitione perorantem reprehendistis.* c. 11 fin. (Oehler p. 160 n.) *aliquem de sapientia Socratem.* c. 15 p. 50 *Mineruam aliquam.* c. 19 p. 64 l 10. De Carn. Resurr. 3 p. 29 l. 1 Kr. *sententia Platonis alicuius pronuntiantis.* De Bapt. 5 pr. *Isidis alicuius aut Mithrae.* De Monogam. 17 pr. *Ioannes aliqui Christi spado.* ib. 6 fin. bis. Hier. In Eccles. 9 7—12 *et haec aliquis loquatur Epicurus.* Aug. Conf. I 13 § 20 *Aeneae nescio cuius errores.*

CARTHAGINIS CONDITRIX De Monogam. 17 pr. *exsurget regina Carthaginis et decernet in Christianas.* ad nat. II 9 p. 112 l. 6 Wiss. I 18 p. 90 l. 5 Wiss. *Regulus* (bis), *Dido, mulier Attica* (see below). Hieron. ep. 123 ad Ageruch. § 8 p. 906 a *stringam breuiter reginam Carthaginis, quae magis*

ardere uoluit, quam Hiarbae regi nubere. Aug. Conf. v 13. Macrob. v 18. Auson. Epigr. 2 (p. 420 ed. Peiper). l. 5 *namque nec Aeneas uidit me Troius umquam, nec Libyam aduenit classibus Iliacis* (an imitation of the palinode of Stesichorus).

CONDITRIX Adu. Marc. I 7 p. 299 l. 4 Kr. Apul. Lact. Eumen. Macrob. Lact. I 5 § 6. Aug. ep. 118 18. Wilmanns 151 2. [See Thes. A.S.]

p. 142 l. 31 REGVLVS De Test. Anim. 4 p. 140 l. 1 Wiss. *longum est retexere Curtios et Regulos.* ad nat. I 18 p. 90 l. 4 *crucis uero nouitatem numerosae abstrusae Regulus uester libenter dedicauit.* Minuc. 37 § 4. Arnob. I 40. Cic. in Pis. c. 19 § 43. Appian Sic. 2 § 1. Pun. 63 etc. (see next n.). Valer. Max. II 9 § 8. IX 2 ext. 1. Lactant. v 13 § 13. Aug. De Ciu. Dei I 15 p. 25 l. 21 D.[3] III 18 p. 127 l. 3 D.[3]

p. 142 l. 32 CRVCES App. Pun. 4 γαλεάγρα κέντρα πάντοθεν ἔχουσα. Sen. ep. 67 § 7. De Prouid. 3 § 4. Apul. Metam. VIII 22. Tuditan. in Gell. VII (VI) 4 § 4 *armarium muricibus praefixum.* Sil. II 340 ff. On suicide Aug. De Ciu. Dei I 21.

p. 144 l. 1 ANAXARCHVS of Abdera, a pupil of Democritus, in the suite of Alexander, after whose death he fell into the hands of Nicocreon (Diog. Laert. IX 58. 59 Men.). Timocreon (Cic. Tusc. Disp. II § 52). De Nat. Deor. III § 82. Prov. 27 22. Ou. Ibis 571—2 *aut, ut Anaxarchus, pila minuaris in alta, ictaque pro solitis frugibus ossa sonent.* Valer. Max. III 3 ext. 4. Philo Quod omnis probus liber 16 (II 462 M.). Nemes. 30. Plut. De Virtute morali x p. 449[c] πτίσσε, πτίσσε τὸν Ἀναξάρχου θύλακον, οὐ γὰρ πτίσσεις Ἀνάξαρχον. Dio Chrys. Or. 37 (Corinthiaca) II 126 R. (Dind. spurious II 306 11). Or. 64 (De fortuna) II 336 R. τὴν δυσδαιμονίαν τὴν Ἀναξάρχου. Tatian 19. Clem. Alex. Strom. IV § 56, 4 p. 589 P. Celsus c. 53 had urged the Christians, if they desired novelty, to deify some who had died nobly, e.g. Hercules, Aesculapius, Orpheus, ἀλλ' ἴσως ὑπ' ἄλλων προείληπτο. Ἀνάξαρχον γοῦν, ὃς εἰς ὅλμον ἐμβληθεὶς καὶ παρανομώτατα συντριβόμενος εὖ μάλα κατεφρόνει τῆς κολάσεως λέγων· 'πτίσσε, πτίσσε τὸν Ἀναξάρχου θύλακον, αὐτὸν γὰρ οὐ πτίσσεις.' θείου τινὸς ὡς ἀληθῶς πνεύματος ἡ φωνή. Orig. Contr. Cels. VII 54 (cf. 56 p. 369 fin.). Apostol. XV 6. Greg. Naz. Or. 4 (in Iulian. I) 70

(I 109b) ὁ τοῦ Σωκράτους ἑταίρων κώνειον καὶ τὸ Ἐπικτήτου σκέλος καὶ τὸν Ἀναξάρχου θύλακον ὧν ἀναγκαία μᾶλλον ἢ ἑκούσιος ἡ φιλοσοφία. Also Zeno Eleates | ἀσκόν, Epigr. 4 2—4 (II 1165). ep. 33 II 28c 29a γενναῖος μὲν οὖν ὁ Ἀνάξαρχος, λέγων τῷ τῆς Κύπρου τυράννῳ Ἀριστοκρέοντι· "πτίσσε, πτίσσε τὸν Ἀναξάρχου θύλακον"· μονογενὲς δὲ τοῦτο περὶ Ἀναξάρχου ἴσασι θαυμαζόμενον Ἕλληνες· ἐφ' ᾧ εἰ καί, ὡς Κέλσος, ἀξίως ἐχρῆν τινας σέβειν ἄνθρωπον δι' ἀρετήν, οὐκ ἦν εὔλογον ἀναγορεύεσθαι τὸν Ἀνάξαρχον θεόν. Poem. Moral. Carm. 10 De Virtute 688—691 (II 449). [Chrys.] Hom. in Ps. 106 3 pr. (V 678 B). Theodoret Graec. Affect. Curat. VIII § 57 p. 120 30. Suid. Wiedemann in Philologus XXX 249 33. [Cf. Ps.-Aug. Quaest. CXV 67 (Anaxagoras by mistake). Hermes XLV (1910) 494. A. S.]

p. 144 l. 3 FOLLEM Lucil. in Non. 110 26 (XXVI 28 L. Müller) *ego siqui sum et quo folliculo nunc sum indutus, non queo.* Rufin. Hist. Eccl. II 9 col. 519c Migne. Basil, in reply to a persecutor's threat, *atque utinam aliquid mihi esset digni muneris, quod offerrem huic, qui maturius Basilium de nodo follis huius absolueret.* cf. Ambr. ep. 37 § 36 *quod ille uerbis gloriatus est, sanctus Laurentius factis probauit: ut uiuus exureretur et flammis superstes diceret: uersa, manduca.* [Arnob. i.e. Arnob.-Iun.] in Ps. 149 *in extensione follis nostri corporei.* lexx. under *folliculus.* Arnob. II 76 f. *in carunculae huius folliculo constitutis.* Gataker on Antonin. VIII 37 *θύλακον.* Petau. on Themist. Or. 17 p. 724. Scaliger on Virg. Catal. p. 301. Plin. Hist. Nat. VII § 87 *praerosam dentibus linguam unamque spem indicii in tyranni os exspuit.*

p. 144 l. 6 PEPIGERVNT c. 3 p. 14 l. 3 *nonnulli etiam de utilitatibus suis cum odio isto paciscuntur, contenti iniuria, dum ne domi habeant quod oderunt.*

p. 144 l. 7 ATTICA Leaena Plin. Hist. Nat. VII c. 23 § 87 before Anaxarchus, XXXIV c. 8 § 72. cf. Timycha in Iamblich. Vit. Pythag. 31 (Rittersh. ad calc. Porph. Vit. Pythag. p. 271 ed. Kiessling). Ambr. De Virginit. I § 17 *Pythagorea quaedam una ex uirginibus celebratur fabulis, quae cum a tyranno cogeretur secretum prodere, ne quid in se ad extorquendam confessionem uel tormentis liceret, morsu linguam abscidisse fertur,*

atque in tyranni faciem despuisse, ut qui interrogandi finem non faciebat, non haberet quem interrogaret. Aleiat. Emblem. 13. La Cerda. ad nat. I 18 p. 90 l. 8 Wiss. *sed et tormenta mulier Attica fatigauit tyranno negans, postremo, ne cederet corpus et sexus, linguam suam pastam exspuit, totum eradicatae confessionis ministerium.* Valer. Max. III 3 ext. § 4 ascribes the story to Anaxarchus (so Diog. Laert. IX 59): Ammian. XIV 9 § 6 to Zeno the Stoic: told of Zeno of Elea by Euseb. Praep. Euang. X 14 § 15 p. 504[d]. cf. Epictet. III 24 § 71 *οὗτινος οὖν οὐχ ἡδονὴ κρείττων ἐστίν, οὐ πόνος, οὐ δόξα, οὐ πλοῦτος, δύναται δ', ὅταν αὐτῷ δόξῃ, τὸ σωμάτιον ὅλον προσπτύσας τινὶ ἀπελθεῖν, τίνος ἔτι οὗτος δοῦλός ἐστι, τίνι ὑποτέτακται.*

p. 144 l. 10 ZENO ELEATES De Anim. 58 m. (I 395 7 Wiss.) *respice ad Mutii* [supr.] *animam, cum dexteram suam ignibus soluit; respice ad Zenonis, cum illam Dionysii tormenta praetereunt.* Cic. Tusc. Disp. II § 52. Valer. Maxim. III 3 ext. § 2 fin. (cf. § 3, another Zeno) VIII 22 (?) § 1). Philo quod omnis probus liber § 14 II p. 460 M. Plut. *περὶ ἀδολεσχ.* 8 p. 505. de Stoic. Repugn. 37 3 p. 1051 and adu. Coloten 32 10 p. 1126. Diodor. Sicul. X 17 (Nearchus). Diog. Laert. IX 26 Menage (Zeno about 180 years older than Dionysius) who also says that he spat out his tongue like the *meretrix* above. Philostr. Vit. Apollon. Tyan. VII 2. Clem. Alex. Strom. IV § 57 p. 589. Thence Theodoret Graec. Affect. Curat. VIII § 57 p. 120 34 *Ζήνων ὁ Ἐλεάτης ἀναγκαζόμενος κατειπεῖν τι τῶν ἀπορρήτων ἀντέσχε πρὸς τὰς βασάνους οὐδὲν ἐξομολογούμενος. ὡς δέ φησιν Ἐρατοσθένης ἐν τῷ περὶ ἀγαθῶν καὶ κακῶν, δείσας οὗτος μὴ τῇ τῶν παθῶν ὑπερβολῇ βιασθεὶς ἐξείπῃ τι τῶν συγκειμένων καὶ τοὺς στασιώτας μηνύσῃ, τὴν γλῶτταν τοῖς ὀδοῦσι τεμών, προσέπτυσε τῷ τυράννῳ* cet. Euseb. Praep. Euang. (cited on l. 7). Bayle Zénon d'Elée rem. C.

p. 144 l. 11 CONTEMPTVM MORTIS l. 17 n.

p. 144 l. 13 LACONVM FLAGELLA ad nat. I 18 fin. *ut taceam de Laconica gloria.* Ad Mart. 4 Oehler. Synes. ep. 57 p. 195[c] *οἵ τινες Λακεδαιμόνιοι τοσούτῳ τῷ διὰ τῶν μαστίγων αἵματι τὴν παρ' αὐτοῖς ἐτίμησαν Ἄρτεμιν.* La Cerda. Lasaulx 255 n. 142. Eunap. Soph. in Iulian. p. 483 med. ed. Boissonade. Diog. Laert. VI 27. Pausan. III 16 § 10 Frazer. Sext. Empiric.

Pyrrh. Hyp. III 24. Cic. Tusc. Disp. II c. 14 § 34 he saw some scourged to death, without a groan. V c. 27 § 77. Themist. Or. 21 p. 250. Muson. in Stob. serm. III 19 § 16 p. 169 [=ed. Hense p. 52 l. 10. A.S.]; also in Stob. Florileg. LXXXV 20 (ed. Hense, p. 113 ll. 1 ff.). Alciphr. ep. 3 54. Pauly II² 1395. Greg. Naz. Or. 39 4 f. *Λακωνικῶν ἐφήβων ἐπιβώμιον αἷμα, ξαινομένων ταῖς μάστιξι καὶ τοῦτο μόνον κακῶς ἀνδριζομένων, οἷς τιμᾶται θεὰ καὶ τοῦτο παρθένος.* Sen. De Prouid. 4 § 11 *numquid tu inuisos esse Lacedaemoniis liberos suos credis, quorum experiuntur indolem publice uerberibus admotis? ipsi illos patres adhortantur, ut ictus flagellorum fortiter perferant et laceros ac semianimes rogant, perseuerent uolnera praebere uolneribus.* inscr. *βωμονίκης* Daremberg-Saglio s.u. and under *διαμαστίγωσις.* Epictet. Diss. I 2 § 2. Simplic. Comm. on Epictet. Man. c. 10 p. 646 (IV 107 Schw.). Lact. on Stat. Th. I 118. IV 48. 227. Plut. II 240ᵇ Wytt. uit. Lycurgi 18. Nicolaus Damasc. Fr. 114 § 11 (III 458 Müller).

p. 144 l. 17 CONTEMPTV Ad Scap. 1. 5. Euseb. Hist. Eccl. VIII 14 § 13. P. E. II 15. Cypr. De Mortal. 16. Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. 45 p. 264a *σαρκοποιηθεὶς ὑπέμεινεν...ἵνα...ὁ θάνατος καταφρονηθῇ.* 96 p. 323ᵈ. cf. Otto (p. 35 n. 5) on Iustin. Apol. I c. 11 p. 59ᵃ. c. 57 p. 91ᵈ. II 4. 11 fin. p. 50a. Minuc. 8 § 6 *pro mira stultitia et incredibili audacia spernunt tormenta praesentia, dum incerta metuunt et futura: et dum mori post mortem timent, interim mori non timent.* Luc. De morte Peregr. 13 *πεπείκασι γὰρ αὑτοὺς οἱ κακοδαίμονες τὸ μὲν ὅλον ἀθάνατοι ἔσεσθαι καὶ βιώσεσθαι τὸν ἀεὶ χρόνον, παρ' ὃ καὶ καταφρονοῦσι τοῦ θανάτου καὶ ἑκόντες αὑτοὺς ἐπιδιδόασιν οἱ πολλοί.* Keim's Celsus p. 149. Ep. ad Diognet. c. 1 *θανάτου καταφρονοῦσι.* c. 7 p. 499a. Tatian 4 p. 144ᶜ. 19 *τοῦ θανάτου καταφρονηταί.* Clem. Alex. Strom. III 7 § 60, of the Brachmanes, *καταφρονοῦσι δὲ θανάτου καὶ παρ' οὐδὲν ἡγοῦνται τὸ ζῆν.* Euseb. Mart. Palest. 11 § 2, of Pamphilus, *παρ' ὅλον αὐτοῦ τὸν βίον πάσῃ διαπρέψας ἀρετῇ, ἀποτάξει καὶ καταφρονήσει βίου.* De Fug. in Persec. 4. ad nat. I 18 bis. Lactant. V 13 § 5 *cum uero ab ortu solis usque ad occasum lex diuina suscepta sit et omnis sexus et omnis aetas et gens et regio et natio unis ac paribus animis deo seruiant, eadem*

sit ubique patientia, idem contemptus mortis. Mart. Polyc. 4. Orig. Contr. Cels. II 17 fin. 73 pr. (cf. 38 and 45 *κολάσεων*) III 68. 78 p. m. Ignat. Smyrn. 3 2 *διὰ τοῦτο καὶ θανάτου κατεφρόνησαν.*

p. 144 ll. 20—1 Adu. Marc. I 9 p. 301 l. 3 Kr. *quem titulum incidemus ex duobus deo Marcionis?* Ammian. XIV 6 8 *quidam aeternitati se commendari posse per statuas aestimantes eas ardenter adfectant* cet.

p. 144 l. 24 PRAESIDES Kellner's transl. p. 17 supr. 30 fin. (an exact parallel). De Spectac. 30 p. 28 l. 23 Wiss. *praesides, persecutores dominici nominis saeuioribus quam ipsi flammis saeuierunt insultantes contra Christianos liquescentes!* Kaye 48 n. 3.

APVD POPVLVM 49 f. p. 142 l. 6. Blunt Right Use 355—6.

p. 144 l. 28 De Pudic. 1 p. 221 l. 8 Wiss. *principalem Christiani nominis disciplinam, quam ipsum quoque saeculum usque adeo testatur, ut, si quando, eam in feminis nostris inquinamentis potius carnis quam tormentis punire contendat, id uolens eripere quod uitae anteponunt.* Neumann I 143 6 doubts the historical character of this account and of that of Potamiaena (Euseb. Hist. Eccl. VI 5 § 2). Cypr. De Mortalitate 15 *excedunt ecce in pace tutae cum gloria sua uirgines uenientes antichristi minas et corruptelas et lupanaria non timentes.* Blunt Right Use 372 n. 1. Ad Herenn. IV § 29 *si lenones uitasset tanquam leones.* cf. Sen. Contr. I 2. S. Afra (Ruinart 501) ex-courtesan 'J'apprends que tu es une courtisane; sacrifie donc, car tu ne peux appartenir au Dieu des chrétiens.' Euseb. Mart. Palaest. 5 § 3 *τότε δὲ γυναῖκας σωφροσύνης τῆς ἀνωτάτω καὶ αὐτοπαρθένους ἀσκητρίας· εἰς αἰσχρὰς ὕβρεις πορνοτρόφοις παραδιδόντα.* ib. 8 §§ 5—8. Some committed suicide to escape rape. Euseb. Hist. Eccl. VIII 14 § 14. ib. III 7 §§ 32—37. Aug. De Ciu. Dei I 26 does not condemn them. Pelagia Euseb. Hist. Eccl. VIII 12 § 2 (cf. Dict. Chr. Biogr.). Domnina and her daughters ib. 3 § 4. Sophronia, a Christian Lucretia. Euseb. Hist. Eccl. VIII 14 § 7. Vita Const. I 34 (cf. § 33). Euseb. Hist. Eccl. VIII 12 §§ 3—4, a rich Christian lady at Antioch urged a number of Christian girls, whom she had trained, to throw

themselves into a river, *ἐν ἀμηχάνοις ἑαυτήν τε καὶ τὰς παῖδας θεασαμένη καὶ τὰ μέλλοντα ἐξ ἀνθρώπων δεινὰ τῷ λόγῳ παραθεῖσα, τό τε πάντων δεινῶν ἀφορητότερον, πορνείας ἀπειλήν, μηδὲ ἄκροις ὠσὶν ὑπομεῖναι δεῖν ἀκοῦσαι.* ib. 14 §§ 15. 16. 17. Ambros. De Virginibus II 4 § 23 *aut sacrificare uirginem aut lupanari prostitui iubent.* cf. the very curious story of her escaping the brothel in the clothes of a soldier who went in to her, and the martyrdom of both. ib. §§ 26—33. Allard Les dernières Perséc. 237. Mommsen Strafrecht 955.

CHRISTIANAM Minuc. 37 § 4 *pueri et mulierculae nostrae cruces et tormenta, feras et omnes suppliciorum terriculas inspirata patientia doloris inludunt.* Cf. Ambr. Exhort. Virginit. 12 § 82. Les vierges martyres, suivies d'un appendice sur la condition matérielle, morale, religieuse et sociale de la femme avant Jésus-Christ, par M. l'abbé F. Martin. Paris 1874 2 v. 12°. pp. xxxi 434. 426 (7 fr.). Allard Persécution de Dioclétien I 283—4. 326. 328. 347—8. 388 seq. (Agnes) m.

p. 144 l. 29 c. 40 p. 116 l. 17.—Lactant. V 19 § 9 *decet eos suscipere defensionem deorum suorum, ne, si nostra inualuerint* (*ut cottidie inualescunt*), *cum delubris ac ludibriis suis deserantur.* 13 § 1 *cum autem noster numerus semper de deorum cultoribus augeatur, numquam uero, ne in ipsa quidem persecutione minuatur* (*quoniam peccare homines et inquinari sacrificio possunt, auerti autem non possunt a deo; ualet enim ui sua ueritas*). Prudent. Peristeph. IV 87—8 *martyrum semper numerus sub omni | grandine creuit.* Aug. De Ciu. Dei XXII 6 (II 563 26 D.) *ligabantur includebantur, caedebantur torquebantur, urebantur laniabantur, trucidabantur—et multiplicabantur.* Iren. IV 33 9 fin. Rufin. Hist. Eccl. VIII 17 fin. VI 5 p. 329. Iustin. Apol. II 12 (p. 50^{ab}) converted by the constancy of martyrs. Comments of spectators [Cypr.] De laude martyrii 15. Chrys. II 711^{c}—712^{c}. 714^{a} *αἷμα διηνεκῶς τὰ καλὰ τῆς ἐκκλησίας ἄρδον φυτά.* cf. 579^{d}. Bingham XX 7 6. Ep. ad Diognet. 6 § 9, Funk.

p. 144 l. 32 Arnob. II 5 p. 50 30 *quod, cum genera poenarum tanta sint a uobis proposita religionis huius sequentibus leges,*

augeatur res magis et contra omnes minas atque interdicta formidinum animosius populus obnitatur et ad credendi studium prohibitionis ipsius stimulis excitetur. ib. 77 *ista quam dicitis persecutionis asperitas, liberatio nostra est, non persecutio.* Iustin. Apol. II 10 p. 49[a] Otto. 12 p. 50[a]. ib. Dial. c. Tryph. 110 Otto ad l. p. 337[b] κεφαλοτομούμενοι γὰρ καὶ σταυρούμενοι καὶ θηρίοις παραβαλλόμενοι καὶ δεσμοῖς καὶ πυρὶ καὶ πάσαις ταῖς ἄλλαις βασάνοις ὅτι οὐκ ἀφιστάμεθα τῆς ὁμολογίας, δῆλόν ἐστιν, ἀλλ', ὅσωπερ ἂν τοιαῦτά τινα γίνηται, τοσούτῳ μᾶλλον ἄλλοι πλείονες πιστοὶ καὶ θεοσεβεῖς διὰ τοῦ ὀνόματος τοῦ Ἰησοῦ γίνονται. ὁποῖον ἐὰν ἀμπέλου τις ἐκτέμῃ τὰ καρποφορήσαντα μέρη, εἰς τὸ ἀναβλαστῆσαι ἑτέρους κλάδους καὶ εὐθαλεῖς καὶ καρποφόρους ἀναδίδωσι, τὸν αὐτὸν τρόπον καὶ ἐφ' ἡμῶν γίνεται. Ep. ad Diognet. 7 fin. οὐχ ὁρᾷς ὅσῳ πλείονες κολάζονται, τοσούτῳ πλεονάζοντας ἄλλους. ib. 6 f. Χριστιανοὶ κολαζόμενοι καθ' ἡμέραν πλεονάζουσι μᾶλλον. Lactant. V 13 § 5. 19 § 9 (quoted above) *augetur religio dei, quanto magis premitur.* § 22 *defendenda enim religio est non occidendo sed moriendo.* Aug. De Ciu. Dei II 29 p. 95 l. 22 D.[3] calls on the offspring of the Scipios and Fabricii: *expergiscere, dies est, sicut experrecta es in quibusdam, de quorum uirtute perfecta et pro fide uera etiam passionibus gloriamur, qui usquequaque aduersus potestates inimicissimas confligentes easque fortiter moriendo uincentes 'sanguine nobis hanc patriam peperere suo.'* Ep. (3 =) 137 § 16 (*Christiani*) *inter inimicos augentur, persecutionibus crescunt, per adflictionum augustias usque in terrarum extrema dilatantur.* Orig. Contr. Cels. VII 26 fin. Rufin. Hist. Eccl. IX 9 p. 528 m. Leo Serm. 1 De Petro et Paulo. [= 82 c. 6, Migne, P. L. LIV 426[ab]. A. S.] Ad Scap. 1 *cum omni saeuitia uestra concertamus, etiam ultro erumpentes, magisque damnati quam absoluti gaudemus.* ib. 4. ib. 5 fin. *nec tamen deficiet haec secta, quam tunc magis aedificari scias, cum caedi uidetur. quisque enim tantam tolerantiam spectans, ut aliquo scrupulo percussus, et inquirere accenditur, quid sit in causa, et ubi cognouerit ueritatem et ipse statim sequitur.* Bibl. Max. Patr. VII 738[c] *martyres moriendo uincunt.* cf. Lucifer Calar. Moriendum esse pro Dei Filio (Bibl. Max. IV 242[cd]. La Cerda cites

ib.^{f} = p. 285 l. 25 ed. Hartel (?)). [Iustin.] Ad Orthodox. 74 p. 436^{b} *ἀλλ' αἱ βάσανοι αὗται, αἷς καὶ πρώην ἦν χρησάμενος ὁ Ἑλληνισμὸς προσδοκήσας δι' αὐτῶν ἄλυτον φυλάττειν ἑαυτόν, τὸν μὲν Ἑλληνισμὸν κατέπαυσαν, τὸν δὲ Χριστιανισμὸν ἔστησαν παγιώτερον.* Ambr. De Fide Resurr. 45 *morte martyrum religio defensa, cumulata fides, ecclesia roborata est.* [Cypr.] De duplici martyrio 9 f. (app. 227 7) *quis enim nescit, fratres, quam uberem prouentum effudit ecclesiae seges, apostolorum ac ceterorum martyrum sanguine irrigata? quo plus sanguinis effusum est, hoc magis effloruit multitudo fidelium, hoc latius sparsit suas propagines illa beata uitis a Christo stirpe surgens et occupans orbem uniuersum.* Blunt Right Use 239.

METIMVR Verg. Hor. Sil. V. F.

p. 144 l. 33 SEMEN cet. c. 21 p. 72 l. 30—p. 74 l. 1 *discipuli quoque...multa perpessi...Romae postremo per Neronis saeuitiam sanguinem Christianum seminauerunt.* [Cypr.] De laude Martyrii 7. Biblioth. Max. Patr. VIII 157^{e} *martyrum sanguis mundum fecundauit.* Lactant. v 13 § 5. 22 § 21 *illae maxime causae nostrum numerum semper auxerunt: audit circumstans populus inter ipsa tormenta dicentes non sacrificare se lapidibus humana manu factis, sed deo uiuo, qui sit in caelo, multi hoc uerum esse intellegunt.* Nilus Serm. 12 De Ascens. (Phot. Cod. 276, 515 a Bekker), *ἃ σφάττοντες διεκώλυον, αὐτὴ σφαττομένη συνεκρότει· καὶ ταῖς σφαγαῖς κατὰ τῶν σφαττόντων ἀνίστη τὰ τρόπαια. τὰ τῆς ἐκκλησίας κατεκόπτετο κλήματα καὶ ὁ τῆς πίστεως ἐπεδίδου μᾶλλον καρπός...Στέφανος ἐκλαδεύετο καὶ ἄλλο κλῆμα μαρτύρων ἐβλάστανεν.* Minuc. c. 37 § 1 (?). Arnob. II 5. Cypr. Quod idola di non sint 7. Iustin. Dial. c. Tryph. 96 p. 323^{e}. 110 p. 337^{b}. 121 p. 349^{d} sq. 46 p. 265^{c}. Apol. I 11 (p. 59^{a}). 39 (p. 78^{b}). 57 (p. 91de). II 4 p. 43^{e}. Luc. Peregr. 13. Ep. ad Diogn. 6 p. 498^{b}. 7 p. 499^{a}. Basil. ep. 264 (III 254^{d}). Aug. in Ps. 3 9 p. m. *dicat etiam: 'Non timebo milia populi circumdantis me'; circumuallantium scilicet gentium, ad exstinguendum nomen, si possent, ubicumque Christianum. sed quomodo timerentur, cum tamquam oleo sanguine martyrum in Christo ardor caritatis inflammaretur?* ib. 39 1 pr. *et sparsus est sanguis iustus et illo sanguine, tamquam*

seminatione per totum mundum facta, seges surrexit ecclesiae. 40 1 p. m. (IV 490[b]) *ad multiplicandam ecclesiam ualuit sanctus sanguis effusus, seminationi accessit et mors martyrum.* ib. 58 Serm. 1 § 4 p. m. *effusus est magnus et multus martyrum sanguis: quo effuso tamquam seminata seges ecclesiae fertilius pullulauit et totum mundum sicut nunc conspicimus occupauit.* 78 15 p. m. 88 S. 1 10 p. m. *martyres occidit, semina sanguinis sparsit, seges ecclesiae pullulauit.* 118 S. 32 6 fin. *et quis non uideat quantum adiuuerit ecclesiam sanguis ecclesiae! quanta ex illa semente seges toto orbe surrexerit!* 134 24 m. *uolebant paucos Christianos exstinguere, occidere; sanguinem fuderunt: de sanguine occisorum tanti exsurrexerunt, a quibus illi interfectores martyrum superarentur.* 140 20 fin. *et quid est factum de tot mortibus martyrum nisi ut ipsa uerba praeualerent, et tamquam irrigata terra sanguine testium Christi pullularet ubique seges ecclesiae?* cf. 21 (IV 2243[c] 2244[a]). Friedländer III[5] 636 n. 1 citing Gieseler I 70 21. Tzschirner 170—1. Blunt Right Use pp. 239—241.

p. 146 l. 3 Minuc. 38 § 6 *non <qui> non habitu sapientiam sed mente praeferimus, non eloquimur magna sed uiuimus.*

TANTOS...QVANTOS supr. c. 40 pr. p. 116 l. 17. Bünemann on Lactant. I 3 § 21.

p. 146 l. 4 OBSTINATIO supr. c. 27 pr. *quidam dementiam existimant, quod cum possimus et sacrificare in praesenti et inlaesi abire manente apud animum proposito, obstinationem saluti praeferamus.* ib. fin. *illos numquam magis detriumphamus, quam cum pro fidei obstinatione damnamur.* De Spectac. 1 p. 1 l. 18 Wiss. *sunt qui existimant Christianos...ad hanc obstinationem abdicatione uoluptatium erudiri, qua facilius uitam contemnant amputatis quasi retinaculis eius nec desiderent, quam iam superuacuam sibi fecerunt, ut hoc consilio potius et humano prospectu, non diuino praescripto definitum existimetur.* ad nat. I 18 pr. *reliquum obstinationis in illo capitulo collocatis, quod neque gladios neque cruces neque bestias uestras, non ignem, non tormenta, ob duritatem ac contemptum mortis, animo recusemus.* cf. ib. 17—19. Epict. [= IV 7

§ 6. A. S.] Antonin. [XI 3. A. S.]. Plin. ad Trai. 96 (97) § 3 *neque enim dubitabam, qualecumque esset quod faterentur, pertinaciam certe et inflexibilem obstinationem debere puniri.* Ep. ad Diogn. 1 *τίνι τε θεῷ πεποιθότες καὶ πῶς θρησκεύοντες αὐτόν τε κόσμον ὑπερορῶσι πάντες καὶ θανάτου καταφρονοῦσι.* ib. 10 p. 501^{b} *τότε τοὺς κολαζομένους ἐπὶ τῷ μὴ θέλειν ἀρνήσασθαι θεὸν καὶ ἀγαπήσεις καὶ θαυμάσεις, τότε τῆς ἀπάτης τοῦ κόσμου καὶ τῆς πλάνης καταγνώσει, ὅταν τὸ ἀληθῶς ἐν οὐρανῷ ζῆν ἐπιγνώσῃ, ὅταν τοῦ δοκοῦντος ἐνθάδε θανάτου καταφρονήσῃς.* Iustin. Apol. I 11 *ἀναιρούντων οὐ πεφροντίκαμεν.* 39 *ἡδέως ὁμολογοῦντες τὸν Χριστὸν ἀποθνήσκομεν.* 57 *οὐ γὰρ δεδοίκαμεν θάνατον.* See exx. id. Apol. II 2. Act. Mart. Iust. 5. Neumann I 153 n. 3.

p. 146 l. 5 MAGISTRA Ad Scap. 5 fin. Iustin. Apol. I 4 p. 55^{b} *ὃν γὰρ τρόπον παραλαβόντες τινὲς παρὰ τοῦ διδασκάλου Χριστοῦ μὴ ἀρνεῖσθαι ἐξεταζόμενοι παρακελεύονται* (Otto ad l. p. 15^{b}). Clem. Alex. Strom. IV 73 fin. p. 596 P. *δοθήσεται δέ τισιν, ἐὰν συμφέρῃ, ἀπολογήσασθαι, ἵνα διά τε τῆς μαρτυρίας διά τε τῆς ὁμολογίας ὠφελῶνται οἱ πάντες, ἰσχυροποιούμενοι μὲν οἱ κατ' ἐκκλησίαν, θαυμάζοντες δὲ καὶ εἰς πίστιν ὑπαγόμενοι οἱ ἐξ ἐθνῶν τὴν σωτηρίαν πολυπραγμονήσαντες, οἱ λοιποὶ δὲ ὑπ' ἐκπλήξεως κατεχόμενοι.*

CONCVTITVR is staggered. Kaye 123—4.

p. 146 l. 9 Scorpiac. 6 p. 158 l. 21 Wiss. De Pudic. 9 p. 238 l. 14 Wiss. ib. 22 p. 272 l. 25 Wiss. *aliud baptisma.* De Bapt. 16 pr. *tota Paradisi clauis tuus sanguis est.* De Anim. 55 fin. Cf. De Fuga in Persec. 9. De Patient. 13 p. 21 l. 4 Kr. *secunda intinctio* Aug. X 700 Gaume. Chrys. XI 86 Ben. Dodwell Diss. Cypr. 13, De secundo martyrii baptismo. Acta Perpetuae c. 18. (Sees only martyrs in Paradise, De Anim. 55, p. 388 l. 26 Wiss.)

DONANTVR De Pudic. 21 p. 269 l. 24 Wiss. *ipsum Paracletum in Prophetis Nouis habeo dicentem 'potest ecclesia donare delictum.'* ib. 21 fin. p. 271 8 *ei ideo ecclesia quidem delicta donabit.* ib. 22 p. 271 27 Wiss. ib. 22 a. m. p. 272 l. 1 Wiss. *sufficiat martyri propria delicta purgasse.* De Bapt. 16 pr. Adu. Marc. IV 35 p. 539 l. 17 Kr. V 19 bis p. 645 ll. 24—5 Kr.

Scorpiac. 6 p. 158 l. 10 Wiss. 12 fin. e.g. p. 174 l. 6 Wiss. *sordes quidem baptismate abluuntur, maculae uero martyrio candidantur.* Blunt Right Use pp. 236—7. Kaye 132 n. 6. 317. 318. 321 (6). 349 seq. 418. heretic martyrs, pseudo-martyrs Bingham XV 8 11 f. XVI 6 7 n. 84—86. Ambr. ep. 26 16. De obitu Valent. 53 n. De Virgin. III § 34. De Viduis § 55. Cf. Aug. tr. 58 in Ioann. II 2, 662[c]. ep. 193 5 fin. bis. Baptism of martyrdom Aug. ep. 265 4 *quoscumque legimus in corpore Christi, quod est ecclesia, pertinere ad regnum caelorum, nonnisi baptizatos intellegere debemus: nisi forte quos angustia passionis inuenit, et nolentes negare Christum, antequam baptizarentur occisi sunt, quibus ipsa passio pro baptismo deputata est.* [Pelag. in Rom. 6. 3. A. S.] Cypr. ind. *baptisma sanguinis* p. 376 a. *martyres* p. 395. Orig. Exh. ad Mart. 30 *βάπτισμα ἡμῖν δίδοται τὸ τοῦ μαρτυρίου.* idem Hom. 2 in Leuit. (II 190[d]) *secunda remissio est in passione martyrii* esp. Cypr. Append. De laude Martyrii 23 p. 45 17. Biblioth. Max. Patr. XIV 7[d] *martyrium peccata dimittit.* Clem. Alex. Strom. IV 9 § 74, 3—4, P. 596—7, quoting Hermas. § 76 p. 596 fin. *ἔοικεν οὖν τὸ μαρτύριον ἀποκάθαρσις εἶναι ἁμαρτιῶν μετὰ δόξης.* ib. § 106 pr. p. 609, the divine wisdom *ἐπάγει καθαρσιν ἔνδοξον τὸ μαρτύριον.* Funk on Hermas sim. V 28, 3.

p. 146 l. 10 SENTENTIIS VESTRIS GRATIAS AGIMVS c. 1 fin. *damnatus gratias agit.* c. 21 p. 66 l. 25. c. 46 prope fin. *Christianus etiam damnatus gratias agit.* Rufin. Hist. Eccl. IV 17 f. Bingham X 2 20. Optat. II 2 p. 52 Dupin. Iustin. Apol. II 2 f. the martyr Lucius when sentenced to be executed, *καὶ χάριν εἰδέναι ὡμολόγει, πονηρῶν δεσποτῶν τῶν τοιούτων ἀπηλλάχθαι γινώσκων καὶ πρὸς τὸν πατέρα καὶ βασιλέα τῶν οὐρανῶν πορεύεσθαι.* ib. 11 pr. *τὸ ὄφλημα ἀποδιδόντες εὐχαριστοῦμεν.* Acta Mart. Scillit. p. 116, Robinson. ll. 5 6 12. Ad Scap. 1 *denique cum omni saeuitia uestra concertamus, etiam ultro erumpentes magisque damnati quam absoluti gaudemus.* Heraldus h. l. pp. 187—8. Prudent. Peristeph. XIII 94. Acta Perpetuae 12. Maximiliani 3. Cypriani 4. Saturnini 17. *Deo gratias.* battle-cry of the catholics in reply to Donatist *Deo laudes* (Aug. Enarr. in Ps. 132 6. Allard Persécut. de

Dioclétien I 106). Acta Marciani et Nicandri 2 (Ruinart 618). Acta Felicis (Ruinart 376—8). Aug. in Ps. 137 3 (IV 1525[e]) *gaudet iniquus in popina, gaudet martyr in catena. quomodo gaudebat sancta ista Crispina cuius hodie sollemnitas celebratur? gaudebat cum tenebatur, cum ad iudicem ducebatur, cum in catasta leuabatur, cum audiebatur, cum damnabatur; in his omnibus gaudebat: et eam miseri miseram putabant, quae cum angelis gaudebant.*

INDEX TO THE INTRODUCTION AND NOTES

The Roman numbers refer to the pages of the Introduction; the Arabic numerals to the pages and lines of the Notes

CAMBRIDGE: PRINTED BY J. B. PEACE, M.A., AT THE UNIVERSITY PRESS.

75
109
111
113
115
131
139
[illegible]